

Lignite Corporation Limited (Acquisition and Transfer of Power Transmission System) Bill, 1994, as passed by Lok Sabha at its sitting held on the 5th August, 1994."

(II)

"In accordance with the provisions of rule 96 of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in Lok Sabha, I am directed to endorse the Manipur Appropriation (No 2) Bill, 1994, as passed by Lok Sabha at its sitting held on the 5th August, 1994.

The Speaker has certified that this Bill is a Money Bill."

(III)

"I am directed to inform you that Lok Sabha, at its sitting held on Friday, the 5th August, 1994, adopted the following motion:—

That this House do recommend to Rajya Sabha that Rajya Sabha do elect one Member of Rajya Sabha according to the principle of proportional representation by means of the single transferable vote, to the Joint committee on Offices of Profit in the vacancy caused by the retirement of Shri E. Balanadan from Rajya Sabha and do communicate to this House the name of the member so appointed by Rajya Sabha to the Joint Committee."

I am to request that the concurrence of Rajya Sabha in the said motion, and so the name of the member of Rajya Sabha so appointed, may be communicated to this House."

Madam, I lay a copy each of the two Bill on the Table.

REFERENCES

Re. Demand for Showing of Regional Language Movies on DD with sub-Titles in English Insead of Hindi

SHRI S. MUTHU MANI (Tamil Nadu): Madam, I rise to draw the attention of the Government towards the attitude of Doordarshan to improve Hindi through the electronic media.

On Sunday, every week, an award winning regional film is telecast on DD-I. Whenever a regional movie is telecast, English sub-titles used to be shown enabling the people of other States to understand the theme of the movie. This practice has been going on for several years and no one found fault with it. However, when a Tamil movie, namely, 'Karahattakaran' was telecast on 24.7.94, to the shock of the viewers the sub-titles were shown in Hindi. This is not the first occasion when Doordarshan has indulged in such activities to impose Hindi. The Central Govt. is all out to impose Hindi through various means in spite of stiff opposition from non-Hindi speaking States.

I do not understand the reason for switching from English sub-titles to Hindi. When the sub-titles are in English, Madam, people from all the States in India can understand. When it is in Hindi people from only the small Hindi belt can understand it. One is compelled to think whether Doordarshan does not want people to understand the regional movies. We have nothing against Hindi as a language. But, keep it to yourself. There is a limit to hurting the sentiments of the non-Hindi speaking people. Language is the most sensitive issue for us in Tamil Nadu. Any move to impose Hindi on us will roomerang. It is time the Centre treated the States south of Vindhya as part of India. While we are for the unity and integrity of the country, we shall not tolerate any move to impose Hindi, directly or indirectly, on us. Therefore, I call upon the Government to instruct Doordarshan to switch back to English sub-titles for regional movies.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, we have Shri S. K. T. Ramachandran and Shri Narayanasamy. I know, you are present in the House. On this issue only, let Mr. S. K. T. Ramachandran speak. If he can have a little precedence today, I will call Shri Ramachandran.

SHRI S. K. T. RAMACHANDRAN (Tamil Nadu): I appreciate Mr. Muthu Mani. He is un against imposition of Hindi on the Tamil-speaking people.

Nothing could be tolerated, if imposed. But, at the same time, we should not allow the people of a State going away from the mainstream. So, while opposing or resisting the imposition, on the pretext of opposing imposition, we should not take up cudgels against the Central Government for any good thing. So, Madam, I request the Tamil Nadu Government...*(Interruptions)*... through Mr. Muthu Mani and their senior leader, Mr. Madhavan, and also the AI-ADMK party which is naming itself as the All-India Anna Dravida Munnetra Kazhagam to take steps...*(Interruptions)*.

SHRI S. MUTHU MANI: Madam, I want to know whether he is associating himself with me. He is not associating himself with me. He is deviating from the subject.

SHRI S. K. T. RAMACHANDRAN: I am fully associating myself with him...

SHRI S. MUTHU MANI: He is making allegations against us...

SHRI S. K. T. RAMACHANDRAN: It is not an allegation. He cannot understand what an allegation is. I am supporting him.

SHRI S. MUTHU MANI: No.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Muthu Mani, let me understand.

SHRI S. K. T. RAMACHANDRAN: He cannot understand 'association'.

