

[2 August, 2002]

RAJYA SABHA

...(व्यवधान)... जो ज्यादा इस बारे में परेशान थे, I agree with them ...(Interruptions)...
आपकी अगर कोई समस्या है तो क्वेश्चन आँवर हो जाए, उसके बाद उसको लेंगे।
...(व्यवधान)...

SHRI KAPIL SIBAL: Madam, our only request is that the concerned hon. Minister should be present in this House at 12 o'clock ...(Interruptions)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am only a medium. I will convey your views to the ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI KAPIL SIBAL: Madam, I request the Government, through you, that the concerned hon. Minister should be present in this House at 12 o'clock. That is our request ...(Interruptions)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Okay, अभी 12.00 नहीं बजे हैं, अभी क्वेश्चन आँवर लेते हैं। क्वेश्चन नं० 281.

ORAL ANSWERS TO QUESTIONS

Manure from Hospital Wastes

*281. SHRI B.P. SINGHAL: Will the Minister of AGRICULTURE be pleased to state:

(a) whether Government have funded any project for generating manure out of hospital wastes,

(b) if so, whether the project has proved successful:

(c) whether a similar project is contemplated for municipal wastes also; and

(d) if not, whether Government would examine the possibility of utilizing the municipal wastes also?

THE MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE (SHRI AJIT SINGH): (a) No, Sir.

(b) Does not arise.

(c) and (d) Ministry of Agriculture has provided funds for setting up of 30 mechanical compost plants for production of compost from bio-degradable municipal waste for use as manure. Besides, Ministry of

Environment and Forests has also funded 3 projects for preparation of compost from Municipal Solid Waste.

श्री भारतेन्दु प्रकाश सिंहल: मैडम, इस प्रश्न के उत्तर में यह कहा गया है कि मेडिसिनल वेस्ट को एक्सप्लोर नहीं किया गया। वास्तविकता यह है कि इलाहाबाद में पिछले सात साल में बहुत ही उम्दा एक्सपेरिमेंट हुआ है, जहां पर मेडिसिनल वेस्ट को खाद में कन्वर्ट कर दिया गया। इस इन्सिनेरेटर में 15 से 40 लाख रुपए इनिशियल कास्ट लगती है, 4 से 6 रुपए प्रति किलो पर ब्रेड रनिंग कास्ट है, इलेक्ट्रिकल ब्रेक डाउन अलग है और कुछ मशीनें ब्रेक डाउन होती हैं। महोदया, इस तरह जो सुप्रीम कोर्ट का 1997 का जजमेंट है, उसको पूरा नहीं किया जा रहा है। दूसरी तरफ यह जो एक्सपेरिमेंट हुआ है, इसमें मेडिसिनल वेस्ट में हाथ तक नहीं लगाना पड़ता है और उसका कोई भी टॉक्सिक बाइ-प्रॉडक्ट नहीं है। जब उस वेस्ट को जलाते हैं तो उसमें से गैसेज निकलती हैं, राख निकलती है, जो कि टॉक्सिक है। मेरा प्रश्न यह है कि क्या गवर्नमेंट इस बात का आश्वासन देगी कि यह जो एक्सपेरिमेंट चल रहा है, उसका अध्ययन किया जाएगा? केवल यही एक्सपेरिमेंट नहीं है, एक एक्सपेरिमेंट 18 साल चलाकर 1997 में एसोसिएशन ऑफ सर्जन्स ने एक पेपर पब्लिश किया था, जिसमें एक बायोलॉजिकल तरीके का जिक्र था जिससे हॉस्पिटल वेस्ट का डिस्पोज़ल हो सकता था। इसके साथ-साथ मैनचेस्टर यूनिवर्सिटी ने कुछ ऐसे प्लांट्स की खोज की है जो टॉक्सिक मैटीरियल्स को सोख सकते हैं।

