

(ii) G.S.R. No. 251(E)/Ess. Com./ Sugar, dated the 1st March, 1993, publishing the Sugar (Price Determination for 1992-93 Production) Amendment Order, 1993. [Placed in Library. See No. LT-3685/93]

**Presentation of the report of the Committee on subordinate legislation**

SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA (Assam) : I present the Ninety-ninth Report (in English and Hindi) of the Committee on Subordinate Legislation.

**MESSAGES FROM THE LOK SABHA**

(I) The Gold Bonds (Immunities and Exemptions) Bill, 1993.

(II) The Wild Life (Protection) Amendment Bill, 1993.

SECRETARY-GENERAL : Madam, I have to report to the House the following messages from the Lok Sabha, signed by the Secretary-General of the Lok Sabha :—

(I)

"In accordance with the provisions of rule 96 of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in Lok Sabha, I am directed to enclose the Gold Bonds (Immunities and Exemptions) Bill, 1993, as passed by Lok Sabha at its sitting held on the 19th March, 1993".

(ID)

"In accordance with the provisions of rule 96 of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in Lok Sabha, I am directed to enclose the Wild Life (Protection) Amendment Bill, 1993, as passed by Lok Sabha at its sitting held on the 19th March, 1993".

Sir, I lay a copy of each of the Bills on the Table.

**RE-ALLEGED TAPPING OF TELE-  
PHONES OF SHRI ARJUN SINGH, (THE  
MINISTER OF HUMAN RESOURCE  
DEVELOPMENT).**

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA (Bihar) : Madam, Deputy Chairman. . . (Interruptions). Madam, I have a very important issue to raise. (Interruptions).

श्री मोहम्मद अफजल उर्फ सीध अफजल (उत्तर प्रदेश) : मैडम, आज के बख्शार में यह स्कैण्डल सामने आया है। . . . (व्यवधान) . . मिस्टर अर्जुन सिंह ने ग्राइम-मिनिस्टर को लिखा है कि उनके टेलीफोन टैप होते हैं। . . . . (व्यवधान) .

شری محمد افضل عرف م۔ افضل  
آج کے اخبار میں اسکیڈل سامنے آیا  
ہے . . . "مداخلت" . . . . .  
نے پرائم منسٹر کو لکھا ہے کہ ان کے ٹیلیفون  
ٹیپ ہوتے ہیں . . . "مداخلت" . . . . .

उपसभापति : एक मिनट, प्लीज, रुकिए।  
. . . . . (व्यवधान) . . . . .

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA : Madam, you have to identify one of us to speak.

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज (हरियाणा) : एक  
दूसरे पर आरोप लगाया जा रहा है, मैडम.  
. . . . . (व्यवधान) . . . . .

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Please. (Interruptions). Let me make one announcement first. (Interruptions). Please, Let me make an announcement first. (Interruptions). Order. (Interruptions). You may raise it. (Interruptions). Let me first raise... (Interruptions). I will allow... (Interruptions).

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA : Madam, please identify the person whom you want

†[ ] Transliteration in Arabic Script.

to permit. We want to raise our issues in an orderly fashion.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : That is why I am saying. . . (Interruptions). We have very little time for discussion. Let us take the Legislative Business first and then we can go ahead till the night for anything which is bothering you. (Interruptions).

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH (West Bengal) : This is a very important issue. (Interruptions).

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA : These issues cannot be swept under the carpet. They have to be taken up here and now.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : Madam, this is an issue. . .

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA : Madam, these issues have to be taken up here and now.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : We have the listed business. Let us go ahead. . . (Interruptions).

SHRI MOHAMMED AFZAL alias MEEM AFZAL : Madam, Mr. Arjun Singh has written a letter. . . (Interruptions).

