

SHRI S. R. BOMMAI: If it is correct, I will inquire into the matter.

SHRI RAM GOPAL YADAV: If his statement is correct, would you assure the House that it would be rectified?

SHRI S. R. BOMMAI: First, I would inquire into the matter; and then take appropriate action. *...(Interruptions)...*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Q. No. 323 *...(Interruptions)...* I have already allowed four supplementaries.

### साक्षरता कार्यक्रमों की समीक्षा

\*323. श्री गोपाल सिंह जी. सोलंकी: क्या मानव संसाधन विकास मंत्री यह बताने की कृपा करेंगे कि:

(क) क्या सरकार ने प्रौढ़ साक्षरता, ऑपरेशन ब्लैक बोर्ड और अनौपचारिक शिक्षा कार्यक्रमों सहित साक्षरता कार्यक्रमों की कोई समीक्षा कराई है;

(ख) यदि हां, तो तत्संबंधी ब्यौरा क्या है;

(ग) गुजरात के संबंध में उक्त समीक्षा के क्या परिणाम निकले हैं; और

(घ) इन कार्यक्रमों को सुदृढ़ बनाने और उनमें सुधार करने हेतु क्या कदम उठाए गए हैं?

THE MINISTER OF HUMAN RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT (SHRI S. R. BOMMAI): (a) to (d) A statement is laid on the Table of the House.

### Statement

(a) Yes, Sir.

(b) The Department of Education constituted an Expert Group under the Chairmanship of Prof. Arun Ghosh for conducting Status-cum-Impact Evaluation of the Total Literacy Campaigns (TLC).

Selected aspects of the Operation Black Board Scheme have been evaluated in 13 States.

Implementation of the Scheme of Nonformal Education in 8 States has been reviewed during Eighth Plan.

(c) The Expert Group on evaluation of TLCs did not make any specific review in respect of Gujarat.

A sample study of implementation of Operation Black Board Scheme in Gujarat undertaken by NCERT in 2 phases in 1991-92 indicates that 93% of primary schools had 2 pucca rooms. 71% had 2 teachers and 89% had been supplied with text books. While the position regarding supply of some teaching learning materials and equipment was satisfactory, there was non-supply and shortage of certain other materials.

The Sardar Patel Institute of Economics and Social Research, Ahmedabad, conducted two separate evaluation studies in 1993 on the implementation of NFE by voluntary agencies and the State Government in Gujarat. The Evaluation Reports Point out several deficiencies in the programme and make suggestions in regard to remedial action to be taken for improving its implementation.

(d) Some of the steps taken to strengthen and improve literacy programmes are:—

- (i) State Governments requested to draw up a time bound action plan for bringing uncovered districts under the coverage of Total Literacy Campaigns;
- (ii) Measures initiated to increase the motivation of volunteers engaged in literacy campaigns through retraining and orientation camps, granting recognition and appreciation of their efforts;
- (iii) Panchayati Raj Institutions being involved more intimately in implementation of literacy campaigns;
- (iv) Stress laid on reinforcing linkages between the literacy programme and other development programmes such as health programmes, Jawahar Rozgar Yojna, DWCRA etc.;
- (v) Decentralisation and delegation of authority to State Governments for implementation of literacy programmes by establishment of State Literacy Missions;
- (vi) Guidelines laid down by National Literacy Mission to revamp and strengthen monitoring and evaluation mechanisms. State Directorates of Adult Education to closely monitor the literacy

programmes by holding monthly monitoring meetings with the Secretaries of Zila Saksharata Samiti.

- (vii) Concurrent evaluation of literacy programmes is being rigorously enforced for identifying shortcomings in the implementation and initiating timely corrective measures.
- (viii) Operation Restoration for revamping and revitalising projects which have languished.

**II. Steps taken to strengthen and improve Operation Black Board are:—**

- (i) Flexibility to States in the selection and purchase of materials:
- (ii) Special Orientation Programme for teachers (SOPT) to use Operation Black Board materials.
- (iii) Extension of scheme to Upper Primary Schools.