उपसभापति: आपको तो मंत्री जी से ज्यादा जानकारी है।

श्री भारतेन्दु प्रकाश सिंहल: महोदया, मेरा कहना यह है कि क्या मंत्री जी यह आश्वासन देंगे कि इस विधि को पूरी तरह से एक्सप्लोर करके इसका इस्तेमाल किया जाएगा क्योंकि इस विधि में पैसा भी नहीं लगता, बल्कि लाभ होता है। जो सूखी गायें हैं, वे खुद पैसा जनरेट करती हैं अपनी सस्टेनेंस के लिए। गौशालाओं में हॉस्पिटल वेस्ट की एक लेयर रखी, फिर गोबर की एक लेयर रखी, फिर हॉस्पिटल वेस्ट की एक लेयर रखी, फिर गोबर की एक लेयर रखी, ऐसा करते-करते 6-8 महीने में सारा बैक्टीरिया एम्सार्ब हो जाता है।

उपसभापति: आप यह पूछिए कि कर रहे हैं कि नहीं कर रहे हैं।

श्री भारतेन्दु प्रकाश सिंहल: महोदया, मैं यह एश्योरेंस चाहता हूँ कि वे इस विधि को एक्सप्लोर करेंगे।

उपसभापति: ये खाली एश्योरेंस चाहते हैं, जवाब भी नहीं चाहिए।

SHRI AJIT SINGH: Madam, the hon. Member, as you have said, is very knowledgeable about hospital wastes. But the fact remains that under the law you cannot make manure from hospital waste. The

[2 August, 2002]

RAJYA SABHA

Environmental Protection Act of 1986 and the rules framed under that Act mentions as to how that hospital waste has to be disposed of, and manure is not allowed to be made from that.

श्री भारतेन्दु प्रकाश सिंहल: महोदया, मेरा कहना यह है कि अगर वह हॉस्पिटल वेस्ट, बैक्टीरिया-फ्री हो जाता है तो फिर क्यों नहीं उस लॉ को चेंज किया जा सकता? आप इस पर भी विचार करने की कृपा करें। इस एक्सपेरिमेंट को आप पूरी तरह से स्टडी करें और फिर अगर लॉ बदलना है तो लॉ बदलिए।

महोदया, दूसरी बात मैं कहना चाहता हूँ कि उत्तर प्रदेश में एक PIL लगी है म्युनिसिपल वेस्ट के खिलाफ, उसमें यू.पी. पौल्यूशन कंट्रोल बोर्ड ने जो काउंटर ऐफिडेविट दिया है, उसमें लिखा है कि 33 इंसिनरेटर्स में से 31 इंसिनरेटर्स आऊट ऑफ सर्विस हैं। महोदया, अगर इस तरीके से यह काम हो रहा है तो जो कानून हमारे आड़े आ रहा है, यह तो उससे ज्यादा भयंकर चीज हो रही है। मैं चाहता हूँ कि इसको बहुत सीरियसली लिया जाए और इसके लिए कानून बदला जाए। इसको वे उस विधि से करें, जो हमारे देश के लिए हो। चक्कर यह है कि इंसिनरेटर्स के तो कमीशन एजेंट होते हैं जो इन्हें बेच लेते हैं लेकिन यह जो हमारा इंडिजिनस तरीका है उसको बेचने वाला कोई नहीं है। इसमें यही कठिनाई आती है।

SHRI AJIT SINGH: As the hon. Member has mentioned, Madam, experiments are being conducted in Allahabad on the hospital waste. Regarding municipal wastes, the schemes are operational in 33 units. Thirty schemes from the Ministry of Agriculture, and three from the Ministry of Environment are already operational.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Dr. Raja Ramanna; let us hear the views of a Scientist.

DR. RAJA RAMANNA: Madam, Deputy Chairman, I would like to bring to the attention of the hon. Minister that hospital wastes are one of the most dangerous things that you cannot use from the point of view of waste as such because, you cannot get rid of bacteria and other viral infections—you are yourself a Doctor, Madam, and you know how difficult it is—unless you use radiation treatment to kill all these dangerous bacteria and viruses. The municipal wastes are a different matter. And, this has been tried out in two-three places in India. While the municipal wastes have been removed from our various plants which produce a lot of these wastes, there is nobody to take the waste and use it for refertilisation of the land. This is a problem, not simply of

hospital wastes and municipal wastes, it is a question of economics of the whole problem.