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA : Madam, if you don't identify somebody then we are going to lose more time in this confusion.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Mr. Yashwant Sinha, you are a senior Member of this House. We have some listed business which we have to complete. If you don't cooperate then how are we going to finish that ? It is your business also.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA : We have cooperated to the best of our ability. The consideration that the Opposition has shown to the ruling party is unprecedented in this Session.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : The ruling party is keeping quiet

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA ■. They have to keep quiet. They don't have anything to speak. (Interruptions).

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : \_\_\_\_\_ telephones are being bugged. . . (Interruptions).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Whose telephone is being bugged ? Please. . . ; , , , , . . . (Interruptions).

— . YASHWANT SINHA: How can this Government function ? The Government has to come out with a statement. The Government must clarify its position. (Interruptions).

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : This is a very serious matter.

श्री मोहम्मद अफ़्ज़ल उर्फ़ मौल अफ़ज़ल :  
देखिए, इसका ज़वाब दिया जाना चाहिए, जिस  
घर से टेलीफोन टैप हो रहा है, जासूसी होती  
है। क्या सीनियर मिनिस्टर को जासूसी  
अख्तियार गवर्नमेंट को है ?

شری محمد افضل عرف م۔ افضل میڈم :  
اس کا جواب دیا جانا چاہیے جس طرح سے  
ٹیلیفون ٹیپ ہوتے ہیں۔ جا سکتی ہوئی ہے۔

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA : The senior-most member of the Cabinet is making an allegation of telephone tapping and bugging of his house. He is saying that the intelligence agencies have been misused for political. . . (Interruptions). This is what is happening. (Interruptions).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Whose telephone ? ... (Interruptions) . . .

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA : How can the Government function ? What is happening ? • (Interruptions) . . .

THE MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI S. B. CHAVAN) : Madam, may I say something ? . . . (Interruptions) . . .

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : The Home Minister wants to say something... (Interruptions) . . .

†[] Transliteration in Arabic Script.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA : We have not been able to say our say. Let the Home Minister react after we have said what we want to say. . . (Interruptions) . . .

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : You have said enough. I am not permitting. . . (Interruptions) . . .

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA : Madam, we kept on asking the Government why the Government intelligence agencies were failing. . . (Interruptions) . . .

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : He is saying something. . . (Interruptions) . . .

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA : Why the intelligence agencies were not able to . . . (Interruptions) . . . unearth the Bombay bomb blast, the Calcutta bomb blast because the intelligence "agencies were indulging in political espionage. . . (Interruptions) . . . This is what we are saying. . . (Interruptions) . . .

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : The Home Minister wants to say something. Please, order, order. . . (Interruptions) . . .

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA : This is an incomparable situation. . . (Interruptions) . . . that the ruling party should use the Government machinery for spying against each other while people suffer. Hundreds are killed because they are not able to unearth the bomb blast. . . (Interruptions) . . .

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Whatever matter you are raising. . . (Interruptions) . . . The Home Minister got up to respond to it. . . (Interruptions) . . . Let him respond. . . (Interruptions) . . . There is nothing alarming. . . (Interruptions) . . .

आप बोले जा रहे हैं, बोलिए । . . . (शब्द-  
धान) . . .

SHRI N. E. BALARAM (Kerala) : You must allow us to raise the issue. . . (Interruptions) . . .

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : No. I won't. One person is enough. I cannot allow discussion on any subject which is not listed. . . (Interruptions) . . . I won't. . . (Interruptions) . . .

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : Why not ? . . . (Interruptions) . . . It is a serious allegation . . . (Interruptions) . . .

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Because it is a serious allegation he is replying to it. . . (Interruptions) . . .

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : It is most important . . . (Interruptions) . . . It is concerning surveillance of a Member of Parliament . . . (Interruptions) . . .

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : That is why he got up to reply to it. . . (Interruptions) . . . You listen to him. . . (Interruptions) . . .

