329

References

Gupta, please sit down. (Interruptions)... Just a minute, Mathurji. You have a right your make viewpoints. (Interruptions)... I said, "please sit down". You made your viewpoints. (Interruptions)...

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: You did not allow me. (Interruptions)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Correct. You also did not allow. (Interruptions)... pleased sit down. Mr. Gurudas Das Gupta, please sit down. (Interruptions)... Mr. Narayanasamy, please sit down. Gurudasji, I called your name and you spoke. (Interruptions)... Just one minute, please. I allowed you to speak and it is a part of the record. Now other Members have a right to have their viewpoints. Definitely I am going to allow to speak whoever wants to speak. Some may speak in support of you and some may speak against you. That does not mean you should not allow others and drown their voice. (Interruptions)... Now, I won't permit it. (Interruptions)... If you agree, please sit down. (Interruptions)...

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Should I not use my freedom?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You have your freedom of speech. (Interruptions)...

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: You did not allow me. (Interruptions)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: One Minute. Let me bring to the notice of the Members that they have their freedom of speech. Now, if I have identified Mr. Mathur, he has his freedom of speech. Please co-operate. The House is run on different opinions. The House is not run on one opinion. So, let them express their opinion. (Interruptions)...

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Let me express my opinion. He did not allow me. (Interruptions)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: If you did not hear, you were not in the House, if I remember. So, definitely you could

not follow. (Interruptions)... Please sit down. I have noticed who are in the House and who are not in the House (Interruptions)... Please go and see the record tomorrow or in the evening. Now, Mr. Mathur. I have other business to do.

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुरः मैडम, जैसे मैंने कहा कि मज़दर का, कर्मचारी का अधिकार है कि हडताल करे। उस हडताल का उपयोग जहां तक किया जा रहा है मैं और मेरा दल उसका समर्थन करते हैं। लेकिन यदि कोई मज़दूर आंदोलन केवल राजनीतिक दृष्टि से ही किया जाए वह आज की परिस्थिति में उचित नहीं है। जहां तक आज की हड़ताल का सवाल है, मेरे दल का यह स्पष्ट मत है कि जहां तक बैंक के राष्ट्रीयकरण या उसमें जो निजी पंजी का सवाल है उसमें मेरा दल उनके साथ नहीं है, लेकिन उसके साथ दूसरी मांगें भी है जैसे थर्ड बैनिफिट आदि जितनी मांगे हैं. उसका मैं समर्थन करता हं। लेकिन उसके साथ सरकार को भी चाहिए कि उन मांगों पर विचार कर निर्णय दे। मैं अपने कम्यनिस्ट दोस्तों से कहता है कि केवल मजदरों का भला न करते हए राजनीतिक दृष्टि से आंदोलन करते हुए और अंडरहैंड समझौता करके, मेरे दोस्त नाराज होंगे, एक नहीं, दस उदाहरण है कांग्रेस के साथ गवर्नमेंट के साथ मिलकर समझौते किए। जहां पर मजदूरों का हित नहीं होता तो मजदरों के हित के साथ राजनीतिक उल्ल सीधा न करें। इसलिए मेरा समर्थन इस हड़ताल के साथ उस हद तक है जहां तक उनके थर्ड बैनिफिट आदि के अधिकार है. लेकिन केवल उसका राजनीतिक उपयोग कर रहे हैं. मैं उसका समर्थन नहीं कर सकता।

उपसभापतिः बोलिए जयपाल जी। जयपाल जी, आप किस पर बोल रहे हैं?

## Reported Postponement of Thirteenth Launch of Prithvi Missile

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY (Andhra Pradesh): Madam, I wish to draw the attention of the entire House to a very disturbing development. I am dismayed and saddened to know that the 13th launch of Prithvi missile has been postponed under the pressure of the State Department of United States. (Interruptions)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Jaipalji, you had raised it two days back. (Interruptions)...

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: Madam.

the last launch of Prithvi missile was in November, 1993. (*Interruptions*)... please hear me, Madam. This was to be postponed under the pressure... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN (Tamil Nadu): Madam, a statement was made in the House... (Interruptions)...

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: Madani....