SHRI AJIT SINGH: Madam, we have been helping the municipalities to set up units. As I have mentioned, 30 units have been set up. Since the year 2000, we have been asking the States to send us schemes under the Agriculture Macro Management Scheme; we will continue with that scheme.

SHRI SANTOSH BAGRODIA: Madam, the hon. Minister has mentioned about the Bio-medical Waste Management Rules of 1998. As per those rules, waste treatment, incineration, auto-clave microwave systems in different hospitals were to be in place by December 31; in 500-bed hospitals by 1999 and in 200-bed hospitals by 31st December, 2000. I do not know if the Minister can enlighten us as to how many hospitals have that kind of a system.

Secondly, in India itself, under the home-grown technology programme, the Technology Information Forecasting Assessment Council (TIFAC) has come out with yet another environment-friendly technology, having a high efficient bio-medical waste incinerator. If the hon. Minister knows about it, does he have any plans to introduce it in different hospitals?

SHRI AJIT SINGH: Madam, as regards the first part of his question, we will collect the information and give it to the hon. Member. Secondly, the hon. Member has mentioned about some new technology. Please give information about it and we will look into that.

SHRI H.K. JAVARE GOWDA: Madam, even though the hon. Minister has answered questions about the municipal waste, I would like to point out that the municipal waste and the medical waste, are combined together in almost all the States. They are not segregating these, they are dumping them together. Under these circumstances, the specific question is how is the municipal waste being used for manure. Has any special provision been made to see that the municipal waste and bio-medical waste are segregated and treated separately. As has rightly been pointed out by Dr. Raja Ramanna, the medical waste has a lot of implications for health. We are not taking into consideration all those aspects and are dumping them in the dustbin. That is the problem.

Secondly, the hon. Minister has talked of 30 mechanical compost plants set up all over the country. One of these plants has been set up

[2 August, 2002]

RAJYA SABHA

in Karnataka also. I would like to know how much fund has been invested in it by the Government of India. Kindly let me know.

SHRI AJIT SINGH: By law, the hospital waste has to be disposed of through incineration, chemical treatment, disinfection and auto-claving. As the hon. Member is saying, municipalities are mixing these wastes, I may also point out that most of the municipal waste is being disposed of and is not being used for making compost or anything like that. But we do expect that all the municipalities will follow the law. The law says how the hospital waste has to be disposed of.

SHRI H.K. JAVARE GOWDA: But it is not being done in Karnataka.

SHRI AJIT SINGH: We will bring it to the notice of the concerned Minister and also the concerned State as I said earlier, we have 30 projects for municipal wastes. I am not sure how much funds have been given to which State for these projects, but, all over India, 30 projects have been aided by the Ministry of Agriculture, for using the municipal waste and producing manure.

श्री सतीश प्रधान: मैडम, मेरे सवाल के दो पहलू हैं। मेरी पहली बात म्युनिस्पल वेस्ट के बारे में है। मैडम, हम जो म्युनिसिपल वेस्ट इकट्ठा करते हैं तो इस म्युनिसिपल वेस्ट में घर का तथा फैक्टरी इत्यादि का जो भी वेस्ट है वह सभी एक ही जगह इकट्ठा किया जाता है और म्युनिस्पल डम्पर में डाला जाता है और वहां कलक्शन किया जाता है। वह म्युनिस्पल डम्प में डाला जाता है और वहां पर कलेक्शन होता है। मैं इस विषय पर जानकारी लेना चाहता हूं। आदरणीय मंत्री महोदय क्या इस विषय पर जन-जागृति करने के लिए, लोगों को एजुकेट करने के लिए कि जो वेस्ट है उसको अलग-अलग ढंग से इकट्ठा करके उसको डिस्पोजल पाइंट पर डालने की कोई व्यवस्था करेंगे? यह मेरे प्रश्न का "ए" पार्ट है।

