

(a) whether it is a fact that one Ashfaq Hussain Lone and one Shahabuddin Gauri (JNU Research Scholar) were arrested by the Jama Masjid Police in March, 1991 in connection with funding of Hizbul Mujahideen and other Militant Outfits in Jammu and Kashmir;

(b) the persons found involved intransmitting funds from broad to these militant outfits and what action has been taken against them by the Investigating agencies; and

(c) the details of all those persons charge-sheeted for such anti-national activities alongwith these two persons?

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE PRIME MINISTER'S OFFICE (SHRI BHUVNESH CHATURVEDI): (a) to (c):— A case was registered by Delhi Police on 25.3.1991 for offences punishable under section 3 & 4 of TADA (P) Act, 1987, the investigation of which was taken over by the CBI on 20.4.1991. During the course of investigations by CBI, it was learnt that the Hawala channel was used by Dr. Mohd. Ayub Thakur for sending money to the terrorists from U.K. for terrorist activities in Jammu & Kashmir. after completing investigations into the terrorist funding part of the case, the CBI filed a chargesheet against the following accused persons in the designated Court at Delhi on 23.3.1992:—

1. Ashfaq Hussain Lone
2. Shahabuddin Gauri
3. Mohd. Yusuf Shah @ Salahuddin
4. Mohd. Ahsan Dar
5. Dr. Mohd. Ayub Thakur.

The Case is pending trial in the said court.

**उत्तर प्रदेश उच्चतर शिक्षा आयोग में प्राध्यापकों की नियुक्ति**

866. श्री राजनाथ सिंह:

**श्रीमती मालती शर्मा:**

क्या प्रधानमंत्री यह बताने की कृपा करेंगे कि:

(क) सरकार द्वारा उत्तर प्रदेश उच्चतर शिक्षा आयोग गठित किए जाने का प्रयोजन क्या है और इसका गठन

कब किया गया था तथा इसके सदस्यों की वर्तमान संख्या कितनी है,

(ख) क्या प्राध्यापक के पदों हेतु इस समय चल रहे साक्षात्कारों में काफी धांधलियां एवं अनियमितताएं बरती जा रही हैं,

(ग) यदि हां, तो सरकार द्वारा ऐसी अनियमितताओं को रोकने के लिए क्या कदम उठाए जा रहे हैं और क्या सरकार इसमें अंतर्ग्रस्त सभी अधिकारियों/कर्मचारियों के विरुद्ध कोई कार्यवाही करने का विचार रखती है, और

(घ) यदि हां, तो ऐसी कार्यवाही कब तक किए जाने की संभावना है?

मानव संसाधन विकास मंत्रालय शिक्षा विभाग और संस्कृति विभाग में राज्य (कुमारी शैलजा): (क) से (घ) सूचना एकत्र की जा रही है और सभा फटल पर रख दी जाएगी।

12.00 Noon

#### FAREWELL TO RETIRING MEMBERS

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members, the pre-ordained occasion has arrived to bid farewell to those Members of this House who will be retiring this year on completion of their term. The founding fathers of our republic while making the Rajya Sabha a permanent, indissoluble body, had provided for change in the scheme of Constitutional continuity. Thus, every two years we face the poignant task of bidding farewell to one-third of our colleagues. The membership of the Rajya Sabha is an intimately personal and intensely political experience. We develop amongst ourselves bonds of friendship and affection of an everlasting character. It is said that the unique characteristic of the human being lies in the fact that he or she is an arguing animal. If that is so, there is no one who is more proper or a more scintillating human being than a Parliamentarian. Here, in this House, in the closeness of contact and in the cut and thrust of debate the arguing qualities are heightened to the climax more than anywhere else. I believe that we have been always arguing to understand one another and contribute to the common good even when the arguments were sharp and somewhat ill-tempered, that is because

we share the same adventure, the adventure of democracy and participate in the same quest, the quest for the good of our nation and our people. Gandhiji used to speak in the thick of his fight with the British of the beauty of compromise. He was not one to give up on fundamentals but he knew how to compromise while sticking to the basics. That is the essence of democracy. We have been pursuing, even in the midst of all our differences, the beauty of democratic compromise and I hope that this pursuit will continue and help to relieve tensions. With this thought I should like to place on record my heartfelt appreciation of the valuable contributions the retiring Members have made to the deliberations of the House and of the service they have rendered to Parliamentary democracy. I personally am grateful to the courtesy and consideration they have shown me in conducting the business of the House. I congratulate those Members who have been re-elected or will be re-elected and welcome them back. To those who are leaving for new pastures and to the tumult of election battle, I wish them all success. May I end with a Sanskrit blessing,

“शिवास्ते सन्तु पन्थानः

“May your journey from here be auspicious and fortunate”. Thank you.

DR. (SHRIMATI) NAJMA HEPTULLA (MAHARASHTRA): Thank you, Mr. Chairman, Sir.

It is on very rare occasions that I am given the opportunity to speak from my seat which is allocated by this House to me. It is a rare and a very sentimental occasion when, every two years, we make these customary speeches while bidding farewell to the retiring Members of the Rajya Sabha. This is the way of our system.

Sir, most of the time I sit in the Chair after you leave and try to keep the Members in their position, as much as possible. I have been a Member of this house for the last sixteen years. I have seen eight such occasions when we bid farewell to the retiring Members. A cou-

ple of times I, myself, have been bid farewell by the House. As they say, like a bad coin or a good coin, I came back. I do not say that those who are not going to come back are good coins. Like bad coins, we would like them to come back to the House.

I would say, whatever time they have spent over here -- whether it is six years or twelve years or more -- it was a time to remember. Their contribution to the deliberations of the House has enriched our Parliamentary system. There have been speeches which I always wanted and which, I am sure, Sir, you also wanted. There have been times when Members have been kind enough not to ask for quorum and have made their points which they thought were necessary from the point of view of their constituency and the people there. But Sir, whether in a full House, or in a House not so full, whatever the Members have said, in a peaceful atmosphere, or, with an agitated voice; their contribution reflected the will of the people whom they represented in this House.

I know, Sir, many a Member would have liked to be elected and would have been happy to be in the Rajya Sabha, if there was an opportunity. Unfortunately, only fourteen of them are going to remain here and the rest of them would, perhaps, defect to the other House. I am quite sure. I met all those. We know the results. We know who are going to come back. Those who are not going to come back have told me-sometimes, very confidently; some times, very quietly-that they are going to become Members of the Lok Sabha.

I am happy that I will have my benchmate, Mr. Sikander Bakht, with me.

AN HON. MEMBERS: Comrade.

DR. (SHRIMATI) NAJMA HEPTULLA: The Leader of the House would also be with us.

SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN (Maharashtra): One of them would be your benchmate.

DR. (SHRIMATI) NAJMA HEPTULLA: One of them is already a benchmate.

The two political parties—the Congress (I) and the BJP—took that into consideration. Those who are going to leave us, we would remember them. The House would remember them. If there had been any moments where I had lost my cool, it was only..

SHRI M.A. BABY (Kerala): Never.

DR. (SHRIMATI) NAJMA HEPTULLA: It was only a pretence. I never meant it...You can try it again.

To those who are not coming back, I would say: 'Though you may not be Members of this House, for sure, you would be there in our minds; you would be there in our hearts'.

Thank you very much.

विपक्ष के नेता (श्री सिकन्दर बख्त): धैर्य यू सर सदर साहब, पिछले दो-ढाई कुछ सियासी तनखियों में गुजरे। आज भी सूरत-ए-हाल कुछ रद्दोगद की सी है दिल कुछ डरा हुआ सा है।

शोला ए जो डरा डरा सा है, शहरे दिल में कोई खुदा सा है।

सवानेजे पे सूरज आ गया है, मगर दिन है कि अब तक सो रहा है।

सदर साहब, लेकिन सियासी तनखियां इस हाऊस में बैठने वालों का जो हमशीनी का रिश्ता है, उस रिश्ते को दबा नहीं सकी है। यह फेहरिस्त मुझे यहां मिली है। कुछ साहेबान मेरे और चव्वाण साहब की तरह से रिटायर होने के बाद लौटकर आ गए हैं। तो यह मिसरा मैं चव्वाण साहब के और अपने दोनों के लिए मैं पढ़ सकता हूँ—“फिर आ गए हैं गर्दिशे दौर को टाल के”।

और बहुत सारे ऐसे लोग हैं, जो हमारे हाऊस से बिछड़ रहे हैं। मेरे लिए डा० साहिबा का यह जुमला कि ये लोग हाऊस में शायद होंगे या एक पार्लिमेंट के मैम्बर की हैसियत से हमारे जेहन में, हमारे दिलों में जो मकाम हासिल कर चुके हैं, वहां रहेंगे, मेरे लिये तसकीन बायस नहीं है। मेरे लिए बिछड़ने का दर्द सहना मुश्किल हो जाता है। अब आप बताएं इस हाऊस की एक बुलबुल हजार दास्तान, सुषमा स्वाराज छोड़कर जाएंगी तो उसका चहचहाना कौन सुनेगा, कहां सुनेगा? हम तो सुन ही लेंगे कहीं न कहीं। शेर याद आ रहा है, कोशिश कर रहा हूँ

याद करने की, कि—

कभी साखा-ओ सब्ज-ओ वर्ग पर, कभी गुनचाओ गुलो खार पर।

तू चमन में चाहे यहां रहे, तेरा हक है फसलों बहार पर।।

एक और बहुत अजीब दोस्त, जिनकी हाऊस बेतरह मिस करेगा, जयपाल रेड्डी साहब को। जयपाल रेड्डी साहब खाली मैम्बर नहीं है बल्कि जो कुछ भी इस सदन में होता था उसमें बहुत नुमाया हिस्सा उनका होता था, लेकिन उनसे यह कहना चाहूंगा कि यह राहें वह हैं, जिसमें हर सांस सफर है, मंजिल भी रास्ता है, लगजिश भी राहबर है। जाइए, जहां रहें खुश रहें, सिधारिए, दुआ करते हैं कि यहां से जाने के बाद आपको अच्छे लोगों की सोहबत मिले।....(व्यवधान)....

