

उपसभापति : अगर चेयर के बारे में डिस्कशन कर रहे हैं तो उस पर सोचा जाएगा। चेयर के बारे में डिस्कशन है तो I will take my decision. If it is a discussion on something else then you can speak.

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त : मेरी दर्यास्त सिर्फ इतनी थी कि अगर आप अपने आपको तकलीफ कम पहुँचाये तो कितना अच्छा हो।

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त : میری درخواست صرف اتنی تھی کہ اگر آپ اپنے آپ کو تکلیف پہنچانے کو کتنا اچھا ہوں۔

उपसभापति : मैं तो चाहती हूँ कि आप लोग मुझे कम तकलीफ दें।

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त : बहुत ज्यादा बोलना हो जाता है, यह मैं कहना चाहता था।

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त : بہت زیادہ بولتا ہوں۔ میں کہنا چاہتا تھا۔

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Sikander Bakhtji, I know. Let me comment. There are people watching us. Have you ever noticed when all of you get up at the same time and expect me to reply to all of you ?

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त : अगर जवाब न दें तो भी काम चल जाएगा।

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त : اگر جواب نہ دیں تو بھی کام چل جائے گا۔

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : If you keep on making allegations against the Chair, should I keep quite and listen and accept them ? It is not possible.

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त : इस वक़्त तो मैंने कोई एलीगेशन नहीं लगाई। इस वक़्त तो बग़ैर रिसार्क के बात चल सकती है।

شری سکندر بخت : اس وقت تو میں نے کوئی ایلیگیشن نہیں لگائی۔ اس وقت تو بغیر ریسارک کے بات چل سکتی ہے۔

श्री सुब्रह्मण्यम स्वामी : इस वक़्त नहीं लगाया तो क्या पहले लगाया था ?

RE. ALLEGED INTERFERENCE BY GOVERNMENT IN C.B.I. PROBE INTO SECURITIES SCAM

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त : (मध्य प्रदेश) : सदर साहिबा, मुझे यह अर्ज करना है कि यह एक अफसोसनाक सूरतेहाल इस हिन्दुस्तान में हो गई है कि कर्प्शन के संबंध में रोज़ एक नया वर्क खुलता है। ज्यादा अफसोसनाक यह है कि दो दिन पहले प्राइम मिनिस्टर साहब ने हाउस में बयान दिया, कल या परसों।

شری سکندر بخت : صدر صاحبہ۔ مجھے یہ عرض کرنا ہے کہ یہ ایک افسوسناک صورتحال اس مملکت پرستان میں ہو گئی ہے کہ کرپشن کے سمجندہ صریح روز ایک نیا درق کھلتا ہے۔

زیادہ افسوسناک یہ ہے کہ دو دن پہلے پرائم منسٹر صاحب نے ہاؤس میں بیان دیا۔ کل یا برسوں۔

उपसभापति : कल ।

श्री सिकन्दर बक्त : उस बयान में एडमिनिस्ट्रेटिव रिफार्म्स के संबंध में, करप्शन के सिलसिले में, जो एडमिनिस्ट्रेटिव रिफार्म्स की जा सकती हैं, करप्शन कश करने या खत्म करने के संबंध में, उस पर एक फुलफ्लेज्ड बहस का उन्होंने वायदा किया था कि वह उसकी करना चाहेंगे। आज जो अखबारात में आया है, रोजाना स्केम के सिलसिले में डायमेंशन का पता नहीं चलता है कि स्केम के सम्बन्ध में कितना घोटाला हुआ है। रोज नये हजारों, सैकड़ों और करोड़ों का जिक्र होता है और ऐसा हम महसूस करने लगे हैं कि कोई न कोई स्कावट का तरीका पैदा किया जाता है। स्केम का मामला मेरा ख्याल है कि जितने भी मामलात करप्शन के सिलसिले में हिन्दुस्तान के सामने आये हैं स्केम से बड़ा मामला रहा ही नहीं होगा और हमारा तमाम बक्त बहुत सारी बातों में लगा और स्केम के मामले में डिसकशन में स्कावटे पैदा हुई। सी.बी.आई. की एक रिपोर्ट आई है जिसमें सी.बी.आई. ने यह कोशिश की है कि ज्यादा से ज्यादा खुले अख्तियारात उनको कैसे मिलते हैं जिससे वे अपने तहकीकात को जारी रख सकें। उस रिपोर्ट की बैकग्राउंड में माधवन साहब का खुद हट जाना बहुत सीरियस मामला है, बहुत संजीदा मामला है। माधवन साहब एक दफा पहले भी बोफोर्स के मामले में तहकीकात करने के दौरान शिफ्ट किये गये, हटाये गये, जो भी कहा जाय। मैं यह जानना चाहूंगा कि वे आफिसर जो कि तहकीकात में लगे हुए हैं उनमें अगर

इस किस्म की कारवाई से, इस किस्म के इस्तीफा से डीमारलाइजेशन पैदा होगा तो करप्शन की हकीकत देश के सामने कैसे आयेगी? सुबह मैंने आपसी विदमत्त में आज किया था कि हम केवल इतना चाहते हैं कि प्राइम मिनिस्टर साहब ने जिस एडमिनिस्ट्रेशन रिफार्म का जिक्र किया था करप्शन के सम्बन्ध में, माधवन साहब के इस्तीफा को लेकर उसका दावरा बढ़ाया जाये और सरकार हमको यह बताये कि वह इस संबंध में डिसकशन की इजाजत कब देगी?

