

- (iv) One Hundred thirty-eighth Report on Demands for Grants (2008-09) of Ministry of Civil Aviation; and
- (v) One Hundred thirty-ninth Report on the Motor Vehicle (Amendment) Bill, 2007.

### REPORTS OF THE PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE

DR. K. MALAISAMY (Tamil Nadu): Sir, I lay on the Table, a copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following Reports of the Public Accounts Committee (2007-2008):

- (i) Sixty-ninth Report on Injudicious release of Grants by the University Grants Commission (UGC);
- (ii) Seventieth Report on Action Taken on Forty Report of PAC (Fourteenth Lok Sabha) on Avoidable expenditure due to delay in taking decision-Chennai Port Trust; and
- (iii) Seventieth Report on Action Taken on Fiftieth Report of PAC (Fourteenth Lok Sabha) on Delay in finalisation of demands.

### MOTION FOR ELECTION TO THE COMMITTEE ON OFFICIAL LANGUAGE

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF HOME AFFAIRS (DR. SHAKEEL AHMAD): Sir, I move the following Motion:

"That in pursuance of Sub-section (2) of Section 4 of the Official Languages Act, 1963 (19 of 1963), this House do proceed to elect, in accordance with the system of proportional representation by means of single transferable vote, four members from among the members of the House to be the members of the Committee on Official language in the vacancies that had occurred therein due to the retirement of Prof. Ram Deo Bhandary, Prof. Alka Balram Kshatriya, Dr. Prabha Thakur and Shri Ravula Chandra Sekar Reddy on the 9th April, 2008 from the membership of Rajya Sabha.

*The question was put and the motion was moved.*

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज: सर, लीडर ऑफ द ओपोज़िशन कुछ कहना चाहते हैं।

### MATTERS RAISED WITH PERMISSION CONTROVERSY INVOLVING A UNION CABINET MINISTER

THE LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (SHRI JASWANT SINGH): Sir, my first request is, if some of the ministerial consultation...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no. They are there.

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: Sir, conversation is parliamentary; Ministerial consultation is unparliamentary. That was my submission.

MR. DEPUTY CHARMAN: There is no ministerial consultation.

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: Sir, interruption is, in fact, further unparliamentary. Even shaking of the head is unbecoming and unbehoving of the Ministers, particularly if they are Ministers of State! (*Interruptions*)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let us come to the subject. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY (West Bengal): Sir, what have you permitted? *(Interruptions)*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The Leader of the Opposition just wants to say something. *(Interruptions)*

MS. MABEL REBELLO (Jharkhand): What is the issue? *(Interruptions)*

DR. V. MAITREYAN (Tamil Nadu): Sir, ...*(Interruptions)*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The Leader of the Opposition has sought permission make some submission. ...*(Interruptions)*... You need not Interfere in to my work. ...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, when the Leader of the Opposition rises to speak, he must be allowed to speak, there is no dispute on that. But the House would only like to be informed of the subject. *(Interruptions)*

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज (मध्य प्रदेश): बोलने दीजिए।

श्री सीताराम येचुरी: उनको क्या परमिट किया है?

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: In the morning, there was a notice given by Dr. Murli Manohar Joshi. On that, it was agreed that the Leader of the Opposition would make a submission.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: On which subject?

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: On Zero Hour submission. ...*(Interruptions)*

DR. MURLI MANOHAR JOSHI (Uttarakhand): Sir, through you, let me inform the hon. Member that it was for the suspension of the Question Hour on the continued intervention by the Prime Minister's office in pressuring a certain ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Joshiji, please. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: I only request please let him speak and make the submission. I have also given a notice for the suspension of the Question Hour and it was also agreed that it can be raised in the Zero Hour.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Your name is there. ...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: I have also given a notice. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Your name is also there. ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS AND MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PLANNING SHRI V. NARAYANASAMI: Sir, will you permit me?

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No. Let the Leader of the Opposition finish.