मैं अर्ज कर रहा था कि खुदा आपको बुरी सोहबत से बचाए और हमारे जैसे अच्छे लोगों की सोहबत में आप रहें।

सदर साहब, एक नाम और है, जो यहां नजर नहीं आ रहे मुझे। वह जब इस हाऊस में बोलते थे, अगर पर्दे के पीछे से बोले तो ऐसा लगता है, जैसे कोई पर्दानशीन पर्दे से बाहर आने की कोशिश कर रही है। बड़ी नर्म आवाज, बड़ी नाजुक आवाज, बेहद बरगोछता रहते थे, लेकिन उनकी आवाज की नमी और नजाकत निहायत निसवानी आवाज जाती नहीं थी। वह हैं चतुरानन मिश्र जी, जिन्हें बहुत बेतहां मिस करेंगे।....(व्यवधान)....इनको मालवीय जी के बराबर में कहीं होना चाहिए था।

जिस बात का मैंने शुरू में जिक्र किया, अब मैं जो आ नोबल मैम्बर्स सब के सब जा रहे हैं, उन सबको लेकर बातचीत करूंगा। मैं सिर्फ इतना ही कहना चाहता हूँ कि इन मैम्बर्स के तशरीफ ले जाने के बाद मैं अपने आपको गरीबतर महसूस करता हूँ, यह हाऊस भी गरीबतर होगा। कौन आएंगे, किस की जगह पर कर सकेंगे, बात अलेहदा है, लेकिन इजाफा होगा हमारी बिरादरी में, पर जो कमी हो जाएगी, उन कमी को वे पूरा नहीं कर सकेंगे, आने वाले। वह एक इजाफा होगा।

शुक्रगुजारी के अल्फाज हैं, सदर साहब, आपके लिए। हम यहां जो कुछ करते रहे हैं, उसमें कुछ तो ऐसा है कि अच्छा कहा जा सकता है, कुछ को बुरा भी कहा जा सकता है लेकिन कोशिश हमने पूरी की है अपनी बजादरियां निभाने की, पर आपकी सरपरस्ती ने हमारी कोशिश को रंग दिया है, आपका बहुत-बहुत शुक्रिया।

हमारी गलतियों का बोझ उठाने वाली मेरे करीब तशरीफ रखती है। इनको हमसे परेशानी जरूर हुई लेकिन इनके वजूद का कोई हिस्सा घटा नहीं। उसी तरीके से कायम हैं और अब भी दुआ है कि खुदा करे जिस हालात में हैं, अल्लाह करे जोर.....

डा० (श्रीमती) नज़मा हेपतुल्ला: आवाज और ज्यादा। ..(व्यवधान)...

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त: नहीं, वह लफ्ज बस की बात नहीं। मैं कहना यह चाह रहा था कि "आपकी आवाज का शबाब कायम रहे, खुदा करे।" यही कहना चाह रहा था।

मैं आप सब हज़रत का बहुत-बहुत शुक्रिया अदा करता हूँ और दिल से विदा देना चाहता हूँ उन लोगों को, जो जा रहे हैं और यह भी दुआ करना चाहता हूँ कि जाने के बाद हम तो आपको भूल नहीं सकेंगे, खुदा करे आप भी हमें न भूलें।

बहुत-बहुत शुक्रिया।

انیتا و رودھی دل نشری مسکن راجست:

تھینکیو سر۔ صدر صاحب۔ پچھلے دو ڈھائی سال کچھ سیاسی تلخیوں میں گزرے۔ آج بھی صورتحال کچھ ردو کی سی ہے اور دل کچھ ڈرا ہوا ہے۔

شعلہ جان ڈرڈر ڈرڈر اسلہ شہر دل میں کوئی خدا سلہ

سوانہز پر سورج آگیا ہے مگر وہ ہے اب تک سو رہا ہے صدر صاحب۔ لیکن سیاسی تلخیاں

اس ہاؤس میں بیٹھنے والوں کا جو ہم نشینی کا رشتہ ہے۔ اس رشتہ کو دبا نہیں سکی ہیں۔

یہ فہرست مجھے یہاں ملی ہے۔ کچھ صاحبان میرے اور جہاں صاحبہ کئی طرح ریشاٹر ہونے

کے بعد نوٹ کرا گئے ہیں۔ تو یہ معرعہ میں جہاں صاحب کے اور اپنے دونوں لیکچر پروہہ سکتا ہوں۔

ہمارے دنوں میں جو مقام حاصل کر چکے ہیں۔

وہاں رہ چکے۔ میرے لئے تسکین کا باعث نہیں

ہے میرے بچھڑنے کا درد سہنا مشکل ہو جاتا ہے۔ اب آپ بتائیے اس ہاؤس کی ایک بلبل ہزار داستان سسٹما سورا ج

خجور کر جا بیٹگی تو اسکا چہیمہا نا کرن

سننے گا۔ کہاں سننے گا۔ کہاں سننے گا۔ ہم

تو سن ہی لینے کہیں نہ کہیں۔ شعر یاد آ

رہا ہے۔ کوشش کر رہا ہوں یاد کرنے کی۔

کتنی شلخ و سبزیرگ پر کئی غنی و کل و خاں پر

تو چین میں چاہے جہاں دیہ تیرا حق ہے فصل بہار پر

ایک اور بہت عزیز دوست۔ جنگھو

ہاؤس سے طرح سے سن کر پکا ہے پال ریڈی

صاحب کو۔ جے پال ریڈی صاحب خاں صبر

نہیں ہیں۔ بلکہ جو کچھ بھی اس سدن میں

ہوتا تھا اسمیں بہت نمایاں حصہ انکا ہوتا

تھا۔ لیکن ان سدیہ کہتا چاہو لگا کہ یہ راد

وہ ہے جسمیں پر سانس سفر ہے۔ منزل

جی ہر اسنت ہے۔ لغزش بھی رہی ہے۔

جایکے جہاں میں خوش رہیں۔ صدر صاحب

دعا کرتے ہیں کہ یہاں سے جانے کے بعد آپکو

اچھے لوگوں کی صحبت ملے۔ وہ ہمدافلت ہے

میں عرض کر رہا تھا کہ خود آپکو بڑی

صحبت سے بچائے اور بہار ہے جیسے اچھے

بھرا گئے ہیں گردش دوران کو حال ہے۔

اور بہت سارے ایسے لوگ ہیں۔ جو

ہمارے ہاؤس سے بچھڑ رہے ہیں۔ میرے

لئے ڈاکٹر صاحب کا یہ جملہ کہ وہ لوگ



**SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY (ANDHRA PRADESH):** Mr. Chairman, Sir, it was my duty on two previous occasions to bid farewell to retiring Members and with them best in their lives. Now, it has come a full circle. It is my turn to receive farewell and good wishes from across all sides of the House.

Rajya Sabha is a Constitutional caravan that goes on continuously and ceaselessly unlike the other House. It does fulfil a crucial Constitutional role. In our electoral system, Lok Sabha can be swept off its feet by sweeping electoral waves and consequent political vagaries. It is the Rajya Sabha, which puts a brake, many times a very healthy brake.

Sir, when I retire, I will miss this House. I will miss everybody. To begin with I will miss our most respected Chairman, who is a beautiful blend of modern erudition, penetrating intellect and judicial temperament. I must confess, Sir, that I was vastly benefited by this special affection, by his well-concealed soft corner for me. I can now reveal it because he will not have to show it any more.

I must now refer to our virile Deputy Chairperson, who represents a very interesting mix of rich experience and robust assertiveness.

She also represents an equally interesting amalgam of synthetic anger and genuine goodwill. But I may admit, Sir, I have been a recipient of her unmixed regard and affection. I never had an occasion to be a victim even of her spurious anger.

Now, Sir, I must come to the Leader of the House, Shri S.B. Chavan sahib, who is truly an *ajat shatru*. He can speak eloquently, of course, without conveying anything. That is why he has survived in this House. He has survived many other things which I don't want to advert to on this occasion.

I must thank the Leader of the Opposition. I myself had the rare privilege of being the Leader of the Opposition in this House for a brief

while. I have had intense ideological differences with him and his party. But I must say there were many occasions when I received great support from them whenever we discovered a common cause. The Leader of the Opposition has been deferential to me not only now when I am retiring but he was also deferential to me when I was very much a leader of a party which was having an ideological persuasion different from that of his own.

Sir, I must thank the seniors of my party. Janata Dal is a difficult party. I am, of course, making a gross understatement. But, Sir, in Rajya Sabha it has not suffered a split. Should I not thank the ruling party for it did not direct its sharp attention to the party? Sir, our party may present itself as a divided house because it is a star-studded party. We have seen seniors like Shri S.R. Bommai, Shri Inder Kumar Gujral, Shri Mufti Mohd. Sayeed, Prof. M.G.K. Menon. We had seniors like Shri M.S. Gurupadaswamy, Dr. Raja Ramanna. All of them were not only my seniors but they were my mentors also. They were my superiors, yet, they generously addressed me as a leader. So, I must seize this occasion to thank them for all the affection they have bestowed upon me.

Sir, I must express regrets to many Ministers and to many of those who are not Ministers partly because of me. Sir, there were occasions which were full of righteous indignation, when I gave an incandescent expression to my righteous indignation. My righteous indignation may have been misplaced. My incandescent expression may have been hyperbolic. But I would like to submit to them they were all done in the best of faith. They were all actuated by what I considered the best of public interest.

Sir, I was telling some friends, including Mrs. Jayanthi, "I am 54. I have spent 28 years in various legislatures. I have spent more than half of my life in legislatures. "Mrs. Jayanthi said, in a very good humoured fashion, "Your

effervescence belies this experience." I would admit that. I have never been Minister. It is a dubious distinction on my part. This, perhaps, is the genesis of my effervescence and exuberance. And all those who suffer from lack of exuberance would have little reason to be in public life. It was Mr. Winston Churchill who, after having been a celebrated war-time Prime Minister, said that he valued only two words, two letters, after his name—Member of Parliament—the most; not the 'P.M.', but the 'M.P.'. There is no office in this country which is taller than that of Member of Parliament.

Politics, Sir, right from the days of ancient Greece, has never been a popular profession. Even in the hey-day of the British parliamentary democracy, it was not popular. Therefore, it was Samuel Johnson who said, "Patriotism is the last refuge of a scoundrel". Politics, now, of course, has gained a greater notoriety. But then, Sir, I am proud to be a politician, and a professional politician at that, though the words "professional politician", as of late, have acquired an odium. I have always found a professional politician, as a rule, to be more useful than an amateurist politician. Sir, many friends asked me, "Why are you in politics? Politics is not so clean." Politics is not clean. But I look around. Do I find any other walk of life more clean than politics? No, Sir. No, Sir. In the midst of this all-prevailing cynicism, I would like to assert, politics is still the noblest profession in the world and in India, in particular. I find better people in politics even today than any other walk of life, though their number may be diminishing. They may be getting described as 'endangered species'. But, then, what about politicians in politics? They are getting outnumbered by non-politicians in politics. Politics is no longer the close preserve of politicians. The neo-rich and the neo-phytes are getting into politics. This is an aspect on which we must all reflect. Sir, I am not saying this of technocrats like Prof. M.G.K. Menon, like Dr. Manmohan Singh, like Dr.

