

## RAJYA SABHA

Monday, the 21st December, 1992/30,  
Agahayana, 1914 (Saka)

The House met at eleven of the clock. Mr. Chairman in the Chair.

### MATTER RAISED WITH PERMISSION AND CONSEQUENT DISPENSING WITH QUESTION HOUR

**Indefinite fast by Shri Atal Bihari Vajpayee**

MR. CHAIRMAN: I am allowing the Leader of the Opposition to say something.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY (Uttar Pradesh): Under what rule?

THE LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (SHRI SIKANDER BAKHT): The other day, honourable Shri Yashwant Sinha while making his observations on the Ayodhya issue had used a term and I want to begin my submission with the same term. He had said: What the hell is happening? And I want to know what the hell is happening क्योंकि कल जो कुछ हुआ है वह तो एक ऐसी चीज है जिसको किसी भी अकल के खाने में डालने की कोशिश की जाए तो नहीं की जा सकती। किसी कायदे कातून... (व्यवधान)

کیونکہ کل جو کچھ ہوا ہے وہ تو ایسا ایسی چیز ہے جس کو کسی بھی عقل کے خانے میں ڈالنے کی کوشش کی جائے تو نہیں کی جا سکتی۔ کسی قاعدہ سے قانون "بند" ہے۔

SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA (Karnataka): I am on a point of order... (Interruptions). You can throw every rule... (Interruptions)

SHRI P. UPENDRA (Andhra Pradesh): Let him first complete. He

has not even completed and he wants to raise a point of order! (Interruptions).

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA (Rajasthan): Sir, you have allowed the Leader of the Opposition to speak, and they are not allowing... (Interruptions).

SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA: I am on a point of order.

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA (Bihar): There is no convention in the House... (Interruptions).

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY (Tamil Nadu): Let him first make his submission.

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM (Andhra Pradesh): Sir, the hon. Member can raise his point of order after the Leader of the Opposition has complete... (Interruptions.)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please sit down.

SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA: Let the Chair rule it out; but I have to raise my point of order.

MR. CHAIRMAN: There is no point of order during Question Hour. So please sit down.

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA: There is no such rule. During Question Hour, these submissions cannot be made.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA (Bihar): Mr. Chairman, you have allowed the Leader of the Opposition to say something in this House and if it is blocked by the Treasury Benches....

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE (Maharashtra): No, we do not block it.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: ... the entire blame will lie on them. We want to hear him.

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM: Let him complete his speech and then

[Shri Mentay Padmanabham]

you can allow any hon. Member to raise a point of order... (Interruptions).

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER (Gujarat): Sir, you have absolute discretion to suspend the Question Hour and allow anybody to speak. There is no difficulty. We are not questioning that discretion of yours which is absolute. But while he is trying to speak and somebody raises a point of order, we would request you to kindly hear him as to what exactly is the point of order and you can even rule it out.

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM: You allow him to complete his speech and then you can allow the point of order.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Let me hear the Minister of Parliamentary Affairs. (Interruptions)

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज (हरियाणा): महोदय, ... (व्यवधान) आपकी परमिशन पर प्वाइंट ऑफ आर्डर नहीं हो सकता। यह मेरा सवमिशन है।

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS AND MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI M. M. JACOB): Mr. Chairman, Sir, you have permitted the Leader of the Opposition to raise some point. On that, we do not have any objection. It is your discretion. But on the point of order, it is up to you to give a decision. It is up to you to give a decision whether the point of order is tenable or untenable. We will abide by your decision. Question Hour is in your hands.

MR. CHAIRMAN: My decision is, no point of order.

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त: सदर साहब, मैं यह अर्ज कर रहा हूँ कि कल की मीटिंग इंडोर स्टेडियम में होने वाली थी। 144 की धारा इंडोर स्टेडियम में कहीं लागू नहीं होती। कल लोगों को स्टाडियम प्वाइंट से—कौन कौन सी जगहों का जिक्र

