

[Shri M. M. Jacob] ears to have been made to set the bodies on fire, which however, did not succeed', perhaps on account of rain.

No group or person has yet claimed responsibility for the killings. It is suspected that two or three gangs who are said to be moving in the area may be responsible. Police and para-military forces have launched intensive operations for combing of the entire area which is densely forested and is about 8 km, from the main road.

The District Magistrate, SP, DIG, Divisional Commissioner and the Zonal IG of Police visited the site on 3rd August and nearby district have been alerted.

The Chief Minister has visited the area on 4-8-1992 along with two ministerial colleagues and the DGP. Rs. 20,000/- has been paid to each affected family as immediate *ex gratia* relief.

The Government of India have allotted sophisticated fire arms including AK-47 rifles, self-loading rifles, carbines, LMGs, pistols etc. to the UP Government. The supply may not have met the total requirements of the State Government. In view of overall constraint of availability of weapons at the national level.

As many as 44 companies of paramilitary forces have been deployed in U.P. We suggested to all the State Governments including U.P. to raise India Reserve Battalions and have offered that 50 per cent of the initial cost of raising will be fully met by the Government of India as a grant and the remaining 50 per cent expenditure will be provided as a long-term loan. We have yet to receive a proposal from the U.P. Government.

A meeting was held by me on 29-2-1992 with the Chief Ministers of the States and the Governors of Union Territories; which are affected by terrorist activities to chalk out a

strategy for combating terrorism. After a frank discussion in the meeting, certain decisions were taken. A cell has been created in the Home Ministry under a Special Secretary and the State Governments/UTs were also requested to have a cell in their jurisdiction. A meeting of the concerned Home Secretaries and Directors-General of Police of the States/UTs was held in the Home Ministry on 28th April, 1992. In this meeting the information and intelligence about terrorists, their activities then *modus operandi* etc. was up-to-date; and exchanged. The logistics and strategy to contain and combat terrorism was also planned. Thank you

HI. Announcement Re. Arrest and Release of a Member.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI HANUMANTHAPPA): Hon. Members, I have to inform the House that a wireless message has been just received from the SHO, Parliament Street, New Delhi that Shri Bhupinder Singh Mann, a Member of Rajya Sabha, has been detained at 13.1 hours and released at 15.15 hours to day on 5-8-92 at Police Station Parliament Street, New Delhi, under section 65 of the Delhi Police Act

SOME HON. MEMBERS: Why about clarifications?

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI HANUMANTHAPPA): It has already been decided to take up the clarifications tomorrow.

THE BHOPAL GAS LEAK DISASTER (PROCESSING OF CLAIM) AMENDMENT BILL, 1992—Contd.

SHRI N. GIRT PRASAD (Andhra Pradesh): Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir: eight years after this catastrophe took place in Bhopal, we are still discussing how to provide relief. That is the state of affairs as far as our administration and welfare are concerned.

sure are concerned. The present amendment Bill which has been brought; here may be a technical matter which the Government may need to speed up the procedure for the implementation of the Supreme Court decision. The Government may not take responsibility for the entire delay. Even after the Supreme Court gave its verdict, almost one year has passed. The Supreme Court also directed the Government to start the relief operation or to provide a permanent relief from February onwards but now we are discussing this Bill.

My main point is that the Government, in the meantime, has issued guidelines on the basis of which the relief will be distributed to the victims.

Now, there is a lot of heart-burning among most of the gas victims. The guidelines are arbitrary in nature. They do not take into consideration the actual state of affairs. As far as I understand, more than six lakh claimants were there for relief. The Madhya Pradesh Government has been distributing Rs. 200/- per month to almost five lakh people till now. Everybody understands that the actual victims may be around five to six lakhs. But according to the guidelines prepared by the Central Government, the main criteria they have set are they must be medically examined and they must be permanently injured or disabled. Of course, as far as deceased persons are concerned, there may not be a problem, but there are people who may not be permanently disabled or permanently injured or there are other people being temporarily injured and we don't know, such type victims, even according to the medical parlance even after some years of the injury — this reverse effect may suffer *rel ipso* and they may undergo serious difficulties; we can't say. Nobody can be sure. Moreover, these victims are supposed to be living in those 36 wards of

