

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE : We also successfully resisted concerted moves to extend the period of integration of textile trade from 10 to 15 years by taking a strong position on the issue. (*Interruptions*). The Standing Committee attached to the Commerce Ministry which had gone into the implications of the Dunkel Draft in great detail has recommended in its report, that while all efforts should be made to safeguard India's interests in key sectors of agriculture, textiles, services and Intellectual Property Rights, at the end of the day, India should remain a part of a multilateral trading system rather than opting out the same and getting totally isolated from the rest of the world. (*Interruptions*).

On the whole it is our considered judgement that India has more to benefit from the expansion of world trade through the Uruguay Round Agreement rather than pursuing any alternative course of action. (*Interruptions*).

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SYED SIBTEY RAZI) : I adjourn the House till 3.30 P. M.

The House then adjourned at forty-four minutes past two of the clock.

The House reassembled at thirty-two minutes past three of the clock, [The Deputy Chairman in the Chair].

RE-DEMAND FOR STATEMENT BY PRIME MINISTER REGARDING GATT—contd.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : There is no Commerce Minister. There is no Prime Minister. Is the Home Minister going to answer our questions on Dunkel? (*Interruptions*). Please adjourn the House till the Prime Minister comes. There is no Commerce Minister also.

उपसभापति: आप लोग जरा बैठिए, वह बोल रहे है ... (व्यवधान) यह कुछ बोलना चाह रहे है ... (व्यवधान)

श्री मोहम्मद अफजल उर्फ मौम अफजल : प्रधानमंत्री को यहां जाना चाहिए। यह देश का सवाल है, आजादी का सवाल है ... (व्यवधान) कहा है प्रधानमंत्री ... (व्यवधान)

شری محمد افضل عرف موم افضل :
پر دھان منتری کو یہاں آنا چاہیے ہے
دیش کا سوال ہے۔ آزادی کا سوال ہے۔
... مداخلت ... کہاں ہیں پر دھان
منتری ... مداخلت ...

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : You must rule on the fact ... (*Interruptions*).

SHRI SUKOMAL SEN : You call the Prime Minister or adjourn the House. How can a Minister make a statement without circulating copies? (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : You ask him for clarifications. Here is the Commerce Minister.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : No statement has been circulated.

SHRI G. G. SWELL (Meghalaya) : The statement of the Commerce Minister was not circulated.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : The statement was not circulated. Therefore, it cannot be taken as read. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI MD. SALIM (West Bengal) : It is not a statement, it is a post-mortem ... (*Interruptions*).

श्री मोहम्मद अफजल उर्फ मौम अफजल :
मैंडम, रूल्स के खिलाफ चेयर के मना करने के
बावजूद कामर्स मिनिस्टर ने अपना स्टेटमेंट यहां
पढ़ने की कोशिश की, जो रिकार्ड पर नहीं गया।
मैंडम, मैं यह जानना चाहता हूँ कि इसका स्टेट-
मेंट रिकार्ड पर गया या नहीं गया ... (व्यवधान)

شری محمد افضل عروت م۔ افضل میڈم

روٹس کے خلاف جیٹر کے منع کرنے کے
بادجورڈ کامرس منسٹر نے اپنا اسٹیٹ منٹ
یہاں پڑھنے کی کوشش کی جو ریکارڈ پر نہیں
گیا۔ میڈم میں یہ جاننا چاہتا ہوں کہ
ان کا اسٹیٹ منٹ ریکارڈ پر کیا گیا یا نہیں
گیا۔ ... مداخلت ...

उपसभापति : आप अपनी जगह पर जाइए
... (व्यवधान)

श्री मोहम्मद अफजल उर्फ मौम अफजल :
यह व्यवस्था का प्रश्न है मैडम। हमारी मांग है
कि यहां पर प्राइम मिनिस्टर आएँ और आकर
बताएं कि उन्होंने क्या किया है। यह काला एग्जी-
मैट जो हुआ है इसका ताल्लुक सिर्फ कामर्स
मिनिस्ट्री से नहीं है। इसका ताल्लुक दूसरी
मिनिस्ट्रियों से भी है और उसके लिए सिर्फ प्राइम
मिनिस्टर रिस्पॉन्सिबल है ... (व्यवधान)

شری محمد افضل عروت م۔ افضل : یہ

ویسٹھاکا پرنسپل ہے میڈم۔ ہماری مانگ
ہے کہ یہاں پر پرائم منسٹر آئیں اور آکر بتائیں
کہ انہوں نے کیا کیا ہے۔ یہ کالا ایگریگیشن
جو ہوا ہے اس کا تعلق صرف کامرس منسٹری
سے نہیں ہے اس کا تعلق دوسری منسٹریوں
سے بھی ہے اور اس کے لئے صرف پرائم منسٹر
ریسپانسبل ہیں۔ ... مداخلت ...

उपसभापति : बैठिए ... (व्यवधान)

श्री मोहम्मद अफजल उर्फ मौम अफजल :
डंकल का काला ट्रीटी है वह ... (व्यवधान)

شری محمد افضل عروت م۔ افضل : ڈंकल کا
کالٹریٹی ہے وہ۔ ... مداخلت ...

