

West Bengal Legislative

taken by them. Nobody takes notice of that. I have repeatedly urged at the level of the Lt. Governor that this money should be given to the State of Delhi because the money is re-invested in that State. But nobody listens. Therefore, the issue is, apart from what the other Members have said, it should also be considered whether the money which is obtained out of conversion charges, ground rents and leases should be given by the Central Government back to the Union Territory so that it is utilised for the people of Delhi. Already, the population of Delhi has gone up to 110 lakhs. What are we going to do if the situation goes on like this?

Thank you very much, Sir.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SURESH PACHOURI): Mr. Gopal-samy. Not present. Mr. Nilotpal Basu... (Interruptions)

प्रो० विजय कुमार मल्होत्रा : उसका क्या हुआ जो मैंने उठाया था दिल्ली के प्लान के बारे में ? 8—9 दिन रह गये हैं इन 8—9 दिनों में क्या होगा ? प्राइम मिनिस्टर और होम मिनिस्टर एक्शर कर चुके हैं ।

Some Minister should come forward and respond... (Interruptions)

उसका हुआ क्या ? (व्यवधान)...

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर : मुझे लगता है ब्यूरोक्रेसी कर रहे हैं । व्यवधान) सरकार को एक्शरेंस देना चाहिए ।

प्रो० विजय कुमार मल्होत्रा : दिल्ली के चीफ मिनिस्टर से कह दिया, प्राइम मिनिस्टर ने कह दिया, प्रणब मुखर्जी ने कह दिया । (व्यवधान) यह कहा से आयेगा ?

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री सुरेश पचौरी) : आपकी फीलिंग कन्वे कर दोगे । (व्यवधान)

Telecommunication

PROF. VIJAY KUMAR MALHOTRA: Sir, let some Minister respond.

इस बारे में कोई डिप्टिचन होना चाहिए । (व्यवधान) यहाँ मिनिस्टर बैठे हुए हैं उनकी तरफ से कोई जवाब आना चाहिए । (व्यवधान) ।

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA): Sir, the Home Minister is not here. We can convey their sentiments to the Home Minister... (Interruptions)...

श्री बागदीश 'साद' माथुर : सेंटिमेंट कन्वे करने की बात नहीं है । गवर्नमेंट की कई भीटिंग हो चुकी हैं... (व्यवधान)

श्री चतुरानन मिश्र (बिहार) : मैं अपने को एसोशिएट करता हूँ । दिल्ली का मामला है इस पर गम्भीरता से विचार करना चाहिए ।

RE: DISHONOURING OF THE WEST BENGAL STATE LEGISLATURE BY THE DEPARTMENT OF TELECOMMUNICATIONS

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU (West Bengal): Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, the issue which I would like to raise is a very important one.

In fact, with a heavy heart, I am raising this issue. The issue pertains to the federal character of this country and to the very blatant violation by the Government of the principles of federal functioning. Sir, as you know, for a better functioning of the Department of Telecommunications, Telephone Advisory Committees have been formed by the Department of Telecommunications. Government of India, Now, in the constitution of these Committees, there is a component of nomination of elected MLAs of the

West Bengal Legislative

respective circles. As far as formation of the Calcutta Telephone Advisory Committee is concerned, on 9th May, 1994, a communication was sent to the West Bengal Assembly asking the Speaker to nominate four Members to the Calcutta Telephone Advisory Committee. A reminder to this effect was again sent to the Assembly on the 16th of May. On 27th May, the Secretary of the West Bengal Legislative Assembly, on behalf of the Speaker, intimated to the Telecommunication Department that four MLAs, three MLAs belonging to the Left Front and one MLA belonging to the Congress Party, would be nominated in the MLAs quota of the Telephone Advisory Committee. On 25th August, the Assembly again gave a reminder to the Telecom Department stating that out of those recommended by the Speaker, two MLAs belonging to the Left Front had not received any intimation from them. Subsequently, on 23rd November, i.e., three months after the reminder of the Assembly of the 25th August, the Telecom Department wrote a letter to the West Bengal Assembly stating that seven MLAs had been nominated. But of these seven MLAs, six MLAs belong to the Congress-I and one belongs to the Left Front. Here I am not drawing your attention to the numerical composition of the West Bengal Assembly. Everybody knows the way we are represented in the Rajya Sabha. From this, everybody knows the representation of the Left Front and the Congress-I in the West Bengal Assembly. We have forwarded the recommendations of the Speaker of the Assembly and from Delhi, the Department of Telecommunications had sent these amendments. They asked us to send four names and we sent four names. Seven people are nominated and six of them belong to