Ashok Mitra. Such people are welcome. We do not mind ideologues of the right or ideologues of the left. But we have many ideologues of the wrong. We must be on guard against that.

Sir, in Parliament, we all do so many things. It is not the exclusive privilege of the deputy chairman to be synthetic in her indignation. All of us are good actors.

When we do something extra-constitutional, Sir, we all do it in a controlled way. None of us lose our balance, none of us lose our temper. It is a case of controlled escalation of temper. But then, Sir, the way in which we meet outside, is very important. I don't find the sporting spirit so much in sports as in Parliament. From the intense clash, a vehement argument and counter-argument, emerges the truth. Truth is not be found in black or white but in shades of grey and we discover the shades of grey in Parliament. Many of us come to Parliament to convert Parliament. What happens at the end of the day? We get converted. Those who come to convert Parliament get converted because Parliament discovers the middle grounds, promotes the consensus, round off the rough edges. Those who come from wild fingers of ideologies get tamed and domesticated in this Hall. This is the beauty of Parliament. Sir, I have had the best of indulgence of this House. This House not only welcomed my persuasive plausible; pleas it also had the grace to put up with my obstreperous obstructions. so, I must thank the whole House.

Last but not the least, I must thank the Secretary-General and the staff of the Parliament which extended unfailing courtesy and cooperation. Sir, I must say a word about the Prime Minister who is the *de facto* Leder of the House. He has known me for the last 38 years. Except one Member here, I don't think I know any body else for such a long time. He has also shown me uniform filial affection. I must express my regret to him because I have not been able to

requite his affection, not for personal reasons, but for intense ideologically political reasons. Thank you, Sir.

**SHRI E. BALANANDAN (KERALA):** Sir, this is an occasion when a large number of Members, who were working with us, are retiring and everybody will have to express his finer sentiments. Ideologically, politically, we may differ seriously in discussions here. Whatever discussion we have here in this House, howsoever, intense and serious it might be, but just after five minutes we come together as one and we forget everything outside the House. Here we quarrel sometimes and every one of them—I mean the retiring Members—has contributed to the functioning of this august House in his own way. Among them many are outstanding personalities. I do not want to mention their names. But the point I want to make is that whatever discussions we had and howsoever tense a situation might have developed in this House, it was because of the fact that some kind of a personal reference might have been made to some of the Members who are retiring. It was because of the fact that certain issues might have come up during the discussion. There was nothing personal in these deliberations in this House. The point to remember is that in a big country like India, we have to safeguard democracy as well as the interests of the people. For that, everybody will be contributing in his own way. The retiring Members have contributed a lot in many ways. I do not want to mention that.

Shri M. G. K. Menon, he is not a politician. He is just retiring. He has been doing serious work in the scientific field in India. He is going. Shrimati Sushma Swaraj—you know that we are having political differences, but she speaks like a socialist sometimes. ...*(Interruptions)*...

**SOME HON. MEMBERS:** Sometimes!

**SHRI E. BALANANDAN:** Yes, sometimes. I am saying it because she is able to intervene in this House many a time so forcefully by presenting her case

properly that one cannot forget her that easily. That is what I must say over here, Sir.

My friend who has spoken just before me, is Jaipal Reddy Sahib and I must say that although he is a leader of his party, yet he has been leading me on so many occasions, he has been leading everybody. This is what he has been doing. Normally, our Deputy Chairman does it, but sometimes he becomes the Chairman of the House in doing that. He is controlling this side, he is controlling the other side and so many other things he is doing. Anyhow, he is going to retire. He is retiring, for what? As he has said, he claims that politics is his own profession which, according to him, is the best and clean. Therefore, I think, he is going rather for a much greater political activity either in the other House or in the broader sense 'India' and he will have a better future in political life. I wish him such a position.

Then I come to this side. Shri Chaturanan Mishra, I do not know much of his Hindi; I only get some translation, but people tell me that his Hindi is superb; I do not know, but people say that. He puts questions and he intervenes without much effort, but he attracts the whole House. That is his quality which we cannot easily forget.

On the other side, I don't want to name many Members. Shri Azad—he does not speak much, but when he speaks—very clearly attracts the whole House. That is one of his qualities. He is also going.

And from our party, you know that Sarala Maheshwariji is retiring. I cannot equate her with Sushmaji, but she has her place in the discussions of this House, in the deliberations of this House. One cannot easily forget her. And so many other friends are also retiring. I do not want to mention all of them, but experts are going, and I hope that many experts are coming also. Now 58 Members are retiring; out of 72, 14 have already come and within a short time you will get another 58 Members. Therefore, I am



only saying that it is a continuous process of politics. In our deliberations we should see that our country's prestige, our country's aims and ideals are protected by all Members who are here. Members who are retiring will be doing the same job in different fields in a different way more efficiently and I wish all of them good health and prosperous political life. With these words, I thank you, Sir.

**SHRI G. SWAMINATHAN** (Tamil Nadu): Mr. Chairman, Sir, I am here for two terms and if I remember correct, this is my fourth speech of this nature, conveying my good wishes to the retiring Members. Sir, while conveying our good wishes during the speeches of this nature we used to say to all the retiring Members, whoever they may be, that they would have an opportunity to come back. That is what we used to say, but this time, Sir, there is a lot of difference in the sense that there are 75 Members who are retiring and 14 Member have already come back, but on the previous occasions whenever we made this kind of farewell speeches, elections were not used to be held before. It was only after the farewell that the elections used to be held and we did not know as to who of the Member that would return. So, uniformly we tell everybody that we expect them all to come back. Sir, I am sorry that I am not able to say the same thing to many of our friends who are going because only 14 of them have been returned. So, this makes a marked difference between the three speeches which I had made before and the fourth speech which I am making today.

Another thing is that among the notable Members who have been returned, Sir, there is Shri S. B. Chavan, the Leader of the House, about whom my esteemed friend, Shri Jaipal Reddy, said that he spoke well and long but never made people understand what he spoke or something like that. I will come to it later. Regarding Chavanji, I have got the greatest respect for him because from my student days I have heard his name as a politician in Maharashtra, as a Minister in

Maharashtra and as Chief Minister of Maharashtra. He is one person for whom I have got the greatest respect. I don't agree with what my friend, Mr. Jaipal Reddy, had said. But I would say only one thing, Sir. Whenever he is in the midst of a storm in the House—as the Leader of the House naturally people start attacking him—I have never found him losing his equilibrium. It is mentioned in the *Ramayana* that whenever Janak Maharaj, is sitting on his throne he always maintains his equilibrium, he is never happy, he is never sorrowful because he always thinks that there is a knife above him which may fall at any time. That is the kind of detachment Janaka had. I always used to find, Sir, in Shri S. B. Chavan a kind of great participation in this House, participation and affection for his own party, and, at the same time, some sort of detachment whenever he is sitting here, getting himself involved in the problems of the House. That is a great quality which many of the politicians are not able to develop. Whenever we are for a particular cause we get too much attached and whenever we are against it we oppose it too much. It is very rarely that we find persons like Mr. Chavan who can be dispassionate and detached whenever he is analysing a problem. We are very happy that he has come back.

Another notable figure who has come back is Mr. N.K.P. Salve. He had been in this House and the other House for a very long time. During a discussion in the Business Advisory Committee his name cropped up many times because when the Opposition started asking whether there had been any such Resolution under rule 167 in this House, whether there had been any precedent, it was Salve's name which was thought of and it was he who, as the Deputy Leader of the Opposition when Morarji Desai was the Prime Minister, moved a Resolution and brought it to vote. Mr. Salve is one who has been in politics and in both the Houses for a very long time.

We have our Leader of the Opposition, who had been a Minister, who had a long

innings in politics, coming back. Then Mr. Solanki is there. All these friends had been here for a long time. I am mentioning all these for a particular reason and that too for a personal reason. The reason is that these Members have been in politics and in the House for a very long time. I looked to them because survival in politics is very difficult. Recently I read an article on "The Art of Survival in Business". The art of survival in politics is more difficult than the art of survival in business. There are many young Members here including me. I am only 65. I would like the seniors to give us a class on how to survive in politics for such a long time. It will help us to a very great extent. I remember a particular incident. Four years back when my period was over the then Chairman of the House, now the hon. President, asked me, "Mr. Swaminathan, are you coming back?" I told him, "Sir, I don't know." Thereafter I came back to this House. When I was in one of the meetings of the Business Advisory Committee he asked me, "Mr. Swaminathan, I asked you whether you are coming back. You said that you did not know and you have come back. Why didn't you tell me that you would come back?" Sir, I told him, "The minds of the leaders are very unpredictable, Sir, and more so if the leader happens to be a lady." I said, "I didn't know whether I would come back to this House or not." Really, I did not know it. I was really happy to come to this House. (*Interruptions*). Sir, he says, "I am spoiling my case." No, Sir. I am not mentioning about any leader either present or not present. The point I have been making about a lady leader is about Mrs. Gandhi. (*Interruptions*). I am talking about Mrs. Gandhi.

Sir, another Member who has come back is Shri K. K. Birla. He is not a politician. We all have full respect for him because he is a leading industrialist of this country. Sir, in Tamil Nadu, when somebody used to be very supercilious or very arrogant. we used to ask, "Are you

a Tata or a Birla?" Even young boys used to feel that Tata or Birla was somebody who was very great. Sir, when I came to this House, I saw a Birla here, a very senior Birla. He is not somebody so monstrous as we had been hearing those days. I have been hearing this name for a very long time, for more than 50 to 60 years. I am very happy that I am a Member of this House because that great Birla is also one of the Members of this House.

