

[श्री राधाकृष्णन भातवीय]

(2) अनुसूचित जातियों और अनुसूचित जनजातियों के कल्याण संबंधी समिति के अध्ययन दल-2 द्वारा जून-जुलाई 1992, के दौरान किए गए गम्बई, कोचीन, कोट्टयम, कोयम्बटूर, उडुपी, मैसूर और बंगलूर के अध्ययन दल पर प्रतिवेदन ।

ANNOUNCEMENT RE-GOVERNMENT BUSINESS FOR THE WEEK COMMENCING 30TH NOVEMBER, 1992

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS AND MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI M. M. JACOB) : Madam, I beg to announce that the Government business in this House for the week commencing 30th November, 1992, will consist of :

1. Discussion on the Resolutions seeking disapproval of the following Ordinances and consideration and passing of the Bills replacing these Ordinances :—
 - (a) The Indian Medical Council (Amendment) Ordinance, 1992.
 - (b) The Dentists (Amendment) Ordinance, 1992.
 - (c) The Multimodal Transportation of Goods Ordinance, 1992.
2. Consideration and passing of the following Bills as passed by the Lok Sabha :—
 - (a) The Constitution (Seventy-second Amendment) Bill, 1991.
 - (b) The Constitution (Seventy-third Amendment) Bill, 1991.
 - (c) The Constitution (Seventy-fifth Amendment) Bill, 1991.
 - (d) The Citizenship (Amendment) Bill, 1992.
 - (e) The Central Agricultural University Bill, 1992.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Special mentions... (Interruptions) I will permit you... (Interruptions) How can all of you speak at the same time ? (Interruptions) Jayanthiji, I will permit you... (Interruptions)

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH (West Bengal) : Here is Mr. Gopalsamy.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I know everybody's name by now.

Re-Question of privilege

SHRI SOMAPPA R. BOMMAI (Orissa) : Madam, the country was shocked when the scam was known to the public. And the JPC was appointed to go into the matter, enquire into it and report. But he find that the Government is not supplying documents... (Interruptions)

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN (Tamil Nadu) : Madam, I have a point of order... (Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Just a minute, please. I think if a point of order is raised, it is not directed towards the Members but it is directed towards the Chair. Now since I am in the Chair, let me deal with it and then I will permit you. Let me find out. She is holding the Rule book. Let me find out.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY (Pondicherry) : Madam, I am on a point of order.

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM (Andhra Pradesh) : Without hearing him, how can you raise a point of order ?

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY : I can raise a point of order without hearing him... (Interruptions)

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN : Madam, the hon. Member has just started referring to matters which are under the consideration of the J.P.C. Under rule 47(x), it is stated that no Member shall ask about proceedings in a Parliamentary Committee which have not been placed before the Council by a report from the Committee. The J.P.C. has not placed its report before the House. There is no confusion on this issue... (Interruptions)...

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY (Tamil Nadu) : It has come in the newspapers... (Interruptions)... It has come in the newspapers... (Interruptions)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Please. In the beginning I said that she is on a point of order. She wants to have my reaction. Let me find out what you are referring to—to the working of the Committee or to what appeared in the newspapers... (Interruptions)...

SHRI SOMAPPA R. BOMMAI : I am referring to a very important matter i.e. the act of the Government in censoring the documents and in not supplying.... (Interruptions).... It is not about the Committee's functioning. I am not at all referring to the functioning of the Committee. It is not that. It is about the act of the Government in not supplying the documents. ... (Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : May I say.... (Interruptions).... Please....

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY : Let him say very clearly.... (Interruptions).

SHRI SOMAPPA R. BOMMAI : The act of the Government is a breach of privilege of the Committee as well as this House. On such an important issue, the act of the Government is a privilege matter against the Government. It is a breach of privilege by the Government, particularly the Finance Ministry.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : There are two issues. One is about what appeared in the newspapers and to which you are referring.

The Members of the JPC are competent enough. They belong to this House and to the other House.... (Interruptions).... Just a minute.... (Interruptions).... Please, just a minute.

Let me finish. Please let me finish.... (Interruptions).... आप किस विषय पर बोल रहे हैं ? ...

(व्यवधान) There are two issues involved in it. One is that the Members are competent enough to take it up. If you are talking about a privilege, that I will permit you to speak.