SHRI S. MUTHU MANI: He is not associating himself with me. He wants to level charges against my Party. It should not be allowed.

SHRI S. K. T. RAMACHANDRAN: I am not charging anybody. *(Interruptions)*.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Muthu Mani, you expressed your views. He is supporting those views. But he is adding something in the interest of whatever he wants to say...

SHRI S. MUTHU MANI: He is making allegations.

SHRI S. K. T. RAMACHANDRAN : The hon. Member cannot understand. I am not making any allegation. It is not an allegation. Let him listen to me. I make a plea to the hon. Members to convince the Tamil Nadu Government to make arrangements for the propagation of Hindi in Tamil Nadu because Tamil Nadu people are anxious to learn Hindi. They are coming to the northern States for so many occupations. They need Hindi. Even the DMK and AI-ADMK people are learning Hindi. But, at the same time, in public institutions, the privilege to learn Hindi is denied. It is against the Constitution. That is all, Madam.

SHRI S. MUTHU MANI: We are not preventing anybody from learning Hindi.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Narayanasamy.

SHRI S. MUTHU MANI: You should not impose Hindi either implicitly or directly upon us. This is our view.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: We needed some sparks in the House. So, I am thankful that there is some controversy!

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY (Pondicherry): While associating myself with the hon. Member, Shri Muthu Mani, who raised the issue that there should be sub-titles for the regional film programmes, that are shown on Doordarshan, Madam, I want to say that there are two aspects to it. One is imposition of Hindi, and the other one is that people who are voluntarily studying Hindi are being prevented...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Why?

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: The people who are studying in the State are not being allowed to read because of the State Government's attitude.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That is a different issue. Here, the issue is limited to the films.

SHRI S. MUTHU MANI : That is the point, Madam.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY : I am coming to it, Madam.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : He has a concern about Hindi, he can raise it. No problem. But if you have a concern about English, you also have no problem, you can raise it.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY : Madam, the issue which the hon. Member has raised is relevant because we have several languages in our country and the people who are in the southern parts of India see the films on the TV, but they do not understand the conversation that goes on. Therefore, Madam, the issue which he has raised is very important. That is number one. Secondly, with the intention of politicising the language issue in the Southern States, specially in the State of Tamil Nadu...

SHRI S. MUTHU MANI : Is it association?

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY : They are preventing the people from reading Hindi. Imposition is bad. And preventing the people from reading it is also bad.

SHRI S. MUTHU MANI : Who prevented? There is no ban in Tamil Nadu.

SHRI S. MADHAVAN (Tamil Nadu) : Lakhs of people are reading Hindi through the Hindi Prachar Sabha.

SHRI S. MUTHU MANI : We are not preventing anybody. He comes from Pondicherry and not Tamil Nadu. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY : How many Kendriya Vidyalayas have been started in Tamil Nadu? Let them tell us now. In all the other States, Kendriya Vidyalayas have been started. But in Tamil Nadu, in the name of language, in the name of imposition of Hindi, they are not allowing these schools to be opened. They are playing politics even in the matter of education.

This is not fair. (*Interruptions*) Therefore, Madam, I would appeal to both the sections. One section is fanatical about Hindi and the other section is fanatical about the regional language. Both sides should realise the sentiments of the people. Whosoever wants to study, should not be prevented.

SHRI S. MUTHU MANI : If your Congress Party wins the elections in Tamil Nadu, you can come forward and set up such schools. (*Interruptions*) You have no moral right. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI S. K. T. RAMACHANDRAN : We are not discussing here the prospects of any party in the coming elections. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : It is a matter concerning films. Let one representative from the film industry speak on it.

श्री राज बब्बर (उत्तर प्रदेश) : सम्प्रदाय गहोदया, मैं माननीय सदस्य, जिन्होंने अंग्रेजी सबोटैटल्स के बारे में कहा है...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I think you should sub-title it in English so that he could understand it.

SHRI RAJ BABBAR : Madam, I do not quite see the point made by the hon. Member. I would like to point out to the hon. Member that Hindi is a language which does not belong to one region alone. The language belongs to the entire country.

SHRI S. MUTHU MANI : Of course; no problem.

