

over ...*(Interruptions)*... Now, we will take up the Calling Attention Motion. Mr. Malkani.

CALLING ATTENTION TO A MATTER OF URGENT PUBLIC IMPORTANCE

Threat of American Terminator Seeds to Indian Agriculture

SHRI K.R. MALKANI (Delhi): Sir, I beg to call the attention of the Minister of Agriculture to the threat of American terminator seeds to Indian Agriculture.

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF AGRICULTURE (SHRI SOMPAL): Sir, recently reports have appeared in a section of the press regarding the harmful effect of American terminator seeds on Indian Agriculture.

Terminator gene, according to the University of Agriculture Science, Bangalore, is one that blocks the genetically altered seed from germinating after one season. This is lethal and poses a global threat to the farmers, biodiversity and food and ecological security. The use of this technology would threaten the farmers' rights to save the seed for their harvest. Because of the lethal nature of the product, the public has been asked to be wary of the introduction of genetically modified foods in many parts wherever this technique is being tried to be introduced.

A patent on control of plant gene expression has been taken jointly by Delta & Pineland Company of U.S.A., which is a subsidiary of Monsanto and the United States Department of Agriculture for controlling the viability of seed produced without adversely affecting the crop. In the patent, the method of producing the transgenic plants that render seeds sterile, has been used. The technology alters the genetic constitution of seed so that it will not germinate if used for raising the second crop.

The company claims that terminator technology is useful to the extent that it

improves the productivity of the crop and will provide more choices to the farmers for selecting high yielding varieties of seeds. However, it is harmful in many ways. The farmer will be dependent upon terminator seed and will have to buy the same seed again and again. The company producing the seed can charge any price from the farmers. The farmer will not be in a position to use seeds saved from the previous crops. It will threaten the farmers' expertise in seed selection and traditional conservation-cum-improved ways of carrying forward the seeds. The technology would have serious implications on the crop bio-diversity. It may lead to gradual extinction of traditional varieties. Crop related wild varieties, important for natural evolution for crop species would be affected by cross-contamination. This concern would be of special relevance to India, since the country abounds in land races and wild relatives of crop plants.

The terminator technology for transgenic gene has not yet been developed to a stage where seeds incorporating such technologies can actually be produced. Monsanto has entered into Memorandum of Understanding with Indian Institute of Science, Bangalore regarding general research which according to them does not include research on terminator seeds.

There is no threat of American terminator seeds to Indian Agriculture as legal entry of such a seed has not been allowed in the Indian market. The Directorate of Plant Protection, Quarantine and Storage, of the Department of Agriculture & Cooperation has issued instructions to the import permit issuing authorities to ensure that seeds imported into India are not having terminator genes. The Indian Council of Agricultural Research and Department of Bio-Technology will develop a suitable technology and also standardise the technique for detecting the terminator genes or their combination in the seeds. It would also be ensured

that entry of transgenic planting material in the country even for research purpose should be done only through one entry point.

While appreciating the concern of the Members and the whole House on the threat to Indian Agriculture because of Terminator Gene, I can assure the Members that the Government is aware of the dangers of introduction of terminator gene in the country and all efforts are being made to ensure that such transgenic material does not find legal entry into India. The interests of Indian farmers would be fully protected.

SHRI K.R. MALKANI: Mr. Chairman, Sir, I am glad to learn that the hon. Minister is seized of the matter. But, I think this matter is not being viewed with due seriousness. The matter is much more serious than that. This seed has been developed by the U.S. Department of Agriculture in collaboration with Delta and Pineland Company. Later, their patents were bought by Monsanto and more recently Monsanto has merged with Cargill which is already operating in India. Mr. Michael Duff, Spokesman of the U.S. Department of Agriculture has said and I quote : "U.S. priority lies in protecting the emerging multi-billion dollar biotechnological seed industry." So, what we are faced with is not just Monsanto—I would rather call it a monster corporation; the U.S. Government is applying pressure, at all the time, on India and all over the world. I do not know for how long the hon. Minister will be able to resist these pressures.

The real problem is that these people want to treat agriculture as an industry, as a corporation, just to make profits. Once this seed gets going, they will decide whom to sell, when to sell and at what price to sell. They will control the food supplies of the whole world. They control not only the largest gold deposits with them in vaults, but they also have thousands of nuclear bombs with them. Now, they want to control the food

supplies of the world. This is a great danger, particularly to the third world countries.

Recently, a very leading magazine published a special issue on Monsanto. *Ecology* is the world's most distinguished magazine dealing with this matter. It devoted its whole issue to this. It also carries a special article by the Prince of Wales, who is a public spirited gentleman. The title of the article is: 'Seeds of Disaster'.

What we are going to face is biological warfare and nothing less. They will try to control the food supplies and the self-sufficiency of not only India, but of all the countries.

I understand the Government has decided that this seed will not be patented in India. I feel that is not enough. There would be a total ban on the import of these seeds. Importing and holding of this seed should be declared a criminal offence.

Only last year the Indian Institute of Science, Bangalore, entered into research agreement with Monsanto. I am shocked that an Institute of that repute should have entered into this type of an agreement with such a disreputable outfit.

The I.I.S. position is that this research, that they will carry on in Bangalore, will not be concerning the terminator seed, it will deal with the "quality of the seed". From Monsanto's point of view, the facts of its being terminator, or in fertile will be the best qualification of the seeds. Their whole value system is different from ours. The import and holding of this seed must be banned in India. It should be made a criminal offence.

I would like to make a submission to the hon. Minister. The Government of India should advise the Indian Institute of Science to cancel its agreement with Cargill and Monsanto immediately. The danger is so serious that if the Government does not act, the people might be constrained to act. Let us not

forget what was done to Cargill in Bellary and Bangalore not so long ago.

Thank you, Sir. I have done.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now, for clarifications.

