

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PETROLEUM AND NATURAL GAS (SHRI T.R. BALU): Madam, I lay on the Table—

I. A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following Reports, under clause (1) of article 151 of the Constitution:—

- (i) Report of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India Union Government No. 19 (Commercial) of 1995—Pricing of Petroleum Products in the Wake of Economic Liberalisation.

[Placed in Library. See No. LT-369/96]

- (ii) Report of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India Union Government No. 20 (Commercial) of 1995—Indian Oil Corporation Limited (Refineries and Pipelines)

[Placed in Library. See No. LT-366/96]

- (iii) Report of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India Union Government No. 23 (Commercial) of 1995—Single Buoy Mooring for Export of Natural Gas Liquid and Import of Liquefied Petroleum Gas (Oil and Natural Gas Corporation Limited).

[Placed in Library. See No. LT-367/96]

- (iv) Report of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India Union Government No. 24 (Commercial) of 1995—Indian Oil Corporation Limited (Marketing Division and International Trade).

[Placed in Library. See No. LT-368/96]

II. A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following Notifications of the Ministry of Petroleum and Natural Gas, under sub-section (6) of section 3 of the Essential Commodities Act, 1955:—

- (1) S.O. No. 471 (E), dated the 2nd July, 1996 publishing the Light Diesel Oil (Fixation of Ceiling Prices) (Amendment) Order, 1996;

- (2) S.O. No. 472 (E), dated the 2nd July, 1996 publishing the Furnace Oil (Fixation of Ceiling Prices and Distribution) (Amendment) Order, 1996;

- (3) S.O. No. 473 (E), dated the 2nd July, 1996 publishing the Paraffin Wax (Supply, Distribution and Price Fixation) (Amendment) Order, 1996;

[Placed in Library. See No. LT-505/96]

Notification of the Border Roads Development Board

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF DEFENCE (SHRI N.V.N. SOMU): Madam, I lay on the Table, under Article 309 of the Constitution of India, a copy (in English and Hindi) of the Border Roads Development Board, Notification G.S.R. No. 247, dated the 8th June, 1996 publishing the General Reserve Engineer Force Group 'C' and Group 'D' Recruitment (Amendment) Rules, 1996. [Placed in Library See No. 356/96.]

REPORT OF THE DEPARTMENT-RELATED PARLIAMENTARY STANDING COMMITTEE ON COMMERCE

DR. MANMOHAN SINGH (Assam): Madam, I present the Twenty-sixth Report (in English and Hindi) of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Commerce, on Demands for Grants 1996-97 of Department of Commerce (Ministry of Commerce).

REPORTS OF THE DEPARTMENT-RELATED PARLIAMENTARY STANDING COMMITTEE ON HUMAN RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT

DR. (SHRIMATI) BHARATI RAY (West Bengal): Madam, I present a copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following reports of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing

Committee on Human Resource Development:—

- (i) Forty-first Report on the Private Universities (Establishment and Regulation) Bill, 1995 which was presented to the Chairman, Rajya Sabha on the 26th March, 1996 when the House was not in session; and
- (ii) Forty-second Report on Demands for Grants 1996-97 of the Department of Indian Systems of Medicine and Homoeopathy (Ministry of Health and Family Welfare).

RE:REPORTS OF THE DEPARTMENT-RELATED PARLIAMENTARY STANDING COMMITTEE ON INDUSTRY

MISS SAROJ KHAPARDE (Maharashtra) : Madam Deputy Chairman, I thank you very much for giving me this opportunity. I want to raise a point of order regarding laying of this reports on the Table of the House.

उपसभापति : क्या आप रिपोर्ट ले करने के लिए खड़ी हुई है?

कुमारी सरोज खापर्डे : इससे पहले मुझे कुछ कहना है।

उपसभापति : अशोक मित्रा जी को ले करना है।

MISS SAROJ KHAPARDE: Regarding this Committee, I want to say something.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Okay. I thought that you want to lay the report.

MISS SAROJ KHAPARDE: About the report, I am going to mention something. I had given a note of dissent to this report on the Demands for Grants of the Ministry of Steel on three paras, which has not been appended to this report by the Chairman of the Committee. It is an utter violation of sub-rule (3) of the rule 274 of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of the Business in the Rajya Sabha.

Madam, I would like to bring to your kind notice that, only yesterday I was

informed by the Chairman of the Committee through a letter that he had rejected my note of dissent and inserted a para in the report to that effect but without waiting for my reply. He has gone ahead to present this report. So, I request for your ruling over this issue and demand that he should not be permitted to present this report because under sub-rule (3) of this rule the dissenting note has to be appended to the report.

Madam, the Chairman of the Committee has no authority to either reject or dilute a note of dissent. But in this case, rule 274 has been thrown to the wind. Therefore, this report cannot be presented without my dissenting note. He should not be permitted to present this report. I request the Chair to direct the Chairman of the Committee to come with a dissenting note before the House. Madam, I would like to know your ruling on this matter.

SYED SIBTEY RAZI (Uttar Pradesh) : Madam, I think this is a very serious matter. We have been working in the Standing Committee. It is the right of a Member to make a dissenting note. (Interruptions). The Chairman has no right to reject the dissenting note submitted by any Member.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am seized of the matter. Let me find out what Mr. Ashok Mitra has to say. I have listened to the person who has made the dissenting note or observation. Let me see what Mr. Ashok Mitra has to say.

SHRI ASHOK MITRA (West Bengal): Madam, the Standing Committee consisted of 43 Members. And the Draft Report was discussed exhaustively by all the 43 Members in session. They authorised the Chairman of the Committee to prepare a draft document. That draft document was presented for discussion before the full Committee. About certain paragraphs in the Draft Report, Madam Khaparde had sent me a letter. The letter had three points to make. Firstly, there was a