Bhopal city, but everybody says that this gas spread over a much larger area, even beyond these 36 municipal wards. According to these guidelines, perhaps, those living within these 36 municipal wards are eligible for this grant of relief. Because of these guidelines, many people are afraid that they won't get any relief. Even those people who are getting these Rs. 200/- per month will not be eligible also. I can't understand this medical categorisation which was done. Some people say, 'temporary injuries', 'permanent injuries', 'temporary disablement caused by temporary injury', 'temporary disablement caused by permanent injury', 'permanent partial disablement' or 'permanent total disablement'. Besides these deaths, these are the so many categories made. Whether they are temporarily disabled, temporarily affected or permanently affected, the quantum of assistance may vary; I have no objection. In the case of death, the quantum must be more; in the case of permanent injury, the quantum may be to a lesser extent and even for these temporary injuries some help must be given. The people who are temporarily injured must get some help. This categorisation, medical examination, could be done only with regard to 50 per cent of the cases; that is the information I am having. Even to determine these cases only 17 courts have been set up so far. Even after these four months or from February onwards 'all these things which should have taken place are moving very haltingly they are moving very slowly and most of the victims, lakhs of victims who have applied for relief are afraid that they won't get any relief. So my request is that the Government should change these guidelines. They must take into confidence the State Government, the local parties as well as the representatives of these victims. After consulting with all these sections. I think, the Government will be able to come to proper assess-

[Shri N. Giri Prasad] ments, proper conclusions. I want to know from the Minister whether he is preared to consult these sections and arrive at an understanding or he wants to leave the whole thing <n suspense and<sup>l</sup> implement these arbitrary guidelines and make the people permanently unhappy or he wants that the people who are temporarily injured or disabled may not get any relief. Lakhs of people are there I appeal to you tjo revise these guidelines in consultation with the concerned people and provide proper relief and to see that that relief should also be given at the earliest possible time so that this! suffering may not prolong further. PROF. SAURIN BHATTACHARYA: Mr. Vice-Chairman, as my friend, Mr. Giri Prasadi who spoke just before me, has pointed out, after eight years of the disaster we are still engaged in the technicalities of the matter. We have not been able to come to the brass tacks, so to say. because whatever amount has been disbursed so far has been don<sub>e</sub> -on an *ad hoc* basis in spite of the guidelines and in spite of the Act framed some seven years back. So far as the Bill is concerned, the Bill with which the Government has come out after seven years, let us hope out of experience that these amendments are necessary in order to exnedite th= work. If that is so, nobody will object. But even after seven years if the stress is only on the technical aspect of it, it will really be very regrettable. I recall when the Supreme Court, the Apex Court of the country, clinched the question of compensation with an amount of Rs. 480 crores—so far as I can re-megiber it is with the concurrence of the Union Carbide—there was a hue and cry, there was objection, there was a question of revision petition. But from the side of the Supreme Court there was the unusual step Of explaining its action which was not a judicial verdict but a compromise arrived at after hearing the Union Carbide. The question of revision petition came up

and ultimately—so far as I can re member—the revision petition was not mad'a. But everybody was flabber-gasted considering the magnitude of the disaster, the crime, which is on the head of the management oi the Union Carbide, that it should be settled at such a paltry sum. Bui that is why even with that amounl it has not been possible to decide how to settle the claims. Now, the Commissioner and his subordinate officers are proposed to be included in the category of authority so thai as a civil court they car decide the thing. Now as the Supreme Court decided this issue, the issue of overall compensa tion—there was a suggestion; I don'i exactly remember, perhaps, Mr Venkatraman made a suggestion tha it should be treated as a summary a sort of summary trial—no trial i; invoVed, but the claim have to be es. tablished. But the establishment o: the claims should<sup>l</sup> be done at a leve of summary trial, so to say, on th< bisis of the understanding of ths authority regarding the claim of ; particular person. Various problem: have cropped up the problems hav< been referred to by various speakers The claims, which type of injur: can receive what claim or what com pensation and all. these things an still pending. A large number o victims who have died have no prob lem. But those who are in the realm of living in this great country, the; are really suffering ?nd suffering ii a manner which beggers descriptor That is the position in regard t them. AH of us shed! enough tears If tears co^d do something by thi time all their sufferings should hav been washed away. It, is a matter c fact that sufferings stand where the were. So far as this Bill is concert ed, at least that is what seems to mi

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI I HANUMANTHAPPA): Please c'oi elude.