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: Sir, this is the third continuous day when we are persuaded to raise the issue of certain statements made in the House, demands raised in the House, and issues published, in detail, in the Press. Every additional day that the response of the Government is delayed or is not forthcoming makes this issue more complex, more complicated and certainly more worrying, because this continued silence and a deliberate obstruction

of Parliament from arriving at the truth and certainly being satisfied about what our concerns are is a matter of a very great concern. What are the issues? I say 'issues' because they are plural; it earlier started with a singular, which was the conduct of the particular Minister, a Union Cabinet Minister. It also resulted in a rather unfortunate application of Rule 255, which in itself had come into this House after a gap of almost twenty years. But that is not any longer the issue because we were consulted in a process, in a meeting, which normally we do not cite here. So, I shall let that, for the moment pass because certain other issues which are neither extraneous nor tangential are involved. Indeed central and the principal one of it is, Sir, an unhindered right to function in the House, which is not the sole prerogative or only of the Treasury Benches or the Ministers. Our concern becomes ...*(Interruption)*...

SHRI SHANTARAM LAXMAN NAIK (Goa): For one-and-a-half hours, I was not allowed to speak...*(Interruption)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Naik, Please. ...*(Interruption)*...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Before that I was prevented. I am senior to you. ...*(Interruption)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Maitreyan, why do you get up every time? ...*(Interruption)*... No, it is not your duty to regulate the House. It is my duty to regulate the House ...*(Interruption)*...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: I am not regulating the House.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please, don't enter into argument. It will not serve any purpose.

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: Yes, Sir, I am sure it does not serve any purpose. But, this ruling from the Chair applies really to the House. It is a ruling, which covers the entire House. I am sure that is what you mean.

There is a certain Minister, a dear friend of mine, who has worked with me, a friend of long standing, because he has said so himself in this House, therefore, I have now no difficulty in stating his name. Shri T.R. Baalu makes a certain statement in the House which is a consequence of certain publications in the Press about gas allocations to a company that he is interested in. Now, the issue was whether the Minister's son ought to be writing to the Prime Minister.

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA (Tamil Nadu): Sir, I am on a point of order.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: There is no point of order.

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: You should hear me. You should allow me.

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Under which rule?

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: Under Rule 238, I have a point of order.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes, what is your point of order?

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: Sir, as per Rule 238, a Member, while speaking, shall not refer to any matter of fact on which a judicial decision is pending. The supply of natural gas to the particular firm, which he is mentioning, is pending in the Delhi High Court and the Chair has to give a ruling whether it should be discussed here or not.

SHRI ARUN SHOURIE (Uttar Pradesh): Why, did you not object when the Minister, Shri T.R. Baalu, mentioned it?

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: My humble submission is whether as per the procedure, we can discuss any matter, which is pending in the Court, in the House or not.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Siva, if he refers to any matter which is *sub judice*, it will not be allowed. But, here, he is referring to some statement made by the Minister himself in the House. Let us distinguish...(Interruptions). Please, if he mentions about the case which is pending in the High Court, I will not allow. I am just listening to the reference of the Minister's statement made in the House; not on anything else.

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA (Jharkhand): Sir, the Minister himself mentioned the name...(Interruptions).

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: Sir, the hon. Minister, Shri T.R. Baalu has himself mentioned it. Otherwise, I would pay full heed to the point of order and do agree that if the matter is *sub judice*, and the Chair rules that it is *sub judice*, it should not be discussed in the House. But, this is a complicated thing. It will be only when the charges are framed, or issues defined; charges framed in a criminal court in a criminal case; issues defined in a civil case. The hon. Minister here stands up and says, "Yes, what have I done wrong? Nothing. I really asked for gas." So, he is very diligent in asking for gas because in a period of, I think, starting from 13th November to 4th February, he has written eight letters. I am sure, he was simultaneously attending, very diligently, to his portfolio also and fully attending to the affairs of the Ministry that he is in charge of. Now, he writes eight times to the Prime Minister. Any of these says, "This is the company etc". Extraneously, he brings in certain political parties. I happened to know the facts preceding it. Therefore, I kept quiet and the BJP has nothing to do with it at all and I explained that also. Now, frequently, the Tamil Nadu politics goes through, what I call, in change of skin. In the change of skin, those who are with us, and those who are against us, and those who are currently meeting, might well go against you day after tomorrow...(Interruptions). It is true. It applies to all.

