

SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD : I cannot indicate the time right now because translation and all that will have to be done.

SHRI SURESH KALMADI : Mr. Minister, are you going to ground 737...

SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD : Let me have the statement. Without a statement, I cannot say... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI SURESH KALMADI : He should apply his mind seriously.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Mr. Kalmadi, the Minister has heard you. Now, when he makes the statement, he may react to it. You can ask at that time. And we will give ample time to enable the Members to be here when the statement is made... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN : He must answer my query also.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : You can ask that also... (*Interruptions*)

RE POLICE STRIKE IN JAMMU AND KASHMIR

DR. NARREDDY THULASI REDDY (Andhra Pradesh) : Madam, I want to speak about the police strike in Jammu & Kashmir. Kashmir has gone from bad to worse. For the fifth consecutive day, the Jammu and Kashmir policemen are on strike. They are not only on strike but they have also gone to the U.N. Observers' office at Srinagar and have submitted a memorandum against State terrorism. Now, their integrity is questionable. In that strategic State, there must be a dependable police. What action is the Government going to take in this regard? They have also raised anti-national slogans. They have given a memorandum against State terrorism. What is the Government going to do in this regard?

RE MALPRACTICES AND MISUSE OF POWER IN ANDHRA PRADESH

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY (Andhra Pradesh) : Madam, there are some questions which, through you, I want to ask this House in its collective wisdom as to what direction a citizen can be shown if for the mere sin of participating in an election the very person at the head of governance of that State threatens, intimidates and, worse, makes inflammatory speeches, resulting in death. Four innocent citizens by virtue of their political affiliation were murdered in the very constituency where this election took place. Madam, I want to draw your kind attention to this.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : My one ear is to you. I am trying to solve some problem. Mr. Upendra wants to say something on the same. I just wanted to organise it.

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY : Madam, it is a grave blow on democracy and it has become more an act of hypocrisy that all of us gather in this House and we talk about bringing electoral reforms when, time and again, an assault is made on these institutions within our country. After this by-election in the Panyam 184 Andhra Pradesh segment, the Chief Election Commissioner was attacked verbally. Why should a man who is holding a responsible post within the State... (*Interruptions*) I can't continue like this, Madam. I am talking on a serious issue.

SHRI R. K. DHAWAN : (Andhra Pradesh) : You always raise serious issues.

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY : I want to know from this House in its collective wisdom: which direction or wherefrom can the citizens take protection if post-electoral violence is unleashed by the very people who are in governance within that State? This is not a false or an imagined allegation. I have enough documentary evidence and the police cases

which were registered when supporters of mine were attacked with soda bottles and others were killed. Four people were killed and worse, I am on the personal threat own and it is on record that the industrialists of that region have been threatened by that very gentleman, whom I am referring to, in a stringent manner that he will see how they will survive. If elections are going to be used as extensions to individual, personal vengeance, if they are going to behave as feudal lords in a democracy, if they are going to suppress the voice of a citizen and, worse, if they are going to snuff out lives, if industrialists are threatened and intimidated.....

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : All associations to you. You have been disturbed by associations.

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY : ...if affiliated political parties are abused, if the Government machinery and vehicles are abused to subvert the very system they are standing for, then I seek, through you, Madam, guidance from the Centre as to how they are proposing to protect me, not as a Member of Parliament, but as a woman, as a citizen who has a fundamental right to resent the inflammatory speeches regarding regional affiliations made by this man. He has categorically said that I have to go and fall his feet and beg his forgiveness and his Government whip has made a threat through the press that she is going to have me attacked.

SHRI DIGVIJAY SINGH (Bihar) : who is that man ?

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY : If you permit me, I will mention the name of the person. He is the Chief Minister of Andhra Pradesh, Mr. Vijaya Bhaskar Reddy, who has flouted every norm of

democracy and act of governance and he has made a specific allegation which I am making as a woman of this country. This man has the audacity to question my femininity. He has stood on public platforms and accused me of not behaving as a woman. I want to know who is this man and what is his description of my femininity or any woman in this country and who is he to question and speak in a manner denigrating to the status of women.