I come back to the Members who are not returning. So far, I was talking about the Members who are returning. Some of the Members are not returning. I have to say something about them because it is very necessary. Sir, I will always remember Shri P. Upendra. When I became a Member of this House nearly 10 years back, Shri P. Upendra was in his prime. He was the leader of the Telugu Desam party and he was controlling 14 Members in this House. I always found him fighting with Shri Rajiv Gandhi, the then Prime Minister. He was very good at the job of a leader. I don't know what has happened to him because now he is not a leader of that party. I would like to tell him one thing. He has now joined the ruling party. I may or may not be correct. I would like to make one strong recommendation. I would like to tell him that he is very capable as a leader who fights, not as a leader of the ruling party. We have seen Shri Upendra as a leader of the opposition and also as a Minister. So, I will strongly recommend to him to be in an opposition party. I don't know whether he has already selected a party which, he thought, would be in opposition. I am only saying that I want Shri Upendra to be in his element, not because of my anathema towards any party.

I now come to Shri Jaipal Reddy for whom I have great respect. He is a person who is erudite and who is very knowledgeable. Sir, sometimes, he speaks such a language that I do not understand. Sir, here we have the facility of translation from English to Hindi and

from Hindi to English. But we do not have translation from high English to low English. It is very necessary because sometimes, he speaks certain words which I don't understand. My primary job is to note down all the words and go back and refer to the dictionary, again to forget when he speaks those words. But I have been saved in a way, in the sense that there will not be any need to refer to my

dictionary quite often as I have been doing because Shri Jaipal Reddy is now retiring. Sir, he is one of the best spokesmen in this House who shed light on many important topics about which we might be afraid to talk. There are many intricate subjects on which he has been talking. Whenever such subjects came up for discussion, I used to shrink away because I could not understand those subjects. He devoted much of his time on many important subjects.

There is another important person who is my neighbour. It is not that I am talking about him because he is my neighbour. I am talking about him because I have got great respect for him.

In politics you don't find many wise men. I would readily say that Shri Chaturanan is one of the wisest politicians that I have ever met. I am sorry that he is retiring. I belong to the AIADMK party and he belongs to a party about which I do not have a great opinion, in the sense that I had started my public life, my political career under Rajaji. I was with him for such a long time that I did not develop any fancy for the Communist Party. However, it so happened that I came to this August House, I found myself hedged between two hon. Members of the Communist Party. Personally I like them. But as representatives of the Communist Party—from the beginning, I did not have any equation with the party—I cannot say much. I would only request that hon. Chairman to put a Member of some other party beside me after Shri Chaturanan Mishra retires. As long as Sri Chaturanan Mishra was here, I could not

make such a request. I would like to make one point about Shri Chaturanan Mishra. It so happened that we were sitting and talking about the split in NTR's Telugu Desam Party. At that time he said one thing which caught my imagination. He said, "For an old man, a young wife is a poison." This is what he said. I am not casting aspersions on anybody. At that time one thought came to my mind very strongly. The Dravidian Party which was founded by the great leader E.V.R. Periyar got split into the DK and the DMK after the great, erudite and magnificent leader E.V.R. Periyar married, in his old age, a young lady. ...*(Interruptions)*... Sir, Shri Satya Prakash Malaviya is also retiring today. He is a very good person. He had also been a Minister. He does not arrogate to himself anything even though he had been a Minister. But one thing is common to both of us. There are many things which we don't know about well-known people. Dale Carnegie wrote a book called 'Unknown facts about well-known people'. One thing that is common to both of us is that we both carry briefcases which are always full of papers. Every time I come to the Parliament I am afraid that something might crop up of which I may not know much. Hence, I carry with me a lot of papers. I used to be very happy to see that my neighbour, Malaviyaji also carried with him a briefcase full of papers while Chaturanan Mishra did not carry any paper at all.

Sir, about Shri Ghulam Nabi Azad, our Minister of Parliamentary Affairs, much can be said. I am very fascinated by him. You may have heard of the great poet of Tamil Nadu, Shri Thiruvalluvar. In one of his poems he has said, "*Idukkan Varungaal Naguga*". It means: whenever you are in difficulty smile. Mr. Ghulam Nabi Azad who is the Minister of Parliamentary Affairs is always faced with difficulties. Whenever we confronted him either in private or in the Business Advisory Committee meetings, we always found him smiling and he resolved our problems. He is a contrast to the Minister whose name I do not want to mention

here. Whenever we confronted him, he got angry and he confronted us and again we confronted him and it used to go on like this and the problem would not get resolved. I hope Mr. Ghulam Nabi Azad would continue as the Minister. He is not coming back to the house. But well, there is a method to come back to the House. You should get elected to the other House, become a Minister and you can occupy a seat in this house. There are two methods of coming back to this House. One method is by becoming a Member of the Rajya Sabha and the other method is by becoming a Minister. I wish him all the best. He is one person who should come back and become the Minister of Parliamentary Affairs, if at all his party comes back to power.

I would now talk about our friends from Tamil nadu. We have our DMK friends here, but I am sorry because many of them are retiring. Shri Misa R. Ganesan, Shri Pasumpon Tha. Kiruttinan, Shri Veerappan—all of them belong to the DMK party which is the main Opposition in the State. As stated by our hon. Chief Minister the other day, political fight in Tamil Nadu is between the DMK and the AIADMK, with due regard to the Congress Members here. In their retirement, we are losing the main opponents to our party in Tamil Nadu. I had to fight with them many a time. By Fighting with them, I have also become a prominent figure because one can become prominent only if one fights somebody or somebody fights one. But I am sorry they are retiring.

Sir, just as a coin has two sides—head and tail—Democracy also has two sides—the ruling party and the opposition party. Unless the coin has two sides, it will not have any currency. As Members of the Opposition, they have done a great service. Today all of them are retiring. I wish they had come to this House again. But I am afraid they will not be able to come back now; they may come back after two years because elections to Rajya Sabha were held only recently. So they would not be able to come back for the

next two years. But I am sorry I cannot fight them after two years because after two years I will be retiring from this House.

One more Member, the MDMK Member, is also retiring now. Mr. Gopalsamy had always been fighting like a lion. Unfortunately I don't find him today in the House. Surely when-ever there was a fight, there was Mr. Gopalsamy. After starting a new party, he is not seen very often in this house. I have a very great regard for him in the sense that he is a very good fighter. In this connection, I am reminded of Machiavelli, the great statesman and writer. According to him, a king should have two qualities. I advocate to Mr. Gopalsamy both these qualities because I don't know about his personal qualities. Machiavelli said and I quote.

"A king should have two qualities. To be a king, he should have the qualities of both the lion and the fox..."

I know Mr. Gopalsamy as a member of this house who was always found fighting like a lion. I would suggest he should cultivate the qualities of a fox as well in order to be successful in politics.

An unattached Member, Shri S. Madhavan, is also retiring now. He was earlier a Minister also. Now he does not belong to our party. Personally I have got a great affection and good equation with him. Unfortunately he no longer belongs to our party. I am sorry to say that he could not continue with our party. I hope he will find other avenues to come back to this House.

Lastly I would like to mention about two great ladies who have impressed me—Shrimati Sushma Swaraj and Shrimati Sarala Maheshwari. Shrimati Sushma Swaraj is an advocate by profession. She is very communicative and understanding. She used to recite very good couplets. We were all very much impressed with her couplets and poetry. I have great admiration for her. She is also the spokesperson of the BJP. Incidentally

the spokesman of the Congress party is also an advocate by profession. Even though she is retiring as a Member of this House, she should continue to be the spokesperson of the BJP so that we could hear her name very often through the media, we could remember her even though she would cease to be a Member of this House.

Finally I want to speak about Shrimati Sarala Maheshwari who belongs to the Communist Party Marxist. She will be remembered as long as the hawala issue is remembered. The hawala episode took the present shape because of a question which she raised about some obscure thing which happened somewhere else, and that carried the day. The Press came in and a lot of publicity was given to the issue. Many matters have come out of the issue. She is a very articulate Member. She has been taking up many issues—not only the general issues but also issues relating to women. We are going to miss her in this House.

On behalf of the AIADMK and also on my own behalf, I wish all the Members who are retiring and who are not coming back to this House the very best of their life and very good political future. I wish those who are likely to come back the best of luck.

Thank you, Mr. Chairman, for giving me this opportunity.

1.00 P.M.

**श्री चतुरानन मिश्र (बिहार):** सभापति महोदय, मेरे सामने एक दिकत है कि मैं जानेवालों के बारे में पहले बोलूँ कि रहनेवालों के बारे में क्योंकि मैं तो जानेवालों में से हूँ। मैं समझता हूँ कि जो यहां रहेंगे उन्हीं के बारे में सबसे पहले कुछ कहूँ।

सभापति महोदय, मेरा ख्याल है कि हम लोग जिस वक्त यहां से रिटायर हो रहे हैं उस वक्त हमारे प्रजातंत्र पर गहरा आंतरिक खतरा है। देश में जो कुछ हो रहा है उस से पॉलिटिकल पार्टीज को बहुत जबरदस्त धक्का लग रहा है और बिना पॉलिटिकल पार्टी के, स्वस्थ पॉलिटिकल पार्टी के, प्रजातंत्र चल नहीं सकता है। ऐसे अवसर पर जो माननीय सदस्य यहां रहेंगे, उन से मैं अपेक्षा करता हूँ कि वे अपना काम इतने अच्छे ढंग से करें कि जिससे वे पूरे राष्ट्र को प्रभावित कर सकें और यह पहला प्रजातंत्र

या "फर्स्ट रिपब्लिक" जो हमारे पूर्वजों ने बड़े बलिदान के बाद बनाया है, उस की गरिमा की हम रक्षा करें और आनेवाली पीढ़ी को यह संदेश दे सकें कि यह "फर्स्ट रिपब्लिक" बड़े बलिदान से बना है और जिस की रक्षा करना हम तमाम लोगों का पुरीत कर्तव्य है।

सभापति महोदय, दरअसल मैं यहां कुछ लेट आया। वह इसलिए कि पं० मोतीलाल नेहरू कालेज में आज उन्हीं के "मेमोरियल लेक्चर" में मुझे भाग लेना था। इस कारण मैं देर से पहुंचा। पहली बात तो जो माननीय सदस्य यहां रहेंगे, यह हाउस रहेगा, उन से हमारी यही दरखास्त होगी एक जानेवाले साथी की कि यह जो कठिन कर्तव्य उन के सामने है, खासकर राज्य सभा के लिए जहां कि "कॉउंसिल ऑफ स्टेट्स" है, उन्हें राज्यों के हितों की रक्षा करनी है। इसलिए मैं उन से ऐसी अपेक्षा करूंगा कि वह और भी ज्यादा अच्छे ढंग से काम करें। लोक सभा तो है ही और वह तो सच के लिए है, लेकिन राज्य सभा का जो विशिष्ट काम है, वह और अच्छे ढंग से चले यही मेरी पहली इच्छा होगी।

