

RAJYA SABHA

Wednesday, the 19th April, 2000/30 Chaitra, 1922 (Saka)

The House met at Eleven of the Clock, MR. CHAIRMAN in the Chair

ORAL ANSWERS TO QUESTIONS

THE CHAIRMAN: We will take up Q. nos. 361 and 363 together.

Migration of Sikhs From Kashmir Valley

†361. SHRI SURESH KALMADI: ††
SHRI JHUMUK LAL BHENDIA:

Will the Minister of HOME AFFAIRS be pleased to state:

(a) whether Government are aware of the reported decision of certain Sikhs families in Kashmir valley to migrate to other safer areas in view of the recent carnage at Chattishingpora;

(b) if so, the steps being taken by Government to avoid such a situation as happened with Kashmiri Pandits earlier; and

(c) the details of the security arrangements made to instil confidence among the Sikhs in Kashmir valley?

THE MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI L.K. ADVANI): (a) to (c) There has been no report of migration of Sikh families from the Valley. Security forces have strengthened the security arrangements in the Sikh inhabited villages in the Valley by interalia providing security pickets. Security Forces have also been asked to carry out regular patrolling and combing operations in Sikh inhabited areas. It has also been decided to set up Village Defence Committees in such villages, where sufficient volunteers are available.

Action against the Terrorists

†363. SHRIMATI JAYAPRADA NAHATA :
SHRI AMAR SINGH:

Will the Minister of HOME AFFAIRS be pleased to state :

† Starred Questions 361 and 363 were taken together.

†† The question was actually asked on the floor of the House by Shri Suresh Kalmadi:

(a) the number of people belonging to minority community killed by terrorists on March 20, 2000, in Anantnag district of South Kashmir;

(b) whether Government have arrested any member of the terrorist gang found responsible for this massacre;

(c) if so, the details thereof and the action taken to restore the confidence of minority community;

(d) whether it is a fact that months before the visits of President of U.S.A. to our country, intelligence agencies had predicted some spectacular action by the militants in J&K; and

(e) if so, what precautionary measures were taken by the Central and State Government ?

THE MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI L.K. ADVANI): (a) to (e) A statement is laid on the Table of the House.

STATEMENT

(a) 35 persons.

(b) and (c) A local resident of Chittisinghpura was arrested for participating in the massacre, and the security forces conducted raids on terrorist hideouts resulting in the killing of a number of terrorists, alleged to have participated in the incident. The security forces have already strengthened the security arrangements in the Sikh inhabited villages in the Valley by inter-alia providing security pickets. It has also been decided to set up village Defence Committees in such Sikh villages where sufficient volunteers are available.

(d) and (e) There was no specific intelligence input regarding terrorists targeting the Sikh community, which has remained untouched ever since the start of terrorism in the State of J&K. On receipt of inputs about escalation of violence, prior to and during President Clinton's visit, the security forces had been put on full alert.

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: Mr. Chairman, Sir, the whole country is aghast about the recent carnage at Chattisinghpura. It was not hard to foresee that during the Clinton's visit there could be some problems in Kashmir. I wonder why couldn't the security be beefed up in the Kashmir Valley during the visit of Mr. Clinton? There were reports that wireless messages were intercepted before the killings. This information has come to the newspapers through the Home Ministry Sources. The wireless message which was sent

out from Kashmir said, इन दाढ़ी वालों का क्या करें ? This was a message transmitted from this side. The reply which came from there was इनका भी सफाया कर दो। Now, this wireless message was intercepted a few days before the actual killings. Why couldn't the intelligence take cognizance of that? What is the action proposed to be taken against those who failed to act in spite of the wireless message ?

SHRI L.K. ADVANI : Mr. Chairman, Sir, the whole House and the whole country shares the sense of shock that the hon. Member has expressed in so far as this hastily incident is concerned. I can only say that preceding the US President's visit, there was an apprehension that something would be tried in those days as usual on such occasions only to draw the attention of the whole world that the situation of this kind exists. Every single intelligence input in this regard prior to the President's visit was discussed in three meetings taken by the Special Secretary responsible for J&K in which the officials of the State Government as well as other officials attacked has not been confirmed in any of these intercepts. The intercept did indicate that there is a desire to enact some incident during the period. For all this, all the State Governments, not only of Jammu and Kashmir were duly warned repeatedly. All I can say is that lately the President of the USA himself has made a statement saying, "I feel unhappy because of my visit this kind of tragedy should have taken place". in a way, emphasising that what the militants did at Chattisinghpura was directed only to send a message to him, and through him, to the whole world, that they are determined to carry on with these kinds of nefarious activities, come what may !

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: Sir, you have stated in your statement about the setting up of Village Defence Committees. Actually, this has been going on for quite some time. Are you planning to give arms to these Committees ? Sikhs were asked to surrender the arms in 1980. Are they going to get the arms back if they form these village Defence committees ? I would also like to know the progress of the probe institute after these innocent people were killed. You are aware that a few people were killed. Five of them, it was thought that they were the actual militants who killed the Sikhs and the bodies were exhumed. After that it was found that they were innocent people. I would like to know whether they will probe into both these things. What is the progress of these probes? How many orphan children were there in these areas and what do you intend to do about these orphans ?

