

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, it is Private Members' Business. ...*(Interruptions)* That is over ...*(Interruptions)* I will adjourn the House ...*(Interruptions)* If you don't listen to me, then I will remove everything said from 2.30 p.m. till quarter to three ...*(Interruptions)*

चलिये कमला सिन्हा जी, बोलिये। (व्यवधान)  
अगर आप चर्चा करना चाहते हैं तो बैठिये (व्यवधान)  
बैठिये। (व्यवधान) आप भी बिहार की हैं बोलिये न।  
(व्यवधान)

I am very unhappy ...*(Interruptions)*

बोलिये (व्यवधान) आप बैठिये (व्यवधान) बैठ जाइये (व्यवधान)

Mrs. Kamla Sinha, move your Resolution ...*(Interruptions)*

बहुत सुन लिया है मैंने। बैठ जाइये (व्यवधान)  
बैठिये न। (व्यवधान) प्लीज बैठिये। (व्यवधान)  
सुकुन से सुनिये, अच्छा बोल रही हैं (व्यवधान)  
माइनरिटीज़ के ऊपर एट्रोसिटीज़ हो रही है, आप सुनना नहीं चाहते हैं तो मत सुनिये (व्यवधान) आपकी मरज़ी। (व्यवधान) चलिये, बोलिये आप कमला सिन्हा जी। (व्यवधान)

I will adjourn the House...*(Interruptions)* I am giving the last warning. I will adjourn the House if you don't allow her to speak ...*(Interruptions)* It is on atrocities on minorities. If you don't want her to speak, I will adjourn the House ...*(Interruptions)*

अच्छा बोलिये (व्यवधान) आप बोलिये न। चलिये कमला सिन्हा जी (व्यवधान)

I will adjourn the House if you don't allow her ...*(Interruptions)* अच्छा बोलिये ..(व्यवधान)। हो गया।

#### PRIVATE MEMBERS' RESOLUTION

Re. Atrocities Committed on Religious Minorities, especially Christians

SHRIMATI KAMLA SINHA  
(BIHAR): Madam, I beg to move:—

"That this House expresses its deep concern over the situation arising out of the flagrant violation of the

Fundamental Right of Freedom of Religion as enshrined in the Constitution of India by a group of people in various parts of the country who are perpetrating gruesome murder on Christian social workers, violating the modesty of nuns, burning missionary institutions and churches and thereby creating a sense of terror and insecurity amongst the religious minority communities, specially the Christian community, and tarnishing the image of the country in the world, and urges upon Government to take all possible steps to remedy the situation."

Madam, now I want to... रिजोल्यूशन मूव करने के बाद उस पर ...*(व्यवधान)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: आपको भाषण करना है। Just a minute, Shrimati Kamla Sinha. I have to preside over a conference on atrocities against women. I would request Shri Sanatan Bisi to take the Chair. I thank you for being so patient in listening to me. Please allow Shri Bisi to work in peace.

[The Vice-Chairman (Shri Sanatan Bisi) in the Chair]

SHRI MD. SALIM (West Bengal): Sir, how long are we going to sit today, because Madam said...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): Till five.

श्रीमती कमला सिन्हा: इसमें आपको 5—10 मिनट बढ़ाना पड़ेगा। प्रायवेट मेम्बर्स बिजिनेस में दूसरे कामों का इन्फोचमेंट हो गया है।

मैं अपनी बात कहने के पहले कुल और बात कहना चाहती हूँ और शुरू करते समय यह कहना चाहती हूँ ...*(व्यवधान)* मैं आज के प्रस्ताव के संबंध में अपनी बात कहना चाहती हूँ। भारत एक स्वतंत्र देश है और संविधान के जरिए इसका काम चलता है। भारत के संविधान में, इसके एम्बुल में एक प्रस्तावना में लिखा हुआ है—

"We, the people of India, having solemnly resolved to constitute India into a sovereign socialist secular demo-

practic republic and to secure to all its citizens:

Justice, social, economic and political;

Liberty of thought, expression, belief, faith and worship;

Equality of status and of opportunity; and to promote among them all;

Fraternity assuring the dignity of the individual and the unity and integrity of the nation".

साथ ही साथ हमारे जो फंडामेंटल राइट्स हैं—मौलिक अधिकार—उनमें भी कुछ ऐसे हैं जिनका मैं उल्लेख करना चाहूँगी।

Right to Equality, Right to Freedom of Religion—Freedom of conscience and free profession, practice and propagation of religion. It says here, "All persons are equally entitled to freedom of conscience—अपने विवेक के अनुसार धर्म का अनुसरण करना, अनुसरण करना—and the right freely to profess, practice and propagate religion". Article 26 is regarding Freedom to manage religious affairs. It says that every religious denomination or

any section thereof shall have the right—

"(a) to establish and maintain institutions for religious and charitable purposes;

(b) to manage its own affairs in matters of religion;

(c) to own and acquire movable and immovable property; and

(d) to administer such property in accordance with law".

अब हमारी जो जनगणना पिछले दिनों हुई—1991 की जनगणना—उसमें हमारे देश में पापुलेशन का एक सेंसस बना है—कौन-कौन से धर्म के, अनुपात में कितने लोग हैं। उसके अलावा भी और कुछ है जैसे सबसे बड़े छह (6) प्रमुख धर्म वाले हैं हमारे देश में—धर्म के अनुसरण करने वाले। इसमें 82.72 फीसेंट पापुलेशन हिंदुओं की है। मुसलमान 11.21, क्रिश्चियन्स 2.60..। सिख 1.89 फीसेंट, बुद्धिस्ट 0.70 फीसेंट, जैन 0.47 फीसेंट और पापुलेशन सेंसस 1991 में और भी कुछ बातें कही गई हैं, अंदर परसुएणस एंड विलीफ्स करके

जो उल्लिखित है। उसमें ट्राइबलन्स के बारे में कहा गया है, इस देश के आदिवासियों के बारे में, मूल निवासियों के बारे में, ऐसी 70 कैटेगरीज़ हैं जिसमें यह कहा गया है कि अपनी इच्छा से जो उनका धर्म होगा उसका अनुपालन कर सकते हैं, अनुसरण कर सकते हैं। जैसे बहुत लोग एनीमिस्ट हैं, बहुत लोग कोई किसी चीज़ की पूजा नहीं करते हैं, अपनी इच्छा के मुताबिक जो चाहें वे करें।

अब मैं पिछले दिनों जो घटनाएं घटती जा रही हैं उनके बारे में बताना चाहूँगी। एक तो कर्नाटक की घटना 3.12.98 को हुई। यह सब की शुरुआत अगर हम कहें तो बाबरी मस्जिद डेमोलिशन के पहले से होती है। बाबरी मस्जिद डेमोलिशन का दिन 6 दिसंबर 1992, यह दिन भारतवर्ष के लिए सब से कलंक का दिन है और पूरे विश्व के समक्ष हमारा सिर उस दिन झुक गया था। यह बाबरी मस्जिद के पहले जो घटनाएं घटीं बाबरी मस्जिद को गिराने के लिए जो पृष्ठभूमि रखी गई थी, उस पृष्ठभूमि की दोबारा तैयारी की जा रही है। उसी तैयारी के तहत उड़ीसा में, कर्नाटक में, गुजरात में पिछले दिनों घटना घटीं, मैं उसका उल्लेख करना चाहूँगी।

एक माननीय सदस्य: मध्य प्रदेश।

श्रीमती कमला सिन्हा: हां, मध्य प्रदेश भी।

...(व्यवधान)

एक माननीय सदस्य: उड़ीसा भी।

श्रीमती कमला सिन्हा: उड़ीसा तो मैंने कहा है, उड़ीसा, मध्य प्रदेश, गुजरात और कर्नाटक। 3.12.98 को कर्नाटक में एक घटना घट रही थी। चिकमंगलूर के पास वेस्टर्न घाट में एक मंदिर है। यह गुफा में मंदिर है। उसे मंदिर कहिए या धर्म स्थान कहिए, वह ऐसा स्थान है जो हिन्दू और मुसलमान, दोनों धर्मों के एक समन्वय का प्रतीक है। वह हिन्दू लोग उनको गुरु दत्तात्रेय कहते हैं और मुसलमान कहते हैं बाबा बुद्धन, हजरत बाबा की हयात मीर कलंदर। ये एक सूफी संत थे और सदियों पहले इस गुफा को उन्होंने अपने रहने का स्थान बनाया था। दोनों कौमों के लोग हिन्दु-मुसलमान एक साथ मिल कर उनकी पूजा करते हैं। अब तक कभी कोई झगड़ा नहीं हुआ, कभी कोई बात नहीं हुई। 3 दिसंबर, 1998 को 10 हजार लोग, जिनको लोग कहते हैं और अखबार में जो मैंने पढ़ा "बजरंग दल" और "सेफरान ग्रेड" इन्होंने बहुत उत्तेजित भाषण किया और 10 हजार की

फौज लेकर चल पड़े दो फौट ऊंची गणेश की मूर्ति को वहां स्थापित करने के लिए और यह कहा कि अगर हमें मूर्ति स्थापित नहीं करने दिया जाएगा तो यहां खून की नदी बहेगी। मुसलमान लोग इस स्थान को मक्का कहते हैं यानी मोक्ष का एक स्थान और हिन्दू लोग कहते हैं कि यहां जो जाए, वह क़रीबी जाए। आपस में कोई झगड़ा नहीं। लेकिन उस झगड़े को बढ़ाने का काम किया। मैं कर्नाटक सरकार को बधाई देती हूँ कि सरकार ने वहां पर ऐसे कड़े कदम उठाए कि कोई अनहोनी नहीं होने दी और अंत में दोनों कौमों के लोग, वहां जा कर पूजा करके चले गए। लेकिन यह जो उत्पात मचाने वाले लोग थे उनकी मंशा अभी पूरी नहीं हुई है। इसमें समाचार-पत्रों के जरिए यह देखा गया है कि उसमें कई ऐसे लोग थे जो शासक दल के बहुत जिम्मेदार ओहदे पर थे।

3.00 P.M.

इनके संसद भी थे, ऐसा बताया गया है। महोदय, आप उड़ीसा से आते हैं, आप को मालूम है कि कोस्टल उड़ीसा आदिवासियों की संख्या बहुत है और अगर हम करें कि कोस्टल एरिया में जगन्नाथ जी का बहुत प्रभाव है, तो यह गलत नहीं होगा। उड़ीसा के लोग तो "जय जगन्नाथ" के नाम से ही उठते बैठते हैं। वहां 22 जनवरी, 1999 को वारीपदा के पास मनोहरपुर में आस्ट्रेलिया के एक मिशनरी अपने दो छोटे बच्चों—टिमोथी व फिलिप को लेकर एक जंगल केप में गए थे। उस 22 जनवरी की रात को जब वे सो रहे थे, उन को ज़िंदा जलाकर मार दिया गया और उनकी पत्नी स्टेरीस्टेन से जब पत्रकारों ने इस दुखद घटना पर उन की प्रतिक्रिया पूछी तो उस महिला ने कहा—

God, forgive them; they do not know what they have done.

महोदय, जिस दिन ब्राइट को क्रूसीफाइ किया जा रहा था तो उन्होंने भी यही कहा था—

God, forgive them; they do not know what they have done.

अब सवाल यह है कि वारीपदा के मनोहरपुर में ही क्यों यह घटना घटी और स्टेन साहब वहां क्या कर रहे थे? उन्होंने वारीपदा में एक लेप्रोसी हॉस्पिटल खोला था और कुछ रोगियों की सेवा उनका काम था।

महोदय, उड़ीसा में 22 फीसदी पांपुलेशन आदिवासियों की है और देश की पूरी आबादी में से क्रिश्चियंस की पांपुलेशन केवल 2.60 फीसेंट है। महोदय, उड़ीसा में वर्ष

1967 में एक कानून बना जिसे उड़ीसा प्रीमडम ऑफ रिंलीजन एक्ट, 1967 कहते हैं। इस कानून में कहा गया कि—

The Act made conversions through coercion, allurement and inducement punishable.

