

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: One minute please. I am very sorry. I am not going to delay the business of this House, whether there is ...*(Interruptions)*... The House is my job ...*(Interruptions)*... The Minister has said. This is not fair ...*(Interruptions)*... Let the answer conic. I am not going to adjourn the House ..*(Interruptions)*... You cannot do all this. I am not allowing. Now. Mr. John F. Fernandes ...*(Interruptions)*... Just a minute. Please just a minute ...*(Interruptions)*... You are taking things too far. I made a promise. I told Mrs. Alva to go. You cannot stop the business of the House on an unlisted business. Please sit down. Nothing will go on record. I cannot get you the answer now itself and I am not going to adjourn the House. I can assure you this. Let Mr. John F. Fernandes speak. Tragic Crash of a Sahara Airlines Aircraft
SHRI JOHN F. FERNANDES (Goa): Madani, we all know the tragic crash of a Sahara airline. Some persons were injured ...*(Interruptions)*... The hon. Minister of Civil Aviation is not in the country ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You are taking things too far. You are taking things too far. Take your seats. Please take your seats. It amounts to taking things too far. It is not fair...*(Interruptions)*... The business of the House cannot be stopped till you get an answer ...*(Interruptions)*... I am not allowing you to stop the business of the House. Mr. Fernandes, you speak.

SHRI JOHN F. FERNANDES: Madam, the Sahara aircrash is a very tragic one *(Interruptions)*.....

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: you cannot do all this just because I am very co-operative. The Leader of the Opposition cannot say that the business of the House should be stopped till an answer is received. He does not have that right. We have some listed business.....*(Interruptions)*..... Just a minute. Please don't argue. Please sit down*(Interruptions)*..... Please sit down. Mr Jaipal Reddy, please sit down.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY (Andhra Pradesh): Madani, we have a right to get an answer *(Interruption;)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Jaipal Reddy, you don't understand what I say. You are irritating me very much. You don't understand how I can hear if ten people speak at the same time and you are asking me to get an answer. I cannot. I have conveyed your sentiments and that is all about it. We will go ahead with the listed business*(Interruptions)*..... I am not adjourning the House at all. You can go out*(Interruptions)*..... I am not going to adjourn the House. Please sit down.

श्री दिग्विजय सिंह (बिहार): मडम, मेरा बात मुनि। मैं यह कह रहा हूँ कि सरकार का खैया क्या है? इसी सदन में हमने पूछा था कि भारत के प्रधानमंत्री का अमरीका का दौरा राजकीय दौरा है या नहीं। जो सम्मान भारत के प्रधानमंत्री को मिलना चाहिए था। वह नहीं मिल रहा है। यहां पर सरकार की तरफ से उसका कोई जवाब नहीं आया। दूसरे दिन अमरीका की सरकार की तरफ से जवाब आता है अखबारों के माध्यम से कि भारत के प्रधानमंत्री का यह दौरा स्टेट विजिट नहीं है। हम लोग सदन में बैठकर कर क्या रहे हैं? हमारे सवाल का जवाब भारत की सरकार न दे, हमारे सवाल का जवाब अमरीका की सरकार दे, यह क्या हो रहा है?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I cannot adjourn the House.*(Interruptions)* I am not adjourning the House for no reason.*(Interruptions)* Till the answer comes from the Government, we will continue with our business. Mr. Fernandes, please speak. *(Interruptions)*

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त: सदर साहिब, हम सम्झते हैं कि हमारे मन्त्रिमण्डल में कौन सी कार्यवाही इस में ज्यादा जरूरी है.... (व्यवधान)

مشرقی سکندر بخت: صدر صاحب - ہم
سمجھتے ہیں کہ ہمارے مستقبل میں کون سی
کارروائی اس سے زیادہ ضروری ہے...

