

Business	Time Allotted
Consideration and passing of the following Bills :—	
(1) The National Highways (Amendment) Bill, 1992, as passed by Lok Sabha . . . . .	2 Hrs
(2) The SAARC Convention (Suppression of Terrorism) Bill, 1992 . . . . .	2 Hrs. & 30 Mts
(3) The Indian Contract (Amendment) Bill, 1992 . . . . .	2 Hrs.
(4) The Infant Milk Substitutes, Feeding Bottles and Infant Foods (Regulation of Production, Supply and Distribution) Bill, 1992, as passed by Lok Sabha . . . . .	1 Hr.
(5) The Cinematography (Amendment) Bill, 1992 . . . . .	2 Hrs.

The Committee recommended that the House should sit up to 6.00 PM daily from Thursday, the 26th November, 1992 for the transaction of Government Legislative and other Business.

**STATEMENT BY THE MINISTER**  
**The Indian Medical Council (Amendment)**  
**Ordinance, 1992**

**THE MINISTER OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE (SHRI M. L. FOTEDAR) :** Madam, I lay on the Table a statement (in English and Hindi) explaining the circumstances which had necessitated immediate legislation by the Indian Medical Council (Amendment) Ordinance, 1992. [Placed in Library. See No. LT-2733/92].

**The Indian Medical Council (Amendment)**  
**Bill, 1992**

**THE MINISTER OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE (SHRI M. L. FOTEDAR) :** Madam, I beg to move for leave to introduce a Bill further to amend the Indian Medical Council Act, 1956.

*The question was put and the motion was adopted.*

**SHRI M. L. FOTEDAR :** Sir, I introduce the Bill.

**STATEMENT BY THE MINISTER**  
**The Dentists (Amendment) Ordinance,**  
**1992**

**THE MINISTER OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE (SHRI M. L. FOTEDAR) :** Madam, I lay on the Table a statement (in English and Hindi) explaining the circumstances which had

necessitated immediate legislation by the Dentists (Amendment) Ordinance, 1992. [Placed in Library. See No. LT-2734/92].

**THE DENTISTS (AMENDMENT)**  
**BILL, 1992**

**THE MINISTER OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE (SHRI M. L. FOTEDAR) :** Madam, I beg to move for leave to introduce a Bill further to amend the Dentists Act, 1948.

*The question was put and the motion was adopted.*

**SHRI M. L. FOTEDAR :** Madam, I introduce the Bill.

**RE WITHDRAWAL OF NSG PROTECTION TO THE CHIEF MINISTER OF**  
**TAMIL NADU**

**SHRI DIPEN GHOSH (West Bengal) :** What will happen if we don't grant leave?

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :** I knew that you would say "Aye". I am sure that you want a discussion on this... (*Interruptions*)

**SHRI DIPEN GHOSH :** But advise the Government not to take recourse to passing ordinances very often.

**SHRI MURLIDHAR CHANDRAKANT BHANDARE (Maharashtra) :** You look at the ordinance aspect.

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :** It is about dentists. Don't you want more teeth? For everything and at every time, we want more teeth.

**SHRI YASHWANT SINHA (Bihar) :** We are left with our dentures all these years... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI G. SWAMINATHAN (Tamil Nadu) : I am standing on a very important matter... *(Interruptions)*

SHRI MURLIDHAR CHANDRAKANT BHANDARE : I want to raise an important issue... *(Interruptions)*

SHRI G. SWAMINATHAN : Madam, it is a very serious matter. It is regarding the withdrawal of NSG protection...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Mr. Swaminathan, the Chairman has very kindly permitted you to make a special mention appropriate time, I will call you for that... *(Interruptions)*

SHRI G. SWAMINATHAN : This is regarding the withdrawal of the NSG protection to the Chief Minister of Tamil Nadu by the Government of India.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I know that this is regarding the withdrawal of the NSG protection. I will permit you... *(Interruptions)*

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN (Tamil Nadu) : You should allow us also... *(Interruptions)*

SHRI G. SWAMINATHAN : They are withdrawing the protection from there at a time when the LTTE...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Special mention has been permitted.