करा, आईटी.ओ. से, लक्ष्मी नगर से, धौलाकुआ से, त्रिनगर से, शक्ति नगर से, बिड़ला मन्दिर के दरवाजे तक बंद कर दिये गये कल। कुछ समय में नहीं आता है। लोगों को मीटिंग के स्थान पर पहुँचने से रोका गया और अटन बिहारी वाजपेयी साहब जो वहाँ की मीटिंग में बोलने जा रहे थे वे अभी अने दरवाजे के दरवाजे से निकले थे कि उनको निकलते वक्त ही गिरफ्तार किया गया। यह किस किस की... (व्यवधान), किस कायदे कानून के अन्तर्गत रोका गया। सदर साहब, मैं यह कहना चाहता हूँ कि रोजाना देहली में रैलीय निकाली जा रही है... (व्यवधान) रैलीय जा रही हैं... (व्यवधान)

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त: सदर صاحب—میں یہ عرض کر رہا ہوں کہ کل کی میٹنگ اندر اسٹیڈیم میں ہونے والی تھی۔ ۱۴۴ کی دھارا اندر اسٹیڈیم میں کہیں لاکو نہیں ہوتی کل لوگوں کو اسٹیشننگ پوائنٹ سے۔ کون کو کسی جگہوں کا ذکر کروں آئی۔ ٹی۔ او سے لکھتی نگر سے۔ دھولاکنوال سے تری نگر سے۔ شکستی نگر سے۔ بڑا مندر کے دروازے تک بند کر دیے گئے کل۔ کچھ سمجھ میں نہیں آتا ہے لوگوں کو میٹنگ کے استھان پر پہنچنے سے روکا گیا۔ اور اٹل بہارنا ایچ پی صاحب جو وہاں کی میٹنگ میں بولنے بارہ تھے وہ ابھی اپنے دفتر کے دروازے سے نکلے تھے کہ انکو نکلنے وقت ہی گرفتار کیا گیا۔ یہ کس قسم کی... "مداخلت"... کس قاعدے قانون کے ماتحت روکا گیا ہے۔ میں یہ کہنا چاہتا ہوں کہ روزانہ دہلی میں ریلیز نکال جا رہی ہیں۔... "مداخلت"... ریلیز نکال

... "مداخلت" ...

श्री एस. एस. अहलुवालिया : बिना परमिशन के थोड़ा (व्यवधान) वहां दंगा कराना चाहते थे ... (व्यवधान)

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त : मैं यह अजुब करना चाहता हूँ कि इंदोर मीटिंग के लिए पुलिस की ... (व्यवधान)

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त : मैं यह عرض करना चाहता हूँ कि इंदोर मीटिंग के लिए पुलिस की ... "मداخلत" ...

MR. CHAIRMAN: I have heard your point. (Interruptions)

SHRI SIKANDER BAKHT: Sir, I only want to bring to your notice... (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: I am asking the Government to give a reply to this. (Interruptions)

SHRI SIKANDER BAKHT: Sir, I just want to bring to your notice that no permission is required for an indoor meeting. Those people who hold the administrative charge of the Talkatora Stadium had allotted the Stadium to us. (Interruptions)

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA: Have they taken permission from the...

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त : यह दमन खत्म होना चाहिए। सदर साहब, दमन नहीं हुआ है। मैं यह कह रहा हूँ कि यह दमन खत्म होना चाहिए। कल मीटिंग नहीं करते दी गयी। हमारे लीडरों को गिरफ्तार किया गया। कुछ जमातों को बंद कर दिया गया। कुछ सरकारों को गिरा दिया गया। यह दमन का राज कब तक चलेगा हिंदुस्तान में, यह कहना चाहता हूँ मैं आपसे। किस किस का राज चलेगा यह कहना चाहता हूँ आपसे ... (व्यवधान)

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त : यह दमन खत्म होना चाहिए। सदर साहब दमन नहीं हुआ है। मैं यह कह रहा हूँ कि यह दमन खत्म होना चाहिए। कल मीटिंग नहीं करने दी गयी हमारे लीडरों को गिरफ्तार किया गया। कुछ جماعتों को बंद कर दिया गया। यह दमन का राज कब तक चलेगा हिंदुस्तान में। यह कहना चाहता हूँ मैं आपसे। कस किस का राज चलेगा यह कहना चाहता हूँ मैं आपसे ... "मداخلत" ...

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM: Mr. Chairman, Sir, may I make a submission?

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please sit down. May I say something? Will you please listen to me? (Interruptions) The Leader of the Opposition... (Interruptions)

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: Why don't they object? (Interruptions) Why are they keeping quiet to what is happening in Tamil Nadu? (Interruptions) They are objecting here to this. In Tamil Nadu, the same thing is happening. (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: All of you, please sit down. The Leader of the Opposition has made his point. I am asking the Minister of Parliamentary Affairs to clarify, on behalf of the Home Minister.

