discuss J.P.C. Report on Security Scam

review of the work relating to their construction and repairs has been made during last three years is as under:-

Year	No. of individual bridge work reviewed
1990	33
1991	27
1992	26

Apart from above one work pertaining to repair and rehabilitation of Narmada Bridge was also specifically reviewed during 1992-

; So sho nmings have come to noik the iourse of such review.

Talks between India and Bangladesh In **Inland Waterways**

@3024-A. SHRI H. HANUMAN-THAPPA: Will the Minister of SURFACE TRANSPORT be pleased to state:

- (a) what are the details of talks held between India and Bangladesh regarding inland waterways; and
- (b) what are the follow-up actions taken by both sides?

THE MINISTER OF STATE OF THE MINISTRY OF SURFACE TRANSPORT (SHRI JAGDISH TYTLER): (a) and (b) In accordance with Protocol signed between the Governments of India and Bangladesh on 14.9.1993, the Government of Bangladesh will maintain two specific stretches of waterways to be primarily used by the Indian Transit vessels. For this purpose, it has also been agreed by India to pay a sum of TK 137 lakhs in 1993-94 which has already been paid and TK 150 lakhs is to be paid to Bangladesh in 1994-95. The agreement also provide for sharing of intercountry traffic on 50:50 basis by the two countries. This

@Previously Unstarred Question 3481. transferred from 24th December, 1993.

agreement is effective from 4.10.1993 and shall remain in force upto 3.10.1995.

12 Noon

RE. DEMAND FOR EXTENSION OF CURRENT SESSION TO DISCUSS J.P.C. REPORT ON SECURITY SCAM

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I haVe to inform the Members....

SHRI VIZOL (Nagaland): Madam.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Just a minute. I have to make announcement.

SHRI VIZOL: Madam, I am on a point of order.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will allow you. Will you please sit down for a minute?

I have to inform the Members that we had a Business Advisory Committee meeting today at 10.30. We took the opinion of the Members. There was a desire that we should adjourn the House on 23rd. And I took the view of the leaders of the various political parties and other groups, and they greed that the House should adjourn on 23rd and finish the pending business on the 23rd itself.

SHRI P. UPENDRA (Andhra Pradesh): How can it be?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: This is what the leaders in the Business Advisorv Committee decided. You should ask the

DR. MURLI MANOHAR JOSHI (Uttar Pradesh): We would like that this JPC report should be discussed. And why not extend the session?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I was going to tell you that there was also a demand that the Report of the JPC regarding the scam which was laid on the Table of the House should be discussed. So, it was agreed that we will discuss it tomorrow, and, we can sit till late in the evening as long as we do not finish our business of discussion.

(Interruptions)

SHRI P. UPENDRA: The House has been called up to 24th. The House has to approve it.

fie: Demand for ext.

of current session to

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: This is a decision of the Business Advisory Committee. (Interruptions) Mr. Upendra, you were a Minister for Parliamentary Affairs. You know that it is the Business Advisory Committee which gives the advice. And there are Members... (Interruptions)

DR. MURLI MANOHAR JOSHI: The best course would bo to extend the session rather than to adjourn and discuss it in a lackadaisical manner. The best thing would be that we extend the session.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That also was taken into account.

DR. MURLI MANOHAR JOSHI: We can sit on Monday and Tuesday...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It was also discussed. And in the present circumstances, it was not possible. So, I would say that now that matter is closed.

SHRI M.A. BABY (Kerala): May I make a submission, Madam?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let the Papers be laid on the Table.

SHRI M.A. BABY: Madam, the National Cultural Policy was also listed. Now the scam has become the national culture. But my submission is that we should discuss both.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: If you like to discuss, we will sit late.

(Interruptions)

DR. MURLI MANOHAR JOSHI: The House may be adjourned for three days and...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: suggestion came. The Members of the various parties, leaders and representatives of the various political parties were there. But it was not accepted. So, let us go ahead...

DR. MURLI MANOHAR JOSHI: We

cannot do justice to this Report. This is a historic Report and it should be discussed in all its aspects. And I would plead that the session be extended or a special session be called in the first week of January.

SHRI DIENSHBHAI TRIVEDI: (Gujarat): Madam, if the session cannot be extended, we can have a special session in the first week of

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: We had never in the past...(Interruptions) Please let me put one thing very clear. (Interruptions) Just a minute, please. We are having new precedents and new procedures started. Never before the decision of the Business Advisory Committee was discussed.

SHRI P. UPENDRA: Madam, I am on a point of order. The session has been called up to 24th. The House has to approve it. The BAC cannot take a decision...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Upendra, please.

(Interruptions)

AN HON. MEMBER: What about JPC Report?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: We are discussing it tomorrow.

DR. MURLI MANOHAR JOSHI: We find that something new has happened in the country, and a new thing has to be started.

SHRI P. UPENDRA: Madam, I am on a point of order.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let the papers be laid on the Table.