महोदय, पिछले दिनों लगभग 7 महीने पहले विश्व हिंदू परिषद द्वारा एक घोषणा हुई कि 20 हजार वॉलंटियर्स का एक कैडर तैयार करेंगे जोकि ट्राइबल एरिया में काम करेंगे, ट्राइबल बेल्ट को क्रिश्चियन मिशनरीज से मुक्त करएगा। महोदय, उड़ीसा में कांग्रेस की हुकूमत है और 1998 के केवल एक साल में वहां 30 जगह आदिवासी क्रिश्चियंस पर हमला हुआ है जबकि इस के पूर्व 10 वर्ष में 60 ऐसी घटनाएं घटी थीं। महोदय, यह भी ठीक है कि एक महिला के ऊपर बलात्कार हुआ और उसे लेकर काफी हंगामा हुआ जिस कारण उड़ीसा के मुख्य मंत्री को भी बदल दिया गया, लेकिन आदिवासियों के ऊपर इतने अत्याचार होने के बावजूद कर्नाटक की तरह उड़ीसा की सरकार ने कोई कड़ा कदम नहीं उठाया। अगर कड़ा कदम उठाया होता, अगर उन की इच्छा-शक्ति होती तो इस तरह की घटना नहीं घटती। महोदय, गुजरात राज्य के डांग इलाके में जोकि पश्चिमी घाट क्षेत्र में है, बजरंग दल और वीएचपी ने आर्गनाइज्ड तरीके से चर्च को जलाने व स्कूल को तोड़ने का काम किया और जब वहां की सरकार से कम्प्लेंट की गयी तो उन्होंने कहा कि यह तो केवल झोंपड़ी थी, कोई मकान नहीं था। तो झोपड़ा तो उसको जलाने की इजाजत है, मकान हो तो नहीं होना चाहिए। जिसके अपर क्रूसिफिक्स होगा, लकड़ी का क्रूसिफिक्स उसको जलाने की इजाजत है। ऐसा इन लोगों का कहना है। ... (व्यवधान)...

श्री अनन्तराय देवशंकर दवे (गुजरात): आपको कहना है? ... (व्यवधान)...

श्रीमती कमला सिन्हा: आपकी सरकार ने कहा है। टोकिए मत। आपको जब कहना होगा तो उस वक़्त बोलिएगा।

महोदय, मध्य प्रदेश में भी झाबुआ जिला में नन्स के ऊपर जो रेस हुए हैं, उसमें, गुडमंजी जी यहां बैठे हुए हैं, इन्होंने अपने बयान में कहा कि यह झाबुआ जिले में नन्स के ऊपर जो रेस हुए हैं वह क्रिश्चियन लोगों ने किए, वहां के ट्राइबल क्रिश्चियन ने किए, बाहर के किसी ने नहीं किया है। अब मैं तो कोई अपोरीटी नहीं हूँ, जो आपकी बात को चैलेन्ज करूँ, लेकिन आर्क बिशप एलान डी लास्टिक, प्रेसिडेंट आफ द कैथोलिक बिशप

क्रिश्चन आफ इंडिया ने यह कहा है कि यह बात बिल्कुल गलत है। एक मैगजीन, आउटलुक में है, जब उसने पूछा तो उन्होंने कहा—

"This is left to him. He has to find out what the facts are. But in this context I will tell you something else. He said that he had information that the culprits who raped the sisters at Jhabua were Christians. Now I have not asked him where he got the information from because he can turn around and say that it is confidential. He has that right. But how is it that I have got just the opposite information from the very sisters who were attacked? There was not a Christian among them. Where do we stand? My conclusion is, with due respect to the machinery employed by our dear Advani, there is some defect."

SHRI T.N. CHATURVEDI (Uttar Pradesh): This information was given by the State Government. ... (Interruptions)... Mr. Baby, a former Member of this House, also went there. ... (Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): Where are you quoting from? ... (Interruptions)...

SHRIMATI KAMLA SINHA: I am quoting the statement of Alan de Lastic, President of Catholic Bishops Conference of India, published in the *Outlook* of 8th February, 1999. He has said that. It is not my statement. I did not say anything because I do not have any information. ... (Interruptions)...

मैं यह कहना चाहूंगी। ... (व्यवधान)...

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री सनातन बिसि): प्लीज, प्लीज। मैडम, आप बोलिए अपनी बात।

श्रीमती कमला सिन्हा: सर, मैं तो बोल रही हूँ। तो इन घटनाओं के बाद हमारे राष्ट्रपति जी ने भी अपने भाषण में, 25 जनवरी के इंडियन एक्सप्रेस में उनके भाषण की प्रतिलिपि आई थी, जिसमें उन्होंने कहा—“For the third time in as many weeks, he sharply rebuked those fanning the flames of religious bigotry by underlining that the unity of the country

was not based on any monolithic idea, but on our age-old tradition of tolerance.” ... (Interruptions)...

“वसुधैव कुटुम्बकम्”। ... (व्यवधान) ... जब आप अपनी बात बोलेंगे तो बोलिए। वसुधैव कुटुम्बकम्, यह हमारा मोटो रहा है, लेकिन पिछले दिनों से हम लोगों ने देखा कि यह वसुधैव कुटुम्बकम् आज हमारा मोटो नहीं रहा है।

महोदय, मैंने यहाँ हिन्दू, मुस्लिम, क्रिश्चियन, सिख इत्यादि की आबादी की संख्या आपके सामने रखी। मैं यह कहना चाहती हूँ कि दो सौ साल तक यह देश अंग्रेजों का गुलाम रहा है और ... अगर कन्वर्शन करना होता तो यह पूरा देश क्रिश्चियन हो गया होता।

... (व्यवधान) ... इस देश में ग्यारह, साढ़े ग्यारह प्रतिशत हमारी मुस्लिम आबादी है। आज एक विचित्र बात चल रही है विश्व हिन्दू परिषद और बजरंग दल के द्वारा—घर वापसी, री-कन्वर्शन। अब यह क्या मजाक है? मैं एक बात और कहना चाहती हूँ कि इस देश में जितनी मुस्लिम आबादी है, 12-13 करोड़ की आबादी, ये जब फौज के साथ आए थे, हुमायूँ ने हमला किया तो या उसके पहले पठान या मुगल आदि ने किया हो, जब हमला हुआ तो फौज आई, ये फौज के साथ घर-बार लेकर नहीं आए थे, इसे देश की औरतों के साथ उन्होंने शदी-ब्याह किया और उनकी आबादी बढ़ी। तो अब अगर हम री-कन्वर्शन करने जाएं तो हम कहां तक डीप्लेन्ड टैस्ट कराएंगे? हरेक व्यक्ति का डीप्लेन्ड टैस्ट करना होगा आपको कि किसमें हिन्दू का खून कितना है और फिर उनको री-कन्वर्शन के लिए आपको वापसी की दावत देनी पड़ेगी और इसी तरह की बात क्रिश्चियन पापुलेशन में भी करनी पड़ेगी, जो कि बिल्कुल ही रेडिकुलस बात है। आज के दिन हमें विश्व शांति की बात करनी चाहिए। केवल एक घटना, स्टेन्स की घटना से पूरी दुनिया में हमारी नाक कट गई। पूरी दुनिया के प्रेस ने भारत और भारत सरकार की इतनी निन्दा की है, जिसका कोई हिस्सा नहीं। The Western press has been so critical about India, जिसकी कोई सीमा नहीं है। आपने बार-बार अलहिन्दुता का परिचय देकर अपने देश का अपमान कराया है। पार्टियों आती-जाती रहेंगे लेकिन एक-एक बात मील का पत्थर बन जाती है। 6 दिसम्बर एक मील का पत्थर बन गया है, इस देश की इन्टॉलरेंस एक प्रमुख बात हो गई है और यह घटना भी उसी तरह की बात है। क्रिश्चियन पापुलेशन, ये इस तरह के लोग हैं जो किसी पर हमला भी नहीं करते, किसी के ऊपर अत्याचार भी नहीं करते

और उनका काम विशेष रूप से इस देश में शिक्षा वगैरह देने का ही है। मैं यह कहना चाहती हूँ आपको कि क्रिश्चियन पापुलेशन हमारे यहां 2.60 प्रतिशत है सैसस् के अनुसार लेकिन मिशनरी, अब 32,101 क्रिश्चियन इंस्टीट्यूशन्स हैं देशभर में जो 95,87,838 स्टूडेंट्स को पढ़ाती है, 4,800 हास्पिटल्स और डिस्पेंसरीज़ रन करती हैं। 683 homes for the aged and handicapped; 163 homes dedicated to those afflicted by leprosy. और यह काम 26 हजार के करीब प्रीस्ट्स और 72 हजार के करीब नन्स हैं, जिनका कोई पारिवारिक जीवन नहीं होता, साया जीवन उत्सर्जित होता है समाज के लिए, ये लोग यह काम करते हैं। फंड कुछ अपने देश से आता है, कुछ विदेश से भी आता है—यूरोप से और अमेरिका से। एक बात और है, जो बड़ी इंटरैस्टिंग बात है, अब क्रिश्चियन्स की घर वापसी की बात चल रही है, उन पर हमले भी हो रहे हैं, साथ-साथ पढ़ाई-लिखाई का काम भी हो रहा है। गुजरात में घटना घटी, लेकिन गुजरात के मुख्यमंत्री का फ्रेंड सन, पोता क्रिश्चियन मिशनरी स्कूल में पढ़ता है। आडवाणी जी यहां बैठे हैं, इन्होंने भी सेंट पेट्रिक्स स्कूल, कराची में पढ़ा है। श्री टी०ए० चतुर्वेदी भी डायमंड जुबली कालेज, कन्नौज और क्रिस्ट चर्च कालेज, कानपुर में पढ़े हैं। सत्यपाल जैन क्रिश्चियन हाई स्कूल में पढ़े हैं। मदन प्रसाद जयसवाल क्रिश्चियन कालेज, इलाहाबाद में पढ़े हैं। श्री दिलीप सिंह जूदेव मेयो कालेज, अजमेर में पढ़े हैं। रीता वर्मा उर्सुलेन स्कूल रांची में पढ़ी हैं। इसी तरह कितने सारे लोग हैं जो क्रिश्चियन स्कूलों और कॉलेजों में पढ़े हैं। उनकी सूची दी हुई है ... (व्यवधान)

श्री संजय निरुपम (महाराष्ट्र): सर, यह मुद्दा क्या है?

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री सनातन बिसि): बैठिए, बैठिए ... (व्यवधान) आप बोलिए मैडम।

श्रीमती कमला सिन्हा: मैं केवल इतना ही कहना चाहती हूँ कि इतने इन्टॉलरेंट मत बनिए। इस देश की स्वतंत्रता और धर्म-निरपेक्षता का जो चरित्र है, उसको बरकरार रखना चाहिए और केवल धर्म का उन्माद फैलाने से देश का नाम नहीं बढ़ता, देश आगे नहीं जाता। यह देश हिंदू, मुसलमान, सिक्ख, ईसाई, सबका देश है। सब लोग साथ मिलकर रहते हैं। क्रिश्चियन पापुलेशन दूर-दराज में फैली हुई है। नार्थ-ईस्ट से लेकर अंडमान-निकोबार हर जगह फैली है। अगर सिक्खों की तरह केवल पंजाब में एक जगह फैली हुई होती तो आप

उनसे भी समझौता कर लेते, चुनावी समझौता कर लेते। चूंकि वे लोग फैले हुए हैं, एक जगह नहीं है, इसलिए जो उनकी 2-3 करोड़ की आबादी है, उससे आप समझौता नहीं करते और उनके साथ मार-पीट होती है, उनकी घर वापसी होती है। ठीक है, घर वापसी है पई, बुला लिया उनको और कह दिया कि तुम हिंदू हो गए, कल ईसाई होकर फिर उधर चले जाएंगे। ट्राइबल रिलीजन, उनका अपना रिलीजन है। They are all animists. They are neither Hindus, nor Muslims nor Christians.

महोदय, जो कोई अपनी स्वेच्छा से क्रिश्चियन बनता है, ठीक है लेकिन यह बात मान लेनी चाहिए कि क्रिश्चियन मिशनरी के काम से ट्राइबल ऐरियाज़ में काफी हद तक जागृति आई है, वे शिक्षित हुए हैं और उनका जीवन-स्तर उन्नत हुआ है, इससे कोई इंकार नहीं कर सकता। सत्यता यह है कि जो काम हुआ है पिछले दिनों में, उसे दोहराना नहीं चाहिए। मैं नहीं जानती कि सरकार का कितना कंट्रोल है। भाजपा के जो डिफरेंट विज़न हैं, डिफरेंट आर्म्स हैं, उनके ऊपर सरकार का कितना कंट्रोल है। इसलिए गृह मंत्री जी से मैं निवेदन करूंगी कि सख्खी से उसको कंट्रोल करें और उन्माद फैलाने के लिए छोड़ न दें। आपकी सरकार वैसे ही मुश्किल में है। आगे आने वाले दिनों में आप और मुसीबत में होंगे अगर इस तरह की घटनाएं घटती जाएंगी।

महोदय, मेरे पास बोलने के लिए बहुत कुछ था लेकिन मैं चाहूंगी कि इस विषय पर हमारे सदन के अन्य घक्ताओं की भी भागीदारी होनी चाहिए। अंत में मैं एक बात कहकर अपनी बात समाप्त करना चाहती हूँ। महोदय, आज के दिन दुनिया में कोई देश अकेले रहकर जिंदा नहीं रह सकता। We live in family of nations. एक-दूसरे देश के प्रति सौहार्द बहुत आवश्यक है। हमारा अच्छा नाम हो दुनिया में कि हिंदुस्तान एक टॉलरेंट देश है, इसकी जरूरत है। आज हिंदुस्तान की सरकार के बारे में जो विदेशों में लिखा जा रहा है कि—“India is Governed by a Hindu fundamentalist party.” यह कोई गौरव की बात नहीं है। एक डेमोक्रेटिक कंट्री के बारे में इस तरह की बात कही जाए कि हिंदू फंडामेंटलिस्ट पार्टी ... (व्यवधान)

श्री टी०ए० चतुर्वेदी: नेशनलिस्ट कहते हैं।

श्रीमती कमला सिन्हा: मैंने तो पढ़ा हिंदू फंडामेंटलिस्ट पार्टी ... (व्यवधान)

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI):** No cross-talking. Let her speak.