अब जो हम लोग जानेवाले हैं, उन में मैं भी हूँ। आप ने और दूसरे माननीय नेताओं ने मेरे प्रति जो उद्गार प्रकट किए हैं, मैं उन के प्रति कृतज्ञता प्रकट करता हूँ। हां, यह जरूर है कि मैं सदन में 12 वर्ष रहा तो किसी से झगड़ा नहीं हुआ। ऐसा भी नहीं कि मैंने व्यंग्य नहीं छोड़ा हो किसी पर। वह तो मेरा स्वाभाविक धर्म था, लेकिन यह जरूर ध्यान में था कि किसी से मित्रता में कोई कमी नहीं आए। यह मुझे जरूर अखरेगी। मैं एक बात की चर्चा यहां करना चाहूंगा कि जितना काम इस सदन में है, उस से ज्यादा महत्वपूर्ण काम देश में अब बाहर हो गया है। हां, यह एक दुर्भाग्य की बात है कि हमारे देश में अब गांधी जी जैसा कोई नेता नहीं है जोकि जन-मानस को एक सूत्र में बांध सके। हम छोटे-छोटे जीव हैं और प्रधान मंत्री पद पर भी बहुत हुए, लेकिन पद से तो सब कुछ होता नहीं है। जन-मानस को आप पद पर रहकर अपनी तरफ खींच ही सकेंगे, यह जरूरी तो नहीं है। मैंने इसलिए दूसरी तरफ ध्यान देना शुरू किया था जैसे "भास-लिटरेसी की तरफ, हरिजनों और दूसरे उपेक्षित वर्गों के अधिकार की तरफ। मैंने एक/दो जिलों को चुना और उनके बीच में जाना शुरू किया था। फिर बुढ़ापे में कोई काम तो करना चाहिए, इसलिए कुछ "शॉर्ट स्टोरीज" भी लिखना शुरू किया और वह इसी बात के लिए कि हमारे देश में समाज में बहुत बड़ा परिवर्तन हो रहा है जिस की हम लोगों ने परिकल्पना तो की थी, लेकिन वह नजर नहीं आ रहा था। अब यह देखते हैं कि महिलाएं आगे आ रही हैं और पंचायती राज के जरिए और भी वर्ग आगे

आ रहे हैं, हरिजन आगे आ रहे हैं, आदिवासी आगे आ रहे हैं और दूसरे पिछड़े लोग आगे आ रहे हैं तो मुझे बड़ी प्रसन्नता होती है। अब हमारे मित्र स्वामीनाथन जी तो चिंतित हैं क्योंकि कम्युनिष्टवाद उन्होंने कभी पसंद नहीं किया। और वही बात हमको जीवन भर पसंद आई कि इसी को लेकर के हम आगे बढ़े हैं। जब हम देखते हैं कि समाज में यह परिवर्तन हो रहा है तो मैं समझता हूँ कि यह सारा परिवर्तन भारतीय गणतंत्र को बहुत ही मजबूत करेगा। अभी जो कुछ हम देख रहे हैं, वह असली चीज नहीं है। यह काले बादल छट जाएंगे और हम लोग आगे निकलेंगे।

इन्हीं शब्दों के साथ हमारे जितने जाने वाले मित्र हैं, उनसे हाथ मिलाते हुए चाहेंगे कि हम बाहर का काम देखें और जो यहां रहेंगे उनसे यही अपेक्षा करेंगे कि इस प्रजातंत्र के झंडे को वे बराबर लहराते रहें, इसके लिए ने काम करते रहें, हमारी शुभकामना बराबर उनके साथ रहेगी। धन्यवाद।

**श्री सत्य प्रकाश मालवीय (उत्तर प्रदेश):** माननीय सभापति जी, भारत विश्व का सबसे बड़ा संसदीय लोक तंत्र है और विश्व के संसदीय लोकतंत्र के इस सदन में, जो फर्स्ट अप्रैल या फूल डे था 1984 का उसके दूसरे दिन, मुझे यहां आने का अवसर प्राप्त हुआ और तब से कई बार यहां पर इस तरह के समारोह देख चुका हूँ। सदन में लोग आते हैं, चले जाते हैं, लेकिन यह सदन हमारे लोकतंत्र की निरंतरता और परिवर्तन की एक जीती-जागती मिसाल है।

आज हमारा जो लोकतंत्र है, वह सहमति, असहमति और सर्वानुमति के आधार पर चलता है। लोकतंत्र में सत्ता पक्ष और विपक्ष दोनों एक ही गाड़ी के पहिए हैं और इसलिए सत्ता पक्ष को विपक्ष की बातों का आदर करना चाहिए और विपक्ष को भी जो सत्ता पक्ष की अच्छी बातें हैं, जो उनको रूचिकर लगें देशहित में, उसका आदर करना चाहिए।

मान्यवर, मैं इलाहाबाद नगर महापालिका, उत्तर प्रदेश विधानसभा और इस सदन का सदस्य रहा हूँ, लेकिन जितना सौहार्दपूर्ण वातावरण मैं इस सदन में देखा वैसा वातावरण मैंने आज तक किसी भी सदन में नहीं देखा। यहां की जो घटनाएँ हैं, वह मेरे लिए विस्मरणीय रहेंगी, विस्मरणीय रहेंगी। मेरी अपनी समझ से आज देश को तीन बुराइयों से बहुत ज्यादा खतरा है और वह है—सांप्रदायिकता, जातिवाद और भ्रष्टाचार। मुझे पूरी तरह से आशा है और विश्वास है कि यह सदन एकजुट होकर के राष्ट्रहित में, देशहित में

इन तीनों बुराइयों को समूल नष्ट करने का प्रयास करेगा और प्रयास ही नहीं करेगा बल्कि इसमें सफलता हासिल करेगा।

मान्यवर, जब कोई कहीं से जाता है तो आम तौर से लोग उससे पूछते हैं कि तुम्हारी इच्छा क्या है? मैं अपनी दो इच्छाएँ यहां पर बतलाना चाहता हूँ। इस सदन के सभापति डा० राधाकृष्णन, डा० जाकिर हुसैन, श्री वी० वी० गिरी, श्री आर० वेंकटरमण और वर्तमान राष्ट्रपति डा० शंकरदयाल जी शर्मा भारतीय गणतंत्र के राष्ट्रपति बने। मुझे पूरा विश्वास है कि भारत के भावी राष्ट्रपति के पद को, मान्यवर, आप निश्चित रूप में सुशोभित करेंगे। नजमा जी दस वर्षों से अधिक समय से उपसभापति पद का संचालन कर रही हैं और उससे अधिक समय से सदन की मैबर रही हैं। वह गुस्सा भी करती हैं, स्वयं उन्होंने कहा कि वह गुस्सा भी करती हैं तो गुस्से का बहाना करती हैं, लेकिन मैं समझता हूँ कि गुस्सा तो करते हैं, लेकिन मुक्काकर गुस्सा करती हैं। आपकी जो बायोग्राफी है, उसमें दिया हुआ है कार्डिएक एनाटोमी में आपने पीएच०डी० किया है, लेकिन मैं समझता हूँ कि जो पोलिटिकल एनाटोमी है उसमें आप ज्यादा दक्ष है कार्डिएक एनाटोमी से क्योंकि जो पोलिटिकल संरचना है। पोलिटिकल लोगों की जो संरचना है। उन संरचना को आप बहुत अच्छे तरीके से समझती हैं। नजमा जी राज्य सभा का संचालन बहुत ही दक्षता से करती हैं, बहुत ही चतुराई से करती हैं और अपनी पूर्ण योग्यता से करती हैं। आपने न केवल भारत में बल्कि विश्व के विभिन्न मंचों पर जाकर महिलाओं की समस्याओं का चिंतन किया है। इसलिये मेरी दूसरी इच्छा यही है कि चूंकि आज तक इस देश में न कोई महिला राष्ट्रपति हुई हैं और न कोई महिला इस सभा की सभापति हुई हैं, इसलिये मेरी दूसरी इच्छा यह है कि भविष्य में नजमा जी इस हाऊस की सभापति हों। यहां के महासचिव या उनके सहयोगी जो अधिकारीगण हैं या जो अन्य राज्य सभा के छोटे से छोटे कर्मचारी भी हैं, उनको मैंने बहुत दक्ष पाया और कभी भूल से भी यहां के किसी कर्मचारी ने मुझे कभी भी किसी शिकायत का मौका नहीं दिया, हमेशा हंसकर के उनका सहयोग मिलता रहा और मैं समझता हूँ कि अगर इस तरह के कर्मचारी अन्य कार्यालयों में भी हो जाए तो जनता को बहुत आराम मिले, जनता को बहुत सुख हो जाए। इसलिये मैं हृदय से इस राज्य सभा के जितने अधिकारी हैं, कर्मचारी हैं, उनके प्रति, नेता विपक्ष, नेता सदन और प्रधान मंत्री जी के प्रति आभार प्रकट करता हूँ। जाने-अनजाने में यदि मुझसे कभी कोई भूल हो गई हो तो मैं उसके लिये खेद प्रकट करता हूँ।

मैं कृतज्ञतापूर्वक इस अवसर पर चौधरी चरण सिंह को स्मरण करना चाहूंगा। सन् 1984 में मैं लोक दल में था और उन्होंने ही मुझे इस सदन में भेजने का काम किया और मेरे जैसे साधारण व्यक्ति को उन्होंने राज्य सभा का सदस्य बनाया।

मुझे एक बात का जरूर अफसोस है कि 2 अप्रैल, से जिस दल से मैं संबंधित हूँ—जनता दल (समाजवादी), इस राज्य सभा से जनता दल (समाजवादी) का लोप ही हो जाएगा। हमारे जो सदस्य हैं—विद्या बेनिवाल, दिग्विजय सिंह, अनंतराम जायसल वाल और हरिमोहन चौधरी, सब अवकाश ग्रहण कर रहे हैं, इस बात का मुझे अफसोस है लेकिन फिर भी यह एक निरंतर प्रक्रिया है और किसी शायर ने कहा है:—