SHRI L.K. ADVANI: Sir, so far as the probes are concerned, both are still on. Until they are completed and the Chief Judicial Magistrate gives his report, we cannot do anything about it because bodies have been exhumed. But portions of them have been sent for DNA test to finalise the whole thing. Only after the DNA tests are done, the Magistrate would be able to give his report. There is another judicial inquiry which has been ordered by the State Government and both of these are on.

As far as the question of weapons is concerned, all Village Defence Committees, wherever they are formed, are provided with weapons.

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: What about the orphans in that particular area? How many of them are orphan children? What are you trying to do with them?

SHRI L.K. ADVANI: A fresh notice would be needed to find out how many orphans are there.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri Jhumuk Lal Bhendia. He is not there. Now, Shrimati Jayaprada Nahata.

SHRIMATI JAYAPRADA NAHATA: Sir, as we are aware of it, the law and order situation in Jammu and Kashmir has become worsened. Lives of persons are not safe and secure due to terrorist activities. About 40 people have been killed in Chattisinghpura on 23rd March, 2000, at the time of the visit of Bill Clinton, at Anantnag. Terrorists are still playing with the lives of innocent people in Jammu and Kashmir. As per Press reports, 40 people have been killed. But the statement mentions 35. I am very much concerned about this. Jammu and Kashmir, once upon a time, was a tourists' paradise. Now it has become a hell on account of the continuous militant activities and the law and order situation worsening day by day. In this situation, the precautionary measures taken by the authorities to give protection to people are not satisfactory and they have failed to curb terrorist activities. The general feeling of the people is that the whole law and order should be handed over to the military to curb militant activities, as it is apprehended that there is no coordination between the State police authorities and the military personnel. My question is whether the Government proposes to use helicopter gun-ships of the Indian Air Force on regular basis, to demolish militant hide-outs in mountains and jungles in Jammu and Kashmir. If it is so, I would like to know the details.

SHRI L.K. ADVANI: Mr. Chairman, the hon. Member is right that Kashmir had been deemed a tourist's paradise for a long time. In fact, tourists coming to India from abroad used to make it a point to visit Kashmir. But ever since Pakistan has unleashed its proxy war against us and focused on Kashmir, tourism in Kashmir, particularly since 1989, has dried down. It is only in the last two and a half, or, three years that it has picked up again. In fact, in the year 1998-99, it was fast returning to normalcy. So much so that the Amarnath Yatra and everything went on smoothly. I believe that it is this setback in the proxy war received by Pakistan which is one contributory factor to its invasion of Kargil. Again, the setback in Kargil that Pakistan suffered because of the valour and sacrifices of our Armed Forces, ironically led them to accentuate the proxy war and increase their activities. So, it is not correct to say that all these years Kashmir has always been unsafe. The situation improved towards the middle of 1999 and once again, after that, they have again tried to accentuate it and we are trying to deal with it effectively. We feel that we will be able to contain it. So far as the other question is concerned, I would say that the Army is playing its part very ably and effectively. But saying that there is no coordination between the State Government, the State Police and the Army is not correct. There has been complete coordination and so many meetings have also been held in the last six months. There are efforts to see that the elected Government of the State, the State Police, along with the Army and the paramilitary forces put together, are able to deal with the militants and with the proxy war. In Punjab also, the success came about when the State Police, the army and the paramilitary forces together tried to contain militancy and they succeeded. In Kashmir also, we are confident that this would happen.

श्री अमर सिंह: धन्यवाद सभापति महोदय, मैं माननीय गृह मंत्री जी से कहना चाहूंगा कि 20 मार्च, 2000 को जो अनन्तनाग में घटना हुई उस घटना के फलस्वरूप वहां ज्यादातर सिख भाई ... (व्यवधान)

MR. CHAIRMAN : When the questions are clubbed, you are not given a second supplementary.

श्री अमर सिंह : हमारे जितने सिख भाई हैं वे कृषि के ऊपर ज्यादातर निर्भरशील हैं। उनकी कृषि 6-7 किलोमीटर के एरिया में फैली हुई है और वे इस घटना के बाद से अपने खेतों में नहीं जा पा रहे हैं क्योंकि वहां पर सी.आर.पी.एफ. के केवल 2 प्लाटून लगाए गए हैं। क्या

माननीय गृह मंत्री जी यह बताने का कष्ट करेंगे कि इतनी व्यवस्था क्यों नहीं की गयी है कि कम से कम वहाँ जो बचे हुए सिख भाई हैं, कृषि पर जिनका जीविकोपार्जन आधारित है वे कम से कम खेती कर सकें सुरक्षित महसूस कर सकें ?