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM: Sir, please allow us to say something on this. We want to say something on what the Leader of the Opposition has said. Before you allow the Government to react, please allow some of us to say something on this. (Interruptions)

SHRI SIKANDER BAKHT: Sadar Sahab, my leader is on fast. वे यह कहते हैं कि वे इस चीज के खिलाफ हैं (व्यवधान) One of our conditions is that there should be no restrictions on us from holding public meetings in a peaceful manner. (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: I am asking the Minister to reply. (Interruptions)

SHRI SIKANDER BAKHT: Sir, I want to bring your notice that my leader is on fast. It is on certain conditions. I am only reading out to you these conditions so that the Government can react to it and decide. One condition is that there should be no restrictions on the BJP from holding public meetings in a peaceful manner to place its point of view, in exercise of its democratic right, before the people of India. The second condition is, no hindrance to the normal functioning of the BJP as a political organisation. The third condition is, no arrest of BJP workers on grounds of their past association with the RSS, whose activities stand suspended because of the ban. I would like the Government to react to this.

MR. CHAIRMAN: May I ask Mr. Jaipal Reddy to speak? (Interruptions). I will allow you.

SHRI P. UPENDRA: I may also be allowed to make a point. This is an important matter.

MR. CHAIRMAN: All right, I will allow you.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY (Andhra Pradesh): Mr. Chairman, we find ourselves caught between the devil of a vile BJP and the deep sea of a blundering Government. I do not know how to respond to this situation. Yesterday the Government gave an impression to the country that it does not have a sense of di-

rection, it does not have a sense of proportion.

I do not agree with any of the demands made by Mr. Atal Behari Vajpayee. They are all politically motivated, but....

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: Is it a discussion that we are going to have? (Interruptions).

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: But I would like to be informed as to why... (Interruptions) the Government did not permit an indoor stadium meeting. (Interruptions).

AN HON. MEMBER: We have not suspended the Question Hour.

SHRI SURESH KALMADI (Maharashtra): This is entirely a new procedure being followed.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: This is a case of bungling on the part of this Government which does not deserve to rule the country any more.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Mr. Chairman, Sir, we find from newspaper reports that yesterday the hon. Home Minister had gone to see Mr. Atal Behari Vajpayee at the spot where he is fasting and we also find from the reports that he mentioned to Mr. Vajpayee that he did not know that the meeting had been banned. If this is happening in Delhi and the hon. Home Minister of India is not aware of what is happening in Delhi, then I would like to repeat what I said the other day, what the hell is happening in this country, who is responsible for what is happening in this country? Let me make it very clear that whereas we will not allow BJP to trample upon democracy, we shall also not allow the ruling party to trample upon our democratic rights. We shall uphold them and resist all attempts to trample any of our democratic rights, wherever it might come from.

SHRI P. UPENDRA: Sir, Just now I met Atalji and got a first hand account and it is a very serious matter. If a man like Shri Atal Behari Vajpayee could be prevented from holding an indoor meeting, I do not know where we are leading to. Whatever may be the follies of the BJP, we cannot allow emergency conditions to return. I strongly condemn this action.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Subramanian Swamy. ... (Interruptions). I will come to you afterwards.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: Sir, the issue that is being raised by the Leader of the Opposition, Mr. Bakht, is that the fundamental right to assemble has been abridged or denied, they are protesting on that and their leader Mr. Vajpayee has gone on fast, demanding certain conditions to be met.

At the outset, I would like to say that the conditions which have been listed by Mr. Vajpayee are already being met by the Tamil Nadu Government (Interruptions)

SHRI G. SWAMINATHAN (Tamil Nadu): He is obsessed with Tamil Nadu... (Interruptions)

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: I am telling what is actually happening in Tamil Nadu also. The Anna DMK Government should also be dismissed because they are also not allowing free assembly. The day before yesterday I was not allowed to hold a fast and goondas were let loose. Janata Party workers were there... (Interruptions). The same thing, of which they are complaining now, is happening in Tamil Nadu but they are not complaining of what is happening there (Interruptions). Therefore, I demand dismissal of the Tamil Nadu Government also. (Interruptions).

MR. CHAIRMAN: I am allowing Mr. Padmanabham.