“कि तेरी महफिल में बहुत होंगे, लेकिन मुझे अफसोस है कि हम न होंगे” इसलिये इस अवसर पर मैं सबके प्रति आभार प्रकट करता हूँ। मैं अलबिदा तो नहीं कहूंगा, यही कहूंगा कि फिर मिलेंगे।

श्री राम गोपाल यादव (उत्तर प्रदेश): सभापति महोदय, आज ऐसा अवसर है जबकि हमें अवकाश ग्रहण करने वाले अपने साथियों को बहुत भारी मन से विदाई देनी पड़ रही है। हालांकि एक तिहाई रिटायर होने वाले सदस्यों में से 14 माननीय सदस्य दोबारा चुनकर आ गये हैं, उनको मैं अपनी तरफ से, अपनी पार्टी समाजवादी पार्टी की तरफ से बधाई देता हूँ और जो लोग रिटायर होकर जा रहे हैं, उनमें से कुछ लोगों की कार्यशैली और इस सदन में सक्रियता इतनी थी कि उन्होंने राज्य राज्य सभा को हमेशा एक जानदार सदन के रूप में बनाए रखने का काम किया।

मान्यवर, यूं तो दुनिया में जहां भी पार्लियामेंटरी सिस्टम है, संसदीय शासन प्रणाली है, सैकिंड चैम्बर, जो सरकार को बनाने और बिगाड़ने का काम नहीं करता है, उसकी भूमिका बहुत ज्यादा महत्वपूर्ण नहीं है। एक विद्वान ने ब्रिटिश हाउस आफ लार्ड्स के बारे में यह कहा कि अगर यह प्रथम सदन से असहमति व्यक्त करता है तो शरारती है और सहमति व्यक्त करता है तो अनावश्यक है। तो यह इस हाउस, कनाडा की सीनेट और सीनेट आफ आस्ट्रेलिया पर भी लागू होता है। पोलिटिकल साइंस का स्टूडेंट होने के नाते मैं यह पढ़ाया भी करता था और अपने छात्रों से यूनिवर्सिटी एग्जामिनेशन में पेपर सैट करते वक्त भी कभी-कभी जब यह सवाल पूछ लिया करता था और जब मैं राज्य सभा में चुनकर आया तो यह देखा कि हमारा सैकिंड चैम्बर सारी ज्वलंत समस्याओं के प्रति हमेशा एलाइव रहता है तो ऐसा अहसास हुआ कि यह केवल द्वितीय सदन नहीं

है बल्कि यह उच्च सदन अपनी मर्यादाओं, अपनी जिम्मेदारियों के प्रति पूरी तरह से सज्जग है। इस दायित्व को निभाने में हमारे सदन के कुछ रिटायरिंग मैम्बर्स का जो योगदान रहा है, उसको यह सदन कभी नहीं भुला सकता है। मैं इस अवसर पर आदरणीय जयपाल रेड्डी जी का, चुतयनन मिश्र साहब का, सुषमा जी का, दिग्विजय सिंह जी का, मालवीय जी का, जगमोहन जी का, अम्बेडकर साहब का और गुलाम नबी आजाद साहब का नाम अवश्यक लेना चाहूंगा।

इन लोगों ने निरंतर अपने योगदान से इस सदन को लोगों की आकांक्षाओं और आशाओं के अनुरूप बनाए रखने का काम किया। उत्तर प्रदेश से जो सदस्य रिटायर होने जा रहे हैं, उनके बारे में मैं ज्यादा इसलिए नहीं कहना चाहता क्योंकि हो सकता है कि उत्तर प्रदेश की विधानसभा के चुनाव के बाद उनमें से कई लोग दोबारा चुनकर राज्य सभा में आ जाएं। चौधरी हरिमोहन सिंह जी जैसे तो मालवीय जी की पार्टी में हैं लेकिन वस्तुतः वे हमारी ही पार्टी के मेंबर हैं। उनका हमेशा हम पर बड़ा स्नेह रहता है जैसे बड़े भाई का छोटे भाई पर स्नेह रहता है। ये सभी लोग जो रिटायर होकर जा रहे हैं और अभी चुनकर नहीं आ रहे हैं, इनके लिए मेरी यह शुभकामना है कि वे अपने यश की सुगंध पूरे समाज में बिखेरते रहें। इस वक्त मैं यही कह सकता हूँ कि जो लोग दोबारा लोटकर नहीं आ रहे हैं, उनके बगैर यह सदन सूना-सूना लगेगा और इनकी हमें बहुत याद आएगी। बहुत-बहुत धन्यवाद।

SHRI PASUMPON THA. KIRUTTINAN (Tamil Nadu): Sir, on behalf DMK Party, my colleagues here, who are retiring and also on my own behalf, I would like to thank our hon. Chairman, hon. Deputy Chairman and all Members of this House for having shown courtesy towards me and to our Members. We are four Member here from the DMK Party. All of us are retiring on 2nd April, 1996. My friends, Mr. Misa R. Ganesan, Mr. T.A. Mohammed Saghy and Mr. K.K. Veerappan, have served the House for full six years. I myself have served the House for full seven years. We all come from very, very ordinary families. We belong to backward and minority communities which were neglected socially and educationally for thousands of years. We have come to this House because of the relentless social and political work done by our great leaders Thanthai Periy-

ar, Aringnar Anna and our dynamic leaders, Dr. Kalaingar. They created political awareness in our State and in the whole of the country, brought us to this House of Elders and illuminating personalities. I, therefore, would like to record my sincere thanks and gratitude to our departed leaders, Periyar and Anna and particularly to our relentless leaders, Dr. Kalaingar Sir, in this House we were guided by our Group Leader, Murosoli Maran, who retired some months back, and also by the eguidance given by our leaders Dr. Kalaingar. We are proud of it; it has been a great privilege for us to be in this august House. We have served this House quietly. We were sincere in our duty. We carried out our work with dignity and maintained the discipline of this House. We were keen in maintaining decency and decorum during the proceedings of the House. I must say that we have been sincere to our leader and to our party. We have also shown the same amount of sincerity to Parliament and to all citizens of this country. I have made great friends in this House cutting across party lines. I treated every Member with great honour and respect. I have seen many fine minds and it has indeed been a gathering of great minds. I have seen some of the finest debates covering every aspect that concerns every citizen and the nation as a whole. I have no doubt that this House will continue to be the power-house of the most vibrant democracy in the world and its relevance will grow in the emerging times with increasing decentralisation of power in favour of the States. It is only the strongest States which will make a stronger nation. I am sure that in time to come all our States will be very strong economically educationally, socially and culturally. I must take this opportunity to thanks all my colleagues present and past who have shown unflinching affection and underserved consideration for me and to my colleagues who have made every moment in this House a pleasant and lasting memory. With these words I conclude. Thank you.

SHRI G. G. SWELL (Meghalaya): Mr. Chairman, I discovered that my name is in the list of speakers not because I am retiring myself but because I happen to be the leader of a group in this House known as the United Parliamentary Group which comprises twelve Members. About this I shall come later in my speech. Mr. Chairman, they say that old soldiers never die, they just fade away. I have been an old soldier of this Parliament, although a lone soldier. With my retirement from this august House, in April next, I would have completed five terms in the Parliament, with a little bit of truancy in between, when I went abroad as an envoy of this country. I retire from this House with regret because in the course of the last six years I have developed a kind of affection for this House as well as the Members of this House. This being a much smaller House than the other House in which I had been for four terms, there has been more closeness among the Members, more personal knowledge of each other, more appreciation of each other and on my part, I have benefited a lot. I must say I have sincere affection for many of my colleagues, those who have retired, those who are retiring and those who may still be here. I have also developed regard for you, Sir, for the consideration that I have received at your hands. You have always been receptive, always reasonable, always patient. I have seen you functioning not only as the presiding officer of this House, but also while presiding over rumbustious, bumptious committees of this House. I would also like to thank the Deputy Chairman, for her kindness behind her rough exterior in this House. I can understand her loudness and roughness, having to control this House, but behind that there has always been a well of tenderness and affection. I must also thank the Secretary-General. Each time we have a problem she has been always helpful; so also the staff of the Secretariat. There is no problem with which you go to them, for which they don't have an answer. They have always been



courteous and very good. I must say that my six years in this House has been very enriching. As I told you, I have been in the other House for four terms before coming here. I had a wrong conception of this House, this being the House of the States and not of the people.

The other House being the House of the people is a mirror of the people of this country, of the different stages in which they live, the different levels of education they have, the different kinds of motivation they have. It is only fair and necessary that the House should be the mirror of all that. It is only fair and necessary that this House should also be the barometer of the mood in this country. An it is right and proper because democracy in this country has gone to the grass-roots. The people of India are aware of their power. There was a time, soon after independence, when the people of India entrusted their wisdom and their decision to a handful of leaders, true leaders, leaders of great character, leaders of great intellect. Indira Gandhi once said that the cream of the world intellect was reflected among the leaders who framed the Constitution of this country, people of both sides, people of utter unselfishness, people who lived only for the good of this country and sacrificed their lives. We have failed. We, in the succeeding generations, have failed. And, therefore, the people of India are impatient with us. That finds reflection, as it is in finding today. Mr. Chairman, I am an optimist. I love my country. I love this Parliament because it is only this Parliament that holds this country together. Take away the Parliament, there is no India, no one India. What do I have in common with all of you here? I, a poor tribal, who some people think still wears a tail underneath my trousers, coming from the North-East, speaking a different language, with a different background, what do I have in common with all of you except this House, which is the House of the people of India? Here, we all belong. I am proud to belong to this country. I am proud of the fact of five

thousand years of continuous civilisation of this country.

Mr. Chairman, each time this country has fallen apart, each time this country has been in the dumps, there have been social movements. There have always been great men, as if sent for a purpose. There was Buddha, at one time, whose name lives even today; not only in this country, but in other parts of the world as well. There was Shankaracharya. There was Swami Vivekananda who told the world what this country had, who aroused the conscience of the people of this country and also of the world. There was Mahatma Gandhi who led us to Independence.

I am happy that, today, there is turmoil in this country. Turmoil in both Houses of Parliament. Turmoil here. We have been at the receiving end. There was a time, when India was about to achieve here Independence, when some fellows in the West thought that India was ungovernable. But we have existed for more than fifty years as a democracy, as a real democracy. Our elections are free and fair.

If there is turmoil today, it is only right and proper. But even in the midst of this turmoil, I only wish that some of our leaders who are placed in positions where they can make the right decision, should make the right decision and, that too, in time and with grace.

