

Gupta, please sit down. (*Interruptions*)... Just a minute, Mathurji. You have a right to make your viewpoints (*Interruptions*)... I said, "please sit down". You made your viewpoints. (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: You did not allow me. (*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Correct. You also did not allow. (*Interruptions*)... please sit down. Mr. Gurudas Das Gupta, please sit down. (*Interruptions*)... Mr. Narayanasamy, please sit down. Gurudasji, I called your name and you spoke. (*Interruptions*)... Just one minute, please. I allowed you to speak and it is a part of the record. Now other Members have a right to have their viewpoints. Definitely I am going to allow to speak whoever wants to speak. Some may speak in support of you and some may speak against you. That does not mean you should not allow others and drown their voice. (*Interruptions*)... Now, I won't permit it. (*Interruptions*)... If you agree, please sit down. (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Should I not use my freedom?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You have your freedom of speech. (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: You did not allow me. (*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: One Minute. Let me bring to the notice of the Members that they have their freedom of speech. Now, if I have identified Mr. Mathur, he has his freedom of speech. Please co-operate. The House is run on different opinions. The House is not run on one opinion. So, let them express their opinion. (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Let me express my opinion. He did not allow me. (*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: If you did not hear, you were not in the House, if I remember. So, definitely you could

not follow. (*Interruptions*)... Please sit down. I have noticed who are in the House and who are not in the House. (*Interruptions*)... Please go and see the record tomorrow or in the evening. Now, Mr. Mathur. I have other business to do.

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर: मैडम, जैसे मैं कह रहा कि मजदूर का, कर्मचारी का अधिकार है कि हड़ताल करे। उस हड़ताल का उपयोग जहां तक किया जा रहा है मैं और मेरा दल उसका समर्थन करते हैं। लेकिन यदि कोई मजदूर आंदोलन केवल राजनीतिक दृष्टि से ही किया जाए वह आज की परिस्थिति में उचित नहीं है। जहां तक आज की हड़ताल का सवाल है, मेरे दल का यह स्पष्ट मत है कि जहां तक बैंक के राष्ट्रीयकरण या उसमें जो निजी पूंजी का सवाल है उसमें मेरा दल उनके साथ नहीं है, लेकिन उसके साथ दूसरी मांगें भी हैं जैसे थर्ड बेनिफिट आदि जितनी मांगें हैं, उसका मैं समर्थन करता हूं। लेकिन उसके साथ सरकार को भी चाहिए कि उन मांगों पर विचार कर निर्णय दे। मैं अपने कम्युनिस्ट दोस्तों से कहता हूं कि केवल मजदूरों का भला न करते हुए राजनीतिक दृष्टि से आंदोलन करते हुए और अंडरहैंड समझौता करके, मेरे दोस्त नाराज होंगे, एक नहीं, दस उदाहरण हैं कांग्रेस के साथ गवर्नमेंट के साथ मिलकर समझौते किए। जहां पर मजदूरों का हित नहीं होता तो मजदूरों के हित के साथ राजनीतिक उल्लू सीधा न करें। इसलिए मेरा समर्थन इस हड़ताल के साथ उस हद तक है जहां तक उनके थर्ड बेनिफिट आदि के अधिकार हैं, लेकिन केवल उसका राजनीतिक उपयोग कर रहे हैं, मैं उसका समर्थन नहीं कर सकता।

उपसभापति: बोलिए जयपाल जी। जयपाल जी, आप किस पर बोल रहे हैं?

Reported Postponement of Thirteenth Launch of Prithvi Missile

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY (Andhra Pradesh): Madam, I wish to draw the attention of the entire House to a very disturbing development. I am dismayed and saddened to know that the 13th launch of Prithvi missile has been postponed under the pressure of the State Department of United States. (*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Jaipalji, you had raised it two days back. (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: Madam,

the last launch of Prithvi missile was in November, 1993. (*Interruptions*)... please hear me, Madam. This was to be postponed under the pressure (*Interruptions*).

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN (Tamil Nadu): Madam, a statement was made in the House... (*Interruptions*)..

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: Madam....