Legislations have been made and passed in this very Parliament of which I thought he was also a respected colleague of Lok Sabha but unfortunately for a man of his stature to behave like this in a fashion which is denigrating and humiliating to the status of women, I am taking strong objection to this and I wish to place on record that now I am asking—since the Home Ministers are also here—to know as to what protection the Government is going to give to me as a citizen, my husband and children and my properties because we have been the victims of violence. When Shri Rajiv Gandhi died, they came and attacked our industries in Andhra Pradesh and in that process, I have suffered once and I will not be able to ascribe for a second time. I am standing for every citizen in this country who has a fundamental democratic right to fight an election under the Constitution in any part of the country. The C.E.C. himself was accused by this man. He has claimed that Mr. Seshan, whom I do not even know, has helped me secure 37,000 votes in that Assembly sector. This man has gone to the constituency, to every village and told them, "You people have allowed Renuka Chowdhury. How did you allow her to enter, how was she allowed to leave this place, how was she able to take a procession from here, how did the people receive her with such welcome? So, those of you who have supported her should come and fall at my feet and beg my forgiveness".

This is what the Chief Minister of Andhra Pradesh has said. Since I have nobody else to turn to, I am asking you, Madam.

Thank you.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Mr. Upendra wants to speak.

विषय के नेता (श्री सिकन्दर बख्त):
मंडम, स्टेटमेंट चीफ मिनिस्टर सहव का
बाकई तकलीफदेह था। वह नहीं होना
चाहिए था। वह आपने पढ़ा होगा। अब इस
किसम की नामनासिब बातें और नामनासिब
एटीट्यूड अगर हमारी पॉलिटिकल जिंदगी
में होने लगेंगे तो बहुत अफसोसनाक होगा।

نیتا وودھی دل: شری سکندر بخت!
میدم۔ اسٹیٹ منٹ چیف منسٹر صاحب کا
واقعی تکلیف دہ تھا۔ وہ نہیں دینا چاہیے
تھا۔ وہ آپ نے پڑھا ہوگا۔ اب اس قسم کی
نامناسب باتیں اور نامناسب ایٹی ٹیوڈ
اگر ہماری پولیٹیکل زندگی میں ہونے لگیں گے
تو بہت افسوسناک ہوگا۔

SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA (Karnataka) : Are we holding a discussion on the election campaign ?

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY : It is not about the election campaign; this is after the election is over. We are not talking about the election campaign.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA (Bihar) : No, it is not that. Elections have come and gone. Elections are over. We are not concerned with what happened in the election, who won and who lost. That is not the issue. The point is, if Shrimati Renuka Chowdhury has any grievance in regard to the conduct of the election, she is free to

move the courts. That is not the issue, to my mind. The issue is a post-election one. There is a situation there in which she feels threatened and she feels threatened by no less a person than the honourable Chief Minister of that State who was her rival in that election. Now this is what impinges on the norms of democracy in this country and this House has to concern itself with this. It is an honourable lady Member of this House who is feeling threatened in her own home State and shall we be mute witnesses to this or the Government of India will do something about it or the House will do something about it? We cannot remain quiet with this kind of an enormity, this kind of callousness and this kind of oppression which is being perpetrated on this Member. So, this House must decide and the Government must respond. The Home Minister must stand up here and assure that all protection will be given to Mrs. Renuka Chowdhury and that she will not be threatened any more. The Chief Minister belongs to their party and they must intercede and see that he does not threaten Mrs. Chowdhury.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Now, Mr. Upendra... (Interruptions)...

THE MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI S. B. CHAVAN) : Madam, may I say something on this?... (Interruptions)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Just a minute, Mr. Upendra. Mr. Chavan wants to say something... (Interruptions)...

SHRI P. UPENDRA (Andhra Pradesh) : You permitted me, Madam... (Interruptions)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : It is up to him to get up and say... (Interruptions)...