”مرا خلت“
उपसभापति: मिस्टर बख्त साहब आप बैठिए।
.....*(व्यव)* I conveyed your sentiments. Beyond

that, it is not in my power. I can only get the Government to convey it to the right quarters. That is all. (*Interruptions*) If they do not react, I cannot keep on reacting all the time I have to ask Mr Fernandes to speak (*Interruptions*)

मैं गुस्से में इसलिए खोली कि एक ही बात को 25 लोग रीपीट कर रहे हैं। आप गणमान्य सदस्य हैं। पढ़े-लिखे लोग हैं, ज्यादा पढ़े हैं, ऐक्सपर्ट लोग हैं। मगर जब मैंने कह दिया ... (व्यवधान) ... यही तो मुझे अफसोस होता है कि मैं आप की बात काटू तो आप को बुरा लगता है। मैंने अपनी तरफ से कहा कि मंत्री जो आप सुन रहे हैं, आप प्रधानमंत्री को यहां से कह दीजिए। उन को यहां से जा कर बोलना है कि और उस में समय लगता है। इस का मतलब यह नहीं है कि तब तक हम यहां कोई काम नहीं करें। देश में और बहुत से सवाल हैं जो आप उठाना चाहते हैं। फर्नांडीज साहब को दूसरी बात कहनी है। (व्यवधान)

कुछ माननीय सदस्य: पहले जवाब आ जाए (व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: How can you stop Mr. Fernandes ? It is his right to speak. You cannot dictate terms to Mr. Fernandes or anybody else from this side or that side. This is not fair. We are in a democracy and YOU should allow others also to function. (*Interruptions* Your sentiments have been conveyed. Please sit down and don't get agitated. That is all. (*Interruptions*)

श्री दिग्विजय सिंह: यह मेरे सवाल का जबाब है ही नहीं। मेरे सवाल का जबाब दीजिए ... (व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I cannot. I will not give.

SHRI SOMAPPA R. BOMMAI: I am on a point of order.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No point of order. There is no discussion. I am sorry. There is total disorder in this House just now. So, there can be no point of order. I would request you to please sit down. Mr. Fernandes, please speak, (*Interruptions*) Nothing will go on record except Mr. Fernandes.

SHRI JOHN F. FERNANDES.
Madam, one aircraft of the Sahara

Airlines crashed and collided with an aircraft of the Aeroflot at the Plam airport (*Interruptions*)..... The Minister of Civil Aviation was not here in the country at that time. The next day, there was a *suo motu* statement by the Minister of Surface Transport.

..... (*Interruptions*)..... In the statement, he mentioned that an enquiry will be held (*Interruptions*) Let me speak. She gave an assurance that the reply will come tomorrow. (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please sit down. (*Interruptions*) Please sit down. Until and unless the Government reacts, how can I react? This is not in my power. I have asked Mrs. Alva to go (*Interruptions*) Please sit down] know. Prithvi. Agni, Prime Minister's visit—are agitating Your mind. Please sit down. Mr. Malkani, please sit down. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI K.R. Makani (Delhi): I raised my hand ten times. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please sit down. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI K.R. MALKANI: There is a limit.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: What is the limit, I want to ask you, Mr. Malkani? If I put a limit.... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI K.R. MALKANI: Madam, I raised My hand ten times but I was not identified.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I know you did. But you ask your leaders. When they stand up in the front, they do not recognise people sitting at the back. You ask them first. My eyes are towards you, but they have their back towards you. They do not know that you are standing. I cannot identify you when five people are standing. There is no disrespect meant to you. Mr. Malkani. Do not get agitated. In this turmoil, do you expect me to run the House in proper order? To run the House in proper order, I need your support. Till the statement comes,

Now, Mr. Fernandes, finally, you can start.

SHRI JOHN F. FERNANDES: Thank you for permitting me for the sixth time. Madam. (Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No; no more, Mr. Jaipal Reddy. (Interruptions)

SHRI JOHN F. FERNANDES: I was mentioning about the air crash. Madam.....(Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Jaipal Reddy, enough is enough.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: Madam, is it an assurance that the statement by the Government would be made today Or, atleast, tomorrow? Is it an assurance?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: How can I give an assurance? Am I the Government? I am the Presiding Officer.

DR. MURLI MANOHAR JOSHI: What did the Minister say?

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: As we understood, she said....

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let Mrs. Alva conic back and then I will tell you.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: She herself said....

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: She said that she is going to convey.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: She herself said here(Interruptions)

DR. MURLI MANOHAR JOSHI: The Ministers of State for External Affairs is here. Other Ministers are there. (Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: She has gone to convey to the Prime Minister. You want the Prime Minister to come. (Interruptions) That is why she has gone to convey to the - Prime Minister. (Interruptions) Let her come back. Don't be in a haste. Now, let Mr. Fernandes speak.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: Madani, if not today, at least, tomorrow, would the statement be made? Would you assure that?