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS AND MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI M. M. JACOB) : Madam, the NSG protection to the Tamil Nadu Chief Minister has not been withdrawn. It is a wrong reporting... *(Interruptions)* What he is saying is about the withdrawal of the NSG protection to the Chief Minister. The Government of India has not withdrawn the NSG protection to the Tamil Nadu Chief Minister. I assured on the floor of the House earlier that the NSG protection would be given to her as long as it was required... *(Interruptions)*

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN : But you have been going on writing letters... *(Interruptions)*

SHRI G. SWAMINATHAN : THE HOME MINISTRY is going on writing letters... *(Interruptions)*

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN : The letter is very clear and the Minister is misleading the House... *(Interruptions)*

SHRI G. SWAMINATHAN : The Minister is misleading the House... *(Interruptions)*

SHRI V. RAJAN CHELLAPPA (Tamil Nadu) : It was withdrawn on 31-12-1991... *(Interruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Will you please take your seat ? *(Interruptions)* Mr. Swaminathan, Will you please take your seat for a minute ? *(Interruptions)*

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY (Tamil Nadu) : We are very much concerned about the security of the Chief Minister... *(Interruptions)*

SHRI G. SWAMINATHAN : And she is a lady...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Mr. Swaminathan, will you please take your seat for a minute ? *(Interruptions)*

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY (Andhra Pradesh) : Madam, now that Mr. Gopalsamy is concerned you should be concerned.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I think I am now concerned for my security... *(Interruptions)*

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY (Pondicherry) : Mr. Swaminathan has raised a special mention... *(Interruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Please take your seat... *(Interruptions)* Mr. Narayanasamy, just a minute. As the Minister of State for Home Affairs has assured on the floor of the House that there is no question of withdrawing the NSG protection given to the Chief Minister of Tamil Nadu... *(Interruptions)*

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN : It is a wrong information.

उप सभापति : आप जरा एक मिनट मेरी बात सुन लीजिए। आप बैठिए।

Please sit down. If there is an assurance from the Minister of State for Home that this news is wrong, I think the matter settles... (Interruptions).

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN : No. There is a letter from the Joint Secretary... (Interruptions).

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : Let the Home Minister make a statement regarding...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : When he makes a special mention and not now... (Interruptions).

SHRI SIKANDER BAKHT (Madhya Pradesh) : The letter has been reproduced in the newspaper... (Interruptions).

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : You may kindly direct the Home Minister to make a statement thereon.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : When he makes the special mention, at that time you make this point. Not now... (Interruptions).

SHRI SIKANDER BAKHT : He has been allowed to make a special mention and not the rest of the Members.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I am not allowing now... (Interruptions).

SHRI G. SWAMINATHAN : They are going on writing letters. They have written so many letters... (Interruptions).

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : Now that the Home Minister has intervened in the matter and responded to the issue, he should be able to tell the House that he would make a detailed statement on the whole question... (Interruptions) There are many controversial aspects on this issue... (Interruptions).

SHRI S. MUTHU MANI (Tamil Nadu) : NSG protection should not be withdrawn... (Interruption).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Please sit on your seat... (Interruptions).

I will permit the Special Mentions as permitted by the Chairman. At that point of time, you may raise whatever fears or enquiries you have. Now, please take your seat... (Interruptions)...

श्रीमती सरला माहेश्वरी (परिचली बंगाल) : मैडम,

उपसभापति : मैं आपको एलाउ करूंगी।

Let me identify. Mr. Bhandare... (Interruptions)....

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN (Tamil Nadu) : I want to know who leaked the letters to the *Indian Express*. Today, the *Indian Express* published the confidential letters of the Home Ministry and these were leaked to the *Indian Express*... (Interruptions).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : At the time of Special Mentions, I will permit you to mention... (Interruptions)... Order... (Interruptions)... Order in the House... (Interruptions)... Order...

आप अपने स्थान पर रहकर बोलेंगी :

SHRI MURLIDHAR CHANDRAKANT BHANDARE : Madam, I rise to express the strong sentiments not only of myself, but of the entire House and all the citizens of our great nation against the Torricelli Bill, also called the Cuban Democratic Act. The purpose of this measure is to strengthen the economic, commercial and financial blockade imposed by the U.S.A. against Cuba since 3rd February, 1962 and the extraterritorial operations of that measure, what is worse, it obligates the third world countries, including India to the dictates of the U.S. Administration. It is heartening that a strongly worded Cuban Resolution was passed by the O. N. General Assembly, totally isolating the United States of America with 59 in favour and only 3 against while 71 abstained.

I congratulate the Government of India for supporting the Cuban Resolution. Many of the U.S. allies like Great Britain, Germany, Japan, Australia have abstained. France and Canada supported repeal. The British Ambassador, speaking on behalf of the entire European Community, denounced the U. S. embargo as a viola-

[Shri Murlidhar Chandrakant Bhandare]

tion of general principles of International Law and sovereignty of independent nations. The near-unanimous feeling was that the measure infringes on the sovereignty and violates the rights of free trade and navigation of nations.

