श्री बालकवि बैरागी (मध्य प्रदेश): मैडम,मुझे नेता सदन के बारे में एक प्रार्थन करनी है। मुझे प्रार्थना सिर्फ यह करनी है कि आप सिकन्दर बख्त साहब के ऊपर एक प्रतिबन्ध लगा दीजिए कि वे जब भी इस हाउस में आएं तो उसके पहले लोक सभा से होकर नहीं आएं। ये जब-जब वहां से आते हैं बहुत गुस्से में आते हैं और बड़ी मृश्किल से नार्मल होते हैं।

श्री ऑकार सिंह लखावत: गुस्सा न करें यह बात आप अपनी पार्टी वालों से भी कह दें।...(व्यवधान)...

श्री संघ प्रिय गौतमः आप कविता सुनाकर गुस्सा कम कर दीजिए।....(व्यवधान)...

श्री बालकवि बैरागी: ये वहां से जब भी यहां आए हैं,यहां पर बरसे हैं और बहुत गुस्सा करते हुए आए हैं। अब नार्मल हुए हैं।

उपसभापति: जो लोग इस हाऊस के मेम्बर रहते हैं वह बहुत समझदारी से अपनी जिम्मेदारी निभाते हैं। कभी-कभी उधर चले जाते हैं तो दूसरी बात है। श्री अहमद पटेल।

Perpetuating Atrocities on Minorities and Weaker Sections in Gi^arat and other parts of the Country.

श्री अहमद पटेल(गुजरात): महोदया, मै आपका आमारी हूं कि एक महत्वपूर्ण मुद्दे पर, गंभीर विषय पर आपने मुझे सदन का ध्यान आकर्षित करने का मौका दिया। बहुत ही भरे मन और व्यथित हृदय के साथ में आज सदन के सामने खड़ा हुआ हूं। इसलिए नहीं कि सिर्फ अक्लियत या वीकर सैक्सन का सवाल है। सवाल इन्सान का हैं, सवाल इंसानियत का है।

अंधेरों में जो रोशनी दिखाई देती हैं, बस्ती अमन की जलती हुई दिखाई देती हैं, और सियासत,सियासत इन्सान को ऐसे गन्दे मोड़ पर ले आई

कि इंसानियत आज दम तोड़ती दिखाई देती हैं।

मैडम,अफसोस की बात तो यह है कि गुजरात,राजस्थान,उत्तर प्रदेश और महाराष्ट्र में ये हो रहा हैं जम्मू एंड काश्मीर में कुछ दिन पहले हमने डोडा के वाकये पर यहां चर्चा की और सिर्फ भारत में ही नहीं बल्कि पाकिस्तान में भी जो हमसे अलग हुआ था मानवाधिकार का वहां पर भी उल्लंघन हुआ है। अक्लियतों के साथ वहां पर जो हो रहा हैं,उसको हम अच्छी तरह से जानते हैं। ऐट्रोसिटीज किसी पर भी

हो-चाहे वह अक्लियत पर हो, चाहे वीकर सैंक्शन पर हो,चाहे मेजोरिटी क्मयुनिटी पर हो,उसकी भर्त्सना होनी चाहिए, उसकी निन्दा होनी चाहिए। लेकिन अफसोस की बात तो यह है कि कभी-कभी हम भी सब्जेक्टिव हो जाते हैं, सलेक्टिव हो जाते हैं। ऐसे जो भी हादसे होते हैं, जिस तरह से उनकी निन्दा होनी चाहिए उस तरह की नहीं होती है। प्राइवेटली बहुत सारे हमारे जो सत्ता में लोग हैं गुजरात में । वे इसबात को स्वीकार कर लें कि जो कुछ हो रहा है वह गलत हो रहा है। लेकिन प्राइवेटली क्यों कह रहे हैं,पब्लिकली इसका खंडन क्यों नहीं करते ? जहां भी ऐसे मसले आते हैं,मैं समझता हूं कि अगर किसी पर एट्रोसिटी हो,किसी पर अन्याय हो,इसके खिलाफ सब को आवाज उठानी चाहिए,इसको सब को कंडेम करना चाहिए,उसकी निन्दा होनी चाहिए । अफसोस तो यह है कि राष्ट्रपति महात्मा गांधी जी की आजादी के बाद हत्या हुई ,देश का बंटवारा हुआ है। लेकिन आज कुछ ताकतें ऐसी है जो लोगों के दिलों का बंटवारा कर रही है। राष्ट्रपिता महात्मा गांधी की जो विचारधारा है,आज उसकी हत्या हो रही है। गुजरात में पिछले दिनों से जो कुछ हो रहा है,मैं समझता हूं कि यह सीमा से बाहर है। इसका बयान इसको बंद करना भी मुश्किल है। पिछले चार महीनों में बीस से भी ज्यादा वाकियात वहां पर हुए हैं,घटनायें घटित हुई है। वहां पर जो माहोल हैं, सत्ता में आने से पहले तो यह कहा गया कि हम भय-मुक्त शासन,भय-मुक्त वातावरण,भय-मुक्त वायुमंडल तैयार करेंगे। लेकिन वहां आज लोग भयभीत हैं । लोगों को आतंकित किया जा रहा है। वहां का जो सामाजिक ढांचा है,जो सोशल फैब्रिक हैं उसको कमजोर करने की कोशिश की जा रही है,सामाजिक स्परूप को तहस-नहस करने की कोशिश की जा रही है। जो वाकयात वहां पर हए हैं मैं सब का यहां ज़िक्र नहीं कर सकता हूं क्योंकि इतना वक्त नहीं है। लेकिन चार-पांच जो वाकयात वहां पर हुए हैं, उन्हें मैं सदन के सामने रखना चाहंगा।

महोदया,कुछ देर पहले हमारे साथी ने बताया,उन्होंने जो जिक्र किया वह कपड़वन का वाकया है। बाकायदा क्रिश्यिन कम्युनिटी को वहां पर सिमेट्री के लिए जगह दी गई। गवर्नमेंट ने इसको नोटिफाई कर दिया,सर्वे नं. 643 को जब एक क्रिश्यिन भाई का देहान्त हुआ तो उनको वहां दफनाया गया। उसके बाद क्या हुआ? काफीन को ऊपर लाकर सड़क पर रख दिया गया। शर्मनाक बात हैं। उनकी समझ में नहीं आ रहा था कि इसका क्या किया जाए सिमेट्री में उसको दफनाने नहीं दिया गया। नदी किनारे कहीं जाकर उसको दफनाया

गया। इससे बड़ी शर्म की घटना क्या हो सकती है। गवर्नमेंट १ जुलाई को नोटिफाई कर रही हैं किय ह ग्रेवयार्ड का प्लाट आपको दिया जा रहा है, उसके बाद यह हो रहा हैं।

झंगवा, डिस्ट्रिक सूरत में क्या हुआ ? सालों से वहां क्रिश्चिन सोसायटी अपना स्कूल चला रहे हैं और ऐसा नहीं है कि सिर्फ वहां प क्रिश्चिन स्टुडेंट्स हों। हार्डली 1,2 या 3 परसेंट होंगे। 95 परसेंट और कम्युनिटी के बच्चें वहां पढ़ते हैं। एक टेनेंट था। सालों से केस चल रहा था। वहां की सरकार चेंज हुई तो किसी तहसीलदार ने आर्डर कर दिया। टेनेंट को रिकग्राइज कर दिया और रात को ट्रेक्टर लेकर वहां पहुंचते है और स्कूल का जो कम्यांउड था उस को प्लो किया गया। हजार,बारह सौ बच्चे सड़क पर आ गए। वहां पर ज्यातादर बच्चे दूसरी कम्युनिटी के हैं,न कि सिर्फ क्रिश्यन हैं।

राजकोट में क्या हुआ ? आई.पी.मिशन स्कूल में बाईबल की बेइज्जती की गई । उसकी 300 कापियां जला दी गई । मेरे ख्याल से यह जो कुछ हो रहा है,कुछ समय से हो रहा हैं । ऐसा क्यों हो रहा हैं? आखिर ऐसा क्यों करना पड़ता हैं? आज तक वहां पर किसी के खिलाफ कोई कार्यवाही नहीं की गई है । हमारे साथी वहां पर गए हुए है । वारडोली और रणधरीपुर में इंटरकास्ट मैरेज और इनटर कम्युनिटी मैरेज होती रहती हैं। कोई वाकयात वहां पर नहीं हुए थे।

जहां पर मुस्लिम लड़कों ने माइनारिटी के लड़कों ने मेजोरिटी कम्युनिटी की लड़िकयों से शादी की है। मेरे पास लम्बी लिस्ट है। मैं आपको पूरी लिस्ट दे सकता हूं और सदन को यह बता सकता हं कि कहां पर मुस्लिम गर्ल्ज ने मेजोरिटी फेमलीज़ के लड़कों से शादी की हैं। यह तो सामाजिक समस्या है। इसको रिलीजियस प्रोब्लम में परिवर्तित किया जा रहा है। रणधीरपुर में संजेली की जो 500 फेमलीज़ थी माइनारिटी की उनको गांव छोड कर चले जाना पडा । अगर 29 अप्रैल के इण्डियन एक्सप्रेस की रिपोर्ट आ पढ़ेंगे, उसमें सारी डिटेल्ज़ दी हुई है। वहां पर स्लोगन क्या दिया जा रहा हैं? कहते हुए भी शर्म आ रही है। पहले कसाई फिर इसाई। यह भी कोइ बात हुई। वहां पर स्पेशनल प्रोब्लम हैं। अगर कोई गुनाहगार, दोषी था तो उसको फांसी पर लटका दो । आई.एस.आई.अगर कुछ कर रही है तो उसको रोकने की आपकी जिम्मेदारी है । आई.एस.आई.का पर्दाफाश करो । लेकिन यह कहना कि लड़के-लड़कियों की शादी हो रही है,इसमें आई.एस.आई.का डिज़ाइन है,इसलिए मुस्लिम पापूलेशन बढ़ाने के लिए आई.एस.आई.यह कह रही है । हद हो गई है। ऐसे 20