SHRI SOMAPPA R. BOMMAI : It is the act of the Government.... (Interruptions).... The question of giving a privilege motion is there. But I would say that the act of the Government in censoring the documents to a parliamentary committee, which is a mini Parliament amounts to breach of privilege and misconduct, particularly, when the country is awaiting the outcome of the J.P.C. There are a number of instances. A Finance Minister

circulating documents to select Members unofficially, that matter is pending before the Chairman.

श्री प्रमोद महाजन (महाराष्ट्र) : जयन्ती जी आप किसको बचाना चाहती हैं । ... (व्यवधान)

श्रीमती जयन्ती मढराजन : राज्य सभा को ... (व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Now the matter is pending before the Committee.

आप पहले मेरी बात तो सुनिए.... (व्यवधान)

SHRI SOMAPPA R. BOMMAI : No, I will not go into that.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : That matter is before the Committee.

Mr. Chairman has already referred it to the Committee.

SHRI SOMAPPA R. BOMMAI : No. It is before the Chairman.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : No. That privilege was already sent to the Committee. Mr. Chairman is taking note of it.

SHRI JAGESH DESAI (Maharashtra) : It has come in the newspapers.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Yes, it has come in the newspapers.

SHRI SOMAPPA R. BOMMAI : Thousands of crores had been practically siphoned off out of the banks, siphoned off out of the Government and most of the officers are involved, including the Governor of the Reserve Bank and other officials. I am told that a number of politicians are also involved.

उपरभाषण : आप अपने प्रिविलेज की बात करिए । आपने प्रिविलेज नोटिस दिया है या नहीं दिया है, उसके विषय में पूछ लीजिए.... (व्यवधान)

SHRI SOMAPPA R. BOMMAI : The act of the Government in censoring the documents indicates that they want to suppress the matter. They want to protect certain individuals.... (Interruptions).... This is coming in the way of the functioning of the J.P.C.... (Interruptions)....

[Shri Somappa R. Bommai]

This is coming in the way of fair enquiry of the J.P.C....*(Interruptions)*....The J.P.C. will be irrelevant if this kind of things are not stopped.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY : He is raising an issue which is before the J.P.C.

SHRI SOMAPPA R. BOMMAI : It is a very important matter. Madam, I would like the Finance Minister to come and make a statement here and now...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SUKOMAL SEN (West Bengal) : Madam, I want to make a point...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY : Madam, the JPC is already there...*(Interruptions)*....

SHRI SOMAPPA R. BOMMAI : I would like this matter, the notice I have given, to be referred to the Privileges Committee. I have given a notice and let it be referred to the Privileges Committee...*(Interruptions)*...I will just read the notice :

"We wish to raise a question of privilege under rule 187. We reliably understand from the Press and from other sources that the Finance Minister which was to submit certain documents to the JPC which is inquiring into the Securities Scam, has resorted to heavy censoring. This is nothing but an attempt to withhold information deliberately from the JPC. This is a clear case of breach of privilege of the JPC and this House. We wish to raise a question of privilege...*(Interruptions)*..."

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY : Madam, on a point of order. The honourable Member has raised an issue...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY : Madam...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY : Madam, I am on my point of order...*(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : If everybody speaks like this, I do not think we can run this House...*(Interruptions)*.... Order, please ...*(Interruptions)*... Just a

minute, please...*(Interruptions)*... This paper has been shown to me now by the Secretariat and this is a letter written by a number of people to the Chairman regarding the breach of privilege. The matter is before the Chairman...*(Interruptions)*.... There are signatures, but I cannot read all the signatures. One is of Mohd. Afzal...*(Interruptions)*...I cannot read the others...*(Interruptions)*... There are Division Numbers given. Division No. 203, Division No. 194, are there. I cannot read them because they have not written their names...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SOMAPPA R. BOMMAI : The names are : Bommai, Gujral and Afzal...*(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Just a minute. It is very difficult to compete with five or six voices when my throat is so bad...*(Interruptions)*... I would request Mr. Bommai to read out the names as he has given in the privilege notice. The matter is before the Chairman and the Chairman will, as and when he takes a decision on it, inform the House or when he informs me, I will come before the House and inform what the decision is ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY : Madam, I am on a different point ...*(Interruptions)*... I am on a different point altogether ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA (Rajasthan) : Madam, on a point of order...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY : Madam, you promised to call me...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA : Madam, it is a well-settled convention that anything which is before a Parliamentary Committee we cannot discuss in the House. Mrs. Jayanthi Natarajan is correct to that extent and I do not want to go into all those matters which the JPC is seized of. Similarly, there is a breach of privilege motion which is pending with the Chairman. As per our rules and traditions, we are not supposed to discuss it till the Chairman decides on it. But I am on a fundamental question and that is this :