श्री लाल कृष्ण आडवाणी : अभी तक इन सिख आबादी वाले गांवों में 93 गांवों में 101 पिकेट्स लगायी गयी हैं। यह ठीक है कि पुलिस के साथ सी.आर.पी.एफ. और बाकी भी व्यवस्था है लेकिन पैट्रोलिंग सारी फैलायी गयी है। शायद 140 के करीब गांव होंगे। एक-एक गांव में पिकेट करना संभव नहीं है। लेकिन अधिक से अधिक इनको सिक्योरिटी मिले इसका प्रबंध किया जा रहा है और इसमें किसी भी प्रकार की कमी नहीं होगी। स्टेट गवर्नमेंट ने भी अनेक ज्वाइंट मीटिंग्स करके उसके आधार पर वहाँ आत्मविश्वास पैदा करने की कोशिश की है और केन्द्र सरकार उनको इस मामले में पूरी सहायता कर रही है।

DR. MANMOHAN SINGH : Mr. Chairman, Sir, I along with a number of my colleagues, visited Chattisinghpura and we found a great sense of insecurity among the population. The hon. Minister has stated that they are establishing village defence committees. Sir, it is my submission that in the situation that prevails in this valley now, village defence committees can never play an effective instrument of providing security because the terrorists are armed with extra modern weapons and these village defence committees cannot cope with the problem.

We discussed the matter with the hon. Prime Minister on our return and he assured us that the Government would make more effective arrangements for the 130 villages where the dominant Sikh population resides. Now some action has been taken. But I would like to bring to the hon. Home Minister's notice that in spite of the actions that have been taken, there is a great sense of insecurity and we should not presume that migration is not a possibility. The specific question which I would like to put to the hon. Minister is that when all these ghastly incidents had happened, *ad hoc* compensations are announced. But, as a nation, I think we have no credible and effective mechanism to look after the rehabilitation of the affected families, particularly, where the bread-winner has been taken away by the cruel hands of the terrorists. Since we have to live with this unfortunate situation in Jammu and Kashmir for quite some time to come, would the hon. Home Minister consider establishing a national council for effective relief and rehabilitation of the terrorist-affected families?

SHRI L.K. ADVANI : The hon. Member has suggested setting up of a permanent mechanism to look after the rehabilitation of terrorist-affected families. I would certainly consider it. But I feel satisfied that, though the initial reaction of the Sikh population living in those villages was to quit those areas because there was insecurity, till now there is no migration as such. This is a matter of satisfaction because one of the objectives of this Chattisinghpura incident was to make the Sikhs to leave that area just like the Kashmiri Pandits quit and migrated earlier. This was aimed at another round of ethnic cleansing. This was one of the objectives, apart from the fact that it was intended to give a message to the President of USA, who was visiting India those days. Apart from that, it was also intended to provoke some kind of communal backlash, if possible. None of these things has happened. If there is no migration also, the objective of Chattisinghpura incident would have been completely defeated.

So far as the other aspect is concerned, it may or may not affect the Sikh inhabited areas of the Valley. But it is our duty to see that the families, which are displaced because of terrorism, are rehabilitated properly. As regards the suggestion that a national council or a national mechanism or an institutionalised arrangement should be made, the Government will consider it.

SHRI SWARAJ KAUSHAL : Will the Government consider recruitment of members of the terrorist-affected families in the State Police and in Paramilitary Forces for the purpose of rehabilitation and instilling confidence in the terrorist-affected families?

SHRI L.K. ADVANI : Already directions have been given to the Paramilitary Forces and an advice has been given to the State Government that it would be good if we were able to recruit people from these areas. So far as the Paramilitary Forces are concerned, steps are already being taken in that direction.

DR. KARAN SINGH : Mr. Chairman, Sir, when we talk of rehabilitation of the terrorist-affected families, I would like the hon. Home Minister and this hon. House to realise that in the last ten years lakhs of people have been affected. As regards the people killed in the Valley itself, the estimates vary from 25,000 to 50,000. There are widows. There are children. There are Muslims. A lot of them are Muslims. The Kashmiri Pandits had en bloc migrated from there. In Jammu border regions, at least, one lakh of people have been displaced and are huddled in Jammu. It is not merely a question of

rehabilitating the victims. The Government must come out with a policy to rehabilitate all the communities which have been affected. I will reiterate that the Muslims, the Hindus and the Sikhs, all the three communities, have been very terribly affected in very large numbers.

It is a human tragedy of immense proportion. When an earthquake occurs somewhere, everybody rushes there because there is an earthquake. This earthquake has been occurring for the last ten years. But I fail to see that upsurge of sympathy or understanding, either on the part of the Government or on the part of the general public. I must point out that this requires a paradigm shift in our consciousness.