Though there is turmoil today, I see a silver lining in the cloud. There is a silver lining in the cloud. I am still proud of this country. I am still proud of our democracy. I am still proud of this Parliament. I have defended Indian Parliamentary democracy in different fora of the world and I will continue to do so. I tell you, Mr. Chairman, after the elections, this nation and this democracy will have a metamorphosis. Many of us will fall by the wayside; does not matter, but the country will go forward. This is the Indian way of democracy. This Indian way of democracy will be visible after the next General Elections.

Mr. Chairman, I bid farewell to this House. I do not hope I will come back to this House. But I will always be around Parliament. Nobody can stop me. I am coming back. Nobody can stop me: May not be in this House Mr. Chairman; maybe anywhere, but I will be around here to play my part in shaping the destiny and the future of this country.

Just one last word, Mr. Chairman. People in India, today, will not go by party labels. People of India wish to see men of character, men of knowledge, men of ability; more and more of such people will come to Parliament. I say this with a purpose.

We are unattached Members of this House. We have banded ourselves into a group of very fine people. I cannot conceive a better individual than my friend, Mr. Jayant Malhoutra, who does a quiet job; or, a better friend than Mr. Jagmohan and many others in our group—fine people; people of knowledge and people of ability.

We are always left last. More of such people will be coming to this House and to the other House. Will a hundred unattached Members coming together and working for the good of the country be put last? Will they be put before a small party with two or three Members? Is it fair for the purpose of this House?

Therefore, my last advice is this. Mr. Chairman, you will be here for some time more. The Deputy Chairman should be here for some time more. May I request you and the Secretariat to think about according priority to the Members in various ways?

Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

**SHRI M. P. ABDUSSAMAD SAMADANI** (Kerala): Sir, as it is too late, I do not want to make a speech here. I humbly wish all the best to the elders who are retiring. Most of these elders are like *gurus* to junior Members like me.

Sir, I am concluding by quoting a couplet from Iqbal. I got inspired by the

beautiful verses quoted by Sikander Bakhtji. I greet all these hon. Members who are retiring by this couplet.

अगर खो गया एक नशेमन तो क्या राम।  
मुकामत-ए-आह-व फुगों और भी हैं।  
तू शाही है, प्रवाज़ है काम तेरा।  
तेरे सामने आसमां और भी हैं।

اگر نھو گیا ایک نشےمین تو کیا غم  
مقامات آہ و فغاں اور بھی ہیں  
تو شاہین ہے - پروانہ کج کام تیرا  
تیرے سامنے آسمان اور بھی ہیں

Thank you, Sir.

**SHRI P. UPENDRA** (Andhra Pradesh): Sir, many vocal, active and learned Members are retiring from this House. I do not know whether the loss of Rajya Sabha will be the gain of the Lok Sabha. Only time will show that.

Sir, just like the complexion of the debates, the complexion of Rajya Sabha has also been changing over the years. More and more younger Members are coming to this House. In fact, if you compare the debates in Rajya Sabha with those in the Lok Sabha, we have been more active. This House has been more turbulent. There is a qualitative difference in the speeches also. We should claim that.

Sir, Mr. Swaminathan, a good friend of mine, has mentioned about the gradual change in the tenor of my speeches etc. Maybe. I was 47 then I am 59 now. Definitely there would be change. More than that, when one represents a regional party, with bosses issuing orders, he knows very well, under what tension one should work. I had the rare privilege of coordinating the Opposition activities for five years when the party of which I belonged at that time was the main Opposition party in the Lok Sabha, with a substantial strength in the House. I have also been the Minister for Parliamentary Affairs, dealing with both sections of the House. That was a very

good experience. I tried to do both the jobs sincerely.

One basic thing which I find lacking today is this. There used to be a lot of trust between the Opposition and the Government, in spite of turbulent scenes now and then. Even in the Opposition at the height of agitations also, the concern was for the country and for the interest of the country and to get the essential business passed. That should be the guiding spirit even today in spite of all the differences that we have politically or otherwise.

I do remember the five years when I coordinated the Opposition activities and even when the then Prime Minister became the Leader of the Opposition: and as Parliamentary Affairs Minister I used to talk to him everyday, both in the morning and in the evening, telling him about the next day's business and meeting him the next morning to explain to him what the business was. I still remember one incident when the Constitutional (Amendment) Bills on Punjab were voted down in the Lok Sabha twice and I submitted my resignation to the then Prime Minister. It was Rajiv Ji, who called me and told me, "One should not be sensitive on this. We are particular that these Bills should be passed, but we wanted to score a point. You bring them in two days and I will get them passed." And he did it. That kind of spirit should prevail. I humbly plead with my colleagues on this side that whatever may be the differences, once we destroy the institution or do something which would destroy the institution, it would be difficult to rebuild. We can mar the prestige and authority of any public man very easily, but we should think where this country would go, once the highest authority is subjected to that kind of a ridicule or criticism. It is only in a passing way that I have said.

I had the privilege of seeing five Prime Ministers in this House with different styles of functioning; and they set glorious examples in the debates in this House. They contributed much. And we

had Leaders of the House like Pranab Babu and Chavan Ji, who also guided the functioning of this House.

We have a Prime Minister now, who is well-experienced, who is knowledgeable and who has changed the shape of the country economically and otherwise. That is the reason which prompted me to support him.

you had been kind enough Sir, to appoint me as Chairman of the Standing Committee on Human Resource Development and Health. I can tell you, Sir, that we have submitted the maximum number of 41 Reports and there is no pending work. We are adopting seven Reports today. That is all I wanted to tell you. I sincerely thank you, Sir, for the indulgence and affection you have shown me both in the House as well as outside.

With the Deputy Chairperson I had very good relations, both as a Member and also as a Minister. She helped me at that time to get the business of the House passed in the House.

I am grateful to the Secretary-General and other officers of this House for the cooperation they extended.

Definitely, I would not be coming back to this House and it is a real farewell. I wish all the Members, who will be continuing in this House all the best and a good career. Thank you.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Before I call upon the Leader of the House and the Prime Minister, there are two other names I would like to call. I would request them to be brief. Shri Ghulam Nabi Azad.

श्री गुलाम नबी आज़ाद (महाराष्ट्र): माननीय चेयरमैन साहब, मुझे लम्बा नहीं बोलना है क्योंकि प्रधानमंत्री जी बोलेंगे लेकिन मैं दो केपेसिटीज़ में दो शब्द बोलना चाहूंगा। एक तो पार्लियामेन्टरी अफेयर्स मिनिस्टर होने के नाते और दूसरा रिटायरिंग मैम्बर होने के नाते। मैं इस सदन के सभी साथियों का बहुत बहुत धन्यवाद करता हूँ।

तीसरी दफा, पिछले दस साल में मैं पार्लियामेन्टरी अफेयर्स मिनिस्टर में आया हूँ। 1985 और 86 में मैं लोक सभा का सदस्य था और मिनिस्टर आफ स्टेट

पार्लियामेंटी अफेयर्स मिनिस्टर था। 1991-92 और 1993 के शुरू में इस सदन का सदस्य होने के नाते पार्लियामेंटी अफेयर्स मिनिस्टर रहा और अब कुछ महीनों से फिर तीसरी दफा हूँ। इन तीनों दफा मुझे बहुत प्रेम और प्यार आपोजीशन के लीडर्स से मिला चाहे पोलिटिकली उनसे कितने ही डिफरेंसेज हों लेकिन व्यक्तिगत तौर पर, चैम्बर में, मेरे चैम्बर में और उसके अलावा व्हिप्स से, डिप्टी लीडर्स से जो स्नेह और प्यार मिला उसके लिए मैं हमेशा उनका आभारी रहूँगा। अपनी पार्टी के साथ ही उनका भी बहुत बहुत मुझे प्रेम मिला। कभी श्री लाइन व्हिप के लिए उनको बुलाना पड़ा। कभी उनके घर में शादी ब्याह होते थे उससे भी उठाकर उनको लाना पड़ता था। कभी कभी वे नाराज भी होते थे। लेकिन वे हमारी मजबूरी को समझते थे। उसके लिए मैं मैं हमेशा उनका आभारी रहूँगा। खास तौर से मैं पिछले दो चार दिनों की बात तो नहीं कहूँगा क्योंकि पार्लियामेंट इलेक्शन नजदीक आ रहे हैं इसलिए ज्यादा मैं अपने आपोजीशन के साथियों को चाहे वे इस हाउस के हों या दूसरे हाउस के, मना नहीं पा रहा हूँ और इलेक्शन में जाहिर है कि कुछ न कुछ उनको गर्मी रखनी है। उसके लिए मैं उनको दोषी नहीं समझता हूँ। कुछ न कुछ मसाला जारी रखना है। लेकिन पिछले तीन मीकों पर जब भी पार्लियामेंटी इलेक्शन बहुत दूर होते थे जिस तरह का कोआपरेशन उनसे मिला, मैं हमेशा कभी कभी कहता था कि पार्लियामेंटी अफेयर्स मिनिस्टर सिर्फ रूलिंग पार्टी का मिनिस्टर नहीं है बल्कि वह आपोजीशन का भी मिनिस्टर है क्योंकि दोनों के बीच में तालमेल करना और दोनों की सहमति से गवर्नमेंट का बिजनेस पास करने में पार्लियामेंटी अफेयर्स मिनिस्टर का काम होता है। तो जो साथी आज रिटायर हो रहे हैं आपोजीशन से मेरे ख्याल में राज्य सभा के इतिहास में हमेशा उनको याद किया जाएगा चाहे वे भारतीय जनता पार्टी की सुष्मा स्वराज हों, चाहे वे जनता दल के जयपाल रेड्डी जी हों, सी०पी०आई० के चतुरानन जी हों, सरला माधेधरी जी हों, कांग्रेस पार्टी के जगेश देसाईजी हों या उपेन्द्रजी, मैं उनको हमेशा याद करता रहूँगा। लेकिन उससे ज्यादा जो आप साथी हैं मैं आपको भी हमेशा याद करता रहूँगा। पार्लियामेंटी अफेयर्स मिनिस्टर होने के नाते ये मेरे कुछ शब्द हैं, लेकिन एक आउट गोटिंग मेंबर होने के नाते मैं यह कहूँगा कि जिस तरह से मौत अटल है, जब इंसान जन्म लेता है तो उसको किसी न किसी दिन मरना होता है इसी तरह से राजनीति में हम जो आते हैं और विशेष रूप से जब पार्लियामेंट में आते हैं तो रिटायर होना जरूरी है चाहे लोक सभा से हों या राज्य सभा से और राज्य सभा से हर दो साल के बाद रिटायर होते हैं तो