उपसभापति : काला पोला जो भी है, वह इसका
जवाब देगे ... (व्यवधान) Mr. Mukherjee
is there. Dunkel is related to Commerce.
He will reply to it. (Interruptions). Please
sit down. (Interruptions).

SHRI S. VIDUTHALAI VIRUMAI
(Tamil Nadu) : This is nothing but a post
mortem report.

श्री मोहम्मद अफजल उर्फ मौम अफजल :
वाशिंगटन वालों को पता नहीं है कि यहाँ रोज़
सभा भी चलती है, स्पीकर नहीं होता है बिबर
मैन होता है। (व्यवधान)

شری محمد افضل عروت م۔ افضل : واشنگٹن
واलों کو پتہ نہیں ہے کہ یہاں راجیہ سبھا
بھی چلتی ہے۔ اسپیکر نہیں ہوتا ہے۔ مداخلت ...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Just a
minute. I will explain.

... (Interruptions) ...

SHRI SATYA PRAKASH MALAVIYA :
This is what is circulated in the House.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I will tell
you about that. ... (Interruptions) ... I
was informed that somebody died in the
family of the gentleman who was dealing
with it and he had to go, and so this has
come. If it is a mistake, you cut out "Mr.
Speaker, Sir" and write "Madam Deputy
Chairman" or whatever it is.

श्री शंकर दयाल सिंह (बिहार) : मैं दूसरी
बात कह रहा हूँ कि हिन्दी की कापी कहाँ है।
मैं जानना चाहता हूँ कि हिन्दी की कापी कब
आएगी? हिन्दी की कापी सदन में आनी चाहिए।
हिन्दी की कापी नहीं आती है तब तक मंत्री जी
... (व्यवधान)

उपसभापति : आ रही हैं। (व्यवधान)

SHRI M. A. BABY (Kerala) : Madam, I am on a point of order. It is very important. Madam, first of all please listen to the point of order.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : Where is the Hindi copy ?

श्री सत्य प्रकाश साल्गीय : इसकी हिन्दी की काफी कहां है ? (व्यवधान)

उपसभापति : अगर आप चुप होंगे तो बता-
वेंगी। (व्यवधान)

Afzal Saheb, go back to your seat, please. Hindi copies are coming. Anyway, those who are asking about Hindi, at least they should speak in Hindi. सुब्रह्मण्यम स्वामी जी आप हिन्दी में बोलिए (व्यवधान)

SHRI M. A. BABY : Madam, I am on a point of order. Already the matter has been brought to your notice that this statement begins with an address, "Mr. Speaker, Sir" (व्यवधान)

उपसभापति : एक-एक करके बोलिए। (व्यवधान)

SHRI M. A. BABY : One minute. Please listen to me. I do not consider it an inadvertent mistake because on the top of it, it is typed, "Rajya Sabha." Madam, it betrays the callous, haphazard and irresponsible manner in which the Ministry functions, and this relates to the role of our representatives in the Geneva discussions. Did they read the proposals properly? Have they been going through the contents? If this is how the Ministry and the Government function, you can well imagine what would be the ... (Interruptions) ... Swamyji, one minute. This betrays the total callousness and carelessness with which our Government is functioning. After having typed "Rajya Sabha," they do not care to go through the text, and the address "Mr. Speaker, Sir" is there. In the same way if our negotiators were conducting themselves in Geneva, you can well imagine how the interests of our country might have been mortgaged. Therefore, We

cannot proceed with this. The Prime Minister himself should come and explain what has happened in Geneva. Our allegation that this Government has been functioning in a most careless manner has already been proved.

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA : What is he talking ? ... (Interruptions) ...

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : Madam, may I make a point of order with your permission ? ... (Interruptions) ...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Everybody, go back to your seats, please.

... (Interruptions) ...

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA : Rather he should feel proud of it. ... (Interruptions) ... आप टाइपोग्राफिक मिस्टेक के लिए इतना बोल रहे हैं। ... (व्यवधान)

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : Madam, I have a point of order. Will you listen to my point of order ? ... (Interruptions)

SHRI M. A. BABY : This is symbolic of the irresponsibility of the Government.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : The Commerce Ministry is dealing with this matter, and the Commerce Minister is here. Members have given their names to ask for clarifications. I will call the name ... (Interruptions)

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : I have a point of order, Madam.

SHRI M. A. BABY : This describes the callousness of this Government. ... (Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Whatever it is, you ask your questions ... (Interruptions)

SHRI M. A. BABY : This is symbolic of the irresponsibility of this Government. This symbolises how this Government would have conducted itself. ... (Interruptions)

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : See page 2. You are seeing page 1. page 2 is totally blank. There is nothing on page 2. They have gone to page 3. ... (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : This is one. This is two. These are three, four and five. Correct.