The Joint Parliamentary Committee was set up by a resolution passed by both Houses of Parliament. This House also

passed a resolution. We have nominated ten Members to that Committee. I am sure the Members on the other side will agree with me that this is not a partisan matter. We should all be unanimous in seeing that this Committee functions effectively and does its duties as per the terms of reference. I hope there is no dispute about it.

SHRI JAGESH DESAI : Absolutely not.

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA : Now, ever since this Committee was appointed, this is not the first instance. There was an instance—when Parliament was not in session—when some information was given selectively to some Members of the Committee, and I am glad to say that, cutting across party lines, a Member of this House had raised objections in the Committee and said : “We may belong to any party. But, in the Committee, we do not belong to any party. It is a Parliamentary Committee and all the Members should be treated equally.” That Member upheld the dignity of this House and the Parliamentary Committee... (*Interruptions*)...

Madam, my fundamental question to the Government is this : The Government must make up its mind now. It must decide whether it does not want to go any further in this or it sticks to its original pledge to see that the truth came out. In that case, it is not a matter whether some junior official did it or some senior official. In today's papers, a junior official is mentioned. This way let us not push the problem under the carpet. First you say that the scandal is done by some junior man in the bank. Now you want to say that the obstruction to the Committee's work is being done by some junior man. Madam, I want an assurance from the Leader of the House who is sitting here that whoever is guilty within the Government will be immediately dealt with. Immediately means today because the Committee is meeting every day, and the information is going to the Committee every day. Otherwise, if it goes into the heads of the officials that they can take the Parliament for a ride, it will make a mockery of the Parliamentary process. I am not concerned with who is guilty in that scam. I am not concerned with what the JPI will find. But I am definitely concerned

about the sanctity of the Parliamentary process. Either let us have a JPC and give it all the powers, all the powers of the people—the Parliament represents the people—or if you cannot give it, let us not have a JPC. But the Government cannot first agree to a JPC and then thwart the very functioning of the JPC by methods which are not only crude but will make a total mockery of the parliamentary process. I want an assurance from the Leader of the House that action will be taken against whosoever is guilty, whether he is a Secretary to the Government of India or a Minister. That is all I want to say. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I thought... (*Interruptions*). Just a minute, please... (*Interruptions*)... Just a minute. Please sit down. Once I allowed a Member to make his point very clearly and in elaboration, I thought that this is the voice of the Opposition or the House. Now let the Leader of the House speak.

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY : Kindly permit me, Madam.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : What are you going to say ? Are you going to say something different ? Are you going to say something which is contrary to what Mr. Morarka has said ? (*Interruptions*).

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY : On behalf of my Party...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : The Leader of the House is reacting. He wants to react now.

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY : He can react after all the Members speak.

SHRI SUKOMAL SEN : Just a minute, Madam.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Please take your seat. What I want to say is that there is no discussion before the House... (*Interruptions*) Just a minute. We have no formal discussion before the House. It is only because you have given a notice of breach of privilege to the Chairman—it is under his consideration—and the Members are agitated on an issue. Now, if it is not a matter before the House in a for-

[The Deputy Chairman]

mal motion or a discussion—as Mr. Morarka has said, we should run under certain rules and regulations—however important the issue is, it is not proper on my part to allow a party-line discussion on it. Let the Leader of the House react. (Interruptions)

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY : You promised me, Madam.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I promised you... (Interruptions)... I do not take that you are going to speak on the same subject which I allowed one Member to speak on. There should be one voice of the Opposition or different voices?

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY : Only two minutes, Madam. (Interruptions).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : We are not having a debate, we are not having a discussion. (Interruptions) भंडारी जी कुछ बोलना चाहते हैं।

I do not know what he is saying. Let me find out. He has been standing for quite some time.