MORARKA SHRI KAMAI. (Rajasthan): Madam, I want a clarification. This is a JPC report. This is a report of Parliament. Tomorrow if we start discussing it, will the Government make a statement on action taken against the people who have been indicated in the report? Are they only for a discussion on the report? There is nothing to discuss

322

in the report. That is our report. There is nothing to discuss about it. We want to know from the Government what action the Government is taking against the Ministers who have been indicted in the report...(Inerruptions.) I don't think we can discuss the report as such.

Re: Demand for ext.

of current session to

DR. MURLI MANOHAR JOSHI: We would demand action also on the report.

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM (Andhra Pradesh): Will the Government make its position clear? (Interruptions.)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am not going to allow a discussion on the report today itself.

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM: Madam, try to understand our point.

DEPUTY THE CHAIRMAN: understand.

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM: Let the Government make its position clear.... (Interruptions.)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: One person at a time.

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: Madam, my point of order is that the reports of Parliamentary Committees are never discussed in the House. The Public Accounts Committee and the Estimates Committee day in and day out are giving reports which are tabled in the Parliament. ..(Interruptions.)

V NARAYANASAMY (Pondicherry): This is a Joint Committee. Others are Standing Committee. Let him understand the difference.

MORARKA: KAMAL Narayanasamy, I can never match your ignorance. Just wait for a minute. The Public Accounts Committee is also a Joint Committee; the Committee on Public Undertakings is also Joint Committee. This was a special Committee on one subject. I do not think it is proper for Parliament to start a discussion on the report because nobody can criticise the report. It is a unanimous report of the Joint Committee. What can

we discuss about it? We only want to know from the Government as to what action they are taking on the report, if any.

SHRI V. NARAYANASMY: we discussed the report on Bofors. (Interruptions.)

SHRI VITHALRAO MADHAVRAO JADHAV (Maharashtra): Madam,....

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Are you replying to the point of order, Mr. Jadhav?

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: Madam, my submission on a point of Parliamentary procedure is, we will be sitting a wrong precedent if we start criticising our own report. We cannot have a discussion on the report. What is required is, the Government must announce the removal of the Ministers who have been indicted in the report and make its position clear. Unless the Government is willing to do that, I do not think we can have any discussion on the

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Regarding the point of order raised by the hon. Member, the special Committee was constituted for it and that is the reason why whenever Members wanted to raise any matter ralating to the scam, we always said and the Government said that till the Committee's report comes, we cannot take up that issue because the matter is- before the Committee. It was the desire of the Members. Now if the Members do not want to discuss, it is again their desire.

KAMAL MORARKA: Members cannot make the rules. This is the position.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It was a demand

विपक्ष के नेता (श्री सिकन्दर बख्त): सदर साहिबा, जे॰पी॰सी॰ की रिपोर्ट आई है और कमल मोराका साहब ने जो मतालबा किया है कि गवर्नमेंट क्या कर रही है जे॰पी॰सी॰ की उस रिपोर्ट पुर, क्या जिन मिनिस्टिस के खिलाफ डायरेक्ट एनडाइटमेंट है. क्या वे

on Security Scam

[श्री सिकन्दर बख्त]

रिजाइन कर रहे हैं या प्राइम मिनिस्टर साहब उनको अपनी कैबिनेट से निकाल रहे हैं? वह सीधी बात है और डिस्कसन के बाद उन पर दूसरी किस्म की बात है।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That is onot my prerogative. . That is Government's prerogative. That is not my .responsibility.

श्री प्रमोद महाजन (महाराष्ट्र): उपसभापति महोदया, प्रधान मंत्री ने लाल किले पर यह कहा था कि जे॰पी॰सी॰ की रिपोर्ट में अगर किसी मंत्री की कोई आलोचना होती है तो सबसे बड़े आदमी को भी में बख्संगा नहीं। यह उन्होंने लाल किले पर कहा था। श्री बीरेन जे॰ शाह (महाराष्ट्र): दोनों हाऊस में भी कहा था।(व्यवद्यान)....

श्री प्रमोद महाजनः मैडम, उन्होंने दोनों हाऊस में कहा था। इतना ही नहीं, उन्होंने पत्रकार परिषद में भी कहा था जिनके नाम आएंगे वह मेरी कैबिनेट में नहीं रहेंगे और उन्होंने कहा था पत्रकारों से कि(व्य-बधान) मैं प्रधानमंत्री की बात बता रहा हूं, उन्होंने कहा था कि कल इसको बाक्स आइटम में आप छापिए कि वह मंत्री नहीं रहेगा, जिसकी जे॰सी॰पी॰ आलोचना करेगी।(व्यवधान).... हिन्दुस्तान के इतिहास में पहली बार,(व्यवधान).... आप जरा अहल्वालिया जी को पुछिए, हिन्दुस्तान के इतिहास में पहली बार वित मंत्री पर, पेट्रोलियम मिनिस्टर पर, वित्त राज्यमंत्री पर एक मत से, कांग्रेस और सभी सदस्यों ने मिलकर, सिक्युरिटी स्कैम में आरोप लगाया है।(व्यवधान).... क्या प्रधानमंत्री ने जो लाल किले से देश को वचन दिया था, उस बचन के अनुसार प्रधानमंत्री इन मंत्रियों को कैबिनेट से बाहर निकाल रहे हैं?(व्यवधान)....