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM: Sir, what has happened yesterday is really very, very shameful, and this Government is going on committing one mistake after another. This Government has no right to exist. That is the reason why I demand the resignation of the Minister and this Government. If a man like Shri Atal Bihari Vajpayee was arrested—later on he was let off; that is a different thing—it means that this Government lacks direction and has no sense at all. Sir, way back in 1979, Mr. Charan Singh arrested Mrs. Gandhi and had given a new lease of life to the Congress (I) Party then. This Government is committing the same mistake by arresting Mr. Vajpayee, and this Government is doing the greatest harm to this country. Therefore, I demand the resignation of this Government.

... (Interruptions) ...

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY (Pondicherry): Mr. Chairman, Sir, on behalf of the Members of this House, I plead with Vajpayeeji to withdraw his fast.

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: Sir, he is pleading on behalf of the Members of this House. Who has given him the right to plead on our behalf?

... (Interruptions) ...

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: I am pleading ... (Interruptions) ... Sir, section 144 Cr. P.C. is in force in the Delhi area, but what happened there? Hundreds of people gathered with weapons and, in the name of assembling in the streets they created a law and order problem in the area. In the name of BJP, RSS and other cadres gathered there and tried to create a law and problem within the city limits. Unlawful assembly has been banned. When it was not

[Shri V. Narayanasamy]

allowed, how have these people been allowed to gather and go in a procession? What is the answer? (*Interruptions*)... My feeling is, Sir, in the Delhi area they are searching for a mosque for demolition...

... (*Interruptions*) ...

MR. CHAIRMAN: You have said it now. Please sit down now.

... (*Interruptions*) ...

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY (Andhra Pradesh): Sir, it is an irresponsible statement—which has been made just now—to say that a particular lot of people assembled in search of a mosque for demolition... (*Interruptions*) ...

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM: Sir, this is an irresponsible statement without any credible backing. Therefore, I request you to expunge this remark. (*Interruptions*)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please let us not have this cross-talk. I am prepared to allow each Member—as many as possible—to say something. If you please keep quiet, then I think we can listen to everybody. Now I call Shri Gopalsamy to say something.

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY: Sir... (*Interruptions*) ...

MR. CHAIRMAN: I will call you afterwards.

SYED SIBTEY RAZI (Uttar Pradesh): Ask the Government, Sir.  
... (*Interruptions*) ...

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: Sir, we are seriously concerned about the decision of Shri Atal Bihari Vajpayee to go on a indefinite fast. Sir, I want to make my submission on behalf of my party in no uncertain terms, that we are second to none to fight the diabolical concept of *Hindutva* and *Sangh Parivar*... (*Interruptions*)... Sir, the Government headed by Mr. Narasimha Rao will go down in the pages of the

Guinness Book of Records for bungling and inaction. This Government has miserably failed.

SYED SIBTEY RAZI: Sir, can he cast aspersions on the Government like this? No, no... (*Interruptions*) ...

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: If they resort to repeat their actions of the days of Emergency. I would like to give a strong warning that again they will be thrown into the dustbin of history. Now what appears from the Press reports is that they have decided to stifle the voice of the Opposition and curtail the freedom of expression. It is a danger signal. Again they will be thrown by the people into the dustbin of history... (*Interruptions*)

I do not support any of the steps which the Government is taking to stifle the voice of the Opposition.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please sit down. You have finished it. Dr. Bhattacharya... (*Interruptions*) I will come to you next.

SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA (Assam): Has the Question Hour been suspended? We want a ruling from you, Sir: whether the Question Hour has been suspended.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I am suspending the Question Hour in the circumstances... (*Interruptions*) Please. Mr. Bhattacharya.

SHRI CHATURANAN MISHRA (Bihar): A point of order.

MR. CHAIRMAN: After him.

SHRI CHATURANAN MISHRA: A point of order... (*Interruptions*)

Mr. Chairman, Sir, you have every right to do anything in the House. But take the consent of the House to suspend the Question Hour. On your own you cannot suspend the

Question Hour. Ask the House, take its permission and then you can suspend the Question Hour under the rules. On your own you cannot suspend the Question Hour.

... (Interruptions).

It could be allowed... (Interruptions)

You have allowed something else...

(Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: I have suspended the Question Hour in view of the obvious state of affairs in the House. It is very clear to you. It is very clear.