श्री सुन्दर सिंह भंडारी (राजस्थान) : मैडम, जो विषय आपके सामने रखा गया है, जे. पी. सी. को एक काम सुपुर्दा किया गया है। हम सब चाहते हैं कि जे. पी. सी. अपने काम पर चिंता करे और ठीक प्रकार से जांच करके सदन को अपने निर्णयों से सूचित करे। सवाल तब खड़ा होता है जब जे. पी. सी. के पास भी ऐसे डॉक्यूमेंट्स दिए जाते हैं जिनमें कुछ बातों का ब्लैक आउट कर दिया गया है, नाम काट दिए हैं, तो फिर यह सरकार की जिम्मेदारी हो जाती है कि यह किसने किया? सरकारी डॉक्यूमेंट्स या रिजर्व बैंक की रिपोर्टें जो भी जे. पी. सी. के सामने गईं उस रिपोर्ट को ब्लैक आउट किसने किया, क्यों किया और किस मोटिव से किया? यह जानकारी देना सरकार की जिम्मेदारी है और इसलिए मैं आपके माध्यम से यह निवेदन करना चाहता हूँ कि आज जो चीजें छपी हैं और जिसकी फोटोस्टेट कभी वृत्तचारा में निकली हैं,

इससे किया गया है कुछ अंशों को। मैं चाहता हूँ कि लीडर आफ दि हाउस इस मामले को गंभीरता के साथ लें और इस बात का पता लगाएं कि यह किसने किया है। यह फाइनेंस मिनिस्ट्री से हुआ है तो किस अधिकारी ने किया है या सरकार के आदेश से यह हुआ है? इस बात की जानकारी हमको मिलनी चाहिए ताकि जे. पी. सी. अपनी जिम्मेदारी को निभाने में किसी प्रकार की रुकावट अनुभव न करे। धन्यवाद।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Now I have permitted enough number of Members.

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY : You kindly permit me.... (Interruptions).

SHRI DINESHBHAI TRIVEDI (Gujarat) : We are thankful to the media for giving out this information. JPC Members cannot speak on the subject, and we are not getting any information from the Government... (Interruptions)

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY : Kindly permit me.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY : Madam, the JPC.... (Interruptions).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Mr. Narayanasamy, we are not discussing the proceedings of the JPC. We are not discussing anything about it. I have only permitted a few Members because there is a notice of breach of privilege submitted to the Chairman. I am only allowing them to raise it. No other discussion.

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY : Kindly permit me. Madam Deputy Chairman, through you I draw the attention of the Government.... Only two minutes, Madam.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I thought that Mr. Kamal Morarka was speaking not only on behalf of the Opposition but the entire House. Now, what do you mean? If every Member of every party wants to speak, then we would not have any other business and we will only be discussing this thing. We cannot do that. There are special mentions before us. No, we have already spent quite a lot of time.

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY : Madam, through you,.... (*Interruptions*).

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE (Maharashtra) : Madam, before the leader of the House, reacts, my party's views may kindly be heard.

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY : What is wrong? Only two minutes, Madam you permit me.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Absolutely wrong, because there is no provision in the rules to allow you to speak on a subject which is not under discussion. Then, you have not given notice of privilege. If it had been given by you, I would have permitted you.

SHRI SUKOMAL SEN : It is a privilege of the House.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Yes, it is the privilege of the House to run according to the rules. We have to run according to the rules. You want the JPC to run according to the rules. Similarly, it applies to us also. I permitted two or three Members to make their submission before the House and to the Government. On the request of Mr. Morarka, the Leader of the House wanted to react. Don't you want him to react? Everybody wants to say the same thing. No, I cannot allow. There are certain rules. We cannot go beyond it.

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY : You promised me first.

SHRI DINESHBHAI TRIVEDI : The Finance Minister must come to the House and tell us.... (*Interruptions*).

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY : You were kind enough to promise me. What happened to that kindness?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : There is no question of my being kind or unkind. My hands are tied as the hands of everyone else are tied. We have to go according to certain rules and regulations. Everyone of you knows about it. It makes me sad to remind you that there are certain rules of procedure....

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY : It is outrageous....

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Is it going to add anything to it. Let us run this House.