Telecommunication

the Congress-I and the remaining one belongs to the Left Front. The Department of Telecommunications mentioned that one of the names recommended was not existing in the list of MLAs of the West Bengal Assembly. One particular Congress-I MLA, Shri Somendar Chatterjee, informed the DOT that he had been nominated. The entire thing was done in the most non-transparent manner. Not only this, it involves the dignity of the Legislative Assembly. This is the Council of States, We are talking of co-operation. We are talking in terms of honouring the federal set-up in this country. We are recognising the fact that there are political forces in different parts of the country running the Governments. The issue which I have raised is a very serious issue. The point is, how has this happened? The point is, we want to know the names of people in other categories who are on the Telecom Advisory Committee. There are other people from social service, doctors, etc. In one form or the other known Congress-I loyalists are being nominated to the Advisory Committee under different categories. We want the Government to react to this. We want the Government to find out from the Ministry of Telecommunications how this has happened. I don't know if it is the kind of treatment that the State Assemblies are going to get. I think this is an issue which should be considered cutting across the party lines because it concerns the dignity and honour of the Parliamentary system as such. When the recommendations of the Speaker can be trampled upon so blatantly, I don't know what happens tomorrow to the dignity and powers of the Legislative Assemblies. They will also stand dishonoured. Mr. Vice-Chairman, the Minister should react. The issue calls for a specific reply and a specific condemnation by all cutting across the party lines. I would like the other Members also to respond to this cutting across the party lines.

West Bengal Legislative

SHRI S. VIDUTHALAI VIRUMBI (Tamil Nadu): Mr. Vice-Chairman, I am not accusing anybody. The issue cropped up because the Government has not framed any norms in respect of nominations. If some norms were framed in regard to nominations to the Advisory Committees, this would not have happened... (*Interruptions*) What I feel is that the Government should come forward and give an assurance to this nation through this august House that they are going to frame some norms by which nominations would be made to the Advisory Committees. Otherwise, problems like this will continue to occur... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI T. A. MOHAMMED SAQHY: (Tamil Nadu): Mr. Vice-Chairman, this problem is not confined to the Advisory Committees only. Even at the district level, the sitting MPs are not involved. Only the Congress-I people are involved. The Members of Rajya Sabha are also left out of the district level committees... (*Interruptions*)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SURESH PACHOURI): Please take your seat... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI S. VIDUTHALAI VIRUMBI: Mr. Vice-Chairman, there is no response from the Government. Even on important issues, the Government would not like to respond. It is not fair. Unless and until some norms are framed, this menace will continue for ever... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA: Mr. Vice-Chairman, I am not talking... (*Interruptions*)

DR. BIPLAB DASGUPTA: Mr Vice-Chairman, may I make a small point?... (*Interruptions*)

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA): Mr. Vice-Chairman

Telecommunication

Sir, I am not talking about what has happened in this case because I am not competent to talk of MLAs... (*Interruptions*)... One minute. I cannot respond to the present issue. But I think it is very unfair on the part of the Members of Parliament to say that they had not been included because I had personally looked into this aspect. I can say this with confidence because I had personally gone through the nominations of the Members of Parliament to various District Telephone Committees. And, in every case where there is a local MP, his name is there... (*Interruptions*)

PROF. VIJAY KUMAR MALHOTRA: Not in Delhi?