To go back to a proud page in our own history, a similar measures was resisted by Pandit Jawaharlalji and at that time the U.S.A. had to backtrack and the measure was dropped. It must be remembered that great changes, which have overtaken our planet leaving the winter of cold war behind and promising a spring-time of human rights and freedom, have come from the well-spring of change in the hearts of all the citizens of those countries and not out of deterrence of war or economic sanctions. Therefore it is wrong to call this as a unipolar world. According to me, what is emerging is truly a democratic, non-violent world where the freedom of choice is given to all the nations. May I end up by saying that if the rest of the world is changing, it is time that the U.S.A. also shall change and appreciate the democratic urges of other nations. The U.S.A. must desist from imposing its will on other nations and let every nation decide what is best for its people.

Thank you, Madam.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : Madam, I associate myself... (Interruptions)...

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : The whole House is associated... (Interruptions)

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : One by one Madam, I would like to associate myself completely with the sentiments and views so beautifully articulated by our colleague Mr. Bhandare. But I would like to tell Mr. Bhandare that the congratulations are not entirely well-deserved because the Government of India while voting for the Resolution, did not participate in the discussion on the Resolution. I want to know what prevented the Government from articulating its views in the course of the discussion there... (Interruptions)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : All right. Let us not start a discussion on that now... (Interruptions)...

SHRI SHANTI TYAGI (Uttar Prdaesh) : Madam,... (Interruptions)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : You want to support this ?

SHRI SHANTI TYAGI : Yes, I want to support it.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Now, Mrs. Sarala Maheshwari.

श्रीमती सरला माहेश्वरी : मैडम, एक बहुत ही महत्वपूर्ण मसला है जिसकी ओर मैं आपका और इस सदन का ध्यान आकर्षित करना चाहती हूँ। कल दिल्ली के बोट क्लब पर देश के कोने-कोने से लाखों मजदूर एकत्रित हुए थे, गरीबों और मजदूरों को तबाह और बरबाद करने वाली, उनकी रोजी-और रोटी छीनने वाली सरकार की आर्थिक नीतियों के विरुद्ध... (व्यवधान)

उपसभापति : कल तो आपने बोल दिया था इस पर... (व्यवधान)

श्रीमती सरला माहेश्वरी : मैडम, यह दुर्भाग्य की बात है कि सत्यम शिवम सुन्दरम के नीति वाक्य के तहत सूचनाओं को प्रसारित करने वाले हमारे दूरदर्शन ने यह उचित नहीं समझा कि उस विशाल रैली, मजदूरों के इतिहास में जो एक ऐतिहासिक रैली थी, उस रैली को दूरदर्शन पर दिखाया जाए... (व्यवधान) सरकार ने मजदूर विरोधी रुख अख्तियार कर रखा है। उपसभापति महोदया, मैं यह जानना चाहती हूँ कि हमारे सूचना और प्रसारण मंत्री बंगाल की रैली को, कलकत्ता में होने वाली रैली को दूरदर्शन के परदे पर दिखा सकते हैं लेकिन दिल्ली के बोट क्लब पर होने वाली रैली को दिखाता उन्होंने उचित नहीं समझा। मैं आपसे यह अपील करती हूँ कि आप सरकार से निवेदन करें और पूरा हाऊस उनसे निवेदन करे कि सरकार इस बात की सूचना दे कि आधिकारिक कारण है कि दूरदर्शन के निजीकरण के नारे लगाने वाले हमारे सूचना और प्रसारण मंत्री किस तरह सूचना पर अपनी इजारेदारी के कायम रखना चाहते हैं... (व्यवधान)

श्री मोहम्मद अफजल उर्फ मीन (उत्तर प्रदेश) दूरदर्शन को इन् बंदी बनाकर रखा हुआ है...

شری محمد افضل عرف م افضل :-  
یہ بات بڑی حد تک صحیح ہے ۔  
... ”مداخلت“ ...

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : Madam, the Information Minister must apologize to the House... (Interruptions)... He must apologize to the House... (Interruptions)...