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY : It is gross disrespect to Parliament. After all, JPC is a Committee of Parliament; it is a limb of Parliament. It is a gross disrespect to Parliament. It is a nefarious attempt to protect big shots like Ambani. Who is behind this? What is the intention? (*Interruptions*).

श्री प्रमोद महाजन : प्रिविलेज कमेटी जो बैठेगी, उसका निर्णय जो बहलाऊ उससे बहुत बेर है (व्यवधान) जे. पी. सी. की बैठक रोज हो रही है। मेरी जानकारी की अनुसार आज भी जे. पी. सी. के पास जो कागज गए हैं वह सेंसर्ड कागज गए हैं (व्यवधान) आज भी जे. पी. सी. के पास सेंसर्ड कागज नहीं पहुंचे हैं (व्यवधान) आज भी जे. पी. सी. के पास सेंसर्ड कागज गए हैं (व्यवधान) रोज जे. पी. सी. बैठ रही है। प्रिविलेज कमेटी का डिजिटल होगा (व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : There is no party line in this. There is no discussion. We have no motion. (*Interruptions*). They are speaking. I cannot help it. I do not have any motion to shut the mouth of the people. The only thing I can do is to ask them not to record it, which I don't want to use. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN : He should reply. (*Interruptions*). We should know what exactly had happened in the JPC. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY : Madam, we want the Finance Minister to come to Parliament. He owes an explanation to Parliament. The JPC is a limb of Parliament. It is a gross disrespect to Parliament. It is a nefarious attempt to protect big shots like Ambani. It is an attempt to sabotage the JPC. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Order, please. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY : The whole country is shocked. After all, the JPC is a limb of Parliament. From Kashmir

[SHRI V. GOPALSAMY]

to Kanyakumari, the whole country is shocked. The Finance Minister owes an explanation to the House. The people concerned should be taken to task. There should be an enquiry. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE : Madam, the JPC is a mini Parliament. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI MOHAMMED AFZAL *alias* MEEM AFZAL (Uttar Pradesh) : Madam, I am on a point of order. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Mr. Afzal, there is no discussion before the House. I may remind you again that under the rules, until and unless there is a discussion before the House, you cannot raise a point of order. There is already point of disorder.

SHRI MOHAMMED AFZAL *alias* MEEM AFZAL : I am raising a point of order on my privilege matter. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY : The Finance Minister should come before the House and explain. The JPC is, after all, a limb of Parliament. In fact, it is a gross disrespect to Parliament, not to the JPC.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : It is also a disrespect that you do not sit down when I say 'Please sit down'.

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY : I have respected you, Madam. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE : Madam, we also concede. My party's viewpoint is this. Let us not make this issue a partisan or a party issue. It is a very important question. As I said, the JPC is a mini Parliament. Its dignity and authority is the dignity and authority of Parliament. We will religiously protect the same. Therefore, if any thing is being done by any Minister or any official of the Government, which amounts to impeding the functioning and working of the JPC, we are all concerned about it. The only question is, Madam, (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Don't interrupt him, Mr. Gopalsamy.

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE : I would not like to sit in judgement over and above the JPC. All that I want to submit is, if ever the JPC feels concerned and thinks that the Government is not co-operating and is out to scuttle the authority and working of the JPC, all of us would be behind the JPC. But Madam, the only crucial question is, are we entitled to think that the JPC is not capable of tackling the issue which Mr. Morarka has raised. (*Interruptions*) If the JPC is capable of tackling this issue, are we trying to create a parallel power?

SHRI INDER KUMAR GUJRAL : No. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE : Please bear with me. Mr. Gujral, please listen to me. I would like to submit, respectfully, to all those who want to stand by parliamentary procedure. This is a matter relating entirely to the authority and working of the JPC.

SHRI SUKOMAL SEN : The entire Parliament.

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE : Entire Parliament via the JPC. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Now do not supplement. (*Interruptions*). Mr. Gopalsamy, please.

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY : It is his duty to come and....

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Please do not interrupt.

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE : it is the authority of the Parliament. Therefore, in a sense it is a question of Parliament, but it has to be appreciated that the person or the authority aggrieved directly is the JPC. If I go one step further, if JPC were to feel that the Government was deliberately going in a matter as to scuttle or impede its functioning, all of us will ensure and secure that the Government affords cooperation. Therefore, please, do not put the whole matter in a manner where we are forced to take a party line.

