

बड़ी गंभीरता से चर्चा की है। मैंने लोगों की बात समझी और लोगों को भी अपनी बात समझाई, क्योंकि हरेक को यह लगता है और स्वाभाविक भी है कि यह बोझ आ रहा है। अब कौन सा ऐसा परिवार होगा कि जो नहीं कहेगा कि यह बोझ नहीं है। मैं भी कह रहा हूँ कि बोझ आ रहा है। लेकिन अपने एक कटु कर्तव्य के नाते हमने यह निर्णय लिया है और देश के हित में यह निर्णय लिया है। जब भी कोई निर्णय लेते हैं तो बड़ी जिम्मेदारी के साथ लेते हैं और तभी यह कीमतें बढ़ाई गई हैं। हमने कीमतें बढ़ाते समय बहुत सोच-विचार करके यह निर्णय लिया है। इसलिए उसको वापिस लेना मेरे लिए संभव नहीं है। इतना ही मैं कहना चाहता हूँ। धन्यवाद।

MOTION OF THANKS ON THE PRESIDENTS ADDRESS

THE VICE CHAIRMAN (SHRI ADHIK SHIRODKAR): Shri Venkaiah Naidu to move the motion.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU (Karnataka): Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, I beg to move:

That an Address be presented to the President in the following terms:

"That the Members of the Rajya Sabha assembled in this Session are deeply grateful to the President for the Address which he has been pleased to deliver to both Houses of Parliament assembled together on February 23, 2000."

Sir, before I talk about this, I would like to say something about the use of air-conditioners and attending meetings in five star hotels. Sometimes, I also wonder about the fact that Parliament is airconditioned, but the people are not living in air-conditioned houses. Parliamentary meetings are held in five star hotels. Many people do not have houses; then, why are we doing this? And when we are doing this; then, why this hypocrisy? Let us not take things to that level and then try to unnecessarily criticise each other. *(Interruptions)*

MISS MABEL REBELLO (Madhya Pradesh) : You are in the Government. *(Interruptions)* Are you not organising them? *(Interruptions)*

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: I am enlightened by your clarification. Earlier, in the five star hotels, I used to meet Members from

your side also. (*Interruptions*) Anyway, it is a good idea. It is a welcome idea also. Members who do not want to do that can stay in ordinary places also. (*Interruptions*).

Sir, I have really a great pleasure in moving this Motion of Thanks to the President. The President's Address is really inspiring. It is very comprehensive and it is like an agenda for action. We are in the golden jubilee year of our republic. The Indian Republic has just completed 50 years. It is time for us to look back at our achievements. And it is also time for us to see whether we have performed our responsibilities to the expectations of the people. If not, what are the areas of shortcomings? What remedial measures have been taken? The Government has to take up certain programmes to serve the people. This should be the endeavour of everybody. The President, through his Address, has tried to focus our attention to these various aspects that are really facing us today. Sir, after 50 years of independence, it is a fact that more than 46 per cent of the people are living below the poverty line. Who is to blame for this? Does it serve any purpose if we blame each other? We came to power only recently. So, we cannot be held responsible. And by holding you responsible, I am not doing any service to the nation. So, let us address ourselves to this very problem and then come with some programmes, some plans and some action as to how to improve the situation, how to accelerate the progress and how to speed up the development. That is why. Sir, I quoted the hon. Prime Minister. During his address, he said, "Development is my mantra and consensus is my approach."

He asked for the cooperation of all people. If you go through the President's Address in detail, you will find that even in this President's Address various issues have been mentioned. Whether, it is the development of backward areas, whether it is targetting the poorer sections to uplift them from poverty, whether it is the issue of rural development, whether it is information technology, whether it is reforms in different sectors, whether it is the setting up of Debt Recovery Tribunal to collect the money which is due—a mention was made about it in the House and we also came to know that a large amount of money is due to the public institutions and the banks were not able to recover the money in the manner in which we expected it—whether it is the need for tax reforms, whether it is the need to remove inessential laws and regulations like the one which we

had discussed yesterday—yesterday the Civil Supplies Minister came forward to enact a particular legislation—whether it is the need to take steps to reduce the fiscal deficit, which has become a major problem to the entire country irrespective of the Central Government or the State Governments, we have a greater responsibility to really debate and discuss these issues and come to some sort of meaningful conclusions. We have this problem of fiscal deficit in different States, whether it is the RJP-ruled States or the Congress-ruled States or the Marxist-ruled States. As regards the income and expenditure of the States, the expenditure is more than their income. That is the situation in majority of the States. We have the example of my own State of Andhra Pradesh. As regards Andhra Pradesh, the income is Rs.22,831 crores and the expenditure is Rs.29,761 crores. In the case of West Bengal, the income is Rs. 11,466 crores and the expenditure is Rs. 18,976 crores. With regard to Maharashtra, the income is Rs.24,957 crores and the expenditure is Rs.32,209 crores. I need not read out all this. In Assam, Bihar, Maharashtra, Orissa, Punjab, Rajasthan, U.P., West Bengal, Andhra Pradesh, in all these States there is the problem of fiscal deficit. We are short of resources. We are not able to mop up the needed resources and fill the deficit. What should we do? We have an oil pool deficit of Rs. 16,300 crores. The international prices are increasing. We have inherited a situation where you have to do debt-servicing. I am told an amount of Rs. 1,24,000 crores is required. If my figures are wrong, I may be corrected. We have learned people like Dr.Manmohan Singhji and Mr.Pranab Mukherji. I am not a student of economics. But my information is that debt-servicing requires an amount of Rs. 1,24,000 crores. (*Interruptions*)... I don't want to join issue with you. Just now Vayalar Raviji said, "We all agree". Your leader. Dr. Biplab Dasgupta, also said, "let us respect each other". I don't want to join issue with you. You have a right to make comments and you can make the comment here, and you can walk out and still you can make it outside.

Sir, this being the case, should we not go in for some harsh steps? This is the issue which we, all of us together, should address. Fortunately or unfortunately, today different States in India are ruled by different parties. The regional parties are ruling Tamil Nadu and Andhra Pradesh. The Marxist Party is ruling in West Bengal, Kerala and Tripura. The Congress Party is having Governments in Madhya Pradesh as also in Rajasthan and a coalitions Government in Maharashtra. We have our own

Governments in Uttar Pradesh, in Gujarat and in other States. That being the case, people are watching. I read an interesting article today by Shri Jayaram Ramesh, the Secretary of the Economic Cell of the Congress Party. He is a very knowledgeable person. I really admire him. He was saying, "don't bother about what is being said in Delhi. You see what is happening in the States of Madhya Pradesh, Maharashtra and Rajasthan." A very frank and forthright interview has been given to a newspaper. The reason is very simple. Should we be hypocritical even after so many years? We have fertile land. We have perennial rivers. We have intelligent people. We have hard working agriculturists. We have skilled labour. We have great artisans. We have boys who are excelling everywhere, in Silicon Valley, etc., Everybody is asking for them. America is ready to take them. Germany is ready to take them. The Irish leaders came here and they wanted an agreement with us with regard to IT. We have the potentiality to become a super power. All these resources, land, water, skilled labour, intelligence, etc., are available.

Have you adopted them properly? Have you used them properly? We have not. Secondly, what about the expenditure? Sir, here, in this President's Address, at page 9, it is mentioned "to downsize the Government, recovery of economic cost for goods and services, and greater austerity in Government spending." These are the need of the hour. We agree. But are we in a position to do so? The moment we downsize a particular Department or reduce the staff there, a hue and cry will be made outside by the same political party. Then, some people are saying that this Government has taken hard decisions. My friends are very much agitated. One of my hon. friends, Shri Bratin Sengupta, — normally he does not lose his temper — went to the extent of saying "let the Government go to hell." Babu, people have elected us. They have given us some responsibility. We are here to perform that responsibility. I do not know whether the marxists believe, that there is a hell and a heaven. I do not think you believe in that. But, at the same time, my point is, let us respect the mandate of the people. People have given us a mandate. We are trying to perform our responsibility to the extent possible, to the best of our capacity. If we fail in our responsibility, if we bungle, you are there to criticize us. There is always a scope for criticism, exposition, in the system of democracy. First educate the people and then try to come back to power. But the fact of the matter is, my strength is increasing. It has increased from 2 to 182. I have

won the Lok Sabha elections. I have won the Rajya Sabha elections. I have won the assembly elections. My strength is increasing and my critics strength is decreasing. So, what do the people feel? Do you think that people are so innocent? When they vote for Congress Party, they are intelligent, when they vote for the RIP, they are not intelligent, when they vote for you in West Bengal, they are intelligent. Perceptions differ, assessments differ. Tomorrow, I may go to the people to say that the marxist philosophy is not good. Let me educate the people. But physically obstructing here or doubting or using such a harsh language is not good. Criticize me to the extent possible with all the strength at your command. I may feel pained or may not. When the Minister of Petroleum was responding to the queries raised by Members, he was not allowed. Where are we going to? Now, Sir, I come back to the main point. The fiscal deficit of the States, the fiscal deficit of the Centre is the biggest challenge that is before the nation. We should put our heads together. The Government has started taking some action. People call it hard decisions. After the presentation of the Budget, a lot of disappointment was there among the general public. They were not that much hard decisions. But now, there is criticism even about those hard decisions also. How to reduce the deficit? How to improve the revenue? How to provide for the service sector, social sector, infrastructure? You don't have drinking water in many places. You don't have roads in a number of villages. You don't have the minimum requirements for the commonman in the rural areas. How to address all these problems? The Government has come out with some schemes. Prime Minister 's Rojgar Yojna, the Gramin Mahila Samridhi Yojna, and some other schemes for rural developments and roads, etc. Rs.2500 crores out of the cess on petrol and diesel have been given for that particular thing. We are also talking of national highways. Twenty-five lakh houses per year. For whom? For the homeless. Then a Comprehensive Crop Insurance Scheme for the unorganised agricultural sector who are always left to the vagaries of monsoon, flood, drought and cyclone. Some of the steps have been initiated by this Government. I can happily say today. My friend Shri Nilotpal Basu is not here. This morning he was saying "you have no right to talk about corruption." Yes. We have not intelligent scams, we have no expertise. I agree. No scams, no tension, no riots, the entire attention is being paid to the development process. As the Prime Minister rightly said, this is the direction in which we are moving.

Today, the rupee is stable. Inflation is under control. If you compare with your regime, if you compare with the regime of the Congress Party, you will find that inflation is under control under this regime. Can you deny this fact? Our foreign exchange reserves have gone up - Rs. 32 million: Investors' confidence is increasing. Inflation is under control. No major communal riots, whatsoever, to mention, except a few incidents here and there. But there also, as you know, law and order is a State subject. Some incidents happened in Orissa, Gujarat, Bihar and in different parts of the country. In Karnataka, eight dalits were killed. The other day, two dalits were burnt in Bihar. Such things are happening. There was a discussion about something which happened in the Jamia Milia. Is anybody happy with all this? But should we give it a communal colour? There was a lathi charge on the students. Who is the Vice-Chancellor there? When we bring up these issues and try to give a communal colour to it, are we doing a service to the nation?

What image are we giving to the outside world? Foreign delegations are coming here. The whole world is watching us. The communication system has improved. Parliament is now thrown open to the public to see as to what is happening here. The message which we are conveying should be a proper message which should really enhance the image of the country. You are trying to say that after this Government came to power there is no security for minorities. I would like to go through the figures if you really want them. Let there be a comparison between what has happened earlier and what is happening now. If you have something specific regarding scams and scandals, you make a serious charge. But you are simply making allegations. The Asian Age today published a story. One week back a former Prime Minister said that the Prime Minister himself was responsible. After going to Patna and after visiting the jail he said that the Prime Minister was behind all this. Other friends were saying, "The Prime Minister does not know it. The Home Minister is behind this."

Today the CBI has issued a statement which has appeared in the same newspaper. My friends have read only yesterday's newspaper. They have not read today's newspaper because they believe more in yesterday. They do not have faith in future, they do not have confidence in today. That is their problem. But my point is, the same newspaper has carried a story saying that the CBI has said, "We have not taken instructions from the Home Minister or from the Prime Minister." The hon. Member, who is

also an advocate, said in the morning, "That is done as per the direction of the court. It is a fall out of the fodder scam." You can say on the basis of your past experience when you were in power that it is politically motivated. You have every right to say that. But, at the same time, attributing motives and trying to mislead the people will not help us. My request to the Congress Party and to the Communist Party and to all the friends who are sitting in the House is, come out with concrete suggestions. We are also there to impress upon the Government to take corrective steps wherever there is a necessity. Our leader, the Prime Minister, has said on record, "I believe in consensus. I will go as per the consensus." He is taking the Opposition and all the people into confidence in each and every matter. That being the case, you have a forum available there. You have a forum available in the House. You have so many avenues available. Let us discuss the issues. Let us make out points. You expose us if we have weaknesses. Let me expose you if you have weaknesses. Let there be a debate which will really be helpful to the people. I want all the political parties to take up this approach.

Today the cooperative credit in the rural banks has gone up to Rs.51,000 crores. So far as Kisan Paid Cards are concerned, last year the target was Rs. 50 lakhs. This year the target is Rs. 75 lakhs. So far as housing is concerned, the target is 25 lakhs. So far as the Prime Minister Udyog Yozana is concerned, the target is Rs. 25,000 crores. So far as literacy is concerned, the Government has taken an initiative to raise the literacy rate to 75 per cent by 2005 under the Serva Shiksha Abhiyan. Where do you find fault with the Government? Why haven't you talked about the Janshree Bima Yozna Scheme, an insurance cover for the poor people so far? This Government has come out with an idea. Try to improve upon that idea. You may have better ideas than this. So far as rice allocation under PDS is concerned, earlier it was 10 kilos at the rate of Rs.3.50/- which comes to Rs. 35/-. The remaining 10 or 15 kilos were to be purchased from the open market. Open market price is Rs. 12/- per kilo. They have to pay Rs. 120/- for purchasing 10 KGs. of rice. So Rs.35/- plus Rs. 120/-, it comes to Rs. 155/-. Today the price is Rs. 5.85/- per kilo. They are given 20 Kgs. rice. They have to pay Rs. 116/- for 20 KGs. rice. ...*(Interruptions)*... Mathematics is also necessary. After all, in this House some Bills are passed by voting. Democracy functions on numbers. ...*(Interruptions)*... Inflation is going down. My image is going up. My party's image is going up and the image of the country is going up.