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : Madam, here is a charge of a Union Cabinet Minister that his telephone is bugged. . . (Interruptions)

उपसभापति : वे जवाब दे रहे हैं । .  
(शब्दधान) . . . जवाब दे रहे हैं, बैठिए ।

SHRI S. B. CHAVAN : Madam, I want to submit. . . (Interruptions) . . . that so far as the allegations made against the intelligence agencies and about tapping of telephones of politicians are concerned. . . (Interruptions) . . . it is totally baseless. It is absolutely false. . . (Interruptions) . . . I am saying this. . . (Interruptions) . . .

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA : Will the Home Minister go on record. . . (Interruptions) . . . Let the Home Minister say on record that Mr. Arjun Singh has not written a letter in this connection to the Prime Minister. . . (Interruptions) . . . Let him deny it. . . (Interruptions) . . . Let him deny the fact that Mr. Arjun Singh has written a letter to the Prime Minister. . . (Interruptions) . . .

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Now that matter is closed. After the Home Minister's reply the matter is closed. . . (Interruptions) . . . Please. . . (Interruptions) . . .

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : According to the Home Minister. . . (Interruptions) . . .

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Please . . . (Interruptions) . . . One minute. . . (Interruptions) . . .

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज : मंत्रिमंडल में  
ऐसे मंत्री मौजूद हैं जो ... (व्यवधान) ...

SHRI N. E. BALARAM : We have to say;  
then let him be allowed to say..'  
(Interruptions).. ,

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : He said it. .  
(Interruptions) ...

SHRI N. E. BALARAM : You allowed him  
to speak first. . . (Interruptions). . .

विपक्ष के नेता (श्री सिकंदर बख्त) :  
सदर साहिबा, . . . . .

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I cannot  
permit it every day. Just a minute. . .  
(Interruptions). . . Will you take your seat ? . .  
(Interruptions). . . Every day the time of the  
House is taken on issues where every Member  
wants to get up and say the same thing which is  
not listed here... (Interruptions) . . . There was  
an agreement in the Advisory Committee  
meeting. . . (Interruptions) . . . Let us follow  
that. . . (Interruptions) . . .

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : I have a point I of

श्री सत्य प्रकाश मालवीय (उत्तर प्रदेश) :  
यब यह आरोप नहीं लगाया गया था कि अर्जुन  
सिंह का फोन टैप हुआ है । . . . (व्यव-  
धान) . . . . .  
order. . . (Interruptions) . . .

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Mr. Dipen  
Ghosh, no business has started-How can you  
have a point of order ? . . . (Interruptions)... It  
is point of disorder. . . (Interruptions) . . .

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : The Leader of the  
House has made a statement...(Interruptions) .  
..

श्री प्रमोद महाजन (महाराष्ट्र) : क्या पता  
था कि ऐसी भी दिजनेस यहां होता है ।  
.. (व्यवधान) . . .

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA : Madam. I  
want to know from the Home Minister • Is he  
aware that Mr. Arjun Singh written a  
letter to the Prime Minister.. ...

this connection ? Has he written a letter ? Let  
him reply to it. Let the Home Minister say the  
HRD Minister has not written a letter in this  
connection... (Interruptions) ... If he says Mr.  
Arjun Singh has made baseless allegations,  
then Mr. Arjun Singh has no business to  
continue in the Government. . . .  
(Interruptions)'. . .

श्री सिकंदर बख्त : सदर साहिबा, मुझे  
पूछना यह है कि अगर वे तस्लीम करत हैं कि  
वह खबर गलत है तो उसके आगे और कान सा  
कदम उठा रहे हैं ? . . . (व्यवधान)  
... वह गलत खबर है तो इस किस्म की  
खबर को तस्लीम कर लेने के बाद अगला  
कदम कान सा उठा रही है गवर्नमेंट ?