**श्रीमती कमला सिन्हा:** जितनी पोलिटिकल पार्टीज हैं, सब नेशनलिस्ट पार्टीज हैं। No political party is anti-national in this country. एक तो वैसे ही हम पेशानी में हैं। पिछले दिनों जो बातें हुईं, हम न्यूक्लियर नेशन बन गए, उसके बाद बस यात्रा भी हो गई लेकिन बस यात्रा से लाहौर जाने के बाद भी कोई बात नहीं बनी। शायद आप लोगों ने देखा होगा, ढाका में उसके बाद एक सम्मेलन हुआ डी-8 कंटीज का। पेट डेवलपिंग कंटीज का एक कॉन्फ्रेंस हुआ अभी हाल में पिछले सप्ताह। उसमें उन लोगों ने अपने विकास के बारे में बातचीत की। उस कॉन्फ्रेंस में नवाज शरीफ जी ने यह भी कहा कि— "No solution of problem: without solution of Kashmir issue". और यह भी कहा कि एशिया महाद्वीप की जो समस्याएँ हैं खासतौर से साउथ ईस्ट एशिया उसका मूल कारण है, कश्मीर की समस्या का हल नहीं हो रहा है और जब तक जम्मू कश्मीर की समस्या का हल नहीं होगा तब तक कोई बात नहीं बनेगी, यह साफ कहा है। हमारे ऊपर इकोनॉमिक सैंक्शंस लगा हुआ है। अब इस हाल में ऐसी घटनाएँ घटने में मदद करेंगे या सरकार सख्त से पेश नहीं आएगी तो फिर हमारे लिए आगे आने वाला दिन अच्छा नहीं होगा। नेक्स्ट मिलेनियम में हम जाने वाले हैं, नई सदी में हम जाने वाले हैं। क्या चेहरा लेकर हिन्दुस्तान नई सदी में जाएगा। हिन्दुस्तान एक फंडामेंटलिस्ट कंट्री है। हिन्दुस्तान में जिस धर्म वाले ज्यादा संख्या में हैं उसके अलावा किसी की जान-माल की रक्षा नहीं है। क्या यही चेहरा हमारा होगा? या यह होगा कि India is a tolerant country इंडिया में रिलिजियस इक्विलिटी है India is governed by its Constitution which gives equal rights to every individual residing in the country. यह होगा। तो आप जब यहाँ बैठे हैं तो इसकी देखभाल करने की जिम्मेदारी आपकी है। आइवाणी जी, मुझे खुशी है कि आप आज यहाँ बैठे हैं। मैं आपसे निवेदन करूँगी कि आने वाले दिनों में इस तरह की घटनाएँ नहीं घटने दें। यह देश के लिए भी अच्छा नहीं है, समाज के लिए अच्छा नहीं है, आपके लिए तो कतई नहीं है। धन्यवाद।

**SHRI ARUN SHOURIE (Uttar Pradesh):** Sir, Mrs. Kamla Sinha has drawn the attention of the House to a very

important matter; and it is indeed salutary that she has spoken in such moderate terms. Sir, I think there is some scope to clarify or nail the facts and also to acquaint some of our friends with what the law is on the matter. Article 25 has been cited; the Fundamental Rights have been cited, but what has been inferred is not what the present position is about. Sir, in the last four months, as far as I am able to recall, there have been 7 incidents—even one incident is one too many—and I am all with Kamalji and with all the Members of the House in strongly denouncing every such incident. But, Sir, the facts are quite the opposite and I will first draw your kind attention to them. The first incident—जिसमें कमला जी ने कहा कि हमारा सिर बिल्कुल नीचा हो गया है। about which the hon'ble Home Minister has also said that nothing tarnished the image of the country as much as this single incident—was the rape of nuns in Jhabua. Now, Sir, the other day, Mr. Rajagopal read out to the House. By now there is no mystery about this. This is not a matter for Mr. Advani to investigate or for the C.B.I., or, the Central Government to investigate. The State Government, I am sure, in good faith, has carried out an investigation and 24 persons have already been apprehended and are in custody. It turns out that they are all of one tribe—it so happened; I am not saying it was done by the Christians to Christian nuns. It just so happened that 12 of them are Christians and 12 of them are Hindus. No affiliation to any organisation outside the locality has yet been established. When we say that the world over we have been tarnished, was it not our duty to call a halt to that tarnishing before the facts were nailed? We did not do that.

**SHRI VAYALAR RAVI (Kerala):** Sir, Mr. Rajagopal did not quote from the FIRs. He only read out the Press reports. That is the problem.

**SHRI ARUN SHOURIE:** The second incident that I have been able to reconstruct by looking at the cuttings of the

newspapers in our Library was this. There was a four-column headline in a leading paper of Delhi, "Jhabua repeated in Jhajjar." I can name the paper it was, "The Hindustan Times." It says, "Nuns located in Jhajjar in Haryana have been assaulted and almost raped, as had happened in Jhabua." Another newspaper sent correspondents to that place. They talked to the nuns. They talked to persons in the locality. Nothing of the kind had happened at all. They taped the interview with the nuns. Just see what had happened. I will come to this matter, how this is done. The nuns had opened an establishment there, and they were teaching sewing lessons to women and young girls. A local election for a local Mahila Samiti was taking place. As it happens in a small place, there was tension. Two groups were in the race. The nuns espoused the cause of the candidate of one group. Persons from the other group came. They shouted at them. They said, "Don't you interfere in our local politics. You mind your own business. Stick to the sewing." This entire sequence has been published. Actually, Sir, one of the big spokesmen, if I may say so, happens to be an editor. He is also one of the great propagandists of such misinformation. He has been cited as an authority for this incident by "The Hindustan Times". Neither that gentleman who is much in the news with these atrocity stories nor "The Hindustan Times" went back to that story, saying that as false.

The third incident was about a doctor running an institution in Allahabad. Mr. Joshi is here. He will recall it.

**THE MINISTER OF HUMAN RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT (DR. MURLI MANOHAR JOSHI):** Sylvester.

**SHRI ARUN SHOURIE:** It was reported, "Sylvester has said that the place was attacked and that he was balaboured." That man himself has said, "Nothing has happened. My institution is running. I learnt of this incident for the

first time through a newspaper." Kamlaji was worried about the Western Press. This incident was manufactured by a western news agency. And it was on the Internet the world over, just imagine, on ten different sites.

The fourth incident was the rape of a nun in Baripada in Orissa. In this particular case, it turns out that the local Superintendent of Police and the Deputy Commissioner himself have said that there was no medical evidence of rape or even struggle, far from injury, on this particular lady. I am not saying it. I do not control that State Government. Other well-wishers of minorities control that Government. The Government is committed, I am sure, to the welfare of minorities in spite of the removal of the Chief Minister. The local officers are saying this, and yet, Sir, that also is all over the Internet and in newspapers.

Sir, the fifth incident was the murder of a girl and a boy in Kandmahal in Orissa. Again, it was connected to this large conspiracy theory, as a further result of this conspiracy against Christians. Sir, the local officials said, "There does not seem to be any communal angle to these murders." But those who want to believe the worst about us, about our country, did not want to believe what the local officials were saying. The lie got compound because of their internal politics. It was used by various persons to remove the Chief Minister. But it so happened that that particular young boy, who had committed the murder and was caught on the third day, turned out to be from the same tribal group and the same religious community. Does that show a great conspiracy?

The sixth incident was a series of attacks in dangs in Gujarat. In that case also the accused and the suspects have been apprehended. Instead of making allegations, why do we not take the Prime Minister up on his words? Sir, in his speech, on the Martyrs Day, on 30th January, he said: "In these matters, I am

for a day-to-day trial." I beseech Members that instead of making generalised insinuations, it would be good to hold the Government to that promise, to that urge, which has been expressed by the Prime Minister on such a sacred day. Let us, together, work for a swift trial of these persons.

Finally, Sir, there was the brutal killing of Mr. Satin and his two little children. Theories have been propounded. One person's name is being taken all the time as the principal accused. One set of persons says he was the associate of a progressive politician in UP; that person's group says he was the associate of Bajrang Dal. But why is it that no evidence is produced at all? There is just mutual slinging of allegations. Sir, a Commission of Inquiry has been set up. I know the reputation of the judge heading the inquiry. People from Bihar will certainly know him because, before his recent elevation to the Supreme Court, he was the Chief Justice of the Patna High Court for many years. His firmness, rectitude and complete integrity was the talk of Bihar. He has been lectured by the Chief Justice to inquire into the Killings. Sir, it is a matter of great regret that while he is functioning, not much evidence has been given to him till now. We do not do that. But we want to beat our breast in sympathy for others just to seduce others and in a sense to seduce our country. Sir, from this four conclusions follow. I agree largely with what Shrimati Kamla Sinha is saying. Of these seven incidents, five were completely capable of different construction. The first conclusion is that we should not jump to conclusions. Don't start with a preconception of a pattern and then just see everything through spectacles that somebody else may have manufactured for some other purpose. The second conclusion is: Those who say so much about Mr. Stanes and his little children, please give concrete information to the Justice Wadhwa Commission. Third is this. The accused in the Madhya Pradesh incident are in jail. Hold them to

two tests. Not just the Prime Minister's test of swift trial, but also hold them to the Home Minister's preference, which he expressed; that, for such a crime the penalty should be death. The State Government is that of the Congress. Let the Public Prosecutor be instructed by the State Government to say that in this case, they will ask for death sentence. Who is preventing them? But problem is that they do not want to do the diligent work that is required.

The next point is that, these actually is a real problem. I would beseech the House to please consider it with some calmness. Kamlaaji was just reminding us of the Babri Masjid... Actually, I happened to be one of those persons who at the time of the reversal of Shah Bano's case and at the time of Meenakshipuram conversions, had said that you are stoking a strong sentiment which would become an irresistible sentiment among the Hindus. It is not that Mr. Advani and others took a *yatra*.—I am sorry, I am saying this in front of him—and, therefore, a sentiment was aroused. In fact, I know from personal knowledge that even Mr. Advani was surprised at the response. The response was stoked by Members of both the Houses and converting every issue into a Hindu-Muslim issue or a Hindu-Christian issue. If the Governor of Assam gives a report or the Home Ministry has a report on inundation of several districts by foreigners, and if a small attempt is made to remove 150 persons, to put them nicely in a train and take them to the border area, in this very House, it is converted into a Hindu-Muslim issue. The same thing is happening now.

Shrimati Kamlaaji read from Article 25, "Not only to practice but to profess and propagate the religion." Now, here a learned person...

SHRIMATI KAMLA SINHA: I have not said. I have read it from the Constitution.



**SHRI ARUN SHOURIE:** Madam, I will just come to that. Madam, you were reading Article 25 of the Constitution. Having written a book on it, I can tell you some useful information. Article 25 was called into question, both in Orissa and in Madhya Pradesh. What happened was this. In the Constituent Assembly, there were many proposals that conversions by fraud, force or allurement should be banned as part of this very Article. Then, as a compromise, it was suggested by Sardar Patel. "leave it out of this, because in any case, in law, things done by force, fraud or allurement are illegal and punishable." if I may say so, with great respect to some of my friends who might take offence by my saying these things Dr. Ambedkar said, "In any case, our not including it here does not prevent the Legislatures from passing any law on this particular subject." Sir, on these two assurances, the matter was deferred.

Now, the States of Madhya Pradesh and Orissa passed these two Acts.

**SHRI VAYALAR RAVI:** It was referred to the Advisory Committee.

**SHRI ARUN SHOURIE:** After it came back from the Advisory Committee, on the suggestion of these two gentlemen, it was taken out on those two rationalization. This was repeated by Sardar Patel in the Advisory Committee and also in the Constituent Assembly itself. Now, Sir, the two States passed these laws. The Madhya Pradesh law of 1968—not anybody here passing that law—it was called the Madhya Pradesh Dharam Sansdiya Adhiniyam.

**SHRI VAYALAR RAVI:** In 1968, there was no Congress Government. It was a Government led by the Opposition party.

**SHRI ARUN SHOURIE:** I am talking of this House, Sir.

Secondly, in Orissa, there was the Freedom of Religion Act, 1967.