SHRI L. K. ADVANI : It is different from the natural tragedy like an earthquake, cyclone or rain, where those disturbed are almost in the same region. In this case, the migration which has taken place in the last ten years, has disbursed the Kashmiri pandits, particularly, over a large area. It happens in the areas where they are concentrated or where there are camps—they are still living in camps even after ten years and the conditions are, no doubt, harrowing. It is a harrowing experience for them because whole families have been disrupted. If you were to visit any camp in Jammu or in Delhi, you would realise how agonising the whole situation is. Therefore, what the hon. Member has said is correct, but the solution lies in attending to the problem in a right manner. Because we were of the view that it would be good if they were enabled to go to their places of residence. Such a situation may arise. We are exerting for that. The State Government has also drawn up some plans for that. But until that happens, what has been earlier said by the Leader of the Opposition is a matter we would certainly consider, and the points made by Dr. Karan Singh would also be borne in mind.

† श्री शरीफ-उद्-दीन शरीक : जनाब चैयरमेन साहब, इस अलमनाक और अफसोसनाक वाक्ये पर बहुत से ऑनरेबल मੈबर्स ने सवाल पूछे और अपने दुख का इजहार किया और कुछ तजाबीज भी दीं। इस के साथ ही ऑनरेबल होम मिनिस्टर साहब ने इस बारे में जवाब भी दिए लेकिन यह सदमा इतना गहरा है कि जितने भी सवाल पूछे जाएं, बार-बार पूछने को जी करता है। किसी ने कहा कि लॉ एंड ऑर्डर का मसला है, लेकिन मैं विद ऑल रिक्सेस एंड रिस्पेक्ट ऑनरेबल मੈबर्स को कहना चाहूंगा कि यह लॉ एंड ऑर्डर का मसला नहीं है। यह एक जंग है जोकि बाहर से थोपी गयी है जिसमें वहां की हुकूमत, लोग और लाइक-माइंडेड लोग शामिल हैं। इसलिए इसे लॉ एंड ऑर्डर के मसले से जोड़ना अच्छा नहीं है। इससे कम-से-कम इतना साबित हो जाता है कि यह एक बेखबरी की दलील है। काश्मीर के मामलात से जो लोग बेखबर

† Transliteration of speech in Persian speech is available in Hindi version of the Debate.

हैं, वह इस को लॉ एंड ऑर्डर से जोड़ते हैं, लेकिन यह लॉ एंड ऑर्डर का मसला नहीं है। यह जंग चल रही है और अब शायद हमारी सरकार सोच रही है कि जंग का जंग से जवाब क्यों नहीं दे। जनाब चैयरमेन साहब, मुझे नहीं लगता कि हमें कुछ अदरवाइज शुरू करना चाहिए था। एक बार हो जाता, जो होना था तो हम बार-बार नहीं मरते। अभी चित्तीसिहपुरा में हमारे 35 भाई मारे गए, हमारा खून बहा, सदमा हुआ सारे देश को, सारे शरीफ इंसानों और इंसानियत को, लेकिन एक बात मेरी समझ में नहीं आई कि दूसरे ही दिन खबर आई डिफेंस मिनिस्ट्री की कि उन मिलीटेंट्स में से पांच को मार दिया गया है जोकि चित्तीसिहपुरा मासअकर में शामिल थे। यह बात डिफेंस मिनिस्ट्री के स्पोक्समेन ने भी कही और प्रधान मंत्री जी के निवास से भी कही गयी, लेकिन मैं यहां इस बात को होम मिनिस्टर के सामने, गवर्नमेंट ऑफ इंडिया के सामने चैलेंज करूंगा कि उन में से कोई नहीं मारा गया बल्कि बेगुनाह लड़कों को पकड़ कर ले गए और मार डाला। जनाब चैयरमेन साहब, इन हकायकों से अगर कोई समझे कि मिलीटेंसी रोकी जा सकती है तो वह अहमकों की दुनिया में रहता है, वह बेवकूफी की जन्नत में सैर करता है। मिलीटेंसी रोकी जाएगी एक तो प्रो-एक्टिव पॉलिसी से और दूसरे वहां के लोगों का दिल मोह लेने से, वहां के लोगों का एतबार बहाल करने से, जो एतबार लोगों का टूट गया है, चाहे वह हिंदू हों या मुसलमान हों, उस एतबार को बहाल करने में। मेरे भाई डा. कर्ण सिंह साहब ने अभी कहा, गवर्नर सक्सेना साहब ने भी हाल में कहा था कि 95 परसेंट मुस्लिम उस में मारे गए, लेकिन उन के बारे में कोई आंसू नहीं बहाता है। तो यह एतबार बहाल करने की बात नहीं हुई। जनाब चैयरमेन साहब, टोटल काश्मीर परेशान है। चाहे वह हिंदू है, मुसलमान है या सिख है— वह तो एक ही जिस्म के तीन अलग-अलग आजा हैं। एक को छेड़ेंगे तो दूसरा बर्बाद होगा। यह हमारी तारीख सदियों से रही है। इस तारीख को बचाने के लिए, इस एतबार को बहाल करने के लिए यह फक ऐनकाउंटर्स का सिलसिला बंद करा दिया जाए। आपको लोगों का एतबार बहाल करना चाहिए। वही लोग आज सड़कों पर निकले हैं। पचास साल तक इन्होंने गला फाड़कर आजाद हिंदुस्तान ज़िंदाबाद के नारे लगाए हैं। वहां पर हमारा तिरंगा झंडा इन्हीं लोगों ने लगाया है। वहां आज अगर हम उनका एतबार बहाल नहीं करेंगे तो यह देश के लिए नुकसानदेह होगा और सबके लिए नुकसानदेह होगा। इसलिए मैं ऑनरेबल होम मिनिस्टर साहब से गुजारिश करूंगा कि फेक ऐनकाउंटर्स के सिलसिले में वे तुरंत इक्वायरी कराएं। मैं उनसे जानना चाहूंगा कि लोगों का एतबार बहाल करने के सिलसिले में क्या इंतज़ामात हुकूमत के जेरे गौर हैं ?

