

जिससे उन उद्योगपतियों को संरक्षण मिल सके और उन्होंने जो कर्ज लिया है, वहां को जो परिस्थितियां हैं उसके कारण अपना कर्ज पटा नहीं सक रहे हैं उसके लिए रिपेमेंट शेड्यूल तय किए जायें। साथ ही उनको इस तरह से मदद दी जाए कि उन्हें नए ऋण मिलें ताकि उन क्षेत्रों में जो उद्योगपति गए हैं, उद्योग लगाए हैं, वहां के बेरोजगारों को रोजगार देकर आतंकवाद से उनको अलग कर रहे हैं, उनको कुछ प्रोत्साहन मिल सके।

SHRI SURESH KALMADI (Maharashtra): Madam, I support whatever he is saying. I think the industrialists are going through a bad time there and they must be given relief.

श्री मोहम्मद अफजल उर्फ सीम अफजल
(उत्तर प्रदेश) : मैडम, एक छोटे
अखबार में कुछ मंत्रियों पर यह इल्जाम
लगाया है कि ... (व्यवधान) ...

†[]Transliteration in Arabic Script.
(अनुवाद) : श्री अफजल उर्फ सीम अफजल
मैंने कुछ मंत्रियों पर यह इल्जाम
लगाया है ... (व्यवधान) ...

RE. SHARING OF THE EIGHTH PLAN DOCUMENT BY THE GOV- ERNMENT WITH THE WORLD BANK

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA (Bihar): Madam, I have raised in this House earlier the question of the Government sharing the Eighth Plan document with the World Bank, and the comments of the World Bank. Yesterday, there was a Short Notice Question on that, and the Minister absolutely denied any communication sent to the World Bank and any communication being received from the World Bank on this question. Now, we know from the 'Indian Express' that the statement which the Minister has made was absolutely untrue, and the paper has given details of the diary entry also by which these comments were received.

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS AND THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI M. M. JACOB): How do you know that the 'Indian Express' is true?

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: You deny it. I do not know. Neither the newspapers, Madam, nor the Members of the Opposition have access to the information. (Interruptions)

AN HON. MEMBER: The 'Indian Express' is *magna carta* for the Opposition.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Now, the point is that a serious question has arisen. This House appears to have been taken for a ride. The Minister has made a statement which appears to be untrue. And I would request the Government to come clean on the subject. And even if they have shared, they should, as Mr. Salve said yesterday, admit it before this House. This is the highest forum of the nation where they should really come clean and tell the truth in this House.

SHRI INDERKUMAR GUJRAL (Bihar): I had asked the Short Notice Question and I am, supplementing it by endorsing to what my friend, Mr. Yashwant Sinha, has said. If the Minister wishes to contradict it, then he must produce the entry of diary No. 3494 of the Secretary's office whereby the acknowledgement has been sent to the World¹ Bank that comments have been received. Therefore, it is not just as simple as Mr. Jacob has put it that a denial is enough. A definite receipt is there and I think it is a privilege issue and we suggest that this privilege issue may be admitted. (Interruptions).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let me handle the point Mr. Gujarat has raised. If you feel that it is a matter of privilege, you can move it and we will look into it. If it comes with-

[The Deputy Chairman]
in the purview of the privileges of the House,
we will look into it.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: If there is a violation of law, you approach the court and you will get justice. Is this the way the Government should¹ treat the House?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: As Deputy Chairman and as a presiding officer of this House, I have certain parameters of functioning. Now within my parameters of functioning I can give protection to the Members. And my parameters are that if you feel or if any Member feels that truth is not being said on the floor of the House and it is a matter of privilege of the House, you raise it and it will be seen.

श्री प्रमोद महाजन : (महाराष्ट्र) :
उससे पहले अगर सरकार को अवसर
दिया जा रहा है कि सरकार अगर
गलती करे तो अपने आप मान ले...
(व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now I have asked Mrs. Jayanthi Natarajan to raise her point.

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर : (उत्तर
प्रदेश) : विरोधी दलों के नेताओं को वह
डायरी दिखा दें... (व्यवधान) जिस डायरी
का जिक्र है... (व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Mathur, the Leader of the House is saying something.

THE LEADER, OF THE HOUSE (SHRI S. B. CHAVAN): In reply to the Short Notice Question, it was a categorical reply from the Minister concerned that no documents were shown to the World Bank. Merely because it has come in a newspaper, if the hon. Members are raising this issue, I think the practice is that what the Minister says will have to be taken as correct unless proved otherwise. So if the hon. Members, instead of relying on the newspaper, have any other information by which

they can establish, that what the Minister says is incorrect, then certainly it can be a matter of privilege.