**SHRIMATI KAMLA SINHA:** I have also quoted that.

**SHRI ARUN SHOURIE:** I am coming to that. Both were tested in the court. And you did not quote what the court has said. Both Acts prohibited forcible conversions. The Orissa Act was truck down in a famous case of Mrs. Yulitha Hyde. An appeal was filed against the judgement. It came to the Supreme Court. In Madhya Pradesh, a person called Reverend staineslaus was convicted of using force, fraud allurement in conversion by the Magistrate. He appealed to the high Court. The High Court upheld the conviction. He came to the Supreme Court challenging that Madhya Pradesh Act. Now, Sir, just see, the Supreme Court judgement was delivered by Judges—whom Mr. Ravi would approve of a great deal—it was not a one—Judge Bench, it was not a tow-Judges Bench... not a Full Bench of three Judges; it was a Constitutional Bench of five Judges. It was headed by whom? By the very Judge to appoint whom as the Chief Justice, Mrs. Gandhi superseded three very distinguished Judges—Justice A.N. Ray. The second Judge was Justice M.H. Baig who became the Chief Justice. The third Judge was Justice R.S. Sarkaria. The fourth Judge was Justice P.N. Singhal. The fifth Judge, another person much favoured by some persons, was Justice Jaswant Singh. You will remember his Commission in Haryana. He was specially chosen for that. To these five Judges, the plea of Staineglaus was, "Look here! Enforce that article 25, my fundamental right for conversion." And what did the Supreme Court say on this? I will just read out two paragraphs from the Supreme Court judgment. I hear again and again in our House, just now about this. They quoted the meaning of "convert". They have got a right of "biological conversion" or "propagate". "Propagate" cannot mean "biological conversion". According to the Twentieth Century Dictionary, the Encyclopaedic Lexicon of English Language, Vol. VI,

"propagate" means as follows: "To transmit or spread, from person to person or from place to place: carry forward or onward: diffuse, extend as to propagate a report: to propagate the Christian religion." This is the dictionary meaning. Not to propagate Islam, but the Christian religion. This is what the dictionary says about 'propagate'. Let us see what the Supreme Court says on this. I have done a computer search of Supreme Court cases. This is the standing judgment today, as Mr. Singhvi will tell us. The Judges say, "We have no doubt that it is in this sense that the word 'propagate' has been used in article 25(1), for, what the article grants is not a right to convert another person to one's own religion but to transmit or spread one's own religion by an exposition of its tenets." It has to be remembered that article 25(1) guarantees freedom of conscience to every citizen and not merely to the followers of one particular religion who were claiming that they were conscience-bound to convert others. That, in turn, postulates that there is no fundamental right to convert another person to one's own religion because if a person purposely undertakes the conversion of another person to his religion as distinguished from his effort to transmit or spread the tenets of his religion, that would impinge on the freedom of conscience guaranteed to all citizens of the country alike. They further go out to quote a 1954 case of the Supreme Court and then say, "This court has given the correct meaning of the articles and we find no justification for the view that it grants a fundamental right to convert persons to one's own religion. It has to be appreciated that the freedom of religion enshrined in the article is not a guarantee in respect of one religion only but covers all religions alike." So, if you say that conversion is a fundamental right of somebody, re-conversion is the fundamental right of the others. That covers all religions alike. And it can be properly enjoyed by a person if he exercises his right in a manner

commensurate with the like freedom of persons following the other religions. What is freedom for one is freedom for the other in equal measure and, there can, therefore, be no such thing as a fundamental right to convert another person to one's own religion.

This was the judgement given by the Five Judges Constitution Bench, and that is the judgment that stands today. On the other side, what is the singular focus of the activities of missionaries? Madam, I speak with some advantage. I will tell you something. *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRIMATI KAMLA SINHA:

Mr. Shourie, you are not to address me you are to address the Chair.

SHRI ARUN SHOURIE: Madam I was just being courteous. Sir, the hon. mover of the Resolution has quoted the Archbishop, who is the President of the Catholic Bishop Conference of India. Probably, it is not known. This Conference was established 55 Years ago, and is the highest coordinating body of the Catholic Church in India. We now have almost 130 Bishops. We have now four cardinals, and it so happened that in January 1994, the Catholic Bishops Conference of India, whose President has just been quoted to us, celebrated its 50th anniversary. All the 126 Bishops, three cardinals, the christian scholars and heads of other churches in India were invited at that time for a four-day workshop to Pune. They asked me, your humble servant, to give them an assessment, spread over the entire morning, of the work of the Church in the last 100 Years, and my proposal for their work in the future. All this is contained in a book called "Missionaries in India". I had shown how the critics of Swami Vivekananda, of his activities—it is in very strong terms—and of Gandhi Ji, have made their view-point. We had extensive conversations with them, how that had been vindicated by time. Gandhi Ji had called this as the deadliest poison. These are his words. He was not tuned to using strong words, and he had warned the church leaders: "You will end-up

becoming the vendors of goods. You are making wise Christians." You can find his words in the Collective Works. You can find them summarised in my book. Now, it so happens that this singular pre-occupation of all churches is just one point-conversion. Sir, the new reports that you are citing, are saying today: "Church stand evangelised Delhi poor by focussing on slum dwellers." This is called the 'Delhi Harvest Network'. These are their documents. There is a strategy to evangelise. Some friends will be interested in Bengalis all over the world. It is in the observer of Business and Politics. A full thing has been given in their document. *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI VAYALAR RAVI: Sir, I am on a point of order.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): What is your point of order?

SHRI VAYALAR RAVI: Sir, the hon. Member is quoting some press reports. *...(Interruptions)...* You can quote every press report. There is a rule to be observed while quoting from the press reports. The hon. Member is quoting from somebody's statement. This incident might have taken place somewhere. He is trying to make an allegation against a community or a society. *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI ARUN SHOURIE: No, no.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): Mr. Arun Shourie, please take your seat. Mr. Vayalar Ravi, what is your point of order?

SHRI VAYALAR RAVI: Sir, the hon. Member is quoting from a document which has not been substantiated. *(Interruptions)...* It is just a statement by somebody to malign a section of the society in this country. Is it in order or not? *...(interruptions)...*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): Mr. Narendra Mohan, I have not allowed you to speak. *...(interruptions)...*

DR. L.M. SINGHVI (Rajasthan): The report itself may be laid on the Table of the House. *...(interruptions)...*

SHRI VAYALAR RAVI: Mr. Shourie was quoting a statement made by somebody *...(interruptions)...*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): Mr. Basu, I will allow you. I will allow you. He is on a point of order. *...(interruptions)...* Just a minute आप लोग बैठिये, प्वाइंट आफ आर्डर किया गया है। *...(interruptions)...* Please take your seat. Please take your seat. *...(interruptions)...* Mr. Shourie, please take your seat. *...(interruptions)...* आप क्यों खड़े हो गये हैं? (व्यवधान) हम आपके बुलायेगे (व्यवधान) It is a point of order. *...(interruptions)...*

SHRI VAYALAR RAVI: Sir, Mr. Shourie can quote; I will accept it. This is somebody's statement. An hon. Member like Mr. Shourie does not quote something said by some-body.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): Please. Just a minute. Wait, wait, wait. What is your point of order, Mr. Ravi?

SHRI VAYALAR RAVI: Sir, my point of order is, if a Member quotes a statement made by somebody, then, who will take the responsibility for the statement? Sir, when I quote a statement from some newspaper, it is my responsibility also to take the responsibility for the statement. Here, Mr. Shourie, who is a most respectable Member, is making statement. I have also seen the statement. It is made by somebody somewhere. It is not at all connected with any church in India. Then how can he make such a statement here to malign a section of the society in India?

SHRI ARUN SHOURIE: I am not maligning, Sir. *...(interruptions)...*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): Just a minute. Mr. Shourie, please wait. *....(Interruptions)....* Mr. Shourie, I have allowed him. *....(Interruptions)....* Mr. Shourie, I have allowed him.

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU (West Bengal): Sir, my point of order is exactly this, with just one additional line, that there could be one evidence, out of 230 million people, how many have been subsequently, actually converted? Can he also quote those figures?

SHRI NARENDRA MOHAN (Uttar Pradesh): Sir, I am on a point of order.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): Wait, wait, wait. ....(Interruptions)....

अभी एक प्वाइंट आफ आर्डर खल नहीं हुआ है, मैं कैसे आपको अलाउ करूँ? (व्यवधान)

Let me dispose of one point of order. ....(Interruptions)....

Let me dispose of one point of order.

SHRI YOGINDER K. ALAGH (Gujarat): Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, a distinguished Member, Mr. Arun Shourie, has been quoting from his scholarship on the whole issue of Christian conversions, would he also tell us something about the reform movement of Catholic Church in India? I know economics. He is also a very distinguished economist. I know somebody like. ....(Interruptions)....

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): Your point is got. ....(Interruptions)....

SHRI NARENDRA MOHAN: This is not a point of order. ....(Interruptions)....

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): Mr. Alagh, please wait. ....(Interruptions).... Wait, wait, wait. ....(Interruptions).... Alaghji, wait, wait, wait. ....(Interruptions).... Mr. Agarwal, why are you getting up? Why are you getting up? ....(Interruptions).... why are you getting up? ....(Interruptions).... Why are you getting up? ....(Interruptions).... why are you getting up? ....(Interruptions).... आप बैठिये। (व्यवधान) सिस्टर शरीरी आप बैठिये। (व्यवधान) मैं आपको भी अलाउ करूँगा, तब आप बोलियेगा (व्यवधान) मैं आपको भी अलाउ करूँगा (व्यवधान)

Mr. Alagh, please wait. ....(Interruptions)....

आप क्यों बोलते हैं? (व्यवधान) आप मत बोलिये (व्यवधान)

Don't speak ....(Interruptions).... Just a minute. Please take your seat, Mr. Shourie. Mr. Alagh, you see it is a discussion on the Resolution. If the Resolution is beign adopted, what all correct things are there, they would be adopted any time. Otherwise, if he is misquoting, if things are not correct, how can they be a part of the Resolution? It cannot be a part of the Resolution. So, before we make any correction in the Resolution, if it is moved and approved by the House, all the things would be looked into. And these are the pieces of information they have collected on their own, these are the facts they have collected on their own. They are responsible for the facts they are submitting here. Please continue, Mr. Shourie.

SHRI ARUN SHOURIE: Thank you, Sir. ....(Interruptions)....

SHRIMATI KAMLA SINHA: Mr. Vice-Chairman, with due apology, I would like to say....(Interruptions)....

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): Here, the point is....(Interruptions)....

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: Sir, he is quoting from some papers or from some documents; I do not know what they are. ....(Interruptions).... Whatever it is, he is not quoting from a newspaper. ....(Interruptions)....

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): Just a minute. Please take your seat, Mr. Shourie. When the Members quote from a newspaper, they have to quote all the details. If you have got, you can quote them.

THE ARUN SHOURIE: Sir, I have not been allowed to complete the statement. ....(Interruptions).... I will, therefore, read the text of the item, another one. This is a long item.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): Mr. Shourie, your time is over.

SHRI ARUN SHOURIE: Sir, this is a very important matter. Let us extend it, please. ....(Interruptions)....

SHRI SANJAY NIRUPAM: Sir, the issue is very important.

SHRI NARENDRA MOHAN: Sir, it is very important issue.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): I know that, but, in the Business agenda the time has been mentioned. How can I change that? ....(Interruptions).... Mr. Shourie, please conclude. ....(Interruptions).... Please conclude. Please conclude. ....(Interruptions)....

SHRI NARENDRA MOHAN: Sir, on Resolutions, there is no time-limit..

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): How can you say this?

SHRI NARENDRA MOHAN: As far as I know, there is no time-limit on a Resolution. ....(Interruptions).... Sir, I need your ruling on this.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): Who told you? ....(Interruptions).... टाइम मेशन किया हुआ है (व्यवधान) होने के बाद भी हो गया है (व्यवधान) सुनि, 22 मिनट हो गए हैं (व्यवधान)

श्री संजय निरूपम: हम सारे लोगों का समय शौरी साहब को दे दीजिए और उन्हें बोलने दीजिए।

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: For every business, there is some time-limit. ....(Interruptions)....

SHRI ANANTRAY DEVSHANKER DAVE: This is the practice of the House. ....(Interruptions).... There is no time limit.

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री सनातन बिसि): ये सब एलीमेंट्री चीजें हम बोलते रहेंगे? टाइम जाएगा इसमें। क्या एलीमेंट्री चीजें बोलते रहेंगे।

श्री अरुण शौरी: हम आपको बतला रहे हैं। एलीमेंट्री नहीं बतला रहे हैं। वह तो लोगों को सरप्राइज है (व्यवधान)

I think Shri Alagh has made a point. He has always been kind to me. As you know, he is a professor who keeps teaching the students as to what answers should be given for the questions. But I will speak according to the things that seem right to me and which seem to be balanced. If they seem one-sided to you—unfortunately, you are not marking my question-answers today ....(Interruptions).... Sir, the point I am. ....(Interruptions)....