THE **DEPUTY** CHAIRMAN: lust one minute. (Interruptions)... Just one minute. (Interruptions)... Order, please. {Interruptions}... Jayanthiji, please down. (Interruptions)... Narayansamy, Please sit down. (Interruptions)... Please sit down. Let mc keep everybody quiet. Please be quiet. Jaipalji, two days ago you had raised this issue. You know that under our rules a matter which has been raised in the House you cannot raise it again and again. We have other business also. (Interruptions)...

DR. MURLI MANOHAR JOSHI (Uttar Pradesh): This issue has not been raised. (Interruptions)...

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: This issue has not been raised. (Interruptions). I am making a serious allegation with all sense of responsibility that the 13th launch of Prithvi has been postponed under the pressure of the United States. (Interruptions)... The Prime Minister's visit to the United States... (Interruptions). This is a disturbing development. May tell you.... (Interruptions).

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY (Pandicherry): Madam. ....(Interruptions).

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: Madam, I am being disturbed. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Madam..... (Interruptions).

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: Madam. 1 want.to be heard. (*Interruptions*).

I want to be heard. (*Interruptions*). The Indian Army... (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr Reddy, you have raised it earlier also. (*Interruptions*). It has been raised before also. (*Interruptions*).

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Madam,... (Interruptions).

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: The Government should clarify the position. (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Shri John F. Fernandes. (*Interruptions*).

S\*HRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: ...took objection to the launch of prithvi... (*Interruptions*). The Government of India has succumbed... (*Interruptions*). I make this allegation as a responsible Member of this House. (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Jaipal Reddy, you raised this point earlier also. Mr. I. K. Gujral spoke about it. Everybody spoke about it. (*Interruptions*). 1 cannot permit it. (*Interruptions*). I have to call other Members also. (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am going according to the rules. It is not my will or my

विपक्ष के नेता (श्री सिकन्दर बख्त): सदर साहिबा, सवाल किंतनी दफा उठाने का नहीं है। गर्वामेंट ने अपना एटीच्यूट पृथ्वी के बारे में आज तक साफ नहीं किया है। हम बार-बार दरखास्त करते रहे हैं और इस मामले में गर्वामेंट अगर बिल्कुल खामोश है तो यह सखाल बार-बार उठना ही चाहिए।

متری سکندر بخت: صدر معاحبه - سوال شخشی د فعدا تفات کا نیس پیدگورنمنگ نے اپنادیشی چیوٹ " پیر تقوی "کے بارے س اُبعی تک سما مذہری کہا ہے - ہم بار بار درفق مرد بیے ہیں اور اس معاطہ میں گورنمنٹ اگر بالکل نی مدیش ہے تو پیرسوال بار بار انگفنا جا پیش ووں \* مداخلت "

wish or my desire. I have to run this House on certain rules. Mr. Sikander Bakhtji, that is what I am

<sup>†[]</sup>Transliteration in Arabic Script.

telling. If a matter is being raised in this House... (Interruptions).

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: Madam, you ask the Government to react... (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: 1 cannot ask them to react. (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: You can. (Interruptions).

DR. MURLI MANOHAR JOSHI: Madam, it is agitating the minds of all the people in the country. (*Interrupttons*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: ! must tell you that Shrimati Alva reacted to it the day before yesterday and made a statement in the House. What else do you want? (Interruptions).

श्री दिग्विजय सिंह (बिहार): ग्रेज एक नई घटना घट रही है और इसकी मुचना मिल रही है और आप इस बात को कहकर नहीं टाल सकती कि यह पुगनी बात है। ..(क्यवधान)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Do you want the whole Government to react? (*Interruptions*).

SHRI DIGVIJAY SINGH: Madani. (Interruptions).

DR. MURLI MANOHAR JOSHI: The Government must react and inform the people why this touch of Prithvi has been postponed. This is not a very simple matter. It is a very serious matter. The Prime Minister had assured the House that the missile programme, missile experiment, will not he capped and will not be stopped and all that. What happened to that assurance'.' (Interruptions).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: They stand by that. (*Interruptions*).

The Government has reacted to it What else do you want? (Interruptions!.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: The scheduled launch of Prithvi has been postponed for political reasons. It was a launch which was... (*Interruptions*).

DR. BIPLAB DASGUPTA (West Bengal): We would like to know whether

it has been stopped or it has not been stopped We want a categorical answer from the Prime Minister. (*Interruption*.)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Y,. have expressed your sentiments.