से ज्यादा वाकयात है जिनको मैं बयान कर सकता हूं । जो कुछ हो रहा है,मेरे ख्याल में,हमारा सर शर्म से झुक जाता है। आखिर यह तो इन्सानियत का सवाल है । जैसे मैंने कहा किसी एक कम्युनिटी का सवाल नहीं है,न अक्कलियत का सवाल है और न वीकर सेक्शन का सवाल है। वीकर सेक्शन के साथ भी यही हुआ। मैं आपके ज़रिये,इस सदन के ज़रिये मरकज़ी सरकार से,सेंट्रल गवर्नमेंट से यह अनुरोध करना चाहूंगा कि कम से कम यह जो घटनाएं घटित हो रही है,इस पर ध्यान दे । सिर्फ वोटों की राजनीति नहीं चलनी चाहिए । हमें राजनीति से ऊपर उठना पडेगा.अपनी निहित-स्वार्थो से ऊपर उठना पड़ेगा । अब वहां पर क्रिश्यिन कनवर्शन करा रहे हैं,ऐसा प्रोपेगंडा करने का मकसद यह है कि ट्राइबल के वोट लेने हैं। सोशल प्रोब्लम जो शादियां हो रही है शादियां करके मेजोरिटी के वोट लेने हैं। यह भी हो सकता है कि अभी कांडला में जो घटना घटित हुई उसमें 10 हजार से ज्यादा लोग मारे गए और अभी भी डे-बॉडीज़ मिल रही है। कहीं लोगों का ध्यान डाइवर्ट करने के लिए तो नहीं कह रहे हैं? सिर्फ वोटों की राजनीति कर के समाज को बांटने का काम हो रहे हैं। एक तरफ राष्ट्रहित की बात करते है और दूसरी तरफ समाज को बांटने की बात करते हैं,कम्युनिटी को बांटने की बात करेंगे तो इससे राष्ट्र का हित नहीं होगा,अहित होगा । यह आपको समझना पड़ेगा । ऐसे वाकये अगर देश में कहीं और हो रहे है, किसी के साथ भी हो रहे हैं.यह इन्सान के साथ हो रहे है.इसको गंभीरता के साथ लेना होगा। बाकी प्रदेशों में जहां और दलों की सरकारें हैं,वहां हम अपनी सेंट्रल टीम भेज देते हैं । मैं सदन के माध्यम से अनुरोध करूंगा कि गुजरात तथा अन्य प्रदेशों में जहां-जहां ऐसा हो रहा है,वहां पर सेंट्रल टीम हो भेजा जाए। वहां लॉएंड आर्डर सिच्येशन क्या है, उसका मुआयना किया जाए। इन्हीं शब्दों के साथ,आल पार्टी डेलेगेशन भी भेजा जा सकता है। अगर, इसको गम्भीरता से ले रहे हैं तो मैं समझता हं हमारे लीडर आफ दी हाऊस भी उपस्थित हैं, उनसे भी अनुरोध कंरूगा कि इस को गम्भीरता से लेना चाहिये।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Shri Nilotpal Basu. As he has give» the details, you please be a little brief so that we can cover the whole thing.

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU (West Bengal): Madam, 1 will be very brief. In fact, our Patelji has covered many of the incidents. Basically. through you, Madam, I would like to pose some questions before the leader of the House. He will show certain respect in the House and he is known for his balanced judgment. When this Government came to power, the issue which was exercising the minds of the entire country was this, whether the secular fabric of the country will remain intact or not. It is not a question of this community or that community. Certain provisions are there for the protection of the fundamental rights of different sections of the society and more particularly of the minorities, not for any appeasement. You see, the maturity of a democracy, the strength of the democracy can understood by the extent to which a minority and its fundamental rights are protected in a particular country.

This has been the understanding of the civilisation over the years. Take, for example, the whole issue of Christianity. India, is one country where Christianity arrived much before it arrived in Europe. We have before us a philosophy. That philosophy has been put into words by somebody. Somebody will claim that he is Mr. Golwalkar. He has defined the theory in his so-called treaties called "Our Nationhood Defined" some sixty years back.

प्रो.विजय कुमार मल्होत्रा(दिल्ली): यह किताब उन्होंने नहीं लिखी। बार-बार उसको मिसकोट कर रहे हैं। 50 बार उसका ज़िक्र हो चुका है।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Which book?

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: Nitionbood Defined.

PROF. VUAY KUMAR MALHOT-RA: It was not I book written by him. It was clarified many times. Again and again it is being reoorded. (*Interrupdoru*)

THE DEPUIT CHAIRMAN: I would like it to oome oa reoord that he bat clarified that it docs not need to be his. He hM daciOadl it. It is a part of record.

PROF. VTTAY KUMAR MALHOT RA: Why should he go on repeating? (Interruptions)

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: He might not have written it. The book continues to inspire cadres of a particular organisation which is behind this kind of activities.

प्रो.विजय कुमार मल्होत्रा: 50 साल पहले की बात है। । वह भी मना कर रहे हैं।

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: How "can we erase that fact? (Interruptions)

PROF. VIJAY KUMAR MALHOT-RA: Some other book was written by somebody else. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: I am quoting from a newspaper. (Interruptions)

PROF. VIJAY KUMAR MALHOT-RA: That is a wrong newspaper report. (*Interruptions*) It was not written by him. It was clarified that he did not write that book.

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: Who wrote?

PROF. VIJAY KUMAR MALHOT-RA: Someone wrote the book. Later his name was mentioned and that he clarified it. (Interruptions)

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: Who wrote and who clarified? (*Interruptions*) Do you condemn the book?

PROF^ VIJAY KUMAR MALHOT-RA: I do not say that I condemn the book. (Interruptiorts)

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: We condemn the book. Do the RSS condemn the book? We do not agree with the formulations that are written in the book. (*Interruptions*) RSS does not condemn the book. BJP does not condemn the book and that is the fact (*Interruptioru*)

PROF. VUAY KUMAR MALHOT-RA: We do not condemn. (Interruptions)

प्रो.रामबख्श सिंह वर्मा: अग हम कंडेग्र नहीं करते है तो इसके माने यह नहीं है ...(व्यवधान) SHRI K.R. MALKANI: This book was withdrawn from circulation. (*Interruptions*) It was withdrawn more than 30 years ago. (*Interruption.'*) It was withdrawn from circulation more than 30 years ago.

उपसभापति: आपने लिखी थी क्या ?

SHRI K.R. MALKANI: Whoever wrote it, but I did not write. It was withdrawn from circulation more than 30 years ago.

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: Do you disown the book? Do you condemn the book? Does the RSS condemn the book?

SHRI K.R. MALKANI: It was withdrawn. (*Interruptions*)

PROF. VIJAY KUMAR MALHOT-RA: We do noi condemn the book.

प्रो.विजय कुमार मल्होत्राः पुराने किस्से को कहां जोड़ रहे हैं । आज इस मामले से उसे कहां जोड़ रहे हैं ...(व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Nilot-"palji, let me settle the matter. Who has written the book by the way? I have not read the book.

SHRI K.R. MALKANI: Ask them to produce the book. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Nilotpal, which book are you referring to? (Interruption)

SHRI NILbTPAL BASU: I am talking about 'Our Nationhood Defined" written . by Golwalkar.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. V.K. Malhotra and Mr. Malkani, both . have said that this book has been withdrawn. (*Interruptions*) That is what he said. (*Interruptions*) I am only saying what he said.

श्री ख़ान गुफ़रान जा़िहदी: क्या यह बिदड़ा हो गयी है ? ...(व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Go ahead and talk about what happened in Gujarat.

PROF. VUAY KUMAR MALHOT-RA: Are we discussing this book?

30 साल,50 साल पहले की बात कर रहे हैं। कोई बात हैं। वह जो आज है उसका ज़िक्र करें। 50 साल पहले की बात का क्या ज़िक्र कर रहे हैं...(व्यवधान)

श्री खान गुफ़रान ज़ाहिदी: मैडम,दो बातें कहीं गयी हैं वहां ...(व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let us go ahead with the issue because... (Interruptions)

श्री संघ प्रिय गौतमः आप के पास सिवाय आर.एस.एस.और बी.जे.पी.की आलोचना के कोई और भी सब्जेक्ट रहता है क्या ?

श्री नीलोत्पल बसुः हां,बहुत हैं...

श्री संघ प्रिय गोतमः आपका खाना हज़म होता है कि नहीं।

श्री नीलोत्पल बसुः बहुत सारे हैं...(व्यवधान) इसलिए मैं बोल रहा हूं....(व्यवधान) इसलिए मैं बोल रहा हूं....(व्यवधान) वर्यों के यह जो वारदात हैं इसके बारे में अहमद पटेल ने कहा...

(Interruptions) You give a notice on the subject. We have no problem. (Interruptions)

प्रो.विजय कुमार मल्होत्रा: अभी वेस्ट बंगाल में जो-जो कुछ हुआ ....(व्यवधान)

SHRI NITLOPAL BASU: I am speaking on the subject. Madam, I quote...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Nilot-palji, let us confine ourselves to the issue which Mr. Ahmed Patel has raised so that the focus is not diverted to some book which somebody had written or had not written. Whatever somebody has said or whatever his ideology is ....(Interruptions)... What is happening exactly ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: In order to understand what is happening in Gujarat, you cannot just eliminate the role of this book and the formulations made in this book with regard to the incidents that are taking place in Gujarat. ...(Interruptions)... If somebody says that all foreign races, all people having any religion other than Hinduism, they are to integrate with the society in such a manner that their distinct identity cannot be continued, if that is the philosophy and on the basis of

that organisations are being organised, then this is going to happen. I am sorry to say that this is the inter-connection. ... (Interruptions)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now I will call Mr. Vayailar Ravi.