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): Please conclude ....(Interruptions)....

SHRI YOGINDER K. ALAGH: The hon. Member has the right to say whatever he wants.

SHRI ARUN SHOURIE: Thank you.

SHRI YOGINDER K. ALAGH: He said that he was quoting a balanced view. He said that the Catholic Church values his views ....(Interruptions)....

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): Mr. Alagh, please take your seat.

SHRI YOGINDER K. ALAGH: I will. ....(Interruptions)....

SHRI ARUN SHOURIE: I can give a large number of reports ....(Interruptions).... I will ....(Interruptions)....

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री सनातन बिसि): बोलिए अरुण शौरी जी (व्यवधान)

SHRI ARUN SHOURIE: There are a large number of reports quoting documents. I can bring them and present them to the House—original documents. They show that the Singular focus of the activities of the church is to multiply what is called a 'harvest of souls'. This is the term they use. This was the term that was used at the Catholic Bishops' Conference. In our meeting it was discussed at great length and its entire. ....(Interruptions)....

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: Sir, my point of order remains. He has not quoted the source of ....(Interruptions)....

SHRI ARUN SHOURIE: I was going to pass over the point ....(Interruptions)....

SHRI BANGARU LAXMAN (Gujarat): What is this? Let him finish. He is quoting. ....(Interruptions)....

SHRI ARUN SHOURIE: I will quote. ....(Interruptions)....

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: The quotation will take five minutes ....(Interruptions)....

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): I have already said that members should say from which source they are quoting.

SHRI ARUN SHOURIE: I am doing that. Here is the Business and political observer. It is a dispatch from Hyderabad about the Jushua Vision India. ....(Interruptions).... Please let me say; let me read the news item. ....(Interruptions)....

SHRI VAYALAR RAVI: What is that? (...Interruption...) There is no such church in India...(Interruptions)...जोशुआ क्या है?

They will make you a minister, don't shout like that.

SHRI NARENDRA MOHAN: Who are you to teach discipline? ....(Interruptions)....

SHRI VAYALAR RAVI: There is no such church at all.....(Interruptions)....

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): I have not allowed you ....(Interruptions).... बैठिए (व्यवधान)

श्री नरेन्द्र मोहन: सर। समय की भी सीमा है। व्यवसायिक (श्री सनातन बिसि): हां नरेन्द्रजी क्या हुआ?

श्री नरेन्द्र मोहन: और मेम्बर को भी बोलना है।

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री सनातन बिसि): समय दिया जाएगा। उनको बोला गया है। (व्यवधान) नरेन्द्रजी, उन्होंने सब पार्टी मेम्बरों का टाइम ले लिया है (व्यवधान) सब पार्टी मेम्बरों का टाइम वे ले रहे हैं—उनके कलैम्स जो हैं (व्यवधान)

श्री रामदास अग्रवाल (एनस्थान): इसके लिए कोई समय सीमा नहीं है (व्यवधान) यह विषय चल सकता है।

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री सनातन बिसि): हां, बोलिए (व्यवधान)

SHRI T.N. CHATURVEDI (Uttar Pradesh): This has nothing to do with the party. This has something to do with the individual. ....(Interruptions)....

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): The office has mentioned like that. ....(Interruptions)....

SHRI NARENDRA MOHAN: Sir, in the past, Resolutions have been discussed by Members. ....(Interruptions)....

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): Please conclude now.

SHRI NARENDRA MOHAN: One single resolution was discussed in this House for a number of days. (Interruptions).

श्री टी.एन. चतुर्वेदी: बोलने की नहीं दे रहे हैं उनके।

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री सनातन बिसि): समय कोई नहीं लिया है... (व्यवधान)

4.00 P.M.

SHRI GOPALSINH G. SOLANKI (Gujarat) Sir, just one minute. Looking to the argument of Mr. Ravi, it appears that he must quote the source. He has already quoted. I would like to remind the hon. Member that Kamla Sinha, while moving the Resolution, has quoted THE OUTLOOK saying, "I do not have any personal knowledge; I do not know anything; I do not have any information". (Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): No, no. I was there. (Interruptions)... Please take your seat. (Interruptions)... I was there (Interruptions)... Please take your seat. (Interruptions)... Mr. Arun Shourie, please conclude. (Interruptions)...

SHRI ARUN SHOURIE: Sir, I have a number of points to bring to the notice of the House. (Interruptions)...

SHRI NARENDRA MOHAN: Sir, it is a very wrong precedent that he is forced to conclude. (Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): What is that? (Interruptions)...

नेत्र मोहन जी, आप बैठिए। ... Just a minute (Interruptions)... मैं बोल रहा हूँ बैठिए। ... (अवधान) ... Mr. Narendra Mohan, just one minute. (Interruptions)... Please take your seat. (Interruptions)... Please take your seat. (Interruptions)... Mr. Arun Shourie, you told me that you would take only two minutes. Your two minutes are over. (Interruptions)...

DR. L.M. SINGHVI: Sir, only the other day it was conceded by the Honble Vice Chairman at that time that Mr. Kapil Sibal would be heard for much more than 45 minutes on Mr. Gadgil's bill. The hon. Member Mr. Shourie is making very valid points and we want to understand them. Why should there be this intolerance in the name of tolerance? (Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): No, there is no intolerance. Mr. Shourie, please conclude.

SHRI ARUN SHOURIE: Sir, the Home Minister wants to say something.

THE MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI L.K. ADVANI): Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, I tried to enlighten myself from the Secretary-General because I have been in the House for many years and I did not remember that during Private Members' Business any Member was restrained from speaking, unless he was irrelevant, unless he was totally off-the-mark or he was using unparliamentary language. I have heard speeches delivered for hours on end and the basis was proviso that we have in rule 27, which says—

“Provided that notwithstanding anything contained in rules 25 and 26 any such business which is under discussion at the end of that day shall be set down for the next day allotted to business of that class, and shall have precedence over all other business set down for that day.”

Therefore, it used to go on. I remember the famous Bill which went on for many Fridays. I was apprised by the Secretary-General that subsequently a direction has been issued imposing a ceiling of two hours on a particular matter. But unless that is incorporated in the rules, I would plead with the Chair that this rule should prevail. Unless it is incorporated in the rules, this rule should prevail.

Furthermore, as Dr. Singhvi has stated, the hon. Member is making a speech which is enlightening for all. They may differ from his viewpoints. They should not try to stop him only because he may not agree with the viewpoints of several members of this House. That is all. Therefore, I would plead with you to allow Mr. Arun Shourie to have his say. This debate is bound to continue even

next Friday. It we are enlightened in the process, it would be good, whether the enlightenment comes from this side or that side. *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir,...

SHRI T.N. CHATURVEDI: Mr. Baby's Bill on International Treaties went on for five or six Fridays. *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: Sir, this issue has to be sorted out. *(Interruptions)*... We have absolutely no problem. *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI RAMDAS AGARWAL Sir,...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): I will allow you. *(Interruptions)*... रामदास जी, मैं आपको एलाउ करूँगा। ...*(व्यवधान)*

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: Sir, this is a procedural issue which he has raised. The point is very clear. The Rules book is here. He has quoted rightly from the Rules book. He knows much better than me, because he is more seasoned, that there is a Rules Committee and the Rules Committee has decided to adopt a certain procedure. These points have been elaborated in the Bulletin itself. If that is to be reversed, the Bulletin which has been sent to the Members by the Secretary-General has no significance. If that has no significance in terms of functioning of the House, we have no problem.

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: But if we adopt this course, every morning the bulletins that we receive, the sanctity will come under cloud. So, you must clarify that.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): Yes, yes.

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: Secondly, we have no problem in discussing the Resolution. This cannot be converted

into a national debate for which the Prime Minister had given a call...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): It is not coming like that... *(Interruptions)*.

आप क्यों खड़े हो रहे हैं? आप क्यों खड़े हो रहे हैं?... *(व्यवधान)*... आप बैठिए बैठिए, बैठिए। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

I have not allowed any person... *(Interruptions)*. Please take your seat... *(Interruptions)*

बैठिए, आप प्लीज बैठिए बैठिए, मैं बोल रहा हूँ ...*(व्यवधान)*... बैठिए ...*(व्यवधान)*...

I have not allowed *(Interruptions)*.

अभी आप बैठिए, आप बैठिए, मैं बोल रहा हूँ बैठिए ...*(व्यवधान)*... Let him complete. I will allow everyone.

उन्हे कम्प्लीट करने दीजिए। ...*(व्यवधान)*... मैं अलाउ करूँगा आप को ...*(व्यवधान)*... मैं आप को अलाउ करूँगा। ...*(व्यवधान)*... आप बैठिए, बैठिए प्लीज। मैं अलाउ करूँगा। सुनिए, सुनिए...

I will allow you. Rule 27... *(Interruptions)*. Please take your seat... *(Interruptions)*. I allow everyone. Mr. Shourie, please take your seat. When the hon. Member has raised an objection regarding Rule 27, I will hear that. So, your points are there. Already I have heard it. Do you want to say something on Rule 27. These are two things. Speak on Rule 27.

SHRI VAYALAR RAVI: The hon. Home Minister is the seniormost Members of this House and, of course, of the other House also. There are certain conventions. We have received a bulletin wherein two hours have been allotted to the debate on this Resolution. It means, naturally, the time will be divided among the parties. That is the practice in this House. If at all he wants to extend the time... *(Interruptions)*. Last time they had decided to extend the time for discussion in the House on one of the Resolutions. *(Interruptions)*.



उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री सनातन बिसी): सुनिश्चित, क्या आप का समय आए तब बोलिए। ... (व्यवधान न)...

SHRI VAYALAR RAVI: Sir, only this House can decide whether the time may be extended or not. Then only it can be done. I have no objection. We are in agreement...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): That has already been dropped... (Interruptions). That has already been dropped by the Prime Minister. That has been dropped.

SHRI VAYALAR RAVI: You can take a decision only at the end of the discussion. But as suggested by the hon. Home Minister, overruling all the conventions and practices, as directed by the Chairman, I think, only one Resolution would be discussed during the whole Session. Therefore, I want you to give a ruling before coming to the final conclusion after going into the precedents and directions given by the Chairman.

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री सनातन बिसी): रामदास जी, आप रूल-27 पर क्या बोलना चाहते हैं? ... (व्यवधान न) ... Yes, on Rule 27

श्री रामदास अग्रवाल: सर, मैं...

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री सनातन बिसी): और किसी पर अलाउ नहीं करेंगे। ... (व्यवधान) ... संजय जी, आप रूल-27 के बारे में क्या बोलना चाहते हैं? ... (व्यवधान) ... बैठिए, रामदास जी, कुछ बोलना चाहते हैं। हाँ, बोलिए।

श्री रामदास अग्रवाल: उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, पहले भी रेजोल्यूशन मेरा इस सदन में तीन बार आ चुका है। ... (व्यवधान) ...

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री सनातन बिसी): बैठिए। बैठिए। सुनिश्चित, प्लीज, सुनिश्चित। आपके मामले में पहले क्या हुआ था, वह आप मत बोलिए। आप रूल 27 पर बोलिए। इस पर आपको क्या बोलना है, वह बोलिए।

श्री रामदास अग्रवाल: सर, आप मुझे कहने दो बोलिए। ... (व्यवधान) ...

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री सनातन बिसी): सुनिश्चित, मैं रूल में जाऊंगा या फिर जो बिजनेस हेममिनिस्टर किया गया है, उसमें जाऊंगा। रूल 27 के बारे में आपको क्या कहना है, वह आप बोलिए या आप का बिजनेस क्या है उसके बारे में आपको कुछ बोलना है तो बोलिए। पहले क्या हुआ, चीज के ऊपर मत जाएं।

श्री रामदास अग्रवाल: सर, मैं वह नहीं कह रहा हूँ। मैं पहले क्या बोला था, वह नहीं बता रहा हूँ। मैं तो सदन में जो व्यवस्था चली आ रही है उस पर आपका ध्यान आकर्षित करना चाहता हूँ। आप स्वयं भी चेयर पर बिगड़ते रहे हैं पिछले समय में भी और उधर के मैम्बर भी उस समय मौजूद रहे हैं, इस सदन में यह व्यवस्था रही है पहले से, कि जब प्राइवेट मैम्बर का बिल या रेजोल्यूशन आया है तो वह एक शुक्रवार नहीं, दो शुक्रवार नहीं, तीन शुक्रवार तक चलता रहा है।

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री सनातन बिसी): वह तो आप पंपप, कन्वेंशन के बारे में बोल रहे हैं।

Are you talking about conventions?