SHRI SOLIPETA RAMACHANDRA REDDY: (Andhra Pradesh): Sir, as we all are aware, Indian farmers work independently and sustainably on their small plots of land which are averaging one acre or two acres in size and are supporting the economy of this predominantly agricultural country. Sir, this 7.5 billion dollar global seed giant multi-national company, Monsanto, had entered into an agreement with its collaborator, Mahyco, which is a very big seed seller agency, to sell the terminator seeds.

Sir, there are a lot of apprehensions about this seed in the farming community. The entire farming community is afraid that the use of terminator seeds would force them to buy these seeds year after year, whereas they themselves now generate a major quantity of their seed requirements. The terminator seed, which is under experiment, is not desirable to the Indian agricultural climatic conditions. This is not an argument advanced by any ordinary farmer or myself, but also by the famous agricultural scientist, Dr. M.S. Swaminathan in his address to the Nutrition Society of India recently in Hyderabad. Another leading food expert, Mr. Devendra Sharma, has also said the same thing. According to Mr. Devendra Sharma, once the Indian farmers are hooked to genetically engineered seeds, the multinational companies can programme them to produce more or less crops depending on how they want to play in the global grain market. In any case, the multi-national companies can easily control the prices of their seeds and even deny them to the Indian farmers completely undermining the food security in the country. Also, Sir, Dr. Shiva, Director of the Research Foundation of Science Technology and

Ecology, called this genetically manipulated product a health hazard. Sir, in the State of Karnataka, an agitation is already going on. Throughout this State farmers' organisations are agitating in this regard. In my State of Andhra Pradesh also there is a lot of apprehension about the Terminator gene. Our farmers are also agitating. Now, there is a talk going on among farmers that their cotton crop might have been affected due to this gene; and many farmers have committed suicides due to cotton crop failure. In the Andhra Pradesh State Assembly, major political parties and minor political parties, irrespective of political affiliations, have passed a resolution unanimously requesting the Centre to impose a ban on the entry of Terminator gene. I request, through you, the Government of India to impose a total ban on the entry of Terminator gene; and send away Monsanto.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Jeneswar Misra. Please seek clarifications only.

श्री जनेश्वर मिश्र (उत्तर प्रदेश): सभापति महोदय, सबसे पहले तो मैं अपनी चिंता बता दूँ कि लगता है कि हिन्दुस्तान की खेती एक गंभीर आफत के दौर से गुजरने वाली है। मुझे खुशी है कि कृषि मंत्री जी ने पहले ही इस चिंता को अपने वक्तव्य में जाहिर कर दिया है और उनके वक्तव्य को सुनने के बाद मैं यह मानकर के चलूँगा कि चाहे वह विश्वसनीय हो या न हो लेकिन मान करके चलूँगा कि सरकार इस खतरनाक स्थिति से सतर्क है। यह भारत के लिए ही नहीं बल्कि सारी दुनियाँ के कृषि जगत के लिए एक खतरनाक चीज है। एक ऐसा बीज जो खास तौर से कपास के लिए प्रयोग होने वाला है। हिन्दुस्तान में 40 जगहों को चुना गया है जहाँ पर इसका प्रयोग किया जाएगा। प्रयोग प्रयोगशाला में हुआ करता है, प्रयोग खेत-खलिहानों में नहीं हुआ करता है और जिस किसी दिन प्रयोग खेत-खलिहानों में होने लगेगा उस दिन खेत-खलिहान चौपट हो जाएंगे। तो इस स्थिति से अवगत करने के लिए राज्य मंत्री जी खुद बहुत सतर्क हैं। लेकिन 40 जगहों को चुना गया है जहाँ पर इसका प्रयोग किया जाएगा। क्या यह सच है और अगर सच है तो किसी भी बीज का प्रयोग खेत-खलिहान में नहीं होता, फिर मैं चेतावनी देना चाहता हूँ। किसी प्रयोगशाला में कम्पनी अपनी छोटी सी जगह

पर इसका प्रयोग कर सकती थी। यह बीज ऐसा है सभापति जी, कि केवल एक बार इलेमाल होगा। दूसरी बार जो फसल निकलेगी या तो लंगड़ी-लूली, टेढ़ी-मेढ़ी या छोटी फसल होगी। इसमें जो फूल का पर होता है उसमें पर-परागन का रोग लगता है और वह रोग अगर लग गया तो अगल-बगल की सारी फसलों को भी बरबाद कर देगा और हिन्दुस्तान की खेती पूरी की पूरी तौर पर चौपट हो जाएगी। मैं समझता हूँ कि एक बार अगर यह बीमारी आ गई तो हिन्दुस्तान में खेती हो नहीं हो पाएगी और खाद्यान्न के मामले में हम दुनिया के सामने कटोरा लेकर के फिर खड़े हो जाएंगे। इस स्थिति से निबटने के लिए कुछ संक्षेप में यह कह देना कि भारत सरकार सतर्क है, भारत सरकार इसका पेटेंट नहीं होने देगी, आने नहीं देगी हम इतना ही नहीं चाहते बल्कि इस कम्पनी को बेन किया जाए और हिन्दुस्तान में आने से इसको रोका जाए। अगर किसी बहाने वह आ जाती है तो उसके खिलाफ कड़ी से कड़ी कार्रवाई की जाए, क्योंकि वैज्ञानिकों ने, खेतों में काम करने वाले लोगों ने उनके एक संगठन ने भारत के प्रधान मंत्री को भी झूठी लिखी है। मेरा ख्याल है कि कृषि मंत्री जी को उसकी जानकारी होगी। उन लोगों ने बताया है कि इसके कितने खतरनाक नतीजे निकलने वाले हैं। प्रधान मंत्री कार्यालय से लेकर कृषि मंत्रालय तक मैं उम्मीद करता हूँ कि इस खतरनाक कम्पनी से देश को बचाने के लिए और खेती को बचाने के लिए बहुत ही सक्षम कदम उठाए जाएं ताकि यह कम्पनी अपने बीजों को इस देश में आने नहीं दे, इसका प्रयास करें।

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Gurudas Dasgupta. He is not here. Now, Mr. Shirodkar, please clarifications only.