SHRI S. B. CHAVAN : Madam, I will specially tell the Chief Minister of Andhra Pradesh that there should be no scope for any kind of grievances and he should provide all the security that is required and I will personally look into the matter... *(Interruptions)*. •

SHRI SIKANDER BAKHT : Madam, he has been making very bad statements... *(Interruptions)*...

जोकि कोई भी सिविलाइज्ड सोसायटी बर्दाश्त नहीं कर सकती है। यह बड़े अफसोसनाक स्टेटमेंट्स आ रहे हैं। यह क्या बात है ?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Yes, Mr. Upendra... *(Interruptions)*... I have allowed Mr. Upendra... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MOTURU HANUMANTHA RAO (Andhra Pradesh) : Madam, I come from the same State... *(Interruptions)*...

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PERSONNEL, PUBLIC GRIEVANCES AND PENSIONS WITH ADDITIONAL CHARGE OF THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA) : Madam, how many Members will get up and speak on this ?... *(Interruptions)*... we can also say so many things... *(Interruptions)*... What is happening in Tripura... *(Interruptions)*... त्रिपुरा में क्या हो रहा है, वह बात आपक्यों नहीं करते हैं ?

SHRI MOTURU HANUMANTHA RAO : He is threatening the people for having voted against him... *(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Order, order, please... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MOTURU HANUMANTHA RAO : This is the way he is behaving... *(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Order, order, please... *(Interruptions)*... Yes, Mr. Upendra... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MOTURU HANUMANTHA RAO : After the elections are over, he is threatening those who voted against him and asking them to fall at his feet... *(Interruptions)*... This is a very bad thing on the part of the Chief Minister... *(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Just a minute, please... *(Interruptions)*... We are not discussing Andhra. Please note... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MOTURU HANUMANTHA RAO : The Home Minister must make a statement on that... *(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : The point is that the Chairman allowed Mrs. Renuka Chowdhury to make a statement and we are not having any discussion on the aftermath of the Andhra elections. There is a proper forum for that and you can take it up there. She is a Member of this House and if there is a threat to her life, she has a right to speak. But we are not discussing what happened in the Andhra elections... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MOTURU HANUMANTHA RAO : This is only a consequence of that... *(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Permission was granted because she is an honourable Member of this House and she feels that her life is in danger. So, she has a right to speak about it... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI G. G. SWELL (Meghalaya) : Madam, we have also to make some observations on this... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI P. UPENDRA : Madam, I will be very brief... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI G. G. SWELL : This is an important issue and we have to make some observations on this ... *(Interruptions)* ... we have to discuss it ... *(Interruptions)* ...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I agree that you have a right to speak. You may ask for a discussion. But there is a method. You move a motion and ask for permission of the Chairman. If he permits you, I will allow you, but not like this. I cannot allow a discussion on any issue like this ... *(Interruptions)* ...

SHRI G. G. SWELL : The House is concerned and we would like to speak on this ... *(Interruptions)* ...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Everybody is concerned. But there is a proper manner and especially you know it. How can we raise this issue? If it concerns the House, you cannot just get up and start discussing it.

SHRI P. UPENDRA : Madam, can I finish now?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Yes, you may finish in one minute.

SHRI P. UPENDRA : Madam, though I have no love left for the Telugu Desam, I fully support Mrs. Renuka's points. But I would say, in fairness to the Chief Minister, that he behaved well up to the election. And the election was more or less free. That much we should concede. But after the election, something has gone wrong, and the Chief Minister has behaved very atrociously. On 17th and 18th April, he visited the constituency and he made certain utterances of which Mrs. Renuka did not give the details but which have a bearing on the conduct of free and fair elections in the country, and the right of the citizens to contest anywhere. One point he made was, speaking at Vendurtni, he said, "Renuka is an outsider and how dare she come to our area and contest the election here?" Speaking at another place, at

Ratnapally, he said, "How was she allowed to enter these villages and canvas for votes? Why did you allow her?"

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Now, these things, Mr. Upendra, can be referred to the court. And I am only concerned about her security. *(Interruptions)* ...