**III. Steps taken to strengthen and improve Non-formal Education programme include the following:—**

- (i) Increase in Central share for co-educational centres.
- (ii) Enhancement of Project cost.
- (iii) Increase in proportion of girls centres.
- (iv) Provision of more flexibility and decentralisation in implementation.

**SHRI GOPALSINH G. SOLANKI:** Mr. Chairman, Sir, even after 50 years of independence, we are still talking of total literacy among all the States in the country. We are going to celebrate the diamond jubilee of our independence next year. We have been spending a lot of money on literacy programme, but nothing substantial has been achieved. The answer given by the Minister to my question is also not at all satisfactory. It is a very lengthy answer containing three pages. We can see among the scheduled areas not only in Gujarat, but in Madhya Pradesh and other parts of the country also, there are no schools. The figures which have been given in reply to part (c) of my question is also not satisfactory. About 93 per cent of the schools in Gujarat are having only two rooms; and 71 per cent of the

schools are having only two teachers. I would like to know from the Minister whether this survey has been based on population or village-wise or on the basis of number of villages.

Secondly, in reply to my question, the Minister has stated about strengthening and improving Operation Blackboard, improvement of literacy programmes. I would like to know from the Minister whether the recommendations which have been made by the Arun Ghosh Committee have been put into action. If so, what is the result thereof? This is my first supplementary.

**SHRI S.R. BOMMAL:** Mr. Chairman, Sir, so far as the Arun Ghosh Committee is concerned, they have made a number of recommendations. The Government has accepted most of them. I will read out the recommendations that are accepted. One minute, Sir. These are the recommendations that are accepted:

- To stop formal declaration of total literacy achievements by States/Districts.
- Results of final evaluation to be shared with people.
- Target of 80% unrealistic. 55% to 60% success to be considered as good progress.
- To ensure adequate pre-launch preparations. Environment building to persuade the entire literacy campaign.
- To enhance involvement of Panchayati Raj institutions and the elected representatives of gram panchayats and panchayat samitis.
- To orient Collectors and Senior administrators. National Resource Centre set up with NLM funds for this purpose at Lal Bahadur Shastri Academy of Administration, Mussorie.
- To decentralise sanction procedure. State Literacy Mission Authorities being empowered for sanctioning TL projects.
- To launch second phase of total literacy in projects where achievement is 40% to 50%. A scheme of operation restoration prepared for languishing projects.

- Contents of primers to be reviewed to prevent gender bias, stereotyped image of women.
- To integrate literacy phase and post-literacy phase and sanction postliteracy project where 25% of enrolled learners or 50,000 learners have completed Primer II.
- To sanction at least one Continuing Education Centre per village. A new scheme of continuing Education approved.

MR. CHAIRMAN: If it is long, still long, you can lay it on the Table of the House.

SHRI S.R. BOMMAI: I am completing it, Sir.

- To lighten evaluation procedure. Agency for concurrent evaluation to be decided by State Directorate of Adult Education. Final evaluation to be done by an agency identified by National Literacy Mission.
- To cover age group of 15—35 under TLCs. Where non-formal education is not in operation to cover 9—14 age group also.
- Need to carry out accurate survey.
- Systematic cross-district and cross state exchange visits of government officials.
- Proper and regular training of Key Resource Persons, Master trainers, Volunteer teachers through periodic camps.

These are the recommendations which have been accepted.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Second supplementary. Can you make it brief? So many questions are there.

SHRI GOPALSINH G. SOLANKI: We talk about Scheduled Areas. Manual labourers live there and they even go to distant places to earn their daily wages, to earn their bread. They go with their small children. Thereby, small children are deprived of education and the percentage of illiteracy always increases. Therefore, part (a) of my second supplementary is whether there is any proposal in the mind of

the Government or the Ministry to prevent the people who go for manual labour outside their native places from taking their children with them so that the children could be retained and could be educated. I would like to know whether the Government has any proposal to introduce centres where such children can stay permanently and have their education. Part (b) of my question is this. So far as the question of improving the non-formal education is concerned, it has been said that it is proposed to increase the proportion of the girl-centres. I would like to know how many such centres have been introduced so far in the whole country.