Then there are programmes for senior citizens and helpless people. Earlier, 10 KGs. of rice was given and now 15 KGs. of rice is given. The Government is helping the people. The Government is taking care of the helpless people. After the Kargil war our defence expenditure has gone up. An additional responsibility of Rs. 0,000 crores has come on us. Then because of the Fifth Pay Commission an extra responsibility of Rs. 5,000 crores has come on us.

Because of the cyclone in Orissa, the entire nation has to take up the responsibility. For the cyclone in Orissa, for Kargil, then for the Pay Commission Report's implications, then Rs. 16,300 crores Oil Pool deficit and Rs. 1,24,000 crores for interest and debt servicing; where do you get the money? My friend says, do not go to the IMF and do not go to the World Bank; okay. Do not raise the prices; okay. Then do not repay the loans also. Can we say that? Can we survive without repaying the loans? What is the way of mobilising the resources?

Nobody is saying that subsidies are to be withdrawn totally. It is not possible, as long as disparity is there, as long as poverty is there. The subsidies have to continue. The food subsidy has to continue, the fertilizer subsidy has to continue. But a consensus has to be built up to have a better targeting of the subsidies. The poorest among the poor, the really deserving ones, should get it.

Even during 1991, when Manmohan Singhji was the Finance Minister, the urea price was hiked by Rs. 1,000 per tonne. One thousand rupees! In 1991, raising the price by Rs. 1,000 was okay. In 2000, if you raise the price of fertilizers, then you are anti-kisan. I am not able to understand. As I said, I am not a student of economics. The 1991 price hike is justified; but in 2000, after 10 years, if you raise it, then you are anti-kisan. We can criticise each other and go to the people and make a campaign, but the entire country is watching us. Are we responsible? In my State, one of the political parties said, 'after the elections there will be free power.' The same party, which is ruling in the neighbouring State, says, 'How is it possible? Impossible.' These people say that it is possible and impossible. It is possible till the ballot is over. The moment the ballot is over, it is impossible. Whom are you trying to fool? Are we fooling ourselves? This should not be the approach. There has to be a consensus on reforms. Sir, Manmohan Singhji has earned a place for himself in the history of this

country, undoubtedly. It is a different matter that we have serious political differences with the Congress party. But he has set the process. Since it would bring some improvement in the process, we said that we would give a human face to it. We are trying to give it a human face, to the extent possible. If you can make better suggestions to improve upon this, *you* are welcome. We are open to suggestions.

To my Marxist friends, I would say that whether it is heaven or hell, if they come to power, at any time, if they bring about an improvement to this idea, nobody would prevent them. But, here, let us not try to mislead the people on this issue.

Today, the support to the Government is increasing in all the States. As 1 to 2 you just now, whether it is Lok Sabha, Rajya Sabha, assembly or by-elections, they are all the indications of this. They want stability. They are tired of elections - 1996 elections, 1998 elections and 1999 elections. They are tired. So, people want stability. If stability is assured, this Government is here to stay. Whether you like it or not, it is the mandate of the people. Try to respect the mandate and try to help us in implementing the welfare and developmental programmes that we have promised, and then judge us after the expiry of the time. Shortcut methods and unholy gang-ups will not help. It may temporarily help you. You may be a part of the ruling power in Bihar, you may be a part of the ruling power in Pondicherry. But your grass root support is going down. Your public support is going down, for various reasons. I do not want to talk much on politics and say what has happened.

AN HON. MEMBER: What about the recent gathering?

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, it was a gathering of suppressed and oppressed people. People came to Delhi to thank this Government, to congratulate this Government, for taking effective and corrective steps on the five office memoranda issued at your behest, under your guidance, depriving the dalits of their privileges and rights. This Government has decided to see to it that justice is done. The Congress party made a representation; and other friends also have raised the issue. The Government is positively responding. We are going to have a Constitutional amendment. The Supreme Court judgement has caused this issuance of five

memoranda between January and August 1997. We want to annul that, with your support and cooperation. We want to help the dalits. This is a matter of history. It took nearly forty years to have the photo of Babasaheb Ambedkar here. Who is to be blamed for this? Who is responsible? Let us not take politics too far. हम लोग कर रहे हैं। हम लोगों पर आरोप लग रहा है कि बाबा साहब अम्बेडकर का अपमान हो रहा है। क्या अपमान हो रहा है? संविधान में संशोधन लाना क्या अपमान है? संविधान की समीक्षा करना क्या अपमान है? अगर संविधान की समीक्षा करना गलत है तो आप लोगों ने तुरन्त सत्ता में आने के बाद 17 महीने में ही क्यों संशोधन किया? पहला संशोधन 1951 में किया गया। इसके बाद और संशोधन लाने के लिए 1954 में कांग्रेस वर्किंग कमेटी ने पंडित जवाहर लाल नेहरू जी के नेतृत्व में एक उपसमिति बनाई। 1976 में आप लोगों ने खुद ए.आई.सी.सी. के द्वारा स्वर्ण सिंह जी के नेतृत्व में एक कमेटी बनायी। उस कमेटी ने बताया कि पूरे संविधान की समीक्षा करने की जरूरत है। आपको सबूत चाहिए। Do you want any *saboot*?

श्री जीवन राय (पश्चिमी बंगाल) : अब संविधान पर बहस कीजिए।

श्री एम.वेंकैया नायडु : बहस करेंगे। Friend, should I read out what the Communist Party said about the Constitution? ..(*Interruptions*).. Should I read out what the Communist Party said about the Constitution? ..(*Interruptions*)..X will be very embarassing ..(*Interruptions*).. They said that was a Constitution of tyranny.. (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI JIBON ROY : It talked about the rule of the poorest of the poor..(*Interruptions*).. Even today we are saying *this*..(*Interruptions*).. You used the Constitution to ride the poor *peopk*..(*Interruptions*).. Everybody knows that ..(*Interruptions*)..

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, it is a communist Party document. It says that this is a Constitution of tyranny, slavery, suppression and oppression.('/</e/rM/?//o<i/.Now you are saying that we are trying to change it. What you said yesterday, you do not remember today. What you said in you document, the Communist Party's document, you do not remember it today. I do not want to waste my time on talking about the Constitution because they can never touch it.(*Interruptions*)..They will be nowhere near the power in spite of all their manipulations ..(*Interruptions*).. The wind is blowing against them in West Bengal. Even the Congress people who are friends of the Communist Party

at the Centre and tired saying 6 हमको मुक्त करो, कम से कम हमें इससे मुक्त करो
This is what they are saying..Sir, the Constitution was amended for the first time on June 2, 1951, that is, within seventeen months and then again in 1954 within four years of the adoption of the Consitution, the Congress Working Committee appointed a sub-committee headed by Nehruji to study the question of changes in the Constitution. Sir, in these 50 years of our Indian Republic, of adopting the Constitution, it has been amended for 79 times. The Congress Party's account is 69 times. Out of 69 times.

t

श्री गांधी आज़ाद (उत्तर प्रदेश) : सर, संविधान संशोधन दूसरी बात है और समीक्षा दूसरी बात है। संशोधन की प्रक्रिया संविधान में दी गयी है...(व्यवधान)... प्रक्रिया दी गयी है...(व्यवधान)... संविधान का संशोधन किया जाए।

श्री एम.वेंकैया नायडु : एक बहुत ही वेलिड प्वाइंट गांधी आज़ाद जी ने रेज़ किया है...(व्यवधान)...

श्री गांधी आज़ाद : समीक्षा की जरूरत थी तो क्यों नहीं सदन में लाकर बहस कराकर समीक्षा की गयी?

श्री एम.वेंकैया नायडु : जहां तक मेरा सामर्थ्य है, वहां तक मैं इसका जवाब देने की कोशिश करूंगा। संविधान में संशोधन कर सकते हैं, समीक्षा नहीं करनी, स्टडी नहीं करनी — यह आरग्यूमेंट कहां से आया, मेरी समझ में नहीं आता। कोई बिना समीक्षा संशोधन करे, कोई बिना स्टडी अमेंडमेंट करे That means you are not applying your mind ..(Interruptions).. .

श्री गांधी आज़ाद : पूरे संविधान की कौन सी समीक्षा होगी?

SHRI JIBON ROY: The Constitution was adopted by the Parliament.... (Interruptions)..

श्री एम.वेंकैया नायडु : मैं आ रहा हूँ। You talk about other things but not about the Constitution. ..(Interruptions).. .You talk on other issues except the Constitution because you do not believe in it. ..(Interruptions).. . Sir, in 50 years out of 79 times, 69 is the Congress' account and out of it 52 times account for one family; 32 times during Madam Indira Gandhfs period 15 . ..(Interruptions).. .

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE (West Bengal):Most respectfully I would like to submit to the hon. Member and to the House that the Constitution can be amended by the Parliament and not by one family or this family or that family. The hon. Member is fully aware of it.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, I am really enlightened by the information given by Pranabbabu. I think that the Congress Party will also understand that the Constitution cannot be changed by a committee. The Constitution cannot be changed by any hidden agenda. It will be amended. It will be changed, if necessary, by both the Houses of Parliament. Let them realise it. He has agreed on this. I am happy about it.

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: You said that 52 times by one family...(Interruptions).. You check up your record and simply on a serious debate do not try to bring in triviality like this. This is my most respectful submission.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: I do not want even to take the names because it hurts a particular party. But it is a fact of the history now.

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: You can take the name of the party but not of any family. Even a party can only take an initiative. It is the two Houses of Parliament which amend the Constitution.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, as I said, he believes in party. He does not believe in dynasty. I am happy about it. Sir, the amendments. (Interruptions)..

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: So, this is the hidden agenda to slander, to raise a malicious campaign.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: I cannot but sit when Pranabji or Manmohanji stands up even to interrupt me.

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: I am sorry for interruption. I will show you to interrupt me as many times as you want, Mr. Venkaiah Naidu.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI ADHIK SHIRODKAR): What he meant is, he respects you both so much that even at the cost of interruption he is willing to yield for the time being. Please continue.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, they are senior Members. One has to respect them. Sometime, we have a point to counter an argument. If I have the capacity to counter an argument, I will do it. My point is, my friends are saying, amend this Constitution but do not review it. In these fifty years - let us see - 50 per cent of the original provisions have been amended. The Preamble has been amended. Sir, Preamble यह अपमान नहीं है अम्बेडकर जी का? यह क्या सेवा करना है?

SHRI RAJU PARMAR (Gujarat): For whose sake?

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: For the sake of an individual whose name I do not want to mention because the Chair said not to take the name of the family. Sir, 177 Articles and 377 Clauses have undergone change. The headings of five chapters and five sub-chapters have been changed, mostly during the regime of the Congress Party. Sir, it is eight times in Fifties; fifteen times in Sixties; twenty-one times in Seventies; nineteen times in Eighties, and sixteen times in Nineties. This is how the Constitution stood the test of time. Do not worry. Just Ke Khanna in his book, 'Law Man and Law of Education', said, "There are two distinctive features of our Constitution. It is one of the lengthiest Constitutions in the world and it has, perhaps, subjected to the largest number of amendments." The Congress Party's Resolution said, - I am not quoting from my own resolution ~ "Nothing can be sacrosanct which is not able to meet the challenges of the changing times squarely..." - it is not the resolution of Venkaiah Naidu or Atal Bihari Vajpayee or this is not a secret agenda; this is the resolution of the Congress Party - "...the Congress..." - underline it - "...therefore, urges that our Constitution be thoroughly re-examined in order to ascertain if the time has not come to make adequate alterations to it so that it may continue as a living document..." - that means, the document is not a living document today; they want to give something else - "...and effectively responding to the current needs of the people and the demands of the present." Sir, the AICC Resolution further says, "There has been recently a great deal of public discussion on the need to have a second look at the Constitution." What does it mean? Second look at the Constitution! With regard to Article 368 they said that this amendment cannot be questioned in any court of law. What were the speeches that they made at that time? I do not want to go into those. All they want is a committed judiciary, not to uphold the fairness and justice but committed to help the rulers to stick to their chairs of power. Sir, the Government at the Centre was elected for five years, but extended to six years; the State Assemblies were elected for five years, but extended to six years. What for? What was the reason? What was the great cause? Allahabad High Court's judgment. And, you bring a constitutional amendment to retrospectively amend it to give effect for the sake of one person. Now, why I am trying to do it is for the sake of Dalits, for the sake of women, for the sake of decentralisation, for the sake of giving more powers to Panchayati Raj institutions and for the sake of devolution of more powers to the local bodies. And you say that I have a

hidden agenda. Yes, this is the hidden agenda I have - welfare of Dalits, welfare of weaker sections of the society, welfare of women, welfare of Centre-State relations and devolution of more powers to the local bodies. This is the need. Look at the Congress Manifesto. With regard to judicial reforms, you agree with us; with regard to election reforms, you agree with us; with regard to decentralisation of powers, you agree with us, with regard to separation of powers between the Judiciary, the Legislative and the Executive, you agree with us. We are trying to bring in a legislation as per the common consensus of the country and you say that we have a hidden agenda. हमारे पास केवल झंडा है, कोई हिडन एजेंडा नहीं है। केवल एक नेशनल एजेंडा है। उस एजेंडे के आधार पर ही हम सब लोग चल रहे हैं। You said, what is this basic structure? Mr. Rajiv Dhavan and Mr. Alias Jacob studied a case; I earnestly feel that the concept of basic structure or basic features, and the judges who pronounced it in the Kesavananda Hiarti's Case in 1977, need not have been ridiculed by styling the concept as judges' invention. That means, according to the Congress Parly, the basic structure is judges' invention.