श्री जलालुद्दीन अंसारी (बिहार): सर, हमको बोला है उनकी जगह पर।

श्री जलालुद्दीन अंसारी: सर, हमको बोला है उनकी जगह पर।

MR. CHAIRMAN: Your name is not here. It will not be allowed.

श्री सभापति: किस पर?

श्री जलालुद्दीन अंसारी: गुरुदास दासगुप्त जी की जगह पर।

श्री जलालुद्दीन अंसारी: गुरुदास दासगुप्त जी की जगह पर।

श्री सभापति: उन्होंने ऐसा नहीं मुझे बोला है।

श्री जलालुद्दीन अंसारी: वह दे चुके हैं।

श्री सभापति: उसके बाद। Mr. Shirodkar, only clarifications.

SHRI ADHIK SHIRODKAR (Maharashtra): Yes, Sir. Sir, at the very outset I congratulate the hon. Minister for the bold and unambiguous stand that has been taken. However, this is not sufficient. I have four clarifications to seek.

A statement has been made that the Government will develop a suitable technology to detect these things. Now, this is an assurance and it has to be done on a war-footing. I would like to know as to what action has been taken. Secondly, there is no mechanism to check the clandestine use and import of these seeds. I would like to know whether a suitable legislation will be introduced or the existing legislation will be amended accordingly for the purpose. Thirdly, so far as Cargill and Monsanto companies are concerned, is the Government thinking of studying the agreement entered into by them to see whether it can have a potential threat in this respect? Lastly, I would like to warn the Government that the American multinationals have no other interest except their own economic interests, first, last and the middle, and they see this as a potential multi-billion dollar industry and any effort to resist will be met financially, with a dire threat. This should also be kept in view. Thank you.

PROF. M. SANKARALINGAM (Tamil Nadu): Mr. Chairman, Sir, I would like to thank the Agriculture Minister for his bold steps taken in this regard for banning the terminator seeds, especially from America. Our agriculture is based on seasonal crop-raising. We raise our crops according to the season, the first season and the second season. The first season seeds are not used in the second season. The conventional seeds are here. We are threatened with that kind of foreign seeds. Now, the agriculture scientists have invented hybrid varieties of seeds and they have introduced

this type of seeds. Apart from this, the terminator seeds are imported here and an agreement has been entered into. The hon. Agriculture Minister, after having been convinced, is prepared to take necessary steps in this respect. The Central Seeds Act is there and that Act should be suitably amended to give more teeth to it to take action in such situations where the importance of raising the seasonal crops is ignored. I request the Government to take necessary steps keeping all these things in mind. Thank you.

श्री जलालुद्दीन अंसारी: सभापति महोदय, माननीय मंत्री जी ने अपने बयान में चिंता जाहिर की है लेकिन एक जगह उन्होंने लिखा है कि मोन्सैन्टो ने भारतीय विज्ञान संस्थान, बंगलौर के साथ एक समझौता ज्ञापन पर हस्ताक्षर किए हैं जो सामान्य अनुसंधान के बारे में है और उनके अनुसार उनमें टर्मिनेटर बीजों संबंधी अनुसंधान सम्मिलित नहीं है।

चर्चा यह है कि ये दो कंपनियां अमेरिकी मोन्सैन्टो और मेहिको जो महाराष्ट्र की हाइब्रिड कंपनियां हैं। ये दोनों मिलकर 40 स्थानों पर फील्ड का ट्रायल कर रही हैं। किसी अनुबंध के बिना अपने देश में इस तरह के ट्रायल करने का उस अमेरिकी कंपनी को क्या अधिकार है? इसलिए मेरा सुझाव होगा माननीय मंत्री जी से कि तत्काल उसको इस ट्रायल ऑपरेशन से रोका जाए। इसलिए कि ये बीज जो टर्मिनेटर सीड्स हैं, उनका इस्तेमाल अगर अपने यहां होगा तो उससे किसानों को कई तरह के नुकसान होंगे। पहला यह कि वह जो बीज पैदा करेगा, जो फसल होगी, उस फसल से वह दूसरे साल उस बीज का इस्तेमाल नहीं कर सकता है। तो प्रति वर्ष — मंत्री जी ने अपने बयान में भी कबूल किया है कि प्रति वर्ष उनके खरीदना पड़ेगा। तो इससे हमारे किसान भाइयों को बाजार पर निर्भर होना पड़ेगा।

श्री सभापति: यह बात उन्होंने कह दी है। आप जो क्लैरिफिकेशंस पूछना चाहते हैं, वह पूछिए।

श्री जलालुद्दीन अंसारी: हम यह पूछना चाहते हैं कि किस वजह से यह दोनों कंपनियां मिलकर चालीस स्थानों पर फील्ड ट्रायल कर रही हैं, अगर कोई अनुबंध नहीं है तो? एक अमेरिकी कंपनी और महाराष्ट्र की हाइब्रिड कंपनी है, इन दोनों ने चालीस स्थानों में ऐसा क्यों किया है?

श्री सभापति: आपका दूसरा प्वाइंट क्या है?

श्री जलालुद्दीन अंसारी: मेरा दूसरा प्वाइंट यह है कि अगर इसको छूट दी जाएगी तो यह पूरे इनवायरमेंट

को, जो खेती के लिए है — इनके सीड्स के इस्तेमाल से और इनकी जो दूसरी टेक्नोलॉजी है, इससे हमारा खेती का इनवायरमेंट बर्बाद होगा और इसका विरोध जो किसान संगठन हैं, वह कर रहे हैं तथा यह देखा गया है कि लो यील्ड के कारण हमारे कॉटन ग्राउंड्स...