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA: We have done it even in Delhi. There are six zones I think. We have put the local MPs in the Committees. In many cases, like in the case of Punjab, where we found that there was no local MP... (*Interruptions*)... where the local MP of the Rajya Sabha was not there in a particular constituency, the MP residing the adjoining constituency was nominated for that area.

PROF. VIJAY KUMAR MALHOTRA: Even Rajya Sabha Members?

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA: Even Rajya Sabha Members... (*Interruptions*). Please listen to me... (*Interruptions*)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SURESH PACHOURI): Let her complete (*Interruptions*)

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA: Let me finish. Do not interrupt. In some constituencies, where there are two or three MPs, one has been nominated. We have ensured that every political party of that particular State has been given equal representation—may be, one in one District, and in the other. I have made sure

West Bengal Legislative

of this because I have personally seen the list of nominations of MPs to these Telephone Committees... (Interruptions)...

SHRI SATYA PRAKASH MALAVIYA: What about U.P.? (Interruptions)

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर . राज्य सभा के मੈम्बर्स का नहीं दिया गया है (अवधान)

उपसभाध्यक्ष (मुरेश पचौरी) उन्होंने कहा है जो रह गये हैं उसको देखेंगे । (अवधान)

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA: I want to say that there are two Members of the Lok Sabha and one of the Rajya Sabha on each one of these committees. So, each Rajya Sabha Member, who belongs to that area, has been nominated to the Committee. But if there are three or four Members from one area, only one of them has been nominated. (Interruptions). I am prepared to show the list to the leaders of all the political parties here and satisfy them ... (Interruptions)

PROF. VIJAY KUMAR MALHOTRA: Please do.

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA: I have personally seen to this. (Interruptions)

SHRI ASHOK MITRA (West Bengal): Mr. Vice-Chairman, I have great admiration for the Minister of State for Parliamentary Affairs But what she just said has no relevance to what my colleague .. (Interruptions)

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA: No. I said that I am going into.. (Interruptions)

SHRI ASHOK MITRA: I have listened to you. Why can't you, Madam, listen to me for a couple of minutes?

It is a very specific problem and complaint which my colleague, Shri

Telecommunication

Nilotpal Basu, has raised. A gross misdoing on the part of Ministry of Communications has been performed. What is it that is 'specific'? That is the point. I am just trying an analogy. There are 16 Members from West Bengal in the Rajya Sabha, of which 15 belong to the Left Front and one to the Congress Party. And, what has been done for representing the Members of Rajya Sabha from West Bengal is that you pick up a ruling party Member and ignore the other 15.

You take the composition of the West Bengal Assembly. Out of 294 Members, only 40 belong to the ruling party at the Centre. Out of these 40 Members, 6 are nominated to the Telephone Committee.

Those people who do not represent the people of West Bengal are being put on this Telephone Committee.

If this the way you want to govern, then this country cannot be held together. This is not the way to run a federal policy. You must respect the sentiments of the people of a particular State. Otherwise, this country will disintegrate.

I would, therefore, still appeal to the Minister of Parliamentary Affairs to have a discussion with the Minister for Communications and set right the grave wrong that has been done to the people of West Bengal. Otherwise, even the single representation that you have from West Bengal in Rajya Sabha will dwindle down to zero.

SHRI T. A. MOHAMMED SAQHY: Sir, I want to clear what the Minister has said just now. I want to go on record. In North Arcot Ambedkar district, there is a district committee wherein there are two MPs. One is Mr. R. Jeevarathnam, and the other Shri Akbar Pasha; both are Lok Sabha Members. I am the Rajya Sabha Member from there. My name is not being included. That

West Bengal Legislative

is a fact. Sir, throughout Tamil Nadu there is no Rajya Sabha Member in these Committees.