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: N< Papers to be laid on the Tale of House. (Interruptions)

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY (And Pradesh): Madam, I have a submission make. (Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I not allowing anything on this matter am not allowing anything. (Interruptio Papers to be laid on the Table of i House. (Interruptions) Whate! Members want to say, they can co after I go to my chamber and discuss 1 matter. (Interruptions)

SHRI SIKANDER BAKHT: Mada with regard to the business of the Hou you made an announcement that this is be taken up

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: TI was discussed in the Business Advise Committee. Your Member was thei (Interruptions)

SHRI DINESHBHAI TRIVEDI: I the Government react, Madai (Interruptions)

डा॰ मुरली मनोहर जोशी: इस मांग पर आप र कहना चाहती हैं, जो हमारी ओर से यह कहा जा रहा कि सरकार इस पर अपनी प्रतिक्रिया व्यक्त कं(व्यवधान)....

उपसभापति: इस पर मैं क्या कहं। इस पर मैं वृ नहीं कहना चाहती।(व्यवधान).... I do n want to say anything on that.

डा॰ मुरली मनोहर जोशी: इस पर सरकार से पुछिए(व्यवधान).... There is a specil question. (Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Ord now. (Interruptions) Order, pleas (Interruptions)

THE LEADER OF THE HOUS (SHRI S. B. CHAVAN): Madam, tl matter is only about the decision taken the Business Advisory Committee as 1 whether the .T.P.C. report needs to t discussed either tomorrow or in the ne: Session. The unanimous view was that should be discussed tomorrow.

As for the statement made by the

325

Prime Minister, I do not know why the hon. Members are .saying to infer something which the Prime Minister had never .said. If said had something. (Interruptions) सुनिए तो सही ।(व्यवधान)

उपसभापतिः प्लीज, आप सुनिए।(व्य-बधान).... बैठिए। बैठ जाइए।(स्थवधान).... I am not permitting anything. Let the Leader of the House speak. (Interruptions) There are certain norms in this House. The Leader of the House is saying something. If you do not agree, you can react, but let him finish first. (Interruptions) I am not permitting. (Interruptions) I cannot permit. (Interruptions) He is on his legs. (Interruptions) No. (Interruptions) I will not permit anybody to speak till he finishes what he wants to say. (Interruptions)

SHRI S.B. CHAVAN: I am sorry that they do not allowme even to complete the sentence. Before I complete the sentence, they rise in their seats and start shouting. (Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIMAN: Please sit down,

Mr. Afzal. This is not the way to behave. का हाईस में।

SHRI S. B. CHAVAN: Madam, what I am trying to submit is, has the Prime Minister said anything which can give this kind of inference that he is going to run away from the statement the has made? Are you satisfied, or, are you not? You do not allow me even to complete the sentence. Therefore, it would be unfair on the part of hon. Members to say that he is going to run away from what he has already said. He will be able to explain the position. The report is to be discussed. We do not have any objection. (Interruptions)

श्री सिकन्दर बख्तः सदर सहिबा, मैं यह अर्ज कर रहा है कि इस जे॰पी॰सी॰ की रिपोर्ट के बारे में, कि इसके दो पहलु हैं। एक पहलु तो इस पर डिसकशन का है, मगर दूसरा पहलू वह है कि इस पर प्राइम-मिनिस्टर की रिएक्शन कल रात को आ जानी चाहिए थी। जे॰पीसी॰ की रिपोर्ट आ जाने के बाद, सवाल यह है कि

उनकी रिएक्शन क्या है?(व्यवधान).... क्या प्राइम मिनिस्टर साहब उन लोगों को अपने कैबिनेट से डाप करने को तैयार हैं, जिन पर सीधा इल्जाम लगा है। ...(व्यवधान)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am not allowing. (Interruptions). I am not allowing anything on this. I have heard enough points of order. (Interruptions). Just a minute. Until and unless we have agreed, the House has agreed to discuss the Report, we cannot discuss it today.

SHRI SIKANDER BAKHT: It is a not a question of discussing the Report. We want to know the reaction of the Prime Minister, whether he is going to drop those Ministers who have been directly indicted by the JPC.

That is the question.

PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE

- I. Reports and Accounts (1992-93) of the Cochin Shipyard Limited, Cochin and the Hindustan Shipyard Limited, Visakhapatnam related papers.
- II. Madhya Pradesh Motor Yan Karadhan (Second Amendment) Act, 1993.