شری سکندر بخت : صدر صاحبہ  
مجھے پوچھنا یہ ہے کہ اگر وہ تسلیم کرتے ہیں  
کہ یہ خبر غلط ہے تو اس کے آگے اور کونسا  
عملی اقدام اٹھا رہے ہیں... "داخلت" ...  
اگر یہ غلط خبر ہے تو اس قسم کی غلط خبر کو تسلیم  
کر لینے کے بعد اگلا قدم کونسا اٹھا رہا ہے  
گورنمنٹ ۔

श्री एस. बी. चव्हाण : इसका अगला कदम  
यही है कि जो बाग पार्लियामेंट में कही  
गयी है, वह सारे अखबारों में आ जाएगी ।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : The  
Home Minister has said it... (Interrup-

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA : What has  
been ? He wants to communicate his  
Parliament Members through the  
newspapers. Is this what he is saying?...  
(Interruptions). . .

SHRI SIKANDER BAKHT : The queseven if  
it is a wrong news report, ivernment has got to  
proceed and

take further action. . . {*Interruptions*} What further action are you taking ? {*Interruptions*}

SHRI S. B. CHAVAN : If the hon. Members are going to allow me to speak . . . {*Interruptions*} I have made the matters absolutely clear that there has been no telephone tapping so far as the intelligence agencies are concerned and what Mr. Arjun Singh wrote to the Prime Minister is between Mr. Arjun Singh and the Prime Minister. I can't say. . . {*Interruptions*}

HON. MEMBERS : No.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA : This letter was published. Once it is quoted in the Press, it is the property of the House. . . {*Interruptions*}

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM (Andhra Pradesh) : May I make a suggestion ?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : After the Home Minister's statement, the matter is over. . . {*Interruptions*}

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA : After the Home Minister's statement, more questions arise. . . {*Interruptions*} More questions arise after the clarification on the matter . . . {*Interruptions*}

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM : Since the Home Minister denies. . . {*Interruptions*}

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Mr. Afzal, please go back. . . {*Interruptions*}

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : Madam, it is not a private affair. . . {*Interruptions*} The Home Minister says that his colleague has made a baseless charge to the Press. Is it a private affair. . . {*Interruptions*}

SHRI MOHAMMED AFZAL *alias* MEEM AFAZAL : Mr. Arjun Singh has no right. . . {*Interruptions*}

SHRI G. SWAMINATHAN (Tamil Nadu) : Madam, we want a parliamentary committee to investigate this matter. . . {*Interruptions*}

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM : Is he prepared to allow a parliamentary committee to look into this matter ? {*Interruptions*}

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY (Andhra Pradesh) : Our authentic information is. . . {*Interruptions*}

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Mr. Mentay Padmanabham, will you please sit down ? {*Interruptions*} Please, Mr. Yashwant Sinha, just a minute. . . {*Interruptions*} I said, please sit down. . . {*Interruptions*} When I request you. . . {*Interruptions*}

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM : Our demand is that a parliamentary committee should be constituted to go into this matter {*Interruptions*}

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : How can it be a private matter . {*Interruptions*}

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : One minute. . . {*Interruptions*}

J. HRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : Our authentic information is that Mr. Arjun Singh wrote three letters to the Prime Minister in this connection; not one, three letters. . . {*Interruptions*}

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Please take your seat. . . {*Interruptions*}

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : It can't be a private affair between the Minister and the Prime Minister. . . {*Interruptions*}

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Mr. Narayanasamy, please take your seat. . . {*Interruptions*} The Members are agitated on an issue. The Leader of the House who is also the Home Minister responded to it. To me, the matter is closed. I am not discussing it any more. . . {*Interruptions*} No, the matter is closed. . . {*Interruptions*}

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA : The Home Minister has responded by saying, "It is a private affair." It is not a matter now only between the members of the Government. It is a public matter and he has to inform ... {*Interruptions*}

DR. MURLI MANOHAR JOSHI (Uttar Pradesh) : He has to answer the question raised by the Leader of the Opposition. . . (Interruptions)

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA : Various allegations have been made not by us but by a Cabinet Minister, Madam.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Whenever the Government take any action and come before the House, I will permit you. . . (Interruptions) But I am not going to permit a discussion on it. . . (Interruptions) No, I am not allowing. . . (Interruptions)