SHRI S.R. BOMMAI: Sir, there is already a scheme for imparting non-formal education to boys wherever they are working. But so far as its success is concerned...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI GOPALSINH G. SOLANKI: I am speaking about people who are going from one place to another place as manual labourers, with their children. Could they be prevented from taking their children from one place to another place and could education be imparted to them?

SHRI S.R. BOMMAI: Yes, Sir. Some efforts have been made to see to it that education is imparted to them, wherever they are working, and some centres have been opened for this purpose.

SHRI GOPALSINH G. SOLANKI: There is no question of their working. They are seasonal workers and for four months or six months, they are taking their children with them, with the result that their children are deprived of their education.

SHRI S.R. BOMMAI: Sir, the seasonal labour, sometimes, go from place to place. So, it is very difficult for the Government to open centres for them. But, whatever the Government has thought. I would like to inform the hon. House about the thinking of the Government. In the Chief Ministers meeting held in July, it was unanimously agreed that priority should be given to universal literacy, and out of seven minimum needs programme, we have decided that universal literacy should be there by the end of this century. For that purpose, we had called a meeting of State

Education Ministers and State Education Secretaries. They deliberated for two days. A Sub-Committee has been constituted under the chairmanship of Shri Muhi Ram Saikia, the Minister of State for Human Resource Development, which has held three sittings. The Sub-Committee is going to furnish its report within two weeks. The Sub-Committee will consider various issues. For example, the amount of money required for the said purpose, the number of school buildings required for the said purpose, the number of school teachers required for the said purpose, and so on and so forth. We want to achieve this target by the end of this century by making an adequate provision for the same in the Ninth Five Year Plan. We are awaiting the report which may be submitted within two weeks. Thereafter, I would take the matter to the Cabinet and then to the Planning Commission. We want to achieve this by the end of this century. This is an ambitious target that we have set for ourselves.

**SHRI GOPALSINH G. SOLANKI:** What about the girl centres?

**SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY:** Sir, in the first instance, we need a centre for women in Parliament.

**SHRI S.R. BOMMAI:** Sir, a number of centres have been opened for girls. In the year 1992-93, 79,071 centres were opened, in 1994-95, 96,076 centres were opened, in 1994-95, 99,052 centres were opened, in 1995-96, 1,16,312 centres were opened and in 1996-97, 1,18,080 centres were opened for girls.

**DR. M. ARAM:** Mr. Chairman, Sir, according to the 1991 Census, the literacy level was 52.21 per cent. As of now, that is, by the end of 1996, it is presumed—we don't have the exact position—that it is somewhere between 55 per cent and 60 per cent. The Department of Education or the National Sample Survey Organisation is dealing with it. Now, this being the very slow rate of progress, how do we hope to achieve cent per cent literacy by the year 2000? The hon. Minister said that the Government would be able to achieve the said target by the year 2000.

Now do we have a well thought-out strategy to achieve the target? I am asking this because from 55 per cent, it will be reaching, by the 2001 Census, or, say, by the next census, at least 80 per cent. Do we have a plan to achieve cent-per-cent literacy by the end of the Ninth Plan? It is very important and we should have a radically new strategy in order to achieve cent-per-cent literacy, and then, the involvement of Panchayat system also has to be thought out very clearly. If we say it should be involved, then we have to work out the modalities very clearly. Will the hon. Minister comment on these points?

**SHRI S.R. BOMMAI:** Sir, I agree with the hon. Member that we have to work out a strategy. It is not an easy task to achieve just in three or four years what we have not been able to achieve for the last fifty years. It seems an impossibility. But we have given priority to that. According to me, Sir, education alone is the solution to all our problems. In our country Kerala has achieved it. If economically a poor State like Kerala can achieve it, why can't the other States? That is the thinking of the Government, and we have to adopt the way the Kerala people have done, making it a people's movement and involving themselves in that. Even the voluntary organisations, the Panchayat committees, the local bodies, the leaders and the people have come forward. I agree with the hon. Member that we have to work out a strategy and make it a people's movement and everybody must cooperate with us and then only it is possible, and we are thinking on those lines. For that purpose, a Sub-Committee has been appointed; all State Ministers are there, and experts are there; and we are going to come out with a strategy and seek the cooperation of the people to achieve this objective.