श्री लाल कृष्ण आडवाणी : सभापति महोदय, इस विषय में जब शिकायत आई तो तुरंत वहां के चीफ ज़ुडिशियल मजिस्ट्रेट ने कार्यवाही शुरू कर दी। मैं समझता हूं कि अगर किसी ने अन्याय किया है तो उसका परिमार्जन अवश्य होगा। मैं पहले ही बता चका हूं कि उसकी रिपोर्ट जैसे ही हमारे पास आएगी, हम उस पर कार्यवाही करेंगे।

श्री भारतेन्दु प्रकाश सिंहल : सभापति महोदय, मैं इसी बिंदू पर कुछ कहना चाहता हूँ। महोदय, अगर फेक ऐनकाउंटर्स पर बहुत प्रभावी और डेटरेंट ऐक्शन नहीं लिया जाता है तो उससे सारे पुलिस बल का मनोबल गिरता है। हमारे यहां कहा जाता है कि अगर हम प्रोटेक्ट नहीं करेंगे तो मनोबल गिरेगा। मेरा अपना ऐक्सपीरियेंस यह है कि अगर हम किसी भी तरीके से गलत कार्यों को सपोर्ट करेंगे तो उससे हमारे समस्त अच्छे और ईमानदार कर्मचारियों का मनोबल टूटता है। इसलिए इसमें किसी प्रकार की ढिलाई की गुंजाइश नहीं है। दूसरी चीज मुझे यह कहनी है कि वहां के प्रशासन का रवैया समझ में नहीं आता है।

श्री सभापति : आप सवाल पूछिए।

श्री भारतेन्दु प्रकाश सिंहल : सभापति महोदय, 1940 में जो लीज दी गई थी, वह 1980 में ऐक्सपायर हो गई लेकिन स्टेट ऐडमिनिस्ट्रेशन आज तक उनका रिन्युअल नहीं कर रहा है। 370 तो समझ में आता है लेकिन लीजेज का रिन्युअल नहीं कर रहे हैं। यह कब तक चलेगा?

श्री लाल कृष्ण आडवाणी : सभापति महोदय, माननीय सदस्य ने फेक ऐनकाउंटर्स के बारे में जो बात कही है, मैं उनसे सहमत हूँ कि इससे पुलिस की प्रतिष्ठा बढ़ती नहीं है। माननीय सदस्य स्वयं एक वरिष्ठ पुलिस अधिकारी रहे हैं और इस नाते उनका यह कहना उचित है। दूसरी बात आपने लीज के बारे में कही है। अगर आप कोई स्पेसिफिक केस मेरे ध्यान में लाएंगे तो सरकार उस पर अवश्य कार्यवाही करेगी।

SHRI KARTAR SINGH DUGGAL : I would like to know from the hon. Home Minister whether the Government is aware that a substantial section of the sikh people believes that the Chattisinghpura massacre was not done by the Kashmiri militants but by what they describe as the Millijihad group in the State. They believe that it was to shake the visiting President Bill Clinton out of death that they committed this massacre. This fact was denied by eminent Jathedar Tohra and even Sardar Man. But the people are not going to believe them. I will read out a paragraph from an important journal which is published in Chandigarh.

MR. CHAIRMAN : Please put your question.

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA : Sir, it is useless to read out this journal. It is a wrong information. I have visited that area thrice. I went to Chattisinghpura thrice. This is wrong. What he wants to read is wrong. (Interruptions).

MR. CHAIRMAN : Please put your question.

SHRI KARTAR SINGH DUGGAL : I would like the Government to state whether any steps are being taken to disabuse the community of this misconception.

SHRI L. K. ADVANI : Sir, it is our experience that this proxy war has been going on over the last 15 years. Apart from attacking innocent citizens, the agents and the perpetrators of this proxy war across the border have constantly indulged in a systematic disinformation campaign.

