

You have no point ...*(Interruptions)*...

उपसभापति: मैसेज तो दे दें। लो सभा में मैसेज आया है एटलीस्ट वह तो रिपोर्ट हो जाए कि आगे क्या बिजनेस है।

**MESSAGE FROM THE LOK
SABHA—Contd.**

**(I) The Goa Appropriation (Vote on
Account) Bill, 1999**

(II) The Goa Appropriation Bill, 1999

SECRETARY-GENERAL: I have to report to the House the following messages received from the Lok Sabha, signed by the Secretary-General of the Lok Sabha:—

(I)

"In accordance with the provisions of rule 96 of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in Lok Sabha, I am directed to enclose the Goa Appropriation (Vote on Account) Bill, 1999, as passed by Lok Sabha at its sitting held on the 10th March, 1999."

(II) "In accordance with the provisions of rule 96 of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in Lok Sabha, I am directed to enclose the Goa Appropriation Bill, 1999, as passed by Lok Sabha at its sitting held on the 10th March, 1999."

Madam, I lay a copy of each of the Bills on the Table.

**RE. REMOVAL OF NAVAL CHIEF
AND ALLEGATIONS MADE BY SHIV
MOHAN GURUSWAMY—Contd.**

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Shall we go back to Special Mentions? ...*(interruptions)*...

गुरुदास दासगुप्त जी को बोलने दीजिए।

SHRI SANGH PRIYA GAUTAM: Madam, we want your ruling ...*(Interruptions)*... You have given your ruling ...*(Interruptions)*... Whether they want to

continue with the Business in the House or not ...*(Interruptions)*... This is the question before the House ...*(Interruptions)*... You have given your ruling ...*(Interruptions)*... Nobody should interrupt the Business of the House ...*(Interruptions)* ...

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Madam, I have a short point. I agree with what Mr. Naidu has said. He said that the hon. Chairman of the House, in consultation with the Leader of the House, shall decide the time for the discussion. I agree with him. But that is precisely where our complaint is. During the last three days—let it be known to all—all the political parties, representing the opposition collectively, implored repeatedly that the House may be given some time by the Leader of the House, to which the Leader of the House did not agree. As a result, the hon. Chairman is helpless. According to the Rule Book, the hon. Chairman is helpless, if the Leader of the House does not give time.

SHRI SANGH PRIYA GAUTAM: How can he speak on behalf of the hon. Chairman? ...*(interruptions)*... You cannot speak on behalf of the hon. Chairman ...*(interruptions)*...

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Madam, just see ...*(interruptions)*... No, no ...*(interruptions)*... Madam, just see ...*(interruptions)*... Mr. Naidu, see how he is speaking ...*(interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Gurudas Das Gupta, let me put the things properly. The Chairman is never helpless. The rules are binding on everybody—the Chairman and all of us. I would request you earnestly—I can give a ruling also—that never use words as to the 'helplessness of the Chairman of the House.'

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: I abide by your direction ...*(interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You withdraw those words ...*(interruptions)*...

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Madam, I withdraw those words ...(interruptions) ...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Even I am not helpless. I can easily adjourn the House.

SHRI MD. SALIM: Yes, Madam. You are very helpful ...(interruptions)...

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: The point is, if the Leader of the House does not agree to give time, it is not possible for us—the Business Advisory Committee—to fix the time-table for the discussion. That is what our complaint is. Therefore, the suggestion that has been given by the hon. Minister of State of Parliamentary Affairs does not fulfil the requirement that we are demanding from the Government. The Government must say that it is ready to give time, it is ready to agree for a discussion specifically on the complaint that Mr. Bhagwat has raised in regard to his dismissal.

The Government must agree ...(interruptions) ...

SHRI SANGH PRIYA GAUTAM: You have already spoken ...(interruptions)... Madam has given her ruling.

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Mr. Naidu, what is this? ...(interruptions)...

SHRI VAYALAR RAVT (Kerala): Madam, the point is that rule 170 has been complied with, rule 171 has been complied with; but a decision under rule 172 is pending as the Motion has already been admitted and published in the Bulletin. Even today the Minister says that he is ready for a discussion. But we want a commitment on the floor of the House. So far, he has not made any commitment on the floor of the House. Therefore, we do not accept his offer for a discussion. (Interruptions)

SHRI S. VIDUTHALAI VIRUMBI (Tamilnadu): Let them come forward and assure the House that ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: The Government must make a commitment.