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Just one minute. (*Interruptions*).. Just one minute. (*Interruptions*)... Order, please. (*Interruptions*)... Jayanthiji, please sit down. (*Interruptions*)... Narayansamy, Please sit down. (*Interruptions*). Please sit down. Let me keep everybody quiet. Please be quiet. Jaipalji, two days ago you had raised this issue. You know that under our rules a matter which has been raised in the House you cannot raise it again and again. We have other business also. (*Interruptions*)..

DR. MURLI MANOHAR JOSHI (Uttar Pradesh): This issue has not been raised. (*Interruptions*)..

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: This issue has not been raised (*Interruptions*). I am making a serious allegation with all sense of responsibility that the 13th launch of Prithvi has been postponed under the pressure of the United States. (*Interruptions*)... The Prime Minister's visit to the United States (*Interruptions*). This is a disturbing development. May I tell you (*Interruptions*).

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY (Pandicherry): Madam, ... (*Interruptions*).

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: Madam, I am being disturbed (*Interruptions*)

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Madam,.... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: Madam, I want to be heard. (*Interruptions*)

I want to be heard. (*Interruptions*). The Indian Army. (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr Reddy, you have raised it earlier also. (*Interruptions*). It has been raised before also. (*Interruptions*).

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN. Madam,... (*Interruptions*).

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: The Government should clarify the position. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Shri John F. Fernandes. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY:took objection to the launch of prithvi... (*Interruptions*). The Government of India has succumbed... (*Interruptions*). I make this allegation as a responsible Member of this House. (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Jaipal Reddy, you raised this point earlier also. Mr. I. K. Gujral spoke about it. Everybody spoke about it. (*Interruptions*). I cannot permit it. (*Interruptions*) I have to call other Members also. (*Interruptions*).

विपक्ष के नेता (श्री सिकन्दर बख्त): सदर साहिबा, सवाल कितनी दफा उठाने का नहीं है। गवर्नमेंट ने अपना एटीच्यूट पृथ्वी के बारे में आज तक साफ नहीं किया है। हम बार-बार दरखास्त करते रहे हैं और इस मामले में गवर्नमेंट अगर बिल्कुल खामोश है तो यह सवाल बार-बार उठाना ही चाहिए। (व्यवधान)...

شری سکندر بخت: صدر صاحبہ - سوال کتنی دفعہ اٹھائے گا نہیں ہے گورنمنٹ نے اپنا ایٹی چیوٹ "پیر قہوی" کے بارے میں ابھی تک سفا نہیں کیا ہے۔ ہم بار بار درخواست کر رہے ہیں اور اس معاملہ میں گورنمنٹ اگر بالکل خاموش ہے تو یہ سوال بار بار اٹھنا چاہیے۔۔۔۔ "مدخلت"

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am going according to the rules. It is not my will or my wish or my desire. I have to run this House on certain rules. Mr. Sikander Bakhtji, that is what I am

[†][Transliteration in Arabic Script]

telling. If a matter is being raised in this House... (*Interruptions*).

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY. Madam, you ask the Government to react (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I cannot ask them to react. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: You can (*Interruptions*).

DR. MURLI MANOHAR JOSHI. Madam, it is agitating the minds of all the people in the country. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I must tell you that Shrimati Alva reacted to it the day before yesterday and made a statement in the House. What else do you want? (*Interruptions*).

श्री दिग्विजय सिंह (बिहार): राज एक नई घटना घट रही है और इसकी सूचना मिल रही है और आप इस बात को कहकर नहीं टाल सकती कि यह पुरानी बात है। (व्यवधान)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Do you want the whole Government to react? (*Interruptions*)

SHRI DIGVIJAY SINGH. Madam (*Interruptions*).

DR. MURLI MANOHAR JOSHI. The Government must react and inform the people why this launch of Prithvi has been postponed. This is not a very simple matter. It is a very serious matter. The Prime Minister had assured the House that the missile programme, missile experiment, will not be capped and will not be stopped and all that. What happened to that assurance? (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: They stand by that. (*Interruptions*)

The Government has reacted to it. What else do you want? (*Interruptions*)

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY. The scheduled launch of Prithvi has been postponed for political reasons. It was a launch which was... (*Interruptions*)

DR. BIPLAB DASGUPTA (West Bengal): We would like to know whether

it has been stopped or it has not been stopped. We want a categorical answer from the Prime Minister. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You have expressed your sentiments.

In spite of my request, you have raised this issue. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI DIGVIJAY SINGH: The Prime Minister should come here and explain it.