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY : He was making inflammatory speeches which led to the death of four of our workers. How can he say this?

SHRI P. UPENDRA : These were the words of the Chief Minister. The House should take note. And he said, "Renuka has not behaved like a woman." Of course, she behaves more than a woman many times, but that does not mean that the Chief Minister should speak like that. *(Interruptions)* And in the presence of the Chief Minister, one of the State Ministers, Mr. Diwakar Reddy said, "she is a 'Sikhandi'". And he also said, "A nod from the CM would have shown her what Rayalaseema is". He said it in the presence of the Chief Minister. Then the Chief Minister himself said, "It would not take one minute to teach a lesson to all those who voted for her. But I am refraining. Now, I am giving an opportunity..."

(Interruptions)

SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA : Both sides should be given an opportunity... *(Interruptions)*

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY : I have not said a word.

SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA : All the cassettes of the election speeches should be brought here. We cannot listen to one side only. We want to know what she also said. *(Interruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Just a minute. *(Interruptions)* Please sit down.

SHRI P. UPENDRA : He said, "I will give an opportunity to the voters to touch my feet and apologise..."

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Just a minute, Mr. Upendra.

SHRI P. UPENDRA : He said, "this was an election between me..."

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Mr. Upendra, I am not permitting it. (*Interruptions*) I am not allowing. Please sit down.

आप बैठिए जरा । ... (व्यवधान)

आप बैठिए जरा । ... (व्यवधान)

SHRI P. UPENDRA : We cannot condone this behaviour of a Chief Minister. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Just a minute. Many things are said outside this House... (*Interruptions*) Pleased sit down. Just listen to me. Many things are said outside this by many important people. But there are certain norms of this House. By repeating them, you are repeating those abuses against her. It is not proper. It will come on record. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA (West Bengal) : Madam, I have a point.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I am not allowing any more. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA : Madam, I have a point.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Now that matter is over.

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA : Madam, we are not interested only in protecting the dignity and security of a lady Member. (*Interruptions*) My point is, if the Chief Minister is allowed to behave in this way, then what is going to happen to the democracy of the country? Terrorism is there in Kashmir. Now, it seems, somebody is becoming more terroristic in Andhra. If it is like this, what is going to happen to democracy in the country? That is my point.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Shri Mohammed Afzal.

SHRI INDER KUMAR GUJRAL (Bihar) : Madam, give me a minute... (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I am not allowing.

SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA : There are other people also from Andhra who know the situation. Let them also say...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : बैठिए । I am not allowing anybody. बैठ जाइए । I said, Chairman has given permission and I allowed her. Please sit down.

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA : Chairman has not given permission for everybody else to speak on the subject. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI INDER KUMAR GUJRAL : Madam, the issue...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Gujralji, that matter is closed now.

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA (Rajasthan) : Whether the Chairman has given permission or not, you are going to decide, but not the Minister.

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA : All that we are saying is that on a Special Mention, there is no debate. If everybody else has been allowed to say, let us also participate. We would also participate. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Just a minute. I announced from the Chair that because Mrs. Renuka Chowdhury is an hon. Member of this House, if there is a threat to her life, he has a right to mention it. And I have asked everybody else to refrain from mentioning any derogatory remarks if they were made outside the House. Why do you want to repeat it and make it a record in the House also? There are provisions available to Members through the Constitution that they can go and file a case if somebody is doing something. Because she is a Member of this House and her life is in danger, she is being permitted to raise it. Now that matter is closed. Shri Afzal.

SHRI INDER KUMAR GUJRAL : Madam, kindly give me a minute.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Mr. Gujral, that matter is closed.

SHRI INDER KUMAR GUJRAL : But you said that you will permit me, earlier.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : But we have to draw a line somewhere.

SHRI INDER KUMAR GUJRAL : I will not take more than half a minute.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : All right; but it should be written that parameter.