श्रीमती सरला माहेश्वरी (पश्चिमी बंगाल) : माननीय उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, माननीय नीलोत्पल बसु ने जो प्रश्न उठाया था वह हमारे देश की संसदीय जनतांत्रिक व्यवस्था से जुड़ा हुआ है और जनतांत्रिक व्यवस्था सुनिश्चित कायदे-कानूनों के अनुसार चलती है। तो यहां पर हमारे दूरसंचार विभाग द्वारा जो कार्यवाही की गई वह निश्चित रूप में संसदीय जनतांत्रिक तौर-तरीके के अनुरूप नहीं है। उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, पहले तो दूर संचार विभाग द्वारा पश्चिमी बंगाल की विधान सभा के अध्यक्ष को एक पत्र दिया जाता है और उनसे नाम मांगे जाते हैं कि आप चार नाम दीजिए और जब वह चार नाम भेज देते हैं तो उन चारों नामों को खारिज करके दूर संचार विभाग अपनी तरफ से एक अलग नामों का पैल भेजता है जिसमें 6 नाम सत्तारूढ़ पार्टी के नहीं, बल्कि विपक्ष की पार्टी के जिसके सदन में 294 के हाउस में सिर्फ 40 सदस्य संख्या विपक्ष की पार्टी की है। उसके 6 सदस्यों को नामांकित किया जाता है। यह कौन सी संसदीय जनतांत्रिक व्यवस्था है और किस आधार पर दूर संचार विभाग में इतना साहस हुआ कि वह पश्चिम बंगाल विधान सभा के अध्यक्ष द्वारा भेजे गए नामों की सिफारिश को रद्दी की टोकरी में फेंक देता है? मैं समझना चाहती हूं महोदय, हमारे यहां पर कई साधियों ने यह सवाल उठाया कि उनका नाम नहीं है, उनका नाम नहीं है। यह भी बात उठी कि नामर्ज नहीं बने हुए। मैं यह जानना चाहती हूं कि नामर्ज बने हुए हैं या नहीं यह तो बात इतर है लेकिन यह तो संसदीय जनतांत्रिक प्रणाली का नामर्ज हमारी परिपाटियों में ही बला आ रहा है, कम से कम विधान सभा का अध्यक्ष अगर नामों की सिफारिश भेजता है तो निश्चित रूप में उसके नामों की सिफारिश को अहमियत दी जाएगी।

मैं संसदीय मंत्री से यह चाहूंगी कि इस तरह का काम दूर संचार विभाग ने

Telecommunication

कैसे किया इसकी जांच करेगी और सदन को भी इस बात की रिपोर्ट देगी और पश्चिमी बंगाल की विधान सभा के अध्यक्ष को भी इस बात की रिपोर्ट देगी।

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA (West Bengal): Sir, this is an affront. This is an insult to the West Bengal Legislature. As most of my friends have been saying, this is absolutely an insult. You ask the Legislature to nominate and then if you exclude, that is not correct. The Speaker represents the collective wisdom of the Legislature in the same way our Presiding Officers here do. If you ask the Speaker, you ask the Assembly indirectly and if you exclude, then that is definitely an insult to the Legislature. It should be a matter of concern for all of us. It is not a question which party is in power. It is an insult to our system.

Secondly, Sir Calcutta Telephones had been out of gear for a long time, of gear. Sir...

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY (Pondicherry): The employees are involved in trade-unions. The employees are from the CPM party itself.

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Sir if there is any problem with the trade unions we are ready to discuss with Mr. Narayanasamy because he is also having trade unions somewhere. We are ready to discuss. But, that is not the issue, Sir. It is the mismanagement, mismanagement at the top. There has been a persistent charge of corruption against senior people. We have been saying it and everybody knows it. It is a fact that Calcutta was without a director and even the company that was given the responsibility, ran away with the money. I am only saying this because it is

Explosions

only the other side, it is only another aspect of the total mismanagement and absolute absence of any rule. Therefore, Sir, I take this opportunity to ask the Government to take steps to ensure discipline in the management of West Bengal Telephones as well as to take up with the Ministry of Communications why abuse and insult has been hurled on the Legislature of West Bengal.