I agree with what Mr. Morarka has said except one aspect of the matter which I want someone to reply very objectively. If JPC itself feels that it is capable of

taking care of this issue, is it fair on our part to sit in judgement or to give to ourselves the authority to protect JPC? That is the crucial question.

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA : I totally agree with Mr. Salve that JPC itself is quite capable of looking after its own authority and dignity. JPC could have tackled this particular issue, but it is so blatant and crude that the Government should have come out with a statement this morning *suo motu*, that what has happened is a shame on the parliamentary process. And now Mr. Salve says that we should not have even raised it. It is so blatant and so crude that the Finance Minister himself should have come.

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY : It has come in the newspapers.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Mr. Morarka, please take your seat. Enough discussion has taken place on this. I cannot permit any more on this. (*Interruptions*). No, no, I cannot permit anything more on this. I allowed enough Members belonging to various parties to speak on this. Now that matter is closed. (*Interruptions*). Gujral Sahib, your party people have spoken.

SHRI INDER KUMAR GUJRAL : I am a signatory to the Privilege Motion.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : You are a signatory but not all the Members who are signatories are going to speak. बोलिए, मैं मना नहीं कर रही हूँ आपको, मगर कुछ कायदे में होना चाहिए।

SHRI INDER KUMAR GUJRAL : You give me a minute. I have been trying to catch your eye for a long time. (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : You decide between yourselves, whether you are going to speak or Gujral Sahib is going to speak.

SHRI INDER KUMAR GUJRAL : Madam, Mr. Salve has raised a very pertinent issue. I have great regard for him. Mr. Salve is a very senior Member, but I hope he appreciates the fact that this

House which has been a party to the setting up of JPC has also at the same time a responsibility to see that the JPC is allowed to function in the spirit in which it was set up. What has happened today? Today some censorship has been imposed by the Government on JPC and its deliberations. Some documents which should have gone to it have been censored. This morning again a Member has said that more documents are being censored. There are two methods of dealing with it. One is, of course, to raise the issue of privilege which I have also signed. The second is, in the meantime we would like to get an assurance, not from the Leader of the House because he is not dealing with the subject, but from the Finance Minister who must come to the House and assure that he stands by the commitment made by the Prime Minister that JPC will be discharging its responsibilities.... (*Interruptions*). Let me finish. I have heard you.

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE : Could you please yield?

SHRI INDER KUMAR GUJRAL : No, no, let me finish. I must have my say first. Mr. Salve is a clever lawyer.

AN HON. MEMBER : Lawyer or 'liar'?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Lawyer, advocate.

SHRI INDER KUMAR GUJRAL : Mr. Salve is a clever lawyer. He is swimming with both. He wants JPC and also to protect the Government which I think is highly unfair on his part. He is a senior Member of this House, I am also a senior Member. We also have senior responsibilities and I think one responsibility is that this House and through this House the entire country must be assured that the Government means what the Prime Minister assured and also the Government is not going to sabotage the functioning of JPC. The House must have the responsibility for that and for him to say that JPC can protect itself is one part. If somebody comes to the stage that the JPC was allowed to function, then....

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE : Just one moment.

SHRI INDER KUMAR GUJRAL : Let me finish, please. I heard you, I heard you. Did I not hear you?.... (*Interruptions*).... Why are you so anxious? Can't you wait for a minute? ..(*Interruptions*).... You have to ask her, not me. I am not surrendering.

The main point, therefore, is that the House must get a categorical assurance on two points—(1) that the censorship will stop; (2) that all those who are responsible, howsoever high and mighty they may be, will not only be punished but the action taken against them will be brought before this House even before the next meeting of the JPC is held. Thank you.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Now that matter is closed. If you want the Leader of the House to react, I would allow him. ... (*Interruptions*)... The Leader of the House is reacting. Let us keep the seriousness of the subject.

