

DISCUSSION ON THE WORKING OF THE MINISTRY OF HUMAN RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): We will now take up the Discussion on the working of the Ministry of Human Resource Development. ...*(Interruptions)*... Shri Shantaram Laxman Naik to initiate the discussion. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SHANTARAM LAXMAN NAIK (Goa): Sir, I stand here to speak on the working of the Ministry of Human Resource Development. ...*(Interruptions)*... Sir, I stand here ...*(Interruptions)*... Sir, our education system ...*(Interruptions)*... initiatives taken by Jawaharlal Nehru. Jawaharlal Nehru was interested in seeing that the country prospered in the field of education. ...*(Interruptions)*...

Sir, Jawaharlalji was of the opinion that only through education the country could move forward. ...*(Interruptions)*...

Sir, my rights are violated. That is a breach of privilege of my right. ...*(Interruptions)*... My rights are violated. Sir, this is a breach of privilege. ...*(Interruptions)*... My right is being violated. Sir, kindly take action. I request you to take *suo motu* action, because it is a breach of privilege. ...*(Interruptions)*... I am not being allowed to speak on an important discussion. ...*(Interruptions)*... Sir, hon. Members have been violating. This constitutes a breach of privilege. ...*(Interruptions)*... The hon. Deputy Leader of Opposition is denying me the right to speak. ...*(Interruptions)*... Sir, I want, without waiting; you take *suo motu* action. ...*(Interruptions)*... मेरे अधिकारों की रक्षा करो। ...*(व्यवधान)*... मेरे अधिकारों की रक्षा करो। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

THE RULING OF THE CHAIR

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज: क्या इस तरह से हाउस चलाना चाहिए। ...*(व्यवधान)*... आप लीडर्स की मीटिंग बुलाइए और चैम्बर में यह मैटर सॉर्ट आउट कीजिए। ...*(व्यवधान)*... आप अंदर चैम्बर में मीटिंग बुलाइए। इस तरह से हाउस नहीं चलता जैसे आप चला रहे हैं।

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Don't hold the House to ransom. ...*(Interruptions)*... The House cannot be adjourned. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज: ...*(व्यवधान)*... एक के बाद दूसरी मीटिंग ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री एस0एस0 अहलुवालिया:ऐसे ही हाउस चलता रहेगा जब तक आप *(व्यवधान)*This is not

going to serve the purpose, Sir. ...*(Interruptions)*... You are curbing the right of a Member to speak. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Sir, you should not adjourn the House. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: You can say whatever you like. ...*(Interruptions)*... They can do whatever they like. ...*(Interruptions)*... They can do. ...*(Interruptions)*... They can do it. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI VIPLOVE THAKUR (Himachal Pradesh): You have to respect the Chair. ...*(Interruptions)*... Sir, if they cannot respect the Chair, why are they here? ...*(Interruptions)*... They have to respect the Chair. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: You cannot dictate to the House. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI VIPLOVE THAKUR: Sir, every time, this happens; every time ...*(Interruptions)*... No Question Hour; no discussion on such an important issue like this. ...*(Interruption^)*... What is this, Sir? ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Sir, they cannot dictate to the House. ...*(Interruptions)*... The House cannot be adjourned. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA (Assam): You are talking about curtailing the right of a Member to speak, but you are not allowing Mr. Naik to speak! ...*(Interruptions)*... He has to speak in this House, but you are interrupting him; you are not allowing him. This is how you behave! ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT (West Bengal): Sir, you can start the discussion. ...*(Interruptions)*... Start the discussion ...*(Interruptions)*... Sir, start the discussion. ...*(Interruptions)*... Start the discussion ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SHANTARAM LAXMAN NAIK: Sir, in 1968, the Education Ministry was ...*(Interruptions)*... with the initiative of Pt. Jawaharlal Nehru.

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: Sir, he is speaking from the first row. He is violating the rules. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SHANTARAM LAXMAN NAIK: I have taken the permission. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: He is not speaking from his seat. What is this, Sir? ...*(Interruptions)*... He cannot speak from the first row? ...*(Interruptions)*... Rules cannot be violated. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: You are talking about violating the rules! What rule are you following? ...*(Interruptions)*... You are not allowing him to speak. ...*(Interruptions)*... You should also follow the rules. ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Rules cannot be violated. I am happy that Ahluwaliaji is saying that rules cannot be violated! I am happy. ...*(Interruptions)*... Rules cannot be violated. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: We are not violating the rules. ...*(Interruptions)*... We are trying to protect the right of a Member to speak. ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): This is violation of the rules. ...*(Interruptions)*... What you are doing is violation of rules. ...*(Interruptions)*... We are saying that rules cannot be violated. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: You cannot curtail the right of the House and. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: What is this, Sir? ...*(Interruptions)*... What is the rule? ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: They can do that. ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): You want to violate the rules and get away with that. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज: सर, बीएससी की मीटिंग बुलवाइये। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): You want to violate the rules and get away with that. ...*{Interruptions}*... When there is a small violation from that side, you are arguing. ...*{Interruptions}*... But you can violate the rules any number of times. ...*{Interruptions}*...