श्री रामदास अग्रवाल: दो घंटे की डायरेक्शन को धेव कर दिया गया था। ... (व्यवधान) ...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): Mr. Minister, do you want any ruling? (Interruptions). Do you want any ruling?

SHRI L.K. ADVANI: Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, I would also like to point out that this particular direction has often been waived in the past because of the rule.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): Are you talking about conventions? (Interruptions).

SHRI S. VIDUTHALAI VIRUMBI (Tamilnadu): Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, the hon. Home Minister has referred to the 'Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in the Council of States'. Sir, there was some change made by the Rules Committee in the conduct of a Private Member's Bill or Resolution. The Home Minister says that untill and unless it is incorporated in the 'Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in the Council of States; it does not have any effect, though it was accepted by the Rules Committee. I would like to know

from you whether the decision taken by the Rules Committee prevails or *status quo ante* has to be followed. Sir, I would like to have a clear direction from you.

श्री संजय निरुपम: वाइस चैयरमैन सर, मैं आर्टिकल 27 के आसपास ही हूँ।... (व्यवधान)...

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री सनातन बिसी): आर्टिकल नहीं है, रूल है।... (व्यवधान)...

श्री संजय निरुपम: जी, रूल 27 पर।... (व्यवधान).... ऐसी कोई बात नहीं। इतनी समझ है, इतनी समझ है, भाई।... (व्यवधान)...

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री सनातन बिसी): जी, बोलिए।

श्री संजय निरुपम: बिहार से जाकर मुम्बई में छकर इतना समझ गया हूँ, आप लोग नहीं समझ पाए अभी तक।

सर, तो मैं रूल 27 की बात कर रहा हूँ। आइयाजी जी ने अपना एक सम्मिश्रण रखा कि जो कानून में है या कानून के हिसाब से है वह यह है कि कोई समय लिमिट नहीं है। ठीक है, समय लिमिट नहीं है, लेकिन बस साष्टन ने कहा कि नहीं साहब, रूल कमेटी का सजेसन यह है या बुलेटिन में इस तरह की बात आई है। मेरा कहना यह है कि माइनेरिटिज की समस्या इस समय देश की बहुत बड़ी समस्या बन गई है, जैसा कि कमला सिन्हा जी ने कहा। कमला सिन्हा जी ने अपनी बात रखते हुए कहा कि पूरे देश की इमेज पूरी दुनिया में खराब हो रही है, हमारा नाम खराब हो रहा है। अब अगर इतना बड़ा प्रश्न है, इतनी बड़ी समस्या है तो उसके लिए किसी भी कानून को बदला जा सकता है, राज्य सभा के इस कानून को बदला जा सकता है, रूलस कमेटी के किसी सुझाव को बदला जा सकता है और किसी भी बुलेटिन को चेन्ज किया जा सकता है। अगर कोई सदस्य सच्चाई बयान करना चाहता है तो बिल्कुल पूरी तरह से उसे मौका मिलना चाहिए, उनको पूरी परमीशन मिलनी चाहिए और उसे अपनी बात बोलने देना चाहिए।... (व्यवधान).... यह सरसर अन्वय है। एकतरफा बयान सदन में नहीं चल सकता।... (व्यवधान)...

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री सनातन बिसी): आप क्या कहना चाहते हैं? ... (व्यवधान)...

श्री संजय निरुपम: आप सुन नहीं रहे मेरी बात, सर।

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री सनातन बिसी): आपकी बात क्या है? ... (व्यवधान).... बैठिए। वह बोल रहे हैं। आप बैठिए।... (व्यवधान).... मैं आपको अलाक करूँगा। आप बैठिए। आप क्या करना चाहते हैं, वह बोलिए।

श्री संजय निरुपम: सर, मैं बताना यह चाह रहा हूँ, जैसा कि इस सदन में इस प्रस्ताव को रखते समय कमला जी ने कहा था कि इस प्रश्न से, इस मुद्दे से पूरी दुनिया में हिन्दुस्तान की इमेज खराब हो रही है।... (व्यवधान)....

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री सनातन बिसी): वह बात नहीं है।... (व्यवधान).... सुनिए। प्लीज, सुनिए। एक मिनट।... (व्यवधान)...

श्री संजय निरुपम: सदस्यों को अपनी पूरी बात रखने की परमीशन मिलनी चाहिए।

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री सनातन बिसी): हाँ, हो गया। मैं समझ गया, आपकी बात।... (व्यवधान).... आपकी बात मैं समझ गया। बैठिए। प्लीज, बैठिए। It is withdrawn.

SHRI ARUN SHOURIE: It could well have been that by now I would have finished. Sir, it is also surprising that, as Mr. Nirupam was saying, on the one hand, we say that it is an important matter, and the hon. Member, who moves the Motion, herself says, please allow him to go on speaking, and on the other they do not let me speak. Sir, rules are now being quoted by persons... (Interruptions)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): Madam, please Now, you please conclude.

SHRI ARUN SHOURIE: I am continuing...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): Mr. Shourie, just a minute. You yourself said that you needed two minutes only.

SHRI ARUN SHOURIE: It was two minutes on the point that we were discussing at that time.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): This cannot be the interpretation.

**SHRI ARUN SHOURIE:** Please let me continue. I was reading statements based on newspaper reports. I have been here since July and I have seen reports from newspapers and magazines being quoted all the time. As you have rightly said, Members must identify the magazine or the newspaper from which they are quoting. There are a large number of items that I could read. These are in responsible papers. I have deliberately not quoted from my own writings on this very important matter. They are quite extensive. But I am quoting other people to lend veracity and to give only factual points. Now, a question is raised as to who is so and so. If I quote the Catholic Bishops Conference of India, which is the largest body, there are a number of evangelical groups which you can find in our newspapers, whose activities from the subject-matter of concern. I had mentioned it in a meeting of the Consultative Committee the other day to bring it to the attention of the Home Minister which did not know of that. Their activities were a matter of concern to our intelligence agencies. I can tell you that in Shri Narasimha Rao's time, a study was done by the Joint Intelligence Committee on the activities of the missionaries in the Northeast. I had quoted this directly. I don't want to go into all those things, into Persons who are involved, those involved sources, those involved meetings of persons, of what they have written about the design in the North-East, how having worked in Manipur and Nagaland in Pushing secessionist activities attention is being directed to Arunachal Pradesh, which persons in the Government wing are being used and so on. I have quoted all these things in the past, but because they form part of my own writings. I am not going into these things. There have been a number of reports of interviews with evangelical groups of responsible bodies which are federations of evangelical groups in India. You will see from the Home Ministry's files that they are

receiving foreign funds for operations in India. On Internet and from other literature, you will find that they are soliciting funds for work in India. And if I mention it on the basis of a newspaper report citing the name of the newspaper, I am asked who they are. That is not quite fair. But if you don't want me to quote newspaper reports, I will quote two documents, and I hope that at least now there will be no cause for objection. I will quote to you a committee's report on missionary activities in a State. The document is available in the Parliament Library, and the only reason why I was not able to get the library copy was that they did not want to issue it during the Session period. It is a two-volume report running into 800 to 850 pages. It has been reprinted and I have the copy here and I will take you through just a few items. It is the Report of the Christian Missionary Activities Inquiry Committee of Madhya Pradesh, printed by the Government printing press of Madhya Pradesh.

**SHRI VAYALAR RAVI:** It was forty years ago.

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI):** Please, please.

**SHRI ARUN SHOURIE:** In that case, I will have to take you through some of the recent reports also. *(Interruptions)* Sir, I was being asked to give an account of the schools and the colleges. I am a student of St. Stephen's College. But that does not change the fact of what the missionaries themselves have been saying about their own work. In the Collected Works of Mahatma Gandhi, you will find extensive conversations in which the missionaries, in response to his questions, tell him, "Yes, our primary focus has always to be on conversions". I can quote to you chapter and verse, the page numbers and the volume numbers, if you so desire.

Now, I will quote to you this official report. The Committee was headed by a judge of the Madhya Pradesh High

Court. There is a chapter in this report, which is called 'Ways of Evangelism'. On page 106 it says:—

"The media through which the Gospel is propagated are primarily the schools, hostels, orphanages. The missionaries use this as an instrument in their task of christianising the whole land".

It goes on citing the evidence, which runs into 700 pages, given by one person after the other, saying, "Yes, our main focus is this". And you don't want to listen to that! *(Interruptions)*

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: Sir, ...

SHRI ARUN SHOURIE: Let me conclude. Just one second, Sir.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): Mr. Basu, which rule are you mentioning?

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: Sir, it relates to Rule 27 which Advaniji quoted.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): No, I am not allowing it. He has already withdrawn it.

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: Sir, this relates to what Mr. Arun Shourie is speaking.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): What is your point of order?

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: My point of order is... *(Interruptions)* This is about Rule 27. *(Interruptions)* I don't think people should be hard of hearing. The point is that we are today discussing about the atrocities committed on the minorities, specially Christians and their institutions. Now, is the... *(Interruptions)*

SHRI ARUN SHOURIE: Sir, please let me conclude first.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): This is a point of order. *(Interruptions)* Please take your seats. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: Sir, is the justification of... *(Interruptions)*

SHRI VAYALAR RAVI: Sir, I have also got a point of order. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: Sir, according to Rule 27 we are not supposed to speak anything which is not relevant to the subject that is being discussed. *(Interruptions)* Now, my point of order is... *(Interruptions)*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): Please take your seat. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI VAYALAR RAVI: I have got a point of order, Sir.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): What is that?

SHRI VAYALAR RAVI: I am referring to Rule 240. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: Sir, as I was saying, it is not relevant to the discussion.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): Wait, wait. Let me look at Rule 240.

SHRI VAYALAR RAVI: Sir, Rule 240 says:—

"The Chairman, after having called the attention of the Council to the conduct of a member who persists in irrelevance or in tedious repetition either of his own arguments or of the arguments used by other members in debate, may direct him to discontinue his speech."

And what does the Resolution say? *(Interruptions)*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): Please sit down. Let him speak. *(Interruptions)* Please sit down. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI ARUN SHOURIE: Sir, ...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): I have to hear him on his point of order under Rule 240.

SHRI VAYALAR RAVI: Sir, I can repeat what the Resolution says.

The Resolution says:

"That this House expresses its deep concern over the situation arising out of the flagrant violation of the Fundamental Right of Freedom of Religion as enshrined in the Constitution of India by a group of people in various parts of the country who are perpetrating gruesome murder on Christian social workers, violating the modesty of nuns, burning missionary institutions and churches and thereby creating a sense of terror and insecurity amongst the religious minority communities, specially the Christian community, and tarnishing the image of the country in the world, and urges upon Government to take all possible steps to remedy the situations."

So, this Resolution, in a nutshell, is on atrocities against the Christian minority. The hon. Member is speaking on conversions. I want to know whether the debate is on conversions or on atrocities. So, rule 240 is very much relevant here. The hon. Member is making an irrelevant speech on conversions which has no relation with the Resolution. So, I want your ruling whether he should be allowed to speak on the issue of conversions or not. The hon. Member is repeating the attacks on the Christian community and their institutions. Therefore, his speech is repetitious and irrelevant.  
...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SANJAY NIRUPAM: Sir, ...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): Mr. Nirupam, are you speaking on the point whether his speech is relevant or irrelevant? Either you speak or he will speak.

SHRI SANJAY NIRUPAM: Sir, I am talking about a very relevant point. The point is, atrocities on minorities.

कमला जी, मेरे ख्याल से यही मुद्दा था एक बार फिर से बतला दीजिए। ... (व्यवधान) एक मिनट ... (व्यवधान) वाईस चेयरमैन सर, मैं बताता हूँ।

SHRI NARENDRA MOHAN: Sir, ...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): No, no. Mr. Narendra Mohan, when I

asked you whether you were going to speak on rule 27, you remained silent.

SHRI NARENDRA MOHAN: My name, Sir?

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): Yes yes. I called your name.

श्री संजय निरुपम: मुद्दा यह है कि अल्पसंख्यकों के ऊपर जो हमले हो रहे हैं, उनके मानवाधिकार का और धार्मिक अधिकार का जो हनन हो रहा है उसकी रक्षा होनी चाहिए, उसको बचाया जाना चाहिए। लेकिन मॉनोपॉली पर अटेक क्यों हो रहे हैं उसके पीछे कारण क्या है उन कारणों का जवाब दे रहे हैं वह। वह कारण धर्मान्तरण है ... (व्यवधान)

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री सनातन बिसि): हाँ, बैठिए न, मैं समझ गया।

श्री अनन्तराय देवशंकर दवे: माननीय श्री अरूण शौरी जी ने जब अपना वक्तव्य शुरू किया तो पहले एक, दो, तीन, चार, पाँच, छः और सात इसीसेस जो कमला जी ने बताए वहाँ से बात शुरू की और उसके समर्थन में जो कुछ बता रहे हैं वह उसके समर्थन में ही बता रहे हैं। इसलिए इररिस्पेक्ट नहीं है।

SHRI S. VIDUTHALAI VIRUMBI: Sir, the hon. Members are justifying the attacks on the Christians.  
...(Interruptions)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): Please take your seat. I have followed you.