THE LEADER OF THE HOUSE (SHRI S. B. CHAVAN) : Madam, this is a very extraordinary procedure that when the matter is pending with the Chairman for taking a decision on the matter, the entire thing is being discussed on the floor of the House. Honourable Members, whether they are senior or junior it doesn't make a difference, because you read only one portion of the news item which has come in today's papers. The other portion clearly states that the Banking Secretary appeared before the JPC and it was on Friday that his explanation has been called for as to what he has got to say. We are not prepared to listen to what the JPC has to say in the matter and we ourselves are coming to the conclusion that they have already taken a decision and the Government is trying to scuttle the whole thing. May I say with all the emphasis at my command, without fear of contradiction, that the Government is totally committed to bringing out what the facts are? We will never give any protection to anyone who has committed any kind of a wrong. But to come to a conclusion on a privilege motion like this unilaterally *vis-a-vis* a matter... ..(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY : Mr. Rameshwar Thakur....

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I won't permit any Member while the Leader of the House is on his feet. It is at your request that he is reacting. Please have some courtesy.

SHRI S. B. CHAVAN : I fully agree with my hon. friend, Shri Salve, that so long as the JPC is competent enough to take the decision itself, it is okay, but once the House wants to come to this conclusion that the JPC is not competent and it is not in a position to take the decisions which, in fact, it is required to take, I can understand the other consequences. But so long as both the Houses have full confidence in the JPC, there is no reason why unnecessarily every one of us should try to say that we are trying to protect the JPC. In fact, Government will be supplying all the information, and I will find out from the Finance Minister and ask to come to the House if there is anything required. But I don't think he will come and state anything before us before the JPC pronounce its judgment. Whatever the Finance Ministry has to say, it will say before the JPC, but ultimately we will go by whatever decision the Chairman takes. This I want to make clear.

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY : I want to know whether Mr. Rameshwar Thakur is part of the Government or not, whether he has left the Government.(*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Mr. Gopalsamy, I might remind you that Mr. Rameshwar Thakur's matter, which was referred to the Chairman for the privilege, is already being sent to the Privileges Committee, and I don't think it is proper and appropriate to raise it again and again in this House. Okay? Thank you.

SHRI DINESHBHAI TRIVEDI : Madam, what about my privilege motion?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Your privilege motion is also for consideration before the Chairman. Whatever decision he gives, I will tell you... ..(*Interruptions*)...

श्री विप्लवजय सिंह (बिहार) : मंडम,
... (व्यवधान)

उपसभापति : हाँ, दूसरे सवाल पर
बोलें ... (व्यवधान)

श्री पी. शिव शंकर (गुजरात) : मँ,
... (व्यवधान)

SHRI JAGESH DESAI : It is over now.
... (Interruptions) ... It is closed now.

उपसभापति : शिव शंकर जी, आप काह
पर बोल रहे थे ।

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKAR : On the same issue. I am rather inspired to make my submissions on the basis of what has been observed by the hon. Home Minister, the Leader of the House. The Leader of the House is categorical that Government is committed to bringing in the true facts to the notice of the nation, the IPC and this House, and I must congratulate him on this statement. I would like to make my submission which has a slightly different shade from what the hon. Members were trying to put. I would not like to indulge in verbosity but would come directly to the question.

The main question that arises is that certain facts have now come to our notice based on what has been reported in the newspapers. The question is whether the hon. Members of the House are in a position, or they are not in a position, to know what exactly has happened. I am not going into the question of an assurance etc. that has been referred to. The assurance need not be to the House. But, then, we, as Members of the House, are a party to the constitution of the Joint Parliamentary Committee. Certain terms of reference have been given to the Joint Parliamentary Committee. Now certain facts have been reported in the newspapers. What exactly the position is, should we know or should we not know? Since the hon. Home Minister has categorically said that nothing would be hidden should it be hidden from us? We want to know what exactly the position is and what exactly the facts are. Therefore, we would request that the hon. Finance Minister should come here and ex-

plain to us what exactly has happened...
(Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Now that matter is closed.

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM : That is exactly what we demanded.
(Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Now for me that is closed.

SHRI MURASOLI MASAN (Tamilnadu) : Now the Leader of the House should react.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : No reaction. Enough. That matter is closed. (Interruptions)

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM : The Leader of the House should assure this House that he would talk to the Finance Minister. (Interruptions)

श्री मोहम्मद अफजल उर्फ सीम अफजल :
प्रिविलेज नोटिस पर मंरे भी दस्तखत है ।
... (व्यवधान) मंडम, प्रिविलेज नोटिस पर
मंरे दस्तखत है । ... (व्यवधान)

شہری محمد افضل عرف م۔ افضل :
پریویلیج نوٹس پر میرے بھی دستخط
ہیں ... "مداخلت" ... میڈم
پریویلیج نوٹس پر میرے دستخط ہیں
... "مداخلت" ...