श्री सभापति: आप क्लैरिफिकेशंस पूछिए। यह प्वाइंट्स उन्हें निवार कर दिए हैं। आप क्लैरिफिकेशंस क्या पूछना चाहते हैं?

श्री जलालुद्दीन अंसारी: इससे सबक यह है कि पिछले दिनों भी जिस तरह की कार्यवाही हमारे देश में हुई, उससे हजारों किसानों, कांटन ग्राउंड्स को सुसाइड करना पड़ा। तो किस आधार पर इसे इजाजत दी है?

श्री सभापति: ठीक बात है, आप बोलिए।

श्री जलालुद्दीन अंसारी: हम मंत्री जी से जानना चाहते हैं कि क्यों यह ट्रायल चालीस स्थानों पर हो रहा है और इसको रोकने के लिए वह तत्काल कौन से कदम उठा रहे हैं, यह बताने का कष्ट करें।

श्री सभापति: ठीक बात है। Shri Radhakrishna Murty. Only clarifications. Only clarifications, please.

المشرف جلال الدين انصاري "بہار":

سبحانہ علی مہودے، ماننے مہتری جی
نے اپنے بیان میں چیتا ظاہر کی ہے لیکن
ایک جگہ انھوں نے لکھا ہے کہ مون سائنٹو
نے بھارتیہ و گیان سنسٹھان، بنگلور
کے ساتھ ایک سمجھوتہ کیا ہے پر مستحکم
ہے کہ میں جو سامانیہ انوسنڈھان کے بارے
میں ہے اور ان کے مطابق ان میں ٹرمی
بیجوں سمبندھی انوسنڈھان سمبندھی
ہے۔

چرا یہ ہے کہ یہ دو کمپنیاں مون سائنٹو
اور میپیکو تو مہاراشٹری ہائی برڈ کمپنیاں
ہیں۔ یہ دونوں ملکر لہ اسٹھانوں پر فیلڈ
ٹرائل کر رہی ہیں۔ تو کسی انورودھ
کے بغیر اپنے ویش میں اس طرح کے ٹرائل
کرنے کا اس امر کی کمپنی کو کیا ادھیکار

ہے؟ اس کے لیے میرا سمجھاؤ ہو گا مائیم منٹری
جی سے کہ فوراً اسکو اس ٹرائل آفیشن
سے روکا جائے۔ اس کے لیے یہ بیج جو میں
نیٹر سٹیڈز میں، انکا استعمال اگر اپنے
یہاں ہو گا تو اس سے کسانوں کو کوئی فائدہ
کے نقصان ہو گے۔ یہ ملایہ کہ وہ جو بیج
پیدا کریں گا، جو فصل ہو گی، اس فصل
سے وہ دوسری سال اس بیج کا استعمال
ہیں کر سکتے ہیں۔ تو ترقی و روش، منٹری
جی نے اپنے بیان میں بھی قبول کیا ہے
کہ برقی و روش میں کو خریدنا پڑے گا۔ تو
اس سے ہمارے کسان بھائیوں کو
بازار پر نہ بھرنے پڑے گا۔

منٹری سمجھاتی ہے یہ بات انھوں نے
کہہ دی ہے۔ آپ جو کلیریفیکیشن
پوچھنا چاہتے ہیں، وہ پوچھئے۔

منٹری جلال الدین انصاری: ہم
یہ پوچھنا چاہتے ہیں کہ کس وجہ سے یہ
دونوں کمپنیاں ملکر چالیس استھانوں
پر فیلڈ ٹرائل کر رہی ہیں۔ اگر کوئی نوٹ
ہیں ہے تو؟ ایک امریکی کمپنی اور
مہاراشٹری ہائی برڈ کمپنی ہے، ان دونوں
نے چالیس استھانوں میں ایسا کیوں
کیا ہے؟

منٹری سمجھاتی ہے: آپ کا دوسرا پوائنٹ
کیا ہے؟

منٹری جلال الدین انصاری: میرا

دوسرا پوائنٹ یہ ہے کہ اگر اس کو چھوٹ
دی جائیگی تو یہ پورے انٹرمنٹ کو،
جو حقیقی کے لیے ہے، ان کے سمیڈس کے
استعمال سے اور ان کی جو دوسری ٹیکنالوجی
ہے اس سے ہمارا حقیقی کا انٹرمنٹ برباد
ہو گا اور اس کا ورور جو کسان سنگھن
ہیں، وہ کر رہے ہیں تنہا یہ دیکھا گیا ہے
کہ کو ریلو کی وجہ سے کالین گروورس...
منٹری سمجھاتی ہے: آپ کلیری فیکیشن
پوچھئے، یہ پوائنٹ انھوں نے نوٹ کر دئے
ہیں۔ آپ کلیری فیکیشن کیا پوچھنا چاہتے
ہیں؟

منٹری جلال الدین انصاری: اس
سے سبق یہ ہے کہ کچھ دنوں بھی جس طرح
کی کاررواہی ہمارے سریش میں ہوئی،
اس سے ہزاروں کسانوں، کالین گروورس
کو سوسائٹیز کرنا پڑا۔ تو اس اُدھار
پر اسے اجازت دی ہے؟

منٹری سمجھاتی ہے: ٹھیک ہے آپ
منٹری جلال الدین انصاری: ہم
منٹری جی سے جاننا چاہتے ہیں کہ کیا یہ
ٹرائل چالیس استھانوں پر ہو رہا ہے
اور اسکو روکنا کے لیے وہ تھمال کوں سے
قعد اٹھا رہے ہیں، یہ جتنا کائنات کوں؟

DR. Y. RADHAKRISHNA
MURTHY: Sir, it is all right.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Clarifications you
may seek.

SHRI MD. SALIM (West Bengal): Sir, it is a Calling Attention discussion. It is not a statement by the Minister.

MR. CHAIRMAN: That is right.