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: Madam, give me just two minutes. I would like to go on record that I have understood and it has come in the Press also that the Union Home Ministry is also upset over the series of incidents that have been initiated by the VHP in terms of the attacks that the Christian community is facing in the entire Gujarat. What we heard about churches in Delhi and the series of incidents that are happening elsewhere in the country, this poses a very, very serious threat to the unity and secularism of the country. It is acting like a contagious disease. Therefore, this was our j)oint in the very beginning that this is the hidden agenda of this Government. You may pledge your faith in the Constitution, but no action so far has been taken against those people who perpetrated such inhuman crime in Gujarat. That is the issue. ...(Interruptions),.. I am confining myself to Gujarat. ...(Interrupt tions)... The human crime is that a dead body was taken out of the grave and left op>en on the road. They are burning Bibles. ...(IrUerruptio/ts),..

# PROF. VUAY KUMAR MALHOT-RA: No ...(Interruptions).,.

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: Yes. Bibles have been burnt in Rajkot. You go and fmd out. You are not prepared to ensure to the people the fundamental rights enshrined in the Constitution. You do not want human rights. Madam, this is a very, very serious situation. It puts in doubt the credibility of the Government and the assurance that it has given to the whole nation through the Presidential Address and the National Agenda of Governance. We demand of this Government that they ensure constitutional and fundamental rights to all sections of the

people, irrespective of caste, creed and religion. The rights of the people should be secured and safeguarded and such incidents which have taken place in Gujarat should immediately come to a stop.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have a number of names on this subject. I would like Members to be very, very brief. The basic issue is that the Fundamental Rights enshrined in the Constitution have been violated for whatever reason, they have to be taken care of and such things should not happen. This is the gist of the subject. So, I would request Shri Vayalar Ravi to be brief. I have five names before me.

SHRI VAYALAR RAVI (Kerala): Madam. I will confine myself to the incidents of Gujarat. I will not speak on general issues. I returned only today from Gujarat after visiting that State for two days. I was directed by the Congress President, Mrs. Sonia Gandhi to go there. I can give the first hand information because I have visited that area. Madam, in a period of 90 days, 24 such incidents have taken place. They are not confined to only one district. In many other districts also, these incidents are taking, place. It seems to me that there is an organised effort by a group of people, particularly those people who are propagating anti-minority sentiments. They are also making a propaganda that Gujarat is going to become a part of Pakistan.

This kind of propaganda is going on. It b not confined to one area. Madam, Bardoli is a name associated with the Indian Freedom Movement. It has been written with golden letters in our Freedom Movement. It has started in that place. The whole thing has started in a shameful manner. I am told that earlier it was against one particular community. Now it has spread to other communities such as Christians. I am saying this because the people are complaining to me. Madam, when I went all the way down to Bardoli, they said that a new slogan has

I went there. It is a very serious thing. There is a small church, there are two or three nuns. some doctors, and some nurses. It is a small hospital. The father, who is a priest, is underground. They have invoked the PASA, which is worse than the TAD A, PASA is Prevention of Anti-social Activities. It has mostly been used only against the Christian and Muslim minority.... (Time-Bell rings).... One minute. Madam. This father is under the threat of the police, and he is underground. What is the reason? The parents asked him to go on a strike in the school. One fellow made a complaint. His father had instigated for strike, and PASA has been invoked, PASA has been invoked against many people. I can show you that PASA has been- invoked against many people, and there had been misuse of law. They are not using it against the anti-social elements, who are involved in it.

There is another case that I would like to mention. This is about a school which is at Rajkot. There are 500 girls in this school, out of which only 18 girls are Christians. All other girls are froin other communities. It is a hundred year old school—Century Silver School. Seventy-five per cent < k the teachers are Hindus there. I have beea told that they are allowed to have bindi aad mangal sutra. I went to the tMchers room, and I saw that all the teachers were having bmdi and mangai sum. I asked them, "What happened." They said, "No, there was no proUem." Madam, then I got a statement iron the liris. It is here. The girb sud that aOD Bajnu^ Dal people caaw and entered into dm\* cJMWDoms hig^ classes, such as U^KT seoonduy daates. The girls were pushed out of ttie cb>-srooms. There is a lot of problem. I asked the girls if they were molested. They did not reply either 'yes' or 'no'. That is right. How an they tell me that they have been molested? Is it the way to flourish Hinduism in this country, by attacking girls? These are the statementt with me. I can furnish them to you. I can also produce some evidence which will

show the connivance of the police with antisocial elements.

Then, there is a school in Narora near Ahemadabad. This school has been burnt down. Even an amount of Rs. 75,000, which was collected as fee from the students, was taken away. They burnt a few notes and spread them there. Madam, these are the burnt notes. I have got with me. I am putting the evidence before you. And there has been no police action. Nor the police is taking into custody the evidences. They took only a few burnt notes. The police is merely an onlooker. Nobody has been arrested. There have been 24 such incidents, and only three persons have been arrested, and they too have been released by the police without taking any action. That is worrying me. The Government's connivance is worrying me. That is why I am saying that the Government is instigating other Governments also because they are forming a cell. Police is not taking any action. The minorities are under perpetual fear because it is not only against one community, but it is against Christians also. The Bible has been burnt. I asked them, "Are vou Christians?" They said, "No, Sir, we are not Christians, we are Hindus." They are singing Vande Mataram every day in the morning ...(Interruptions)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: There is nothing wrong. He did not say anything wrong ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI VAYALAR RAVI: That is what I am saying because you are insisting on the Vande Mataram. I am saying they are dagpng the Vande Mataram everyday in the Borai^. There are no religious daaiM. Nobody is teking any religious dams. This is a put (rf the Iruh Church, that is, the diurch (rf the north India. They are trustees. I found six or seven Christian institutions in Ahmedabad town. Many of them came and met me. They are not getting any protection from the Government, and the Bajrang Dal and the VHP people have

come up. The slogan is, "T?^ ^BWf, ^ ffflll" The meaning is, first it was Muslims and now it is Christians. They are saying this with evidence. I am not narrating the incidents which had happened. But, I can tell you that a sense of fear and a sense of insecurity has come into the minds of not only in one section of the minority but in all sections of the minority and all are living in a perpetual fear because it is happening in different parts. There is misuse of law and antisocial elements are taking the law into their own hands and they have not been arrested so far. Our hon. colleague, Shri Ahmed Patel, has narrated certain incidents. I am only saying one or two incidents. In one incident, a marriage has taken place. Madam, sometimes, children in colleges fall in love with each other and get married. But, that happens only if there is constnt from both the sides. I was told in Rajkot, Bardoli and Surat, there are seven cases of Hindu boys marrying Muslim giris. But, there is no complaint. They are all living peacefully. I know the names and if you want, I will give you the names. It is happening. Madam, these are the two leaflets published in a district in Gujarat. They are in Gujarati language. These are abusing the minority communities. It is a congnizable offence under Section 14 and S3(a) and a Magistrate prosecuted them. I can place it on the Table of the House. Anybody can look at it as to how they abused one minority community by saying that they are increasing the population. Madam, they are saying that three lakh Hindu girls married Muslims and are increasing the population of India so that India becomes Pakistan. That is what is written here. How can the Government tolerate this kind of leaflets? So, Madam, I believe that it has been done in connivance with the Government. Yesterday I was in Ahmedabad. It appeared today in the Indian Express. A Minister announced in the Assembly that they are going to form a cell. Cell for what? A cell to enquire into inter-caste and inter-religious marriages. It is, on receiving complaints; ask the police to arrest them; produce them;

establish a statement from the girl and arrest the members of the family and the boy. I am saying this seriously. It has appeared in the Indian Express that it has been announced in the Assembly. What does it mean? Madam, Bajrang Dal and VHP people are behind this. It has been noticed by them. They are doing all this and the Government is giving protection by forming a cell under the Home Ministry at Gandhinagar which is being represented by Shri L.K. Advani and who is the hon. Home Minister at the Centre. They are monitoring. Actually, they are not monitoring but they are enquiring into the marriages. Madam, has anybody heard this kind of a story that marriages have been enquired into? Naturally, every girl's family feels unhappy when some other boy married their daughter, including my wife's family because I had also done this once upon a time. It is a fact. That does not mean that they will make a complaint and the police will enquire into it. I myself feel very sad about this. So, this is happening. And, it is happening with the connivance of the police. Madam, look at this photograph. It had happened in Navasari, where the VHP and the Bajrang Dal members are shouting slogans in front of a mosque. No action has been taken by the police. After the procession, they imposed curfew. What happened after the curfew was that people looted Muslim shops all over. Then, in another town there was an old Muslim, who was a nice person."I do not want to name him. He had eight stabs. His son was running the lone Muslim shop there. They Stabbed with daggars in his back. He is still in th» hospital even today.

Dagger and arrow is the symbol of the Bajrang Dal. I do not know whether they are distributing daggers these days. I do not know. Please find out. Madam, this has happened with the Christian community. He has already explained. I went to that place where this has happened and the land has forcibly been taken over. I travelled for about four hours and

been taking law into their hands. They are not expected to do this. The Government must act and I convey this to the hon. Home Minister, Mr. L.K. Advani. He is elected from Gandhinagar. He represents that State. I am afraid either he has no knowledge or he is closing this eyes towards it. He has got police machinery, he has got intelligence bureau, he has got everything under him. Definitely, he has knowledge of things. I do not know what he is doing, why he Is not acting. I suspect, and I have to charge him that the Gujarat Government is acting against the minorities by allowing the people of the Bajrang Dal and the BJP to take the law into their hands.

Mr. L.K. Advani should be clear and deny my allegations that this is happening with his knowjedge. The Home Minister is the first accused in this case. Thank you.

DR. L.M. SINGHVI (Rajasthan): Madam Deputy Chairperson, I think that the subject is of such profound concern that it must receive the attention of the whole nation.

It is unfortunate that every once in a while accusations are made against a political party. That is not how we can resolve the problem. This is a problem which we must face together. Ours is a country which is proUd of its heritage, the heritage of inter-faith harmony and understanding. Even if one such incident happens, it brings a slur on our ...(Interruptions)....

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let him complete. He is not justifying. I do not think he will justify it. (*Interruptions*) Nobody will justify it.

DR. L.M. SINGHVI: I do not think my learned friends understand what I am saying. (*Interruptions*). I was saying that if one such incident happens it brings a slur on our civilization because respect for minorities, respect for the point of view of others is a part of our civilisation.