This is part of the disinformation campaign which is going on. In fact, the day the Chittisinghpura incident took place, the Indian Ambassador in Washington happened to be here and he immediately told me that it was only a matter of minutes before you would have someone or the other saying that this has been done by the Indian security forces. So, the Indian security forces have been doing a wonderful job in Kashmir for the last fifteen years, and this is the kind of disinformation campaign which Pakistan has deliberately unleashed all over the world. Let it not affect us. Let us not echo this kind of thing. This is my humble request to the hon. Member and to everybody. All the information that we possess shows very clearly that this is an act of militants, inspired by the ISI and about this there is no doubt. Who are those militants? In the course of apprehending them if anything wrong takes place and innocent people are in a way apprehended, action is being taken. Therefore, whatever the State Government has done in this regard is being supported by the Central Government.

SHRI J. CHITHARANJAN : Sir, as has been said by the hon. Home Minister, this tragic situation has been in existence for the last fifteen years. If we go through the experience, certain things come to our notice. So far as the intelligence system is concerned, it has been built up to find out, to identify, how these militants enter the area, how they move about. This could not be understood by the Intelligence. That is one thing that is noticed. The second thing is, even in the case of para-military forces, they are having weapons of low quality, as compared to the weapons possessed by the terrorists. That is also another handicap. Thirdly, when action is taken by the para-military forces, of course, some slanders may be raised. But at the same time, as we know about the police and the military, when such situations occur, if they do not come across the persons who actually commit this thing, they will resort to some action in order to create terror in the area so that this thing may not

appear. Therefore, we do not consider all the allegations that are raised as baseless. Even when one or two incidents happen, it will create a very bad effect. Therefore, I would like to know regarding these three things; whether Government will seriously consider the whole set-up of the intelligence system, the weaponry that is provided to the para-military forces there, and also to see that things like attack on innocent persons do not happen at all.

SHRI L. K. ADVANI : I have been dealing with this issue for the last two years and I would say that had it not been for the input that has been provided by the various intelligence agencies, the situation could have been far worse that way. After all, in these years on every occasion when there was the Republic Day function, Independence Day function, a major VIP was visiting Jammu and Kashmir, there are inputs saying that they are going to do something. Therefore, these precautions need to be taken; these precautions are taken and therefore, tragedies which could have occurred have been averted; even then tragedies do occur, and it is our constant endeavour to see that the intelligence agencies function even more effectively than they are at present and there is greater coordination. So far as arms are concerned, constantly, we are trying to upgrade the kind of arms that we have because our adversaries have very sophisticated arms. They have got them from world over here and there. The Afghan problem there resulted in so many sophisticated arms being left which they fully avil of. Your last question was about attacks against innocent people. I have already said it and I am happy that a former Police official has endorsed this view that any attempt to merely create terror and for that purpose, apprehending innocent people or killing them, is not the right way to deal with a situation of this kind.

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU : Sir, we completely agree with the understanding of the hon. Home Minister that ISI's role is there in fermenting trouble. But, at the same time, we are also seeing that certain sections are using this ISI scare to unleash some kind of a hate-campaign. In this context, I would like to remind, through you, the hon. Home Minister, of a concrete assurance given by the Government in this House about bringing out a White Paper on ISI's activities. Would the hon. Home Minister inform the House when that White Paper is going to come out ?

SHRI L. K. ADVANI : Mr. Chairman, Sir, the Government is considering the matter and the Government would come forth with a statement on this issue soon.

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE : The hon. Home Minister has pointed out, and correctly, that the security forces are doing their best in the given situation. But, of late, we have seen that the security forces themselves have become the target of attack and that those attacks have intensified. In this connection, he has also stated that to provide some security support, a large number of Village Defence Committees have been established. While putting the question, Dr. Singh wanted to know the type of weapons and equipment that had been given to the VDCs to effectively meet the situation. But the hon. Home Minister, perhaps, escaped that part. I would like to know whether the Government has made any hard assessment about the effectiveness of these Village Defence Committees and if so, what has been the outcome of that assessment ? In this connection, I would also like to draw the attention of the hon. Home Minister to the experiment which we had in Manipur, where, ultimately, we had to abandon it, because the extremists and the militants took possession of those weapons and equipment and they equipped themselves with those very weapons and equipment that had been given to the VDCs. I would like to know whether the Government has made any hard assessment about the effectiveness of these Village Defence Committees.

SHRI L. K. ADVANI ; Mr. Chairman, Sir, the hon. Member is correct that I had not replied to this aspect, which Dr. Manmohan Singh had also raised. I can only say that the experience of Village Defence Committees in Jammu and Kashmir is reasonably good. In fact, in some places, it has been very good because these VDCs have been set up since it is just not possible for the security forces to be physically there in so many thousands of dispersed villages. It is in these places that the VDCs, though equipped with ordinary weapons not with highly sophisticated weapons have acquitted themselves very well. The comparison with Manipur is not quite correct because, in Manipur, the problem has been that the militants have been able to get the arms from the Police Stations themselves, not from any VDCs, whereas, here, in Jammu and Kashmir, the VDCs have been very effective against the militants in many cases. Several incidents are there, which can be cited, where the VDCs have been the principal support or the principal protectors of that particular village. Therefore, it is they who have been the principal targets of the militants in many places. Our experience of that has been, on the whole, quite satisfactory.