SHRI MD. SALIM: Sir, you shouldn't restrict him to asking questions.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Clarifications on this statement.

SHRI MD. SALIM: Okay. You can restrict the time but you can't restrict him to asking questions. Normally, you should go by the practice of this House. It is a Calling Attention motion.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I am going by the practices and according to the Rules of this House. Clarifications should be put so that everybody can join.

SHRI SANGH PRIYA GAUTAM (Uttar Pradesh): Now everything is clear. There is no need to interrupt.

SHRI MD. SALIM: We put only one name from each party. It is not that everybody is asking.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Yes, yes. I am calling one Member from each party.

DR. Y. RADHAKRISHNA MURTHY (Andhra Pradesh): Sir, I have heard carefully the statement given by the Minister of Agriculture, but I would say that I am only partly satisfied. The Monsanto Company is entering the field of Indian agriculture in the name of B.T. cotton seed trials. That is the most important point. And the apprehension is that this Company may also conduct trials on terminator technology under the guise of B.T. cotton experiments. So the track record of this Company is such, and it is highly suspect, that the Minister himself has almost apprehension is that this Company may also conduct trials on terminator technology under the guise of B.T. cotton experiments. So, the track record of this Company is such, and it is highly suspect, that the Minister himself has almost accepted it. One point of clarification, Sir, is that agriculture is a State subject and trials are going on in various States. The State Government of Karnataka has no knowledge of where the trials are

going on, and the Agriculture Minister of A.P. is equally unaware of where the so-called trials are going on on B.T. Cotton, and the representatives of Monsanto are busy in calling a press conference. They have explained their stand and have said that everything is being done openly; they have got a permission from the Centre! The question is which Department has given this permission and which person is responsible for this permission to conduct these trials on B.T. cotton in various fields. In Andhra Pradesh itself, a newspaper has given the report that in seven districts these trials are going on. So, we are afraid that under the guise of this B.T. cotton trial, the terminator technology also may be tried. Will the Minister explain how this type of permission was given? If that is so who had given this permission for this monster of Monsanto to conduct these trials in various States of India?

MR. CHAIRMAN: Good. Mr. Bommai. Clarifications only.

SHRI S.R. BOMMAI (Karnataka): Sir, when Janata Dal and BJP were in Opposition, the signing of the GATT came in and all the political parties were asked to give, in writing, their objections. They had been approaching me for discussing the matter with Dr. Murli Manohar Joshi, Hon. Minister of HRD.

Now my friend and colleague, Mr. Sompal, is speaking on behalf of the BJP representing the Agriculture Ministry. He is an expert. I accept that. We have given in writing how this will affect the agriculture. Seventy-five per cent of the people are agriculturists in our country. We have no national agricultural policy up-till now, even after 50 years of independence. We have analysed it while discussing the patent law. If you permit such kinds of seeds to be generated here, you will have to entirely depend on foreign companies for seeds in future. I don't want to go into the details. An elaborate statement has been given. Of course, the Karnataka farmers had opposed the production of seeds by Mahyco company. They destroyed their

farm. There were criminal cases. Again last week the Karnataka farmers had gone and destroyed the crops in Raichur district. The Agriculture Minister held a Press Conference and said that the State Government had not permitted these people to have the seed farm. In the last session the Prime Minister had assured that such a thing would not be permitted.

MR. CHAIRMAN: You please seek your clarifications.

SHRI S. R. BOMMAI: Sir, I am only bring to the notice of the hon. Minister what the Prime Minister had said. "Prime Minister Atal Behari Vajpayee has made a statement in Parliament on Monday against the technology and said that the Centre has decided not to grant patent to life-threatening teminators" and so on. The hon. Minister has also said it. There is no law which permits them to import. But still they are doing it. How do you prevent it? It is better that the Agriculture Minister called a meeting of all the State Agriculture Ministers and experts and took an immediate decision. Otherwise, the Indian agriculturists will have to depend on foreigners. If they given the seeds, we will grow the crops. Otherwise, there will be no crops here. The country is facing such a dangerous situation. I would like the hon. Minister to come out with a specific statement in the interest of the farmers.

SHRI JOYANTA ROY (West Bengal): Sir, the statement given by the hon. Minister does not ensure total protection of the Indian peasantry from the all-round assault of US imperialistic forces. First, I would like to know from the hon. Minister how he proposes to save the Indian peasantry and to prevent the all-round extinction of our traditional varieties. Secondly, it is known to all that a few years ago a lot of growers had committed suicide because of the transgenic hybrid cotton seed supplied by the Monsanto company. How do the Government of India and the Agriculture Department propose to safeguard the interests of the farmers? When the virtual

control of the seed market by the Government of India comes to only 10 per cent or 15 per cent, how does the Government propose to control the seed market? Monsanto and Mahyco have entered into an agreement. As reported, 26 per cent share of Mahyco was obtained by Monsanto. Therefore, it is a very serious issue. I would like to have a total clarification on this aspect, how the Government proposes to control the seed market when the multinationals like Monsanto have already entered into the seed market of the country.

SHRI S. M. KRISHNA (Karnataka): Mr. Chairman, sir, I see a diabolical plan of the American agriculture industry to hold the Indian agriculture to ransom. In the name of providing better seeds they are trying to enslave the Indian cotton farmers to start with. I must commend the efforts of the Militant Farmers' Organisation in Karnataka which has brought to our attention the burning problem of how this diabolical conspiracy is being hatched and is being practised. But I am surprised how the Indian Institute of Science fell a prey to this kind of a conspiracy. They have entered into an MoU with Monsanto. Now I would like to pose a question to the hon. Minister. Was the Indian Institute of Science cautioned by the Agriculture Ministry before they entered into Memorandum of Understanding? We have become self-sufficient in food, thanks to Panditji and a host of Prime Minister. Do we need American technology to improve Indian agriculture? What are our laboratories doing? They have done so much to improve the Indian agriculture. We may not come up to the standards of American agriculture patterns, but in America agriculture is an industry and in India agriculture is basically something on which an Indian farmer depends for his livelihood. I would like to warn the hon. Minister that if the Indian Institute of Science, Bangalore does not abrogate this MoU entered into between them and Monsanto, today it is the Militant

Farmers' Organisation and tomorrow it will be the political parties who will get into the act and hold the Indian Institute of Science responsible for any consequences that might flow out of this agreement which they have entered into.