It is alleged that these youths were Hindu youths. Whether they were Hindu, Muslim, Christian or any other, no one is entitled to defile and defy our heritage.

Madam, Our nationhood is defined by our Constitution. Our nationhood is defined by our Constitution. Our nationhood is defined by our constitution. Our nationhood is defined by covenants contained in our 'sense of civilization. Therefore, for God's sake, let us never say that our nationhood can be defined otherwise except through our Constitution or our heritage.

Madam Deputy Chairperson, We must establish a strategy of common concern and common action of national thinking and united action. We must not allow these issues to be politicized because one misguided youth or one misguided organisation is alleged to have done it. Let us, first of all find out the facts. The facts should be found first. People who have committed an offence of this nature must be brought to book without anyone being spared. There has to be an effort to understand that when a crime is committed, that crime has to be dealt within the society and according to law. A crime is committed by an individual or a group of individuals. It is that individual or that group of individuals who have to be punished. The moment you begin to politicize the issue you are destroying the very cause for which we are crusading.

Madam Deputy Chairperson, I would like very much to emphasise that we must do something more j?ositive *sjpaui* promoting inter-faith understanding and harmony. The other day a distinguished journalist, Mr. Chanchal Sarkar, reviewing a book on the late Maulana Abul Kalam Azad, said, for the first time-he came to know heritage of Hindus and Muslims together. It is very important for us to see that this understanding is studioresly inculcated. This Government is committed, BJE is committed to promote inter-faith harmony because that is a part of the Indian heritage. As my

learned friend rightly said, it is a part of our civilization. I "think, we must not allow it to be politicized. We must insist that those who may have committed the crime must be brought to book. Secondly, we must insist on doing something more positive about it, rather than talk about it one occasional afternoon in this august House, there has to be a programme for inculcating true togetherness amongst us all. There has to be an educational programme. There has to be a cultural programme. I suggest, Madam Deputy Chairperson, that, perhaps, Parliament could have, at least, once in a year, an inter-faith prayer in the Central Hall of Pariiament, to emphasise and underline the fact that we are multi-cultural nation, that we are a nation which is '-because of the heritage of the Vedas, oecause of the heritage of the Upanishads, because of the composite culture that we have evolved-committed to certain ideals. Those ideals are enshrined in our Constitution. (Time-Bell rings) Those ideals which are enshrined in our Constitution have to be translated in our workaday life.

It is not the first time that this sort of thing has happened. The burning of the Bible diminshes us all. It is not the concern of just the Christian community. It is the concern of us all. I think it is important that we must understand that there has to be a long-term programme. Madam, years ago, when I was in Parliament, some such thing happened. On community was dealt with by another community in a bad way. The question was brought up. I think, we must stop the habit of criticising just one party. It is a sorrow for us all, as a nation, that something like that could happen in a nation, the heritage of which has always been one of understanding, harmony and amity. That is not enough. We must take some positive action. We must underline the concern of Parliament as a one single institution, across party lines, and speak in one voice to.

TTiank you. Madam.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. John Fernandes. 1 have got a lot of names. If everybody is going to say the same thing....

SHRI JOHN F. FERNANDES (Goa): I am going to say something different from what has been said, Madam.

Madam, what has happened in Gujarat, what is happening in Gujarat for the last two months, is a tragic thing. It is a greater tragedy that this is happening in the birth-place of Mahatma Gandhi.

We hear and read in the newspapers about what is happening in an Islamic country, across the border. I do not justify what they are doing. It is done by the fundamentali.'its. But when we have given to ourselves a secular Constitution, it is a bigger tragedy. We condemn what happened in...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You can name the country; no problem.

SHRI JOHAN F. FERNANDES: We condemn.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It happened in Paki.stan.

SHRI JOHN F. FJERNANDES: It is being said that, in that country, it is done by an organ of the State, namely, the ISI, to make that country an Islamic country. But Madam ours is a secular country. Secularism is enshrined in the Preamble of the Constitution.

When this Government came to power, they gave a document to the country—the National Agenda for Governance. What did they say? This is what they have said in clause 29 of that Agenda. These people art not talking about secularism They are talking about, what is called, 'genuine secularism\*. It is mentioned in clause 29: 'We are committed to establishing a civilised, humane and civil order...' and so on. I do not want to go into it.

What is happening in Gujarat is not only a violation of human rights. It is also a violation of the rule of law. It is most reprehensible that this is happening in a

State from where the hon. Home Minister had been elected to Parliament.

Madam, I do not want to speak in detail on this matter because my colleague, Mr. Ahmed Patel, has mentioned, in detail, as to what happened there. If this sort of thing is allowed to continue, I do not think they would be able to fulfil their dream which they have. It will only end in the balkanisation of India. I think it is not their intention; whoever is doing it. This has to be strongly condemned.

Thank you. Madam.,

SHRI B.P. SINGHAL (Uttar Pradesh): Madam Deputy Chairman, at the outset, I must say that any incident which undermines the secular fabric of the country cannot but be condemned. But having said that, I would like to draw the attention of the I^Iouse to the reasons as to why it has taken place. We have heard so many speakers waxing eloquent on what is happening in Gujarat. But one wished they waxed eloquent earlier also when KashmiiJ pandits were being hounded out of Jammu and Kashmir.

SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA: We condemned it.

SHRI KHAN GHUFRAN ZAHIDI: We condemned it. The whole House condemned it

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: We did it, Mr. Singhal.

SHRI B.P. SINGHAL: Madam, I did not intervene anywhere.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will just tell this to you. Mr. Zahidi just now condemned the Doda killing. Yesterday or the day before yesterday we had a long discussion on it, and each one of us condemned it. There is a unanimous resolution passed by this House before you were elected here. I am prepared to condemn it anywhere in the world.

SHRI B.P. SINGHAL: Madam, more recently when the Devi Temple was attacked in Hyderabad, was such a condemnation visible?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: If somebody had brought it up, we would have condemned it.

SHRI B.P. SINGHAL: Today they are condemning it, and we are condemning it. No such condemnation was done by both the sides of the House on that *Incident...(Interruptions)...* That is the question that I ask of this House today ..... (*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Ut us know what he wants to say.

SHRI B.P. SINGHAL: This country is secular, gentlemen, just because the Hindus form the majority of this country. It is not in spiie of them, but it is because of them that this country *ti* secular today. Misleading things are being given, and I have witnessed this today.

When Mr. Rama Shanker Kaushik spoke about this incident, I was shocked. How can such an incident take place in Uttar Pradesh? I went out and contacted the DIG. I asked, "Has this happened? It is indefensible," Madam, the t'uth, as told to me by the authorities, is that five people had hired a taxi from Meerut and had started looting People near Jansath. A tractor trolley was looted...... (Interruptions)...

Please listen. Please hear the truth.... (Interruptions)...

श्री मोहम्मद आज़म ख़ानः ऐसा सही नहीं है,वह अपनी गाडी से गए थे।

उपसभापति: आप बैठ जाइए।

Just one second. Please sit down. Singhal Sabeb, you are a member of a major party of the ruling alliance. I would not like you to mention this. You will be in trouble. I will not like you to make a statement with such authenticity

<sup>†[ ]</sup>Ttansilteration in Arabic Script

उपसभापतिः नहीं,बहुत हो गया । खाली बोल दीजिए रिपीट करने से फायदा नहीं है।

डा.(श्रीमती) उर्मिला चिमनभाई पटेल: महोदय, जो यहां अहमद साहब ने बात कही है और हमारे दूसरे मैबर्स ने इसके बारे में कहा है, इसके साथ जोड़ते हुए में कह रही हूं कि एट्रासिटी गुजरात में बढ़ रही है। यह ऐसे इंसीडेंट की बात नहीं है, यह सौ दिन की जो बी. जे. पी. की सरकार है उसकी जो सिदियां है उसमें ऐसे 24 इंसीडेंट हैं। अगर ऐसे इंसीडेंट बनते रहे तो बहुत मुश्किल एटमास्फियर हो जाएगा। मैडम् इसलिए यह गंभीर बात है कि यह एट्रोसिटी का प्लानिंग किया गया है। इंसीडेंट एक एरिया में कोई बिना समझ वाले लोगों की गलती से हुए हैं, ऐसी बात नहीं है।

जो 24 जगहों पर हुआ है, वह डिफरेंट डिसिट्रक्ट्स से बना हुआ है या तो साउथ गुजरात हैं, सौराष्ट्र हैं, नॉर्थ गुजरात हैं, मिडिल गुजरात हैं, इसी तरह से अलग-अलग जगह विस्तार से यह किया गया है, इसके मायने यह है कि माइनॉरिटीज़ में टेरिएज़्म फैलाया जाए। प्रयूचन में अगर कहीं भी इलेक्शन हो तो इसके दो मायने हैं, एक तो उनका हिंदू वोट बैंक स्ट्रॉग होता रहे और दूसरी बात, माइनॉरिटी पर से बाहर निकल कर वोटिंग करने की हिम्मत न करें। ये दोनों बातें है और मैडम, दोनों ही बहुत महत्वपूर्ण हैं। यह डेमाक्रेसी को तोड़ने की बात है इसलिए इसकी गंभीरता मैं बता रही हूं

मैडम,तीन दिन पहले जो डिसक्शन हुआ था राष्ट्रपति महात्मा गांधी जी के बारे में,मैं उसे दोहराना नहीं चाहती हं लेकिन इसके बाद भी डिसक्शन होता रहा और न्यूज़पेपर्स में न्यूज़ आती रही कि हमारे राष्ट्रपिता महात्मा गांधी हमारे देश के राष्ट्रपिता नहीं है, उनको पाकिस्तान का राष्ट्रपिता गिनना चाहिए । मैडम,फ्रीडम ऑफ स्पीच की भी कोई मर्यादा होनी चाहिए । फ्रीडम ऑफ एक्सप्रेशन की भी मर्यादा होनी चाहिए और पब्लिश करने की,पब्लिसिटी करने के जो पैम्फलेट या बुकलेट हैं,इनकी भी कोई मर्यादा होनी चाहिए। यहां जो पैम्फलेट दिए गए,ऐसे पैम्फलेट लास्ट इलेक्शन में भी बेचे गए थे,इससे पहले भी बेचे गए थे और वे बजरंग दल और विश्व हिंदू परिषद के नाम से आए थे इसलिए हम सरकार को कह रहे हैं कि आज जो सरकार यहां सामने ट्रेज़ेरी बेंचेज़ पर बैठी हैं,वे इसी भाजपा सरकार की सिस्टर इंसटीट्युशन्स हैं। वे चाहें तो उनको रोक सकते हैं। उन्होंने अभी डिक्लेयर किया कि वह बुक हमने विदड़ाँ करवा ली है। तो ये सब पहले क्यों नहीं

on what the DIG said. It is the job of the Government. It is the job of the Home Minister. That is why I did not give any ruling. I just said that our Leader of the House should convey it to the Governmeidt to find out, to ascertain the facts from the State Government and to come. I cannot permit an individual Member to make a statement with such authenticity because you connot substantiate it. It is the duty of the Government to substantiate anything and to take the responsibility for it. It is not an individual Member's duty. I am just trying to tell you what the do's and dont's of the HouSe are.