Dr. Bhattacharya.

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM: The Chair has every right to suspend the Question Hour if he thinks that it is necessary to do so. There is no need to take a consensus of the House.

PROF. SAURIN BHATTACHARYA: (West Bengal): Mr. Chairman, Sir, under normal circumstances everybody would have upheld what the Leader of the Opposition said regarding their right to hold meetings, peaceful meetings and uninterrupted political activity. But, what was done by them and their allies at Ayodhya on December 6, has placed them outside the pale of the Constitution, outside the pale of I should say, the civilised nation. While the Government, by its complete inaction, has proved itself unworthy of running the country, the BJP cannot escape the responsibility for bringing the country to the brink of disaster. Therefore, they should ponder over it, they should have introspection and they should return to sane ideas.

\* MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Salve... (Interruptions) I am coming to you Please, please.

SHRI M. M. JACOB: One moment, Sir.

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: Sir, I am one of those who consider that the voice of Shri Atal Bihari Vajpayee in their party is a voice of sanity and it is a voice of moderation.

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: Like that of your in your party.

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: We need to strengthen that voice.

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: Therefore you had arrested him... (Interruptions)...

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE: Mr Gopal, listen. Sometimes be serious in your life.

We want to strengthen that voice, and we want to strengthen that approach and attitude in their party. Let that be clear.

There is one more thing which I must clarify for my very esteemed friends. Shri Jaipal Reddy and honourable Shri Yashwant Sinha. Let the record be put straight, we don't want democratic rights to be trampled upon in any manner whatsoever. (Interruptions)

I assure you, I assure you. There are difficult... (Interruptions) Please do understand it.

I don't want to use this opportunity to trade charges and counter-charges. For God's sake.... (Interruptions)

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: Personally you are a good man.

SHRI DIGVIJAY SINGH (Bihar): I support you, Salve Ji, We are with you.

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: Salve Sahabji you are a voice of sanity in your party. Please carry on.

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE: Therefore, Kamal, kindly listen to me That is the minimum courtesy I expect from all of you.

[Shri N. K. P. Salve]

Sir, I want to submit this with great respect. The Home Minister is here. He deals with the situation. But what is required immediately is that instead of precipitating the situation I have two suggestions to make. Number one, all of us should go and persuade Atal Bihari Ji Vajpayee to give up his fist.

SOME HON. MEMBERS: No.  
... (Interruptions) ...

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: Sir, I am submitting this. I said this is my personal opinion. He should be persuaded to give up his fist, because this is not the time to stipulate these conditions. The condition in the country is far from normal. The condition in the country is still very serious. The minorities are still languishing under mortal fear of their life, security, liberty and honour. What is required is to restore confidence in the minds of the minorities and Atal Bihari Ji should join all those forces who want to restore that confidence in the minorities. This is not the time to stipulate conditions. This is the time to ensure that normalcy is restored in the country. That is my submission.

श्री एस. एस. अहलवालिया : सभापति महोदय, कल की जो घटना घटी है, यह अपने आप में एक दुर्भाग्यपूर्ण घटना है और यह दुर्भाग्यपूर्ण इसलिए है कि हमारा देश गणतंत्र में विश्वास करता है और एक गणतान्त्रिक देश होने के नाते हरेक आदमी का अपना गणतान्त्रिक अधिकार है, हरेक पार्टी का अपना एक गणतान्त्रिक अधिकार है। मैं कल की घटना को दुर्भाग्यपूर्ण सल्लिए कहता हूँ कि कल अगर बी.जे.पी. एक शान्ति-मार्च कर रही थी या एक ऐसी मीटिंग करना चाहती थी ... (व्यवधान) ... अरे, बोलने दो, न बाबा। मेरे पास आपसे ज्यादा इन्फोरमेशन है। ... (व्यवधान)

महोदय, अगर यह कोई शान्ति मार्च करके आज के देश के माहौल को शान्त करने की मीटिंग कर रही थी और उसके

बावजूद दिल्ली एडमिनिस्ट्रेशन या भारत सरकार ने उन्हें परमीशन नहीं दी तो यह दुर्भाग्य का विषय है, दुर्भाग्यपूर्ण है, निन्दनीय है, परन्तु मुझे यहाँ तक मालूम हुआ है यह मीटिंग शान्ति के लिए नहीं थी बल्कि इस मीटिंग का नाम ललकार दिवस था। अब यह ललकार किसके खिलाफ थी? ... (व्यवधान) ... यह ललकार इस देश के पंथ निरपेक्ष सिद्धांत के खिलाफ थी ... (व्यवधान)