Having asserted, yes, we did do so, and, what is wrong with it, rather defiantly in the House, Sir, my friends and colleagues then got up to explain to the good Minister what is wrong in all this. And the other hon. Members of the House are not permitted to say what they wish to say then. That is what led me to say that the Right to Expression, to give voice is uniform whether it is those who sit to the right of the Chair, or the left of the Chair.

We are seated to the left to the Chair; a little earlier we were sitting there. Sir, the Right to Expression or give voice to what we hold is uniform. Now, therefore, the wrongs that have been committed in this are the following. Sir, we have been prevented, and, this is the 4th day-three days running-and, my esteemed colleague, a very famous physician in Tamil Nadu was prevented from saying...(Interruptions).

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN (Tamil Nadu): Sir, what is the point in telling all this? (Interruptions) It is not going to...(Interruptions).

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: Sir,, I don't think, impatience...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, we also have some important issues...(Interruptions).

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: If Members are using some expressions, I cannot control.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: But, Sir, this is something...(Interruptions).

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No no. Please let him...*(Interruptions)*.

SHRI D. RAJA (Tamil Nadu): Sir, is it Short Duration Discussion or...*(Interruptions)*. The Chair should clear it.*(Interruptions)*.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: One minute please...*(Interruptions)*.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Sir, how much time will...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The matter that is being raised is to be discussed. The Right to Expression of any Member cannot be curtailed. There are rules according to which it should be discussed. If a notice is given according to the rules, it will be looked into.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, my only request is that as a result of this, the other notices that have been admitted should not be guillotined. You please ensure it. It is your responsibility; it is the responsibility of the Chair.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: My submission is that if any Member wants to express anything in the House, his right should not be curtailed. It should be followed according to the rules of procedure.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: But, at the same time, Sir, *(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Sir, it is not the right to...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI D. RAJA: Sir, everybody should have an equal opportunity.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Sir, after the Leader of Opposition speaks...*(Interruptions)*... I do not understand...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: Sir, the hon. Member protests too much. But if they hear me out, perhaps, they would not protest so much. What I was saying, Sir, what are these wrongs committed. First wrong committed is promotion of a company in which an hon. Minister, leave alone a Minister, an hon. Member has direct or indirect interest and promoting the interest of such company does cause concern because it is conflict of interest prohibited, debarred, frowned upon by a Parliamentary practice.

If we continue to subserve our interests at the cost of Parliament and public interest, somewhere it will get noticed, and, in this case, Sir, promoting the interests of his own company, is a conflict of interest.

Sir, I will now tell you the second wrong. Sir, eight times, the hon. Minister writes to the Prime Minister's Office. And, I have, here, one of the copies of the last letter written by the Prime Minister's Office. It mentions the usual things; that is, 4th of February, Prime Minister's Office, South Block, New Delhi, etc.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Sir, is this authenticated? Who is authenticating it?

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: Yes, yes, I do not think the hon. Member has to be so impatient. I do assert that this is the true version of what was written by the Prime Minister's Office. I authenticate it. It is the same thing. It is the same thing. If a statement is being made, Sir, that the Prime Minister Office is separate to the Prime Minister—and that is a very strange assertion—it is like saying the office of the hon. the Agriculture and Civil Supplies Minister is separate from the functioning of the Ministry of Agriculture and Civil Supplies. The office

is a direct extension of the Prime Minister's responsibility...*(Interruptions)*... It is also, Sir, and I am coming to what his responsibility, therefore, to the House is. Here, it says, reference is invited to this office I.D. note of even number of 13.11.07, reminder is of 27th, within fortnight, 03.12.07, 19.12.07, 11.01.08, 21.01.08 regarding the letter from so and so Shri S. Bahadur, Director, Kings India Power Corporation Limited on the High Court Judgement on allocation of gas. You wanted to know, Sir. This letter is, of course, authenticated and I will place it on the...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You have said about three points.

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: I am coming to the next point, Sir. It is substantial. Now, there is a request, Sir, which is a direct thing, "Report as requested in the matter may kindly be expedited". The report expedition means, "Why? Please give me the report quickly". That is the meaning of that in the Government. So, we would like to know what was meant.