मेरे प्रश्न का "बी" पार्ट मेडिकल वेस्ट के बारे में है या हॉस्पिटल वेस्ट के बारे में है। हमारे यहां बड़े अच्छे डाक्टर्स हैं, अच्छे आपरेशन्स करते हैं और सभी को अच्छी दवाइयां देते हैं, लेकिन ये डाक्टर्स लोग भी जो उनका वेस्ट होता है या हॉस्पिटल का वेस्ट होता है, डिस्पॉजरी का वेस्ट होता है, उसको इसी ढंग से इकट्ठा करते हैं और म्युनिसिपल गारबेज में डाल देते हैं। डाक्टर्स का जो मेडिकल ट्रेनिंग प्रोग्राम होता है उसमें मेडिकल का कोर्स और उससे संबंधित कोर्स पढ़ाया जाता है। मैं मंत्री जी से जानना चाहता हूं कि क्या वे ऐसी कोई व्यवस्था करेंगे कि डाक्टर्स को मेडिकल ट्रेनिंग प्रोग्राम के कोर्स के साथ इस तरह का कोर्स भी पढ़ाया जाए कि वे हॉस्पिटल के वेस्ट को किस तरह से डिस्पोज करें? क्या आप इसके संबंध में संबंधित मंत्रालय से बात करेंगे?

SHRI AJIT SINGH: Madam, I agree with the hon. Member ... (Interruptions).

उपसभापति: एजुकेशन मिनिस्टर साहब भी यहां पर बैठे हैं।

मानव संसाधन विकास मंत्री, विज्ञान और प्रौद्योगिकी मंत्री तथा महासागर विकास मंत्री (डा० मुरली मनोहर जोशी): मैडम, मैं वेस्ट की एजुकेशन नहीं देता हूँ। मैं प्रोडक्टिविटी की एजुकेशन देता हूँ।

SHRI AJIT SINGH: Productivity from waste has to be included in the education now, Madam.

DR. MURLI MANOHAR JOSHI: The question is, if there is a wasteful activity somewhere else, how am I responsible?

SHRI MANOJ BHATTACHARYA: This problem of hospital wastes is an international problem. It has got international dimensions, particularly in the third world countries. I would like to know from the hon. Agriculture Minister whether some study has been made, whether some concrete study has been made if this can be used. This is part one of my question.

उपसभापति: आप एक ही पार्ट पूछ लीजिए क्योंकि वह वही जवाब देने वाले हैं।

SHRI MANOJ BHATTACHARYA: There is a small question, I would like to know whether you are having the knowledge whether, in this country of ours, all the hospitals have adequate arrangements, technical arrangements, to dispose of their wastes.

SHRI AJIT SINGH: Madam, I will collect the relevant information and pass it on to the hon. Member.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Is waste management a State subject or a Central subject?

SHRI AJIT SINGH: It is a very important issue right now. We should all be concerned about it. That is why we want education.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Medical waste is hazardous to health. How to manage it is very important.

DR. MURLI MANOHAR JOSHI: May I just say this? The question of hospital management is now assuming a very significant place in the

[2 August, 2002]

RAJYA SABHA

management of our medical institutions. It is not just the question of medical waste but there are certain other questions related to it. We are, from our side, looking at this point and I have instructed the management institutes to start courses on hospital management wherever it is possible and some of them are framing courses. But I would reiterate that the question of disposing of waste does not fall under my Ministry. It has to be tackled either by the Ministry of Urban Development....(*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let us have a Ministry for Wastes.

DR. MURLI MANOHAR JOSHI: Yes, there can be.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Wasteful management!

THE MINISTER OF ENVIRONMENT AND FORESTS (SHRI T. R. BAALU): It comes under Environment.

श्री सतीश प्रधान: मैडम, सभी डाक्टर्स पढ़े-लिखे होते हैं, लेकिन ये सभी डाक्टर्स इतने एजुकेटेड होने के बावजूद भी हॉस्पिटल के वेस्ट को ऐसे ही डलवा देते हैं...।

उपसभापति: सतीश प्रधान जी, आप तो प्रश्न पूछ चुके हैं।

श्री सतीश प्रधान: डाक्टर्स लोग वेस्ट का मैनेजमेंट ठीक ढंग से नहीं करते हैं। हॉस्पिटल वेस्ट मैनेजमेंट को भी उनकी एजुकेशन का पार्ट बनाने की आवश्यकता है। उनको यह समझाने की आवश्यकता है कि उनकी भी कुछ रेसपांसेबिलिटी है।