PROF. SAURIN BHATTACHAI YA; I am concluding. There

nothing exceptionable in it. But what is a bit fearsome is to tell that the cases would be decided by an authority who will be considered to constitute a Civil Court. Civil cases in our country drag on for a number of years. If that trend is emulated by these authorities also, God help the gas victims. I hope the Government and the Minister will take care of these aspects and would not only revise the guidelines for the victims but at the same time provide guidelines as to how these authorities should conduct themselves in settling the claims.

DR. NAUNIHAL SINGH (Uttar Pradesh): Mr. Vice-Chairman, surprisingly, every hon. Member has been treating the effect, not the cause. Today, I am revealing highly sensational facts about the Bhopal Gas Leak Disaster which are the facts investigated by myself.

In 1960s, India was promoting its 'Green Revolution' a plan to eliminate the chronic food shortages of its socialised system. India was to become self-sufficient in food by modernising its agricultural methods. So, when approached by the Union Carbide about building a pesticide plant, the Central Government was highly responsible.

Bhopal's central location in the nation offered transportation advantages, but some of the real incentives for site were provided by eager local officials. Government land on the outskirts of the city was leased to the factory at a yearly rent of only Rs. 480 per acre. Electricity and water were offered at nominal prices. Taxes were negligible. The company invested less than one million dollars in 1969 in what it hoped would become a booming business.

The Indian Government had its heavy hand on every aspect of the Bhopal Plant, from its design and construction to its eventual operation. Initially, the facility merely imported raw-pesticides, such as

Sevin and then diluted, packaged and shipped them. This was a relatively safe and simple operation. But in accordance with the Industrial Policy, the Union Carbide was under constant pressure from the Government to cut imports and reduce the loss of foreign exchange. To do this Carbide was required by its State-issued operating licence to transfer to Bhopal the capability to manufacture the basic pesticides and, subsequently, even their ingredients. Everything was to be Indianised. Even the chemical production processes used in Bhopal were developed by Indian researchers. So far removed was Carbide headquarters from *de facto* control of the operations at Bhopal that, according to Fortune magazine, it did not even have a copy of the India-designed blueprints for the facility. MIC was not required in Bhopal while the factory simply packaged Sevin, its final product. But the logic of industrial self-sufficiency and technology transfer required the manufacture of Sevin. So in 1971, the Union Carbide factory opened a small plant to manufacture alpha-naphthol, and began to import and store MIC—a chemical which never had to be in India in the first place, except to satisfy the Indian Government. In February 1980, an MIC production facility was opened. The parent Corporation sent guidelines for the design of the safety systems; but under Indian law, the details had to be determined by an autonomous Indian-staffed consulting firm. Step by step Union Carbide's control over the operations at Bhopal was disappearing. What had begun as a Carbide subsidiary for packaging pesticides was now a government-directed business, manufacturing and storing a deadly chemical in a technologically backward culture. Those were not business decisions. Those were political decisions. Until 1982, U.S. supervisory and training personnel were still at the plant. But under Indian law those Americans