SHRI INDER KUMAR GUJRAL : The gravity of the issue basically is that an hon. Member of this House is not only threatened and there is a threat to her life, but also a threat to her dignity and a threat to her prestige by no less a person than the Chief Minister. This is a matter of grave concern for us and, therefore, it is not enough for the Home Minister to get up and tell us that he has only brought it to the notice of the Chief Minister. That does not solve the problem because in this case the accusation is against the Chief Minister himself. Madam, the Home Ministry also is in concurrent charge of law and order and in concurrent charge of the whole thing. Therefore, I would like the Home Minister to assure the lady Member—he should himself assure her—that her prestige, her dignity and her life will be safe.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : He assured it; he made the assurance on the floor of the House.

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY :

Asking the Chief Minister to look after me would mean for me going to the slaughter-house.... (*Interruptions.*) Under the circumstances, please tell me what confidence can I have in the Chief Minister?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Confidence in the Home Minister.

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY : I am requesting the House; I am requesting the Home Minister, and he is going to be responsible. I cannot go to the Chief Minister and tell him. I am sorry I cannot.... (*Interruptions.*) This is after he was officially declared as the Chief Minister that he went on saying all these things. This was not during the elections; it was after the elections.

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA : We want Central protection for her.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Mr. Afzal.

RE. ALLEGED PARTIAL ATTITUDE OF POLICE IN BOMBAY

श्री मोहम्मद अफजल उर्फ मीन अफजल (उत्तर प्रदेश) : मैडम, मैं बड़े दुःख के साथ यहां एक मसला उठाना चाहता हूं। मैडम, 6 दिसंबर के बाद जो कुछ मुल्क में हुआ है, उसमें तकरीबन दो-ढाई हजार लोग मारे जा चुके हैं और उसके बाद बंबई में जो बम ब्लास्ट हुआ उसमें भी काफी बड़ी तादाद में लोग मारे गए हैं, लेकिन उसके बाद भी हालात अच्छे नहीं हैं।

मैडम, मैं आपकी तबज्जो बंबई की तरफ दिखाना चाहता हूं। मैडम, मेरी समझ में एक बात नहीं आती है कि हकूमत के इंसफ के पमाने हमेशा दो क्यों रहते हैं? मैं बड़ी सफाई के साथ यह बात कहना चाहता हूं और मैडम आज मैं आपको यह बात कहना चाह रहा हूं कि मैंने अपने मसाइल्स को और खास तौर पर मुसलमानों के मसाइल को अपने दूसरे दोस्तों के जरिए यहां पर उठाने की कोशिश की है ताकि इसको बुरा रंग देने की कोशिश न की जाए, लेकिन अब हालात इस किस्म के हो रहे हैं कि प्रेम शंकर झा जैसे नामवर साहब यह लिखते हैं कि जो गलती सिखों के साथ की थी, उसे मुसलमानों के साथ मत दोहराया करना इस मुल्क का बुरा हो जाएगा। मैडम, मेरी इत्तला के मुताबिक बंबई के अंदर तीन हजार लोग मारे गए और इसके ऊपर पार्लियामेंट में एक फुल-फुल जेड डिस्कसन बलाउ नहीं किया गया। लोग डिमांड करते रहे, लेकिन जब हाउस खुला तो तीन दिन तक यहां दी. पी. पी. की रैली होगी या नहीं, इस पर बहस होती रही और हम लोग बंबई में मारे जानेवालों के लिए हाथ उठाते-उठाते थक गए और एक जुमला तक इस हाउस के अंदर नहीं कह पाए। उसके बाद जब बम ब्लास्ट हुआ तो इसी पार्लियामेंट में पूरे दिन की बहस मंजूर की गयी। क्या फसादात में मारे जानेवालों की लाशों और बम ब्लास्ट में मारे जानेवालों की लाशों के अंदर कुछ फर्क होता है? यहां पार्लियामेंट पूरे एक दिन बहस करती है और शाम को दो मिनट का मौन रखा जाता है। उसके बाद एक दिन की तनख्वाह काटी जाती है। हमने उसको मंजूर किया था, लेकिन अगले रोज जब कलकत्ते