Sir, the hon. Minister has assured the House that Indian agriculture is safe. Shall we rest with that kind of an assurance? Will it be strengthened by further acts so that this insidious entry of American multinationals into our agriculture sector is prevented and prevented once and for all. Thank you.

श्री नरेश यादव (बिहार): महोदय, इस दशक के प्रारम्भ में, इस देश के किसानों ने डंकल प्रस्ताव का पुरजोर विरोध किया था। उस विरोध के बावजूद भी हमने वर्ल्ड ट्रेड ऑर्गेनाइजेशन में साइन किया, समझौता किया। उस समझौते के तहत आज पूरी दुनिया को पता है कि हाई ब्रीड सीड इस देश में मंगाने के लिए यहां का किसान बाध्य हो गया है। क्योंकि आज अधिक उत्पादन की भी आवश्यकता है इसलिए हाई ब्रीड सीड लगाने को किसान बाध्य है। मैं माननीय मंत्री जी से जानना चाहता हूँ कि क्या उसमें कोई सुधार करने का प्रावधान है? आज जो बीजों का अंधा दौर, हाई ब्रीड बीजों का आ रहा है उसमें आप सुधार करने की कोई व्यवस्था कर रहे हैं? वह बीज कैसा है, किसानों के लिए उपयोगी है या नहीं है, इसकी जांच की क्या कोई व्यवस्था आपने की है? जो बीज हम खेत में डाल रहे हैं वह हर दृष्टिकोण से किसानों के लिए या देश की जलवायु के हिसाब से सही है या नहीं है?

श्री सभापति: ठीक है।

श्री नरेश यादव: सभापति जी, यदि आप किसानों को बोलने का मौका नहीं देंगे तो कैसे चलेगा? आपके माध्यम से मैं मंत्री महोदय से जानना चाहता हूँ कि आज हम सभी किसान हाई ब्रीड बीज बो रहे हैं। जांच की कोई व्यवस्था आपकी नहीं है। हम लोग खेत में जो भी लगाते हैं, वह सब हाईब्रिड लगाते हैं। आप सीड मुहैया के लिए देश में हाईब्रिड का कितना उत्पादन कर रहे हैं? आपकी क्या व्यवस्था है? आपके पास पूरा इनफ्रास्ट्रक्चर है। लेकिन आप 15 से 18 प्रतिशत ही इस देश में हाईब्रिड मुहैया कर रहे हैं। आपका यह कृषि का जाल है। आगे के लिए आप क्या कर रहे हैं? इस देश के किसानों के लिए हाईब्रिड का आगे आप क्या करने जा रहे हैं? अगर आप नहीं करेंगे किसान बाध्य हो जाएगा हाईब्रिड लगाने के लिए। मैं आपके माध्यम से यह

जानना चाहता हूँ कि सरकार क्या व्यवस्था करने जा रही है? मंत्री जी ने जो आगाह किया है, मैं मंत्री जी को धन्यवाद देता हूँ कि समय रहते हम लोगों और सदन को इस बात से वे आज अवगत करा रहे हैं। लेकिन जो मोन्सान्टो का इतिहास रहा है, वह काला इतिहास रहा है। इसके पूर्व भी जब वियतनाम की लड़ाई हो रही थी, उस समय भी इन्होंने ऐसे बीजों को वियतनाम में सप्लाई किया था जिससे वहां की भूमि मरुभूमि हो गई थी। इसलिए इस बात को सदन को बताना पड़ेगा कि इस मोन्सान्टो कम्पनी का क्या इतिहास रहा है और इन्होंने जो बीज पैदा किया है इसके इतिहास के बारे में भी सदन को अवगत कराएँ। मैं मलकानी जी को बहुत धन्यवाद देता हूँ कि उन्होंने बहुत अच्छा ध्यानकर्षण प्रस्ताव किसानों के हित के लिए लाया है और देश को अवगत कराया है। इसलिए मलकानी जी को बहुत बहुत धन्यवाद।

KUMARI NIRMALA DESHPANDE (Nominated): Sir, I would just like to draw, through you, the attention of the Minister that this is a kind of a subtle aggression on Indian agriculture. So, how are we going to meet this aggression and what steps are being planned to see to it that such an aggression does not take place in future. Thank you.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, I want to say something.

MR. CHAIRMAN: On the Calling Attention Motion, only one person from each party is allowed as per the rules...(Interruptions) We have other items of business as well.

SHRI SOMPAL: Mr. Chairman, Sir, I thank all the hon. Members for having drawn the attention of this august House as well as the Government to this issue. This is a burning issue today not only in India but also throughout the globe and there is a very heated debate on it. Regarding desirability or undesirability about the terminator gene, so far as India and the Government of India are concerned, we have a very conclusive and clear-cut opinion and view that the terminator gene should not be allowed. It will only jeopardise the right of farmers to save the seed and re-use it for the next