In spite of my request, you have ralesed this issue. (*Interrupttons*).

SHRI DIGVIJAY SINGH: The Prime Minister should come here and explain it.

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OK PERSONNEL, PUBLIC GRIEVANCES AND PENSIONS AND THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA): I will convey the feelings of the hon. Members to the Prime Minister.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: Madani, we are making an allegation that the scheduled launch has been put off.. (*Interrupttons*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Your allegation will be conveyed.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: We are very much agitated. (*Interruptions*).

DR. BIPLAB DASGUPTA: The Prime Minister has misled the House. Actually the programme

stopped.. (Interruptions).

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: Let the Government take \_\_(Interruptions).

डा॰ पुरनी मनोहर जोफी: महोदया, मरकार को यह ब्यामा चाहिए कि पृथ्वी लांच करने के बारे में लेटेस्ट प्राजीशन क्या है? क्या उसे पोस्टपोन किया गया है? अग्य फेस्टपोन किया गया है ...(व्यवधान)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You have had your say...(*Interrrpuons*). If you go on speaking the whole day, it will not matter. Let her no and explain to the Prime Minister what the Members feel and she can conic back...(*Interruptions*).

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: You direct the Government to come out with a statement.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: She has committed herself. There is no need for

335

direction. If she had done it, I would have given a direction...(Interruptions).

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: We would like to know whether the launching has been postponed... (Interruptions).

DR. BIPLAB DASGUPTA: Let them say, 'Yes' or No'...........(Interruptions). We want a categorical answer—that the launching has been stopped or not stepped... (Interruptions).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: At least let us not postpone our business. Let us go ahead with it...(*Interruptions*).

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Let the Minister find out and tell the House.. (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Jaipalji, what is the point in repeating (*Interruptions*).

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: The Government must, at least, react... (Interruptions).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Just a minute....(Interruptions) One person at a time...(Interruptions) I said, please, just a minute...(Interruptions) Once you raised this matter in the House. Even today, in spite of my reminding you that it was raised two days ago...(Interruptions) I am sorry, Dr. Joshi. You are a Professor and you know that when you speak, students should listen. At least, I am the presiding officer. Please listen me... (Interruptions) Gurudasji, Biplab Dasji, one second. I will allow you.' Let me explain. I had a feeling that according to the rule...(Interruptions) Everybody, Jaipalji, Dr. Joshi, Gujralji, Biplabji, feels that this matter is serious. Okay, you raised it. But if you keep on raising it once, twice, thrice, in the same hour, is it going to make any difference? (Interruptions)

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: The Government should react.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The Government has already reacted with one sentence.... (Interruptions) She did... (Interruptions)

DR. BIPLAB, DASGUPTA: Let them give a categorical answer saying 'Yes' or 'No'... (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Just a minute. What reaction do you want? She cannot go and launch the Prithvi. She can only tell the Prime Minister and she promised that she would go and tell the Prime Minister about your complaint, your allegation, your sentiments, your statement, every-thing...(Interruptions) It cannot be done immediately. Just because you feel that Prithvi is being delayed, I am not going to delav mv business in House...(Interruptions) Forget it. It is over....(Interruptions) That matter is over to me...(Interruptions) Enough enough...(Interruptions).

INDER KUMAR GUJRAL (Bihar): Madam, I want to put a simple question. The hon. Minsiter of State for External Affairs is sitting here. I want to ask the Minister through you: Is it or is it not a fact that the non-paper sent by the Americans demanded suspension of the and Prithvi? And Government told them back that they had no business to interfere in matter? Ι want simple reply... (Interruptions).

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: It is not Question Hour.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Shri John F. Fernandes...(Interruptions) If he wants to answer, he will answer. I cannot... (Interruptions).

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Why should he reply? (Interruptions). You cannot force the Minister to reply...(Interruptions).

श्री सिकन्दर बखाः सदर साहिबा, गवर्नमेंट का इस पर जवाब होना चाहिए।...(व्यवधान) مشری سکندرکشت : صدر مساحبه سگرارشط کا دس پیرجواب میونا چا سیم . . . . . .

श्री दिग्विजय सिंह: अगर गुजराल साहब का ही जवाब नहीं मिल रहा है तो हमारी सरकार इसको छिपा रही है 1...(ज्यवधान)

श्री सिकन्दर बख्तः अगर हम अपने मिसाईल

33?

