

- (ii) Fiftieth Report on the Netaji Bhawan, Calcutta; and
- (iii) Fifty-first Report on the Functioning of National Institute of Homoeopathy, Calcutta.

**REPORTS AND MINUTES OF THE
DEPARTMENT-RELATED
PARLIAMENTARY STANDING
COMMITTEE ON RAILWAYS**

SHRI BALBIR SINGH (Punjab): Madam, I lay a copy (in English and Hindi) of the Third Report and Minutes of Standing Committee on Railways (1996-97) on Action taken by the Government on the recommendations contained in the Nineteenth Report of the Standing Committee on Railways on 'Safety Measures and maintenance of Assets in Railways' of the Ministry of Railways (Railway Board).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, Shri Sanjay Dalmia is to raise a privilege issue.

Re: QUESTION OF PRIVILEGE

SHRI SANJAY DALMIA (Uttar Pradesh): Madam, I want to give notice of a question of privilege against the nefarious activities of BBC and CNN who have been consistently distorting the map of India by showing the Kashmir portion as not fully part of India. On top of it, the BBC in all its pronouncements has been showing...

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN (Tamil Nadu): How is it a privilege issue, Madam?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He has given a notice to the hon. Chairman and it is listed on my paper.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Though it is a very important *issue... (Interruptions)...*

SHRI SANJAY DALMIA: Madam, the Chairman has allowed me.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: No doubt, it is an important issue, but how is it a privilege? ... *(Interruptions)...*

SHRI SANJAY DALMIA: Madam, the Chairman has allowed me under rule 189.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes, he has allowed you... *(Interruptions)...* but the privilege notice is not being allowed.

SHRI SANJAY DALMIA: Madam, I am giving notice.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: One minute. Let me correct it properly. You have only given a notice about breach of privilege. When a Member give such a notice, he is allowed to make a mention about it, but the Chairman has not permitted your privilege notice as yet. I will inform the House, as and when he permits it.

SHRI SANJAY DALMIA: Right, Madam. So, I am just making a statement. Madam, on top of it, the BBC has been describing Kashmir as Indian-administered Kashmir and Pakistan-administered Kashmir. Madam, I raised this issue in my Special Mention about a year back, and at that time, the whole House supported me. Madam, Doordarshan has a pact with the CNN and when a distorted Indian map in which the Kashmir portion is shown as partly Indian and partly not, by the CNN, then the effect it will have on the morale of the people in Jammu and Kashmir who have recently voted for the democratic process and where a new Government has come in, can be imagined.

Madam, we have never used our media to undermine any other country, while

this undermining of our Kashmir effort has been done consistently by these two foreign media. Madam, the Minister of Information and Broadcasting is here and I would like to request him...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Don't deviate from the laid-down principles of the house. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SANJAY DALMIA: Madam, I am only...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let me correct you.

SHRI SANJAY DALMIA: Madam, what I am saying is this. This matter is going to be referred to the Privileges Committee where a decision may be taken. Till that time. Madam, we must put a stop to these nefarious activities. Till the time it is referred to the Privilege Committee and till a decision is taken... *(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no. You cannot relate it to a privilege motion. *(Interruptions)* Just a minute please. Please sit down. *(Interruptions)* Let me correct you. Yes, the issue is extremely important but the hon. Member has raised it at a wrong point. This issue can be raised on the floor of the House but not the way the hon. Member has raised it as a privilege, because till the hon. Chairman permits him under privilege or till such time the Chairman considers whether it can come under privilege... *(Interruptions)* Just a minute, please. Let me explain so that the new Members can understand it. I do not need your prompting. However serious this matter is, it should be looked into by the Government, but as regards whether it comes under privilege or not, this has to be looked into by the hon. Chairman.

SHRI SANJAY DALMIA: Madam, that is why I am suggesting. *(Interruptions)* That is why I am suggesting, till the matter is considered... *(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am

sorry. You have been a Member in the Lok Sabha. What happens?

(Interruptions) Just a minute please. Please sit down. The thing is, the House runs under certain procedure. However, important the matter is, it should be raised under that procedure. Nobody is stopping you from raising it. You can raise it under proper procedure so that the Government will be answerable to you. If you just want to raise it in the House, then it is a different matter. But, I, as a presiding officer, would like you to raise an issue of such magnitude in such a way that the Government can come before the House and answer. I do not want the issue to be diluted by your just raising it. That is it. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI SANJAY DALMIA: Thank you for that, Madam. *(Interruptions)*

AN HON. MEMBER: I want to associate myself.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Nobody can associate himself. It is not a special mention. Please sit down. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI SANJAY DALMIA: Let me complete, Madam.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You have completed. Please sit down. *(Interruptions)* **आप बैठिए।**

श्री एस० एस० अहलुवालिया: मैडम, मैं यह ...*(व्यवधान)*...महोदय, आप सरकार को इस तरह का निर्देश दे सकती हैं क्यों ऐसा जो...

उपसभापति: अहलुवालिया जी, एक मिनट जरा बैठेगे। आप बैठिए ...*(व्यवधान)*... आप बैठिए।

Unfortunately, we do not realise it and that is why the business of the House gets derailed always and, as a result, we do not have a proper discussion. I am happy that you raised it but it was under a wrong procedure. Please raise it by following a proper procedure; otherwise, next time somebody will raise an issue of privilege and he will cite your example. I do not want the procedure of the House to be diluted and changed. We have done

enough. Please raise the issue by adopting the appropriate procedure at some other time and not like this. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI VAYALAR RAVI (Kerala): Madam, I want to raise a point of order in relation to rule 29 and rule 251.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: What is that?