श्री राज बब्बर : इस बारे में आगे एक बात और कहूंगा। इसको समझना, इसके बारे में जानना, यह हर हिन्दुस्तानी का फर्ज है। जहाँ तक सवाल सिनेमा का है, इसका राजनीतिकरण किया जा रहा है। जिस तरह से इन्होंने कहा है कि अंग्रेजी के सब-टाइटल्स समझ में आते हैं, अगर तमिल फिल्म अच्छी फिल्म है,

उसकी कोई जवान नहीं है, चाहे सब-टाइटल अंग्रेजी में हों या सब-टाइटल हिन्दी में हों। सिनेमा किसी टाइटल की जवान नहीं चाहता, किसी जवान की उसका खरत नहीं है। सिनेमा को जरूरत है अच्छे एक्सप्रेशन की, अच्छे माहीश की, अच्छे एटमोस्फियर की और अच्छे दिजुअल की। अगर सिनेमा को नहीं समझा जा सकता तो किसी जवान से नहीं समझा जा सकता।

मैं सिर्फ इतना कहना चाहूंगा अपने नानतीय सक्त्व को कि इसका राजनीतिकरण न करें। हिन्दी और अंग्रेजी का राजनीतिकरण करके इन्हें तमिलनाडु में तमिल भाषा को और हिन्दी को दूर करने की कोशिश की है। यह सिर्फ राजनीति की वजह से हुआ है। तमिलनाडु का कलाकार या तमिलनाडु के सिनेमा देखने वाले, सिनेदिजुअर्स, चाहे वह तमिलनाडु के हों या हिन्दी जवान सीखने वाले हों, वे हमेशा अच्छी फिल्म का स्वागत करते हैं। कृपया इस भाषा को लेकर, अंग्रेजी और हिन्दी को लेकर बार-बार इस तरह के प्रचार न किए जाएं, खास तौर से इन सदनों में अंकर। यह आप लोगों को पार्टी-बार्जी में मदद कर सकता है लेकिन देश को एक करने में मदद नहीं कर सकता। धन्यवाद।

SHRI S. MUTHU MANI: Madam, our demand is that there should be sub-titling in English in the case of these programmes. This is the demand of the six-and-a-half crore people of Tamil Nadu.

SHRI ABDUSSAMAD SAMADANI (Kerala): Madam Deputy Chairman, I just want to say one thing. When some Members wish to point out certain things related to any regional language, it should not be misinterpreted as a deviation from the national mainstream. National mainstream does not mean Hindi. We are proud of the fact that Hindi is our national language. We are proud of that. But at the same time, we have to admit the other fact also that India is a multi-lingual country. There peo-

ple speak so many languages. Particularly, in the South, we speak so many languages. Therefore, we have got, at least, the right to point out our problems. We have got a right to say that the rights and privileges of the linguistic minorities should be protected. Whenever we raise any issue concerning the linguistic minorities concerning regional languages, it does not mean that we are deviating from the national mainstream. If a person speaks for Malayalam, Tamil or Telugu, some people mistake it and try to misinterpret it that he is deviating from the national mainstream, identifying national mainstream with Hindi. National mainstream is something different from language. National mainstream is something related to our culture and it is something related to our national integration. Language is another thing. We have to admit and we have to acknowledge the realities in the country.

Madam, I do not want to go into the matter which has been raised by the hon. Member. But one thing I wish to stress again. National mainstream cannot be identified with anyone of our languages.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I think we had enough discussion on this. We have other important issues.

आप क्या ऐंड करेंगे। नहीं, हिन्दी का तो सवाल ही नहीं है, सवाल यहां यह है...

Mr. Jogi, you should understand what he is saying. If you are showing a programme on television which is of a regional nature, concerning any State, if he is not able to understand it, how are you going to have national integration? This is his point. If you sub-title it in English, he would know what is happening in other parts of the country. That is his point.

SHRI AJIT P. K. JOGI: Madam, I agree with him and I associate myself with him.