प्रोगाम में रुकावटें डालते हैं तो हम अपने-आपको पाकिस्तान के मुकाबले. में कमजोर कर रहे हैं।...(व्यवधान) वह एक अलहदा बात है। ...(व्यवधान) हमारे लिए खतरा पैदा हो रहा है। हम सीधा साफ-सुथरा जवाब चाहते हैं कि क्या उन्होंने पथ्वी और अभि के बारे में जो स्कावट डाली है वह अमेरिका के दबाव से डाली है या नहीं डाली है या हमारे प्रोगाम जिस तरह से चलते रहने चाहिए थे वह इसी तरह से चलते रहना चाहिए। हमें दोहरे खतरे हैं। उपसभापति: सिकन्दर बख्त साहब, समय तो

श्री सिकन्दर बख्तः हर एक तरीके से वलनरेबल पोजिशन में लाकर डिस्पुट खड़ा करने की कोशिश कर रहे हैं।

شیک میمندد بخت ؛ اگرمی اینے میزانل بر*وگرام میں و کاوٹیس ڈ*التے ہیں نو ہر اینے آپ کو پاکستان کے مقابلے میں کرور كرد بيريس . . . . "مدر خلت " و . . و ٥ ایک علیحدی بات سے .... مدرخلت "٠٠٠ بعاد سے بیے خطری ببیدا می*واریا ہیے ۔ ہم ب*یوط معاف متحوا جواب ميا يبيغ بس كدكيا إنفوس ف گیرنفوی" اور"اگئی " کے بارے میں رکمان<sup>ی</sup> والى يى با بماد سه بروگرام صى م 2 سے ملة رسن ما سب بق وه اس مرح سے جلتے دسینا عابشی - بیمیں دومبرے خطریات اب مبعایت : سکندر، کنت معاصب سے تود <u>کھ</u>ئے ۔

مفری سکندر بخت : برایک لمرلیتے بسے « ول نرايبل » يوزيشن سي لاكر ع سپیونٹ کولا کرنے کی کوشٹ کردیے ہیں۔ उपसभापतिः आप जवान चाह रहे हैं । आप थोड़ा क्रक्त तो दीजिए। आप अगर बैठे तो मैं जवाब पार Mrs. Alva, is there any such proposal?

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA: Madam, as I said earlier, I shall certainly convey the feelings of the Members of this House and I shall certainly ask that somebody should come and clarify the position in the House by tomorrow. (interruptions).

THE DEPUTY' CHAIRMAN: She cannot speak. You should understand this. How can she know who will come and clarify the position? She cannot say. She has to discuss it with other people... (Interruptions).

References

श्री सिकन्दर बद्धाः सदर साहिबा, मात्रेरेट अल्बा जी ने जो बात कही है, वह बिल्कुल दुरुस्त है। इससे ज्यादा वह कुछ कह नहीं सकतीं। लेकिन हमारी परेशानी यह है कि हमें जवाब मिल ही नहीं रहा है। भ्रम्याकरें।

نشمی سکند دبخت : مدد صاحبر \_ مادبهت الواجى في جو بات كمى يبي وه بالعل درست یع اس سے زیادہ وہ کھ نسب کسرکتیں لیکن بھاری ہرلیشانی نہ ہے کہ ہمیں جہ اب مل بھی نہیں ریا ہیے - کیا کریں ۔

उपस्थापतिः आ जाएगा। भी सिकन्दर भएतः उन्होंने जो कुछ कहा है वह ठीक है। वह उसके अलावा क्या कह सकती है पर प्रश्र यह है कि हम लोगों के कंसर्न का जवाब आता क्यों नहीं है?