श्री लक्ष्मीराम अग्रवाल (मध्य प्रदेश):  
तानाशाही के खिलाफ थी।

श्री एस. एस. अहलवालिया : यहाँ पर अपनी तानाशाही इन्होंने 6 दिनों पर अयोध्या में जो दिखाई है, इसी की एक नई ललकार देना चाहते थे कि वह तो एक शांकी है, मथुरा और काशी बाकी है। यह नारा देना चाहते हैं। ... (व्यवधान)

महोदय, जब भी इस सदन में किसी भी विपक्ष के नेता के गणतान्त्रिक अधिकारों का हनन हुआ है तो मैंने ट्रेजरी बैंक की तरफ से भी लड़ें होकर अपनी पार्टी का विरोध किया है। मैं कभी चूकता नहीं। मैं आज भी नहीं चूकता, अगर यह वाकई देश में शान्ति और अमन कायम करने के लिए इनकी एक ललकार होती। पर, इस ललकार के माध्यम से यह याद दिलाना चाहते हैं, \*\*

उसी तरह यह इस देश की सारी ...  
(व्यवधान)

महोदय, इस पर विचार करने की जरूरत है कि किन अवस्थाओं में यह मीटिंग करना चाहते थे। ... (व्यवधान)

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: Sir,  
I object to this. (Interruptions) ...

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: Sir,  
this cannot go on record. (Interruptions)

\*\*Expunged as ordered by the Chair.



SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM: Sir, he is misquoting. He does not know anything about Jaya-prakash Narayan. *(Interruptions)* We take very strong objection to this *(Interruptions)*

SHRI SIKANDER BAKHT: That comment is uncalled for. *(Interruptions)*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please allow me to say something. *(Interruptions)*... I am allowing you to speak.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: Mr. Chairman, Sir, I am on a point of order. *(Interruptions)*... I am on a point of order. *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: No, Sir, a reference has been made.

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: He must apologise.

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त : रिमाक्स को...  
(व्यवधान)... सदर साहब, मैं जानना चाहता हूँ कि जय प्रकाश का नाम लेकर क्या यह सरकार दोबारा इमरजेंसी लगाना चाहती है? इसका मतलब क्या है? यह हिन्दुस्तान की जम्हूरियत को खत्म करना चाहते हैं, लोकतंत्र को खम करना चाहते हैं, क्या चाहते हैं यह?  
...(व्यवधान)...

شری سکندر بخت : ریماکس کو... مدافعت  
صدر صاحب - میں جاننا چاہتا ہوں کہ جبے پر  
کا نام لے کر کیا یہ سرکار دوبارہ ایمرجنسی لگانا  
چاہتی ہے۔ اس کا مطلب کیا ہے۔ یہ ہندوستان  
کی جمہوریت کو ختم کرنا چاہتے ہیں۔ لوگ تنز  
کو ختم کرنا چاہتے ہیں۔ کیا چاہتے ہیں یہ۔۔۔

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: I am on a point of order.

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: He should apologise to the House.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: I am on a point of order, Sir. *(Interruptions)*... I am on a point of order, please. I have been permitted by the Chairman. *(Interruptions)*... I am on a point of order. *(Interruptions)*... I have been permitted by the Chairman. *(Interruptions)*... I have been permitted by the Chairman. *(Interruptions)*... I am on a point of order. *(Interruptions)*... I am on a point of order. *(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: I have to hear his point of order. *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: Mr. Jacob, Mr. Chairman has been good enough to identify me. *(Interruptions)*... On a point of order. You were good enough to identify me. *(Interruptions)*... I am on a point of order.

SHRI M. M. JACOB: Sir, I was only trying to point out one thing, Sir. *(Interruptions)*... In the confusion... *(Interruptions)*... You should have given us a chance to make our point clear.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Mr. Ahluwalia must stand up in this House and apologise for his reference to Mr. Jaya Prakash Narayan. *(Interruptions)*... He will have to apologise, there is no question. Nothing short of an apology from Mr. Ahluwalia will do. We will not accept an apology from anyone. *(Interruptions)*... Mr. Ahluwalia must apologise for the false statement made in this House.