Sir, the then Union Law Minister, Shri Gokhaleji, on 28th October, 1976 said, "Some years ago certain Member of Rajya Sabha made observations that law was one generation behind; lawyers, 2 generations behind; judges, 3 generations behind." He added, amidst laughter, "The developments since the Rajya Sabha Member has made the observation prove that judges are not merely three generations behind, but many more. One does not know whether all the judges are saying the same thing, or different things. Sometimes, we do not know whether they are saying anything at all". Commentary about the Supreme Court judges and High Court judges. Sir, he went on to observe, without mincing words, "If a confrontation recurs, it will be a bad day for the judiciary of this country." Should we not see to it that the confrontation does not come? Is it not our responsibility? Sir, I am once again quoting from Justice Khanna's book "Neither Roses nor thorns". While discussing about the habeas corpus, at page 78-79, he says, " Mr. Niren Dey, a former Attorney-General contended that the right to move the court for enforcement of Article 21 has been suspended. The writ petitions were not maintainable.' In the course of the discussion, I put it to Mr. Niren Dey 'Article 21 relates not merely to personal bT^erty, but also to right. In view of this submission, would there be any remedy if a police officer, because of his personal enmity, kiUs

another man. The Answer of Mr. Niren Dey was unequivocal, 'consistently with my argument'. What a sad situation! So, there would be no judicial remedy in such a case; as long as emergency lasts. 'My Lord,, it may shock your conscience, it shocks my conscience, but consistently with my submission, no proceedings can be taken in a court of law on that score.' I am a victim of emergency. I was in jail for 17 months. Dr. Y. Radhakrishna Murty was also there. I know it. *(Interruptions)* You have simply forgotten it. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI T.N. CHATURVEDI (Uttar Pradesh): They try to forget.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, the Congress Party went one step further. This morning, we were discussing about the Centre-State relationship. The Swaran Singh Committee says, "If the Centre is able to render help effectively to the States in such a situation it should have the power to deploy police or other civil forces under its own superintendence and control in any State." That means the Centre wanted to have power even on law and order also, without involving the State Governments. This is what you had proposed to do at that time and when we opposed, you put us behind bars. You put all the Opposition Members in jail. You had it passed in the House. Sir, I have a book, written by Shri Kuldip Nayyar. ...*(Interruptions)*... We are coming to that. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI JIBON ROY: Why don't you constitute the Committee from amongst the Members themselves? Why from outside?

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Shri Jawaharlal Nehru - when he studied - he was not studying as a Member of Parliament. The Swaran Singh Committee was not a Parliamentary Committee. It was a party Committee. Here, some expert Committee has been constituted. *(Interruption)*

SHRI JIBON ROY: You have given a constitutional ...*(Interruptions)*... That is why we say that there is a hidden agenda. You are trying to take away whatever is there in the Constitution.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: You are neither there, nor here. *(Interruptions)*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI ADHIK SHIRODKAR): I believe, both of you will be participating in the debate and I am confident you will effectively try to demolish this argument. But keep it for a later stage.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, I am just quoting from the book "Judgement", written by our friend, Shri Kuldip Nayyar. _He says, "Indeed, it was an unseemly hurry that the Bill was introduced in the Lok Sabha on 7th August, at 11.00 a.m., and after over-riding objections and suspension of the requirement of a minimum period of consideration for a Bill, the Government moved it for consideration at 11.08 a.m. The Bill was passed at 1.50 p.m." That means, within 2 hours and 42 minutes, you passed a constitutional amendment. Sir, a Bill requires three readings. But, all the three readings were completed in just two hours and fifty minutes. The Rajya Sabha passed it the following day, within an hour, without anybody speaking on it. Then, the State Legislatures, where the Congress had a majority, were summoned on August 8. The requisite ratification was secured the next day. The President gave his assent on August 10, a day before the Supreme Court was to hear Mrs. Gandhi's appeal.

SHRI JIBON ROY ; Can you yield for a minute? I want to seek a clarification. What is this 40th amendment?

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU ; If a Member from the Congress Party had asked for a clarification, I would have been ready to clarify. But I am not yielding to you because you do not believe in Constitution.

DR. BIPLAB DASGUPTA (West Bengal): I just want to say one thing. Are you justifying everything you have done, in terms of what the Congress Party did during the Emergency period? Are you moving towards Emergency? Is it that you have in mind?

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU : You will not get the privilege to go to jail because we do not believe in suppression of fundamental rights. ...(*Interruptions*)... You are taking objection. Shri Ghani Khan Choudhary Ji is trying to do something. ...(*Interruptions*)... Why are you complaining tome? Please settle the score there. ...(*Interruptions*)...

DR. BIPLAB DASGUPTA : Are you moving towards the Emergency Rule? Is it that you have in mind?

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU : Sir, the Constitutional amendments are carried out in just two hours and thirty minutes, without a discussion in the Rajya Sabha. You just get it approved, for the sake of one individual. You have done it, and now you are saying that we are doing it in a surreptitious manner. Sir, nothing is done in a surreptitious manner.

Everything is done in a clear and open manner. It is done by persons with integrity, from the journalistic field, from the legal profession, from the judiciary, from the legislature. We have eminent persons. You may be disturbed because one Member, who was there earlier in your party, has spoken on a broad issue. First, you said, " We do not agree." Then you said, "Amendments are all right, but no review of the Constitution." How can there be a review of the Constitution without amendments? You said about the constitution of the Committee. You were objecting to Mr. Sangma. Why? He has conducted the other House in an able manner. He has got so much experience. He comes from the North-Eastern region. Do you want me to show press clippings of your objection? Do you want me to show where the spokesman of the Congress Party has objected to the name? If you want, I will give you the press clipping. There is no problem. ...*(Interruptions)*... I can come to the House with that cutting, specifically showing the date, time and the name of the person who has made that statement; officially, not personally. Now, Sir, you want a free, fair and a thorough discussion. You have shown the way for such a discussion. But we are not going to follow it. We are not going to be influenced by you. We will be dictated by only one motto. After 50 years, a situation has come when there is a need for studying the grey areas, the misuse of Article 356, etc. The States are clamouring for powers. The Panchayats are not getting the funds. During the Rajiv Gandhi period, the 73th and 74th amendments were passed. They were good amendments. Everybody supported them. Now, there is a need to strengthen them. There is need for a debate. Again, we are thinking of having an amendment with regard to the Panchayati Raj Act also, to give more powers to the Panchayats. In the case of Dalits, the five Office Memoranda can be annulled only through a Constitutional amendment. Ending the muscle power and money power. Women Reservation. ...*(Interruptions)*... You have reminded me of the time.

SHRI SANTOSH BAGRODIA (Rajasthan): I have not reminded you about the time. I want to know from you, by what time the Government is thinking of bringing the Dalits and the Panchayati Raj Bills.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU : The Committee was constituted. I can give you the month and date also. ... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI RAJU PARMAR : With regards to the Dalits, can you say something? ... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU : With regards to the Dalits also, I am proud to say that our party has the largest number of Dalit-brethren in the Rajya Sabha and in the Lok Sabha. ...(*Interruptions*)... We have the largest number of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in our Party. Once upon a time, our party was untouchable. But, today, we have different groups, different parties; regional, national, Samata, B.J.P., etc.. Everybody is with us. Why this situation has come? It is because you have deviated from your main line. It is because you have deviated from your chosen path. It is because you have left the ideas of Shri Mahatma Gandhi and Shri Jawahar Lai Nehru. You have left the ideas of the founding fathers of the Congress Party. You are going down, and we are growing. If you are unhappy, I can't help it.

SHRI SANTOSH BAGRODIA: People know who is growing.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Definitely. That is why, while you were here earlier, now you are there. We were there earlier, now we are here (*Interruptions*)

SHRI JIBON ROY: All over the world, it happens.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: If communal parties can grow, the Muslim League would have come to power by this time.

SHRI JIBON ROY: All over the world, communal parties come to power initially.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: So, be careful in Bengal.

Sir, I want to ask of the people who are opposing the constitutional review: Are you against giving more powers to States and Panchayats? Are you against extending the reservations in promotions? Are you against giving reservations to women? Are you against having the Judicial Commission?(*Interruptions*).... Then, why are you opposing this?(*Interruptions*)

I will conclude this. Sir, because my friend has to speak.
(*Interruptions*) ...

They have a temptation to disturb me. I do not know why.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI ADHIK SHIRODKAR): Mr. Naidu, avoid anything but temptation.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, the hon. Prime Minister has categorically stated that there is no question of deviation from parliamentary democracy. He has said that there is no question of touching the basic structure of the Constitution.

I quote Smt. Indira Gandhi. I cannot help it because it is a matter of history and record. Madam Gandhiji has said that the basic structure is a dogma. What is this basic structure? This question has not been raised by Venkaiah Naidu. It was raised by Smt. Indira Gandhi in Parliament. It was raised by Mr. Gokhale in Parliament. It was raised by Mr. Jagannath, the then Member, in Parliament. It was raised by many other people like them. I have all the names. I have also the speeches made by great Congressmen at that time, during the constitutional debate, and that too putting the Opposition in jail and having the discussion for two-and-a-half hours, a great debate. They have said that this basic structure is a dogma. If the basic structure is a dogma, what are you now objecting to? We believe that there is the basic structure which has to be preserved and protected.

You say that we have not got the approval of the people. My manifesto, the NDA manifesto of 1998 contains the proposal that we would have a constitutional study. It was approved by the people. I have been returned to Parliament. My supporting party, the Telugu Desam also feels that there is need for study of the Constitution for making some changes and for decentralisation of powers also. Not only that, the President, in his speech of October to the Joint Session of Parliament, has clearly said that the Government is going ahead with institution of a committee to review and study the Constitution. It was approved by both the House of Parliament, of which you are all Members.

Parliament approved it, and the people have approved the NDA agenda. Then, we have set up a committee. The committee will make recommendations. They will be discussed here in Parliament. Parliament can approve it or reject it. Debate and discussion is an essential part of democracy. Don't you believe in it? If you want to defeat it, defeat reservations, reservations for women and defeat decentralisation. It is up to you. I cannot demand that you should support all these things.

My point is this. Please, for the sake of the country and for the sake of the system, let us have an open mind. We are not with a closed mind. We want this issue to be discussed in both the Houses of Parliament.

It is a question of simple understanding. Unless you have two-third majority, you cannot pass it.

SHRI RAJU PARMAR: We know the rule.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: I am not quoting the rules. I am only mentioning the requirement. Why are you afraid of it? Do you think that by our effective and forceful argument, we will mesmerise you and that you will vote with us? Are you afraid that you will lose your argument and that you will vote with us? (*Interruptions*)

So, whenever there is an agreement and whenever there is a consensus, let us work on that. Come to an agreement on some broad issues in the larger interest of the nation, in the interest of democracy and in the interest of strengthening the Constitution. Let us join together. (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI RAJU PARMAR: What is the RSS chief saying? Tell this to the House.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: The RSS chief says: "Namaste, salavatsare, Matrabhoomi." Do you have an objection to this? (*Interruptions*)

SHRI RAJU PARMAR: He says, "Scrap the Constitution."

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Why are you so disturbed about the नींद नहीं आए तो आर.एस.एस. खाना नहीं मिले तो आर.एस.एस. और खाना डाइजेस्ट नहीं हो तो आर.एस.एस. । आखिर क्या मतलब है आपका आर.एस.एस. से (**व्यवधान**) जयप्रकाश जी भी गये थे, महात्मा जी भी गये थे, उन्होंने उनको आशीर्वाद दिया । हाऊस में इस तरह से आर.एस.एस. की एक अच्छी आर्गेनाइजेशन की निंदा करनी चाहिए । बाहर जाकर बहस करो, आरोप लगाओ । समाधान मिलेगा आपको । मगर यहां हाऊस में डिबेट में आर.एस.एस. का प्रस्ताव मत लाइए । They are the people who created the Kerala Congress, it is these people who created the Muslim League, it is these people who created the different casteist and communal groups. You are doing the same thing even today. That is not politics.

Sir, I sum up by saying that there is a large area of consensus on reforms, on strengthening the economy, on having social harmony, on strengthening the Constitution of India, on strengthening the Parliamentary democracy. There is a large area of agreement. Let us not vitiate the

atmosphere. Let us come together. With regard to areas of disagreement, you are free to go to the people and I am free to go to the people. We can convince the people. I am only concerned with the views of the people of the country, that they should be given a proper perception, proper understanding, of the whole issue. Let us not try to sidetrack by saying ? अपमान हो रहा है। पहली बार हो रहा है। यह अच्छा नहीं है। हम ही कर सकते हैं। आप लोग नहीं कर सकते हैं। If you do it, it is good. If we do it, it is bad. यह अच्छा नहीं है। देश के हित में नहीं है। इतना ही कहकर propose that this Motion of Thanks should be considered by the entire House and then passed unanimously. I am thankful for the patient hearing. I am thankful to my Marxist friends also, because they allowed me to speak. I believe, they believe in democracy. Thank you very much.

श्री सतीशचन्द्र सीताराम प्रधान (महाराष्ट्र) : धन्यवाद, उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय। मैं अभी वेंकैया नायडू जी के आदरणीय राष्ट्रपति जी ने 23 फरवरी 2000 को दोनों सदनों के सामने जो अभिभाषण दिया था उनका आभार प्रदर्शित करने वाला प्रस्ताव को अनुमोदन देने के लिए खड़ा हूँ। मैं उनको अनुमोदन देता हूँ। साथ साथ मैं पूरे सदन से भी प्रार्थना करता हूँ कि हम सभी एक दिल से आदरणीय राष्ट्रपति जी को धन्यवाद दें, अगर प्रकट करें

सर, अभी बात हो रही थी और वेंकैया नायडू जी कांस्टीट्यूशन के बारे में बता रहे थे। कल-परसों मुझे किसी ने बाई पोस्ट एक किताब भेजी थी 'द टू डेस्टिनी आफ इंडिया' श्री अरविन्दो जी की। आखिर में उन्होंने जो संदेश दिया था उसकी यह किताब है। पहला संदेश है जो इंडिपेंडेंट डे के दिन उन्होंने दिया था। उसको पढ़ते पढ़ते उसमें उन्होंने जो 2-4 विचार रखे थे वे आज मुझे बहुत ही सतर्क करने लायक लगे। इसलिए वे मैं सदन के सामने रखना चाहता हूँ। उन्होंने कुछ स्पष्ट देखे थे। उसमें से सबसे पहला एक स्पष्ट देखा था :

The first of these dreams was a revolutionary movement which was to create a free and united India. India today is free, but she has not achieved unity मैं यहाँ आज की परिस्थिति जो पूरे देश में देख रहा हूँ, यहाँ सदन में भी जो देख रहा हूँ इस विषय में मैं बहुत चिंतित हूँ। आगे उन्होंने बताया है,

"But the old communal division into Hindus and Muslims seems now to have hardened into a permanent political division of the country."