उपसभापति: कुछ जिम्मेदारी पब्लिक के इलेक्ट्रिड रिप्रजेंटेटिव्स की भी है। उनको भी अपनी-अपनी कांस्टीट्यूएंसी में लोगों को एजुकेट करने की जरूरत है how to do waste management. सब कचरा अलग-अलग डाल दें। सब कचरा इधर-उधर न डालें। लोगों की भी अपनी कुछ जिम्मेदारी है।

PROF. M. SANKARALINGAM: Madam, the hon. Minister has stated in his reply that the Ministry of Agriculture has provided funds for setting up of 30 mechanical compost plants for production of compost from bio-degradable municipal waste for use as manure. I would like to know from the hon. Minister the names of States where these 30 mechanical compost plants are located. Secondly, I want to know... (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That is all. Now, let other hon. Members put questions. (*Interruptions*)

PROF. M. SANKARALINGAM: I would request the hon. Minister to enlighten us about the rules framed in this regard. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI AJIT SINGH: Madam, we have a list of States where these plants are located, and we will send it to the hon. Member.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You lay it on the Table of the House.

SHRI AJIT SINGH: All right Madam.

SHRI PRASANTA CHATTERJEE: Madam, at one point of time, the Supreme Court had constituted a committee to deal with the subject of municipal wastes. I am aware of this thing because of my association with Kolkata as a Mayor. Now, the point is, the hospital waste has to be segregated from the municipal waste, and then disposed of. A separate arrangement for disposal of the hospital waste is a very important issue so far as the question of health of people in the metropolitan cities is concerned. Although I know that this subject does not fall within the ambit of the Ministry of Agriculture, yet it comes within the purview of the Government of India. I would also like to know about the industrial waste. We can make power out of the industrial waste and the question of formation of manure is also there. I know that two years back, we had started that project in Kolkata. We have no problem regarding the availability of Garbage. We have 1400 metric tonnes of municipal waste in Kolkata. We have started generating manure out of the municipal wastes. And, so far as the question of hospital waste is concerned, we started disposing it of separately. I would like to know from the Minister whether the Government will take up related matter with the State Governments and the local bodies.

SHRI AJIT SINGH: Madam, I am not sure what information the hon. Member wants to seek. As I said earlier, the waste management is a very important issue, so much waste is being generated now that we really look at this question very seriously. I need the Chair's protection, because, my predecessor started accepting questions in this regard. No one else accepts questions on this issue. The Ministry of Agriculture accepts question on this issue. So, the question of wastes come under the Ministry of Agriculture.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Minister, I would like to remind you one thing. One day, I had told you that the water management was not

[2 August, 2002]

RAJYA SABHA

under your Ministry. At that time, you had said: "The Ministry of Agriculture covers everything." So, it is your own admission.

SHRI AJIT SINGH: But, exclude the waste management.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Time management is my job, and I think, enough time has been spent on this question without getting much support. Now Question No. 282. (*Interruptions*) I have to manage questions. The job of the Chairperson is, if the answer is going to be the same, he should move on to the other question. (*Interruptions*).

Forest area for Rope-way in A.P.

*282. SHRI K. RAMA MOHANA RAO: Will the Minister of ENVIRONMENT AND FORESTS be pleased to state:

(a) whether any request has been received from Andhra Pradesh Government for surveying the forest area of Sri Venkateswara Wildlife Sanctuary, for a rope-way project;

(b) if so, the details of the request; and

(c) the steps contemplated by the Ministry in this regard?

THE MINISTER FOR ENVIRONMENT AND FORESTS (SHRI T. R. BAALU): (a) to (c) A statement is laid on the Table of the House.

Statement

(a) and (b) A request has been received from Government of Andhra Pradesh for undertaking a survey in Sri Venkateswara Wildlife Sanctuary for installation of a modern rope-way to connect Tirumala and Tirupati.

(c) The Ministry has accorded permission for carrying out preliminary survey for installation of the rope-way subject to the conditions that during the process of survey no tree will be felled or vegetation including grass removed as contained in the order of Supreme Court dated 14.2.2000 in Writ Petition No. 202/1995. The permission for survey is not to be construed as any commitment on the part of the Ministry to support the project. The proposal will ultimately also need the approval of the Indian Board for Wildlife and the Supreme Court.