सदर साहिब, बराबरास्त सरकार से ताल्लुक रखने वाले फाइनेशियल इंस्टीट्यूशंस का संबंध सेक्युरिटी स्कम के संबंध में साबित हो चुका है। बदकिस्मती से जिन लोगों को सरकार से इस्तीफा देना पड़ा है, इसमें कुछ लोगों का संबंध इन इस्तीफा देने वालों से बहुत ज्यादा है और ऐसी बदकिस्मती हो गई है कि जमीं जुम्बद न जुम्बद गुलमोहम्मद कि जो लोग अपनी जगह बैठे हैं, जिनका बराबरास्त सेक्युरिटी स्कम से संबंध है, न वह अपनी जगह से हिलते हैं बल्कि इसके अलावा उन लोगों की हिमायत करने में मुसलसिल लगे हुए हैं जिनका कसूर बराबरास्त इस स्कम से साबित हो चुका है। मेरा सरकार से मुताबला यह है कि इस डिसकशन का सिलसिला आज ही शुरू किया जाय और जब तक यह डिसकशन मुकम्मल न हो, वह सोमवार तक जाये, मंगलावार तक जाये, जब तक जाना हो जाये। लेकिन करप्शन के मामलात में एक साफ-सुथरे डिसकशन का वायदा सरकार करे यह मेरा मुताबला है।