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : It is not a private matter.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I am not allowing any discussion, please... (Interruptions)

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA : Mr. Arjun Singh should be called before this House, Madam. . . (Interruptions)

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : According to the Leader of the House, the Minister has made a baseless charge to the Press. Let him come to the House. . . (Interruptions) Let Mr. Arjun Singh come to the House . . . (Interruptions)

श्री मोहम्मद अफजल उर्फ मीम अफजल :  
मि. कोतदार का भी टेलीफोन टैप हो रहा  
है . . . (व्यवधान) इन नेताओं के टेलीफोन  
टैप हो रहे हैं ।

شری محمد افضل عرف م۔ افضل ہسٹروٹیڈار  
کا بھی ٹیلی فون ٹیپ ہو رہا ہے ۔ یہ مداخلت  
ان نیتاؤں کے ٹیلی فون ٹیپ ہو رہے ہیں ۔

SHRI G. SWAMINATHAN : It is not only between Mr. Arjun Singh and the Prime Minister. It relates to the MPs also. . . (Interruptions)

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM : It is not a matter between the Prime Minister and Mr. Arjun Singh. Let the Prime Minister come and tell this House. . . (Interruptions)

SHRI G. SWAMINATHAN : It appear that the telephones of the MPs have been tapped.

" THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : It seem the Members are not interested to discus the Railway Budget or listen to Mr. Kesri': reply. We have discussed it enough... (Interruptions)

SHRI SIKANDER BAKT : The reply of the Home Minister has opened the floodgate . . . (Interruptions)

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : Let the Minister, Mr. Arjun Singh, be summoned before the House to tell the House as to whether he wrote letters to the Prime Minister. Our information is, the Minister, Mr. Arjun Singh, wrote three letters to the Prime Minister in this regard. And the Home Minister is not justified. . . (Interruptions)

SHRI G. SWAMINATHAN : The telephones have also been tapped. As a Member of Parliament, I am interested to know the exact position. Newspapers say that not only Mr. Arjun Singh. . .

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : The Minister has clarified the position... (Interruptions)

SHRI G. SWAMINATHAN : I am interested in the matter because the newspaper says that the telephones of the MPs have also been tapped. We want to know the actual position as a Member of Parliament. . . (Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Order.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA : There can- no: be any order if there is so much disorder in the Government. How do you expect order in the House if the Government is in such a disorder ? (Interruptions)

श्री मोहम्मद अफजल उर्फ मीम अफजल :  
. . . . (व्यवधान) मि. कोतदार को कॉन्डिनेट  
से इसलिए निकाला गया कि वह कोई ऐसा  
काम कर रहे थे, जो इनका टेलीफोन टैप

†[ ] Transliteration in Arabic Script.

करने की आवश्यकता पड़ी। ....  
(व्यवधान) मैडम, लगता है कि अपने  
कैबिनेट के लोगों पर इनको कोई भरपौरा  
नहीं।

Full details should be given to the House.

شری محمد افضل عرف م۔ افضل : ...  
”مداخلت“... مسٹر فوئید اراکو کیبنٹ سے  
اس لئے نکالا گیا کہ وہ کوئی ایسا کام کر رہے  
تھے جو ان کا ٹیلی فون ٹیپ کرنے کی آوشلیکٹ  
پڑی۔ ”مداخلت“... میڈم لگتا  
ہے کہ اپنے کیبنٹ کے لوگوں پر ان کو کوئی  
بھروسہ نہیں۔۔۔

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : All right.  
When the details come, I will permit you ...  
(Interruptions). . . Now please take your seat.

SHRI N. E. BALARAM : Unless the  
ڈیٹیلز آئیں گی تب एलाऊ करूंगी।  
अभी कुछ नहीं। अभी आप अपनी जगह  
पर जाइए।  
Minister comes here, how can the information  
come ? The Minister has to tell us.  
Otherwise, how do we know ?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : He has «aid  
it.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA : Madam, the  
Home Minister says that it is a private matter  
whereas it is not a private matter. How is it a  
private matter any more ? . . . (Interruptions). . .  
It is not a private matter any more.