RE: SERIES OF EXPLOSIONS
THAT TOOK PLACE IN NEW
DELHI

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY (Andhra Pradesh): Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, I wish to draw the attention of the House to the series of blasts that took place last night in Delhi. It is very important to note that they took place in the heart of Delhi, i.e., in and around Connaught Place. Nobody knows for sure the cause of these blasts. Sir, it is generally presumed that clogging of some methane gas in the sewer pipeline causes explosion but the Police did not preclude the possibility of a foul play. I think, the Government should have come forward and made a *suo motu* statement. Even though the Government has failed to do so, I would still demand that the Government should respond with a statement on the question just now raised.

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथूर : (उत्तर प्रदेश) : उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, यह तो सौभाग्य था कि एक्सप्लोजन रात्रि को हुआ। यदि यह दिन में हुआ होता तो बहुत सी जानें जातीं। यह सच भी है, जैसा माननीय जयपाल रेड्डी जी ने कहा। संदेह यह किया जा रहा है कि यह कोई गैस थी और उसमें कहीं बिजली का तार फंस गया। अब एक ही समय में एक साथ कई जगह से गैस फूटे तो इसमें संदेह होना स्वाभाविक है और खासकर उस समय कि जब लगभग इसी प्रकार की

जापात की एक दुर्घटना के बारे में अभी हमने समाचार पढ़ा है। यह अत्यन्त आवश्यक है कि एक इन्क्वायरी की जाये साइंटिफिक तरीके से, कि वास्तव में यह मीथेन गैस है या अन्य कुछ और है।

उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, इस अवसर पर मैं एक बात और कहना चाहूंगा। यह नई दिल्ली म्युनिसिपल कमेटी का एरिया है, जिसमें यह दुर्घटना हुई है। और दुर्भाग्य यह है कि इस नई दिल्ली म्युनिसिपल कमेटी में कोई भी पापुलर रिप्रजेंटेटिव है ही नहीं। जो नया एक्ट बनाया है, उसमें वहां का लोकल एम.एल.ए. नहीं है, लोकसभा के मੈम्बर को स्वीकार किया गया है, राज्य सभा के मੈम्बर जो उस क्षेत्र में रहते हैं उनको रखा नहीं है। तो ऐसे अवसरों पर जब आम आदमी की जान खतरे में होती है तो इसके लिए जिम्मेदार कौन होगा? क्या उसका संरक्षण केवल ब्यूरोक्रेट करेंगे? यह तो नई दिल्ली म्युनिसिपल कमेटी का कानून बना है, उसमें जो पापुलर रिप्रजेंटेटिव है उनमें किसी को भी इसमें सदस्य रखा नहीं गया है, उनके बारे में सोचा जाना चाहिए और उनको स्वीकार किया जाना चाहिए। उसमें उस क्षेत्र का जो राज्य सभा का मੈम्बर हो, लोकसभा का मੈम्बर हो, एम.एल.ए. हो, उनको स्वीकार किया जाना चाहिए। जो ब्यूरोक्रेट बैठे हैं, मैं नाम नहीं लेना चाहता, नई दिल्ली म्युनिसिपल कमेटी के जो चेयरमैन हैं, उनके सामने कौन आम आदमी कैसे जाएगा? उनसे कौन बात करेगा? अतः यह अवसर है कि इस पर रिकंसीडर किया जाए। साथ ही इस दुर्घटना की जांच की जाए और अगर संभव हो तो आज सदन में वह सारी जानकारी, जो केन्द्र सरकार के पास है, एकत्र कर हम लोगों को दी जाए।

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, you may kindly direct the Government to give a statement. By Monday it should be able to give a statement.

SHRI JAGDISH PRASAD MATHUR: Why Monday? Even today they can do it. It is a local affair.