crop which the terminator gene technology does not allow. We have taken adequate steps and I am pleased to inform the House through you, Sir, that we are the quickest to react in this matter, and immediate and adequate steps, I repeat, have already been undertaken to see to it that this is not allowed inside India. All the authorities who are concerned with the matter have already been instructed, in writing, not to allow any seed which has this technology. And I would also inform you, Sir, that this terminator gene technology has not so far been perfected in the field. It is only at the conceptual level. It is right that the Monsanto of the U.S.A. and the United States Department of Agriculture together have taken the patent. I have got the number and full details of the patent and the process. They have put this gene initially into two crops of tobacco and cotton. But I would repeat that they have not yet been grown in the field. This is just in the laboratory which shows that when the seed is sown for the next crop, the germination procedure or the germinating capacity of the seed is switched off. But it has not come to the field as yet. So far as the permission to allow the Monsanto growing B.T. cotton in India at 40 sites in 15 fields is concerned, it is correct that it has been allowed but it is not a terminator gene. BT is a toxic bacteria separated by a company from some other substance and bombarded into leaves and plants of cotton and tobacco and this produced a sort of toxin which we are using for spraying on the crops so far, to tackle certain diseases and insect attacks like American boll-worm, Pink boll-worm and spotted boll-worm. The same toxin now would be produced by the plant itself instead of spraying it. So, this is the technology. But I will again repeat to clarify the matter that it has not come to the field anywhere in the world, not to speak of India. So far as BT cotton is concerned, it has been allowed after due care by the Department of Biotechnology and the Department of Biotechnology has

done this; permitted this under the Environment Protection Act, 1986, read with the Notification of the Government of India from the Ministry of Environment and Forests dated 5th December, 1989, and in accordance with the recommendations of the Review Committee on Genetic Manipulation—RCGM in brief—which is the National Committee constituted by the Department of Biotechnology under the Environment Protection Act, 1986. DBT has not given any permission to Monsanto or Monsanto—MAHYCO Biotech Private Limited of Maharashtra to conduct field trials using BT cotton. DBT has also not given any permission to any company in the country to conduct experiments or research using production for use of terminator genes. The Ministry of Agriculture has, in the meantime, issued a directive to all the concerned Government agencies to prevent the use of terminator genes in all kinds of seeds. Coming to the specific points raised by the hon. Members, I wish to deny, Sir, that there is any pressure from USA, on the Government or, on any company on the Government of India, and also say that we would not—and we are not—susceptible to such a pressure. Import would not be allowed in any case. Mr. Ramachandra Reddy has raised the issue of a large number of farmers who are small and marginal farmers in India. I have already voiced the concern in my statement that we are aware of this situation and these farmers would never be put to a situation where they lose their right to re-use their seed and save it. This has an implication which we are aware of.

श्री जनेश्वर मिश्र जी ने कहा कि कपास की खास किस्म का प्रयोग 40 स्थानों पर हो रहा है। मैं कहना चाहता हूँ कि जिस किस्म का प्रयोग हो रहा है वह बी-टी काटन है, जिसका डिटेल मैंने आपको बताया है और पूरी वैज्ञानिक समीक्षा के उपरान्त ही यदि वह कृषकों के हित में हुआ तभी उस बीज को निर्मुक्त किया जाएगा, अन्यथा नहीं। जहां तक प्रयोग का प्रश्न है, मैं माननीय मिश्र जी से थोड़ा सा मतभेद व्यक्त करना

चाहता हूँ कि फसलों के संबंध में वैज्ञानिक प्रयोग प्रयोगशाला में भी करते हैं और उसके बाद क्षेत्र में भी होता है। जब तक क्षेत्र में उसका प्रयोग नहीं किया जाए किसी भी बीज की किस्म की रिलीज़ हिन्दुस्तान में या कहीं भी नहीं की जा सकती है। क्योंकि उसका प्रयोग न केवल उसके उत्पादन की गुणवत्ता और क्षमता के लिए किया जाता है बल्कि उसके कुछ और प्रभाव भी हो सकते हैं। पर्यावरणीय प्रभाव हो सकते हैं या कुछ इस तरह की एलर्जीस और ऐसी चीजें उनसे पैदा हो सकती हैं जिससे मानव और पशु के स्वास्थ्य के ऊपर दुष्प्रभाव पड़ सकता है। इन सब के दृष्टान्त और प्रयोग खेत में ही किए जाते हैं और जब वे पूरे हो जाते हैं कई वर्षों के बाद तभी उस बीज की किस्म को रिलीज़ किया जाता है। तो मैं आपसे निवेदन करना चाहूँगा कि आगे यदि कभी ऐसी बात कही जाए तो खेत में प्रयोग किए बगैर... (व्यवधान)

श्री जनेश्वर मिश्र: श्री-एन बी-टी जींस के बारे में इन्होंने कहा कि इन्होंने परमिट किया है प्रयोग के लिए क्या उसके आफ्टर इफ़ेक्ट्स चाहे वह पर्यावरण पर होते हों और चाहे संपूर्ण अगल-बगल की खेती पर होते हों, इसका अध्ययन पहले से कर लिया गया या जिस कंपनी ने यह दिया है उस कंपनी से उसकी रिपोर्ट ले ली गई, यह मैं जानना चाहूँगा?

श्री सोमपाल: जहां तक कंपनी का प्रश्न है उनका तो दावा है कि इसका कोई दुष्प्रभाव नहीं होगा, पर हम उस दावे से सहमत नहीं हैं, इसलिए उसकी समीक्षा की जा रही है। वह अध्ययन जारी है। जब तक वह अध्ययन पूरा होकर निश्चित रूप से हम इस मत पर अंतिम रूप से नहीं पहुंच जाते कि यह ठीक है, तब तक उसको यहां उगाने की इजाजत नहीं दी जाएगी। केवल प्रयोग के लिए और इन चीजों को देखने के लिए ही उस को उगाने की अनुमति दी गयी है, केवल प्रयोग के रूप में और वह भी बहुत कठोर निबंधन के तहत।

