

[Shri P. R. Kumaramangalam]

(iii) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (i) above. [Placed in Library. See No. LT. 3540/93]

THE COIR INDUSTRY (AMENDMENT) BILL, 1993

THE MINISTER OF STATS IN THE MINISTRY OF INDUSTRY (DEPARTMENT OF SMALL SCALE INDUSTRIES & AGRO AND RURAL INDUSTRIES) (SHRI M. ARUNACHALAM); Madam, I beg to move for leave to introduce a Bill further to amend the Coir Industry Act, 1953.

The question was, put and the motion was adopted.

SHRI M. ARUNACHALAM; Madam, I introduce the Bill.

Re. T. V. coverage of debates in Rajya Sabha

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN (Tamil Nadu); Madam, I want to raise an issue and I am sure all the Members will agree with me. The debate on the Motion of Thanks on the President's Address has been televised only in the Lok Sabha. I *don't understand the* reason why the Rajya Sabha is being consistently left out of the television coverage. If the coverage is going to be on the Motion of Thanks, the entire debate should be covered, in the Rajya Sabha as well as in the Lok Sabha. This is something which is going to be preserved for posterity. Madam, consistently an attempt is being made to reduce the position of the Rajya Sabha. I don't know who is responsible for all this.

Now when the Budget comes up, the argument is going to be that there the Lok Sabha is chiefly concerned with the Budget. So, therefore, they won't cover the Budget also. Madam, I think that this is very wrong. I would like the Government or the Minister of Information and Broadcasting of whoever is responsible to kindly come up with a statement and let us know.... *(Interruptions)...*

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY (Pondicherry) : Madam, we want a direction from the Chair.

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA (Rajasthan) ; Madam, the Minister of Parliamentary Affairs is here. He can clarify the position.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Now the entire debate has been covered in the Lok Sabha. I don't see any reason why it could not have been covered in the Rajya Sabha also.

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: Her point is valid. Shuklaji should tell us the reason.

SHRI SURESH KALMADI (Maharashtra) : Madam, with you sitting in the Chair how can there be a stepmotherly treatment in the Rajya Saba? Please give a ruling. ... *(Interruptions)* ...

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Madam, please give a direction.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN; I don't think it is the responsibility of the Ministry of Parliamentary Affairs because the Parliamentary Affairs Ministry does not look after the Parliament job. The Rajya Sabha Secretariat and the Lok Sabha Secretariat are responsible for it. I will tell the Secretary-General to take note of the sentiments of the Members and we should record it. This matter was raised before also, I think, by Mr. M.A. Baby in the last Session last year and we had made the complaint also. And I think this is absolutely correct that the speeches made here either on the Budget or on any other subject are as relevant as those made in other House and they should be kept for posterity or for televising, if and when necessary, as they do for the Lok Sabha. So, I will ask the Secretariat, we will discuss the matter and a redressal of your grievance would be done.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAM SWAMY (Uttar Pradesh); Madam, ... *(Interruptions)* ...

श्री एस० एस० अतुलचलिया (बिहार) : महोदय, यह प्रिविलेज का सबाल नहीं है। राज्य सभा और लोक सभा का जोइंट सेशन होता है और उसमें राष्ट्रपति जी भाषण देते हैं। अगर बजट की बात होती तो दूसरी बात है, मैं बजट के पीछे नहीं पड़ना चाहता। किन्तु राष्ट्रपति जी का यह भाषण जोइंट सेशन को एड्रेस किया जाता है। यहाँ पर इसको रिकार्ड न करने का मतलब राज्य सभा की अवमानना करना या अपमान करना है, ऐसा मैं समझता हूँ। मैं समझता हूँ यह हमारे अधिकारों का हनन है। मैं माँग करता हूँ कि यह प्रिविलेज का मैटर है। यह साधारण बात नहीं है, इट इज ए मैटर ऑफ प्रिविलेज। जब हम सेंट्रल हॉल में बैठते हैं और दोनों सदनों के सदस्यों के सामने राष्ट्रपति जी भाषण देते हैं और उसके बादवजूद वह सिर्फ लोक सभा में रिकार्ड होता है और राज्य सभा में रिकार्ड नहीं होता है। इसका कारण क्या है? यह जो लॉग कैमरा रूम है, यह डिजीजन नहीं ले सकते हैं। कौन रिस्पॉन्सिबल है, किसने फैसला लिया है यह? यह इस सदन का अपमान है। इस सदन का अपमान और अवमानना जो की गई है, उसके लिए कौन जिम्मेदार है? उसके खिलाफ क्या कार्रवाई होनी चाहिए?