ये उस जमाने के विचार हैं। उस जमाने में बुजुर्गों ने जो विचार रखे थे, वे आज की तारीख में भी बहुत बढ़िया हैं। हमें सतर्क करने लायक हैं कि इस विषय पर यह करना चाहिए। उन्होंने एक और ड्रीम रखा था,

"The third dream was a world-union forming the outer basis of a fairer, brighter and nobler life for all mankind."

मैं यह सब देखने के बाद विचार करता हूँ कि 1950 में जिस घटना या संविधान को हमने स्वीकार किया, उसका आज की तारीख में पूरा प्रयोग और 50 साल में जो डेमोक्रेसी का इस्तेमाल किया, क्या वह सक्सेसफुल हुआ, यशस्वी हुआ? हमें पूरे 50 साल का कारोबार संभालते समय बहुत सारी जगहों पर कुछ कमियां महसूस हुई या नहीं? हमने जो उद्देश्य रखे थे, इस घटना ने हमें जो अधिकार दिए थे, उनका सरकार ने सही ढंग से इस्तेमाल करते हुए लोगों को जो चीजें देनी थीं, क्या हम वहां यशस्वी हुए? 50 साल के बाद भी लोगों को जो चीजें देने लायक थीं या जिन्हें देने की हमारी जिम्मेदारी थी, यदि वह निभा नहीं पाए तो उसमें या तो कंस्टीट्यूशन में कुछ कमियां रही होंगी या जिन लोगों ने राज्य का भार संभाला, उन्होंने अभी तक जो लोगों को देना था, वह नहीं दे पाए। जब मैं इस विचार पर सोचना शुरू करता हूँ तो मुझे समझ में आता है कि मैं कभी भी ऐसा नहीं कर सकता हूँ। जो बुजुर्गों ने देश का नेतृत्व संभाला उनमें कुछ कमियां थीं, ऐसा मैं मानने के लिए बिल्कुल तैयार नहीं हूँ। उनको उसी समय लोगों ने चुन कर भेजा था और उन्होंने अपने अधिकारों का ठीक ढंग से इस्तेमाल किया था। इसलिए मैंने थोड़ा अभ्यास करने की कोशिश की और अभ्यास करने की कोशिश करने के बाद अभी जो सब जगह पर घटना के संदर्भ में विवाद चल रहा है और बताया जाता है कि यदि घटना को हाथ लगाया जाएगा या संविधान में बाबा साहब की जो आत्मा बसी है, यदि उसे बदलने की कोशिश की जाएगी तो उसे बदलने नहीं दिया जाएगा। इस ढंग की भाषा बरती जाती है। तब मैं देखना चाहता हूँ कि स्वयं बाबा साहब ने इस घटना के संदर्भ में क्या विचार किया था। जब मैंने इसका अभ्यास करने की कोशिश की तो मुझे राज्य सभा की डिबेट में से कुछ पढ़ने के लिए मिल गया। उसे मैं बताना और कोट करना चाहता हूँ। यह राज्य सभा की 2 सितम्बर, 1953 की डिबेट है। उसमें बाबा साहब अम्बेडकर एक जगह बता रहे थे,

"People always keep on saying to me "Oh, you are the maker of the Constitution." My answer is, " I was .. what I was asked to do, I did it against my will."

यह क्यों किया, कैसे किया, क्यों हुआ, इस विषय पर मैं बाद में आऊंगा। उसी ढंग से, उसी दिन, आगे उन्होंने दूसरी जगह पर बताया है,

Once in a moment of anger, he said in the House, "My friends told me that I have made the Constitution. But I am quite prepared to say that I shall be the first person to burn it out. I don't want it, if it doesn't suit anybody."

4.00 P.M.

महोदय, 2 सितम्बर, 1953 को राज्य सभा की डिबेट में भाग लेते हुए डा.बाबा साहेब अम्बेडकर जी का यह वक्तव्य था। उस के बाद डा. अनुज सिंह, जो कि पंजाब से राज्य सभा के सदस्य थे, ने उन्हीं का रिफरेंस देकर उस विषय पर बात छोड़ी जोकि राज्य सभा की डिबेट में 19 मार्च, 1953 को कोट हुई। उस में डा.अनुज सिंह जी बता रहे हैं :

"Last time when you spoke, you said that you would burn the Constitution."

Immediately, Dr. Baba Saheb Ambedkar responded.

"DR. BR. AMBEDKAR: Do you want a reply to that? I would give it to you right here. My friends say that the last time when I spoke, I said that I wanted to burn the Constitution. Well, in a hurry, I did not explain the reason. Now that my friend has given me an opportunity, I think I shall give the reason. The reason is, we built a temple for a god to come in and reside. But before the god could be installed, if the devil has taken possession of it, what else we do except to destroy the temple? We did not intend that it should be occupied by the *Asuras*. We intended it to be occupied by the *Devas*. That is the reason why I said I would rather like to burn it."

डा. बाबा साहेब अम्बेडकर जी ने इस विषय में यह वक्तव्य दिया था। महोदय, अगर हम आज की तारीख में उसे देखें तो प्रश्न उठता है कि कांस्टीट्यूशन ने हमें जो अधिकार दिए थे, उन का किस ढंग से अमल किया जाता है ? महोदय, कांस्टीट्यूशन और हमारे बुजुर्गों ने हम सभी लोगों को अलग-अलग अधिकार दिए, अलग-अलग लोगों के लिए बहुत से कार्यक्रम तय किए और बाद में उन कार्यक्रमों पर अमल करने की कोशिश की गयी।

महोदय, मैं शिव सेना का सदस्य बनकर इस सदन में आया और शिव सेना ने शुरू से भूमि पुत्रों के हक में मांग उठायी, उन के लिए लड़ाई लड़ी। महोदय, सभी लोगों ने इस विषय में हम को 'संकुचित' होने की भावना से देखा, हमारे ऊपर इस तरह अटैक किया, लेकिन मैं आज यहां बताना चाहता हूं कि जब हम महाराष्ट्र में मराठी बोलने की कोशिश करते हैं और उस के लिए आग्रह करने की कोशिश करते हैं तो कहा जाता है कि आप मराठी नहीं बोलिए। आप को संपूर्ण भारत को सर्वदा सभी को साथ लेकर चलना है और उन्हें आगे बढ़ाना है। इसी बात को कर्नाटक के संदर्भ में देखें तो बताया जाता है पगार लेने के लिए अगर सिग्नेचर करना है तो उन्हीं की भाषा में करना चाहिए, नहीं तो पगार नहीं मिलेगी। इस पर

वहां कोई शिकायत नहीं करता। महोदय, अभी परसों ज्योति बाबू ने बंगाल में यही जिक्र किया। उन्होंने कहा कि आप को बंगाल में जो कार्य करना है, उस में बंगाली भाषा का सम्मान होना चाहिए, उस को प्रायरिटीज मिलनी चाहिए। यह उन का हक है और उन के लिए यहां प्रायरिटीज रहेगी। तो किसी को आपत्ति नहीं होती। केवल शिव सेना के बारे में आपत्ति होती है। महोदय, मैं आपको बताना चाहता हूँ कि बाबा साहब अम्बेडकर जी के समय में कांस्टीट्यूशन के बारे में एक कमेटी नियुक्त की गई थी। बाबा साहब अम्बेडकर के बारे में एक किताब है — अभी आर.एस. गर्व जी यहां नहीं बैठे हैं। वे एक ज़माने में इस किताब के संपादकमंडल में थे और उन्होंने बहुत अच्छा संग्रह प्रकाशित किया है। इसके लिए मैं उनको धन्यवाद देना चाहता हूँ। उसमें एक जगह प्रिफेस में बताया गया है कि —

"Soon after it became definite that the framing of the future Constitution of India was to be entrusted to a Constituent Assembly, the Working Committee of the All-India Scheduled Castes Federation asked me to prepare a Memorandum on the Safeguards for the Scheduled Castes for being submitted to the Constituent Assembly on behalf of the Federation."

उन्होंने इसमें शैड्यूल्ड कास्ट्स, शैड्यूल्ड ट्राइब्स और बाकी लोगों को अपने हक संभालने के बारे में बताया है। महोदय, कांस्टीट्यूशन के दसवें पैराग्राफ, आर्टिकल 2 सैक्शन (1) में फंडामेंटल राइट्स ऑफ सिटीजंस का जिक्र है। इसमें 5वां कॉलम जो है, वह मैं पढ़ना चाहता हूँ। इसमें लिखा है कि —

- "5. All citizens shall have equal access to all institutions, conveniences and amenities maintained by or for the public.
6. No citizen shall be disqualified to hold any public office or exercise any trade or calling by reason of his or her religion, caste, creed, sex or social status.
- 7 (i) Every citizen has the right to reside in any part of India. No law shall be made abridging the right of a citizen to reside except for consideration of public order and morality.
- (ii) Every citizen has *a right to settle in any part of India, subject to the production of a certificate of citizenship from the State of his origin. The permission to settle shall

not be refused or withdrawn except on grounds specified in sub-clause (iv) of this clause."

What does sub-clause (iv) says? I quote:

- "(iv) The permission to settle may be refused or withdrawn by a State from persons—
- (a) who have been habitual criminals;
 - (b) whose intention to settle is to alter a communal balance of the State;
 - (c) who cannot prove to the satisfaction of the State in which they wish to settle that they have an assured means of subsistence and who are likely to become or have become a permanent burden upon public charity;
 - (d) whose State of origin refuses to provide adequate assistance for them when requested to do so;
 - (v) Permission to settle may be made conditional upon the applicant being capable of work and not having been a permanent charge upon the public charity in the place of his origin, and able to give security against unemployment.
 - (vi) Every expulsion must be conferred by the Union Government.
 - (vii) The Union Legislature shall define the difference between settlement and residence and at the same time, prescribe regulations governing the political and civil rights of persons during their residence."

मैं यह बताना चाहता हूँ कि मुम्बई, दिल्ली से और सभी मेट्रो सिटी के अंदर आज की तारीख में परिस्थिति ऐसी है कि दुनिया के सभी जगह से, हिन्दुस्तान के सभी जगह से लोग आते हैं और जब रहने के लिए उनको जगह नहीं मिलती तो वह झोपड़ पट्टी बनाकर रहते हैं। वहां सभी सुविधा देनी पड़ती है तथा उसका बर्दन जो टैक्स पेयर्स हैं उनको ऊपर आता है। सुप्रीम कोर्ट द्वारा निर्णय देने के बावजूद पौलिटिकल रीजंस की वजह से यह सब हो रहा है। यह जो इम्बेलेस हो रहा है, डा. बाबा साहेब अम्बेडकर जी ने 1950 में इस विषय पर विचार करके जो सजेरेंस दिए थे क्या आज उस विषय पर दोबारा विचार करके उस पर

अमल करने की आवश्यकता है या नहीं? अगर फिर गौर से सोचना है तो उस पर कंस्टीट्यूशन रिफार्म करने के बारे में विचार नहीं करेंगे तो और क्या कर सकते हैं। साथ-साथ मैं यह बताना चाहूंगा कि हमारे अरुण जेटली जी यहां नहीं हैं लेकिन उनको धन्यवाद देना चाहूंगा कि उन्होंने एक बहुत अच्छा कदम उठाया। जब से उन्होंने आकाशवाणी और दूरदर्शन का कार्यभार संभाला है, उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, उन्होंने इतने अच्छे ढंग से काम करना शुरू किया कि आज की तारीख में हमारे दूरदर्शन के प्रोग्राम अच्छे हो रहे हैं और उसको देखने-सुनने वाले बहुत बढ़ गए हैं। इसके लिए उनको धन्यवाद देना चाहिए, अभिनन्दन करना चाहिए।

शहरों का विकास होते-होते क्या हो रहा है? क्या देहातों का विकास हो रहा है? देहातों का विकास नहीं हो रहा है। देहातों का विकास भी हमें साथ-साथ करने की आवश्यकता है। अभी तक 50 साल में देहातों का विकास करने के लिए हमें जो कदम उठाने की आवश्यकता थी वहां हमारी बहुत सारी कमियां रही हैं। अभी वैंकैया नायडु जी बतला रहे थे कि पंचायती राज का कानून राजीव गांधी जी के समय पर बन गया। लेकिन पंचायती राज का कानून बनने के बाद उस पर अमल करने की जो आवश्यकता थी वहां हम ढीले रहे, वहां हम सतर्क नहीं रहे। मैं नगर पालिका क्षेत्र से आता हूं। मैं थाने, नगर पालिका का नगराध्यक्ष रह चुका हूं और मेयर भी रह चुका हूं और मैंने देखा है कि वह जो कानून है उसको मजबूत करने की आवश्यकता है, जो लोक प्रतिनिधि चुन कर आते हैं उनको अधिकार देने की जरूरत है। हम यहां चुन कर आते हैं तो पांच साल, छः साल के लिए हमें अधिकार प्राप्त होता है। हम वह अधिकार संभालते हैं या नहीं संभालते हैं? तो क्या प्रतिनिधि चुन कर आने के बाद में पालिका या पंचायत समितियों में लोक प्रतिनिधि को अधिकार नहीं होना चाहिए, उनको भी अधिकार होने की आवश्यकता है और अधिकार देने के लिए कानून मजबूत करने की जरूरत है और अगर कानून मजबूत करना है तो उसके ऊपर क्या प्रोविजन किया जाए उसका अभ्यास करने की जरूरत है और अगर अभ्यास करने की जरूरत है तो सिर्फ मैं अकेले ही सोचूं कि मैं ही सब को दुरुस्त कर सकता हूं, ऐसा समझना गलत है। यह समझना बिल्कुल ठीक नहीं रहेगा। जो लोग राज्य सभा या लोक सभा में सांसद चुन कर नहीं आते और वह समाज में बहुत होशियार, एक से एक अच्छे बड़े एक्सपर्ट हैं, तो उनकी भी सलाह ले सकते हैं और उनकी सलाह लेने में कोई गलत बात नहीं है। इसीलिए जो आयोग का गठन किया गया उसके लिए मैं भाजपा को धन्यवाद देता हूं और उनका अभिनंदन करूंगा और उनसे कहूंगा कि आयोग की रिपोर्ट आने दो और तब वह चर्चा के लिए सब के सामने आएगी। यह नहीं सोचना चाहिए कि यह आयोग पूर्वाग्रहित से निर्णय दे देगा और कंस्टीट्यूशनल अमेंडमेंट हो जाएगा ऐसा नहीं हो सकता। जो हमें कंस्टीट्यूशन अमेंडमेंट