श्री मोहम्मद अफजल उर्फ मौम अफजल :  
दूरदर्शन ने पहले भी ये हरकत को थी जब  
जनता दल के बैनर के तहत बम्बई के अंदर  
बहुत बड़ी लाखों लोगों की रैली हुई, दूर-  
दर्शन ने उसको नहीं दिखाया और कलकत्ता के  
अंदर कांग्रेस (आई) की छांटो सी रैली को  
दिखाया ..... (व्यवधान)

شری محمد افضل عرف م افضل :-  
دور درشن نے پہلے بھی یہ حرکت کی تھی  
جب جنتا دل کے بینز کے تحت بمبئی  
کے اندر بہت بڑی لاکھوں لوگوں  
کی ریلی ہوئی دور درشن نے اُس کو  
نہیں دکھایا اور کلکتہ کے اندر کانگریس  
(آئی) کی چھوٹی سی ریلی کو دیکھایا ۔  
... ”مداخلت“ ...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Please sit down. You have not taken my permission... (Interruptions)... You have not been permitted. ... (Interruptions)... I have not permitted you. Please sit down.

... (Interruptions)... I have permitted the lady Member only.

श्री मोहम्मद अफजल उर्फ मौम अफजल :  
जम्हूरियत को कल करने का प्रयास किया जा  
रह है .... (व्यवधान)

उपसभापति : आई एम सारी, जिनकी  
आपको आवाज है मेरी आवाज ने मिला नहीं  
रही ।

[ ] Transliteration in Arabic Script.

I have got a very sore throat. Please have mercy on me and please sit down.

SHRI SURESH KALMADI (Maharashtra Madam, this news item was the headline news item on the Doordarshan yesterday... (Interruptions)... It was the headline news item... (Interruptions)...

SHRI CHATURANAN MISHRA (Bihar) : Why were the pictures not shown? ... (Interruptions)... Why were the visuals not shown? This is discription... (Interruptions)...

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY : The first item was this news only... (Interruptions)...

SHRI CHATURANAN MISHRA : But why were the visuals not shown? That is what I want to know... (Interruptions)... This is not the way to run the Doordarshan impartially. It is anti working class and discriminatory.

... (Interruptions)

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : Kuni. Mamta Banerjee's rally held at Calcutta was shown on the Delhi TV, not only on the National Network, but also in the local news... (Interruptions)...

SHRI SURESH KALMADI : In Mamta Banerjee's rally, ten lakh people were there... (Interruptions)... Mamta's rally had ten lakh people against the CPM's rally of two lakhs, so, they had to show it... (Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Just a minute. Please sit down. (Interruptions) Afzal Sahib, please sit down. I say, please sit down. If you feel that showing one rally was not right, then two wrongs will not become one right. So, the matter is being raised in the House. (Interruptions) Just a minute. You don't allow me to speak ? Please sit down. The Government will take note of the matter, and the Minister would be told by the Ministers present in the House. Now, you please sit down.

**SHRI SUKOMAL SEN (West Bengal) :** Doordarshan made a specious plea....

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :** Whatever it is, it will be taken up by the Ministers here with the Minister concerned. (*Interruptions*).

आप बैठ जाइए । चतुरानन जी बोलिये ।  
... (व्यवधान)

**SHRI SUKOMAL SEN :** I told the DG that as far as the rally is concerned, it is a rally by different trade union people and that lakhs of people came there. (*Interruptions*) I asked him how the Calcutta rally was shown on Doordarshan. He said, "No, no. Calcutta film was edited but this could not be edited." I told him, "the work-to-rule is being observed more in Calcutta than in Delhi. When Calcutta could produce the film, why not Delhi?" He said, "all right, I will enquire." I told him, "you see, Mr. Krishnan, you are making a political discrimination between the Congress and other parties." (*Interruptions*)

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :** Please do not mention the names of the people. (*Interruptions*) I must remind you, Mr. Sukomal Sen. This is a convention of the House. Do not mention what discussion you had with Doordarshan DG. (*Interruptions*)

**SHRI DIPEN GHOSH :** They are underlining the necessity to make TV an autonomous body. The Prasar Bharati Bill was passed by the Parliament. (*Interruptions*)

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :** Please sit down.

**SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN :** (Maharashtra) : I fully support Mr. Dipen Ghosh to make Doordarshan autonomous. It will save the time of the Parliament. And whether it is reported or not will be the concern of the autonomous Doordarshan. To report "X" rally or "Y" rally will be their concern and we will be much relieved... (*Interruptions*)

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :** Please sit down. Yesterday you all made so much of pledges that you were going to go by the rules. Please sit down.