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PERSONNEL, PUBLIC GRIEVANCES AND PENSIONS AND THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA): I will convey the feelings of the hon. Members to the Prime Minister.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY. Madam, we are making an allegation that the scheduled launch has been put off. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Your allegation will be conveyed.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY. We are very much agitated. (*Interruptions*)

DR. BIPLAB DASGUPTA: The Prime Minister has misled the House. Actually the programme was stopped. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY. Let the Government take. (*Interruptions*).

डा० मुरली मनोहर जोशी: महोदया, सरकार को यह योजना चाहिए कि पृथ्वी लॉन्च करने के बारे में लेटेस्ट पोन्ट्रॉपन क्या है? क्या उसे पोन्ट्रॉपन किया गया है? अगर पोन्ट्रॉपन किया गया है... (व्यवधान)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You have had your say... (*Interruptions*). If you go on speaking the whole day, it will not matter. Let her go and explain to the Prime Minister what the Members feel and she can come back. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: You direct the Government to come out with a statement.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: She has committed herself. There is no need for

direction. If she had done it, I would have given a direction...(Interruptions).

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: We would like to know whether the launching has been postponed...(Interruptions).

DR. BIPLAB DASGUPTA: Let them say, 'Yes' or No'.....(Interruptions). We want a categorical answer—that the launching has been stopped or not stepped...(Interruptions).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: At least let us not postpone our business. Let us go ahead with it...(Interruptions).

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Let the Minister find out and tell the House...(Interruptions).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Jaipalji, what is the point in repeating (Interruptions).

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: The Government must, at least, react...(Interruptions).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Just a minute....(Interruptions) One person at a time...(Interruptions) I said, please, just a minute...(Interruptions) Once you raised this matter in the House. Even today, in spite of my reminding you that it was raised two days ago...(Interruptions) I am sorry, Dr. Joshi. You are a Professor and you know that when you speak, students should listen. At least, I am the presiding officer. Please listen to me...(Interruptions) Gurudasji, Biplab Dasji, one second. I will allow you. Let me explain. I had a feeling that according to the rule...(Interruptions) Everybody, Jaipalji, Dr. Joshi, Gujralji, Biplabji, feels that this matter is serious. Okay, you raised it. But if you keep on raising it once, twice, thrice, in the same hour, is it going to make any difference? (Interruptions)

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: The Government should react.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The Government has already reacted with one sentence....(Interruptions) She did...(Interruptions)

DR. BIPLAB DASGUPTA: Let them give a categorical answer saying 'Yes' or 'No'...(Interruptions).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Just a minute. What reaction do you want? She cannot go and launch the Prithvi. She can only tell the Prime Minister and she promised that she would go and tell the Prime Minister about your complaint, your allegation, your sentiments, your statement, every-thing...(Interruptions) It cannot be done immediately. Just because you feel that Prithvi is being delayed, I am not going to delay my business in this House...(Interruptions) Forget it. It is over....(Interruptions) That matter is over to me...(Interruptions) Enough is enough...(Interruptions).

SHRI INDER KUMAR GUJRAL (Bihar): Madam, I want to put a simple question. The hon. Minister of State for External Affairs is sitting here. I want to ask the Minister through you: Is it or is it not a fact that the non-paper sent by the Americans demanded suspension of the Agni and Prithvi? And has the Government told them back that they had no business to interfere in this matter? I want simple reply...(Interruptions).

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: It is not Question Hour.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Shri John F. Fernandes...(Interruptions) If he wants to answer, he will answer. I cannot... (Interruptions).

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Why should he reply? (Interruptions). You cannot force the Minister to reply...(Interruptions).