[Dr. Naunihal Singh] were licensed for fixed periods and had to leave once their Indian replacements were trained. At this point Carbide visits to the site all but ended, and Headquarters relied mainly on reports issued from Bhopal. In June 1982, representatives from U.S. Headquarters did conduct one final safety inspection, based upon which they filed a critical report. But safety was now the responsibility of local management!. The parent company claims to have been assured by the Bhopal subsidiary that it had' taken all the action it considered necessary to respond effectively to the safety instructions. One last element of Government policy helped lay the groundwork for the pending disaster. The area around the plant had been deserted at the time Carbide moved in. But in 1975 the local government in a re-zoning scheme, encouraged thousands and thousands of people to settle near the plant by giving them construction loans and other inducements. In fact, Government first helped to make the plant unsafe, and then drew the people into the path of the coming gas cloud. Further, Mr. Vice-Chairman, for over a week, employees had been trying unsuccessfully to get MIC out of storage tank number 610 by pumping in nitrogen and forcing out liquid. But every time the workers tried, the nitrogen leaked<sup>5</sup> Out somewhere. The technical manual of the parent Union Carbide Corporation suggests that these 15,000 gallon tanks be kept no more than half full to prevent pressure from building up rapidly in an emergency. The Bhopal operating manual, somewhat less conservative, states, "Do not fill MIC storage tanks beyond 60 per cent level". But tank 610 held between 11,000 and 13,000 gallons of MIC that night.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA): Please conclude. If you have a written statement then you may send it to the Minister.

DR. NAUNIHAL SINGH: I will conclude. It meant that it was between 70 and 87 per cent full. The shift, supervisor was Gauri Shanker, a novice at MIC work who had been transferred from a Union Carbide battery plant only two months earlier. At 9.15 he summoned MIC operator Rahman Khan.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA): Please conclude.

DR. NAUNIHAL SINGH: Shakil Qureshi, the shift supervisor, noticed the same thing at 11.30 p.M and dismissed it. "Instruments often didn't work", he explained<sup>1</sup>. And, of course, the temperature alarms, which would have revealed the increased heat resulting from the pressure build up, had been turned off. At about the same time, the workers' eyes began to tear and they realised that MIC was leaking somewhere. At 11.45 p.m., one worker noticed a drip of liquid and spurts of gas fifty feet off the ground. He went to inform Qureshi. Qureshi's answer was that he would deal with it after the next tea break scheduled for 00.15 a.m. And so, as the gas continued to escape, the men discussed the leak in the control room, over tea. After tea, Suman Dey noticed that the temperature gauge for tank 610 had climbed off the top of the scale and that the pressure gauge was rising towards 40 p.s.i. at which point an emergency relief valve burst. He rushed to Qureshi's office to inform him, then went back onto a concrete slab over the partly-buried tanks. "There was a tremendous sound, a messy boiling sound, underneath the slab", he recalled. The slab began to shake, and Dey ran. There was a loud<sup>1</sup> noise behind him, and a giant crack appeared in the concrete. Then came a blast of intense heat. When he heard the loud hissing sound, he looked up and saw huge amounts of MIC gas billowing out of a pipe, 120 feet above the tank. Like an ominous white spectre, it began to drift away from the



[Shrimati Mira Das] take la ty more time to rehabilitate them a td I urge upon the Minister to look at the problem with a humanitaj tan outlook and in the most human way. Then Only, we can realise thf objective of this Bill and we can do something for the victims.

Thar.fe you, Sir.

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर (उत्तर प्रदेश) : एक मिनट मझे दीजिए । श्रीमन मैं अपना दल की नीति का स्पष्टीकरण कर दूँ । मेरे सहयोगी ने इतनी बात अवश्य कही और ठीक कही है कि यह जिम्मेदारी केंद्र सरकार की और उस समय की मध्य प्रदेश सरकार की है, लेकिन मैं यूनियन कारवाइड को पूरी तौर से जिम्मेदार मानता हूँ । उनकी जिम्मेदारी हमारे हजारों लोगों को और क्षति पहुंचाने की है । मैं इस बिल का समर्थन करता हूँ क्योंकि अधिकार दिया जाना चाहिए अमरीका यूनियन कारवाइड को उसी कीमत पर, जिस कीमत पर वह इन्सान की कीमत अमरीका में लगाते हैं, उसी कीमत पर हिन्दुस्तान के आदमी की कीमत देनी चाहिए थी । मैं भर्त्सना करता हूँ इस बात की कि सरकार ने अभी तक इस बात पर जोर नहीं दिया, कोई समझौता उस समय तक नहीं होना चाहिए था जब तक कि पूरी भरपाई वह न करते ।