† [] Transliteration in Arabic Script.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: How can. I assure you? If I had to make a statement, I would have made just now, but I am not to make any statement. If I had to make any statement, I would have done that. Now, Mr. Fernandes, Please.

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त: सदर साहिबा, आप हम को बताइये हमें क्या करना चाहिए। (व्यवधान)

شری سکندر بخت: ہم کو کیا کرنا چاہیے۔ آپ

ہم کو بتائیے ہم کو کیا کرنا چاہیے۔

مداخلت: "....."

उपसभापति: आप बैठिये और सुनिये।

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त: हमारा तो यह सवाल है.....(व्यवधान)

شری سکندر بخت: ہمارا تو یہ سوال ہے.....

ایج "مداخلت" "....."

उपसभापति: एक घंटे से ज्यादा आप इस सवाल पर बोल लिये..... (व्यवधान) पौना घंटा बोल लिये.....(व्यवधान) आई स्टैंट कोर्ट। (व्यवधान)

SHRI JOHN F. FERNANDES: Madam, thank you for calling my name. I was referring to.....(Interruptions)..Oh! My God!.....(Interruptions)

SHRI M.A. BABY (Kerala): If the Government cannot give an assurance__ (Interruptions)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Why should you take it on Mr Fernandes?.... (Interruptions)...

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: It is a matter of supreme importance.(Interruptions)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mrs. Kamla Sinha has given me something. Mrs. Sarala Maheshwari wants to say something(Interruptions).....

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: Unless the Government comes out with a statement by tomorrow, we will not be a party to any business in the House.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Jaipalji, nobody can threaten me like that. I am very sorry, you cannot threaten the

Chair. ...*(Interruptions)*... It is about the lit of people. Don't you want to hear Mr. Fernandes?

SHR! JOHN F. FERNANDES: Madam, a Boking-737 belonging to the Sahara Airlines crashed at the Palam airport, killing nine people. Civil aviation in this country...*(Interruptions)*... The Minister of State for Surface Transport, Mr. Tyler, made a statement in this House....*(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Wait Let the statement come. Let the Government come. Then we will stop the business and do that job.

SHRI JOHN F. FERNANDES: The Minister has made a *suo motu* statement in the House....*(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The Minister is here. Ghulam Nabiji. there is a problem. Mr Fernandes is speaking about a Boeing air crash in which some lives were lost.

SHRI JOHN F. FERNANDES: Last month there was an air crash in which a Boking-737 of the Sahara Airlines was involved. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SOMAPPA R. BOMMAI Orissa: Madam, the Minister said either by this evening or by tomorrow a statement will be made.*(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY Chairman; I don't Know; I did not hear it.*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: You sec the record.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will check the record*(Interruptions)*... Jaipalji, there are only two days—today and tomorrow. Friday is a Private Members' day. I will find out; I will look into the record.*(Interruptions)*...

Boliye, boliye*(Interruptions)*

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: No, Madam, sorry*(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will look into the record.*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI JOHN F. FERNANDES: There is no probe into this air crash.

As a result, the people who are involved.*(Interruptions)*... The Minister of Civil Aviation has proposed an arbitrary fine of Rs 8 crores against the Sahara Airlines. I think it is a matter of privilege. The Minister has assured this House that judicial inquiry will be conducted. And there are reports in the press. Madam, I want the hon. Minister of Civil Aviation to assure this House that a proper inquiry will be conducted into this air crash so that further air crashes at international airports are avoided.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: The Minister is maintaining a studied silence, which is a vindication...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Shrimati Kamla Sinha. *Boliye*....*(Interruptions)*... I am not going to adjourn the House. You may keep standing. It looks very bad to me that hon. Members are standing in the House. It is very unfortunate. But if you want to do so, it is your own free will... *(Interruptions)*... Shrimati Kamla Sinha. ... *(Interruptions)*...