SHRI S. R. BOMMAI : Sir, the hon. Home Minister told the House about the recent information being spread by the Pakistan Government. My own experience, whenever I have visited foreign countries, is that our

Missions/Embassies have a complaint that the Government is not supplying them with full information and suggestions to educate the public of those countries to build up international opinion in our favour. Pakistan is not only giving a lot of publicity material but it is printing the material in the local languages of those countries and getting them distributed to the general public. That is how they are spreading information and building opinion in their favour.

Would the Government take note of this and take appropriate steps to give our Missions/Embassies the required information and literature ?

SHRI L. K. ADVANI : Sir, it is the constant endeavour of the Government of India in the External Affairs Ministry and our Embassies abroad to mobilise public opinion against terrorism—particularly cross border terrorism and State-sponsored terrorism. I think, lately, even in the world opinion, there is a considerable change in this regard and all the material, that is necessary, is being provided to them. If any specific instance of any specific country has come to the notice of the hon. Member, the External Affairs Minister's attention would be drawn to it.

SHRI CHO S. RAMASWAMY : Sir, the Kashmir problem is not a problem concerning Kashmir alone and rehabilitation is not a problem concerning the adjoining States alone. I think, all the States of the country should be co-opted in the effort of rehabilitation. I would like to know whether the Home Minister would assure the House that all States would share the responsibility of resettling the refugees from Kashmir whether they are Pandits or Sikhs.

Secondly, on fake encounters, the death of innocents just could not be avoided when the security forces are acting against terrorists and when terrorists are mixed up with civilians. There could be, perhaps, some rare occasions where some intentional killing of civilians could have happened. Would the Government made a distinction between the two types of killings of innocents before contemplating any action in the matter.

Thirdly, the Home Minister said that in 1998-99, there was total peace and tranquillity or almost near peace and tranquillity. What was the strategy adopted by the Government prior to that, which enabled achievement of this situation and would the same strategy be re-employed now ?

SHRI L. K. ADVANI : So far as the suggestion that the entire country be mobilised to provide for rehabilitation of the displaced persons of Kashmir is

concerned, this approach has not been adopted because for a long time, it has been our desire—that Government of India's as well as Jammu and Kashmir's—that to the extent possible, normalcy would be accepted only if the Kashmiri Pandits, nearly 2,50,000 or about that size, who migrated from the valley, go back to their own places and are able to live there in peace. That would be a true stepping stone for normalcy. Therefore, regarding them as permanent refugees or accepting that they will not go back again and on that basis asking them to settle down in different parts of the country has not been our strategy, though in the course of their displacement for the last ten years, if they had problems to get their children admitted in medical colleges or engineering colleges, we have been trying to persuade the State Governments that in the case of Kashmiri migrants, some liberal attitude should be adopted. This has been the approach and I think, this approach would continue.

The second question, in respect of people, innocent people, who are deliberately killed because of their mixing up with others, I think, any enquiry always would bear this in mind. Therefore, I have said that a judicial inquiry has been ordered in one case and a magisterial inquiry in another case. We will come to a conclusion as to what exactly has happened after the report comes. *(Interruptions)*. The change that came about was because of the coordinated efforts of the Government of India, the State Government and the various security forces working in cooperation, and also, of course, because of a conscious effort that we should not react only after an incident has taken place. In so far as identifying militants are concerned, agents of the countries across the border are concerned, we should be pro-active and our intelligence agencies should be active.

SHRI ADHIK SHIRODKAR : Sir, the hon. Minister has rightly stated that there are scattered village pockets and it is not possible to have the presence of armed forces—para-military or the police forces, would the hon. Minister consider providing them with walkie-talkies or similar wireless provisions so that the moment there is an attack, there is a quick response from a strategically located presence of military or other forces.

SHRI LALITBHAI MEHTA : Sir, so much time has been consumed on this question. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN : No. ...*(Interruptions)*... Let me tell you ...*(Interruptions)*... I know many Members have spoken elaborately because it is an important question ...*(Interruptions)*... I thought you would also be thinking of the importance of this question. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI L. K. ADVANI : Sir, when Village Defence Committees are set up, they are provided with weapons. Sometimes they are given communication equipment also but not invariably. But, we would keep this in mind. I am told that 1200 sets have been provided. There are in all 2484 Village Defence Committees having two or three SPOs, Special Police Officers. In all there are about 18,000 Special Police Officers in the State. So, the Village Defence Committee network in the State is a large one and is by and large effective.