سے وہ اپنی تحقیقات کو جاری رکھ سکیں۔
اس رپورٹ کی بیک گراؤ میں مادھون صاحب

کا خود ہٹ جانا بہت ہی مصلحت مندانہ ہے۔

بہت سنجیدہ معاملہ ہے۔ مادھون صاحب

ایک دفعہ پہلے ہی بوفورس کے معاملے میں

تحقیقات کرنے کے دوران شلف کے گئے

بٹائے گئے جو بھی کہا جائے۔ میں یہ ماننا

چاہوں گا کہ وہ آفیسر جو کہ تحقیقات میں لگے

ہوئے ہیں ان میں اگر اس قسم کی کارروائی

ہے۔ اس قسم کے استعفیوں سے ڈی مار

الائیزیشن پیدا ہوگا تو کرپشن کی حقیقتیں

دیش کے سامنے کیسے آئیں گی۔ صبح

میں بے آپ کی خدمت میں عرض کیا تھا کہ

ہم کیوں اتنا چاہتے ہیں کہ پرائم منسٹر صاحب

نے جس ایڈمنسٹریٹر ریفرم کا ذکر کیا تھا۔

کرپشن کے سمبندھ میں۔ مادھون صاحب

کے استعفی کو لیکر اس کا دائرہ بڑھایا جائے

اور سرکار ہم کو یہ بتائے کہ وہ اس سمبندھ

میں ڈسکس کی اجازت کب دے گی۔

صدر صاحبہ براہ راست سرکار سے

تعلق رکھنے والے فائیننشیل انسٹیٹیوٹیشن

کا سمبندھ سیکورٹی اسکیم کے سمبندھ میں

ثابت ہو چکا ہے۔ بد قسمتی سے جن لوگوں کو

سرکار سے استعفی دینا پڑا ہے۔ اس میں

کچھ لوگوں کا سمبندھ ان استعفی دہنے

شری سکندر نعمت: اس بیان میں ایڈمنسٹریٹر

ریفرم کے سمبندھ میں۔ کرپشن کے

سلسلہ میں۔ جو ایڈمنسٹریٹر ریفرم کے

جاسکتی ہے کرپشن کم کرنے یا ختم کرنے

کے سمبندھ میں۔ اس پر ایک نل قلیجٹ

بحث کا انہوں نے وعدہ کیا تھا کہ وہ اسکو

کرنے چاہیں گے۔ آج جو اخبارات میں

آئیے۔ روزانہ اسکیم کے سلسلہ میں

ڈائمنشن کا پتہ نہیں چلتا ہے کہ اسکیم

کے سمبندھ میں کتنا گھوٹالہ ہوا ہے۔

روز نئے ہزاروں۔ سینکڑوں اور کروڑوں

کا ذکر ہوتا ہے اور ایسا ہم محسوس کرنے

لگے ہیں کہ کوئی نہ کوئی رساؤٹ کا طریقہ پیدا

کیا جاتا ہے۔ اسکیم کا معاملہ میرا خیال

ہے کہ جتنے بھی معاملات کرپشن کے سلسلہ

میں ہندوستان کے سامنے آئے ہیں۔

اسکیم سے بہت بڑا معاملہ رہا ہی نہیں ہوگا۔

اور ہمارا تمام وقت بہت ساری باتوں

میں لگا اور اسکیم کے معاملے میں ڈسکس

میں رساؤٹیں پیدا ہوئی۔ سی۔ بی۔ آئی۔ کی

ایک رپورٹ آئی ہے۔ جس میں سی۔ بی۔ آئی

نے یہ کوشش کی ہے کہ زیادہ سے زیادہ

کھلے اختیارات انکو کیسے ملتے ہیں جس

दलों से बहुत زیادہ ہے۔ اور ایسی
بدقسمتی ہوگئی ہے کہ زمین جمہ نہ جمہ گل محمد
کہ جو لوگ اپنی جگہ بیٹھے ہیں جن کا براہ راست
سیکورٹی اسکیم سے سمبندہ ہے۔ نہ وہ اپنی
جگہ سے ہٹتے ہیں۔ بلکہ اس کے علاوہ ان لوگوں
کی حمایت میں کرنے میں مسلسل لگے ہوئے
ہیں جن کا تصور براہ راست اس اسکیم
سے ثابت ہو چکا ہے۔ میرا سرکار سے مطالبہ
ہے کہ اس ڈسکشن کا سلسلہ آج ہی شروع
کیا جائے اور جب تک یہ ڈسکشن مکمل
نہ ہو۔ وہ سووار تک جائے۔ منگلوار
تک جائے۔ جب تک جانا ہو جائے۔
لیکن کرپشن کے معاملات میں ایک صاف
ستھرے ڈسکشن کا وعدہ سرکار کرے
یہ میرا مطالبہ ہے۔

उपसभापति : कल बिजनेस एंडवाइजरी
कमेटी में यह तय हुआ था कि प्रधानमंत्री
जी ने जिस बात का आश्वासन दिया था,
आपको पता है कि उसके लिये उसमें टाइम
निकाला है। सब लोगों की जब राय होगी,
जैसा समय होगा, उसमें जरूर उस पर डिस्-
कशन करेंगे। आज के दिन समय बहुत
कम है। आज तो केवल 45 मिनट ही रह
गये हैं।

श्री चतुरानन मिश्र (बिहार) : प्रधान मंत्री
जी ने जो सवाल... (व्यवधान)...

उपसभापति : ठीक है, दूसरी बात कह
रहे हैं।

श्री चतुरानन मिश्र : आपने कहा कि
प्रधानमंत्री ने कहा था। आज सवाल
उठ गया है तो क्या प्रधानमंत्री...
(व्यवधान)...

SHRIMATI KAMLA SINHA
(BIHAR): It is a different issue alto-
gether.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN
He referred to it, that is why I am
saying it. I am not volunteering it
on my own.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY
(Andhra Pradesh): Madan
Deputy Chairperson, now that you
are kind enough to permit us to raise
this question, I would like to know a
to who, on behalf of the Government
will respond to our queries. Are we
to raise these question in the air and
satisfy ourselves for having raised
them? We have to put the question
to the Minister through the Chair
Therefore, I would like to know as to
which Minister is going to answer
our queries on behalf of the Govern-
ment.

THE MINISTER OF HOME
AFFAIRS (SHRI S.B. CHAVAN):
which query?

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: The
query in regard to the premature
retirement application of Mr
Madhavan, the CBI official.

SHRI S.B. CHAVAN: In the
case of the CBI, the Prime Minister
is in charge and the Minister of State
is Mrs. Margaret Alva. But now I
am here; you can raise the points and
I will see that she responds to the
points.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:
Mr. Chavan, we do not have a reg-
ular motion before the House. It
is just the concern of the
Members and they want to raise it
today. There is no motion for dis-
cussion. Mr. Sikander Bakht him-
self said that a discussion should

take place as promised by the Prime Minister for which we need more time. As the matter is of concern to them, we are allowing them to speak. We will get margaretji, as promised.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: I am afraid that the level of our participation is getting demoted. The point is, the discussion on the question of corruption in general is different from the specific question that we are raising now. The specific question that we are raising now relates to the application of Mr. Madhavan for premature retirement. Anyway, I will come to that later. Madam, it is important to note in the first place that... *(Interruption)* Mr. Upendra, you need not reply on behalf of the Government. I don't mind if Mr. Upendra is made a Minister... *(Interruptions)*

SHRI P. UPENDRA (Andhra Pradesh): There is a procedure Mr. Jaipal Reddy, you were Leader of the Opposition. When points are raised, the Minister are not supposed to be present in the House and reply spontaneously. I am just referring to this.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: Mr. Upendra, you must note this. Madam, this House was adjourned during the Question Hour and it was said that we were meeting again at 12 O'clock to discuss the issue. The Government should have been alert and sensible enough to feed the information to the concerned Minister. Anyway, in the first place, it is important to note that Mr. Madhavan had put in his papers on 20th of July. Today is 31st. Nearly 12 days have since passed by. What has the Government been doing on the application of Mr. Madhavan? Secondly, when the scam broke out and when the Members in both the Houses of Parliament demanded a CBI probe... *(Interruptions)*

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE (Maharashtra): Madam, a point of order.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes, please.

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE: The House is entitled to know... *(Interruptions)*

SHRI VIREN J. SHAH (Maharashtra): What is the point of order when there is no motion?