SHRI B.P. SINGHAL: I accept it, Madam. I tried my best to find out the truth. I wanted to find out the truth about it.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let the truth come from the Government. I will be very happy if you will brief the Government. It should come from the Government, not from any individual member. Let it come. I will be very happy.

SHRI B.P. SINGHAL: The last point that I want to make is that they talk about the feeling of insecurity among the minorities. The truth is that the majority community is feeling insecure, and all this that is taking place is a reaction to things which are done by others but which are condoned. That is all.

Thank you, Madam.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Thank you.

I have got so many names written here, I can read them: Smt. Urmilaben Patel, Shri Bratin Sengupta, Shri Algh, Shri Maikani and Shri Prafull Goradia. एक-एक मिनट बोल दीजिए। उर्मिलाबेन जी,एक मिनट बोल दीजिए,क्योंकि काफी विस्तार से इस पर बात हो चुकी हैं। आप खाली कह दीजिए कि आपकी बात सच है या गलत हैं,आपकी क्या ऑपिनियन हैं।

**डा**.(श्रीमती **उर्मिला चिमनभाई पटेल** (गुजरात)ः मैडम,थोड़ा तो बोलना पड़ेगा।

करवाते हैं? क्यों ये समाज में इतना पॉयज़न डालने का काम कर रहे हैं? फ्यूचर जेनरेशन के ऊपर इसका क्या इम्पैक्ट होगा, इसके बारे में भी सोचना चाहिए। ऐसी भी सूचनाएं दी जाती हैं कि हिंदू लड़कियों को मुस्लिम लडकों से बात नहीं करनी है,यह नहीं करना है,वह नहीं करना है। ऐसे रिटन मैनडेटस यहां पर दिए गए हैं मैडम,यह सब टेबल पर आएगा तो आपको मालूम होगा । मैं यही कहना चाहती हूं कि यह थियोक्रेटिक नेशन नहीं है,यह डेमोक्रेटिक नेशन है। अगर यहां हिंदुओं का राज होता तो कोई और बात होती लेकिन हमारे कंस्टीट्युशन ने सेक्युलरिज्म एक्सेप्ट किया है,सबको अपने धर्म को मानने की छूट दी गई है। आप हंस रहे हैं लेकिन हम सब चाहे माइनॉरिटीज़ हों या मेजॉरिटी हों, सब ऐसा कर रहे हैं। मैं यह कहना चाहती हं कि ऐसे साहित्य पर बैन होना चाहिए,ऐसे इंसिडेंस की ज्युडीशियल निष्पक्ष इनक्वायरी सरकार करवाए और जो ऐसा साहित्य है,चाहे वह किसी भी फॉर्म में हों,उसके ऊपर बैन करना ज़रूरी हैं। मैडम,अभी यहां बताया गया कि:-

अगर यही बात है,हम राष्ट्र की राष्ट्रीयता की रक्षा करना चाहते हैं तो हमें कंस्टीट्यूशन की रक्षा करनी पड़ेगी। फंडामेंटल राइट्स की रक्षा करनी पड़ेगी और ह्यूमन राइट्स की भी हमारे देश में रक्षा करनी पड़ेगी। इन तीनों का यहां बीच हुआ है,इसलिए यह बहुत गंभीर बात है।

SHRI VAYALAR RAVI: Madam, you did not hear a serious thing which the hon. Member has mentioned.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: 1 have heard her

SHRI VAYALAR RAVI: There is a substantive issue. Hindu girls are not being allowed to talk to Muslim boys. If they do so, they are not allowed in the school. That is being done there.

SHRI M.R, MALKANI (Delhi). Madam, I have no intention of saying an>thing, but some of the things that ! have heard here being mentioned have disturbed me. Allegations have been levelled. If they are true, they are very serious. There have been allegations of violance against some Muslim gentlemen in some place in U.P. I hope there will be a proper inquiry, investigation and

prosecution. If it is found true, go and hang them, but is it fair to 'we the impression as though our country, our people and our Government have nothing else to do, except to harass and attack minorities.

#### [4.00 P.M.]

I will give you just two examples. Our friends have quoted from the press. So, I would also like to quote from the press. There have been reports that the Bible was insulted. Copies may have been burnt, I do not know. But the report also says that in these copies of the Bible there were slips saying that "I accept Jesus." Now, from one point of view, it does not make any difference. When we go to hotels, we find a copy of the Bible. Nobody finds time to read it. Even if we read it, we don't become Christians. Should anybody go to a school and provoke students? Are they their parents? Is it fair?

Madam, I would like to mention one last point. Why are they emphasising only negative aspects of these human relations in India? Only a few days back, there was report from Gujarat....(/iiterruptions).... There was a report from Surat, Gujarat. Some road was being widened. Everybody had agreed. Some temples were shifted. Ultimately, a mosque's minaret was abutting on the road. Everybody agreed to shift. Everybody was happy. Why don't they emphasise these positive: aspects also? Why are they emphasising only negative aspects, only violence, hatred and so on? Madam, that is all I have to say. Thank you very much.

SHRI VAYALAR RAVI: There is no question of asking anybody to become Christians because there are no missionaries. There was no nun in the school. There were only a few Christian teachers. Nobody else...(/iitenupf/ons)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now that matter is *over...{Interruptions}...* I think that is enough...(Jnterruptions)... It is a serious matter. It is a matter of

Constitution. One of our Members, Dr. Singhvi who has just joined us, who himself is a legal luminary, talked about the Constitution. We talk about education and there is no educational institution in some parts. For whatever reason, if educational institutions are burnt, it is a loss to the country because we need more and more educational institutions.

I would like the Government to find out the details and come back to the House and let the Members know about it. As Mr. Singhal has said that things spoken about Uttar Pradesh are wrong, this House, as the Council of States, has a right to know what the truth is. If what has happened in Gujarat is wrong, then, the Government has a responsibility to let the Members, the House know that it is wrong. If anything is bringing a bad name to the States of which we are representatives, it is our duty to get it cleared. It is the duty of the Government to respond to it...(Interruption)... Now, I will call Mr. Prafull Goradia to speak because he comes from that place. After Mr. Goradia, I will allow Mr. Alagh. ..(Interruptions)... आप थोड़ी देर बैठिए अभी जो नाम दिए हैं,वह पूरे हो जाने दीजिए,फिर बाद में आप कीजिए...(व्यवधान)....सिकन्दर साहब,नहीं,अभी इनको बोलने दीजिए , No clarifications...(Interruptions).... I am not allowing. Let Mr. Goradia speak. I have

clarifications...(Interruptions).... I am not allowing. Let Mr. Goradia speak. I have identified him. Let him speak. I am allowing Members from both sides. I am not keeping\* it one-sided. Let the truth come out.

SHRI PRAFULL GORADIA (Gujarat): Madam Deputy Chairman, if an unfortunate incident or a tragic incident takes place, naturally, we feel very sorry. We also become emotionally worked up. The hon. Member, Mr. Vayalar Ravi, had been to Gujarat and naturally he felt very sorry and probably his emotions were affected. But surely in this House, in this Council of States, we the Elders should try and control our

emotions in such a manner and see that such incidents do not recur in future. We should not add fuel to that incident because it will create some more incidents. I will give you an example of how we have become emotional. Here I will only refer to the hon. Member, Mr. Vayalar Ravi. He spoke two or three times. He himself said that he went to Rajkot and visited the school and the school had roughly 1,500 children. And only, 15-20 girls were of the Chirstian denomination. The rest, presumably, wearing 'mangalsutras' were Hindus ....(Interruption).

SHRI VAYALAR RAVI: No, Teachers.

SHRI PRAFULL GORADIA: Fair enough. Anyway, the presumption was that only 15-20 girls were Christians and the rest were Hindus and others. In that case, really, should this school have been a target of distribution of the Bible copies? Could it be just innocent or could there be an intention behind distribution? This is food for thought.

Then, we have talked about asking women. When you meet ladies, the first thing is, you do not ask them whether they had been molested. Why was this pointed, provocative question put? Nobody complained to anybody about any molestation that took place in the school, not even the most anti-Hindutva Press has said that any molestation took place in that school. Then why do we ask a lady, "Have you been molested?" I do not see the point, Naturally, we get emotional; I get emotional, you get emotional. But I think in this House we should try and restrain our emotions so that such incidents do not recur rather than provoke some more.

Then, we have talked about 'suspicion' and 'apprehension'. All this only adds fuel to the fire or could do that. The hon. Member, Mr. Ahmed Patel, spoke several times about 'elections', 'vote bank' and 'the majority vote'. As far as I know—^I may be ignorant there is no

election whatsoever in sight in Gujarat. (Interruptions).

SHRI VAYALAR RAVI: One by-election is coming. (*Interruptions*). You are putting the atrocities on Harijans agaisnt the Congress candidate ....(*Interruptions*). Please enquire. It is coming.