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MISTRY OF CHEMICALS AND IERTXLIZERS (SHRI CHINTA MCHAN): Sir, I am grateful to the hoi\*. Members who have participated :on the debate—mainly Suresh Pachouriji, Hariprasadj, Girl PrasadliP'haitftachailyaji, Mira Dasji, Naunibal Singhji, Guptaji—and who have given very valuable suggestions. Everybody is concerned about the de'ay. Before coming to the House, I had gone through the records. This incident took place in Decemler 1984. After that, the Government giave immediate medical and financial relief. Thereafter there was a prolonged legal battle. In 1989, Vi e reached a settlement in the Suprette Court. After that, voluntary os ganizations had gone and filed a r^ fision petition in the Sup-

reme Court. Finally, the Supreme Court gave its guidelines and directives in the month of October 1991. In its judgment, the Supreme Court has said that the Government can give the guidelines and appoint Welfare Commissioners within four months. The Supreme Court gave the judgment in October 1991 and the Government, as per the directives Of the Supreme Court, has taken four months to appoint the Welfare Commissioner and in time the Welfare Commissioner also has started the adjudication process in Bhopal.

At least once in fifteen days, the Government is monitoring the progress of the adjudication. Immediately after his appointment, the Welfare Commissioner had! written to the High Court of Madhya Pradesh that some more magistrates should! be appointed for dealing with the compensation claims. He got 17 Deputy Commissioners and 5 Additional Commissioners appointed. He has persuaded the High Court to give more Judges to serve as Deputy Commissioners and Assistant Commissioners and this process is going i on on the one side.

With regard to the delay in compensation.—actually, I have gone through the case—a few days back the Finance Minister cleared the file and it has gone to the CAG. Before coming ts> the House, I got in touch with the CAG and he is going to clear the file today or tomorrow. Immediately after that, we will get in touch with the Registrar of the Supreme Court. The amount is at present lying with the Reserve Bank of India in the name of the Registrar of the Supreme Court and it is about Rs. 1,400 crores. Immediately thereafter, that is, in about a week or two, we will have this amount transferred from the Registrar to the Gas Victims' Relief Fund in Bhopal. Already three hundred cases have been examined and the amount of compensation will be paid

after the transfer of this amount, maybe in seven or ten days' time. I can assure the House very humbly that there will not be any further delay in giving the compensation to the poor victims.

With regard to the staff, the Courts have started functioning and they need staff also. There was some delay. The Department of Personnel has given some guidelines laying down that for appointment of people to certain posts of this type, this much of educational qualification is required or this much of experience should be there. But this is a very temporary job and people are not coming forward to join these Courts. So we have gone to the Department of Personnel and we have persuaded them and we have given blanket permission to the Commissioner to appoint a thousand people immediately in order to hasten the process.

Coming to the question of the building, the Government of Madhya Pradesh is very kind and is doing its best to give the building and everything is going on as per schedule.

With regard to categorisation, a number of categories have been mentioned. We are doing this categorisation as per the directives Of the Supremo Court. We are not going even one inch beyond that. We are strictly following the guidelines with regard to categorisation given by the Supreme Court.

Coming to the question of guidelines, Prasadji has said that these are arbitrary in nature. But I would like to submit humbly to him that these guidelines are only indicative in nature. When this Bill is passed, all powers will go to the Welfare Commissioner and the Welfare Commissioner is a sitting Judge of the High Court of Madhya Pradesh. He will have all judicial powers. He will have full powers. He can take any decision he thinks proper. And if anybody has got any problem, instead of giving Rs. 3 lakhs, he can

give Rs. 4 lakhs. Instead of giving Rs. 4 lakhs, if he feels that the victim needs some more compensation, he can give four and a half lakh rupees. It is not strictly stipulated within the parameters. It is his decision. He can take a decision depending on the nature of the case.

Coming to the claims, there are some claims left-over. That is what Mr. Suresh Pachouri was mentioning. And we have come to know that some more cases have to be finalised. And there is already the Claims Commissioner there. If anybody has got any problem, he can immediately go to the Claims Commissioner.