THE MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI S. B. CHAVAN): Mr. Chairman, Sir, what I have to say is that... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Mr. Ahluwalia must apologise.

SHRI MUFTI MOHD. SAYEED (Uttar Pradesh): Mr. Chairman, Sir,

what Mr. Ahluwalia has said is very objectionable. He must apologise to the House.

**SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM:** Or let him withdraw that remark.

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Mr. Reddy, will you give your point of order?

**SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY:** Mr. Chairman, Sir, I thank you for permitting me to say a few words on Mr Ahluwalia's remark. Mr. Ahluwalia has made a false and highly reprehensible reference to the memory of Lok Nayak Jaya Prakash Narayan. \* It is a historical fiction. Therefore, Mr. Ahluwalia must withdraw his charge and the Congress party must apologise. It should be removed from the record.

**SHRI SIKANDER BAKHT:** Mr. Chairman, Sir, I join Mr. Jaipal Reddy in demanding an apology from Mr. Ahluwalia. He has made absolutely uncalled-for remarks. (*Interruptions*). He must apologise.

**श्री एस. एस. अहलुवालिया :** सभापति जी, मैं बिहार का रहने वाला हूँ जो जय प्रकाश नारायण जी की भक्ति है। मेरे दिल में उनके प्रति श्रद्धा है। मैं ने कुछ इतिहास के पन्ने पढ़े हैं और मैं.... (*व्यवधान*)

**SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM:** He must withdraw his remarks.

**SHRI V. GOPALSAMY:** He must withdraw the remarks made against Mr. Jayaprakash Narayan. (*Interruptions*).

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** May I say something? I think the reference to Shri Jayaprakash Narayan was out of context and not required in this discussion at all. Therefore, I

\*Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

would request Mr. Ahluwalia to kindly withdraw it. It was not relevant to what we were discussing today. I would request him to withdraw that.

**श्री एस. एस. अहलुवालिया :** सभापति जी, मैं सिर्फ इतना चाहता हूँ.... (*व्यवधान*)

**डा. जिनेन्द्र कुमार जैन :** (मध्य प्रदेश) : पहले माफी मांगो। .... (*व्यवधान*)

**SHRI SATYA PRAKASH MALAVIYA** (Uttar Pradesh): We do not want any explanation. We want an unqualified apology.

**SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA:** Sir, if they do not allow me to speak, how can I withdraw? (*Interruptions*).

**SHRI PASUMPON THA. KIRUTINAN** (Tamil Nadu): Sir, we do not want any explanation from him. Let him apologise first.

**SHRI V. GOPALSAMY:** Nothing short of an apology will do.

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Let us listen to what he is going to say. I have asked him to do something. Let me listen to what he says. (*Interruptions*).

**SHRI INDER KUMAR GUJRAL** (Bihar): Sir, I rise on a point of order. Mr Chairman, the issue before the House is unfortunate and that is, an hon. Member of this House, exhibiting utter irresponsibility, has uttered words which are not acceptable to any part of the House. He does not need to give any preamble. He has only to say that he apologises unconditionally. That is all.

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Are you withdrawing it, Mr. Ahluwalia?

**SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA :** Sir, they should let me speak first. If they do not allow me to speak, how can I withdraw? Let me speak. (*Interruptions*).

MR. CHAIRMAN. He has been allowed to express himself. He wants to say something before withdrawing it.

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA: I have got a right to explain things in the House. I have got my right, as a Member of this House, to explain under what circumstances I have mentioned this. I have every right to do that. (Interruptions).

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: We do not want any preamble. He must apologise or he must be named. We are not prepared to listen to any preamble whatsoever.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: I am sorry that this is not the way to express... (Interruptions)

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: Let him apologise first.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: No 'buts' and 'ifs'.