Thirdly, Sir, the Prime Minister's conduct is directly involved here. We do not accept that what is stated by the Prime Minister's Office is separate to what the Prime Minister's responsibility is. I too, Sir, had the benefit of holding a variety of offices. If any body, any officer, in the various Ministries that I had held, made any statement, I stood up there and said it is my responsibility. I shall be answerable to the House. The officer is not answerable to the House. Therefore, here, now to say that the Office of the Prime Minister is not the same as the Prime Minister is a very curious, very very curious thesis.*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That point is made. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: Now, they are shaking their heads.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I can't say don't shake your hands.

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: And, they do not have to demonstrate their extra assertive loyalty by prematurely shaking their heads. ...*(Interruptions)*... I expect no loyalty from ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no...*(Interruptions)*... You see, it happens on either side. So, let us not go into that. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: Sir, I quite agree that sycophancy is the order of the day. How can you have loyalty then?

Sir, then, it is the Prime Minister's conduct. We also have, rather, a belligerent attitude of a very energetic Minister, when Mr. Baalu stands up here belligerently and says, "What wrong have I done?" We would like the Prime Minister to explain to the House whether he also thinks that the Minister, Mr. Baalu, has done no wrong.

Then, next wrong, Sir, is of the Petroleum Minister. The hon. Petroleum Minister, to whom or to which office these 8 reminders are sent, Mr. Deora, I do not think it is illegal to name him. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI SUSHMA SWARAJ: He is also a member of this House.

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: He is also a Member of this House. I came with an impression, Mr. Deputy Chairman that Mr. Deora, as the recipient Minister, of 8 communications from the Prime Minister's office, has not answered. Then, this is the third Minister. The Prime Minister, Mr. Baalu and Mr. Deora. Now, all the three Ministers, the persistence with which the questions arise about their conduct is also wrong, Sir.

The further wrong is that thereafter, the Government continues to ignore our concern. This is the fourth day we are having to raise it, Sir. You cannot continue to do this. We demand, therefore, that the Prime Minister, please come and clarify this whole situation. If they now start saying that the Prime Minister is not answerable for his Government or for his Ministers, that would be a very curious thesis. And, then, it should no longer remain हमारे शरद बाबू ने जो एक बहुत लम्बी कौड़ी फेंकी थी, बड़ी लम्बी कौड़ी थी। काफी दिनों तक लोगों को समझ में नहीं आया कि हमारे महाराष्ट्र के नेता ने क्या कौड़ी फेंकी है। उन्होंने कह दिया ... (व्यवधान)... जो पहले सुन चुके हैं ... (व्यवधान)... उन्होंने कौड़ी फेंकी थी कि हमारे कोई ... (व्यवधान)... उनको प्रधान मंत्री बना दीजिए ... (व्यवधान)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Other Members also want to participate in it.

श्री जसवन्त सिंह: ऐसी कौड़ी फेंक कर उन्होंने सबको गफलत में डाल दिया। वे अक्सर ऐसी कौड़ी फेंकते हैं। अगर प्रधान मंत्री जी को सब मिल कर हटाना चाहते हैं, तो तुरन्त हटाएं ... (व्यवधान)... या प्रधान मंत्री जी यहां आकर जवाब दें ... (व्यवधान)... हमको यह जवाब चाहिए। We do want an answer from the Prime Minister.

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज: सर, एलओपी ने बहुत substantial issues उठाए हैं, इन पर गवर्नमेंट का response आना चाहिए।

श्री मुरली मनोहर जोशी: उपसभापति जी, मैंने यह दरखास्त की थी कि माननीय प्रधान मंत्री जी इस सम्बन्ध में आकर सदन को ... (व्यवधान)...

श्री उपसभापति: आप मुझे बताइए। This House functions on the basis of rules and procedure. You have raised an issue. Under which Rule ... (Interruptions)...

DR. MURLI MANOHAR JOSHI: Sir. ... (Interruptions)...