SHRI N. E. BALARAM: How do we know  
unless the Minister tells us ?

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA : Madam, we  
want the Home Minister to clarify whether the  
HRD Minister has written to the Prime  
Minister or not. It is not a private matter any  
more.

†[ ] Transliteration in Arabic Script.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : He will  
clarify. Please... (Interruptions) Please . . .  
(Interruptions) . . .

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA : We do not  
accept his argument that it is a private affair.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I am not  
allowing anything on that. Please, that is  
enough. . . (Interruptions). . . That is enough.  
Please, that is enough... (Interruptions) . . .

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त : चेंबरमैन साहिबा,  
मैं यह पूछना चाहता हूँ कि अगर ये खबर  
गलत है तो क्या गवर्नमेंट कुछ प्रपोज कर  
रही है उन लोगों के खिलाफ जिन लोगों ने  
गलत खबर दी है। कोई प्रिविलेज का  
सवाल उठा रहे हैं ? क्या कर रहे हैं ?  
खाली फाल्स कह देना तो काफी नहीं है।  
इन्होंने तो दरवाजे खोल दिए हैं क्योंकि इसके  
आगे तो दर्जनों कदम उठने हैं। आखिर  
क्या कदम उठाना चाहते हैं गलत खबर देने  
वालों के खिलाफ ? हुकूमत बताए, होम  
मिनिस्टर साहब बताएं।

شری سکندر بخت : چیمبرمین صاحبہ- میں  
یہ پوچھنا چاہتا ہوں کہ اگر یہ خبر غلط ہے  
تو کیا گورنمنٹ کچھ پریوز کر رہی ہے ان  
لوگوں کے خلاف جن لوگوں نے غلط خبر دی ہے  
کوئی پریویلیج کا سوال اٹھا رہے ہیں۔ کیا کر رہے  
ہیں۔ خالی فالس کہہ دینا تو کافی نہیں ہے انہوں  
نے تو دروازے کھول دے ہیں۔ کیوں  
کہ اُس کے آگے تو درجنوں قدم اٹھنے ہیں۔  
آخر کیا قدم اٹھانا چاہتے ہیں غلط خبر دینے  
والوں کے خلاف۔ حکومت بتائے۔ ہوم  
منسٹر صاحب بتائیں۔

†[ ] Transliteration in Arabic Script,

SHRI G. SWAMINATHAN : Madam, newspapers have reported it. As the Leader of my party, I want to know... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : A senior Minister's telephone is being tapped. How can they ask us to believe it is a private affair? How can it be a private affair?... *(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Now that matter, to me, is closed because I have other business. Please sit down. . . *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA : He did

होम मिनिस्टर ने जवाब दे दिया, बात खत्म हो गई . . . . *(अवधान)*

not reply. He said that it was a private affair. We are challenging that thesis. That argument will not cut much ice. It is not a private affair. It is the business of this House to go into it.

SHRI P. UPENDRA (Andhra Pradesh) : Simple denials will not do.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : The Ministers and the Members of Parliament write many letters to many people. Do you think that (he Home Minister has to reply to all of them ?