SHRI DIPANKAR MUKHERJEE (West Bengal): Sir, they are trying to justify the atrocities committed against Christians.

SHRI ANANTRAY DEVSHANKER DAVE: We are not justifying that.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): Please, please.

आप बोलिए न। ... (व्यवधान) क्यों खड़े हो रहे हैं आप। बस, बैठिए।

श्री नरेन्द्र मोहन: सर, जो रिजोल्यूशन है वह यह है कि —

whether there is a situation of deep concern because of flagrant violation of Fundamental Rights of Freedom of Religion as enshrined in the Constitution. This is what they are expressing. On that issue, all the points, whether positive or negative, have to be brought before the House. If all the points are not brought before the House, perhaps, the House will not know the truth. So, the truth has to be brought here. All the points made by Shri Shourie are relevant as they are in reply to the points Mrs. Sinha has made. Sir, his reply is to what Mrs. Sinha has said and has to be listened to. After all, there should be someone who should reply and tell the House what the truth is behind this, and that is a relevant thing.

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री सनातन बिसि): रुल-240 पर और कौन बोलने वाला है? आप बोलेंगे, बोलिए।

SHRI GOPALSINH G. SOLANKI (Gujarat): Sir, so far as Shri Shourie's speech is concerned, he is on the subject of atrocities on Christians, and he is referring to a particular Commission's report. It is also relevant. Therefore, there is no question...

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: Forty years back!

SHRI GOPALSINH G. SOLANKI: Maybe 60 years back.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): You have made your point. Who else is going to speak on rule 240?

SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA (Karnataka): Mr. Arun shourie, my learned friend, has cited items 1, 2, 3, etc. He has argued that it was not a communal atrocity at all and he has justified that. But, he went on conversions as though he was justifying the atrocities. That is not the subject today. After all, the mover said that she expresses her concern on the atrocities. (Interruptions) I am only objecting to the

later portion of the hon. Member's speech. The House has to express its concern on the atrocities going on in various parts of the country and should find a remedy to that; and not find out the reasons to justify the atrocities. This is my point. It was not relevant. (Interruptions)

SHRI NARENDRA MOHAN: Nobody is justifying the atrocities, but the point is whether ... (Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): Please take your seat.

आप बैठिए ...उन्होंने प्वाइट ऑफ ऑर्डर पर बोला 240 में।

श्री रामदास अग्रवाल: प्वाइट ऑफ ऑर्डर पर बोला लेकिन...

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री सनातन बिसि): 240 में मैंने मना थोड़े किया है। ...नहीं, नहीं, रामदास जी, 240 में बोलने के लिए मैंने मना थोड़े ही किया है। ... (व्यवधान)...

श्री संजय निरुपम: कानून को तो जन्मा ही होगा।

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री सनातन बिसि): आपको मैंने एलाऊ नहीं किया है। ...मैंने आपको एलाऊ नहीं किया है। ... (व्यवधान) ... आप 240 में क्या बोलना चाहते हैं, बोलिए।

श्री एच. हनुमन्तप्पा: 240 में ही बोला मैंने। यह रिलेवेंट सब्जेक्ट नहीं है।

I said on the relevance of the subject. (Interruptions) Please listen to me, Sir; the mover, in her resolution, has expressed her concern on the atrocities committed on the Christian community in several parts of the country. The Hon. speaker was right in saying that it was not a communal atrocity, but it was an incident. (Interruptions) But, later on, he went on conversions, saying that the Christian community or the churches or the Bishops are indulging in these activities and that this was a reaction. that means, he is justifying the atrocities on the Christians ... (Interruptions) ... It is a turnaround on the subject which has been under discussion before the House.

THE VICE-CHARMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): I am not allowing any point of order.

SHRI VAYALAR RAVI: What is your ruling, Sir?

THE VICE-CHARMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): I must know if he was making any repetition. He was not making any repetition. *(Interruptions)* Please listen to me. *(Interruptions)* Please conclude, Mr. Shourie.

SHRI ARUN SHOURIE: Here, it is shown with volumes of evidence. Many of us have taken the benefits of the activities which are undertaken by the Christian missionaries work for which we have great admiration. Sir, when I read this, please do not keep on saying that it is forty years old because, then, I will quote to you...

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री सनानन बिसी): वह चीज आप क्यों बोल रहे हैं 40 ईयर्स हो गए... आपको जो बोलना है, वह बोलिए ...*(व्यवधान)*...

SHRI VAYALAR RAVI: The Commission was appointed in 1954!

THE VICE-CHARMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): Please take your seat. He has mentioned about a document. The document, whether it is hundred years old or fifty years old that itself will speak. *(Interruptions)* The document itself will speak; you need not speak.

SHRI ARUN SHOURIE: You are right, Sir. I will abide by only the document. The Committee of Inquiry quoted a Christian missionary report which said about the objectives of setting up schools: "Care should be taken to secure that evangelism has a central place in all medical and educational institutions." This is at page 107. It says, quoting an annual report, "The first good result of going to school is that the school produces devout Christians." It quotes a publication of the church and says about education: "Evangelism is our call. We make no excuse nor ask for any reservation in this field. Jesus has called

us to preach the Gospel to every creature and we mean to do it in every phase of our work, be it educational or medical; they are distinctly evangelistic. 'Go, teach and win' is the command under which we work. We cannot lessen this emphasis." It quotes another report, their own publication: "Missionaries and board members alike are increasingly aware of the need of both members of educational institutions in the State for dynamic programme of direct evangelism and use of medicine and education in the development of that work. It says that in educational institutions, the devices which are being used for conversion are concessions in fee, provision of free boarding and lodging, allurement of free books and other facilities. For each of these, it gives evidence ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHARMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): That is all right.

SHRI ARUN SHOURIE: Then it says, ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHARMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): Please conclude.

SHRI ARUN SHOURIE: I will actually give suggestions in relation to the Resolution of Mrs. Kamla Sinha for preventing such a situation. Let me lead you to the evidence on the basis of which I will give suggestions; I will not give half-baked suggestions. ...*(Interruptions)*... I will give you suggestions...*(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHARMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): You have already given a lot of suggestions. ...*(Interruptions)*... What more do you want to give? ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ARUN SHOURIE: I have only started giving evidence ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI CHANDRESH KUMARI (Himachal Pradesh): He has been speaking for one hour. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ARUN SHOURIE: Sir, I was absolutely shocked that even in Gandhiji's Works, Vinobaji says in one of his lectures...(Interruptions)...

SHRI VAYALAR RAVI: He is quoting from the documents which were published in 1954. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI ARUN SHOURIE: I am coming to that. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI NARENDRA MOHAN: There is also one latest report published in London. ...(Interruptions)...

श्री ओंकार सिंह लखावत (राजस्थान): महत्मा गांधी जी ने 1924 में जो कहा उसको अगर 1999 में कहे तो उसमें क्या अन्तर है? ...(व्यवधान)...

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री सनातन बिसि): आप बैठिए। ...(व्यवधान)...

SHRI VAYALAR RAVI: They are \* ...(Interruptions)... They are quoting what Gandhiji said. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI T.N. CHATURVEDI: He is repeating the same thing. ...(Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHARMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): Please conclude. ...(Interruptions)... Please conclude. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI T.N. CHATURVEDI: It should be removed from the record. ...(Interruptions)...

श्री उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री सनातन बिसि): आप बैठिए। आप बैठिए। ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री टी.एन. चतुर्वेदी: सर। मैं आपकी बात मानकर बैठ रहा हूँ। ...(व्यवधान)...

THE VICE-CHARMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): Please come to your conclusions. ...(Interruptions)... You need not say that. ...(Interruptions)... If there is anything which is not admissible under the procedure, that will not go on record. ...(Interruptions)...

\* Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

SHRI T.N. CHATURVEDI: It should not go on record. ...(Interruptions)...

श्री संजय निरूपम: सर। इन्होंने ज्यादा टाइम नहीं लिया है। सारा टाइम तो झगड़े में चला गया है। ...(व्यवधान)...

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री सनातन बिसि): आप बैठिए। आप बैठिए। ...(व्यवधान)... कमीशन रिपोर्ट तो हो गई। उसका डिटेल तो आ गया है। आप और क्या बोलना चाहते हैं! ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री अरुण शौरी: सर, मुझे दो पैसेज और पढ़ने दीजिए।...

THE VICE-CHARMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): Mr. Arun Shourie, you have taken a lot of time. ...(Interruptions)... Please conclude. You come to your conclusions. So far as this Resolution is concerned, ...(Interruptions)... You have to give your suggestions keeping in view the contents of the Resolution. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI ARUN SHOURIE: Sir, with your permission, I will read out only two passages. Then I will come to something more recent...(Interruptions)... I will read out one passage...(Interruptions)...

SHRI HIPHEI (Mizoram): Sir, I would like to have one clarification from Mr. Arun Shourie...(Interruptions)...

SHRI ARUN SHOURIE: This is not the occasion for clarification. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI HIPHEI: Do you want to say that those atrocities and killings are there because of those reports? You have to clarify that.

SHRI ARUN SHOURIE: No, no ...(interruptions)...

SHRI HIPHEI: You are reading the contents from the Report of the Commission. On the basis of the Report of that Commission, the Christians were prosecuted, insulted and killed ...(interruptions)...



SHRI ARUN SHOURIE: I beg your pardon? ...*(interruptions)*...

SHRI HIPHEI: On the basis of the Report of the Commission which you are quoting, the Christians were prosecuted, insulted and killed. Can you clarify that? ...*(interruptions)*...

SHRI NARENDRA MOHAN: Sir, this is absolutely a wrong interpretation ...*(interruptions)*... He is not interpreting that way ...*(interruptions)*...

SHRI HIPHEI: Are you going to justify the atrocities on Christians today? ...*(interruptions)*... On that line ...*(interruptions)*... Please do not do that ...*(interruptions)*... He is justifying that ...*(interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): Just a minute ...*(interruptions)*...

SHRI HIPHEI: I am listening to him for a long time ...*(interruptions)*... He is trying to do that ...*(interruptions)*...

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री सनतन बिसि): वह ठीक नहीं है। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

SHRI HIPHEI: Are you going to justify? ...*(interruptions)*... Sir, India will disintegrate if he justifies like that ...*(interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): Please take your seat ...*(interruptions)*...

SHRI ARUN SHOURIE: Sir, I will just read out two more paragraphs which are at page 113, from this Report ...*(interruptions)*... They are at page 113. It says, "...now, as to christian orphanages ..."—this is the Report given by Justice Niyogi Committee set up by the State Government— "...they are undoubtedly being run to multiply the population of Christians. A large number of such orphanages were gathered..." ...*(interruptions)*... Please let me read it ...*(interruptions)*...

SHRI C.P. THIRUNAVUKKARASU (Pondicherry): Sir, the subject is "atrocities on minorities" ...*(interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): Please wait ...*(interruptions)*... Please wait.

उपसभाध्यक्ष: आप बैठिए, बैठिए। आप क्यों खड़े होते हैं? बैठिए ...*(व्यवधान)*...

SHRI DIPANKAR MUKHERJEE: If he speaks from there, I will speak from here ...*(interruptions)*... What is happening in this House? ...*(interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): I will tell him ...*(interruptions)*... Just a minute ...*(interruptions)*... Madam, please, take your seat ...*(interruptions)*... Please take your seat ...*(interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI KAMLA SINHA: I seek your ruling ...*(interruptions)*... The whole issue is being diverted ...*(interruptions)*...

SHRI ARUN SHOURIE: I will tell you as to how the tension mounts ...*(interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): No, no ...*(interruptions)*... Please wait ...*(interruptions)*... Mr. Singhal, the prudent thing is, if any Member wants to change his or her seat, he or she has to take prior permission from the Chair ...*(interruptions)*...

SHRI B.P. SINGHAL (Uttar Pradesh): Sir, I have a lot of papers. So, I thought ...*(interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): Whatever the case may be ...*(interruptions)*... If you want to change your seat, you have to take the permission of the Chair ...*(interruptions)*...

SHRI B.P. SINGHAL: I asked the hon. Members of my party whether I could sit here. When they said "Yes", I sat here ...*(interruptions)*... I am not aware of it ...*(interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): No, no. You have to take permission from the Chair ...*(interruptions)*... Mr. Shourie, please conclude ...*(interruptions)*...

SHRI B.P. SINGHAL: Sir, may I have your permission, now, to sit here ...*(interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): Now you are not speaking. When you speak, you take permission from the Chair and change your seat ...*(interruptions)*...

SHRI B.P. SINGHAL: Okay. I will go to my seat ...*(interruptions)*...