श्री उपसभापति: मेरी भी बात सुन लीजिए ... (व्यवधान)... बाद में आप जो बोलना चाहते हैं, बोलिए सवाल यहां पर यह है कि आज आपने यहां एक इश्यू raise किया है कि यहां पर प्राइम मिनिस्टर को बुलाना है या और किसी मिनिस्टर को बुलाना है। This House functions on the basis of rules and procedures. You give a notice under a rule and substantiate the issues. We will have a discussion on the issues which you have raised. Based on the rules, the Chair will decide. If the subject relates to Prime Minister, Prime Minister will answer, and if the subject relates to Petroleum Minister, Petroleum Minister will answer or whoever be the Minister ... (Interruptions)...

श्री मुरली मनोहर जोशी: उपसभापति जी, ... (व्यवधान)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: If you say other than that, how can the Chair direct? ... (Interruptions)...

श्री मुरली मनोहर जोशी: उपसभापति जी, एथिक्स कमेटी के कुछ प्रोविजंस हैं ... (व्यवधान)... सर, एथिक्स कमेटी के भी कुछ प्रोविजंस हैं। ... (व्यवधान)...

श्री उपसभापति: उसके लिए भी नोटिस दे सकते हैं ... (व्यवधान)... I agree that there is the Ethics Committee and there are other Committees which can examine these matters. But you have to give a notice.

श्री मुरली मनोहर जोशी: उपसभापति जी, केवल इतनी दरखास्त है कि एलओपी ने जो कुछ कहा है, सरकार उस पर response करे। हम यही चाहते हैं कि सारा मामला transparency के साथ ... (व्यवधान)...

श्री उपसभापति: मैं मानता हूं, इसके लिए आप under relevant rules नोटिस दीजिए, it will be examined. Shri Sitaram Yechury.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Thank you, Sir. ...*(Interruptions)*... I want to raise an issue which is connected with the people of the country. It is very unfortunate that ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री उपसभापति: आपका भी इसमें नाम है, मैं आपको बुलाता हूँ।

It is not like that. I am telling you that there are eight matters, I will call one by one; all cannot be called simultaneously. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री उदय प्रताप सिंह (उत्तर प्रदेश): उनको कमाल अख्तर के बाद ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री उपसभापति: उनको भी बुलाऊंगा ...*(व्यवधान)*... उदय प्रताप सिंह जी, ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री उदय प्रताप सिंह: सर, एलओपी के लिए तो मान लिया ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री उपसभापति: यह एक छोटा मैटर है, इसके लिए आप क्यों ऐसा करते हैं ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री उदय प्रताप सिंह: सर, यह नम्बर से है ...*(व्यवधान)*... आपकी लिस्ट में किसका नम्बर पहले है ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री उपसभापति: उदय प्रताप सिंह जी, अब उनका नाम बुला दिया है, तो उनको तो बोलने दीजिए ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री उदय प्रताप सिंह: आप उनको बोलने का मौका तो दीजिए ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज: सर, इस इश्यू पर सरकार का response तो आना चाहिए ...*(व्यवधान)*...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Sir, my notice is on the same issue. *(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I know. ...*(Interruptions)*... मैं बुलाऊंगा ...*(व्यवधान)*... आप बैठिए ...*(व्यवधान)*...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: I just want to know if it is a connected matter. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज: सर, एलओपी ने इश्यू क्या talk-out करने के लिए बोला है जो इश्यू उन्होंने उठाया है, दूसरे व्यक्ति को बुलाने से पहले आप उस पर सरकार का response तो दिलवाइए ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री उपसभापति: अब सरकार response नहीं कर रही है, तो मैं क्या करूँ! ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज: आखिरकार नेता विपक्ष ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री उपसभापति: सरकार response नहीं कर रही है, तो मैं क्या करूँ! ...*(व्यवधान)*... मैं मानता हूँ ...*(व्यवधान)*... I cannot direct it to respond in the matter which is raised ...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: I want the Prime Minister to come to the House. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You want it. ...*(Interruptions)*... But I cannot direct that the Prime Minister should come without a notice on anything. I cannot direct ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, you have to protect me. I need your protection. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have called you. ...*(Interruptions)*... You can mention. ...*(Interruptions)*... If they are disturbing...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, it concerns them also. ...*(Interruptions)*... This is the Prime Minister's Office which says that raising the issue of price rise is ...*(Interruptions)*... Sir, I want to raise an issue of the people. ...*(Interruptions)*...