The Finance Minister has said this, but even then the Government is not making any commitment. We want a commitment from the Government. There is no pious wish to fulfil the commitment. We want a commitment from the Government that it is ready for a discussion of the subject which we have suggested to the House ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI MD. SALIM: It is a valid point. Nobody else can replace the Leader of the House...(Interruptions)...

उपसभापति: बैठिए। फाइनेन्स मिनिस्टर साहब कुछ कह रहे हैं।

THE MINISTER OF FINANCE (SHRI YASHWANT SINHA): Madam, the Leader of the House is unfortunately not present just now. Therefore, I am unable to answer the points which are being made against him. If he were present, he would have ...(Interruptions)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I would rather say, "Attributed to him", not 'against him'.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: All right, 'attributed'. I stand corrected. But, I recall, I was present in this House on Tuesday when hon. Shri Pranab Mukherjee, who is not present in the house at the moment, had raised a point about the dignity of the House. He had also said that these issues, to which a reference is being made today, should be discussed I stood up on behalf of the Government, and said it very clearly that the Government would absolutely have no objection or hesitation in discussing these issues, provided the Business Advisory Committee of the House fixes a time for it. Now, as a former Member of this House, I am also aware of that 'little red book', according to which this House is run. I have also attended a number of meetings of the Business Advisory Committee. Unless the tradition of the House has changed, or, the rules have change this whole dispute will come to an end in no time, if we just put our faith in the Business Advisory Committee, where all

parties are represented. The Business Advisory Committee, on the basis of the permission given by the Chairman, would decide when, in what manner, and under which rules this discussion should take place. That is the position. As far as the Government is concerned, *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: The Government will have to agree. The Leader of the Opposition did not *...(Interruptions)...*

उपसभापति: जी यशवन्त सिन्हा साहब कुछ बोल रहे हैं, तो उनकी बात पूरी सुन लीजिए।

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Madam, Gurudasji and I had attended many meetings of the Business Advisory Committee together. We know how the Business Advisory Committee of the House functions. The Leader of the House cannot resist the will of the House. In fact, nobody can resist the will of the House. So, where is the question of *...(Interruptions)...* I complimented Shri Pranab Mukherjee that day because he had assured the cooperation of the majority party of the House, which happens to be in Opposition because of the composition in the Lok Sabha. That is why the majority party today is sitting in the Opposition. On behalf of the Government, I said that I welcome the cooperation of the majority party in this House. Everyone knows that we are in a minority *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI JAYANT KUMAR MALHOUTRA (Uttar Pradesh): Congress is 'a major Opposition party, and not a majority party.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: I stand corrected. It is a major Opposition. It is not the intention of the Government to ride rough shod over the collective will of the House. We are in the hands of the Chairman and the Business Advisory Committee. *...(Interruptions)...*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The Business Advisory Committee is going to be meeting now. *...(Interruption*)...*

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: I would like to say that that it is not only one Guruswamy, but we are prepared to discuss a thousand Guruswamys in this House. *...(Interruptions)...*

श्री सुरेश पचौरी : महोदया, सदन के नेता ने यह कहा था कि वे एक मीटिंग के सिलसिले में प्रधान मंत्री जी से 3:00 बजे के आसपास मिलेंगे और 4:00 बजे सदन में बता देंगे कि इन दोनों विषयों पर चर्चा करने के लिए उनका क्या रुख है, कौन सी तिथि और समय तय करना चाहते हैं, जबकि उनको इस बात की जानकारी थी कि 4:30 बजे बिजनेस ऐडवाइजरी कमेटी की बैठक है, फिर भी उन्होंने 4:00 बजे का समय तय किया था बताने के लिए। सदन के नेता अभी अनुपस्थित हैं और 4:30 बजे बिजनेस ऐडवाइजरी कमेटी की बैठक है। हम यह चाहेंगे कि आप बिजनेस ऐडवाइजरी कमेटी की मीटिंग में ही फैसला ले लें कौन सी तिथि और कौन सा समय आप इन दोनों विषयों पर, जो रूल 170 के तहत मोशन स्वीकार किया गया है, कौन सा समय इसके लिए निर्धारित करते हैं, उसके बाद आप सदन चलाइए। *...(व्यवधान)...* उसके बाद आप सदन चलाइए। *...(व्यवधान)...* लगातार * बातें कही जा रही हैं। *...(व्यवधान)...*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have in any case to go to the meeting of the Business Advisory Committee.