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA : He has written about the tapping of his telephone to the Prime Minister. That kind of an argument from the Home Minister will not do. . . *(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I have not permitted it. It has never been permitted by me. . . *(Interruptions)*... What you are talking is absolutely irrelevant. . . *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : Madam, it is a matter of urgent and paramount public importance. . . *(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Let me be very clear to you. please. You see, some matter is agitating your minds. You raised it and the Home Minister had responded to it...Please, just a second... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA : How can he respond ?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Whatever he does, it is his responsibility.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA : He did not. He has not responded to the whole matter.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Just a minute. About the letters anybody writes to anyone, it is not the responsibility of this House to discuss. . . *(Interruptions)*... I am not permitting it. . . *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA : What is the responsibility, Madam ? The concern of this House is about the tapping. The concern of this House is about the Prime Minister using the Government's intelligence machinery to tap the telephones. *(Interruptions)*... This is the issue.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : The issue concerns. . . *(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Will you please sit down ?... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA : When the Prime Minister and the Home Minister misuse the Government's intelligence machinery to do this, then we have a right to ask in this House.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : May I remind the Members that we have business—Railway Budget and the General Budget and so many other Ordinances. If the Members do not co-operate, then we will have to. . . *(Interruptions)* . . . Let me finish. . . *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA : We are not responsible for the Ordinances. Madam, we are not responsible for the Ordinances.

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM : But the Government is not cooperating.

SHRI N. E. BALARAM : Are they running a Government ?

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA : It is not our intention to stall the business of the House.



THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Otherwise, we will have to pass the Budget without discussion.

SHRI N. E. BALARAM : The Minister? telephones are being tapped....  
(Interruptions)...

श्री मोहम्मद अफजल उर्फ भीम अफजल : मैं इस, मैं पूरी जिम्मेदारी से कह रहा हूँ कि एक प्राइवेट एजेंसी ने अर्जुन सिंह जी के टेलीफोन को चेंक करने के बाद ये रिपोर्ट दी है, ये सर्टिफाई किया है कि उनका टेलीफोन टैप हो रहा है। एक प्राइवेट एजेंसी ने दिया है और अगर गवर्नमेंट यहां पर आए अपने रिप्लाइ के साथ....  
(व्यवधान)

श्री محمد افضل عرف م۔ افضل : میڈم میں پوری ذمہ داری سے کہہ رہا ہوں کہ ایک پرائیویٹ ایجنسی نے ارجن سنگھ جی کے ٹیلیفون کو چیک کرنے کے بعد یہ رپورٹ دی ہے۔ یہ سرٹیفائی کیا ہے کہ ان کا ٹیلیفون ٹیپ ہو رہا ہے۔ ایک پرائیویٹ ایجنسی نے دیا ہے اور اگر گورنمنٹ یہاں پر آئے اپنے ریلیٹی کے ساتھ... بد اخلت...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Let us discuss the issues which are of concern to us..  
.. (Interruptions) I am not permitting it..  
..(Interruptions)-..

श्री मोहम्मद अफजल उर्फ भीम अफजल : उसकी पूरी डिटेल्स आनी चाहिए हाऊस में....  
(व्यवधान) आज जब इनको सबसे सीनियर मेंबर पर एटेन्शन नहीं है तो हमारा पूरा हाऊस कैसे इनके बाकी मिनिस्टर्स पर एटेन्शन कर सकता है ?

†[ / Transliteration in Arabic Script.

شری محمد افضل عرف م۔ افضل :- اس کی پوری ڈیٹیلز آنی چاہئے ہاؤس میں...  
”بد اخلت“... آج جب ان کو سب سے سینئر ممبر پر اعتماد نہیں ہے تو ہمارا پورا ہاؤس کیسے باقی ان کے منسٹروں پر اعتماد کر سکتا ہے۔

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY (Pondicherry) : The Home Minister has clearly explained to the House. They are trying to politicise the issue.... (Interruptions)

They are trying to politicise the issue. There is no tapping. (Interruptions)

श्री मोहम्मद अफजल उर्फ भीम अफजल : हमारा पूरा हाऊस कैसे एतेराज कर सकता है....  
(व्यवधान)

श्री محمد افضل عرف م۔ افضل :- ہمارا پورا ہاؤس کیسے اعتماد کر سکتا ہے...  
”بد اخلت“...