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज: सर, आप इस मसले को sort out करवाइये। ...*(व्यवधान)*... वह चैम्बर में होगा। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

(wreqFT)... This matter has to be sorted out first. ...*{Interruptions}*... This matter has to be sorted out first. ...*{Interruptions}*... You call a meeting of the leaders. ...*{Interruptions}*... DR. K. KESHAVA RAO (Andhra Pradesh): Sir, we agree that there can be a debate. ...*{Interruptions}*... We should express our concern. ...*{Interruptions}*... The House should express its concern, but not through blackmail or armtwisting or not through saying that the Chairman has no right to pass the order. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री प्रकाश जावड़ेकर: हम इसी पर चर्चा करना चाहते हैं। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

DR. K. KESHAVA RAO: You give a notice ...*{Interruptions}*... THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Please sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज: सर, आप हाउस एडजर्न्ड करके मीटिंग बुलवाइये। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

DR. K. KESHAVA RAO: We want a debate. ...*{Interruptions}*...

SHRI PRAVEEN RASHTRAPAL (Gujarat): You are anti-democratic. ...*Interruptions*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Please. ...*{Interruptions}*...

श्री प्रकाश जावड़ेकर : आपके लिए कर रहे हैं, आपके लिए लड़ रहे हैं, डेमोक्रेसी के लिए लड़ रहे हैं, सबके लिए लड़ रहे हैं। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

DR. K. KESHAVA RAO: No. We don't need your help. ...*(Interruptions)*... We don't want your help to defend us. ...*(Interruptions)*... We are strong enough to defend ourselves. ...*(Interruptions)*... Don't bother about us. We are strong enough to defend ourselves. ...*(Interruptions)*... Don't bother. ...*(Interruptions)*... We don't want these wrong defences. ...*(Interruptions)*... Don't bother. ...*(Interruptions)*... If we want, we can defend ourselves. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI PRAKASH JAVADEKAR: You should be thankful to us. ...*(Interruptions)*... You should be grateful to us. ...*(Interruptions)*... We are fighting for the Members' right. ...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. K. KESHAVA RAO: Don't bother. ...*(Interruptions)*... We shall not do that. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI PRAKASH JAVADEKAR: We are fighting for the Members' right. ...*(Interruptions)*... We are fighting for decency in the House. ...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. K. KESHAVARAO: Sir, all of us are really feeling sorry. ...*(Interruptions)*... Nobody is saying that our colleagues should be sent out. ...*(Interruptions)*... Nobody. I don't think anyone of us here are happy. ...*(Interruptions)*... But the question today is that the Chairman had taken a decision after hearing what exactly the point was. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज: सर, आप हाउस एडजर्न्ड करके मीटिंग बुलवाइये।...*(व्यवधान)*... You call a meeting....*(Interruptions)*... Let it be sorted out first. ...*(Interruptions)*... It can't be sorted out in the House. ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Only the speech of Shri Shantaram Laxman Naik would go on record. Nothing else will go on record. ...*(Interruptions)*...

**DISCUSSION ON THE WORKING OF THE MINISTRY OF HUMAN
RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT—cont.**

SHRI SHANTARAM LAXMAN NAIK: As I was saying, it was at the instance of Late Shri Jawaharlal Nehru that 1968 Education Policy was enacted. That policy reiterates that the Government of India is convinced that a radical reconstruction of education on broad lines recommended by the Education Commission is essential for economic and cultural development of the country. ...*(Interruptions)*... National integration and for realising an ideal socialistic pattern of society. ...*(Interruptions)*... This will involve a transformation of the system. ...*(Interruptions)*... to expand education opportunities, sustained and intensive efforts to raise the quality of education at all stages and emphasis on the development of science and technology and cultivation of social and moral values. This was the emphasis laid by late Jawaharlal Nehru when 1968 policy was framed. It was on the basis of 1968 Education Policy that the nation had ...*(Interruptions)*... marched forward towards achieving the goals of education. Then came the 1986 Education Policy which was a reformative policy. This initiative was taken by Rajivji. It was Rajiv ji who took the initiative of enacting the 1986 Education Policy. And I recollect, Sir, that I was a member of the other house when the New Education Policy of 1986 was adopted.

...*(Interruptions)*...

As I said, Sir, in 1986, Rajiv ji took the initiative of having a discussion in the House, before the 1986 policy was adopted. After the Draft Policy was discussed in both the Houses, an Action Taken Report was also discussed exhaustively. Therefore, Sir, it was by means of a thorough Parliamentary debate that the 1986 policy was enacted. However, Sir, a policy by itself does not have a statutory force. All policies should have the force of statute. Accordingly, laws are amended from time-to-time

....*(Interruptions)*...

Now, Sir, when NDA was in power, they sought the circumvention of the whole Education Policy of the Government. ...*(Interruptions)*... It was the NDA which sought to change the history of the nation. It was the NDA which tried to denigrate Mahatma Gandhi and glorified Nathuram Godse. This was their Education Policy. ...*(Interruptions)*... The whole country had opposed the saffronisation of our educational policy. It is the NDA, which tried to wipe out the principle of secularism from the ethos of this country. They sought to do it through the medium of education. They realised that the people of the country are secular. They realised that the people believed in the principle of secularism. Therefore, they chose the medium of education of finish secularism in the country. ...*(Interruptions)*... Eminent scholars who believed in the principles of secularism were removed from the posts they were holding. ... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI PRAKASH JAVADEKAR: I have a point of order, Sir.