SHRI VAYALAR RAVI: Madam, it is with regard to listing of business. My point is, last week important statements came under rule 251. There were two very very important statements made by the Ministers. One was with regard to drought situation in Orissa and the other was with regard to the situation in Andhra Pradesh. Madam, the drought situation in Orissa is equally important. Also a very very serious development is the air disaster. This concerns air safety. Unfortunately, Madam, we could not list it in the business, may be because of inconvenience of the Minister. I do not know whether he is ready to answer. No clarification has been done. My point is, if clarification cannot be done, let it come under discussion at least. The procedure is, when a Minister makes a statement, clarification has to be there. I want the ruling of the Chair. It cannot be postponed. It is such an important issue. Issues like drought and air safety cannot be postponed for weeks together for clarification. It shows the lack of interest among the Members of this House. We should not be blamed for dragging our feet on such important issues. The Ministers themselves are delaying it. They want their own time. I want to know when the Ministers will give clarifications. I also want a ruling on this important issue.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will find out about the list of business. The list of business is drawn on the recommendations of the Minister of Parliamentary Affairs. I will find out how it is being drawn and let the House know. I agree that when we have a statement in the House, it is because

some very important issue has taken place and if it is not discussed. *...(Interruptions)...* Just on second... *(Interruptions)...* Let me finish. When we do not discuss it at that particular point of time, the relevance of the issue is gone.

SHRI JOHN F. FERNANDES (Goa): Madam, what Dalmiaji raised is an important issue.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Who? *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI JOHN F. FERNANDES: Madam, what Shri Dalmia has raised is an important issue. *...(Interruptions)...*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No. That matter is closed.

SHRI JOHN F. FERNANDES: Madam, we cannot brush it aside on technical grounds... *(Interruptions)...* It can be converted into a Zero Hour submission.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: If he raises it properly... *(Interruptions)...*

SHRI JOHN F. FERNANDES: Madam, we cannot brush it aside.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No. Nobody is brushing it aside. Please do not say that. You are a senior Member of this house and I am surprised how you are talking like this. I can understand Mr. Dalmia, because he has not had so many years as you *have...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI JOHN F. FERNANDES: Madam, can this not be permitted under. *...(Interruptions)...*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please sit down. See, I have said it already. If you want me to repeat it again, then I am sorry, I do not want to waste the time of the House. No doubt, the matter is important but you cannot raise it on privilege. I cannot start a discussion on a privilege matter. You want me to throw away all rules?

SHRI JOHN F. FERNANDES: You can convert it into a Zero Hour submission. *...(Interruptions)...*

PROF. SAIFUDDIN SOZ (Jammu and Kashmir): Madam, You give the verdict after hearing us...(Interruptions)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No. The thing is...(Interruptions)...

PROF. SAIFUDDIN SOZ: Madam, briefly.. (Interruptions)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I cannot hear it because there is no rule under which I can allow you. This House runs on certain procedures and rules. You raised this issue. I will see to it that the hon. Chairman gives permission and we find time for it and the concerned hon. Minister should answer about it, whoever is concerned. The Government should be seized with the situation. But you cannot just raise it and ask me to throw away the rules, and allow you to speak. I do not expect it from a senior member like you... (Interruptions)... Shri Suresh Pachouri.

PROF. SAIFUDDIN SOZ: Madam, he was allowed to make a statement... (Interruptions)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That is done in our House. ..(Interruptions)... Please do not argue with me. You are a new Member in this House; I think, after some time, you will know all this.

SHRI S. B. CHAVAN: Madam, Mr. Ravi, raised a point...(Interruptions)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I said that I will find out and let you know when we are going to list it.

PROF. SAIFUDDIN SOZ: Madam, I want your verdict after hearing me. He was allowed to make a statement. Privilege is different. That is a different issue.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You do not know about it...(Interruptions)...

PROF. SAIFUDDIN SOZ: I know it...(Interruptions)... I want to tell you that he was allowed to make a statement and now this august House has taken notice of that statement. So, I wanted to

associate myself in a limited sense that the matter must be examined.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: listen. Let me tell you ...(Interruptions)... Just one second...(Interruptions)... It is not a statement. That is why I said, 'You will learn the conventions of this House when you sit here longer.' ... (Interruptions)...

PROF. SAIFUDDIN SOZ: I know ... (Interruptions)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Just one second. ... (Interruptions)...

PROF. SAIFUDDIN SOZ: What is the convention?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The convention is, when a privilege notice is given in this House, the hon. Member is allowed to mention about it. That is all. There is no statement ... (Interruptions)...

PROF. SAIFUDDIN SOZ: It is not the privilege but he has made a statement. This is the. Zero Hour. Whenever a statement is made ... (Interruptions)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Soz, you come to my chamber and I will explain to you and show you the rule.. (Interruptions)...

PROF. SAIFUDDIN SOZ: Madam, I will show you the rule.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please sit down. Please sit down, Mr. Soz, and do not waste the time of the House. Mr. Pachouri.

Re; RELIEF AND REHABILITATION TO VICTIMS OF BHOPAL GAS TRAGEDY

श्री सुरेश पचौरी (मध्य प्रदेश): उपसभापति महोदय, विश्व की भयावह औद्योगिक दुर्घटना भोपाल गैस कांड की आज 12वीं बरसी है। दो-तीन दिसम्बर, 1984 को इस भोपाल गैस ट्रेजेडी की वजह से हजारों भोपालवासी चिरनिद्रा में सो गए थे। लाखों लोग इस गैस ट्रेजेडी की वजह से प्रभावित हुए। आज भी यह स्थिति है कि इस भोपाल गैस के आफ्टर इफेक्ट्स की वजह से जो नवजात शिशु जन्म ले रहे हैं, वह विकृत अवस्था में जन्म ले रहे हैं। किसी के कान नहीं हैं,