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त: सदर साहिबा, गवर्नमेंट का इस पर जवाब होना चाहिए।...(व्यवधान)

شری سکندر بخت: صدر صاحبہ کو جواب ملنا چاہیے۔۔۔۔۔۔
"مداخلت"

श्री दिविविजय सिंह: अगर गुजराल साहब का ही जवाब नहीं मिल रहा है तो हमारी सरकार इसको छिपा रही है।...(व्यवधान)

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त: अगर हम अपने मिसाईल

प्रोगाम में रुकावटें डालते हैं तो हम अपने-आपको पाकिस्तान के मुकाबले में कमजोर कर रहे हैं।... (व्यवधान) वह एक अलहदा बात है। ... (व्यवधान) हमारे लिए खतरा पैदा हो रहा है। हम सीधा साफ-सुथरा जवाब चाहते हैं कि क्या उन्होंने पृथ्वी और अग्नि के बारे में जो रुकावट डाली है वह अमेरिका के दबाव से डाली है या नहीं डाली है या हमारे प्रोगाम जिस तरह से चलते रहने चाहिए थे वह इसी तरह से चलते रहना चाहिए। हमें दोहरे खतरे हैं।

उपसभापति: सिकन्दर बख्त साहब, समय तो दीजिए।

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त: हर एक तरीके से वलनरेबल पोजिशन में लाकर डिस्पुट खड़ा करने की कोशिश कर रहे हैं।

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त: अगर हम अपने मित्रांश परोग्राम में रुकावटें डालते हैं तो हम अपने आप को पाकिस्तान के मुकाबले में कमजोर कर रहे हैं।... "मداخلत" ... ००

एक एलिमेंट बात यह है... "मداخلत" ... हमारे बड़े बड़े खतरे पैदा हो रहे हैं - हम सिद्धांत रूप से समझते हैं कि पाकिस्तान ने "निरत्यू" और "अग्नि" के बारे में रुकावटें डाली हैं या हमारे परोग्राम को २ से ३ घंटे रोकने का प्रयत्न है वह इसी तरह से चलते रहना चाहिए - हमें दोहरे खतरे हैं -
अब समाप्ति: सिकन्दर बख्त صاحب से
तुदिये -

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त: हर एक तरीके से
"वर्ल्ड नरिबल" पोजिशन में लाकर
डिस्पुट खड़ा करने की कोशिश कर रहे हैं -

उपसभापति: आप जवाब चाह रहे हैं। आप थोड़ा वक्त तो दीजिए। आप अगर बैठे तो मैं जवाब मांगू। Mrs. Alva, is there any such proposal?

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA:
Madam, as I said earlier, I shall certainly convey the feelings of the Members of this House and I shall certainly ask that somebody should come and clarify the position in the House by tomorrow. (Interruptions).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: She cannot speak. You should understand this. How can she know who will come and clarify the position? She cannot say. She has to discuss it with other people... (Interruptions).

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त: सदर साहिबा, माग्रीट अल्वा जी ने जो बात कही है, वह बिल्कुल दुरुस्त है। इससे ज्यादा वह कुछ कह नहीं सकती। लेकिन हमारी परेशानी यह है कि हमें जवाब मिल ही नहीं रहा है। क्या करें।

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त: सदर साहिबा - माग्रीट अल्वा जी ने जो बात कही है, वह बिल्कुल दुरुस्त है। इससे ज्यादा वह कुछ कह नहीं सकती। लेकिन हमारी परेशानी यह है कि हमें जवाब मिल ही नहीं रहा है। क्या करें।

उपसभापति: आ जायगा।

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त: उन्होंने जो कुछ कहा है वह ठीक है। वह उसके अलावा क्या कह सकती है पर प्रश्न यह है कि हम लोगों के कंसर्न का जवाब आता क्यों नहीं है?

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त: अगलों ने जो कुछ कहा है वह ठीक है। वह उसके अलावा क्या कह सकती है पर प्रश्न यह है कि हम लोगों के कंसर्न का जवाब आता क्यों नहीं है?

उपसभापति: अभी चुप हो जाएं तो मैं कुछ बोलू... (व्यवधान) एक मिनट आप तशरीफ रखाए (व्यवधान)

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त: सदर साहिबा, इसका यहाँ रास्ता है कि हम उस वक्त तक दरखास्त करें आपसे जब तक यहाँ सही जवाब देने वाला कोई न आ जाए। प्राइम-मिनिस्टर हों या दूसरे कोई हों, उस वक्त तक हाऊस की कार्रवाई को रोका जाए... (व्यवधान)

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त: सदर साहिबा - इसका यहाँ रास्ता है कि हम उस वक्त तक दरखास्त करें आपसे जब तक यहाँ सही जवाब देने वाला कोई न आ जाए। प्राइम-मिनिस्टर हों या दूसरे कोई हों, उस वक्त तक हाऊस की कार्रवाई को रोका जाए... (व्यवधान)