DR. V. MAITREYAN: Sir, ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You have given a notice, I will call you. ...*(Interruptions)*... But there is nothing like that if it is a related matter, it will be called simultaneously. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, I take a very strong objection to the official response of the Prime Minister's Office ...*(Interruptions)*... political parties raising ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: If the Government is not responding, what can I do? ...*(Interruptions)*... The Government is here ...*(Interruptions)*... If they choose not to respond, what can I do ...*(Interruptions)*... Dr. Maitreyan, you can refer to the rules. But you do not follow the rules. ...*(Interruptions)*... But the Chair has to follow the rules, ...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: The Government has to follow the code of conduct. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It is really unfortunate that we are not able to transact business according to the rules. ...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Sir, the country is not getting answer from the Prime Minister.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Maitreyan, it is your impression. But this House functions according to the Rules of Procedure ...*(Interruptions)*... The country is there, the country will function, the country will remain. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज: सर, गवर्नमेंट को आप यह तो कहें कि वह रिसपांस दे।

DR. V. MAITREYAN: The country will remain, but this Government will not remain. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You can express your views according to the rules. ...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: I have been prevented from doing so. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have not prevented you. You have not given the notice. ...*(Interruptions)*... I am calling you. ...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Okay, you can call me under rule 255...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Ahluwalia, you were also in the Government. When you are in the Government, and you choose not to respond, the Chair cannot do anything. ...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: For the last 3 days, I am giving notice...*(Interruptions)*...

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज: सर, पार्लियामेंटरी अफेयर्स मिनिस्टर खड़े हो कर कुछ कहना चाह रहे हैं।

DR. MURLI MANOHAR JOSHI: Sir, he is ready to respond.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: If the Government choose not to respond, the Chair cannot do anything. The hon. Leader of the Opposition has said what he wanted to say. The Chair has given an opportunity to him to say whatever he wanted to say. He has made his point. The Government is not choosing to reply. So, what can I do? ...*(Interruptions)*... There are other matters also. ...*(Interruptions)*... Sushmaji, in the meeting you said that the hon. Leader of the Opposition will be speaking ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, it is most unfortunate that they are not allowing the House to function. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I cannot direct the Government because it is not according to the rules. How can I direct the Government? ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: It is very unfortunate that they are not reacting to the charge of the Prime Minister. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: If the Government wants to respond, I will be happy. If the Government does not respond, I cannot do it. The Minister of Parliamentary Affairs wants to respond. He volunteered to respond, and I am allowing him. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI SUSHMA SWARAJ: Sir, he wanted to respond at that time also. ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE MINISTER OF OVERSEAS INDIAN AFFAIRS AND THE MINISTER OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRI VAYALAR RAVI): Even though the Deputy Chairman has already mentioned about the rules and everything, I am not seized of that. I fully agree with your view. At the same time, the hon. Leader of the Opposition raised an issue which had been raised earlier also. Certain new points have been brought. Definitely, the Government will look into what he said and the response will come later.

DR. V. MAITREYAN: When? ...*(Interruption)*...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, I am raising a matter of great importance, and I wish my colleagues from the other side... *(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: One minute. It is Zero Hour, So, confine to 3 minutes.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: I wish you had the same standard for others.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That is not Zero Hour. That is the prerogative of the Leader of the Opposition.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: There is no hour, only zero.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : These rules have been accepted by you. So, confine to 3 minutes please.

### Remarks of the Prime Minister on the issue of Price Rise

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY (West Bengal): You start counting the time from now. It is very unfortunate that the main Opposition Party has not raised this issue, and this is the statement that has been issued by the Prime Minister's office after a delegation of the Left Parties met the Prime Minister on the issue of price rise and demanded 6 concrete steps to be taken. I quote from the Prime Minister's office statement. It says: "the Prime Minister urged all political parties to eschew the temptation of politicising the misery of the people and warned against creating an environment of scarcity etc. etc." ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Siva, what is this? This has nothing to with that. ...*(Interruptions)*... He is putting forth his views. What is this? You can't do like this. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA (Tamil Nadu): He has said that consultations should not be allowed in the Parliament. Now, what is going on...*(Interruptions)*...