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE: The point of order is on the procedure, Madam. The House would like to know as to what precisely you have permitted. Have you permitted a discussion on merits or have you permitted... *(Interruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Zero hour. There is an organised way...

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE: Madam, I seek your indulgence. Or is it that you have permitted the Members to raise an issue to seek your permission for a discussion? The scope of the two will be entirely different. All that we want to know is what precisely you have permitted... *(Interruptions)*

THE LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (SHRI SIKANDER BAKHT): We are demanding that the Government should come out with the facts regarding the premature retirement of Mr. Madhavan. Therefore, it has nothing to do with the procedure.

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE: That means you are not arguing on the merits of the matter, Mr. Sikander Bakht.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Are you asking Mr. Sikander Bakht or me?

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE: Through you, I am talking to him, Madam.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: His answer is coming. A point of order cannot be made to a Member. It should be to the Chair. I think, I am in my right to answer it.

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE: Not only you are obliged to answer, Madam, one way or the other, I only seek your indulgence in apprising the House as to what precisely you have permitted.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will explain. *(Interruptions)* Just a second, please. Let me answer this. The thing is that there was an uproar in the Question Hour because the Members were worried about certain newspapers reports which appeared in some of the newspapers today. So they wanted to raise that issue and wanted to suspend the Question Hour. They wrote to me. I said, "The Question Hour is a right of the Members. So I do not approve of the suspension of the Question Hour." I gave an assurance that I would allow them to raise those queries at 12'o clock when most of the problems which the Members are worried about and which appear in various newspapers every day are brought before the House. So, in the same manner, it is being raised. What Mr. Sikander Bakht referred to also was another matter on which the Business Advisory Committee has already taken a decision for having a discussion in a proper manner about corruption or improvements in the working of the administration, administrative reforms or whatever it is. That will come in another form. This is only their worry about the news which has come in today's papers.

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE: In other words, Madam, you have permitted a discussion on...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It is not a discussion, Mr. Salve. There is no discussion... *(Interruptions)*

SHRI S.K.T. RAMACHANDRAN (Tamil Nadu) : But they are making it a full-fledged discussion.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: There is no discussion whatsoever... *(Interruptions)* Let me make it very clear... *(Interruptions)*

SHRI S.K.T. RAMACHANDRAN: We seek your protection.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Only if you will allow me, can I give you the protection... *(Interruptions)*

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH (West Bengal): We want to raise this issue relating to the interference in the securities scam also.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : O.K. Now the he has explained it. The thing is, at 12 o' clock, there are many issues which are raised. It is without moving any motion that Members are raising their concern. I am only trying to put it in an organised manner instead of a disorganised manner. This is the matter... *(Interruptions)*.

SHRI MADAN BHATIA (Nominated) : Madam, I am on a point of order.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Let him speak. We have only less than an hour... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : Madam, a systematic attempt is being made by the Government with an intention to scuttle the discussion on the floor of the House... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA (West Bengal) : Madam, I have a submission to make... *(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I am allowing it... *(Interruptions)*

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA (Bihar) : Madam, it cannot be allowed. This filibuster cannot be allowed. This is only a waste of time. *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA : Madam, there are many occasions. Whenever we choose to discuss... *(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN
Mr. Gurudas Gupta, I am saying the same thing what you are saying. There is no contradiction. There is no contradiction in what I am saying. There is very little time. Please take your seat. *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI P. UPENDRA : Madam, if the Government is prepared to reply, we also want to raise the issue. Are you allowing it ?

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY :
Sure. Why not. The Home Minister is here and he will respond... *(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :
I am not part of the Government. The Leader of the House is here. He has the responsibility to convey the concern of the Members to the Government as it is done every day at 12 o' clock and then he will come back to the House as he promised already.

देखिए, मैं डिसरप्ट नहीं कर रही हूँ।
अभी आपको तरफ से मेम्बर ही कर रहे हैं... *(व्यवधान)*...

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY :
Madam, let me reiterate the first point I made, for it might have been forgotten. Mr. Madhavan put in his papers as far back as on 20th of this month. Twelve days have since passed by. I want to know what the Government has been doing during these long twelve days. When the scam broke out and the CBI enquiry was ordered, we were glad to learn that Mr. Madhavan was spared for this task. But we later realised Mr. Madhavan was not exclusively spared for this. He had been earlier given a loop-line posting to deal with economic offences and it so happened that the scam came under his

direct charge. After Mr. Madhavan took charge of enquiring into the scam, all efforts have since been made to scuttle, dilute and sabotage the enquiry into the scam.

SHRI S.B. CHAVAN : I deny this charge, Madam... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI R.K. DHAWAN (Andhra Pradesh) : No need to inform. One can see that... If an officer wants to voluntarily retire.... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY :
Mr. R.K. Dhawan, you are certainly aware... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI R.K. DHAWAN : He has asked for retirement. Do you know how many officers have asked for voluntary retirement ?... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY :
I do not want to join issue with anybody... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MADAN BHATIA :
Madam, I may be allowed to raise a point of order... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI R.K. DHAWAN : What are you trying to say ? You know how many people are seeking voluntary retirement. What is wrong ? He has sought voluntary retirement *(Interruptions)*.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY :
Madam, I concede that Mr. R.K. Dhawan knows much more than all of us know in this matter... *(Interruptions)*... Certainly has superior knowledge in this matter.