उपसभापति : नहीं, अभी अफजल साहब
... (व्यवधान)

श्री मोहम्मद अफजल उर्फ सीम अफजल :
मैंने प्रिविलेज नोटिस पर दस्तखत किए हैं ।

شہری محمد افضل عرف م۔ افضل :
میں نے پریویلیج نوٹس پر دستخط
کئے ہیں -

उपसभापति : आपका नाम है ।

श्री मोहम्मद अफजल उर्फ सीम अफजल :
आपने एलाउ किया है ।

[†] Transliteration In Arabic Script.

شری محمد افضل عرف م۔ افضل :
آپ نے الاؤ کیا ہے۔

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I am not allowing.

श्री मोहम्मद अफजल उर्फ मौम अफजल :
जिन लोगों ने दस्तखत किए हैं उनको बोलने के लिए... (व्यवधान)

شری محمد افضل عرف م۔ افضل :
جن لوگوں نے دستخط کئے ہیں ان کو
بولنے کے لئے... "مداخلت"۔

उपसभापति : नो ।

श्री मोहम्मद अफजल उर्फ मौम अफजल :
मैडम, जिन लोगों ने प्रिविलेज नहीं दिया आपने उनको भी एलाउ किया है ।... (व्यवधान)

شری محمد افضل عرف م۔ افضل :
میدم جن لوگوں نے پریویلیج نہیں دیا
آپ نے ان کو بھی الاؤ کیا ہے ۔۔
"مداخلت"۔

उपसभापति : मि. अफजल । मि. अफजल प्लीज ।... (व्यवधान)

श्री मोहम्मद अफजल उर्फ मौम अफजल :
आप मुझे भी दो मिनट सुन लें ।

شری محمد افضل عرف م۔ افضل :
آپ مجھے بھی دو منٹ سن لیں۔

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : No, Mr. Afzal, please. Mr. Afzal, please. Mr. Afzal, please. There should be a limit to anything. Your leader spoke. Not one, but three persons spoke. I think, it is enough. Your name is on the privilege....

[] Transliteration in Arabic script.

SHRI MOHAMMED AFZAL alias MEEM AFZAL : Even if I have a different point, should I not speak ?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : No.

SHRI MOHAMMED AFZAL alias MEEM AFZAL : Even if I have a different point, should I not speak ?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : No. That matter is closed. Everybody has given his viewpoint. Now I will go ahead to another business. If ten people have ten different viewpoints, we cannot suspend the business of the House and start doing something else.

SHRI MOHAMMED AFZAL alias MEEM AFZAL : Madam, from the beginning I have been trying to make my point. You are not allowing me.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I am not permitting you. Please. I am requesting you.

RE FAMINE IN BIHAR

श्री दिग्विजय सिंह (बिहार) : उपसभापति महोदया, मैं आपके माध्यम से सरकार और इस सदन का ध्यान बिहार में अकाल के बारे में खींचना चाहता हूँ। पूरे बिहार में अकाल पड़ा हुआ है। बिहार सरकार की तरफ से बिहार को अकाल क्षेत्र घोषित कर दिया गया है। बिहार में राहत का कोई काम हो नहीं रहा है। केन्द्र सरकार की तीन टीमों बिहार गईं और आज तक यह तय नहीं कर पाई है कि बिहार को कितनी राहत देनी है। महोदया, सब से गंभीर समस्या आज बिहार के सामने यह खड़ी हो गई है कि लोग वहाँ से बिहार के घर-दरवाजे छोड़ कर देश के दूसरे हिस्सों में जा रहे हैं। जहाँ कजाक में निरीह बिहारियों को गोलीयों से मार दिया जा रहा है। सरकार इस बारे में गंभीर नहीं है। मैं आपके माध्यम से सरकार से आज जानना चाहूँगा कि बिहार को अकाल क्षेत्र घोषित किए एक महीना हो गया और आज भारत की सरकार इस काम के लिए कौन सा कदम उठा रही है और बिहार सरकार को क्या निर्देश दे रही है कि अकाल से नष्टों के