**श्री चतुरानन मिश्र :** उपसभापति महोदया, पहले मुझे यह कहना है कि यह जो टी. वी. वाली बात आई है अगर उस पर मंत्री महोदय ने कल भी सदन में जवाब नहीं दिया कि क्यों ऐसा भेदभाव किया गया है तो हम लोग फिर प्रोटेस्ट करेंगे, यह बात मैं सरकार के ध्यान में ला दूँ ...

जहाँ तक आपने मुझे दूसरी बात कहने की इजाजत दी है, मैं ...

**श्री एन. के. पी. साल्वे (महाराष्ट्र) :** मंडम, मैं भी इसी पर ...

**उपसभापति :** साल्वे जी दूरदर्शन वाले मामले पर बोलना चाहते हैं, इसलिए पहले यह बात हो जाने दीजिए, फिर आप अपनी दूसरी बात कहिएगा । ...  
(व्यवधान)

**SHRI N. K. P. SALVE :** Madam, it is true... (*Interruptions*)

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :** Order, please.

**SHRI N.K.P. SALVE :** Madam, it is true that a rally of the dimension which was held in Delhi, not only the headlines but the visuals of it should have been shown. At the same time, when the are asking that the visuals here should have been shown, I do not see the rationale or the logic behind their objecting to what Mamta Banerjee did in Calcutta (*Interruptions*)

**SHRI DIPEN GHOSH :** Mr. Salve, we are not objecting... (*Interruptions*)

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :** Mr. Dipen Ghosh, please sit down. This is not the way, (*Interruptions*) This is not proper. I am not permitting. Mr. Salve is a Senior Member of this House. He never interrupted you. why are you interrupting him? Let him speak.

**SHRI N.K.P. SALVE :** Madam, that is a watershed in the politics of West Bengal. And it must be understood. It has to be understood and appreciated that Doordarshan is expected to act impartially and as the very rightly eulogised Kumari Mamta Banerjee for embarking on a historical mission, they should have also shown visuals... (*Interruptions*).

**SHRI KAMAL MORARKA (Rajasthan) :** Everybody in that party is embarking on a historic mission. Kumari Mamta Banerjee also and Sudhakarrao Naik also... (*Interruptions*).

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :** Mamta Banerjee is a Member of the other House. Don't mention about her in this House.

**SHRI MOHAMMED AFZAL alias MEEM AFZAL :** I have a point of order on Doordarshan... (*Interruptions*).

**SHRI VISHVJIT P. SINGH (Maharashtra) :** My heart-felt condolences to my friends of the Left Front.

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :** What point of order, Mr. Afzal? There is no discussion on which you can raise a point of order or disorder.

**श्री चतुरानन मिश्र :** उपसभापति महोदया, कल सुप्रीम कोर्ट ने जो एक आदेश दिया है वह इतना महत्वपूर्ण है कि मैं उस ओर सदन का ध्यान आकर्षित करना चाहता हूँ। मैं आर्डर से कोट करता हूँ :

'We indicated to Mr. Venugopal that the matter was indeed sensitive and it was not a question of simple construction of structure on the land, but the demolition of constitutional institutions in the country when the State, for whatever reason, was not able to uphold and enforce the orders of the highest court', the court added.

मैंने यह कहना है कि... (*व्यवधान*)... आपको क्या कहना है इसमें... (*व्यवधान*)...

**उपसभापति महोदया, ... (व्यवधान)...**  
जरा सन्तुल्य। माननीय बी.जे.पी. के सदस्यगण संविधान की शपथ लेकर यहाँ पर आये हैं। मैं लीडर ऑफ दि अपोजीशन से अनुरोध करूँगा कि आप भी शपथ ग्रहण करके आये हुए हैं और  
21-404 RSS/93

अगर सुप्रीम कोर्ट कहता है कि यह धूँट है डिमालिशन ऑफ कंस्टिट्यूशनल इंस्टीट्यूशंस के लिए, तो उनको क्या कहना है, मैं यह जानना चाहूँगा ?

दूसरा मैं आपसे यह कहना चाहूँगा कि उस आर्डर में उन्होंने कहा है कि उनके वकील, जो उत्तर प्रदेश सरकार के हैं, उन्होंने कहा है कि :

'Venugopal expressed that he was not in a position to say more than that given a week's time, the State would negotiate with the religious groups and persuade them not to follow a collision course, and persuade them to take a rational and sensible view of the situation.'

I want to know whether the BJP Members are also taking a rational and sensible view of the situation or not. That is why I have raised this question. It is a threat to our Constitution and, therefore, this House must beware, and I specifically request the Leader of the Opposition in this regard to react.

**SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY :** Madam, I gave my name to the Chairman. I want to speak on the same subject.

**SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN :** Madam, can a matter lying before the court, be brought under discussion in this House? I want to know under which rule we can discuss something which is going on in a court. There are arguments from both sides; there are observations from the judges, and the case is pending.

**SHRI CHATURANAN MISHRA :** I have not referred to the case... (*Interruptions*).

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :** In his own wisdom, the Chairman has only allowed whatever has appeared in the newspapers to be raised. Nothing is being referred to by him.

**SHRI SURESH KALMADI :** This is what the judge has said... (*Interruptions*)

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :** If it can appear in the newspapers, I think the House also can take note of it. Therefore, in his wisdom, the Chairman has permitted it.

**THE LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (SHRI SIKANDER BAKHT) :** He wants a reply from me. My reply is ... (*Interruptions*). If the court has addressed this question to somebody, they will reply to the court. There is no point in putting this question here. (*Interruptions*) You are asking me. I cannot reply here on the basis of what the court has told some party. They will take it up. (*Interruptions*) I am not bound to answer this question.

**SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY :** Madam, when the negotiations were going on, on the Ayodhya issue, between the All-India Babri Masjid Action Committee and the VHP leaders, the VHP unilaterally declared that they would be starting the *kar seva* on December 6. (*Interruptions*)

**THE MINISTER OF STATE OF THE MINISTRY OF SURFACE TRANSPORT (SHRI JAGDISH TYTLER) :** Why are you shouting? You are BJP people.

**SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY :** The VHP predominantly consists of BJP leaders and BJP MPs are in that committee. The Chief Minister of U.P. has said that he would protect the mosque. But in a different tone,...

**SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN :** He has said 'disputed structure'. Don't distort what the Chief Minister is saying. He never said that he would protect the mosque. There is no mosque to protect.

**SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY :** When your turn comes, you can raise your voice. Madam, in a different tone, ... (*Interruptions*) the Chief Minister has said that the policy of his party was to raise the *mandir* on the disputed site. We find that the State Government is speaking in different tones. The Chief Minister is showing double face. The State Government has told the court that they had been giving grave and anxious consideration to the situation arising from the call given for resumption of *kar seva* on the acquired land. The State Government has also said

that the duty of preventing the violation of its orders lies on it and is its responsibility.

In spite of all these things, in spite of what the State Government has said, in spite of this assurance, the VHP, the Bajrang Dal and the RSS are trying to send their volunteers, advancing the date of *kar seva*, anticipating that the Supreme Court would give an order against them. Apart from this, they also know that the Central Government would act immediately.

Therefore, I would like to know the stand of the BJP. Are they going to respect the court order, or, are they going to violate the court orders? ... (*Interruptions*) Kindly bear with me. This is a sensitive issue. The BJP is trying to politicise the religious sentiments of the people of this country. (*Interruptions*) I have a right to raise my voice here. I have a right to convey the feelings of the people of this country. (*Interruptions*)

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :** Mr. Narayanasamy, will you please be brief? I have got Special Mentions. I have to call other people. (*Interruptions*)

**SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN :** Madam, I would like to know what exactly is the nature of the permission given by the Chairman to Mr. Narayanasamy. Has the Chairman given permission to Mr. Narayanasamy to ask a few questions to the BJP leaders in the House, or, to raise some matter? What is it?

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त : अगर यह डिस्कशन है तो मोस्ट वेलकम । लेकिन यह कमाल की बात है (ध्वनान)

شری سکندر بخت : اگر یہ ڈسکشن ہے تو موست ویکم ۔ لیکن یہ کمال کی بات ہے ۔ ۔ "مداخلت" ۔

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :** Mr. Sikander Bakht, a question has been asked. I have to answer it. A question was raised by the hon. Member as to what kind of



permission the Chairman gave. The Chairman did not have a text of what Mr. Narayanasamy was going to speak. He wanted to raise an issue from a newspaper report about the Ayodhya matter. Now in that respect the Chairman is not responsible nor am I. I do not know what he is going to speak, but if he is speaking anything which is unparliamentary, improper or derogatory to anybody, it will be my inherent duty to protect the right of the Member. So, Mr. Narayanasamy, while you are speaking, I would request you to keep restraint and not to say anything which is derogatory to any Member in this House.

**SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY :** I have not used even a single word which is unparliamentary or derogatory to any political party or to any political leader.