SHRI R.K. DHAWAN : He is a Government employee. He is asking for his retirement. The Government has to see whether he comes under the voluntary retirement... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY :
I seek your protection... I seek your protection.

SHRI MADAN BHATIA :
Madam, I want to raise a point of order... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY :
Madam, what is happening here ?
You take control of the proceedings of the House.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :
आपकी क्या प्रब्लम है ? What is the problem ? Let him speak....

SHRI MADAN BHATIA :
Madam, I want to raise a point of order... *(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :
What is the point of order?

SHRI R.K. DHAWAN : Don't forget, whether to allow him to retire or not is the prerogative of the Government.

SHRI DIGVIJAY SINGH (Bihar) : This is not Mrs. Gandhi's Government... *(Interruptions)*... There is a Government here and let them reply... *(Interruptions)*... Why are you speaking?... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI R.K. DHAWAN : He was mentioning about sabotage and other things... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI DIGVIJAY SINGH :
The Government is there to reply. Why are you replying ?... *(Interruptions)*... You are not in the Government. Then why are you replying on their behalf ?... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI R.K. DHAWAN : He has said that he is seeking voluntary retirement. Why are you agitated ?... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI AJIT P.K. JOGI (Madhya Pradesh) : On personal grounds he has put in his papers. Why are you people agitated ?... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM (Andhra Pradesh) : Madam, why not the Home Minister come out with all the facts, come out with full facts?... *(Interruptions)*... Madam, let the Home Minister assure the House that he will come before the House with all the facts... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI DIGVIJAY SINGH :
The Government is there and let the Government reply... *(Interruptions)*... Why are you coming in between ? *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI R.K. DHAWAN : I know that... *(Interruptions)*... You sit down... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI DIGVIJAY SINGH :
You sit down... *(Interruptions)*... You better sit down... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI R.K. DHAWAN : What were you doing when you were in power ? *(Interruptions)*... When you were in power, what were you doing?... *(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :
Order, order, please... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI R.K. DHAWAN : They are saying, "Madhavan, Madhavan" *(Interruptions)*... He has only sought voluntary retirement. What is wrong about it ?... *(Interruptions)*... He wanted to take voluntary retirement. What can the Government do about it ?... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM : He has sought voluntary retirement or are you forcing him to retire?... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MADAN BHATIA :
Madam, on a point of order... *(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :
Order, please... *(Interruptions)*... Let us go ahead with the business... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MADAN BHATIA :
Madam, you have allowed me to raise my point of order...*(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :
Order, please...*(Interruptions)*... Let me handle it...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI R.K. DHAWAN : Mr. Reddy, you are coming in the way of the officers...*(Interruptions)*... He has sought voluntary retirement and if he wants to retire, why do you want to come in his way? ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :
There should be order in the House. Then only I can run it...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA :
Madam, may I insist that whatever may be going on here, every Member will have an opportunity to say what he wants to say? We only want to make a brief intervention...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI R.K. DHAWAN : Madam, he has levelled charges that efforts are being made to sabotage the inquiry...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MADAN BHATIA :
Madam, I need only one minute...*(Interruptions)*... I must be permitted ...*(Interruptions)*... Madam, this point has been raised on account of which the whole Question Hour was suspended...*(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :
No. It was not suspended...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MADAN BHATIA :
Madam, I must submit that this is a very wrong precedent in the annals of our Parliament...*(Interruptions)*... We will be setting a wrong precedent ...*(Interruptions)*... Madam, if a member of the bureaucracy resigns his post or seeks voluntary retirement from his post, this can never be the subject matter of discussion in the Parliament...*(Interruptions)*...

SOME HON. MEMBERS : No, no...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM : No, no. He is involved in a very very important investigation ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MADAN BHATIA :
This is against all norms of parliamentary democracy...*(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :
Will you please sit down?...*(Interruptions)*... You have made your point ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA : Madam, under what rule this is being raised...*(Interruptions)* ... Under what rule? ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MADAN BHATIA :
I have not concluded my point yet ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :
You please sit down. We do not have time. *(Interruptions)* I have to adjourn the House at one O'clock...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MADAN BHATIA :
Madam, just half-a-minute only...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY :
What is this, Madam, I was making my point...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MADAN BHATIA :
Madam, if a member of the bureaucracy seeks retirement, his retirement, ...*(Interruptions)*... or even his conduct cannot be the subject matter of discussion in this House...*(Interruptions)*... Even his conduct cannot be a matter of discussion in this House, much less his resignation or his seeking voluntary retirement...*(Interruptions)*... If we make this a subject matter of discussion here, we will be establishing a very

[Shri Madan Bhatia]

very wrong precedent... (*Interruptions*)... I appeal to you to decide this, whether this issue will be raised here at all... (*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Please take your seat... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI MADAN BHATIA : The Government cannot be asked to respond to this... (*Interruptions*)... The Government cannot be asked to respond to all that is being said here... (*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : O.K. I am not asking the Government to respond. Please sit down. (*Interruptions*)... Will you please take your seat ? I have not allowed any discussion on this subject. Probably you did not hear what I said right in the beginning. There is no formal motion before the House... (*Interruptions*)... Some news paper reports are there and the Members are excited about them, worried about them and concerned about them, on both sides of the House. And I am permitting them to air their views. The Government is not obliged to answer. If they are obliged to answer, it is entirely up to them. It is not within my right to ask.