Once he finalised the case, they can go to the process of adjudication, and immediately compensation also will be given.

Coming to the medical examination, the Indian Council of Medical Research has done some studies on that. It is a very open document. And the State Government of Madhya Pradesh has also given their report. As per their guidelines, the Government is proceeding. Coming to the Hospital, the Supreme Court has given its decision saying that the UGC should give Rs. 50 crores. They are ready to give this amount. And the State Government has already given 30 acres of land. And I also discussed with the concerned people why there is delay in starting this hospital. The reason for the delay is very genuine also. Immediately after this, they have approached the Hospital Consultancy Corporation of India, which is one of the public sector Corporations attached to the Ministry of Health to start the project report. I even spoke to the Managing Director of that Hospital Consultancy Corporation yesterday. He said that he will take one month to prepare the project report. He is preparing that Rs. 50 crore project, that 500-bedded hospital project with all the architectural plans



[Shri Chinta Mohan]

and all that. Once it is ready, it will be submitted to the Welfare Commissioner and<sup>1</sup> the State Government. They can decide and they can start the hospital. There was a problem about the location of the hospital site. That we will discuss with the State Government and see what best we can do in this.

Finally, about the sewing machine centre, it was started long back and it was stopped. Shri Pachouri and some Members said that these sewing machine centres should<sup>1</sup> be started. Yesterday, the Law Minister from Madhya Pradesh has come. He is in charge Of the Bhopal gas victims, I discussed with him and he said that he will come out with a proposal very soon. Once we get a proposal, if it is very good to go on, the Government is ready to do that.

Coming to the criminal cases, Anderson is in the USA. We are trying to locate him through our diplomatic channels. The CBI is concentrating on this case. Once we locate this person, will not hesitate to arrest him. We are ready to do what the few of the land says.

SHRI VITHALBHAI M. PATEL (Gujarat): Law of the land of the USA or India?

SHRI CHINTA MOHAN: We are in India. And we have advertised this in the 'Washington Times' also. The Government is taking all efforts to see that this man is arrested<sup>1</sup>. And we are not going to spare anybody. We will take all possible efforts to see that these things should be closed as quickly as possible.

With these words, Sir, I request the House, through you, to pass this Bill.

SHRI N. GIRI PRASAD: Sir, I want to seek one small clarification.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA): I cannot open it, please.

PROF. SAURIN BHATTACHARYA: About the extradition of Anderson. ...

श्री कैलाश नारायण सारंग (मध्यप्रदेश):  
 उसको छोड़ा क्यों था? ... (व्यवधान) ...

SHRI N. GIRI PRASAD: I want to ask the Minister. ...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA): Please sit down. The House has permitted to pass this Bill. There is hardly any time.

SHRI N. GIRI PRASAD: Just one minute, please.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI H. ; HANUMANTHAPPA): Mr. Giri Prasad, please sit down. The purpose of taking the permission of the House will be defeated. !

SHRI N. GIRI PRASAD: I want to seek one information. If it is not possible, I will sit down.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA): The question is:

"That the Bill to amend the Bhopal Gas Leak Disaster (Processing of Claims) Act, 1985, as passed by the Lok Sabha, be taken into consideration." .

*The motion was adopted.*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA): We shall now take up clause-by-clause consideration of the Bill.

*Clause 2 was added to the Bill.*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA): There is one amendment for insertion of a new clause 2A by Shri Suresh Pachouri.

श्री सुरेश पचौरी : माननीय उपसभा-ध्यक्ष महोदय, केवल दो बातें कहकर अपनी बात समाप्त करूंगा। मुझे संतोष है कि माननीय मंत्री जी ने भोपाल गैस पीड़ितों के प्रति अपनी चिंता जाहिर की