श्री अजीत जोगी : (मध्य प्रदेश) : उपसभापति महोदया, जो हमारे सम्मानित सदस्य ने बात रखी है, उस से अपने आप को संलग्न करते हुए मैं केवल इतना ही कहना चाहता हूँ कि इस संबंध में बहुत पहले हमारे प्रथम प्रधान मंत्री पंडित जवाहरलाल नेहरू ने एक बात कही थी जिस को हमें हमेशा याद रखना चाहिए विशेषकर हम हिन्दी भाषी लोगों को। उन्होंने अहिन्दी भाषी लोगों को आश्वासन देते हुए यह कहा था कि जब तक आप लोग खुद तैयार नहीं हो जाएंगे, हिन्दी आप के ऊपर लादी नहीं जाएगी। हम लोगों को भी कुछ ऐसा नहीं करना चाहिए जिस से हमारे दक्षिण के भाई महसूस करें कि उन के ऊपर हिन्दी लादी जा रही है। पर ऐसा माहौल बनाना चाहिए कि राष्ट्र की एक भाषा हो, एसी ज़बान हो जा हम सब को एक ही सूत्र में बांधे। वह हिन्दी या उस से बेहतर हिन्दुस्तानी भी हो सकती है। उस दिशा में प्रयास होने चाहिए पर दोनों तरफ से अतिवादी नहीं होना चाहिए। हमारे दक्षिण के भाई यह कोशिश न करें कि जब हिन्दी की बात आए तो उत्तजित हो जाएं और हम उत्तर भारत क लोगों को भी इस बात को मानना चाहिए कि हम ऐसा काम न करें जिस से उन को लगे कि उन के ऊपर हिन्दी लादी जा रही है। लेकिन एक हिन्दुस्तानी जुबान जो क्लिष्ट हिन्दी नहीं, जिस को देश के ज्यादातर लोग बोलते, समझते हों, वह हम को एक सूत्र में बांधे, उसके लिए बात हो सकती है।

Re. Deteriorating Health Situation in Bihar due to Cholera and Diarrhoea

डा. जगन्नाथ मिश्र (बिहार) : उपसभापति महोदया, मैं एक अत्यंत ही महत्वपूर्ण विषय पर सदन का और सरकार का ध्यान आकषित करना चाहता हूँ। पिछले कुछ सप्ताहों में एक हजार लोग मर चुके हैं हैजा और डायरिया से। राज्य सरकार के पास उन के इलाज के लिए पर्याप्त साधन नहीं हैं जिस से बिहार में सरकारी अस्पतालों में 10 हजार रोगी इस रोग से ग्रस्त हैं और राज्य सरकार

की ओर से पूर्ण व्यवस्था नहीं की जा रही है। अकेल पटना में 35 लोग मर गए, लाटी में 50 लोग मर गए, ऋषवा में 35 धादमी मर गए।... (व्यथधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Rameshwar Thakur is the Minister of Parliamentary Affairs. He should make a note of it and inform the Government. Whatever you want to discuss, you may do it later.

डा. जगन्नाथ मिश्र : इस लिए महोदया, मैं आप से निवेदन करूंगा कि आप भारत सरकार को निर्देश दीजिए क्योंकि राज्य सरकार कहती है कि हमारे पास साधन नहीं है, दवा नहीं है। क्या बिहार के लोगों को ऐसे ही मरने के लिए छोड़ दिया जाए? क्या भारत सरकार की कोई जिम्मेदारी नहीं बनती है, क्या स्वास्थ्य मंत्रालय को इस में हस्तक्षेप नहीं करना चाहिए? पिछले 4 सप्ताह में एक लाख से ज्यादा लोग हैजा और काका-जार से मारे जा चुके हैं। राज्य सरकार पूरी तरह से विकल रहती है इस रोग को रोकथाम करने में। विश्व स्वास्थ्य संगठन की ओर से इस पर कार्यवाही की गई और बीमारी पर रोक लगाई गई। इन सबब बिहार हैज और डायरिया में प्रभावित हो गया है। हजारों लोग प्रभावित हैं। उनमें बच्चे और महिलाएं बहुत अधिक हैं। इसलिए मैं आपसे निवेदन करूंगा कि आप भारत सरकार को निर्देश दीजिए कि भारत सरकार इसकी जानकारी हासिल करे। यदि राज्य सरकार के पास साधन नहीं हैं तो भारत सरकार इन विषय को बहुत जल्दी से ले ताकि बिहार के लोगों का तत्काल इलाज किया जा सके।

उपसभापति : ठाकुर साहब आप नोट कर लीजिए।...

श्री रजनी रंजन साहू (बिहार) : महोदया, मेरा सरकार से आग्रह है कि बिहार में तत्काल एक सेंट्रल टीम भेजी जाए स्वास्थ्य मंत्रालय की ओर से, ताकि स्थिति पर काबू पाया जा सके।