SHRI AHMED PATEL: Not only in Gujarat, in Rajasthan, Madhya Pradesh and other States also, we would have. (Interruptions).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, please let him finish. I have permitted him. Let him speak. (*Interruptions*).

प्रो.विजय कुमार मल्होत्राः मैडम,ये आधा-आधा घंटे बोले और इन्हें बीच में कुछ हीं कहा । ....(व्यवधान) ....इन्होंने ऐसी-ऐसी बातें कहीं है,उनको हमने सुना हैं ....(व्यवधान)....

श्री मोहम्मद आज़म ख़ान: बिल्कुल ऐसा ही हैं। यह बिल्कुल सच्चाई है मैडम।..(व्यवधान)...गर्म माहौल में बात चल रही हैं?....(व्यवधान)....

SHRI K.R. MALKANI: It is giving an impression as if nobody is safe in the country. (*Interruptions*). What kind of patriotism is this? (*Interruptions*). I get worked up when my good friend would like to defend the country (*Interruptions*). You opened the doors for Pakistan (*Interruptions*).

SHRI VAYALAR RAVI:-We are here for that. Why has not anybody been arrested?

श्री नागेन्द्र नाथ ओझाः मैडम,एक बात कहनी है ...(व्यवधान)...

उपसभापतिः आप बोल चुके हैं । सभी बैठ जाइये ।....(व्यवधान) ...

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: Everybody is questioning the patriotism (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Ravi, please sit down. (Interruptions).

SHRI VAYALAR RAVI: I am not asking the Government ofBceis (Jaterruptions). It is right? (Interruptions).

PROF. VIJAY KUMAR MALHOTRA: How many times will he speak. Madam? (Interruptions).

SHRI VAYALAR RAVI: it shows up\*. The real\* is coming up.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That word will not go on record.

श्री मोहम्मद आजम खान: मैडम,...(व्यवधान) ...गर्म माहौल में बात चल रही हैं।...(व्यवधान)...मैं कह रहा था अच्छे माहौल में बात ....(व्यवधान)...

उपसभापति: आप बैठिए।...(व्यवधान)....

SHRI K.R. MALKANI: You all have to behave. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: Are you a teacher; (Interruptions).

SHRI K.R. MALKANI: I have not talked to you. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: You are not a teacher. (Interruptions).

SHRI K.R. MALKANI: You address the Chair. (*Interruptions*). Your Marxism is dead. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI VAYALAR RAVI: Madam, I suggest that Mr. Malkani and I should go together. (Interruptions).

उपसभापतिः आप मत बोलिए।

I don't hear anything. I am not allowing anybody. I had allowed Mr Goradia to speak. Mr. Goradia, in the beginning of his speech, said that emotions should not be there. But I was really surprised to see that emotions were coming more from Mr. Goradia's side. That was really surprising. When a Member says that it is a serious problem and we should discuss it in all seriousness, we believe in what he says. I know that when the sentiments of the people are hurt, emotions are there. We let emotional. But as a Member of this august Body, known to be the House of Elders, we should not have so much emotions. (Interruptions). Mr. Nilotpal Basu, if you speak any more, I will ask you to go to my room and have a cup of coffee. (Interruptions).

<sup>\*</sup>Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

SHRI K.R. MALKANI: Madam, this is an affront to our country.

**एक माननीय सदस्यः** आपने मेरा नाम लिया ? ...(व्यवधान)...

उपसभापति: आप तो गुस्से नहीं थे ...(व्यवधान)...

**एक माननीय सदस्य**: उनको भी बुलाइए मैडम । आपको भी चाय पर बुलाइए आप ...(व्यवधान)..

**उपसभापति**: उनको भी चाय पर ले जाइए ...(**व्यवधान**)...

श्री नागेन्द्र नाथ ओझा: मलकानी जी,इस तरह अपना बचाव नहीं कर सकते हैं एक घिनौनी घटना के लिए ....(व्यवधान) ....हाउस में इस तरह खड़े होकर बचाव नहीं कर सकते हैं।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I think, I am going to adjourn the House now for the day. (Interruptions). I am so upset. I am honestly telling that I am very upset. Please keep quiet. (Interruptions). It is a very serious matter. People were being killed and allegations were made in this House that something had happened in U.P. You can imagine the plight of those people whose children they were. Certain allegations were levelled by those who had visited Gujarat, saying that such and such

things had taken place in the educational institutions, such and such things had happened elsewhere in that State. We are just throwing muck on each other. We are not discussing the point at issue. I am requesting everybody to listen to each other. Why can't you keep quiet and listen to what others have to say? Why don't you have patience? If the Members of this House do not have patience, do you think there will be patience at those places where people are living together without any protection? Let the Government come up with a statement as to what is happening in the country. I am really pained. But I do not want any Member to interrupt any other Member. Whatever anybody says, I am there to protect the right of the Member.

SHRI PRAFULL GORADIA: Madam, I am again referring to emotions

which you have just witnessed in the House. The hon. Member, Shri Ahmed Patel, has also referred to the Kutch cyclone. I see no relation whatsoever between the incident which he has reported and the cyclone in Kutch. Then, the hon. Member, Shri Femandes, went off to Pakistan. (Interruptions).

Mentions 124

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am not telling anybody to raise his hand. I am there to tell. Otherwise, I tell you that I will adjourn the House. Let him say whatever he wants to say. If he makes a wrong statement, I will correct him.

SHRI PRAFULL GORADIA: Madam, I said it figuratively. If that has offeneded him, I withdraw the statement. But nevertheless, he has referred to Pakistan. Is this an insinuation that we should try and copy Pakistan? I don't understand it.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, I must correct you, Mr. Goradia. When you sit in the House, please keep your eyes and ears open. He condemned as to what had happened in Pakistan

SHRI PRAFULL GORADIA: So, Madam, what is the connection between the Gujarat incident and Pakistan?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It is his perception. Everybody is condemning what has happened in Pakistan. Mr. Malhotra's Special Mention is there. I have admitted it. (Interruptions)

SHRI PRAFULL GORADIA: Then, of course, there was a mention about increasing atrocities in Gujarat. The hon. Members. Shrimati Urmilaben Chimanbhai Patel, has referred to the Hindu vote bank. I don't see how Hindus are going to vote more. Is it because of the fact that a dead body hias been removed from a grave? I think it was just the mischief of an individuals who must be crank, and I think, to give it a political colour, seems to be very odd. I don't see how you can get the Hindu votes by digging up a grave. I just don't understand the point. Then there was a

mention of *Rashtrapita*, whether he is a *pita* or not. That is hardly releveni to the unfortunate incidents that have been reported from Gujarat. That is all I have to say, Madam. Thank you very much for giving me this opportunity.

SHR1 YOGINDER K. ALAGH (Gujarat): Madam Deputy Chairperson, I will make three brief points while associating myself with the views expressed by the hon. Member, Shri Ahmed Patel, and some other Members. I think it is correct, what one of the previous speakers has said, that some of these incidents in educational institutions do not seem to be targeted only at minority institutions. I have with me a citizen's proposal, from my own home city of Gujarat, from prominent citizens. There has been, as reported in the Press, an incident in one of the premier educational institutions in Gujarat, which is the Centre for Environmental Planning. This is an institution which was set up by the Ahmedabad Education Society. Its Chairperson, Shri Lai Bhai belongs to a family which was associated with the freedom movement. The founders of this school includes the architect Doshi who incidentally signed an appeal for everybody to vote for the present Prime Minister, and I also happen to be a founder professor of this Institute. If prominent citizens are protesting against these incidents--because Gujarat does need eduction very badly; it is developing very fast, and if this is happening-and it is happening-then I think this needs to be gone into very carefully. As some hon, members said, something should be done about it. It would be wrong to say that there has been no communal violence in Gujarat. There has been communal violence in Gujarat, but it is,, by and large, a very peaceful State and there has been very little communal violence in rural areas in Gujarat, and generally when there is communal violence-you can even go by the records of major Commissions of Inquiry in the old cities or the major

towns of Gujarat; it is a highly urbanised State-things tend to normalise very quickly. So, these kinds of incidents which are taking place in rural areas need to be looked into very carefully, and we need an adequate response so that this State which is developing very fast, which was developing very fast,-and I am sure will develop very fast; perhpas, the House doesn't kno'w that in the ninetiees, in one year Gujarat industry grew by 23 per cent, which, in other words, means that a quarter of Gujarat's industry was created in one year-continues to develop fast and it is important that Gujarat's peaceful image and the image that it is the land of Gandhiji where (jeople live together in harmoney is kept up. There have been incidents, but this kind of a thing has to stop. Thank you, Madam Deputy Chairperson.

SHRI GOPALSINH G. SOLANKI (Gujarat): Madam Deputy Chairman, I will speak for just one minute. I am not concerned with other affairs but only with the incident which has driven us to this political scenario. I would like to submit that in my district an incident of kidnapping of a Hindu gril of just 13^ years had happened.

SHRI K.R. MALKANI: What is the name of your district?

SHRI GOPALSINH G. SOLANKI: It is Punchamahal District;- in Dandipur area a Hindu gril was kidnapped by a Muslim boy. Generally, it would not arouse communal feelings. In the Adivasi community a girl is kidnapped or abducted, then the people will rise in revolt. Therefore, some stray incidents had taken place, but it cannot be said that this ihcident is connected with communal passion or it has occurred with a view to gaining a political mileage. It is not like that. That is what I want to say.

SHRI BRATIN SENGUPTA (West Bengal): Thank you, Madam, for allowing me to associate myself with the views expressed by the Members about the incident. We all know about the

United Nation's Charter of Human Rights. We all know about the fundamental rights enshrinea in *our* Constitution. Apparently, in this case there have been violations galore. I only want to know--I fully appreciaw' that law and order is a State subject-whether Che Government can offer us any proactive action plan that similar crimes will not be perpetrated and that similar violence will not be perpetrated again in this country.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: With all these people who have generated so much of heat, we have completed the matter

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: Just one minute, Madam. You have also suggested that this is a very serious thing. Leaving aside all the differences of opinion, will the Leader of the House tell us by what time the Government would come out with a statement or with their assessment of the situation? Let them not go by our assessment. Will the Government come out with their assessment of the situation? This is a very serious situation. I have seen reports in the Press that even the Government is upset. Shall we know officially what the Government thinks or what the Government's mind on this issue is?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Sikandar Bakhti Sahib has been listening to everything. I have beared both the sides barring a few who had something to say. *I* feel everybody is agreed that these things should not have happened in both the States, Gujarat and Uttar Pradesh. Sikandar Bakht Sahib can convey to the Government the sentiments of the House and what the Government wants to say they can say.