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA (West Bengal): Madam . . (Interruptions) . .

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I gave my ruling. I gave my direction. . . (Interruptions)...

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Madam, Mr. Shukla is here. The Parliamentary Affairs Minister is here. (Intervptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It is not Mr. Shukla's responsibility. I am telling you, it is not the Parliamentary Affairs Ministry which decides. I know it. It is the Secretariat which is responsible. (Interruptions)

THE MINISTER OF WATER RESOURCES AND THE MINISTER OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRI VIDYACHARAN SHUKLA): Madam, I would like to respond to it. Madam,

I have heard the submissions made to you by the hon. Members. You know that these matters regarding television and other matters are handled by the Speaker. Therefore, I am going to bring the sentiments of this House to his notice and also . . (Interruptions) . .

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let him speak . . (Interruption)... Hon. Members, let us make a habit of listening to other people and then express our opinion. You will also be heard. Let him finish first. . . (Interruptions) ...

SHRI VIDYACHARAN SHUKLA: I agree that this House has an equal right to be not only recorded but also to be televised. From our side we will emphasise these facts and particularly so in relation to major debates that take place in the two Houses, the Motion of Thanks to the President's Address, Budget and the Railway Budget. In the case of Budget, may be the lower House has certain additional responsibilities. But on the Motion of Thanks to the President's Address, proper arrangements should be made. I want to express my solidarity with these demands and I will see what we can do about it. . . (Interruptions) ...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Shukla, I would like to say that the Speaker is responsible for Lok Sabha. The Chairman and Rajya Sabha Secretariat are responsible for Rajya Sabha. I agree with the sentiments expressed that it was a lapse on the part of Rajya Sabha not to have recorded in spite of the demand made last year. Now the Secretary General has told me that he would take care of it and Budget and other speeches during the Budget discussion and the Railway Budget would be fully recorded. It is not the Parliamentary Affairs Ministry's responsibility. So we should absolve them of this unnecessary responsibility. . . (Interruptions) ...

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA (Bihari): Madam may I bring to your notice

the fact that when we had an important debate on the post-6th December situation in this House, I remember, the debate was videoed by the TV group but it was never telecast. This is also a lapse which has taken place. We really become the secondary chamber... (*Interruptions*) ...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Recording is the responsibility of Rajya Sabha Secretariat and telecasting is the responsibility of the I & B Ministry. Now we should know where to draw a line. We will find a way out. But the Parliamentary Affairs Ministry has got nothing to do with it.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: As far as we are concerned the whole thing is one process. That is the point I am making... (*Interruptions*) ...

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Madam, the Government has a collective responsibility. The Members cannot run from pillar to post to find out which Minister is responsible. But the point is Government has to see that when the bicameral system is in operation nothing is done which goes against the spirit and letter of the Indian Constitution. It is not a question of our sentiments. We have an equal right- While replying to the debate the Minister was saying that in respect of Budget the other House has a priority. If this is the way hon. Ministers seek to argue before the House, we can quite well understand what is at the back of their mind ... (*Interruptions*) ...

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: I also want to bring to your notice... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH (West-Bengal): Even if it is televised, who witnesses?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, we have to take other things also... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Madam, I have the Chairman's permission to raise an issue today... (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I think, Mr. Subramanian Swamy wants to raise on that matter.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: No. I had given in writing also to you that when I raised the question of the income-tax of Ms. Jayalalitha...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, I am not allowing you. See, Mr. Subramanian Swamy will show respect to the Members. We are on a serious issue. Let us discuss... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: It is a serious matter.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: There are many issues to be raised in the House?

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: I had raised it during the Question Hour. It was deliberately edited out.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, we have got other matters... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: Income-tax fraud is a very serious matter... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI S. MUTHU MANI (Tamil Nadu): Mr. Subramanian Swamy represents Uttar Pradesh. He has no right to talk about Tamil Nadu... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI V. RAJAN CHELLAPPA (Tamil Nadu): You did not allow PM's name to be mentioned in the House but Mr. Subramanian Swamy always uses our Chief Minister's name. Daily he brings in our Chief Minister's name... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI S. MUTHU MANI: Several times he went to America. Where

did he get the money from? (*Interruptions*)
He Is flying to other nations also... (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I won't permit you... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI S. MUTHU MANI: What does Mr. Subramanian Swamy know... (*Interruptions*)

DR. JINENDRA KUMAR JAIN (Madhya Pradesh): Madam...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You are back, Dr. Jain. Welcome to the House.