**AN HON. MEMBER :** VHP is not an unparliamentary word.

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :** Yes, Mr. Narayanasamy, I have already requested you to be brief.

**SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY :** The country has already seen how, when the Kar Seva was started and the V.P. Singh Government was there, in Gujarat, Maharashtra, Madhya Pradesh, Rajasthan, in all these places communal tension flared up and thousands of people were killed.

**SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN :** It is totally wrong.

**SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY :** It is the BJP which said that the U.P. Government was killing thousands of Kar Sevaks. It is your own version.

**SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN :** You are talking of Gujarat, Maharashtra, which were the Congress-ruled States. Can you give the number? It is easy to say thousand but difficult to give the number. It is easy to generalise.

**SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY :** On both sides people were killed, that is my version.

Therefore, I request the hon. Members, especially the BJP leaders, to inform the House whether they are going to respect the court order. They should inform the people of this country. This country is secular. The mosque is to be protected and Ram Mandir is also to be built without destroying the sentiments of the people of this country belonging to whichever community or religion.

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :** Now I will go to the special mentions.

**श्री सिकन्दर बख्त :** सदर साहिब, मैं वाली यह कहना चाहता हूँ कि यहां जो कुछ भी कहा जाए उसका कोई रेशनल होना चाहिए। गवर्नमेंट आफ इण्डिया कुछ कोशिश कर रही है, इस्लाम मिनिस्टर कोशिश कर रहे हैं। मामला कोर्ट में चल रहा है। कोर्ट ने कुछ उत्तर प्रदेश गवर्नमेंट को कहा है और यहां अगर कोई मेम्बर साहिबान यह समझते हैं कि ये बराहें रास्त हमसे यह सवाल करें कि जो सवाल कोर्ट ने किसी गवर्नमेंट से किया है, उसका जवाब यहां दें? बात क्या हो गयी यह?

I refuse to respond to the questions put to me.

मामला कुछ और आर्गनइजेशन्स के दरम्यान है। उनके दरम्यान रहना चाहिए। वे जवाब देंगे। जिस किसी को जो एक्शन लेना होगा, लेंगे। मगर यहां से सवाल? अखबार आज का पढ़ रहे हैं, जिक्र कर रहे हैं एक सदी पहले का? कोई एक टुक हॉट्टी चाहिए किसी बात में, और इस किस्म के मेन्सन्स की इजाजत देने के लिए मालूम करना चाहिए कि क्या कहा जाना है। निहायत बेतुकी बातें हैं, क्षमा चाहता हूँ मैं आपसे।

نیتا وودھی دل "شری سکندر بخت"  
صدر صاحبہ - میں خالی یہ کہنا چاہتا

ہوں کہ یہاں جو کچھ بھی کہا جائے اس کا کوئی ریشہ نہ ہو نا چاہیے۔ گورنمنٹ آف انڈیا کچھ کوشش کر رہی ہے۔ پرائم منسٹر کوشش کر رہے ہیں۔ معاملہ کورٹ میں چل رہا ہے۔ کورٹ نے کچھ اترپردیش گورنمنٹ کو کہا ہے اور یہاں اکثر کوئی ممبر صاحبان یہ سمجھتے ہیں کہ یہ براہ راست ہم سے یہ سوال کریں کہ جو سوال کورٹ نے کسی گورنمنٹ سے کیا ہے اس کا جواب یہاں دیں۔ بات کیا ہو گئی یہ۔

I refuse to respond to the questions put to me.

معاملہ کچھ اور آرگنائزیشن کے درمیان ہے۔ اُن کے درمیان رہنا چاہیے۔ وہ جواب دیں گے۔ جس کسی کو جو ایکشن لینا ہو گا لیں گے۔ مگر یہاں سے سوال اخبار آج کا پڑھ رہے ہیں۔ ذکر کر رہے ہیں ایک صدی پہلے کا کوئی ایک تک ہوئی چاہیے۔ کسی بات میں۔ اور اس قسم کے میسٹن کی اجازت دینے کے لئے معلوم کرنا چاہیے کہ کیا کہا جاتا ہے۔ نہایت بے تکی باتیں ہیں چھما چاہتا ہوں آپ سے۔

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now that matter is over. Shri Bhandare.