**श्री महेश्वर सिंह:** सभापति महोदय, गांव-गांव तक प्राथमिक शिक्षा पहुंचाने की दृष्टि से भारत सरकार ने डी.पी.ई.पी. और छाइट कार्यक्रमों के अंतर्गत प्रांतों को करोड़ों रुपए की आर्थिक सहायता प्रदान की गयी है जिस के अंतर्गत प्राथमिक स्कूलों का खोला जाना और भवन निर्माण भी सम्मिलित है। महोदय, हिमाचल प्रदेश अकेले को इस कार्यक्रम के अंतर्गत 129 करोड़ रुपए की आर्थिक सहायता प्रदान की गयी है, लेकिन खेद का विषय है कि

राजनीतिक आधार पर जहाँ-तहाँ स्कूलों को खोलने की घोषणा की जा रही है और जो इस कार्यक्रम की मूल-भावना है उस की ओर ध्यान नहीं दिया जा रहा है और जहाँ स्कूल शिक्षा की दृष्टि से खुलने आवश्यक हैं, वहाँ नहीं खोले जा रहे हैं। इसलिए मैं आप के माध्यम से माननीय मंत्री महोदय से जानना चाहूँगा कि क्या वह जिला स्तर पर इस प्रकार की समितियों का गठन करने का निर्देश देंगे कि जिलाधीश की अध्यक्षता में समिति का गठन किया जाए जिस में स्थानीय विधायक और सांसद और शिक्षा विभाग के अधिकारी सदस्य हों ताकि समय-समय पर प्राथमिक शिक्षा के इस कार्यक्रम की समीक्षा की जा सके और इस समिति की अनुशंसा के अनुसार ही उस क्षेत्र में स्कूल खोले जा सकें?

SHRI S.R. BOMMAI: Sir, I am not aware of the reality of what the hon. Member has stated, that in Himachal Pradesh schools are not properly located. Sir, I want to make it very clear, categorically clear, that schools are to be opened wherever there is a need, and in every village, if possible; that is the idea, and special grants are given to Himachal Pradesh so that most of the villages have schools. I would write to the Chief Minister and find out whether what you have stated is correct or not.

श्री महेश्वर सिंह: सर, मेरा प्रश्न सीधा था कि क्या जिला स्तर पर जिलाधीश की अध्यक्षता में समिति का गठन करने के निर्देश देंगे ताकि सांसद भी अपनी अनुशंसा उस समिति के सामने रख सकें और विधायक भी अपनी अनुशंसा रख सकें और इस अनुशंसा के आधार पर स्कूल खोले जा सकें? क्या ऐसी समिति के गठन के निर्देश देंगे?

SHRI S.R. BOMMAI: Your suggestion is worth considering.

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA: Sir, I want to raise a specific question. Huge amounts are being spent on the literacy programme. We understand that we have set it as a national programme—we may call it a people's programme or a panchayat programme or whatever we want—and everybody is committed. What is happening today is that the whole programme is only to have a district or a State declared illiteracy-free. Everybody says that everybody will be literate. But there is no follow-up. The programme that was planned was that there should be very careful follow-up so that they do not lapse into illiteracy again. The follow-up programme

seems to have been given a go-by over the last couple of years. The whole emphasis is now on declaring an area to be literate. But surveys are showing that a lot of those areas which are declared literate have now again become illiterate because there is no follow-up. Nothing of that which was built into the system is being done either by the Ministry or by the Panchayats. We don't know where that money is going. I would, therefore, like to know from the Minister whether it is a fact and, if it is so, what he is doing to ensure that the entire programme of literacy, as envisaged, is implemented by the various Departments involved.