करना है, उसका रिव्यू करना है, उसको दुरुस्त करना है तो उस पर निर्णय हमारे यह दोनों सदन ही करेंगे। उस समय अगर हमें यह लगे कि इसमें यहां परिवर्तन किया जाए और यदि संसद के दोनों सदनों की मंजूरी नहीं मिले तो परिवर्तन नहीं हो सकेगा। उसमें यह प्रोविजन है कि सब के साथ में लेकर जाना है उसके बिना कंस्टीट्यूशन अमेंडमेंट हो सकता, यह बतलाने की जरूरत नहीं है। कंस्टीट्यूशन पर विचार करना, कंस्टीट्यूशन पर अभ्यास करना, कंस्टीट्यूशन में क्या गलत है, क्या सच है इस पर विचार करना मैं समझता हूँ कि इसमें कुछ भी गलत नहीं है। उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, मैं दो-चार मिनट में अपनी बात खत्म कर दूंगा। मैं यह भी बताना चाहूंगा कि कंस्टीट्यूशन में परिवर्तन करने की जब से बात कही गई है.... इसके बारे में सबको मालूम है इसीलिए मैं ज्यादा कुछ नहीं कहूंगा। हमारे कंस्टीट्यूशन में 76वां अमेंडमेंट हुआ है और इसके बाद भी हुए हैं। इस संबंध में दो-चार विषयों की तरफ आपका ध्यान दिलाने की कोशिश करूंगा। लोग कहते हैं कि जो बेसिक स्ट्रक्चर है वह चेंज नहीं होने देंगे। यह बेसिक स्ट्रक्चर चेंज करने की बात किसके दिमाग में आई, कहां से आई इसके बारे में मुझे मालूम नहीं है। लेकिन किसी ने भी यह बात छेड़ दी और आज सब लोगों ने वही बात करनी शुरू कर दी कि बेसिक स्ट्रक्चर में फेरबदल नहीं करने देंगे। मैं पूछना चाहता हूँ कि बेसिक स्ट्रक्चर का मतलब क्या है? बेसिक स्ट्रक्चर की डेफिनिशन क्या है? क्या किसी ने इसको सामने रखा है? बेसिक स्ट्रक्चर क्या है? मैं बताना चाहूंगा कि कंस्टीट्यूशन में 32 वां अमेंडमेंट हुआ "When the State of Andhra Pradesh was formed in 1956, certain safeguards were envisaged for the Telegana area in the matter of development and also in the matter of employment opportunities and educational facilities for the residents of that area."

उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, कंस्टीट्यूशन में एक जगह बताया जाता है कि हिन्दुस्तान के हर नागरिक को समान अधिकार दिया जाएगा। दूसरी जगह स्पेशल केस कहा जाता है। यह क्या बेसिक स्ट्रक्चर में बदलाव नहीं है। मैं इसके विरोध में नहीं हूँ यह मैं खुलासा करना चाहता हूँ। लेकिन यह बेसिक स्ट्रक्चर चेंज नहीं हो गया ?

सर, कंस्टीट्यूशन में 38वां अमेंडमेंट किया गया जिसमें बताया गया, "This was also the intention of the makers of the Constitution. However, contentions were being raised that the issue was subject to judicial scrutiny and there was litigation involving justiciability of this issue. To place the matter beyond doubt, the Act seeks to provide in the Constitution itself that the decision of the President, Governor or Administrator shall be final and conclusive and shall not be questioned in any court on any ground."

सर, यह क्या बेसिक स्ट्रक्चर के ऊपर आघात नहीं हुआ? जो उसमें ज्युरिसडिक्शन का अधिकार था वह अधिकार कोर्ट के पास से निकाल लिया गया। तीन मुद्दों के ऊपर हमारी पूरा ढंवा खड़ा है और उसमें ज्युडिशियरी को जो अधिकार दिया गया वह अधिकार हमने वापस ले लिया। ऐसा हुआ है और उसके आगे भी ऐसी ही परिस्थिति है। हमारे संविधान में 1976 में बहुत बड़े अमेंडमेंट हुए 42,43 वें संविधान संशोधन के द्वारा।

उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, मैं यह बताना चाहता हूँ कि इस तरह के जो अमेंडमेंट किए गए, उनमें वे सब अधिकार छीन लिए गए और एक प्रस्ताव भी बीच में लाया गया जो सदन के सामने नहीं आया। वह प्रस्ताव कांग्रेस पार्टी ने रखा था, स्वर्ण सिंह कमेटी ने रखा था। उन्होंने कहा था कि हमारे यहां अमेरिकन सिस्टम की तरह प्रेजिडेंशियल राज होना चाहिए। क्या यह कांस्टीट्यूशन के मुताबिक बेसिक स्ट्रक्चर में परिवर्तन नहीं था? हम उस विषय पर क्या करें? हमने प्रियम्बल में बदल किया और प्रियम्बल में बदल करने के बाद भी आज हम बात कर रहे हैं की बेसिक स्ट्रक्चर में बदल नहीं करेंगे। इस विषय पर सतर्क होने की आवश्यकता है। महोदय, सरकार ने बहुत अच्छा काम किया है, उसके लिए उनको धन्यवाद देना चाहिए। मैं पूरा उस पर न जाते हुए सिर्फ दो-चार बातें बताना चाहूंगा। 1984 में जो दंगे हुए थे, जो सिखों का हत्याकांड हुआ था, इस विषय में लोगों का ऐसा ख्याल था कि बहुत सारे केसिस दबाए गये थे। मैं यह कहना चाहूंगा कि इस विषय में सरकार ने चौकस होकर इन्क्वायरी करने के लिए कदम उठाए हैं। महोदय, हम यहां कॉन्स्टीट्यूशन के ऊपर विश्वास रखने की, एक-दूसरे से विचार करके, एक दूसरे से बात करके निर्णय लेने की बात करते हैं। यही हमें कहा जाता है लेकिन आज इस सदन में एक और विषय में रखना चाहता हूँ और वह विषय महाराष्ट्र और कर्नाटक की सीमा विवाद का विषय है। यह बहुत पुरानी बात है लेकिन आज तक डेमोक्रेसी में जो अधिकार दिये गये हैं, पूरे के पूरे अधिकारों का इस्तेमाल करके, पंचायत लेवल से लेकर लोक सभा तक के सभी चुनाव लड़कर, महात्मा गांधी जी ने सत्याग्रह का आन्दोलन करने का जो तरीका बताया था उन सभी तरीकों का इस्तेमाल करने के बावजूद, बेलगांव के ईशू पर सरकार की तरफ से निर्णय नहीं हुआ। जो भी सरकारें आयीं, वे सब सरकारें इसके लिए जिम्मेदार हैं। मैं आज इस सदन के माध्यम से सरकार से प्रार्थना करूंगा कि इस विषय पर तुरंत निर्णय करे। आखिर में एक बात कहकर मैं अपनी बात समाप्त करूंगा। हमें इस बात पर गंभीरता से विचार करना चाहिए। हमें स्कूल में महाभारत या रामायण पढ़ायी जाती है। आज की तारीख में कई लोगों को उसके ऊपर भी आपत्ति होती है। किसी को लगता है कि भगवान के नाम पर पढ़ाया जा रहा है। मैं अपना अनुभव बताना चाहता हूँ। रामायण और महाभारत दोनों ऐसे ग्रंथ हैं जिसमें ऐसी घटनाओं का वर्णन किया गया है — यह घटनाएं घटी हैं या नहीं घटी हैं, इस विषय पर जाने के बजाय मैं बताना चाहूंगा कि

अपनी जिंदगी में आप जिस-जिस प्रसंग से गुजरते हैं, वह सभी प्रसंग रामायण और महाभारत में आ चुके हैं। इन ग्रंथों का अध्ययन करते हुए यह ध्यान देने की आवश्यकता है कि यह क्या बात कह रहे हैं और उसको उसी ढंग से देखने की आवश्यकता है। अगर हम यह नहीं करते हैं तो हम बहुत बड़ी गलती करते हैं, यह मैं कहना चाहता हूँ।

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI ADHIK SHIRODKAR): Please conclude.

श्री सतीशचन्द्र सीताराम प्रधान : मैं समय की पाबंदी को समझता हूँ और आपको तकलीफ मैं नहीं लाना चाहता हूँ। लेकिन मैं पूरे सदन से प्रार्थना करूंगा कि आदरणीय राष्ट्रपति जी ने जो 23 फरवरी को दोनों सदनों के सामने विचार रखे, जो अभिभाषण किया, उसका समर्थन करे और वेंकैया नायडु जी ने जो रेजोल्यूशन हमारे सामने रखा है, वह पारित करे। धन्यवाद।

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI ADHIK SHIRODKAR): There are 459 amendments to this Motion, which may be moved at this stage. Amendments Nos. 1-5. Sardar Gurcharan Singh Tohra, Shri Sukhdev Singh Libra - Not present.

SHRI KAPIL SI BAL (Bihar): I beg to move -

6. that at the end of the Motion, the following be added namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the action to be taken against the elements responsible for delay in the implementation of on going projects."
7. that at the end of the Motion, the following be added namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the benefit accruing from the agreement reached between America and India for lifting ban on imports."
8. that at the end of the Motion, the following be added namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about any scheme for implementing the suggestion of the Central Vigilance Commission to make the administration of the country corruption free."
9. that at the end of the Motion, the following be added namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about formulating a permanent effective system to deal with the problem of sickness prevalent in small scale industry sector."

10. that at the end of the Motion, the following be added namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the efforts made for bringing about drastic reforms in the convention and policies of the World Trade Organisation in order to make them beneficial for the poor nations."

11. that at the end of the Motion, the following be added namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the declaration of any time-bound target for bringing down the increasing unproductive expenditures of the Government."

12. that at the end of the Motion, the following be added namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the implementation any scheme to make the produce of the land of the small and marginal farmers of the country remunerative."

13. that at the end of the Motion, the following be added namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the implementation of the target-oriented time-bound scheme to make full utilisation of water available in the country."

14. that at the end of the Motion, the following be added namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the target fixed from implementing the target-oriented time-bound scheme to make the country free from drought and flood."

15. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely :-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about taking effective steps to remove negligence and inaction prevailing in the administration and to make it responsible."

16. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about formulating an independent system to investigate the charges of corruption levelled against the persons holding high level posts in the administration."

17. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added namely*-
"but regret that the Address does not mention about the comprehensive changes to be made in the economic reforms related policies to bridge the gap between the rich and the poor in the country."
18. that at the *end of the* Motion, the following be added namely-
"but regret that the Address does not mention about the implementation of target-oriented time-bound scheme for full utilisation of available water in the country to increase agricultural produce in the country."
19. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added namely*:-
"but regret that the Address does not mention about the measures to be taken to reform the education system to make higher and vocational education in the country easily accessible for the poorer section."
20. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added namely*:-
"but regret that the Address does not mention about the scheme of development and expansion of the education system for providing equal opportunities of education to all in the country."
21. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added namely*:-
"but regret that the Address does not mention about any national level scheme to promote establishing hospitals equipped with the latest medical facilities by the private sector for the purpose of providing appropriate medical facilities to all the citizens of the country especially to the inhabitants of remote rural areas."
22. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added namely*:-
"but regret that the Address does not mention about the schemes to give special incentives to the domestic

- Industries to make them competitive in the International market."
23. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
 "but regret that the Address does not mention about the change in the Government policy in order to remove the increasing gap in the society due to imbalanced contribution made in GDP by agriculture, industry and service sectors."
24. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
 "but regret that the Address does not mention about the announcement of a specific time frame for eradication of poverty of the families living below the poverty line in the country."
25. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
 "but regret that the Address does not mention about the measures to prevent print and electronic media from broadcasting and publicizing visuals and news polluting the back; culture and civilization of the country."
26. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
 "but regret that the Address does not mention about the measures to reduce the cost of agricultural production to make agricultural products of the country competitive in the international market."
27. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
 "but regret that the Address does not mention about the measures to bring down the prices of commodities of daily consumption of common man in the country such as rice, wheat, pulses, milk, ghee, salt, etc."
28. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely :-
 "but regret that the Address does not mention about measures to get vacated the area of Pakistan Occupied Kashmir."