सदन के नेता(श्री सिकन्दर बख्त): सदर साहेबा,मैं अपने अज़ीज दोस्त नील साहब ने जो कुछ कहा है, उसके रियेक्शन में कुछ बोलने के लिए खड़ा नहीं हुआ हूं। जिस कैफियत और जिस ज़ज़जातियत का आपने इज़हार किया बीच में उस कैफियत का खुद मैं बहुत देर से शिकार रहा हूं। इस किस्म के वाकयात होते हैं निहायत अफसोसनाक और उनकी भरपूर मज़म्मत होनी चाहिये। मलकानी जी ने जो बात कहीं थी, हो सकता है।

मेरी बात कुछ उसी रंग में हो लेकिन मेरे अल्फाज़ मुखतिलफ होंगे। मैं सिर्फ यह सोच रहा था कि गुजरात में जो कुछ इसाई बिच्चियों के साथ हुआ, उसकी तो जितनी भी मज़म्मत की जाए, वह कम है। उसको एक इनिफरादी इन्सीडेंट करना चाहिये। मुज़फ्फरनगर में जो कुछ, हुआ उसकी तफसीलात हमारे सामने नहीं है लेकिन बेगुनाह बच्चों को मारा जाए, अगर ऐसा हुआ तो उसकी भरपूर मज़म्मत होनी चाहिये, इसमें कोई रत्ती बराबर शक नहीं है। अफसोस यह होता है कि इस किस्म के मामलात पर जब भी कभी इस सदन में बहस होती है तो उसमें जो रंग आता है, वह हिन्दू को कसूरवार उहराने का रंग आता है, पूरी हिन्दू कम्युनिटी को कसूरवार उहराने का रंग आता है। (व्यवधान) जरा सुनिये। आप मेहरबानी से अपनी तकरीर का काबू रखिये। मैं बैठ जाऊंगा। (व्यवधान)

**उपसभापति**: उनके जो ख्यालात हैं,सुन लीजिये । (**व्यवधान**)

श्री सिकन्दर बख्तः आप से बड़ी उमर हैं (व्यवधान) बहुत बहुसों को सुना हैं।(व्यवधान)

श्री रमा शंकर कौशिक: हमने भी कम नहीं सुना हैं। (व्यवधान)

श्री सिकन्दर बख्तः आप तशरीफ रिखये मैं इनसे बातचीत नहीं कर रहा हूं।(व्यवधान) मैं बैठ जाऊंगा।

उपसभापतिः सुन लीजिये । He is the Leader of the House. Please listen to him.

श्री सिकन्दर बख्तः मैं सिर्फ कहना चाहता हूं कि इन तमाम वाकयों के होने के बावजूद भी यह भी एक हकीकत है कि जब 1947 में दो थियोक्रेटिक स्टेट्स बनाई गई थी, एक थियोक्रेटिक स्टेट आज भी मौजूद हैं । हिन्दुस्तान थियोक्रेटिक स्टेट क्यों नहीं है, उसकी वजह सिर्फ यह है कि यह हिन्दू की अक्सरियत का मुल्क था इसलिए यह हिन्दुस्तान कुदरती सेकुलर बन गया । यह चीज़ें हमारे ज़हनों में नहीं रहती है । बदिकस्मती से हर चीज़ को रंग देते हैं फिरकापरस्ती का हम खुद बदिकस्मती से रंग देते हैं हिन्दू को ही सिर्फ फिरकापरस्त उहराने का, यह नहीं होना चाहिये । इंसीडेंट को इंसीडेंट की हद तक महदूद रखना चाहिये । मैं सिर्फ अपने दर्द की इज़हार इन्हीं अल्फाज़ में करना चाहता हूं ।...(व्यवधान)

श्री नीलोत्पल बसुः क्या आप कोई रिपोर्ट लाएंगी ? (व्यवधान)

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त: माफ करों । (व्यवधान) आप बैठ जाइये (व्यवधान) आप बैठ जाइये (व्यवधान) तमाशा बना दिया है (व्यवधान) हिन्दू को गाली देना सेकलूरिज्म हो गया हैं ...(**व्यवधान**)

## (نیتا سد ن شری سکندر بخت :

صدرصاحب، میں اپنے عزیزدوست نیل صاحب نے جوکچھ کہا ہے،اس کے ری ایکشن میں کچھ بولنے کے لئے کھڑا نہیں ہواہوں۔جس کیفیت اورجس اب سبهاپق:ان کے جوخیالات ہیں 'سن جذباتیت کا آپ نے اظہار کیا بیچ میں اس کیفیت کا خودمیں بہت دیر سے شکار ہوا ہوں۔اس قسم کے واقعات ہوتے ہیں نہایت افسوسناک اورانکی عمر ہے--- مداخلت ---- بہت بحثوں کوسنا بہرپورمذمت ہونی چاہئے۔ملکانی جی نے جوبات کہی تھی 'ہوسکتا ہے میری بات کچھ اسی رنگ میں ہو لیکن میرے الفاظ مختلف ہونگے۔میں صرف یہ سوچ رہا تھاکہ گجرات میں جوکچھ عیسائی بحیوں کے ساتھ ہوا'اسکی توجتنی بھی مذمت کی جائے وہ کم ہے۔ اسکوایک انفرادی انسیڈینٹ كېناچائے۔مظفرنگرمیں جوكچه ہوا اسكى اپ سبھا پق: سن لیجئے۔ ہی ازدی تقصیلات ہمارے سامنے ہیں ہیں لیکن بے گناہ بچوں کوماراجائے اگرایسا ہوا تواس کی بهريورمذمت بوني چائے اسميں کوئي رتي برابر شک نہیں ہے۔افسوس یہ ہوتا ہے

کہ اس قسم کے معاملات پرجب بھی کبھی اس سدن میں بحث ہوتی سے تواس میں جورنگ آتا ہے، وہ ہندوکوقصووارٹھہرانے کا رنگ آتا ہے ، یوری ہندو کمیونٹی کوقصوروارٹھہرانے کا رنگ آتا بے۔۔۔ مداخلت ---ذراسنئر۔آپ اینی تقرير يرقابو ركهئے۔ميں بيٹھ جاؤنگا---مداخلت ---

ليحئر--- مداخلت ---

شری سکندربخت: آپ سے بڑی يے--- مداخلت ---

شری رام شنکر کوشک:ہم نے بھی کم نهس سنا بع--- مداخلت ---

شری سکندربخت: آپ تشریف رکھئے۔میں ان سے بات چیت نہیں کررہا ہوں---مداخلت ---ميں بيٹھ جاؤنگا۔

ليڈرآف دى ھاؤس يليزلسن توہم ۔

**شری سکندربخت:** میں صرف کہنا چاہتا ہوں کہ ان تمام واقعوں کے ہونے کے باوجود بھی یہ ہے ایک حقیقت ہے کہ جب 1947میں دوتهيوكر ٽيك

<sup>†[ ]</sup>TransiIteration in Arabic Script

اسٹیٹ آج بھی موجود ہے۔ ہندوستان تھیوکرٹیک اسٹیٹ آج بھی موجود ہے۔ ہندوستان تھیوکرٹیک اسٹیٹ کیوں نہیں ہے اسکی وجہ صرف یہ ہے کہ یہ ہندوکی اکثریت کا ملک تھا اس لئے یہ ہندوستان قدرتی سےکولر بن گیا۔ یہ چیزیں ہمارے ذہنوں میں نہیں رہتی ہیں۔ بدقسمتی سے ہرچیزکورنگ دیتے ہیں فرقہ پرستی کا ہم خودبدقسمی سے رنگ دیتے ہیں ہندوکوہی صرف فرقہ پرست ٹھہرا نے کا نیے نہیں ہونا چاہئے۔ انسیڈینٹ کی حدتک محدود رکھنا چاہئے۔ میں صرف اپنے دردکااظہار انہی الفاظ میں کرنا چاہتا ہوں۔۔۔ مداخلت ۔۔۔}

شرى نيلوتپل بسو:كيا آپ كوئى رپورك لائس گے؟--- مداخلت ---

شری سکندرخت: معاف کرو--مداخلت ---آپ بی<sup>ن</sup>ه جائیے ---مداخلت --تماش بنادیا بے --- مداخلت --
ہندوگوگالی دینا سیکولرازم ہوگیا ہے--مداخلت ---}

श्री ख़ान गुफरान ज़ाहिदी: नेता सदन का ख्याल,नज़रिया सही नहीं है। (व्यवधान)

श्री रमा शंकर कौशिक: मैडम,यह बात तो किसी ने नहीं कहीं कि पूरी हिन्दू कम्युनिटी दोषी है। यह किसी ने नहीं कहा।...(व्यवधान) यह तो अगर कहा गया है तो ...(व्यवधान) हिन्दू कम्युनिटी को नहीं कहा ...(व्यवधान)

उपसभापति: आप लोग ज़रा बैठिए । बैठ जाइये, सब लोग । प्लीज़ बैठ जाइये ।...(व्यवधान) एक मिनट बैठ जाइये । ....(व्यवधान)

श्री रमा शंकर कौशिक: मेरठ में हिन्दू और मुसलमान,दोनों ने ...(व्यवधान)....मनाया है। यह बात कहीं है।...(व्यवधान)

उपसभापतिः एक मिनट बैठिए।...(व्यवधान)

श्री रमा शंकर कौशिक: मैडम,इसमें हमारे ऊपर आक्षेप आया, जिन लोगों ने इस सवाल को उठाया है, चाहे उत्तर प्रदेश के मामले को उठाया हो, चाहे गुजरात का अहमद पटेल ने उठाया हो, यह हम पर आक्षेप किया गया है कि हमने सारे हिन्दुओं को कम्युनल बता दिया। यह गलत है। यह नहीं जाना चाहिए। क्या हम यह कह रहे है कि सारे हिन्दु कम्युनल हैं? यह किसी ने नहीं कहा। ...(व्यवधान)

उपसभापतिः मैं आपसे ...(व्यवधान ) ठीक हैं । ...(व्यवधान)

श्री नीलोत्पल बसुः मैडम,लीडर ऑफ द हाउस को ...(व्यवधान) यह रखना चाहिए । ....(व्यवधान) स्पेसेफिकली नाम से बोला,आर.एस.एस.के नाम से बोला.वी.एच.पी.के नाम से बोला,बजरंग दल के नाम से बोला। यह लोग कहा ...(व्यवधान) \* 1 ...(व्यवधान)

PROF. VIJAY KUMAR MALHOTRA: Madam, these words should be expunged.