SHRI R.K. DHAWAN : They should not make false allegations.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA : The Government is there... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : My authentic information is...

SHRI R.K. DHAWAN : He cannot level charges.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : I stand by every word I say here. My authentic information is that Mr. Madhavan was pressurised into not pursuing this line... (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Please. Just a minute. Let me handle the House. Will you please sit down ? (*Interruptions*) Would you substantiate ? (*Interruptions*) Just a minute please. The person about whom you are...

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : I am not levelling allegations against anybody.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Just a minute, Jaipal Reddyji. At least, let me speak. Whatever you are saying, can you substantiate ? Can you substantiate whatever you are saying on the floor of the House because the Members are saying that it is an allegation. You substantiate it if you have any proof.

SHRI SIKANDER BAKHT : It is a fact that you want to be substantiated.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I do not know. The Members are saying. If there is any allegation, then can you substantiate that allegation ? (*Interruptions*) I am only asking you.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : Yes, I will substantiate if there is a House Committee enquiry into this. I am prepared to substantiate the charge I made that Mr. Madhavan's work was not allowed to be proceeded with. (*Interruptions*) Many influential people tried to interrupt his enquiry. (*Interruptions*) Madam, the UCO Bank Chairman, Mr. Margabandhu who was involved in the scam on a gigantic scale was prevented from being arrested... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA (Bihar) : Madam, are we discussing the scam ? We have already discussed it... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI S.K.T. RAMACHANDRAN : He is an irresponsible fellow. Why should he run away from his duty ? Madam, they are defending an irresponsible fellow...
(*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :
Order, order.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY :
Many important politicians and senior bureaucrats are involved in the operations of the Fairgrowth Company. Therefore, investigations were not allowed to be proceeded with smoothly. (*Interruptions*) If only investigations are allowed to be completed smoothly, many heads of this Government will roll. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :
Hon. Members, please take your seats. (*Interruptions*) I again request the Members to have restraint...

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA :
Unnecessarily, they are making stories.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :
Please. If any allegations are made against any one who is not a Member of the House and is not capable to protect himself, you have to be careful. You have to substantiate those allegations.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY :
I made no allegations. I made no allegations against anybody. I am only making certain points.
(*Interruptions*)

SHRI MADAN BHATIA : Is a member of the bureaucracy the subject matter of the discussion ?
(*Interruptions*)

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY :
I am making certain observations. I made no allegations against any particular Minister. (*Interruptions*) According to Mr. S. K. Datta...
(*Interruptions*)

SHRI S.K.T. RAMACHANDRAN :
He is going on making allegations.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY :
According to Mr. S.K. Datta, the Director of CBI... (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :
No, no. Mr. Dhawan, your name is before me. I will permit you. So, let him say what he wants to say. Then you can reply.

SHRI R. K. DHAWAN : But he should not level any charges...

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY :
No, no.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :
You can reply if you feel that there are certain charges being levelled which are not there... (*Interruptions*)

ग्रहलुवालिया जी, आप बैठिए । आप हाऊस में थे नहीं, इसलिए आपको मालूम नहीं ।

I cannot keep on giving a report to every Member who comes. (*Interruptions*) Look, Mr. Ahluwalia, you were not in the House. So, I cannot report to every Member who comes late in the House. So, please take your seat...

SHRI S.K.T. RAMACHANDRAN : He is making...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :
You should be present in the House to know what I have said before. I cannot repeat every word again. There is a limit to it.

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA :
The Prime Minister has already announced the JPC.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :
Please sit down. I am not allowing you. Please take your seat. I have not permitted you. I have given my ruling. Mr. Ahluwalia, you were not there.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : I would only like to have two uninterrupted minutes. The JPC cannot do its work effectively unless the CBI

[Shri S. Jaipal Reddy]

team is such as to inspire confidence. When Mr. Madhavan sent his letter to Mr. Dutta, Director of CBI, Mr. Dutta wanted to know the reasons and Mr. Madhavan wrote a letter...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :
Please don't take the names of people who are not here. Why are you taking the names? They are not Members of this House. Why do you do that? I have never permitted it before. I do not permit any names of the bureaucrats who are not here to protect themselves.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : But I am not making any allegation. I am merely making a reference, not an allegation.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :
You make your point and finish. Let others also speak.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY :
According to the reports, Mr. Madhavan felt obliged to write his letter because of political pressure. We, therefore, demand that the Prime Minister should come into the House and explain to the House the circumstances under which Mr. Madhavan gave his letter of resignation. It is the Prime Minister who is dealing with the case directly. The Prime Minister should come to the House and explain. I may add towards the end that the clouds of suspicion are gathering around the PM's office also I, therefore, demand that the Prime Minister should come to the House and explain the matter to the House.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :
Mr. Subramanian Swamy.