श्री यशवन्त सिन्हा : मैडम् * शब्द अनपार्लियामेंटरी हैं। * बातें यहां कोई नहीं कह रहा है।

श्री सुरेश पचौरी : असत्य बातें कही जा रही हैं। कौन * बोल रहा है यहां ?

श्री यशवन्त सिन्हा : नहीं ये गलत है। कौन * बोल रहा है यहां।

उपसभापति: * शब्द निकाल दीजिए।

श्री यशवन्त सिन्हा : देखिए, शब्दों पर तो नियंत्रण रखना पड़ेगा।

श्री सुरेश पचौरी : लगातार वहीं बातें कही जा रही हैं, नतीजा कोई नहीं निकल रहा। *...(व्यवधान)...*

श्री यशवन्त सिन्हा : * शब्द अनपार्लियामेंटरी हैं, यह नहीं चलेगा।

उपसभापति: * शब्द रिकार्ड में से निकाल दीजिए, * वाली लाइन।

श्री यशवन्त सिन्हा : यह * शब्द नहीं चलेगा । हम लोग एक दूसरे के बारे में इस तरह के शब्दों का प्रयोग करेंगे ? ...*(व्यवधान)*...

SHRI B.P. SINGH (Uttar Pradesh): They want to take a decision on behalf of the Chairman. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI VAYALAR RAVI: We have discussed this matter. We do not know what stand the Leader of the House is going to take on this issue. ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: If the House is not in a mood to work and if I have to go, in any case, to the Business Advisory Committee ...*(Interruptions)*... When you cut my half sentence, it gives a wrong impression about you, not about me. I was saying, the House is concerned about the problem faced by you; in fact, part of the House is concerned about it. Now, the question is put before me, the Business Advisory Committee is going to meet, on this side as well as on that side. The Business Advisory Committee has to meet now. Hon'ble Chairman must have come. What does the House desire? The majority House desires that I should adjourn the House till we decide or ...*(Interruptions)*... because I have to go. ...*(Interruptions)*... I have to attend the meeting because we should know what is happening. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SANGH PRIYA GAUTAM: Let us carry on with the business of the House. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: What kind of precedent shall we set by saying when the B.A.C. meets there, the House will remain adjourned until then ...*(Interruptions)*... and no business will be carried on? This is a totally new precedent. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MD. SALIM: Why did the Leader of the House not come at 4.00 P.M. We have been agitating since morning. Some kind of assurance should be given on this issue. We have not been provided with any piece of information. What do we do now? ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: The piece of information will be provided in time which will be informed to you. ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have a via-media. Just now we will have Special Mentions. Government business is not listed at the moment. The Special Mentions will be taken up and then the Government business will be decided. Let us have the Special Mentions. Meanwhile, the Business Advisory Committee meeting will be over. Whatever decision is taken there about the time, date, etc. for the discussion on this motion, the House can decide about it. Special Mentions are by private Membes. So we can take them up. ...*(Interruptions)*...

कुमारी सरोज खापर्डे (महाराष्ट्र) : मैडम, जब तक वहां फैसला नहीं होता है, वहां पर कोई निर्णय नहीं होता है, तब तक हाउस चलाने का क्या मतलब है, यह हमारी समझ में नहीं आ रहा है ...*(व्यवधान)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: These are matters for special mention. They are not Government business.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Do you want that this item should be taken up first? Let us take up the Guruswamy issue just now! Shall we take it up?

SOME HON. MEMBERS: Yes. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MD. SALIM: Take it up now. I will be happy, Madam. ...*(Interruptions)*... He is ready to discuss the allegations made by Guruswamy. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: If that is the way, Madam, that we should discuss it first and then only will any other business be taken up, that is not acceptable. You abolish the Business Advisory Committee. You abolish the Rules. You abolish everything else. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री ओंकार सिंह लखावत (राजस्थान) : मैडम, ये क्या हो रहा है ...*(व्यवधान)* मैडम, जब तक बोफोर्स के दलाल जेल में नहीं जाते ...*(व्यवधान)*

श्री सुरेश पचौरी : आपके सदस्य खुद गायब थे ...**(व्यवधान)** हम तो चाहते हैं कि अभी डिस्कशन करो। आपके सदस्य गायब थे, जिनके नाम पर क्वश्चिन था, वे गायब थे ...**(व्यवधान)** हम तो चाहते हैं कि उस पर भी डिस्कशन करो ...**(व्यवधान)**

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, the Parliamentary Affairs Minister will speak. आप कुछ बोल रहे हैं क्या ?