SHRI S.R. BOMMAI: Sir, I agree with the hon. Member that in some districts there is a race for declaring the district fully literate, though it is not a fact. There are some districts like that. I don't disagree with the hon. Member. I do agree with the Member that a follow-up action is absolutely necessary. For that purpose 'Operation Restoration' is being launched in those districts which have not been able to achieve the objective. Forty-five districts in eight States have been identified for covering under 'Operation Restoration'. Under 'Operation Restoration' the districts are being selected and follow-up action is being taken.

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA: Restoration of what, Sir? (*Interruptions*)... Restoration of what?

SHRI S.R. BOMMAI: Literacy. (*Interruptions*)...

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA: You are saying restoration of illiteracy. How can it be restoration of illiteracy? (*Interruptions*)... The Minister is saying restoration of illiteracy. (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI S.R. BOMMAI: Restoration of literacy. (*Interruptions*)...

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA: When an area is declared to be literate, where is the question of restoring literacy? (*Interruptions*)... It is a question of maintaining literacy. (*Interruptions*)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: So that the literates do not lapse into illiteracy!

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA: It is a question of maintenance and not restoration.

SHRI S.R. BOMMAI: Mrs. Margaret Alva was the Minister holding the charge of Education for some time.

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA: No. I never held the Education Department. I was part of the HRD and part of the Planning Process. That is why I am saying that what was planned is not happening today. You may get statistics. But they are all lapsing into illiteracy again.

SHRI S.R. BOMMAI: I have already said that I agree with the Member. It has happened like that in some districts. Therefore, we are having this follow-up action. Follow-up action is being taken.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Dr. Karan Singh, are you itching to say something?

DR. KARAN SINGH: Is there time, Sir?

MR. CHAIRMAN: There are two minutes.

DR. KARAN SINGH: Mr. Chairman, Sir, the Constitution has given us a directive that within ten years from its adoption free and compulsory education should be provided to all children. Is it not a shame and a disgrace that 50 years later we will have more illiterate people in India in 1997 than that we had in 1947? The House will be shocked to learn that the total number of illiterates, if my information is correct, will be more in 1997, fifty years after independence, than in 1947. This is a matter of disgrace for the whole nation, when there are no buildings for primary schools, when there are villages where there are no schools and where false muster rolls are made, when corruption is creeping into the entire system. Why does the Government spend hundreds of crores of rupees on five-star hotels and jumbo jets? No nation will become great, unless it breaks the illiteracy chain around it. Will the hon. Minister assure us that, at least, by the end of the Ninth Plan we will achieve total literacy?

SHRI S.R. BOMMAI: I agree with the sentiments expressed by the hon. Member. The Government will make all efforts, as I have already stated, to have universal education by the end of the century. We will do it.

MR. CHAIRMAN: On an optimistic note, Question Hour is over.

### WRITTEN ANSWERS TO STARRED QUESTIONS

#### **Railway line from Port Blair to Diglipur**

\*324. DR. JAGANNATH MISHRA: Will the Minister of RAILWAYS be pleased to state:

(a) whether Government have decided to lay railway line from Port Blair to Diglipur in North Andaman;

(b) if so, the details thereof;

(c) whether Government are aware that this rail line would cause incalculable damage to the development in Andaman; and

(d) if so, the steps proposed to be taken to remedy the situation?

THE MINISTER OF RAILWAYS (SHRI RAM VILAS PASWAN): (a) and (b) A survey has been taken up. The details will be known after the survey is completed.

(c) and (d) The ecological and environmental aspects would be duly considered before taking up any rail link in the area.

#### **Scheme for disabled children in Gujarat**

\*325. SHRIMATI URMILABEN CHIMANBHAI PATEL: Will the Minister of HUMAN RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT be pleased to state:

(a) the details of the institutions, functioning under the Integrated Education for Disabled Children's scheme in Gujarat;

(b) the details of the grants given by Government to the State during the last four years;

(c) whether the present grant is inadequate as per the requirement; and

(d) if so, the measures taken or proposed to be taken by Government to meet the requirement?

THE MINISTER OF HUMAN RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT (SHRI S.R. BOMMAI): (a) 13 institutions/NGO's are