29. that at the *end* of the Motion, the follow ing be *added* namely:-
"but regret that the Address does not mention about the benefits that reached to the poorest class in the country after adopting economic reform policy."
30. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that the Address does not mention about effective steps for providing benefits of employment opportunities to the unemployed youth of rural areas, which are likely to be created as a result of development of information technotogy industry in the country."
SHRI BALANANDAN (Kerala) : Sir I beg to move:
75. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about the consistant attacks against the secular character of our polity by the BJP led Government at the Centre."
76. that at the *end* of the Motion, the follow ing be *added* namely:-
"but regret that there is no mention in the Address that the Commission for reviewing the constitution of India was constituted for subverting the democratic and secular character of the Constitution."
77. that at the *end* of the Motion, the follow ing be *added* namely:-
"but regret that there is no mention in the Address that the present BJP led Government is surrendering India's interests on all important issues under US pressure."
78. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that there is no mention in the Address that the lifting of quantitative restrictions on imports has put India's interests in to jeopardy."
79. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that there is no mention in the Address that the difficulties of the peasants due to the new economic Policies pursued by the Central Government."

80. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that the Address shows no concern about the unprecedented rise in the prices of essential commodities thus making them beyond the reach of the common man."
81. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that the Address shows no concern about providing remunerative prices to the farmers for the agricultural produce in consonance with the rising cost of the inputs."
82. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that the Address shows no concern about formulating a time bound programme to provide employment opportunities in the rural and in the urban areas."
83. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that the Address does not mention about bringing a comprehensive legislation to protect the interests of agricultural workers in the country by providing them Minimum Wages, land social security measures like Pension, Provident Fund, Workmen compensation for injuries suffered, medical relief, maternity benefits etc."
84. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that the Address shows no concern about the construction of pucca houses for the people belonging to Scheduled Castes, Scheduled Tribes, Minorities and weaker sections in the country."
85. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that the Address shows no concern about national loss due to recurrent floods and droughts in the country and effective steps to be taken to control this misfortune and to give relief to those who are affected by such natural calamities."

86. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that the Address shows no concern about the measures to check rampant corruption in the country."
87. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that the Address shows no concern for evolving a time bound action plan to eradicate the growing poverty in the country."
88. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that the Address shows no concern to take effective measures to combat the growing atrocities on women and children in the country."
89. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that the Address shows no concern to take effective measures to check the problem of increasing pollution in the country."
90. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that the Address shows no concern to formulate an action plan at national level for soil conservation in the country."
91. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that there is not mention in the Address about the encouragement being given by Government to saffronise the education and disturb the history."
92. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret to say that there is no mention in the Address of the disastrous effect of whole sale privatisation of public sector units."
93. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about the attempt to increase the prices of essential commodities like LPG, Kerosene etc."
94. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about the attempt to sabotage the legal rights of the working class."

95. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about Government attempt to sign the CTBT without any national consensus."
96. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about the free entry of agricultural products into the country."
97. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about high rise of prices of essential commodities in the country."
98. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about the encouragement being given by the Government to communalise the education and culture of the country and disrupt the hisotry of India."
99. that at the *end* of the Motion, the follow ing be *added* namely :-
"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about Government's encouragement to allow Government officials to join RSS etc."
100. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about the attempts of the Government to change the secular and democratic foundation of the country."
139. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that in the Address there is no mention about the consistant attack against the secular character of our polity by the B.J.P. led Government."
140. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that in the Address there is no mention that the Commission for reviewing the Constitution was constituted by passing Parliament and violating all democratic norms."

141. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that the Address there is no mention about the present BJP led Government surrendering India's interest on all important issues under American pressure."
142. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about the lifting of quantitative restrictions on imports."
143. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about the specific plan for providing employment to educated unemployed youth in the country."
144. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about the Government of India's efforts to protect the Constitutional Rights of the Minorities."
145. that at the *end of iht* Motion, the following be *added ndtm^]*:-
"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about the strict implementation of Dowry Prohibition Act, 1961 so as to abolish dowry system from the country."
146. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about the rise in price of essential commodities which has hit the common people in the country."
147. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about the enactment of the Essential Commodities (Amendment) Bill, 1998."
148. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about banning the entry of private sector, indigenous of foreign, in the Insurance Sector."
150. that at the *end* of the Motion, the follow ing be *added* namely:-

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about the need to control wide-spread land erosion which is taking place in Murshidabad, Nadia, Hooghly and Bardhaman districts of West Bengal."

151. that at the end of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about equality of rights wages etc. for the women."

152. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about women health and child care."

153. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about land reforms."

154. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address about the Government's desire to formulate a policy for the youth."

155. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address shows no concern about the growing corruption in the administrative machinery at various levels and the effective measures to eradicate it."

156. that at the *end* of the Motion, the follow ing be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address shows no concern about the formulation of a policy to remove regional imbalances and have uniform development of all the regions in the country."

157. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address shows no concern about the revival of sick industrial units in the public sector and rehabilitation of the displaced workers."

158. that at the end of the Motion, the following be added namely:-
"but regret that the Address shows no concern about providing remunerative prices to the farmers for the agricultural produce in consonance with the rising cost of the inputs."
159. that at the end of the Motion, the following be added namely:-
"but regret that the Address shows no concern about the unprecedented rise in the prices of essential commodities thus making them beyond the reach of the common man."
160. that at the end of the Motion, the following be added namely:-
"but regret that the Address shows no concern about the failure of the Public Distribution System to provide essential commodities to the poorer sections in remote areas."
161. that at the end of the Motion, the following be added namely:-
"but regret that the Address shows no concern about formulating a time-bound programme to provide employment opportunities in the rural areas to prevent exodus of educated youth to the urban areas seeking job opportunities."
162. that at the end of the Motion, the following be added namely:-
"but regret that the Address shows no concern about the steps to be taken to check unabated brain-drain of doctors, scientists, technicians and experts."
163. that at the end of the Motion, the following be added namely :-
"but regret that the Address shows no concern about the growing unemployment in the country and the need to provide unemployment allowance to the unemployed educated youths to mitigate their hardship."
164. that at the end of the Motion, the following be added namely:-
"but regret that the Address shows no concern about the closing down of 90 collieries of ECL, thus throwing out 1 lakh workers out of job."

165. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that the Address shows no concern about reducing custom duties and- increasing excise to benefit steel and other industries."
166. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that the Address shows no concern about the Bill for providing minimum wages to agricultural workers."
167. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that the Address shows no concern about the removal of lacuna in 73rd and 74th amendments to constitution which can bound the State Governments to conduct election after every five years."
168. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that the Address shows no concern about checking unprecedented rise in the prices of essential commodities/
169. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that the Address shows no concern about the need to monitor the effective implementation of land reform in the country."
170. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely :-
"but regret that the Address shows no concern about any scheme for all round development of under-developed districts in the States."
171. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that the Address shows no concern about the repair of existing national highways and construction of new national highways in Eastern Zone."
172. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address shows no concern about taking all necessary steps for implementing the programmes to safeguard the interests of the minorities in the country."

173. that at the *end* of the Motion, the follow ing be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address shows no concern about constructing more dwelling units for the economically weaker sections of society in the country."

174. that at the end of the Motion, the following be *added namely*-

"but regret that the Address shows no concern about introducing an integrated Crop Insurance Scheme to save the poor farmer community from natural calamities."

175. that at the end of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address shows no concern about bringing forward a comprehensive Legislation to arrange pension for the most neglected rural labourers who are not in a position to eke out thier livelihood nor their children are in a position to support their parents."

176. that at the *endofXht* Motion, the following be *added namtly*-

"but regret that the Address shows no concern about taking effective measures to make primary education compulsory."

177. that at the *end* of the Motion, the follow ing be *added* namely :-

"but regret that the Address shows no concern about measures for providing facilities of cold storage marketing of farm produce particularly vegetables, fruits etc. in order to enable the farmer to get suitable remunerative price."

178. that at the ent/of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address shows no concern about the distribution of barren land to the local farmers to grow trees."

179. that at the *end* of the Motion, the follow ing be *added* namely :-

"but regret that the Address shows no concern about providing vocational courses to the rural unemployed youth and women to make them self-reliant."

180. that at the *end* of the Motion, the follow ing be *added* namely :-

"but regret that the Address shows no concern about the measures to encourage constructions of Highways and Ports."

181. that at the *end* of the Motion, the follow ing be *added* namely :-

"but regret that the Address shows no concern about checking the cost of electricity for the use of consumers."

182. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely :-

"but regret that the Address shows no concern about the role of NGOs in building the infrastructure in the rural areas and providing employment opportunity."

183. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address shows no concern about the failure to curb atrocities on Dalits."

184. that at the *end* of the Motion, the follow ing be *added* namely :-

"but regret that the Address shows no concern about bringing a legislation for potection, welfare and all round development of minorities."

185. that at the *end* of the Motion, the follow ing be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address shows no concern about a comprehensive plan to provide basic needs of food, clothing and shelter to the poor people in the country."

186. that at the *end* of the Motion, the follow ing be *added* namely :-

"but regret that the Address shows no concern about the measures to check the growing menace of the poverty, unemployment, disparity and price rise in the country."

187. that at the *end* of the Motion, the follow ing be *added* namely :-

"but regret that the Address shows no concern about the businessmen and the multinational companies minting money at the expense of common man."

188. that at the *end of the* Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that the Address shows no concern about the deteriorating economic situation in the country leading to closure of public sector undertaking."
189. that at the *end of the* Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that the Address shows no concern about improvement in cattle breeding and also checking spread of diseases in them."
190. that at the *end of the* Motion, the following be *added* namely :-
"but regret that the Address shows no concern about the spurt of the diseases like Hepatitis-B, T.B., H.I.V. and kidney and heart ailments and various poverty related diseases in the country and providing timely medical facilities for them."
191. that at the *end of the* Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that the Address shows no concern about the schemes for the development of primary education, secondary education and higher education."
192. that at the *end of the* Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that the Address shows no concern about making arrangements for augmenting the production of foodgrains, pulses, oil in proportion to the increasing population of the country."
193. that at the *end of the* Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that the Address shows no concern about meeting the shortage of cold storage for storing vegetables, potatoes, onions and other perishable food items in the country."
194. that at the *end of the* Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address shows no concern about the measures for checking price rise of potatoes, onions, oils, pulses and other essential commodities in the country."

195. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address shows no concern about the measures of pulling the country out of the crisis of deficit financing, unearthing black money and preventing tax-evasion."

196. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address shows no concern about effective measures to check hoarding, black marketing, profiteering and adulteration etc."

197. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address shows no concern about the scheme to save various States from the fury of floods and the loss incurred by the people and the State Governments."

198. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely :-

"but regret that the Address shows no concern about linking all the villages by roads."

199. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address shows no concern about the construction of pucca houses for the people belonging to Scheduled Castes, Scheduled Tribes, Minorities and weaker sections in the country."

200. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address shows no concern about the installation of handpumps for providing potable water for the poor people in States."

201. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely :-

"but regret that the Address shows no concern about national loss due to recurrent of floods and droughts in the country and effective steps to be taken to control the menace."

202. that at the *end* of the Motion, the follow ing be *added* namely:-
"but regret that the Address shows no concern about the measures to check rampant corruption in the country."
203. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that the Address shows no concern about the measures to check child labour and prostitution."
204. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that the Address shows no concern about the development schemes for farmers, labourers, youth and women."
205. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that the Address shows no concern about the increasing number of sick people and general deterioration of the health of the people in the country."
206. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that the Address shows no concern about the miserable performance of India in international sports and game in spite of larger population than many other countries."
207. that at the *end* of the Motion, the follow ing be *added* namely:-
"but regret that the Address shows no concern about the meagre investments in the field of science and technology in public and private sector."
208. that at the *end* of the Motion, the follow ing be *added* namely :-
"but regret that the Address shows no concern about the increasing hegemony of United States of America."

209. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
 "but regret that the Address shows no concern about the growing unemployment in the country."
210. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
 "but regret that there is no mention in the Address to give unemployment allowance to the unemployed youth who are registered with Employment Exchanges until they get employment."
211. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
 "but regret that the Address shows no concern for expeditious disposal of criminal and civil cases pending before the courts."
212. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
 "but regret that the Address shows no concern to rectify the failures of the Government to streamline the Public Distribution System in the country."
213. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
 "but regret that the Address shows no concern for providing sufficient incentives to the small scale industries in the face of stiff competition from the multinational companies."
214. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
 "but regret that the Address shows no concern to the spread of the disastrous disease AIDS in the country."
215. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
 "but regret that the Address shows no concern over lack of transporting facilities in more than 50% rural areas of the country."
216. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
 "but regret that the Address shows no concern over the serious crisis of drinking water in rural areas in the country and to evolve-policy on drinking water."
217. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address shows no concern to the 'Right of Shelter to be included in the Constitution as a Fundamental Right."

218. that at the *end of the Motion*, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address shows no concern for evolving a time bound action plan to eradicate the growing poverty in the country."

219. that at the *end of the Motion*, the following be *added* namely :-

"but regret that the Address shows no concern to review the Private Power Sector Policy as it has failed to take off in a significant manner."

220. that at the *end of the Motion*, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address shows no concern for providing the latest equipment in the Central and State Government hospitals for the treatment of ever growing number of cancer, heart and kidney patients in the country."

221. that at the *end of the Motion*, the following be *added* namely :-

"but regret that the Address shows no concern in bringing in suitable reforms, to the educational system so as to make it employment oriented as the present system is not relevant to the needs of the present day society."

222. that at the *end of the Motion*, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address shows no concern in bringing comprehensive changes in the industrial policy to check the large scale migration from villages to cities which is the result of uneven industrial growth in the country."

223. that at the *end of the Motion*, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address shows no concern over the non-implementation of various schemes for conversion of barren land into cultivable land through a time bound programme."

224. that at the *end of the Motion*, the following be *added* namely:-

- "but regret that the Address shows no concern for taking adequate steps to eradicate communalism, casteism, linguistic chauvinism and regionalism from the country."
225. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
 "but regret that the Address shows no concern over the rapidly declining underground water level and availability of water in the country."
226. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
 "but regret that the Address shows no concern to formulate a comprehensive action plan at national level for water conservation."
227. that at the *end* of the Motion; the following be *added* namely:-
 "but regret that the Address shows no concern over setting up small scale industries in every village in order to stop large scale migration from villages to cities."
228. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
 "but regret that the Address shows no concern over introducing free and compulsory primary education for every child through the medium of his/her own mother tongue in order to eliminate illiteracy."
229. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
 "but regret that the Address shows no concern to formulate a new labour policy with a view to provide round the year employment to the labourers working inorganised and unorganised sector."
230. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
 "but regret that the Address shows no concern for the speedy implementation of the report of the Commission for Linguistic Minorities."
231. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
 "but regret that the Address shows no concern to formulate a comprehensive scheme to generate more employment opportunities in the rural areas."
232. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
 "but regret that the Address shows no concern to appoint a Committee of Experts to suggest permanent measures to

control the loss of lives, crops and property due to natural calamities."