THE MINISTER OF POWER MINISTER OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS AND MINISTER OF NON-CONVENTIONAL ENERGY SOURCES (SHRI P.R. KUMARAMANGALAM): Madam Deputy Chairman, I am extremely obliged.

उपसभापति: आपने गलत जगह हाथ जोड़ा। इधर जोड़ना चाहिए ...**(व्यवधान)**

श्री पी० आर० कुमारमंगलम : जी, आपको भी जोड़ता हूँ, ऐसी क्या बात है। सबको हाथ जोड़ता हूँ।

SHRI P.R. KUMARAMANGALAM: Ultimately, what we really require is that we should have an understanding in the House, especially the Upper House, the House of Peers. ...**(Interruptions)**...

कुमारी सरोज खापर्डे : आप वहीं बात कह रहे हैं जो सुबह कह रहे थे। आप कोई नयी बात थोड़े ही ला रहे हैं सदन में। वही बात कह रहे हैं, सुबह भी वही बात कह रहे थे ...**(व्यवधान)**

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Parliamentary Affairs Minister, the concern of the Members is this. They have given notice under Rules 168 and 170. They are insisting that the Leader of the House should have been here as promised in the morning to give the time because this is a No-Day-Yet-Named motion which is being admitted. The only question is when it should be discussed. That is the question. Now, if the Leader of the House is not there, we expect you to commit to them the decision of the Government.

SHRI SANGH PRIYA GAUTAM: The commitment has already been made by the Minister of State. ...**(Interruptions)**...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: As a senior Minister, he can reiterate it.

श्री संघ प्रिय गौतम: जूनियर की कोई कीमत नहीं होगी फिर क्या ?

उपसभापति: अरे, आपकी भी कीमत है। अभी आप जूनियर और सीनियर का झगड़ा मत उठाइए।

SHRI P.R. KUMARAMANGALAM: I wish to assure the House through you that we are ready to discuss both the subjects.

कुमारी सरोज खापर्डे : मंत्री जी, क्या शुरू करने जा रहे हैं बार-बार ...**(व्यवधान)**

SHRI P.R. KUMARAMANGALAM: The time is to be fixed; anytime.

कुमारी सरोज खापर्डे : यह तो सारा प्रवचन हो गया हाउस में। आप क्या नयी बात बता रहे हैं हमको ? आप तो लेकर आए मंत्री जी, फिर आप उसी बात को क्यों दोहरा रहे हैं, बार-बार उसी बात को क्यों दोहरा रहे हैं ? यह क्या बात हो गई ? कोई नयी बात बोला तो सुनने के लिए हम तैयार हैं ...**(व्यवधान)**

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: - Mr. Kumaramangalam, these are occupational hazards. When you have taken over as the Parliamentary Affairs Minister, you should be prepared for them. So, please get up and speak.

SHRI P.R. KUMARAMANGALAM: Thank you, Madam.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: When I took over the office of Deputy Chairman, I prepared myself for the occupational hazards.

कुमारी सरोज खापर्डे : मैडम, बी० ए० सी० भी शुरू नहीं हो पा रही हैं ...**(व्यवधान)**

SHRI KHAN GHUFRAN ZAHIDI: Madam, they have not come to any decision yet. ...**(Interruptions)**...

कुमारी सरोज खापर्डे : बिजनेस एडवाइजरी कमेटी शुरू नहीं हो सकती इनके बगैर। ...**(व्यवधान)**

उपसभापति: अभी उनको बोलने दीजिये ...**(व्यवधान)**

SHRI MD. SALIM: Madam, he has nothing fresh to offer to us. **(Interrup-**

tions) This is a contempt of the House. See how they look at it. (*Interruptions*) The Leader of the House is not here. This is the way they behave. (*Interruptions*)

प्रो० विजय कुमार मल्होत्रा (दिल्ली) : यह तो किसी को सुनने के लिए तैयार नहीं हैं ।
...(व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Enough is enough. I adjourn the House till 11 a.m. tomorrow.

The House then adjourned at fortyone minutes past four of the clock til) elven of the clock on Friday, the 12th March, 1999.