श्री एस. एस. अहलुवालिया : सभा पति जी, मैंने जैसा कहा है कि मैं बिहार का रहने वाला हूँ और जय प्रकाश नारायण जी के प्रति मेरे मन में काफी श्रद्धा है। .... (व्यवधान) और अगर आज बी. जे. पी. के कुकृत्यों का उल्लेख करते हुए मैंने जय प्रकाश नारायण जी का नाम लिया और अगर उससे किसी को चोट पहुँची है तो मैं क्षमा मांगता हूँ और अगर.... (व्यवधान) मैं कभी भी संकोच महसूस नहीं करता। मुत्क में आग लगाने के लिए इन्होंने सलकार दिवस का पालन करने की कोशिश की थी और मुत्क में एक नया दंगा भड़काना चाहते हैं। पुलिस ने जो भी कार्रवाई की है, वह मैं सही ठहराता हूँ इस मामले में। बी.जे.पी. के लोगों ने जो सलकार पूरे भारत के लोगों को देकर इस मुत्क में फिर से आग लगाने की कोशिश की थी, उस पर सरकार ने जो भी कार्रवाई की है मैं सही ठहराता हूँ।

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Sir, what has he said? We are not satisfied. Let me make it very clear that the memory of the Lok Nayak is sacred to us. It is a sacred memory and we shall not allow that to be defiled by anyone. We shall protect with all our might any defilement of that sacred memory.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I would like to say that he said, he is apologising. In any case, I want this to be expunged from the record. The Home Minister wants to say something. (Interruptions)

SHRI S. B. CHAVAN: Sir, I regret that such a kind of statement should have been made by any Member of this hon. House and I am grateful to you that you have given orders to expunge this from the record!

Sir, about the different points that have been made about yesterday's incident, I had personally gone to see my esteemed friend, Shri Atal Bihari Vajpayee, and requested him that in the present circumstances, it was not proper that he should go on an indefinite fast. In fact, Section 144 has been promulgated throughout the city and it was normally not expected of such a respectable Member to make an issue out of it. At any rate, having made this point, I discussed with him all the three or four points that he had put forth.

The first demand was about non-interference in the working of the BJP and I said, "You can take my assurance that so far as the working of the BJP is concerned, so far as they are within the limits imposed by the law of the land certainly there will be no action against them. They can rest assured." In their normal functioning, in fact, there is no question of any kind of interference on behalf of the Government.

The second point about which he was very keen was that indoor meetings should be allowed to be held. To that also, I have given permission by saying "so long as it is confined to the hall"; it should not spill out of the hall—the crowd who are coming to attend the meeting or going out of the meeting after the meeting is over should strictly observe restrictions imposed by sec. 144 CrPC. If they create any problem of law and order on the way, the organisers of the meeting will have to assume responsibility. They must also take care and see that they hold their meeting inside the hall. The indoor meeting that they wanted to have—and I have agreed that they can hold such of their meetings indoors. We have no objection provided the Organizers give this kind of an undertaking.

The third point was about all those people who had their past association with the R.S.S., that they are being arrested. I said: "If those who are not associated with the R.S.S. or at one time they were associated but they are not active participants now, they are not doing any kind of activity certainly, we are not interested in arresting them." That kind of assurance also I have given. In fact, if he tells the officer who has come to him, "I am not now associating myself with the R.S.S.", there will be no reason as to why he should be arrested.

I think these were the three points which were raised and about which I have given a very clear and categorical reply to Atal Ji and through you, Sir, we will request him not to continue his fast. He should give up his fast after these assurances which the Government has given.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I will pass on to the next item of business of the House—Statement by Minister correcting answer to question. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA (West Bengal): Mr. Chairman, Sir, we wanted to make a submission.

MR. CHAIRMAN: We have discussed it sufficiently and the Home Minister has given an appropriate reply.

### WRITTEN ANSWERS TO QUESTIONS

#### Low Productivity of Indian Labour

\*381. DR. SANJAYA SINH: Will the Minister of LABOUR be pleased to state:

(a) whether it is a fact that Indian labour has been the least productive in the World;

(b) if so, the details thereof; and

(c) what corrective steps Government propose to take in the matter?

THE MINISTER OF STATE OF THE MINISTRY OF COAL WITH ADDITIONAL CHARGE OF MINISTER OF STATE OF THE MINISTRY OF LABOUR (SHRI P. A. SANGMA): (a) and (b) According to the data compiled by the Asian Productivity Organisation published in "Comparative Information on Productivity Levels and Changes in A.P.O. Member Countries-1991" the Indian workers' output per year at 1980 prices in terms of US \$ has been the lowest among the workers of the major Asian Countries for the years 1980-89. A statement indicating the output per worker per year during 1980-89 among the major Asian Countries is given in the Annexure.

[See appendix CLXV, Annexure No. 72]

(c) The steps taken by the Government to improve productivity include setting up of the National Productivity Council announcement of New Industrial Policy which,