233. that at the *end of the* Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that the Address shows no concern to take effective measures to combat the growing atrocities on women and children in the country."
234. that at the *end of the* Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that the Address shows no concern to take concrete steps to bring down the unprecedented rise in the prices of essential commodities."
235. that at the *end of the* Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that the Address shows no concern for formulating a time bound programme to abolish bonded labour existing in certain parts of the country."
236. that at the *end of the* Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that the Address shows no concern to take effective measures to check the problem of increasing pollution in the country."
237. that at the *end of the* Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that the Address shows no concern over the increasing malnutrition problem in the country."
238. that at the *end of the* Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that the Address shows no concern to formulate an action plan at national level for soil conservation in the country."
239. that at the *end of the* Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that the Address shows no concern for formulating a time bound comprehensive action plan to eliminate child labour in the country."
240. that at the *end of the* Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that the Address does not mention about the government appoint a Committee to suggest reforms in

judicial process to enable expeditious disposal of both criminal and civil matters."

SHRI SURESH PACHOURI (Madhya Pradesh) : Sir I beg to move

241. that at the *end* of the Motion, the follow ing be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not denounce in clear terms the communalisation and saffronisation of the bureaucracy by allowing Govt, employees to join R.S.S. by some State Governments and support extended by top Governmental functionaries at the Centre *Xo* such a more which have vitiated the secular atmosphere of the nation."

242. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not condemn in clear terms the Communalisation and saffronisation of education and educational institutions like NCERT, ICHR etc. and attempts to change the historical facts and prescribe syllabi containing communal bias."

243. that at the *end* of the Motion, the follow ing be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not reject the move to review the Constitution of India outrightly which is an attempt to saffronise the Constitution and establish a theocratic State thereby altering the basic principles of the Constitution of India."

244. that at the *end* of the Motion, the follow ing be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address has not censured the vandalism of self appointed culture cops who stopped the shooting of film Water at Varnasi thereby made mockery of the right to Freedom of expression and the terror let loose in Kanpur University on Valentines Day by blackening of faces of boys and girls celebrating that day and Governments inaction against such hoodlums."

245. that at the *end* of the Motion, the follow ing be *added* namely :-

"but regret that the Address displays Governments lack of determination to ban some fundamentalist • organisations who are preaching hatred against religious minorities and terrorising them by attacking killing; destroying the

properties and holy scriptures and vandalising their educational institution."

246. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namei:-

"but regret that the Address is silent about the appointment of a judicial commission to inquire into recent wheat, sugar and edible oils scams to pinpoint the scamsters and take necessary action against them."

247. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* mmth:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about Governments determination to set up a bench of Madhya Pradesh High Court at Bhopal forthwith which is lingering despite recommendation of the High Court and State Government."

248. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely :-

"but regret that the Address is silent about Governments determination to modernise the State Police of Madhya Pradesh to tackle Naxalite menace in the State through a compact Central financial package and technical know how for the same."

249. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namei:-

"but regret that the Address is silent about the unabated miseries and sufferings of victims of Bhopal gas disaster and Governments determination to solve their problems within a time frame."

250. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely :-

"but regret that the Address is silent about the growing air, water, noise and dust pollution in the country particularly in the urban areas due to which the atmosphere has become poisonous and dangerous for the survival of mankind."

251. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely :-

"but regret that the Address is silent about Governments determination to prevent child abuse and exploitation in the society particularly their sexual abuse which is growing day by day."

252. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
 "but regret that the Address does not indicate Governments intention to formulate a national policy for the welfare and upliftment of girl child in the country."
253. that at the *end* of the Motion, the follow ing be *added* namely:-
 "but regret that the Address is silent about the plight of child labour in the country and Governments resolve to identify the child labour and rehabilitate them with a view to enabling the children to enjoy their childhood."
254. that at the e«t/of the Motion, the following be *added mm?.\^*:-
 "but regret that the Address has not announced Governments intention to undertake a special census of the phyhsically challenged persons in the country so as to know their exact number and address for their rehabilitation."
255. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
 "but regret that the Address does not make it clear that it will authorise the Banks to publish the names of the defaulters of the Banks particularly the industrial houses who do not repay the loans taken from the banks resulting in huge NPAs in the Banks and their sickness and also to attach and confiscate the properties of such defaulters."
256. that at the *end* of the Motion, the follow ing be *added* namely :-
 "but regret that the Address is silent about the much awaited jail reforms in the country."
257. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
 "but regret that the Address does not indicate Government determination to rid the malady of defection in Parliament and State Legislatures by amending the Tenth Schedule to the Constitution in whcih the splits and merger will not be recognised and every case of leaving the original party will be treated as defection."

258. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely :-
 "but regret that the Address is silent about the mounting arrears of pending cases in the Supreme Court, High Courts and Subordinate Courts and Governments determination to bring them down substantially by initiating necessary reforms."
259. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
 "but regret that the Address is silent about the appointment of a National Judicial Commission without further loss of time."
260. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
 "but regret that the Address does not reflect Government's determination to bar the criminals from contesting elections to local bodies; State Legislatures and Parliament by affecting electoral reforms in the country."
261. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
 "but regret that the Address is silent about Government's intention to stop money and muscle power in the elections."
262. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
 "but regret that the Address is silent about growing incidents of atrocities against women and girl child in the country and Governments determination to stop the atrocities."
263. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
 "but regret that the Address is silent about the growing menace of diseases like Malaria, Tuberculosis, Encephalitis, AIDS, Hepatitis B, and, other diseases and Governments determination to control these diseases effectively."
264. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address is silent about the growing cases of Cancer in the country and Governments intention to provide best medical treatment to the Cancer victims in the country."

SHRI JIBON ROY: Sir I beg to move

265. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added*, namely:-
 "but regret that the Address does not mention about the failure of the Government to have discussion on Constitutional Review committee in Parliament before its constitution.
266. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
 "but regret that the Address does not mention about the need of decentralised planning with centralised leadership and determined fiscal regulation for balanced human development of all Indian citizens and regional development."
267. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* nameiy:-
 "but regret that the Address does not mention about the steps taken to prevent control of our economy by multinational companies and maintaining Parliament's control over basics of economy."
268. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
 "but regret that the Address does not mention that effective land reforms, remunerative prices of agricultural products and living wages for agricultural workers are the basic need for promoting investment in agriculture and Government will take lessons from the experience of those States, which have benefitted from implementing sweeping land reforms and will adopt policies so that the land reform is executed forthwith in all states."
269. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
 "but regret that the Address does not mention non-privatisation of the coal companies which are now operating under Public Sector."
270. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about taking the public opinion including workers and professionals connected with Aviation Industry, before privatisation of airports."

271. that at the end of the Motion, the following *be added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about non-privatisation of the existing ports."

272. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following *be added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about invasion by alien cultures and ideologies from super powers through their control over the entertainment and Information Technologies and the Government to thwart that invasion policy."

273. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following *be added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the Government mechanism to see that Foreign Direct Investment (FDI) is not utilised for acquisition of Indian industries."

274. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following *be added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention the grievances expressed by the leading trade unions concerning the constitution and the terms of reference of the Second Labour Commission, and the policy of the Government in this regard."

275. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following *be added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the fact that reduction of interest rate in small deposits hit the retired and senior citizens of the country and also the states government felt reduction was not justified and that Government will reconsider the decision in the light of the fact that inflation could not be brought down to 'zero' level."

SHRIMAT SARALA MAHESHWARJ (West Bengal) : Sir, I beg to move:

289. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that the Address does not mention that after fifty years of independence a Government has come into power, which was relations with the sangh family who believe in a State based on religion, against the concept to secularism."
290. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that the Address does not mention that in the name of amendments in the constitution, the sangh family is attacking the basic concepts, federal structure, democracy and secularism of the Constitution."
291. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that the Address does not mention about the attack on Christians in Gujarat in the name of conversion and forcible stopping of a film shooting in Varanasi in Uttar Pradesh with the help of the State Government in the name of Protecting the Culture, which are the instances of direct attack on the freedom of expression of artists and indications of Central Government's connivance."
292. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that the Address does not mention about the lifting of ban imposed on Central Government's employees to join the organisation like RSS and the action taken by Gujarat Government which would politicise and communalise the administration which would be very harmful to the unity of India."
293. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that the Address does not mention about communalisation of research institution like the Indian Council of Historical Research. Which has imposed naked censorship on historians by stopping the Publication of two volumes prepared by Professor Sumit Sarkar and Professor K.N. Pannikar on "Towards Freedom" edited by Professor S. Gopal."
294. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the campaign of communalisation in education."

295. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the slackness shown by the Government at the time of hijacking of the Indian Airlines flight with the result that the Pakistani Hijackers succeeded in taking off in the plane from Amritsar."

296. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about setting up of the Constitution Review Commission impelled by narrow political objectives and due to which it has become the platform of political castigation even before its constitution."

297. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the dangerous role of capital speculators in world economy due to which there is unprecedented rise in Indian sharemarket today and any time the money of lakhs of small investors in the country may be swept away by these international speculators."

298. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the heavy recession prevailing in national economy due to which all the small and big indigenous industries are struggling for their existence."

299. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the adverse effect on the financial condition of State Governments due to liberalisation policies during the last one decade resulting in the State Governments facing heavy financial crisis."

300. that at the *end* of the Motion, the follow ing be *added* nameiy:-
"but regret that the Address does not mention that due to administrative inertia, there is non-utilisation of sanctioned funds for various projects resulting in a vast difference of almost 80 thousand crore rupees between the amount spent till date on the projects and amount sanctioned for different basic infrastructure by three beggest financial institutions ICICI, IDBI, and IFCI during the last three years."
301. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that the Address does not mention about growing disparity in our society."
302. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that the Address does not mention about the increasing atrocities against women specifically the intolerant thoughts being spread against the women in the name of religion."
303. that at the *end* of the Motion, the follow ing be *added* namely:-
"but regret that the Address does not mention about the hike in prices of Petroleum products."
304. that at the *end* of the Motion, the follow ing be *added* namely:-
"but regret that the Address does not mention about the stagnation in rural employment since consumeristic economic reforms have generally lessened the employments."
305. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that the Address does not mention about the growing criminalisation of politics."
306. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that the Address does not mention about the efforts of the USA to fashion a uniploar world order"

through organisations like NATO even after the disintegration of USSR and termination of the Warsaw Treaty."

307. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about America in the crusade against terrorism as wrong because there appears to be a clear role of the USA in spreading terrorism throughout the world."

308. that at the *end* of the Motion, the follow ing be *added* namely :-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the unreasonable interference by Central Government in the campaign lunched by Vigilance Commission against Corruption."

309. that at the *end* of the Motion, the foUowing be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the agrrement made recently with America in which the interest of India have been overlooked by withdrawing all restrictions imposed on imports from USA."

310. that at the *end* of the Motion, the follow ing be *added* namely :-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about declaration of policy and measures to get vacated the area of Pakistan occupied Kashmir."

311. that at the *end* of the Motion, the follow ing be *added* namely :-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the vacillating policy of Government regarding CTBT."

SHRIMATI SAROJ DUBEY (Bihar) : Sir I beg to move

355. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention whether the implementation of constitutional provisions has failed or the constitution itself."

356. that at the *end* of the Motion, the follow ing be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address make a reference about the 'secular' nature of the Constitution."

357. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that the Address does not mention about the bill providing for reservation of one-third seats for women in Lok Sabha and Legislative Assemblies be considered and passed during the current session and provision be made for reservation to women belonging to backward, extremely backward and minority classes therein."
358. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that the Address does not mention that the handing over of major Airports to private sector would pose a threat to the security of the country."
359. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that the Address does not mention about any job guarantee scheme for women who are affected by the modern techniques and computersisation."
360. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that the Address does not mention any preventive measure to check the increasing sickness of industrial units on account of delay in implementing the revival package for sick industrial units."
361. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that the Address does not mention about any scheme to provide employment to the educated and uneducated youths of the country and about the unemployment allowance."
362. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that the Address does not mention the steps taken and to be taken to check child labour and child prostitution."
363. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that the Address does not mention the deteriorating health condition of common man."
364. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention any steps to make the education system job-oriented."

365. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention any concrete steps to check increasing atrocities on women and children all over the country."

SHRI MANMOHAN SINGH (Assam) : Sir I beg to move:

366. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret to state that the Address has failed to take note of the failure of the Government of India to discharge its Constitutional responsibility to protect secularism which is one of the basic tents of the constitution of India by not prevailing upon the State Government of Gujarat to withdraw the circular removing the ban imposed on the State Government employees participating in the activities of RSS."

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE : Sir I beg to move:

367. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the failure of the Government to protect Fundamental Right of Freedom of Expression as was evident in the case of shooting of the film 'Water' at Varanasi."

368. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not take note of the inability of the Union Government to isolate Pakistan in the international community for its support to the hijacking of an Indian Airlines aircraft to Kandahar recently."

369. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not take note of the inability of Union Government to prevent ISI and Pakistan supported terrorists to escalate attack on the Indian security forces in the State of Jammu & Kashmir."

370. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not take note of the failure of the Government of India to get Pakistan declared as a 'Terrorist State' by USA and other permanent members of the Security Council."

371. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not take note of the failure of the Union Government to restore fiscal balance by confining the fiscal deficit to the targetted level of 4.5% GDP as projected in the Budget of 1999-2000."

372. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not take note of the poor performance of the Union Government in generation of adequate employment opportunities in the rural sector in the year 1999-2000."

373. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not take note of the failure of the Government of ensure adequate investment in agriculture and allied activities."

374. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not take note of the extremely poor performance of the Union Government in the whole range of antipoverty programmes launched to alleviate poverty."

375. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not take note of the inability of the Union Government to effectively intervene in the market to protect the interest of farmers by ensuring the availability of Minimum Support Price to the Soyabean growers of Madhya Pradesh, Rajasthan and Maharashtra."

SHRIMATI SARLA MAHESHWARI : Sir I beg to move:

439. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the formation of the project "Sankhya Vahini India Limited."

440. that at the *end of the* Motion, the following be *added namely*:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about passing of a Bill providing for 33% reservation for women in Parliament and Legislative Assemblies."

SHRI S. VIDUTHALAI VIRUMBI (Tamil Nadu) : Sir, I beg to move:

442. that at the *end of the* Motion, the following be *added namely*:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the scheme of linking Ganga and Cauvery rivers."

SHRI DIPANKAR MUKHERJEE (West Bengal) : Sir, I beg to move:

448. that at the *end of the* Motion, the following be *added namely*:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the increase in the kerosene, LPG and Diesel prices and its cascading effect on the prices of essential commodities."

449. that at the end of the Motion, the following be *added namely*:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the socio-economic impact of the Government's decision to privatise or corporatise core sector industries like power, coal, oil, airports, ports, etc."

450. that at the *end of the* Motion, the following be *added namely*:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about the sickness of industries and steps to arrest the industrial sickness."

451. that at the *end of the* Motion, the following be *added namely*:-

"but regret that the Address does not mention about revival of sick public sector units like HSCO, MAMC, BOGL, Tyre Corporation of India, Hindustan Cables, Durgapur and Haldia units of Hindustan Fertilizer Corporation, NTC, NJMC, Jute Corporation of India, Bengal Immunity, Smith Stanistreet, Cycle Corporation of India etc."

452. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that the Address does not mention about payment of statutory dues to Central public sector unit's workers."
453. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that the Address does not mention about guaranteeing minimum wages to agricultural labours."
454. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that the Address does not mention about recognition of single trade union through secret ballot."
455. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that the Address does not mention about the hardships caused to the common man due to lowering of interest rates for small saving schemes."
456. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that the Address does not mention about improving Public Distribution System."
457. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that the Address does not mention about the measures to recover the excess subsidy to the tune of Rs. 1000 crore drawn by some private urea manufacturing companies through 'gold-plating' of nameplate specifications."
458. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that the Address does not mention how the resources will be mobilised to step up investment substantially in the infrastructure sector."
459. that at the *end* of the Motion, the following be *added* namely:-
"but regret that the Address does not mention about the steps to curb the activities or the organisations directly or indirectly involved in inciting and organising attacks on minorities."

The questions were proposed.

DR. MANMOHAN SINGH (Assam): Sir, I thank the hon. President for his Address. I wish I could share the optimism of my colleague on the other side, Shri Venkaiah Naidu, that this Address contains an agenda for action, to meet both the challenges and the opportunities that this great country of ours faces as it enters the 21st century. Mr. Venkaiah Naidu said, "consensus is our approach." Mr. Vice-Chairman, I regret to say that this Address does not outline a comprehensive vision to get this country moving again on the road to a high and accelerated rate of growth, nor do the actions of this Government give us any hope that consensus indeed is the approach of this Government. Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, we are living through exciting times. There are immense opportunities for our country to leapfrog on the road of socio-economic change. There are also great challenges and perils, and what we do now or what we do not do now will have far-reaching consequences for the future of our children and for the future of our grandchildren.

Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, Mr. Venkaiah Naidu has spent a great deal of his time on spelling out what he considers as the justification for the review of the Constitution. I submit to this House that what happened in the 1970s, or before that, cannot provide a meaningful answer to deal with the problems of India, as it emerges into the 21st century. There could be two points of views about what was done in the 1970s whether it was right or not right.

But, I submit to you that this does not by itself provide the justification for the way in which this Government has gone about this whole process of Constitutional review. Sir, a great legal luminary of our country who fortunately is now a Member of this distinguished House, I think, only a few weeks ago delivered a powerful oration as a part of the M.N.Roy Lecture. He is not a partyman. All sections of the House have great regard and respect for Mr. Fali Nariman. I would urge this Government to pay heed to what this great son of India has to say about the enterprise on which this Government has embarked upon thoughtlessly. Sir, we are not against the amendment of the Constitution. But, we want to know as to what is it that the Government is worried about and as to what is the provision of the Constitution which the Government wishes to amend. We are told nothing. We have a blanket statement in the form of a Government resolution which does not give us any clue about the thinking of or what is bothering the Government about the working of the

Constitution. Sir, another Constitutional authority, a student of Constitutional history of India, Dr. Graville Austin was recently in our country. He also delivered a lecture. What he said in substance is that the democracy is a messy business everywhere. But that by itself can never be a reason enough to alter the Constitution. A country like India can ill afford to review its Constitution unless the move is backed by strong justification. And even then while reviewing the Constitution a great caution has to be exercised. This was also the advice that the President of the Republic of our country gave to the Government, I believe, on the 27th of January, 2000 in his Address to the Houses of Parliament. We all know, Sir, that constitutions do not work. They are worked by, citizens and Governments. Before we embark upon the path of reviewing a constitution in order to change it, we have to explore whether the same results can be achieved by legislation or by having some new conventions. And Dr. Austin says that it would be better to achieve those goals by making those changes than by changing the Constitution. The hon. Member, Shri Fali Nariman, has also raised some very pertinent issues. If you are really seeking a consensus then why are you hesitant to come before the Parliament? After all, you cannot amend the Constitution without getting the requisite approval of the two Houses of Parliament and also in some cases the approval of the State legislatures. And yet one day before this Parliament was summoned, the Government appointed this so-called National Commission. There was no consultation whatsoever with any opposition party even when the Government fully knows that this Constitution cannot be amended/ in any manner without the active support of this side of the House.

This is not an example of seeking a consensus about the Constitutional review. There are several other reasons. We suspect - I hope I am wrong but there are suspicions — that contrary to what has been said from the official benches, this Government does have a hidden agenda. I recall the 1998 election manifesto of the BJP talks of its commitment to one nation, one culture and one people. Hon. Shri Fali S. Nariman has, I believe, conclusively shown that this notion of 'one people' is not consistent with the basic ethos and the spirit of our Constitution. Therefore, we are genuinely afraid that this constitutional review exercise can become an instrument of giving rise to a partisan and a divisive debate which can tear apart the body politic of our country. Therefore, I feel, this Government, by its actions, has not shown that it really believes in consensus. Simply quoting what

the Congress Party did in the seventies or before does not absolve this Government of entering into an effective consultation, if they genuinely believe that this country needs a high degree of unity and cohesiveness, to meet the immense challenges and opportunities that this country faces, as we enter the 21st Century. The way the constitutional exercise is being conducted, the way even some Members of the so-called National Commission have gone about interpreting the mandate, Shri Fall S. Nariman has argued again, very convincingly, that they create doubts in the minds of many people in this country. And, therefore, this is a matter which cannot be allowed to rest here. The way this constitutional review process is being carried out, it can never enjoy the support of the Congress Party and, of that, there should be no doubt in any quarter.

Now, coming to the other issues, the Government has repeatedly talked in terms of its commitment to secular goals and secular ideals. Sir, in para 31 of the President's Address, it is stated, "The Government is fully committed to preserving and further strengthening the secular ethos of our country." But, Sir, I say this with a deep sense of sorrow that the extent to which the more militant and fanatic wings of the Sangh Parivar are gaining influence and importance is a matter of serious concern. In the context of the constitutional review, the Head of the RSS has gone to the extent of saying that the present Constitution should be scraped lock, stock and barrel and it should be replaced by a new Constitution. If you really believe in the notion of one-people, one-nation, of the Hindutva type, then, I think, at least, the head of the RSS has been more honest than some Members of this Government. We all know, in the last twelve months, how the tiny Christian Community has been targeted in Gujarat first, in Orissa then, where a tragic incident took place leading to the death of Rev. Staiens and the burning of his two children.

We all know the light-hearted manner in which this Government has taken this matter. It is a matter of intense shame for all of us that one of the RIP Members of Parliament went to the extent of offering support to Dara Singh, who is the prime culprit. Even in Justice Wadhwa's report, it is clearly recognised that he was the main culprit in the whole exercise. Sir, only last week this whole nefarious game of harassing the Christian community started again in Mathura, with attacking on the schools and institutions belonging to this tiny community which is about 2 per cent of India's population. I would say respectfully that this does not speak well

about the secular credentials of this country, more so when the people who are in the ruling party in Uttar Pradesh go on describing such incidents that have taken place in Mathura and elsewhere, in a particular way. Sir, we had seen similar incidents earlier also. You know what happened to the film which Ms. Deepa Mehta was making. She had the approval of the Information and Broadcasting Ministry and yet the hooligan in the holy city of Banaras, with the active connivance of the Government of UP, prevented the filming of that film. What does it show? This sort of cultural terrorism, if allowed to flourish, will destroy the secular credentials of our country. We know what has happened in the academic institutions. We all know the story of withdrawing of the two volumes of "Towards Freedom", written by two distinguished authors. I say with great sorrow that the hon. Minister of Human Resource Development tried to completely mislead the House on that matter. The facts clearly point out that this was a highly motivated attempt to re-write the history of India in the image of the ruling group. I say with all respect that these, to say the least, unfortunate and ill-advised steps may threaten our national unity and the secular fabric of our country. The idea of tolerance which has a very strong and distinguished lineage in Indian culture, which thrives on the plurality of multiple-cultural traditions, today faces a serious challenge from the ruling party. Therefore, Sir, I note with great sadness that the President's Address is completely silent on the suffering and the tragedy of this small minority group of Christians. They may be small numerically, they may not have votes, but, I think, what has happened to them during the course of last one year should stir the conscience of our nation, and if it does not, I think, we should be prepared for the worst days to come and the threat to the secular fabric of our country will mount, as we go along.

Sir, I shall say a few words about the foreign policy. The hon. Leader of the House is a distinguished representative of our country. I am very happy that the President of the United States visited our country. We all want excellent relations with the United States. But, Sir, I would like to know about the results of all the 10-11 rounds of negotiations that the hon. Foreign Minister had with Mr. Strobe Talbot. What precisely is the outcome of those rounds? We have never been told about the outcome of those discussions and of those negotiations. I would like to know whether they relate to the signing of the CTBT or they relate to the security concerns of our country. Sir, President Clinton had come. He had said some soothing

words. But at the same time we do not know what to make of the comments of his Secretary of State, who went on to say, "this statement of the President should not be taken to mean that there is a change in our approach to Jammu and Kashmir or that we have given up our commitment to roll back India's nuclear programme." Sir, when the hon. Prime Minister replies to the debate, I request him to enlighten the House on all those matters. President Clinton had come and gone. We would like to know about the sanctions that the United States Government quite arbitrarily and quite unjustifiably imposed on aid to India and on transfer of technology to Indian entities. He should clarify whether those restrictions have been lifted or whether they will be lifted. Sir, I would like to know from the hon. Prime Minister what happens to the instructions that the G-7 countries have managed to impose upon the World Bank and other international agencies with regard to the suspension of non-humanitarian assistance to India. We should be enlightened as to whether those instructions have been withdrawn or will be withdrawn or not. That will be the acid test of the change of the heart or the paradigm shift. It is not merely the statement of words that may have been spoken by the President Clinton when he was in Delhi or while he was in our country. We all know. Sir, that Japan is by far the largest bilateral donor of development assistance to India. That aid remains suspended. What are we going to do to normalise our relations with that country, that great country of Japan? I learn that recently the former Prime Minister of Japan, Shri Hashimoto was in our country, and that he sought an interview with the Prime Minister, but that interview was not granted. I say with all respect to the hon. Foreign Minister that this is hardly the way to conduct foreign relations with a country of the importance, size and weight of Japan.

With regard to our relations with Pakistan we may draw some comfort from some words of President Clinton or what the British Secretary may have said. But we cannot change the facts of geography." Pakistan is our neighbour and will remain our neighbour and persistence in an attitude that we will continue to maintain a stance of no negotiations with Pakistan will not help us. Our fear that willy-nilly it may invite third party interventions is not correct, even though on surface none of these parties is saying that they want to intervene or mediate.

So, the Indo-Pakistan relations are a matter of concern to us, in fact, they are of the greatest concern to us. I want to know from the hon.

[18 APRIL, 2000]

RAJYA SABHA ,

Foreign Minister whether, in view of the US statement that South Asia and Kashmir continue to remain the nuclear flash points, a statement which was endorsed, if I remember correctly, by the French Government also, there is any change in the thinking of these Governments after the recent visit of President Clinton to India.

On all these matters, I hope that the Prime Minister, when he replies to the debate, would be kind enough to enlighten the House.

Sir, I was very happy to know the reference made to our relations with Afghanistan in the President's Address. We have had long-standing relations with Afghanistan, and it is unfortunate that those relations have snapped. Whatever we can do to normalise our relations with Afghanistan and to use our influence in the world fora to bring back a polity in Afghanistan, which can respect the non-aligned character of Afghanistan, I think, will be something which will be in our interest. So, I am suggesting that in our relations with Afghanistan, Iran and West Asia, we ought to be a lot more active than we have been in the past.

That also applies to our relations with China. In this context, I would like the hon. Prime Minister or the hon. Foreign Minister to enlighten us about the famous Karmapa affair. What is the latest thing of that? Where is Karmapa? What has brought him to India? What is he doing in India? What are the implications of his presence or his non-presence in our country vis-a-vis our relations with a country like China?

If you want me to stop now, I will do so.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI ADHIK SHIRODKAR): If you are coming to a new point.

DR. MANMOHAN SINGH: Well, I will stop here. But I have half the speech still remaining.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI ADHIK SHIRODKAR): You can continue tomorrow. Will that be convenient to you?

DR. MANMOHAN SINGH: Yes.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI ADHIK SHIRODKAR): Thank you, Dr. Manmohan Singh.