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA :
I gave my name also. Madam, you fix a time limit for the Members to speak.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :
Please. Let us not waste time on this. If it is a discussion, it will go according to parties. It is the concern of the Members and as the names came to me, and as I observe, I am allowing it

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA :
But our notice should get precedence.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :
If the matter is serious, we should discuss it in that atmosphere. Otherwise let us have other business. I have got special mentions which Members have to make.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY (Uttar Pradesh) : We have in this House to distinguish between a fact and an inference. All the fact that we have is that an officer investigating the securities scam has put in his papers in which he has asked for voluntary retirement. He has said nothing more than that. Had he resigned and said that he is being blocked from investigating the securities scam, we could have taken immediate notice in this House. But that is not what has happened. What has happened is that he has written a letter seeking voluntary retirement and the newspapers—some of them—have given interpretation why he has resigned or why he has sought voluntary retirement. Now it would be impossible to run any administration if the officers become pro-*Opposition* or pro-ruling party.....(*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : It is his view. How can you object to his view? He is definitely not going to speak others' views. It is his individual view. He is a Member of the House and he has the right to speak as you have that right. I protect you and I am protecting him also. I have a full right to protect him and also to protect all of you.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : You have full right to protect the truth.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :
My throat is not right and I have to take some aspirin also.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : It will be very unfortunate if the administration officers are divided

into those who are with the Opposition and those who are with the ruling party. Now, the question of defending Mr. Madhavan on the floor of this House cannot arise unless there is some fact to show that he has been prevented from conducting the investigation. I can say from personal knowledge of the working in Government that it is possible that there are officers who, in order to get the best of both the worlds,-- I am not saying that it has happened in this case, but I know of cases-- put in their papers for voluntary retirement and then meet some Members and give some sensational news which appears in the newspapers. I am not saying that it has happened in this case. What I would say is that unless the Government makes a statement, or, in this case, if Mr. Madhavan feels--perhaps, Mr. Jaipal Reddy was speaking with conviction, or, perhaps, he had some communication with him--

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: No.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: If you had not, if you are speaking with conviction that he was deprived, it would have been honourable for this officer to have resigned, saying 'I cannot proceed with this investigation and therefore, please accept my resignation than to have put in his application for voluntary retirement and seek all the benefits that the Government gives to its employees. If we continue to allow this kind of thing to go on, in my opinion, no administration will continue. Therefore, I would say to the Government 'Accept Mr. Madhavan request for voluntary retirement. Find another good officer.' There are plenty of good officers in the Government who can do as good a job, or, even a better job. They can do a better job of investigating the securities scam. There are such officers. It is wrong to think that there are only a handful of officers who can do this kind of investigation. We have got tremendous talent in the administration. Let us find such an officer. Perhaps, at that time, Members from the opposition or the ruling party can make their

inferences. There are officers. That would be the correct thing to do to maintain the morale of the administration. This matter must be brought to an end and Mr. Madhavan's request for voluntary retirement should be accepted immediately.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Madam, I would say that it is a blatant interference in the securities scam probe.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN (Tamil Nadu): How?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let him say. Please listen.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: I am not making any allegation against any particular individual. I say that it is a blatant interference.

When we were discussing the securities scam, the Prime Minister came to this House and promised that Government had no objection to the setting up of a Joint Parliamentary Committee. We are now talking about the terms of reference etc., of the JPC.

Now, the point is, the CBI has been investigating this matter. It is not the point whether the officer who was in charge of this investigation had resigned, or, he had asked for voluntary retirement. The fact is, he has decided to quit. The important point, according to me, is whether the Government should allow him to quit, in the midst of this investigation. I say this because the Government says that it is interested in finding the truth. The Prime Minister has also agreed to have a JPC, besides the on-going CBI investigation. Therefore it is up to the Government to decide. When an officer decides to quit, whether by resigning or by voluntary retirement, it is for the Government to decide. But the rule says that it is not incumbent on the Government to accept a request for voluntary retirement. Therefore, I say, when the Government says that it is interested in finding the truth, when it wants to go to the root of the matter, when the Prime Minister has gone on record saying that nobody, howsoever high placed he may be, no Minister

SHRI S. B. CHAVAN: Madam, before 1 p.m., I would like to react.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Sure.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Okay.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You please be brief, Mr. Ghosh. I cannot stretch the time.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Madam, this is a new point. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: One minute each. That is the request of the Members.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: I will make my other points when the Motion on this subject comes up for discussion. But in the meantime, I would say that this officer who was in charge of investigating the securities scam has decided to quit on certain grounds, that he was not being assisted, that he was not being allowed to continue the enquiry according to his method of investigation. I would demand that the Prime Minister should come to this House and assure us that till this probe is completed and responsibilities are fixed, the person who is in charge of this Scam, will not be allowed to quit the service.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA : I Will be very brief.