SHRI ARUN SHOURIE: Sir, I am quoting. It says, "... A large number of such orphans were gathered into the Christian fold during famine, natural calamities like floods and earthquakes. There can thus be little doubt that special emphasis on spreading Christianity is given in dealing with young immature minds or those temporarily disabled by physical ailments. No wonder that the largest number of converts are from such backward classes living in areas where, due to various causes, only missionary schools and hospitals exist. Most conversions have been doubtlessly insincere. Admittedly brought about in expectation of social service benefits and other material considerations..."—The Report goes on to say, "it documents cases where money lending programmes were started by missionaries and then used for conversions"—this is there from page 113 onwards; a number of pages are devoted to specific instances—"...money was lent and then the borrower was told that if you and your children convert you need not pay. Otherwise, you will have to pay. ...*(interruptions)*..."

SHRI RAMACHANDRA KHUNTIA (Orissa): There is nothing in this to justify the atrocities on Christians ...*(interruptions)*...

SHRI ARUN SHOURIE: No, no ...*(interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): Just a minute ...*(interruptions)*... Just a minute ...*(interruptions)*...

SHRI RAMACHANDRA KHUNTIA: They want to justify the killings and atrocities on Christians ...*(interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): Wait, wait ...*(interruptions)*... Please take your seat ...*(interruptions)*...

SHRI RAMACHANDRA KHUNTIA: Repeatedly...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): Please sit down ...*(interruptions)* Please take your seat ...*(interruptions)* Mr. Malkani, what do you want to say? ...*(interruptions)*

Please take your seat. ...*(interruptions)* Please take your seat. ...*(interruptions)* Mr. Malkani, what do you want to say? ...*(interruptions)*

SHRI K.R. MALKANI (Delhi) Sir, I want to say that what is being said, is not being said to justify anything, but to understand what is happening and why.

...*(interruptions)*...

SHRI RAMACHANDRA KHUNTIA: Sir, in the case of the Manoharpur incident, the RDC, which had been nominated by the State Government, has already submitted his report that the Bajrang Dal's Dara Singh is directly connected with the ...*(interruptions)* incident.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): You speak when your turn comes. ...*(interruptions)* You speak when your turn comes. ...*(interruptions)* उम्हस जी, आप क्या कहना चाहते हैं? आप बैठिए ...*(व्यवधान)* Will you please take your seat ...*(interruptions)*

SHRI M. SANKARALINGAM (Tamilnadu): Sir, I am on a point of

order. *...(interruptions)...*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): What is the point of order?

SHRI M. SANKARALINGAM: Sir, this Resolution was limited for today only. If it is to be taken up next Friday also, then it is alright *...(interruptions)...*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): We will take a decision in this regard. Are you concluding, Mr. Shourie? *(interruptions)*

SHRI ARUN SHOURIE: Only one more passage from this particular report *...(interruptions)...* Then, I will continue *...(interruptions)...*

SHRIMATI KAMLA SINHA: Please call somebody else, Sir. He has spoken enough. *(interruptions)*

SHRI ARUN SHOURIE: Now, this is an extract from volume 2 *...(interruptions)...*

SHRIMATI CHANDRESH KUMARI: Sir, I want to seek a clarification from you. It was decided in the Business Advisory Committee that this should be given two hours. We have already given two hours to it. Are you going to extend it, so that other Members may also speak, or, are you going to give him a chance to keep repeating his point about the conversions? *(interruptions)*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): No, Madam *...(interruptions)...* Just a minute *...(interruptions)...* I have given the ruling that he is not repeating. One thing is over *...(interruptions)...* So far as the Private Members' Business is concerned, there are so many Members. There are four Members from the Congress, twelve Members from the BJP, two Members from the CPI(M), one Member from the Telgu Desam, one Member from the Samajwadi Party, one Member from the RJD. It has to go on till 5.20. *(interruptions)*

SHRIMATI CHANDRESH KUMARI: No, Sir, till 5 o' clock only. You just now said, "Up to 5 o' clock." When Mr. Salim asked, you announced that *...(interruptions)...*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): No, no, since it started late, we are appropriating twenty minutes more. It is up to the House *...(interruptions)...* No, no, I will take the sense of the House *...(interruptions)...*

SHRI S. VIDUTHALAI VIRUMBI: I want to seek a clarification from you, Sir. According to rule 27 of the Rules of Procedure, the time can be extended. So, I would like to know whether the Rules of Procedure will prevail or the decision taken in the Rules Committee will prevail *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI NARENDRA MOHAN: Sir, according to the decision given on rule 27, the discussion may continue. The time of two-and-a-half hours is not binding on you because *...(Interruptions)...*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): You are repeating the same thing *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI NARENDRA MOHAN: I say, Sir, that there is no such binding that it should be only two hours. It can definitely be extended *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI S. VIDUTHALAI VIRUMBI: It can be extended. My observation is clear. According to the Rules of Procedure it can be continued even next Friday. But, at the same time, the Rules Committee has clearly mentioned that it should be confined to two hours. Now, I want to know whether the Rules of Procedure will prevail or the decision taken in the Rules Committee will prevail. *...(Interruptions)...* Sir, I am only seeking a clarification from you. *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI B.P. SINGHAL: ... despite both these provisions, Resolutions have been carried to the next Private Members' Day. *...(Interruptions)...*

श्री संजय निरुपम: वाइस-चेयरमैन सर, मैं एक बात ... (व्यवधान) ...

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री सनातन बिसि): बैठिए। क्या चीज है? आप टाइम खराब कर रहे हैं। आप हाउस का टाइम खराब कर रहे हैं।

श्री संजय निरुपम: \*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): I am not allowing him to speak. Nothing will go on record.

श्री देवी प्रसाद सिंह (उत्तर प्रदेश): महोदय, दो बंटे डिसकशन तय था। हमारे उस साइड के साथी कह रहे हैं कि समय समाप्त हो गया है। लेकिन लगातार एक बंटे से उनकी टोका-टोकी में डिसकशन नहीं हो सकता है। अभी भी एक घंटा गया हुआ है ... (व्यवधान) ...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): Not one hour.

SHRI ARUN SHOURIE: From this particular report I will quote only this passage now. This is in volume 2, part B, at page 54. Sir, these are instructions and you will see how tensions arise. ... (Interruptions) ... Please, if you will; just see what instructions are given to the missionary by the church, you will see what is going to happen as a consequence. I do not have to justify, I do not justify, but please try to understand what is igniting a reaction. Please understand. This is a quotation. This is from page 54. The extract which they are giving is from an instruction book let for missionaries. The name of the booklet is "Catholic Dharm Ka Pracharak"

अब आप देखिए कि किताब के पृष्ठ 33 पर क्या लिखा हुआ है:

"यदि आपको स्पष्ट रूप से मालूम हो कि आप अपने बालक को बैपटिज्म देने को कभी राजी नहीं होगा और बालक, जहां तक आप जान सकते हैं, मरने पर हो तो दवाई के बहाने से किसी गुप्त रीति से, उसके सर पर कुछ पानी डाल देते हो तो उसके बैपटिज्म की बात को चालू कीजिए। हे प्रचारक, यह बालक मर जाए तो आपने उसके स्वर्ग का द्वार खोल दिया है।"

\* Not recorded

इस तरह से दवाई के बहाने वह कहते हैं कि ऐसा करो। "क्या यह अच्छा नहीं है। अब हर एक प्रचारक इसी काम में लगा रहे तो वह साल भर में कितने बालकों को स्वर्ग पहुंचायेगा?"

अगली इंटरक्वाशन:

"मरने वाले आदमी के कुटुम्ब के लोग आपको घर में बैठने न दें तो आपको समझाइए कि आपको देन कुछ बुरी बात नहीं। सर्वशक्तिमान परमेश्वर उसको ठीक करेगा। अगर ठीक कर सकता है। यदि यह उपाय न चले तो उसको दवा पिलाने के बहाने उसके पास जाने को छुट्टी मांगिए। संक्षेप में सब उपाय निकालिए जिनसे आप उसकी आत्मा को बचा सकें।"

यह 700 पेज का है। जब इन चीजों पर आप अमल कीजिएगा ... (व्यवधान) ... and even in my own book I have shown that these practices continued till 1994, when I was speaking and not one of the 12 Bishops objected any point of fact. In fact it was said at the lecture that it had been a feast. Not one contradiction of this was advanced. You said that it was 1954. I will now start reading from 1980.

श्री दीपंकर मुखर्जी: अभी और भी पढ़ेंगे क्या? (व्यवधान)

श्री अरुण शौरी: एक और डॉकुमेंट है। ... (व्यवधान)

SHRIMATI KAMLA SINHA: This is too much.

SHRI DIPANKAR MUKHERJEE: This is an atrocity on us, my dear friend. You bring a resolution on conversions, and let us discuss about it. Where is the resolution?

What is he talking, Mr. Vice-Chairman? How long should we put up with this? This is an atrocity on us. ... (Interruptions) ...

SHRIMATI KAMLA SINHA: Sir, I am on a point of order.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): Yes, Madam, what is your point of order?

SHRIMATI KAMLA SINHA: Kindly tell the hon. Member, Mr. Arun Shourie, to place all the documents that he wants to put on record on the Table of the House. There is no need of going on reading here and there.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): Mr. Arun Shourie, conclude ... (Interruptions)... बैठिये। बैठिये। (व्यवधान) आप लोग बैठिये। (व्यवधान) आप लोग बैठ जाइये (व्यवधान)

श्री रामदास अग्रवाल: आप रेजोल्यूशन काहे के लिए लाई है? (व्यवधान)

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री सनातन बिसि): आप बैठिये। (व्यवधान)

श्री रामदास अग्रवाल : जो चीजें छिपी हुई हैं, स्पष्ट नहीं हैं, उनको स्पष्ट करने के लिए आप वह रेजोल्यूशन लाई है।

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री सनातन बिसि): आप क्यों खड़े हो रहे हैं? (व्यवधान) अरुण शौरी जी आप बोलिये (व्यवधान)

SHRI ARUN SHOURIE: This is a report. As an objection was taken that this was about 1954, I will show you in detail that this practice continues till today.

This is important. I want to take you to another document, a more recent one, that of 1980. This is the report of the Consultation on World Evangelisation. It is called, "The Thailand Report on Hindus" by the Consultation on World Evangelisation. The group met in Pataya in Thailand and prepared this document as a guideline for action. You see that on every matter they say that the only object must be evangelisation. They give you specific guidelines on how to use TV, how to use radio, how to use Press in the hands of others for this very purpose etc. There are a large number of things to be read here. But I will read to you only one point. I read this at the Conference. I said, "You have called me for, what you said, a dialogue. Tell me: do you subscribe to this description of a dialo-

gue?" They say, "Engage non-Christians in dialogue." But what is the purpose? This is on page 22.

SHRI VAYALAR RAVI: Which 22?

SHRI ARUN SHOURIE: I have identified the report, Sir.

SHRI DIPANKAR MUKHERJEE: Please refer to the Resolution.

SHRI ARUN SHOURIE: When those instructions are acted upon...

SHRI VAYALAR RAVI: This Conference was in Thailand, not in India.

SHRI ARUN SHOURIE: I just went there. Indians were going there.

एक माननीय सदस्य: पूरी-पूरी बात सुनिये। (व्यवधान)

श्री दीपांकर मुखर्जी: हम सुने के लिए बैठे हैं (व्यवधान) लेकिन यह छोड़ेंगे नहीं पार्लियामेंट (व्यवधान)

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री सनातन बिसि): उनको बोलने दीजिये (व्यवधान)

SHRI DIPANKAR MUKHERJEE: What is the idea? It is a question of convincing the convinced. The Home Minister is also appreciating it. We want to hear him on the Resolution. What is he saying? Then, I too will go on speaking on a solution; I will not stop. We want to hear him on this Resolution. If he is going to continue, let him continue like this.

कोई तबला बजाए (व्यवधान) कोई हारमोनियम बजाए (व्यवधान) हाऊस चलता जा रहा है (व्यवधान)

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री सनातन बिसि): आप बैठिये। (व्यवधान)

श्री दीपांकर मुखर्जी: What is it that he wants? Let us discuss the Resolution. I want your ruling on this, Sir.

SHRI S. VIDUTHALAI VIRUMBI: He may continue but not any further today. It is five o'clock now.

SHRI DIPANKAR MUKHERJEE: Let him bring a resolution on conversions

if he wants. This Resolution is on atrocities and for more than half-an-hour he has not talked a single word on 'atrocities'. He is talking on conversions. ...*(Interruptions)*... This is nothing short of a verbal atrocity ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SANATAN BISI): Just a minute please. Hon. Members, the time is 5 p.m. The

House is now adjourned, till 11 a.m. on Monday, the 8th March, 1999.

The House then adjourned at one minute past five of the clock, till eleven of the clock on Monday, the 8th March, 1999