مشری سکندر مخنت ! انفول نے چوکی کنا ہے وہ تقبیک ہے وہ اسکے علاوہ کیاکنہ مىكتى بېس بېر بېرشن يەرىپے كەبىم بوگوپ کے کنے رن کا جواب آتا کیوں نیس سے उपस्थापतिः अभी युप हो जाए ती मैं कुछ बोलूं...(ट्यवधान) एक मिनट आप तशरीफ रिखए (खबधान)

श्री सिकन्दर बख्तः सदर साहिबा, इसका यही गस्ता है कि हम उस वक्त तक दरख्वास्त करें आपसे तक यहां सही जवाब देने वाला कोई न आ जाए। प्राईम-मिनिस्टर हों या दूसरे कोई हों, उस वक्त तक हाऊस की कार्रवाई को रोका जाए ...(व्यवधान) مشری مکنددیخت ۱ صدرصاحب \_ اسکا یهی دا سنته یبه که اس وقت تک د دفوه<sup>ی</sup> كرس اب سے جب تك كوربان مجوجواب م بینے واللہ کوئے مذہ سے ایٹ - بیرائم منسٹر بېون يا د و بسر يه کې دغې بيون \_ دسو نمت تک بافرس کی کارروائی کو دوکی حالے .... ۱۱ بهراخلت ۲ ۲۰۰۰ ۰۰

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: One minute please. I am very sorry. I am not going the business of this House, whether there is ... (Interruptions) The House is my job ...(Interruptions)... The Minister has said. This is not fair ... (Interruptions)... Let the answer conic. I am not going to adjourn the House .. .(Interruptions)... You cannot do all this. I am not allowing. Now. Mr. John F. Fernandes ...(Interrupttons)... .Just a minute. Please just ...(Interruptions)... You are taking things too far. I made a promise. I told Mrs. Alva to go. You cannot stop the business of the House on an unlisted business. Please sit down. Nothing will go on record. I cannot get you the answer now itself and I am not going to adjourn the House. I can assure you this. Let Mr. John F. Fernandes speak. Tragic Crash of a Sahara Airlines Aircraft SHRI JOHN F. FERNANDES (Goa): Madani, we all know the tragic crash of a Sahara airline. Some persons were injured ...(Interruptions)... The hon. Minister of Civil Aviation is not in the country ...(Interruptions)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You are taking things too far. You are taking things too far. You are taking things too far. Take your seats. Please take your seats, It amounts to taking things too far. It is not fait...(Interruptions)... The business of the House cannot be stopped till you get an answer ...(Interruptions)... I am not allowing you to stop the business of the House. Mr. Fernandes, you speak.

SHRI JOHN F. FERNANDES: Madam, the Sahara aircrash is a very tragic one ........ (*Interruptions*)......

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: cannot do all this just because I am very co-operative. The Leader of the Opposition cannot say that the business of the House should be stopped till an answer is received. He does not have that We listed right. have some business.....(Interruptions)..... Just a minute. Please don't argue. Please sit down ......(Interruptions)...... Please down. Mr Jaipal Reddy, please sit down.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY (Andhra Pradesh): Madani, we have a right to get an answer ....... (Interruption;) ......

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Jaipal Reddy, you don't understand what I say. You are irritating me very much. You don't understand how I can hear if ten people speak at the same time and you are asking me to get an answer. I cannot. I have conveyed your sentiments and that is all about it. We will go ahead with the listed business .......(Interruptions)...... I am not adjourning the House at all. You can go out .......(Interruptions)...... I am not going to adjourn the House. Please sit down.

श्री दिग्विजय सिंह (बिहार): मंडम, मरा बात मृतिए: में यह कह रहा हूं कि सरकार का रवंदा क्या है? इसी मदन में हमने पृछा था कि भारत के प्रधानमंत्री का अमरीका का दौरा राजकीय दौरा है या नहीं। जो मम्मान भारत के प्रधानमंत्री को मिलना चाहिए था। वह नहीं मिल रहा है। यहां पर सरकार की तरफ से उसका कोई जवाब नहीं आया। दूसरे दिन अमरीका की सरकार की तरफ में जवाब आता है अखबारों के माध्यम से कि भारत के प्रधानमंत्री का यह दौरा स्टेट विजिट नहीं है। हम लोग संमद में बंटकार कर क्या रहे हैं? हमारे सवाल का जवाब भारत की सरकार न दे, हमारे सवाल का जवाब अमरीका की सरकार दे, यह क्या हा रहा है? THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I

adiourn the cannot House. ......(Interruptions) I am not adjourning the House for no reason. .....(Interruptions) Till the answer comes from the Government, we will continue with our business. Mr. Fernandes, please speak. (Interruptions)

उपस्भापनि मिकंदर बाक्त साहब आप बैटिए। .....(ब्यह I conveyed your sentiments. Beyond