श्री राम नरेश यादव (उत्तर प्रदेश) : ... (व्यवधान) ... खिलाफ आचरण करने का अधिकार है। मूल्य का प्रश्न यह है।

इस संविधान का ये उल्लंघन करने जा रहे हैं ... (व्यवधान)

श्री मोहम्मद अफजल उर्फ मौलाना अफजल : मेरा पाइन्ट आफ आर्डर है ... (व्यवधान)

شری محمد افضل عرف م افضل : میرا پوائنٹ آف آرڈر ہے .... "مداخلت"

उपसभापति : कोई डिस्टर्बेंस हाउस में नहीं है जिस पर पाइन्ट आफ आर्डर हो ... (व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am not allowing. That matter is over. (Interruptions). That matter is over.

श्री मोहम्मद अफजल उर्फ मौलाना अफजल : यह बात बड़ी हद तक सही है ... (व्यवधान)

شری محمد افضل عرف م افضل : دور درشن کو انھوں نے اپنی باندی بنا رکھا ہوا ہے۔ ... مداخلت ...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That matter is over. I am not permitting. There is no discussion. (Interruptions). Mr. Afzal, you cannot have a point of order on a discussion like this. He wanted to refer to a kind of mention which was not even allowed as a special mention, but allowed to be raised in the so-called Zero Hour and I am not going to permit anything. (Interruptions). Nothing is going on record. I am not starting any new conventions in the House, please.

\* श्री मोहम्मद अफजल उर्फ मौलाना अफजल :

उपसभापति : भंडारे जी, आप बोलिए स्पेशल मॉशन पर !

Mr. Afzal, no cross talk. Yes, Mr. Bhandare.

\*Not recorded.

Afzal Saheb, no cross-talk, please. Mr. Bhandare is raising something very serious, I hope.

श्री मोहम्मद अफजल उर्फ मीम अफजल : \*

श्री विष्णु कान्त शास्त्री (उत्तर प्रदेश) :  
महोदया, ... (व्यवधान)

उपसभापति : आपने स्पेशल मेशन नहीं दिया, आपने कुछ रिटन में नहीं दिया। मुझे क्या सालूम आप क्या बोलने वाले हैं। उन्होंने लिख कर दिया, तो उस पर इतना हंगामा हुआ। आप बिना लिखे कुछ बोलेंगे तो ... (व्यवधान)

You write it down and send it to me. I will look into it. Let's go in an organized way... (Interruptions)

श्री प्रमोद महाजन : इनका बचा हुआ स्पेशल मेशन है।

उपसभापति : नहीं, आज का उनका नया है।

SHRI JOHN F. FERNANDES (Goa) :  
Special Mentions... (Interruptions) ..

SHRI VIREN J. SHAH (Maharashtra) :  
Are there two Special Mentions of Mr. Bhandare ?

SHRI MURLIDHAR CHANDRAKANT BHANDARE : No... (Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Now, don't go into arguments.

SHRI MURLIDHAR CHANDRAKANT BHANDARE : My Special Mention cannot be made on any other day—and you will realize it.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : It is about the Constitution Day. He wants to mention about it. Any objection ?

SOME HON. MEMBERS : No.

### Special Mentions

Need to work for the spirit and ideals of the Constitution and rededicate thereto on the occasion of the Constitution day.

SHRI MURLIDHAR CHANDRAKANT BHANDARE (Maharashtra) : Madam, 26th November is a day for all of us to remember because it was on this day in the year 1949 that we, the people of India, adopted, enacted and gave unto ourselves the Constitution which is universally acclaimed as probably the best and the finest in the world. We celebrate the Independence Day, we celebrate the Republic Day. Let us also celebrate this day as the Constitution Day.

The vision of the Founding Fathers of our Constitution was very large. They conceived the Constitution and, as has been placed on record by Dr. Rajendra Prasad—I quote :

"The Assembly's aim was to end poverty and squalor, to abolish distinction and exploitation, and to ensure decent conditions of living."

It is no use my repeating that. With over 300 million people living under the poverty line, we are well below and we are very far distant from the goals and the vision which are set by the Constitution.

But the Constitution has given us something equally fundamental. It has given us a democratic society, it has given us an open and free society deeply rooted in the rule of law.

The rule of law is ensured by our adherence to the Constitution. All rights—civil, political, religious, economic, social and cultural—are guaranteed and protected under the Constitution. The Constitution also prescribes the limits of their enjoyment and, therefore, it is with a hope that not only we achieve the goals of our Constitution but also we have to rededicate ourselves because every one of us, before assuming our seats in this House, has taken an oath of allegiance to the Constitution. So we should rededicate ourselves to the very basic thing of the Constitution, that is, the rule of law.

No society can survive without the rule of law. Therefore, those who are thinking

\*Not recorded