प्रो. रामगोपाल यादव : श्रीमान्, सीमा पार से आतंकवादी गतिविधियां जो हिंदुस्तान में संचालित की जा रही हैं, उनको प्रभावी ढंग से रोकने के लिए कई साल पहले उपाय सोचा गया था कि हिंदुस्तान की पाकिस्तान से जो सीमा लगती है, उस पर कंटीले तारों की बाड़ लगाई जाए। राजस्थान में यह लगाई भी गई और वह सफल भी रही। यह जो ढाई सौ किलोमीटर लंबी जम्मू-कश्मीर की पाकिस्तान से मिलने वाली अंतर्राष्ट्रीय सीमा है, इस पर बाड़ लगाने के लिए कई वर्षों से सामान भी पहुंच चुका है। मैं माननीय गृह मंत्री जी से जानना चाहूंगा कि आखिर क्या वजह है ? मैं जानता हूँ दिक्कतें हैं। जब कारगिल में 90 डिग्री पर हमारे जवान जा सकते हैं, इतनी ऊंचाई पर जा सकते हैं तो तार बांधने में जब दूसरी तरफ से फायरिंग होती है और वहां रोज-रोज लोग मर रहे हैं तो उसको रोकने में क्या दिक्कत है ? दो साल पहले कंसल्टेटिव कमेटी में जब मैंने यह मामला उठाया था तो ऑब्लीकली यह कहा गया था कि इसके लिए पोलिटिकल विल चाहिए। तार पड़े हुए हैं, सामान पड़ा हुआ है लेकिन जब तार लगाए जाते हैं, पोल गाड़ा जाता है तो दूसरी तरफ से फायरिंग होती है और उस फायरिंग को रोकने के लिए अंदर तक लोग आ जाते हैं और इसके लिए न जाने क्या-क्या करना पड़ता है ? आपको याद होगा कि फारुख अब्दुल्ला साहब ने कारगिल युद्ध के दौरान जब आप वहां मौजूद थे, प्राइम मिनिस्टर भी मौजूद थे, तब कहा था कि जनता चाहती है-इस आर या पार। यही बात मुझे याद है। I was there, लीडर्स मीटिंग थी तो एक बार अगर आर या पार हो जाए और सीमा पर तार लगा दिए जाएं चाहे इसके लिए युद्ध ही क्यों न झेलना पड़े तो यह सब इंशेंट रुक सकता है। क्या इसके लिए पोलिटिकल विल है ?

श्री लाल कृष्ण आडवाणी : सभापति जी, आर या पार का तार से संबंध नहीं है।

प्रो. रामगोपाल यादव : राजस्थान में यह सफल हुआ है। राजस्थान में पूरी घुसपैठ बंद हो गई है।

श्री लाल कृष्ण आडवाणी : मैं जानता हूँ। पंजाब, राजस्थान और गुजरात, इन तीनों राज्यों की सीमाओं पर मैं हो आया हूँ और इसमें कोई संदेह नहीं है कि पंजाब और राजस्थान की सीमा पर कंटीले तार लगाने के बाद स्मगलिंग में भी कमी हुई है। जिसे घुसपैठ कहते हैं उसमें

भी कमी हुई है और सबस्टेंशियल कमी हुई है लेकिन समस्या विल की नहीं है, समस्या भूगोल की है। भूगोल हम नहीं बदल सकते। यहां तक कि राजस्थान में भी एक छोटा-सा एरिया है जहां पर तार लगाना संभव नहीं है। वहां पर जो सेंड ड्यून्स हैं वहां इतनी शिफ्टिंग है कि तार लगाओ तो थोड़ी देर में खत्म हो जाएंगे, गायब हो जाएंगे। इसलिए भूगोल की समस्या है। जम्मू-कश्मीर में तार लगाना संभव नहीं है। जिस एरिया में तार लगाना संभव है इंटरनेशनल बॉर्डर नियर जम्मू, उसके बारे में विचार किया जा रहा है और एक निर्णय शीघ्र ही लिया जाएगा। विल की कोई कमी नहीं है।

SHRI S. VIDUTHALAI VIRUMBI : Mr. Chairman, Sir, from replies we came to know that arms have been provided to the citizens and the Village Defence Committees have been set up. What we want to know from the hon. Minister is, whether the Government has given any self-defence training to the inhabitants of the sensitive areas and if it is not given, whether the Government has any proposal or the Government would ensure that such a type of self-defence training would be given to the citizens inhabiting in the sensitive areas. Along with it, the military dictators of Pakistan should understand that, as far as the unity and integrity of his country is concerned, we will stand, cutting across party lines, as one man and protect this country. This message should go to Pakistan from this august House. I want to know whether you have got any proposal or whether you have taken any action to give self defence training to the citizens living in the sensitive areas bordering Pakistan.

SHRI L. K. ADVANI : When the Village Defence Committees are set up, the services of ex-servicemen are utilised, who are, in a way, already trained. Or, if some brief training is necessary, that has also been given. I fully appreciate what you have said that so far as terrorist and proxy war issues are concerned, the message to the whole world should be that the nation is united on this issue and there are no two opinions on this.

Poverty in Maharashtra

***362. SHRI SURYABHAN PATIL VAHADANE :** Will the Minister of RURAL DEVELOPMENT be pleased to state :

(a) whether it is a fact that the poverty is going up day by day in rural areas of Maharashtra, particularly in backward and adivasi areas of the State ;