यह इस तरह से बात कहना यह गलत है ।...(व्यवधान)\*

यह क्या बात है।...(व्यवधान)

यह रेकार्ड पर नहीं जाएगा । ....(व्यवधान) अच्छा अभी बैठ जाइये । ...(व्यवधान) श्री वायालार रिव । ....(व्यवधान) नीलोत्पल बसु जी,प्लीज सिट डाउन । ...(व्यवधान)

श्री नागेन्द्र नाथ ओझा: मैडम,जब इनको कुछ कहा जाता है तो ये समझते है कि तमाम हिन्दुओं के लिए कहा गया।...(व्यवधान) क्योंकि वे ऐसे जीव हैं,ऐसे प्राणी है, जो मानतें है कि हम ही हिन्दुओं का प्रतिनिधित्व कर रहे हैं।...(व्यवधान) उपसभापतिः बैठिए । अच्छा बैठिए ।...(व्यवधान) बैठ जाइये ।....(व्यवधान)

श्री नरेश यादव: महोदया,में यह कहना चाहता हं कि माननीय सिकन्दर बख्त साहब ने जजबात को रखा है,लेकिन जजबात की बात से अपराध नहीं रूकता है। ये दोनों घटनाएं चाहे मुज़फ्फरनगर से हो या गुजरात में हो,ये दोनों घटनांए चाहे मुज़फ्फरनगर में हो या गुजरात में हो,ये दोनों अपराध हैं। अपराधी के प्रति सरकार क्या सख्त रवैया अख्तियार करती है,हम यह जानना चाहते हैं और इसके बारे में कोई जवाब सरकार की ओर से नहीं आया ...(व्यवधान) कि ये घृणित घटनाएं नहीं हों।...(व्यवधान) फिर से आईंदा स्टेट में कौन सा कड़ा एक्शन लेना हैं....(व्यवधान) यह मामला हिन्दू या मुसलमान का नहीं,मामला अपराध का है और मामला शर्म का है। देश का माथा आज शर्म से झुका हुआ है। किसी ने क्या कभी इसके लिए विचार किया ? इसका जवाब नहीं आया । ...(व्यवधान)

**उपसभापति**: नाठ एवरीबॉडी...(व्यवधान) मलकानी जी.बैठिए।...(व्यवधान)

## श्री नरेन्द्र मोहनः मैडम ...(व्यवधान)

आप बैठ जाइये।...(व्यवधान) आप हाउस में नहीं थे,इसलिए आप बैठ जाइये । आपको मालूम नहीं है कि डिसकशन क्या हुआ । ...(**व्यवधान**) आप बिल्कुल खामोशी से सूनिए । ...(व्यवधान) यह मामला जहां पुलिस का है,पुलिस एट्रोसिटी की बात कही गई है,इलज़ाम लगाया है,यह पुलिस का आदमी किसी भी धर्म का हो सकता है,जब वह वर्दी पहनता हैं,यह जुमला कहा गया वदी पहनकर अगर उसने कोई किया अपरोध तो हिन्दु,मुसलमान,क्रिश्यिन,पारसी के नाम नहीं आएगा। तो सिकन्दर वक्त साहब उससे न जोडिए। जहां तक गुजरात का मामला है,गुजरात के मामले में भी जिन लोगों ने उठाया ,मेरे पास नाम जो लिखे हुए है उसमें अहमद पटेल साहब ने भी और किसी ने भी यह नही इलजाम लगाया, सिर्फ अफसोस का इज़हार किया कि इस तरह के वाकयात हो रहे हैं,आज हमारे मूल्क के उस ढांचे को,उस फैब्रिक को तोड़ने की कोशिश कर रहे हैं जो हिन्दु मुसलमान सिख,इसाई पारसी को एक साथ रखता है। किसी ने यह नहीं कहा ...(व्यवधान) एक मिनट, सिकन्दर बख्त साहब ।....(व्यवधान)

Let me complete. Have patience, Sikandar Bakthji. Please listen to me. From this House a message should not go that this House is discussing and communalising an issue. While I am presiding over, I will never allow this to happen — I am sorry — on humanitarian issues, on the issues which are related to fundamental rights and survival of the people which are enshrined in our Constitution; This was very beautifully spoken by Dr. Singhvi in this House who belongs to your party. Mr. Malkani also when he was making his point said it very correctly that let us not say that somebody was trying to communalise it and call it a Hindu affair or a Muslim affair or a Christian affair.

We all are Indians. We have a right to live in India with dignity and respect. That is the point. So, this message should not go. And this matter is closed now. Malhotraji.

### श्री अहमद पटेल मैडम एक ची ज

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: 1 am not allowing. (*Interruptions*) I am not opening.

सदन के नेता (श्री सिकन्दर बख्त ) अहमद के कहने से पहले में कुछ कहगा । (Interruptions)

The DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Look I will adjourn the House if everyday starts speaking (*Interruptions*) I am not goingto listen.

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त सदर साहिबा ने असल में बीच में मुझे रोका।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am sorry. After the ruling of the Chair, nothing should be talked about. It's finished. It is over. I don't want to reopen the Pandora's box again. I have been sitting over here for three hours. I

<sup>†[ ]</sup>Transilteration in Arabic Script

have shown enough patience and restraint. I told the Members not to get emotional. One day it is this side, another day it is that side. Let us not break the institutions of this country, which all of us repsect. That is all I am asking.

श्री के.आर.मलकानी : मैडम,एक क्लेरीफिकेशन चाहता हं।

उपसभापतिः अब कोई क्लैरिफिकेशन नहीं । मल्होत्रा जी,आप बोलिए । ....(व्यवधान)....मलकानी जी,आप बैठिए । मल्होत्रा जी,आप का मसला बहुत इम्पोटेंन्ट है । ....(व्यवधान)....उन का मसला बहुत इम्पोटेंन्ट है ,वह क्या कह रहे हैं सुनिए।

#### Violation of Human Rights of Minorities in Pakistan

प्रो.विजय कुमार मल्होत्राः (दिल्ली) : महोदया,यह जो विषय में आप के सामने और इस सदन के सामने उठा रहा हूं,पाकिस्तान में मायनोरिटीज राइट्स और मायनोरिटीज पर हाने वाले जुल्मों का सवाल है । महोदया,एमनेस्टी इंटरनेशनल,राइट्स हूमन कमीशन ऑफ पाकिस्तान और अमेरिका की सीनेट रिपोर्ट,इन तीनों रिपोर्टों में पाकिस्तान में अल्पसंख्यकों पर होने वाले अत्याचारों का भीषण उल्लेख किया गया हैं।

महोदया,मैं इन सब रिपोर्टो में से पाकिस्तान के हूमन राइट्स कमीशन का कुछ ज़िक्र कर रहा हूं जिस में उन्होंने कहा है कि:

"1997 was probably the worst year since the aftermath of independence in terms of religious militancy and intolerance. Sectarian killings reached a new height. The Ahmadis were kept on the run and the Christians and Hindus faced incidents of unusual harassment", says the State of Human Rights in 1997 report by the Human Rights Commission of Pakistan."

"When Pakistan was celebrating the golden jubile of its independence, two Hindu girls, aged 13 and 15, were abuducted in Sanghar, kept in confinement, abused for five days, converted to Islam and married to Muslims".

The report also says:

"Some of the most gruesome acts of human rights violations with regard to minorities as listed in the report are as follows. Pancho Bheel of village Wahoro in Tharparkar addressed an appeal to the Commission saying the village Zamindar, Qain :slohammad Shah, threatened the villagers to cut them off from their well if they didn't give him their land. When the villagers resisted. Shah and his men burnt down the Bheel's holy temple of Devi Mataji, and all the sacred statues, relics and symbols with it".

महोदया, इस के अंदर 20-25 और बातों का ज़िक्र किया गया है जिस में मंदिरों को जलाने और बलात्कार का भी उल्लेख हैं।

क्रिश्चियंस के बारे में यह लिखा गया है कि:

"Some 10,000 people gathered in Khancwal and a section of them attacked and set fire to St. Joseph's church there, that was apparently a testing of waters. The next day, February 6, more than thrice the number of people, and better equipped in the use of force, overran 13 churches, 700 Christian households and a number of Christian shops and other properties"

महोदया,इस के अंदर जिन बातों का जिक्र हैं, उस में वहां 'ब्लेसफेमी ला' में निदा नहीं होनी चाहिए, यह एक बहुत बुरी बात है। किसी को किसी की धार्मिक वस्तु के खिलाफ कुछ नहीं कहना चाहिए, यह तो ठीक है, परंतु उस के नाम पर वहां पर कुछ अनपढ़ क्रिश्चियंस को फांसी की सजा दी गयी, उन का कत्ल किया गया और उस में जो फादर डेनियल थे, उन के बारे में लिखा है कि:

"Father Daniel while addressing the protest rally alleged that the Biship was killed by the Pakistan government and later shown to have committed suicide"

महोदया,जब पाकिस्तान बना थातो हमने वहां के रहने वाली माइनोरिटीज को यह आश्वासन दिया थाकि उनकी सुरक्षा होगी,लेकिन आज वहां जो स्थिति पैदा हो रही है।