यह कोई अफसोस की बात नहीं है, गमी की बात नहीं है, खास तौर से मैं सिर्फ अपने लिये और इस वक्त का फायदा उठाकर कहूँगा कि मैं अपने प्राईम मिनिस्टर का जो कि हमारी पार्टी के दल के अध्यक्ष भी हैं, धन्यवाद करूँगा क्योंकि इनके कहने के बावजूद भी इनके टिकट देने के बावजूद भी मैंने बॉलटरिली लोक सभा इलेक्शन लड़ने की इच्छा प्रकट की और मेरे ख्याल में यह पहली दफा होगा कांग्रेस अध्यक्ष के सामने भी किसी ने कहा होगा कि राज्य सभा के लिये लड़ो और उम्मीदवार कहता है कि मैं लोक सभा का लड़ूँगा। इसलिये अपने मर्जी से मैं वही वापस डिफेक्ट कर रहा हूँ जिसे नजमा जी ने कहा कि डिफेक्शन होगा। हमने वह कानून बनाया था। उस वक्त मैं मिनिस्टर आफ स्टेट था पार्लियामेंट अफेयर्स का और इस एण्टी डिफेक्शन के बनाने में मेरा भी बहुत हद तक राजीव गांधी जी के साथ हाथ रहा है। लेकिन उस वक्त लोक सभा से राज्य सभा और राज्य सभा से लोक सभा का यह डिफेक्शन हमारे जेहन में नहीं आया, हमने यह लूपहोल छोड़ दिया।

**डा० बापू कालदाते:** (महाराष्ट्र परमिसिबुल डिफेक्शन है।

श्री गुलाम नबी आजाद: 6 साल पहले लोक सभा से राज्य सभा में डिफेक्ट कर गया था और अब वापस डिफेक्शन की अनुमति आपसे चाहूँगा।

मैं इन्हीं शब्दों के साथ आप सबका बहुत बहुत आभार प्रकट करता हूँ— चेयरमैन साहब का, डिप्टी चेयरमैन का, आपोजीशन लीडर का, लीडर आफ द हाउस का और सभी मेम्बर्स का। धन्यवाद।

**PROF. M.G.K. MENON (Rajasthan)**  
Mr. Chairman, Sir, I would like to speak on behalf of myself as well as a number of colleagues here who will be retiring. I would like, first of all, to say how deeply grateful all of us are to you, Mr. Chairman, to the Deputy Chairman, to the Secretariat headed by the Secretary-General, and as somebody mentioned earlier, to all other staff who have shown unfailing courtesy and kindness. When I came into this House, the present President of India was the Chairman and from him downwards, all of us have received this unfailing courtesy. And the first point I would like to make is how grateful I am and, I am sure, all of my colleagues are, for all of them.

I came into this House at the invitation of the Prime Minister to join the Council of Ministers. I had no intention ever of coming into what is referred to as 'politics' or of becoming an M.P. But the leader of my party, Shri Jaipal Reddy, has mentioned that the two letters, "M.P.", are something which one can be proud of. And I am indeed proud of having been an M.P.

I have a feeling of sadness today: sadness not because I am leaving the House or will not be an M.P., but on account of an aspect which I would really like to communicate to all my colleagues here. I know that Parliament is a political body. It is a legislative body. And I have sat through the debates which go on here. However, ultimately, it is the highest level body in the country responsible for how and where the country goes. And when I look around, I find that on many of the issues, we have major problems ahead, whether it is the growth of population, the continued deterioration of the environment, the creaking infrastructure or the lack of policy in many areas, whether it is science, technology, security and a large number of issues which call for serious attention not by ministries, departments and bureaucrats, but by this highest level body. When I ask myself, "Have I been able to do my duty as an M.P. by the country?", I find that my honest answer has to be, "No". I wish I could have contributed to these and many other areas which call for attention and which are in the nature of a crisis. But, somehow, as far as our country is concerned, I find that we do not value time. Time passes by, the problems grow. So, I do wish that in the midst of all the rest of what we discuss here—they are important; they reflect the problems around in the society—one would find time also to ensure that these crucial issues which we have left unsolved do not become ulcerating points to create more problems for us.

I wish we would pay attention to that and try to solve some of those problems.

In this regard, I believe that what you and the Speaker of the Lok Sabha have done, has been truly important, in trying to set up a Committee System, and I hope that will prove to be successful to take the load off, as far as the main debates are concerned. But we must make that truly effective. Sitting in the discussions that go on in the House and a lot of what one sees on television about the proceedings of the House, people get a very wrong impression. There are insinuations, there are allegations, there are accusations and tempers seem to be lost. But the most remarkable thing, which I think we should be proud of, is the real friendship which one sees when people go out from the House into the Lobbies, into the Central Hall and even outside—what one sees is the real friendship; whether they be from the Government or from the Opposition—it makes no difference. I think it is that spirit which holds the country together, and that, irrespective of the very many different ways of thinking, which must exist in a large country, we adhere together, as Prof. Swell mentioned, as one country, on account of an intrinsic unity of friendship and I hope that will prevail and in some way, that can also be projected to the country, because unfortunately, the image which is projected, is not of that, namely, of the oneness that exists not only amongst Parliamentarians but also within the country as a whole. I hope that we will be able to do much more in ensuring that we regain the confidence, the value system that got us freedom because that is the spirit that we need to recapture, and therefore, my concluding remark is to wish all those who will continue to be Members here, the very best, and hope that they will recapture the spirit that motivated India. Thank you very much, Sir.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shrimati Sushma Swaraj promised to have one couplet only.

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज (हरियाणा): सभापति जी, इन उदास चड़ियों में कोई भाषण करना नहीं चाहूंगी क्योंकि मुझे मालूम है कि अच्छे-से-अच्छा भाषण भी इस

समय मेरे एहसासों को जुबान नहीं दे पाएगा जो इस समय मेरे जेहन में उछल रहे हैं।

मेरे नेता जो इस समय सदन में विपक्ष के नेता भी हैं, उन्होंने बहुत खूबसूरत अल्फाज में मुझे विदाई दी है। इसलिए उन्हें, आप को और अपनी डिप्टी-चैयरमैन साहिबा को मुखातिब कर के पढ़ रही हूँ:

“सैर करी, खूब फिरे, फूल चुने, शाद रहे,

अब जाते हैं बागबां, तेरा गुलशन आबाद रहे।”

दूसरी दो पंक्तियाँ सभी जानेवाले सदस्यों की ओर से सभी रहनेवाले सदस्यों को मुखातिब कर पढ़ रही हूँ:

“बरस पीछे गुलों की खैरियत तो भेजते रहना,

हमें भी याद कर लेना चमन वालो बहारों में।”  
धन्यवाद।

श्री संघ प्रिय गौतम (उत्तर-प्रदेश): सभापति दलित मेबर को भी बुलावा दीजिए।

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now, the Leader of the House, Shri S.B. Chavan.

SHRI S.B. CHAVAN (Maharashtra): No Sir. I am not speaking. The Prime Minister will speak.

THE PRIME MINISTER (SHRI P.V. NARASIMHA RAO): Sir, after so many speeches, replete with sentiments and goodwill, it is difficult for me to make any really long speech.

2.00 P.M.

I am happy that some Members who retired have also come back on the principle of “*Sambhavami Yuge Yuge*”. I wish this happens to other Members also more often because after four or five terms a Member of Parliament starts feeling that he is not fit for anything else except as a Member of Parliament. I wish the retiring Members all the best. We have never thought that being a Member of Parliament or of a Legislature is either a profession or a permanent service. These are interludes in the life of an individual who happens to be in public life and whenever the party wants him, whenever his leaders want him to be in the House, he is in the House; when they want him to do something, he leaves the House with no regrets at all and does the job

assigned to him. We have done that. So, we have not really developed any vested interest in being Members of Parliament, and it is good that we have not developed and we should not develop, particularly the younger generation. I feel that there is a little too much of hurry and also too much of glamour to become a Member of a Legislature or of Parliament. Maybe, one has to get a little more of training, of toughening, if necessary, of persuasion, of going to the people, getting them into a mood which may be correct, but which may be against the mood in which they find themselves at that moment. There are occasions like that when you are not really riding on a wave, but you have to tell the people the truth. All these come by our own *Sadhana* in the field and only then we will be ready for Parliament. The legislative part of Parliament is extremely important. We are so much in the hands of the draftsmen that we do not see the difficulties that come in, the pitfalls that are there in every piece of legislation, and unless the legislature is careful, whatever he legislates is likely to be either set aside or to be found *ultra vires* the Constitution, which means so much of labour lost. So, we have to have multifarious talents, we have to have a certain tenacity, we have to have a certain peace of mind and also presence of mind. So, all these make up a parliamentarian and we have our stint here. We leave the House. We may come back, we may not come back, we may be working elsewhere, but, in any case, public life itself is something like a *Sadhana* a penance which a person voluntarily undertakes to do. No one forces you to do. He voluntarily undertakes to do, I wish this part, this phase of public life, this aspect of public life, had been acknowledged a little more than it is being done at the moment. For this non-acknowledgement also, we have to see whether we are responsible, and if so, to what extent. So, in this continuing phase, in this continuing process of democracy we come and go, but we must see that we do not sully the process and the democracy, the democratic process should be as pure, as

effective and as enlightening as our founding fathers of the Constitution wanted it.

In the end, Sir, I would like to wish all the retiring Members success in whatever else they might be doing. At the same time, I would like to welcome the Members who have been re-elected and some of them will be taking their seats later. On this happy plus sad note let us part as friends as we have always been. This public life, service to the country, is something in which a man can appear in many, many capacities and I am sure we will be meeting at some point of time at some place in some other context always and that is how we would like to be friends always. Thank you very much.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Mr. Prime Minister.

I may remind the Members that there will be a group photograph of Members and Ministers at 4.00 P.M. in the lawn near the Chamber and a function at 7.00 P.M. followed by dinner in the Parliament House Annexe today.

I thank all the Members. Now I adjourn the House to meet at 11.00 A.M. tomorrow.

The House then adjourned at seven minutes past two of the clock till eleven of the clock on Friday, the 8th March, 1996.