उपसभापति: कमला सिन्हा जी आप आगे आ कर के बोलिये (व्यवधान) फ्रंट रो से बोलिये (व्यवधान) डा० बापू कालदाते.. (व्यवधान) सरला माहेश्वरी ... (व्यवधान) ... जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर जी ... (व्यवधान) आप बोल रहे हैं? (व्यवधान)

I have no reason to adjourn the House. ...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI M.A. BABY: The Cabinet Ministers are here. If they remain silent on such an important thing, are we to understand that there is no Government?

DR. BIPLAB DASGUPTA: Please give one single-word answer. Have you given instructions to stop the test or not? That is the question. You have no answer! No Minister can answer it! ...*(Interruptions)*

Madam, there should be a categorical statement. ...*(Interruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Dr Naunihal Singh. ...*(Interruptions)*

श्री भुरली मनोहर जोशी: खामाशी का यह मतलब है कि आप सहमत हैं कि पृथ्वी का प्रक्षेपण रोक गया (व्यवधान)

DR. BAPU KALDATE: How can we speak when there is no order.'

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Who is creating the disorder.' I' ...*(Interruptions)*

Please, one minute, one minute.

श्री अनन्तराय देवशंकर दबे: महोदय ... (व्यवधान)

उपसभापति: एक मिनट। वन में कुछ के लिए खामोशी हो सकती है (व्यवधान)। वर साहब अंग बैठिये।

श्री अनन्तराय देवशंकर दबे: तीन दिन से हम आपकी बात मान रहे हैं (व्यवधान)

उपसभापति: मेरी अपनी बात कोई नहीं है, हाऊस की जो है वह बात होती है, मेरी कोई बात नहीं होती है (व्यवधान)

The House is supreme. Please sit down. एक मिनट बैठ जाइये (व्यवधान)

एक माननीय सदस्य: यह ब्लेक-मेल है (व्यवधान)

उपसभापति: माफी-वाफी का सवाल नहीं है। गुप्से में, डिसऑर्डर में ऐसी बात होती है। कोई बात हम भी कहते हैं, गुप्से में हम भी बोलते हैं, कोई मतलब नहीं होता है इसका (व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please. I understand your sentiments. I am sure, the ruling party Members present here and the Government also feel it. That is the reason why the Minister has gone there.

Now it is my earnest request to all senior Members and Sikander Bakhtji who is the Leader of the Opposition to let us go ahead with the business. We have only two days left, tomorrow and the day after. We have a lot of business. There are a number of special mentions.

There are Bills to be passed. There are financial matters to be cleared. Mr. Mukherjee is here. There are other important matters also. Let us go ahead. *(Interruptions)*

Please, let us run this House. Just because somebody is angry. I don't think you will stop working. You are angry. You keep your anger with you, but continue to work ...*(Interruptions)*

I have not addressed you. I am sorry. I have addressed the Leader of the Opposition because he wanted me to adjourn the House. I am requesting him. Are we going to solve the problem by adjourning the House? We can adjourn the House *sine die* today. Are you going to solve it?

Can you keep quiet for a minute while you are sitting? It was my ruling that when you sit, please keep quiet. I am asking the Leader of the Opposition and other leaders that if by adjourning the House the problem is solved, we adjourn the House for ever. But the question is that we have only two days left. ...*(Interruptions)*. Let us finish our business. It is my request to the Members that in their own interest and in the interest of the country, please continue to work while we get the answer. O.K. ... *(Interruptions)*

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त: सदर साहिबा, इन द इंटेरेस्ट आफ द कंट्री है। हमने जो कुछ कहा है वह इन द इंटेरेस्ट आफ द कंट्री ही कहा है। मैं यह कहना चाहता हूँ कि अगर इंटेरेस्ट आफ द कंट्री सामने न होता तो यह सवाल जो तीन दिन से उठाया जा रहा है यह सवाल यहां (व्यवधान) न उठाया गया होता। आपने हमसे कहा है कि बिजनेस सले इस हाऊस का। यहां से मिनिस्टर साहिबा गयी हैं, किससे बात करने के लिए गयी हैं, क्या हैं हमें मालूम नहीं। क्या आप हाऊस को यह एश्योर करेंगी कि लंच के फौरन बाद जो सवाल यहां पर उठाया गया है, यहां पर आकर — रिएक्शन की बात नहीं कर रहा हूँ — सीधा जवाब गवर्नमेंट आकर हमको यह दे कि पृथ्वी का प्रोग्राम डिसकन्टीन्यूड हुआ है या जिस सूरत में चल रहा है वैसे ही है। ऐसा हमको स्टेटमेंट लंच के फौरन बाद मिलेगा या नहीं (व्यवधान)

उपसभापति: ऐसा है सिकन्दर बख्त साहब, यह एग्जोरस तो मैं आपको दे सकती हूँ कि यह मालुमात कि कि गवर्नमेंट कब तक आकर रिप्लेट करेगी। मगर गवर्नमेंट क्या रिप्लेट करेगी यह मेरे अख्तियार में तो नहीं है I am in no position.