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर : जिस डायरी
का जिक्र है, विरोधी दलों के
नेताओं को वह डायरी दिखाई जाय।
... (व्यवधान)

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY (Uttar Pradesh): I am on a point of order. My point of order is that what has appeared, in the Indian Express cannot be a basis for the privilege motion because the memo is dated June 24th or something like that after the NDC meeting. On the other hand, the other document I mentioned and about which the Minister knew nothing, can be the basis. But this particular -memo cannot be the basis for a privilege... (Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That matter can be looked after by the Secretariat.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: After the NDC meeting, it becomes a public document. So, anybody expressing an opinion cannot be the basis of a privilege motion. It hardly matters and that cannot be the basis for a privilege motion. (Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: If they feel that there is a breach of privilege, they can move it and it can be examined. But it cannot be accepted straightway.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: But the record may be set right that what has appeared in the Indian Express is not violative of what the Minister said. The Minister said that after the NDC meeting the entire document had become public. So whatever exchange took place between the World¹ Bank and the Finance Ministry is not the issue. The point : made is still valid that the World Bank at the Paris meeting had the documents and that is a serious thing about which Minister has not said anything. (Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will call you; I know your name is also in that Short Notice Question. I will all you. Now Mrs. Jayanthi Natara-jan.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARA-JAN(Tamil Nadu): My point of order is very simple. Senior leadens from the Opposition have made serious al legations against a Minister arising out of Short Notice Question which members have referred to a report in the 'Indian Express'. My point of order is, are you going to allow this kind of thing to go on record? It is only based on a news-paper report. Are they prepare to authenticate it?

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Under what rule it will not go on record? You quoe the rule. (Interruptions)

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATA-RAJAN: The problem is, the tragedy is, the agenda of Parliament is kept by the 'Indian Express'. They are not raising it on their own. Madam, the point is, should this be allowed to go on record? I want your ruling on this.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will give my opinion. (Interuptions) I cannot hear. Unless I hear, I cannot say whether it is or whether it is not. (Interruptions)

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATA-RAAJAN: MadaSm, the question is, should this kind of an allegation be allowed to go on record? Are they prepared to authenticate? Let them put it in writing. Take the res>-ponsibility. Say that it is true. Otherwise, it should be struck off from the record.

SHRI YASHWANT SJNHA: Undfer what rule?

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATA-RAJAN: We cannot allow this (In-

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The point which Shrimati Jayanthi Nata-rajan.is raising is this. Many things appear in the newspapers every day. (Interruptions) I will give my opinion. She has asked for my opinion. When you are in the Chair, I will allow you to give your opinion. What she wanted to know was this. Many things appear in the papers. On the basis' of that can any statement made by any Minister be considered wrong? She wanted to know whether any Member who has read the newspaper report can authenticate It.

SHRI INDER KUMAR GUJRAL: Why not?

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: It is after June 24. Therefore, it cian not be a matter of priviege. (Interruptions)

SHRI S. JAIPAL, REDDY (Andhra Pradesh): I am prepared to authenticate it, as a Member.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That is what she w as asking.

आप कुछ कह रहे थे
बोम्माई साहब । (व्यवधान)

I have identified Mr. Bommai.

SHRI SOMAPPA R. BOMMAI (Orissa): Madam, the hon. Leader of the House said that in regard to the things which appear in the newspapers, the matter cannot be raised here. In a way, he is belittling the news-item which appeard in the Pressi. He is belittling the Press.

As you know, it was only on the basis of a news-item which appeared in the Press that the then External Affairs Minister, Mr. Solanki, had to come out with the truth.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN; Shrimati. Jayanthi Natarajan did not say that.

SHRI SOMAPPA R. BOMMAI: Please hear me.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The authentication part she wanted to know.

SHRI SOMAPPA R. BOMMAI:
Please hear me. Let me complete.
(Interruptions)

As I said, on the basis of what appeared in the Press, the Minister had to resign. It was an authenticated news. Many a time, we have to rely on things which appear in the Press.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY:
* used to write all kinds of rubbish in the 'Indian Express'. Not so much now.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I do not know what appeared and what did not appear.
(Interruptions)

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY:
* was writing whatever you wanted him to write. It is different today. With * there has been a change.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: * and * are not Members of this House.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Don't mention the names of people.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY:
When they mention the 'Indian Express', can I not mention names?
(Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: A newspaper cannot be a Member. A person can.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: The quality of a newspaper is judged by its Editor.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am not allowing. (Interruptions)

SHRI SOMAPPA R. BOMMAI: Madam, I have not completed. Let

me continue. The Short Notice Question was based on the newsitem which appeared in the 'Indian Express.' It arose out of the reply given by the Minister. Today, a news-item in this regard has appeared in the 'Indian Express'. The facts are there. On the basis of these facts, it is very clear that the Minister has misled the House.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN:
Who knows the facts?