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त: सदर साहिबा - इसका यहाँ रास्ता है कि हम उस वक्त तक दरखास्त करें आपसे जब तक यहाँ सही जवाब देने वाला कोई न आ जाए। प्राइम-मिनिस्टर हों या दूसरे कोई हों, उस वक्त तक हाऊस की कार्रवाई को रोका जाए... (व्यवधान)

"मداخلत" ...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: One minute please. I am very sorry. I am not going to delay the business of this House, whether there is ... (Interruptions) The House is my job ... (Interruptions) ... The Minister has said. This is not fair ... (Interruptions) ... Let the answer come. I am not going to adjourn the House ... (Interruptions) ... You cannot do all this. I am not allowing. Now, Mr. John F. Fernandes ... (Interruptions) Just a minute. Please just a minute ... (Interruptions) ... You are taking things too far. I made a promise. I told Mrs. Alva to go. You cannot stop the business of the House on an unlisted business. Please sit down. Nothing will go on record. I cannot get you the answer now itself and I am not going to adjourn the House. I can assure you this. Let Mr. John F. Fernandes speak.

Tragic Crash of a Sahara Airlines Aircraft

SHRI JOHN F. FERNANDES (Goa): Madam, we all know the tragic crash of a Sahara airline. Some persons were injured ... (Interruptions) ... The hon. Minister of Civil Aviation is not in the country ... (Interruptions) ...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You are taking things too far. You are taking things too far. Take your seats. Please take your seats. It amounts to taking things too far. It is not fair ... (Interruptions) ... The business of the House cannot be stopped till you get an answer ... (Interruptions) ... I am not allowing you to stop the business of the House. Mr. Fernandes, you speak.

SHRI JOHN F. FERNANDES: Madam, the Sahara aircrash is a very tragic one ... (Interruptions) ...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: you cannot do all this just because I am very co-operative. The Leader of the Opposition cannot say that the business of the House should be stopped till an answer is received. He does not have that right. We have some listed business ... (Interruptions) ... Just a minute. Please don't argue. Please sit down ... (Interruptions) ... Please sit down. Mr. Jaipal Reddy, please sit down.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY (Andhra Pradesh): Madam, we have a right to get an answer ... (Interruptions) ...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Jaipal Reddy, you don't understand what I say. You are irritating me very much. You don't understand how I can hear if ten people speak at the same time and you are asking me to get an answer. I cannot. I have conveyed your sentiments and that is all about it. We will go ahead with the listed business ... (Interruptions) ... I am not adjourning the House at all. You can go out ... (Interruptions) ... I am not going to adjourn the House. Please sit down.

श्री दिग्विजय सिंह (बिहार): मैडम, मेरी बात सुनिए। मे यह कह रहा हूँ कि सरकार का खेया क्या है? इसी सदन में हमने पूछा था कि भारत के प्रधानमंत्री का अमरीका का दौरा राजकीय दौरा है या नहीं। जो सम्मान भारत के प्रधानमंत्री को मिलना चाहिए था। वह नहीं मिल रहा है। यहाँ पर सरकार की तरफ से उसका कोई जवाब नहीं आया। दूसरे दिन अमरीका की सरकार की तरफ से जवाब आता है अखबारों के माध्यम से कि भारत के प्रधानमंत्री का यह दौरा स्टेट विजिट नहीं है। हम लोग सदन में बैठकर कर क्या रहे हैं? हमारे सवाल का जवाब भारत की सरकार न दे, हमारे सवाल का जवाब अमरीका की सरकार दे, यह क्या हो रहा है?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I cannot adjourn the House. ... (Interruptions) I am not adjourning the House for no reason ... (Interruptions) Till the answer comes from the Government, we will continue with our business. Mr. Fernandes, please speak. (Interruptions)

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त: सदर साहिब, हम समझते हैं कि हमारे मन्तकबिल में कौन सी कार्यवाही हम में ज्यादा जरूरी है ... (व्यवधान)

مشرقی سکندر بخت: صدر صاحب - ہم سمجھتے ہیں کہ ہمارے مقبیل میں کون سی کارروائی اس سے زیادہ ضروری ہے ...

उपसभापति: सिकन्दर बख्त साहब, आप बैठिए। ... (व्यवधान)

I conveyed your sentiments. Beyond