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त: परसों हाउस खत्म होने वाला है (व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, she has come. ...*(Interruptions)* I can talk about the running of the House. I cannot talk about the policies of the Government. This is beyond my work.

SHRIMATI MARGRET ALVA: Madam, the Government will respond in both the Houses of Parliament sometime tomorrow afternoon.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Tomorrow afternoon. O.K. Now, how much time has been ...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA (Karnataka): Madam, I have been raising my hand for a long time. I crave your indulgence. What has happened has happened. Many of them were in the Government and many of them were Ministers. There are urgent issues we are all concerned about, but this is not the way. Let it be a one-time incident. It should not be a precedent in this House. They cannot force like they have done today. I accept it is a very serious matter. The Government should react, but this is not the way. You are sitting here. Immediately you react, Mr. Salman Khurshid. He is a Minister. He has to coordinate.

DR. BIPLAB DASGUPTA: I will also respond to it, Madam.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No. I am not allowing.

DR. BIPLAB . DASGUPTA: Why, Madam?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Do not argue. He has a right to speak.

DR. BIPLAB DASGUPTA: But I also have a right. This is not the way.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The

whole morning you have been speaking enough. No, please. I will identify you The whole morning when everybody was speaking, Mr. Hanumanthappa was quiet. The moment he has opened his mouth you object.

DR. BIPLAB DASGUPTA: After he finishes you allow me.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will not allow you. If you argue with me, I will identify you and name you. Enough is enough. ...*(Interruptions)* Hanumanthappa Ji, I have understood what you mean.

SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA: If they do not obey, they should be punished.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am not going to allow this to happen again. You know it. This is not the way.

Forcible Conversion of Young Girls as Jain Saints

श्रीमती कमला सिन्हा (बिहार): मैं एक बहुत ही दुखद घटना की ओर आपका, सदन का और आपके माध्यम से सरकार का ध्यान आकर्षित करना चाहती हूँ। हम जानते हैं कि धर्म हमको सहिष्णुता सिखाता है, धर्म हमको इस दुनिया में और परलोक में जाने का रास्ता भी बताता है। इस दुनिया में ठीक से कैसे जीना चाहिए वह सिखाता है। लेकिन आजकल धर्म के नाम पर विचित्र घटनाएँ हो रही हैं। महोदया, मुझे आज ही जानकारी मिली है राजस्थान की एक घटना मैं बताना चाहती हूँ। हम जानते हैं सन्यास भी लोग लेते हैं, कम उम्र में लेते हैं ज्यादा उम्र में भी लेते हैं। भगवान बुद्ध ने भी सन्यास लिया। राजा के लड़के थे, घर छोड़ कर चले गए, दुनिया की मुक्ति के लिए, इस तरह से सन्यास बहुत लोग लेते हैं अपनी मुक्ति के लिए, दुनिया को मुक्ति की राह दिखाने के लिए। लेकिन मैं जिस घटना के बारे में जिक्र करना चाहती हूँ वह ऐसी घटना है जहाँ जबरदस्ती सन्यास दिलाया जाता है जिसको हम बाल बेगम कह सकते हैं। यह 21 फरवरी की सवाई माधोपुर की घटना है। सवाई माधोपुर में पूरे शोर-शराबे के साथ जश्न मनाकर 7 लड़कियों को जैन धर्म के तहत सन्यासिनी बनाया जा रहा था। उसमें से एक लड़की ममता है। कम उम्र की लड़कियाँ थीं और नाबालिग लड़कियाँ थीं। ममता की माँ विमला देवी और उनके परिवार वालों ने आपत्ति भी की थी। बाप बहुत गरीब