RE. STARVATION DEATHS IN BIHAR

श्री यशवन्त सिन्हा (बिहार) :
उपसभापति महोदय, मैं कोई दलगत राजनीति से संबंधित मामला नहीं बल्कि एक म.नवीय मामला इस सदन में उठाना चाहता हूँ बहुत ही दुःख और तकलीफ के साथ। खैटामियाँ जो हजारीबाग जिले के किरेदारी प्रखंड के रहने वाले थे उनका नाम भारत के इतिहास में स्वर्ण अक्षरों में नहीं लिखा जायेगा। शायद हम उनको कभी याद भी नहीं करेंगे। क्योंकि उन्होंने कोई ऐसा काम नहीं किया जिससे उनको याद किया जा सके। उनके साथ सिर्फ एक दुर्घटना घटी कि वह स्वतंत्र भारत में 45 वर्षों की आजादी के बाद सत दिन लगातार भूखे रहने के बाद दम तोड़ गये और मृत्यु को प्राप्त हो गये।

मैं उनके गांव में गया था। उनके परिवार वालों से मैं ज.कर मिला। अभी जब हम होली की छुट्टियाँ मना रहे थे और देश होली की खुशियाँ मना रहा था उस गांव में मातम छाया हुआ था। न केवल खैटामियाँ परलोक सिधार गये भूखे तड़पते हुए बल्कि उस प्रखंड में, पूरे इलाके में बहुत से ऐसे लोग हैं जो आज भी बहुत मुश्किल से जीने की कोशिश कर रहे हैं और कब वे दम तोड़ देंगे यह कहना मुश्किल है। दो व्यक्तियों से खास तौर से मैं मिला। एक मोहम्मद हुसैन हैं और दूसरे मणि महतो हैं। ये दो लोग भूखे रहने के कारण दम तोड़ने के कगार पर हैं।

खैटामियाँ की जो विधवा पत्नी है उनको अब कोई देखने वाला नहीं है। जब मैं वहाँ पर गया तो वह मेरे कदमों में गिरने की कोशिश करने लगी। इसलिए कि उन्होंने समझा कि शायद मैं उनको कोई रहत पहुँचाने की स्थिति में हूँगा।

मैं आपसे निवेदन करना चाहता हूँ कि हम सब इस सदन में बैठे हैं। यहाँ पर बहुत तरह की चर्चाएँ हम करते हैं। मैं जानना चाहता हूँ कि आजाद हिन्दुस्तान में 45 वर्षों की आजादी के बाद भी क्या यह स्थिति होनी चाहिए कि इस देश के विभिन्न भागों में लोग आज भी भूख से मरने को बाध्य हों। आज भी वे तड़पते हुए दम तोड़ दें इसलिए कि दिनोदिन उनको कुछ भी खाना नसीब नहीं होता है। मैं आपसे जानना चाहता हूँ कि क्या सांसदों की हैसियत से इस देश की सबसे बड़ी पंचायत में बैठकर हम उनके साथ न्याय कर रहे हैं या नहीं कर रहे हैं? काल हांडी का नाम दुनिया भर में मशहूर है इसलिए कि वहाँ लोग भूख से मरे, बिहार में पलामू का नाम दुनिया भर में मशहूर है कि वहाँ भी लोग भूख से मरते हैं। आज हजारी बाग जिले के इस खंड में पलामू से जिसकी सरहद मिलती है वहाँ लोग भूख से मर रहे हैं। देश के दूसरे हिस्सों में आज इसी प्रकार की बातचीत हो रही है। मैं जानना चाहता हूँ कि केन्द्रीय सरकार इसके बारे में क्या कर रही है? मैं जानना चाहता हूँ इस सदन से कि हम सब यहाँ पर बैठकर क्या कर रहे हैं, क्योंकि मैं मानता हूँ कि इससे बढ़कर शर्म की बात हमारे लिए दूसरी कुछ नहीं हो सकती है कि हमारे यहाँ लोग भूख से तड़फ तड़फ कर मरें। वहाँ पर कोई भी अधिकारी, वहाँ पर कोई भी पंचायत का मुखिया, सरपंच इस स्थिति में नहीं था कि उनकी कोई मदद कर सके। बराबर सरकार की तरफ से एक ही एक्सप्लेनेशन आता है कि वह हर्ट पैल्योर हो गया, वह बीमार चल रहा था। जो आदमी लगातार भूखा रहेगा वह रोग की अपेक्षा में आया ही, यह सर्वविदित है और इसलिए मैं इस सवाल को यहाँ पर उठाना