AN HON. MEMBER: Can you authenticate?

SHRI SOMAPPA R. BOMMAI: We would like to know from the Government....

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You authenticate. My ruling would be, according to rule 238, when you are making an allegation against a Minister, you should move a formal Motion. (Interruptions) Mr. Mahajan, please do not interrupt. Do not get agitated. (Interruptions) I am not allowing.
(Interruptions)

SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN: It is a one-sided affair.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It is not one-sided. There is a rule 233. (Interruptions). If you want to make an allegation, you must write it.

SHRI SOMAPPA R. BOMMAI: We are not making a personal allegation. It is a matter of record. If the Government wants to deny and come out with the truth, it is welcome. Otherwise, we will move a privilege motion.

SHRI AJIT P. K. JOGI (Madhya Pradesh): Madam, I want to request you and through you, Dr. Subramanian Swamy that the names of the two editors and journalists which he has taken should not come on record. It will be setting a wrong precedent.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, it won't come on record. Anybody who is not a Member of this House, who cannot defend (*Interruptions*) Whether it was derogatory or not, it won't come on record.

SHRI SUBRAMANI AN SWAMY: This is because he printed whatever they wanted him to Print. Now Mr. * has come in the Indian Express... (*Interruptions*).. How can you take his name off the record?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, it won't go on record because he is not a Member of this House. (*Interruptions*). Mr. Subramanian Swamy, please, do not go beyond certain... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: There are certain rules for that on what can be recorded and....

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now that matter us to stop somewhere.

SHRI SUKOMAL SEN (West Ben gal): How will it stop?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It has to stop somewhere in this House because there was a Short Notice Question and the Minister said something on the floor of this House. (*Interruptions*.) No, I am not misleading you. I am saying on the basis of the facts that are before me. The Leader of the House who is a Member of this House also, has said that whatever the Minister has said should be taken correctly and that ends the whole matter... (*Interruptions*) Unless it is proved. (*Interruption**). You write officially to me, authenticating your allegation, and I will look into the matter. Not now.

Yes, Shri Sunil Basu Ray.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Ha said that the Government denies the fact that the Planning Commission. ..

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes, Shri Sunil Basu Ray.

*Not recorded.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: That is not being denied. What is being denied is that Minister did not write. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI JAGDISH PRASAD MATHUR: Since they do not want to show the diary to opposition leaders that means they are guilty. Otherwise, there should be no difficulty for the Leader of the House to see it.

उपसभापति : माथूर साहब, मैं एक बात आपको याद दिला दूँ, शायद आपको पिछले समय से याद होगी कि जब रूलिंग हो जाती है तो इस पर कोई टिप्पणी नहीं की जाती है। यह बात खत्म हो गई... (*व्यवधान*)

I cannot permit. There is other business which I have to take up. Shri Sunil Basu Ray.

BE. DISCONNECTION OF ELECTRICITY OF A NEWSPAPER OFFICE

श्री मोहम्मद अफजल उर्फ मीम अफजल (उत्तर प्रदेश) : मैं दूसरा मसला उठा रहा हूँ, मैडम... (*व्यवधान*)

شرعی محمد افضل عرفتم۔ افضل : میں ریڈر مسئلہ اخبار کے بارے میں مٹیم۔ مداخلت...

उपसभापति : अब अखबार की बात बहुत हो गई... (*व्यवधान*)

श्री मोहम्मद अफजल उर्फ मीम अफजल : मैडम, मैं एक अखबार के बारे में मसला उठाना चाहता हूँ... (*व्यवधान*)... मैडम, यह अखबारों की आजादी का मसला है... (*व्यवधान*)

شرعی محمد افضل عرفتم۔ افضل : میں ایک اخبار کے بارے میں مسئلہ اٹھانا۔

چاہتا ہوں... مداخلت... مٹیم۔ یہ اخباروں کی آزادی کا مسئلہ ہے۔

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN. I am not permitting it This House runs on certain rules, not on newspaper reports.

† []Transliteration in Arabic Script.