श्री अंसारी जी ने कहा कि इस का असर दूसरी फसलों पर भी जा सकता है। यह बात आप की सही है और इस का उल्लेख मैंने अपने वक्तव्य में भी किया है कि प्रकृति में इस के कारण बहुत बड़ी विपत्ति आ सकती है अगर क्रास-पॉलीनेशन, कंटैमिनेशन या संचन क्रिया के माध्यम से दूसरी फसलों या दूसरी प्रजातियों में इस का अंतरण हो जाए। इस के संबंध में भी अध्ययन किया जा रहा है। इसलिए टर्मिनेशन के संबंध में तो हमारे वैज्ञानिकों की यह अंतिम राय है कि इस को न आने दिया जाए।

Mr. Radhakrishna has again repeated the same concern and I again wish to state that it would not be allowed. So far as his question about the responsibility for permission for BT cotton is concerned, I have already stated it in my previous remarks. Shri Bommai has invoked by stand on these things. I may repeat that I have been thoroughly consistent on this subject and I still remain so. Mr. S.M. Krishna mentioned about the Indian Institute of Science. The Indian Institute of Science has the capability to take note of such things and this information that has come to me is via the Institute also. They are already ware of the hazards and they are taking due care to see to it that this terminator gene is not allowed. They also have the same opinion.

श्री नरेश यादव जी ने संकर बीजों की आवश्यकता के संबंध में कहा। हालांकि इस से थोड़ा सा विषयांतर हो जाएगा, उस के बावजूद हाई-ब्रिड सोड की उत्पादन करने की क्षमता अधिक है और किसानों के ऊपर किसी प्रकार की कोई अनिवार्यता नहीं है। वह केवल स्लेक्छ से जो खरीदता है, खरीदता है। अगर उसे लगता है कि उससे उत्पादन बेहतर है तो खरीदे, अनिवार्यता का कोई सवाल नहीं है, न की जाएगी और न अब तक की गयी है।

श्री नरेश यादव: आवश्यकता के बारे में....

श्री सोमपाल: आवश्यकता यदि है तो उन को दिया जाना चाहिए। वैज्ञानिक अनुसंधान से उन को बंचित रखना भी उचित नहीं है और "मॉनसेटो" हो या कोई भी हो, भारत में उस को अनुमति तब तक नहीं दी जाएगी जब तक कि इन सब पक्षों और फलसुओं की समीक्षा वैज्ञानिक रूप से और कठोर वैज्ञानिक रूप से पूरे अध्ययन के साथ नहीं कर ली जाती।

सभापति जी, इन्हीं शब्दों के साथ... (व्यवधान)... जांच हो रही है। सभापति जी, इन्हीं शब्दों के साथ मैं अपनी बात समाप्त करता हूँ और सभी माननीय सदस्यों को जिन्होंने इस चर्चा में भाग लिया, धन्यवाद देता हूँ।

SHRI S.R. BOMMAI: Sir, the farmers of Karnataka... (Interruptions)

SHRI K.R. MALKANI: Sir, some questions have been raised here which

have not been answered. I said the Indian Institute of Science should be advised to terminate its agreement with Monsanto. How does the Government react to that? Once you let these people in, they are like the Trojan Horse, You and I will not know what they will do here. Where does the Government stand on this issue?

SHRI SOM PAL: There is no proposal to rescind the agreement. This has to continue.

MR. CHAIRMAN: It is over now. We will take up the special mention on the Sufi Shrine in Karnataka now. A number of people have given their names. I will allow only one Member from each party. Shri Vayalar Ravi...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI K. RAHMAN KHAN: Sir, please allow us to speak. *(Interruptions)* We are from Karnataka. *(Interruptions)*

MR. CHAIRMAN: That is all right. I will allow only one person from each party. Otherwise, it will become a debate. It is a Special Mention. *(Interruptions)* One person from each party.

SHRI KHAN GHUFRAN ZAHIDI: Can we associate ourselves, Sir?

MR. CHAIRMAN: Yes, but only by saying, "I associate". *(Interruptions)*

SHRI K. RAHMAN KHAN: Sir, we are from Karnataka. These things are happening there and we are concerned about it.

SHRI CHAIRMAN: I agree. *(Interruptions)* I totally agree with you. There will be a number of Members from Karnataka and I would like to permit them all. *(Interruptions)* But you can just get up and say, "I associate". That is all. Shri Vayalar Ravi, please.

SHRI S.M. KRISHNA: Sir, this has emotional overtones. That is why we are requesting you.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I agree with you. That is why I am allowing you.

Otherwise, on a Calling Attention day, we don't allow anything. Because this is something grave.

I have allowed it. But you can say, "I associate" and that is all.

SHRI VAYALAR RAVI: Sir, if that is the decision, the I wish Shri K. Rahman Khan, who comes from Karnataka, may raise the issue.

MR. CHAIRMAN: All right.

SPECIAL MENTION

Threat to Sufi Shrine in Karnataka

SHRI K. RAHMAN KHAN (Karnataka): Mr. Chairman, Sir, this is a very serious issue. It may disturb the entire peace of this country.

Sir, the Baba Budangiri Hills is a known peaceful area in Karnataka. In Chikmagalur, there is a cave. There is a shrine of Hazrat Dada Hayath Khalandar. History also says that he came there and the coffee seed was brought by him. It is a historical fact. For the last 200-300 years, it is a Muslim shrine. People from all faiths visit there, pay their respects, but all of a sudden, it has been said that it is the Datatreya Peetha. Because of certain mention, the Muthawalli there went to the court for his own selfish motive saying that this should not be a wakf property; it should be a property where it is hereditary because both Hindus and Muslims come and pray here. So, it should not be treated as a wakf property. The High Court only said that the *status quo* is to be maintained and Muslims and Hindus should come and offer this prayers. There is no objection to it. Now, just because the High Court made that mention, the Vishwa Hindu Parishad and the Bajrang Dal say that this shrine belongs to Dattatreya and it is a Hindu shrine. Nowhere is it said that it is a Hindu shrine. It is a registered wakf property. This is going on. All of a sudden, both the Vishwa Hindu Parishad and the Bajrang Dal have joined together and