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM : Page 2 is just blank. Madam.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : It is here. Maybe, your copy is not proper. The copy of the statement with me is correct. (*Interruptions*). You may not have got the correct copy. कापिया दीजिए, फोटोकॉपी बराबर नहीं हुई है।... (*व्यवधान*)

Go back to your place and speak from there ... (*Interruptions*).

SHRI JIBON RAY :*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Now you don't talk of this in this House. I am not allowing it. I am not allowing anything he is saying. It is not going on record. It is not going on record.

SHRI JIBON RAY :*

SHRI G. C. SWELL : The copies are not legible.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Mr. Swell, do you want to ask for clarifications or not?

SHRI G. G. SWELL : How can I ask for clarifications? Kindly read page 2, Madam.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : That page may not have been properly photocopied. You will get a better page.

SHRI G. G. SWELL : We do not have a proper text.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Okay, give him a proper text.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : He gave me two copies. They are the same ... (*Interruptions*).

* Not recorded.

SHRI G. G. SWELL : This is of the Lok Sabha, not Rajya Sabha.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Give him my text. Give it to him.

SHRI G. G. SWELL : You adjourn the House ... (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Mr. Vishvjit Singh, ask for your clarifications.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : You adjourn the House. ... (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : You cannot deprive other Members who want to ask for clarifications; you cannot. They want to ask for clarifications. ... (*Interruptions*).

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : Madam, listen to me. We want the Prime Minister to come.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : They do not want Prime Minister to come.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : We insist upon the Prime Minister's presence. Madam, the Commerce Minister is not competent to answer these questions. They relate to the whole Government. None other than Prime Minister is competent to answer them. ... (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : If Mr. Vishvjit Singh feels that the Commerce Minister is competent to answer his questions, he will put the questions. If you don't want, you may not. ... (*Interruptions*).

SHRI MOHAMMED AFZAL alias MEEM AFZAL : There is no statement on record. ... (*Interruptions*).

SHRI G. G. SWELL : We have not been able to read the statement. How can we seek clarifications?

SHRI MOHAMMED AFZAL alias MEEM AFZAL : Madam, there is no statement on record. Kindly ask the Secretariat whether they have recorded it or not.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : They have recorded it.

SHRI MOHAMMED AFZAL alias MEEM AFZAL : They have not. ... (*Interruptions*).

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : This matter should be clarified by the Prime Minister. How long has the Prime Minister decided to keep away from the House? Why is the Prime Minister not coming to the House? ... (Interruptions).

SHRI M. A. BABY : Madam, the Prime Minister should be summoned. ... (Interruptions).

SHRI JAIPAL REDDY : Why is the Prime Minister fighting shy of the House, Madam? It is not proper. The sovereignty of the nation cannot be bartered away.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I will convey your sentiments (Interruptions). Nothing is going on record. (Interruptions). The great difficulty is that I have not been able to communicate with the Prime Minister. (Interruptions) I said I will convey your wishes. And as long as the Commerce Minister is here, he will answer it. Go back. (Interruptions) Commerce Minister is competent. You go back. (Interruptions). It is the Commerce Minister who should answer. He is the Commerce Minister. He will answer. He is answerable and he is going to sign it. बोलिए (Interruptions). तबतुम, You do not hear. (Interruptions).

श्री अब्दुल अहमद : मडम, अगर किसी भी प्रकार की शंका है माननीय सदस्यों को तो कामर्स मिनिस्टर जवाब देने के लिए तैयार है। कोई भी अगर शंका है किसी प्रकार का ... (व्यवधान) कोई भी सवाल है तो कामर्स मिनिस्टर जवाब देने के लिए तैयार है। ... (व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : It is not going on record. (Interruptions) I will find out. (Interruptions) Go back. (Interrup-

tions). If you do not want to ask for clarifications, I cannot help you. ... (Interruptions) ... You are not interested to know anything. What can I do? ... (Interruptions) ... Go back and put your questions. ... (Interruptions) ... You can put questions to the Government and ask them what they have done. If you stand in the well of the House and make inaudible remarks, you will never know anything. It is better if you go back to your seats and put questions to the Minister. ... (Interruptions). Whatever questions you want to put, you can put to the Minister. ... (Interruptions) ... Please go back, go back. Don't behave like this. It is not proper. Go back, go back, go back, go back. ... (Interruptions) ...

श्री एस० एस० अहलुवालिया : फिर वह नए सिरे से मुल्क को बर्बाद करने के लिए वह आवाज उठाना चाहते हैं। ... (व्यवधान) ... इनसे पूछो जरा, यह क्या करके आए? सारे उद्योगों को बंद करवा दिया ... (व्यवधान) ...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Go back. ... (Interruptions) ... Ask Dunkel. What is he talking? Don't do this. Don't do that. ... (Interruptions) ... Nothing is going on record. I am not allowing. I am not allowing. I won't allow unruly behaviour in this House. ... (Interruptions) ... I am very sorry. ... (Interruptions) ... We are all responsible for the Parliament. I adjourn the House for the day.

The House then adjourned at fifty-three minutes past three of the clock till eleven of the clock on Friday, the 17th December, 1993.