है और उन्होंने आश्वासन दिया है कि भविष्य में गोध्र हो और ज्यादा राहत और पुनर्वास की व्यवस्था दिलाने के लिए क्या कदम उठाए जा सकते हैं। मैं माननीय मंत्री जी से आपके माध्यम से निवेदन करना चाहूंगा कि जैसे पीड़ितों को जो दो सौ रुपये प्रति माह इंडीरियम रिलीफ मिल रहा है वह मार्च, 93 में खत्म हो जाएगा। यदि यह कम्पन्शन का भुगतान नहीं किया तो उन लोगों को अपनी जिंदगी को खतरा-खतरा करने में बहुत दिक्कत होगी। क्या मंत्री जी इस बारे में विचार करेंगे कि यदि कम्पन्शन का भुगतान उन्हें जब तक नहीं हो पाये तो इंडीरियम रिलीफ जारी की जाए और साथ ही मंत्री जी ने जो खद हो फिगम रखी है कि जो टोटल अंमस फाइल किए गए हैं डायरेक्ट्रेट आफ क्लैम्स को वह छः लाख उन्नावन हजार सात सौ तिरानने हैं। उनमें जो मैडिकल एक्जामिनेशन हुआ है वह तीन लाख डनसठ हजार एक सौ छियासठ का है। यानी कीव 40 प्रतिशत लोगों का मैडिकल एक्जामिनेशन नहीं हुआ है। यदि मैडिकल एक्जामिनेशन वाली प्रथा को हमने रद्द नहीं किया तो कटेगरीजेशन जो इतनी ज्यादा की है, उसको हमने तीन कटेगरी में नहीं किया तो साथे से ज्यादा लोग ऐसे होंगे जिन्हें कम्पन्शन का भुगतान नहीं हुआ। तो इस माजूकता को ध्यान में रखते हुए मंत्री जी निश्चित रूप से विचार करेंगे, ऐसा मैं उनसे आश्वासन चाहता हूँ। यही मेरा उनसे अनुरोध है।

**श्री नारायण प्रसाद गुप्ता :** महोदय, एक बात का जवाब नहीं दिया गया और मैं मंत्री जी से एक बहुत छोटा सा प्रश्न पूछना चाहूंगा कि भोपाल के 56 वार्डों को राहत प्रदान की घोषणा आप करना चाहेंगे? यह प्रश्न बहुत प्रसूता से उठाया गया है कि भोपाल में केवल 36 वार्डों को ही यह दिया जा रहा है, 56 वार्डों को नहीं। मंत्री जी ने इसका कोई उत्तर यहां पर नहीं दिया है। 36 वार्डों में से भी एक लाख लोगों को नहीं दिया जा रहा है। यानी आप बहुत

संभरता से इस विषय को लेने की कृपा करेंगे और इस पर कुछ अवश्य आश्वासन देंगे। क्या आप 56 वार्डों को देने का निर्णय करेंगे! ... (व्यवधान)

मंत्री जी ने अभी कोई इसका जवाब नहीं दिया वहन जी। क्या भोपाल शहर के 56 वार्डों को ही राहत शुरू की जाएगी एक बात। और जो 56 वार्ड आपने पहले घोषित किए, उसके भी एक लाख लोगों को नहीं दिया जा रहा है। क्या उनको राहत शुरू की जाएगी? यह दो शर्तें मैं उठाना चाहता हूँ। कृपा करके इसका उत्तर दीजिए।

**SHRI CHINTA MOHAN:** If Gup-taji has got any claims left over, he can meet the Claims Commissioner. We will give him the guidelines.

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA):** Amend-ment of Shri Pachouri is not moved. Now clause 3.

Clause 3 was added to the Bill.

Clause 1, the Enacting Formula, and the Title were added to the Bill.

**श्री सुरेश पचौरी :** सन्ध्या में अपने संसोधन के बारे में तो कुछबोल ही रहा था।

**SHRI SANGH PRIYA GAUTAM (Uttar Pradesh):** Sir,.....

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA):** No, it will not go on record.

**SHRI SANGH PRIYA GAUTAM:\***

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA):** The Minister need not react because it has not been recorded.

**SHRI CHINTA MOHAN:** Sir I move:

That the Bill be passed.

The question was put and the motion was adopted.

\*Not recorded.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA): Now we will take up half-an-hour discussion.