श्री अजीत जोगी (मध्य प्रदेश) : उप-सभापति सहोदया, गृह मंत्री जी ने इस आरोप से इन्कार किया है कि केन्द्रीय मंत्री जी का टेलीफोन टैप हो रहा है। किन्तु इसके बारे में दूसरे बहुत से पहलू उठाए जा रहे हैं। मैं अपनी तरफ से यही कहना चाहूंगा कि चूंकि गृह मंत्री जी कह रहे हैं कि टेलीफोन टैप नहीं हो रहा है, इस का सही समाधान तब होगा जब गृह मंत्री जी इस पर एक विस्तृत स्टेटमेंट यहां दें। जितनी शंकाएं हैं उनकी निराधार साबित करें।  
.... (व्यवधान)

श्री मोहम्मद अफजल उर्फ भीम अफजल : इसकी पूरी जानकारी आनी चाहिए। ....  
(व्यवधान)

श्री محمد افضل عرف م۔ افضل :- اس کی پوری جانکاری آنی چاہئے... بد اخلت...

†[ ] Transliteration in Arabic Script.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : That matter is closed. We have got other business.

तालियां बज गईं, अब आप अपनी जगह पर जाइए ।

SHKI MENTAY PADMANABHAM : Madam, this matter is agitating everybody, including the Congress Members.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : Madam, this is a serious allegation... (Interruptions)

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA : How does the Home Minister react to the suggestion made by a Member of the Treasury Benches ? It is one of their Members.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : The Home Minister can talk to him. Now let us go ahead with Our business. (Interruptions) .

श्री अजीत जी : माननीय मंत्री जी ने कहा है कि ये आरोप निराधार हैं । इस लिए इनकी शंकाएं निराधार साबित हो जाएं, इसके लिए इस पर विस्तृत स्टेटमेंट हो जाए... (व्यवधान)

SHRIMATI IAYANTHI NATARAJAN (Tamil Nadu) : There is no tapping (Interruptions). The Home Minister cannot give a statement on each one's statement.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY : He said categorically that there was no tapping... (Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : If everybody is speaking, nothing will go on record. That is the only thing I can do. Anybody speaking on this matter is not going on record. We have got the listed business. I am going to it. Mr. Sitaram Kesri is sitting here. (Interruptions)

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : Madam, it is a question of propriety .....

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Mr. Dipen Ghosh, you heard what I said ? I said, after this, anything spoken on this subject is not going on record. We have got the listed business. Let us go ahead with that.

SHRI MOHAMMED AEZAL alias MEEM AFZAL : \*\*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Mr. Afzal, please go back to your seat.

आप अपनी जगह पर जाइए । .... (व्यवधान)

SHRI MOHAMMED AFZAL alias MEEM AFZAL : \*\*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Mr. Afzal, please go back to your seat. I said nothing will go on record.

SHRI MOHAMMED AFZAL alias MEEM AFZAL : \*\*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Please go back to your seat. My protection was there enough. I gave you enough protection. You so back to your seat. Whatever you discuss with your leaders, you can discuss with them in the Lobby. Now, I am going to start and announce... (Interruptions) मान साहब, Please do

not argue with me. Please sit down. When I am on my feet, you must sit down. (Interruptions) Please sit down. Let me make an announcement. Mr. Kesri will give a reply to the discussion which we had On the Bill which is pending before the House. And after that, we will take up the Railway Budget as desired by the Members. (Interruptions)

श्री सत्य प्रकाश मालवीय : उपसभापति महोदया, मुझे चेंबरमैन साहब ने एलाउन् किया है । .... (व्यवधान)

उपसभापति : क्या एलाउन् किया है .... (व्यवधान)

श्री सत्य प्रकाश मालवीय : कागज आपके पास होगा .... इलाहाबाद में .... (व्यवधान)

श्री आप्पेन्द्र सिंह (नाम निर्देशित) : महोदय. मुझे भी चेंबरमैन साहब ने एलाउन् किया है .... (व्यवधान) मुझे इजाजत दो ....

उपसभापति : मेरे पास नहीं लिखा है .... (व्यवधान)

\*\* Not recorded.