6.00 P.M.

#### HALF-AN-HOUR DISCUSSION

On points arising out of the answer given in the Rajya Sabha on 15<sup>th</sup> July, 1992 to starred question No. 102, regarding Aids Holocaust in India

श्री प्रमोद महाजन (महाराष्ट्र) : उपाध्यक्ष जी, भारत में एड्स के भारी प्रकोप के संबंध में 15 जुलाई, 1992 को राज्यसभा में तारांकित प्रश्न 102 के दिए गए उत्तर में उत्पन्न मुद्दों में पर मैं चर्चा आरंभ करना चाहता हूँ और इस चर्चा को अनुमति प्रदान करने के लिए आपको धन्यवाद देना चाहता हूँ।

महोदय, मानव इतिहास में एड्स के नन्हें विषाणु ने पूरे मानव समाज को इतनी बड़ी चुनौती इससे पहले शायद नहीं दी होगी। यह सत्य है कि एड्स की समस्या आज सारे विश्व की चिंता का विषय बन चुकी है। फिर भी हमारी चिंता इसलिए अधिक बढ़ जाती है जब यह दिखाई दे रहा है कि हमारा भारत देश के एड्स का सबसे बड़ा शिकार बन जाने की संभावना बढ़ रही है। जागतिक आरोग्य ने भारत में एड्स के संबंध में कहा है कि—

"AIDS is spreading in India at a pace comparable to that in Africa. The Indian health officials have said about coping with the problem. But like all other Governments, their efforts may be a little too late."

विश्व बैंक, जो इसके निराकरण के लिए सहायता करता है, उन्होंने भारत के संघ में जो पत्र तैयार किया है उसमें वह टिप्पणी करते हैं कि—

"The potential for HIV spread is high and the epidemic in India, described! as a silent volcano, may turn out to be the largest in the region."

हमारे स्वास्थ्य मंत्री ने 15 जुलाई के अपने उत्तर में इस समस्या की गंभीरता को स्वीकार किया है। महोदय, 1986 में जब इस देश में एड्स का एक रोगी मिला, इसका मतलब यह नहीं कि उस दिन एड्स का एक ही शिकार था, हो सकता है हजारों ही लेकिन एक आदमी को हम ढूँढ़ पाए जो एड्स का शिकार था और 6 वर्ष के भीतर हम अभी तक लगभग 200 व्यक्तियों के बारे में तो निश्चित रूप से जानते हैं और 8000 व्यक्तियों में हमने एच.आई.वी पाया है।

जागतिक आरोग्य संगठन और विश्व बैंक, जो इसके बारे में विश्वव्यापी अभ्यास कर रहे हैं, उनका यह कहना है कि इस शताब्दी के अंत तक हिंदुस्तान में लगभग 10 लाख एड्स के बीमार पाने की संभावना है। एड्स का बीमार नहीं होता, वह अपने रोग का वाहक भी होता है। तो जब कि वह स्वयं भी बीमार है और उसका वाहक भी है तो इससे आप इस समस्या की भयंकरता को समझ सकते हैं कि अब नयी शताब्दी शुरू होगी तो यह रोग हिंदुस्तान के लिए कितनी बड़ी समस्या खड़ी करेगा।

महोदय, उस दिन स्वास्थ्य मंत्री ने जो कहा कि हमें देश में भय और आतंक का वातावरण इस संबंध में निमित्त नहीं करना चाहिए, मैं इससे शत प्रतिशत सहमत हूँ क्योंकि यदि हम भय और आतंक का वातावरण निमित्त करें हो सकता है कि ये रोगी भूमिगत हो जाएं जिन्हें एड्स हो। वह इतने बढ़ जाएं कि हमें पता ही न चले और इसलिए भूमिगत अगर यह हो जाए तो इससे हमारी समस्या और भी बढ़ जाएगी। लेकिन उसके साथ साथ मैं मंत्री जी से यह जानना चाहूँगा कि भय और आतंक का वातावरण और आवश्यक सतर्कता, इसको सीमा रेखा बड़ी ही अस्पष्ट होती है।

भय और आतंक न हो, लेकिन पूरी सतर्कता हो, इस आवश्यकता की दृष्टि से स्वास्थ्य मंत्रालय इस संबंध में