Madam, we are not here to discuss the conduct of officers, let us be very clear about it. (*Interruptions*). At least I am not doing it. I am absolutely convinced. We will neither praise nor denigrate an officer in this House because the officer is not present. Therefore, it is not a question of Mr. Madhavan. Mr. Madhavan may seek a voluntary retirement and the Government may allow him to go on voluntary retirement and after retirement he may do whatever he likes, that is not my concern, this is not the concern of this House. What is the concern of this House, what is of vital

importance is the fact that all this is happening under very very peculiar circumstances. All the newspapers in this country are screaming with allegations that there is interference with the probe. That is what is causing concern to people like us that the CBI probe is being interfered with and that too by the highest quarters in this land. That is the matter of concern, Madam Deputy Chairman. It is in the interest of the Government (*Interruptions*). Madam, if I had been a part of any Government which would have faced a situation like this, I personally would have rushed to the House, to Parliament, to make the position of Government clear on this issue instead of hiding away, trying to block or trying to filibuster and this is what I expect of this Government that they will come clean. If you have the courage, let Mr. Madhavan go, accept his voluntary retirement, but come clean on the question of interference, assure this House, assure the people of this country that the Government is not trying to protect any one, that the Government is not interfering with the probe of the CBI that all the guilty will be brought to book, however high they might be.

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Madam, I have given you notice. I want two minutes. (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no, I am not permitting. The Leader of the House wants to react. (*Interruptions*). I am not saying 'no'. It is not final. Let us hear the Leader of the House.

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: I will request him to wait for two minutes. Madam, I am not.....

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: One minute.

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: I am not concerned about a particular officer. I am also not concerned about

a particular member of the Government, but kindly allow me to become concerned about the credibility of the country and credibility of the Government because any Government of this country is our Government. Within a short period two important things have happened. Our Foreign Minister submitted his resignation.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:
We are not talking about that. That is not before the House. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA:
Our Foreign Minister submits a letter to another Foreign Minister and he does not know about the person who gave him the letter. Another important member of the bureaucracy resigns now. If we club both the resignations together, the whole world will get a signal that in India a serious cover-up operation is going on. This has degraded our national morale, our dignity and the credibility of the Government. Therefore, it is in the interest of the country that the Government should come up and deny and it is within the right of the Government to say no to the voluntary retirement request of Mr. Madhavan. Mr. Madhavan is not saved by this but the country is saved, our Prime Minister is saved and we are saved from being dishonoured in the comity of nations that India is trying to cover up the crime.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:
Your one minute is over.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:
One minute, Mr. Dhawan.

SHRI M. A. BABY (Kerala):
Madam, two sentences.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:
I will allow you three sentences. Just let him finish. I will allow you three sentences. I will allow you three sentences. Please, let him finish. Mr. Dhawan, two minutes

SHRI R. K. DHAWAN:
want to say that it is the prerogative of a Government servant to seek retirement. The question is whether he sought retirement on personal reasons or on some other reasons. His letter of resignation, as reported in the Press, is very clear that he is resigning because of personal reasons. The Government has no business to ask that. The Government can persuade the officer concerned. It can say that if there is any problem, personal reasons, it will try to help him. But, if the officer insists on resigning, the Government cannot come in his way.

I resigned thrice from Government service for personal reasons.

AN HON. MEMBER: Ha-ha.

SHRI R.K. DHAWAN: Ha-ha nahin. It is a fact. Don't say, "Ha-ha ha." It is a fact. The then Prime Minister asked me at that time, "Is there any personal reason? Can we help you in any way?" I said, "No. I want to seek retirement." So, I retired. So did Mr. Ashwani Sinha.... (*Interruptions*)

By saying that Mr. Madhavan is the only person who can handle the situation, I think, we are casting a slur on the entire bureaucracy of the country. There are very many competent officers. The officer wants to go on his own. Mr. Jaipal Reddy was asking why, when he had asked for retirement on such and such a date, the Government had delayed it. The Government certainly has to give chance to the person to reconsider it. It has to ask from him what the reasons are. He has only said that he was resigning for personal reasons, and he is within his rights.

All these insinuation and all other things that he was under pressure and all that are being made. When Mr. Madhavan was assigned his job to look into the scam, the

[Shri R. K. Dhawan]

Government was fully aware that he had the backing of the Opposition, including Mr. V.P. Singh and the Janata Dal, but they did not change him. They said, "He is a good officer."... (Interruptions)

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: This is an allegation... (Interruptions).

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA: It is a fact... (Interruptions)

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : Mr. Madhavan was not given a special charge. He was dealing with economic offences. The task had to be handled by him under normal circumstances. (Interruptions)

SHRI R. K. DHAWAN : You know what has happened. Mr. Madhavan has gone into the whole scam. He has found nothing. He has to show his face to his friends who are in the Opposition. So, he wants to resign on totally personal reasons. We should not say that only he is competent. There are many other competent officers.

I would request the Home Minister to accept his resignation immediately.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: One minute. Chavan Saheb, I will give you time. Mr. Upendra wants to say a word.

SHRI CHATURANAN MISHRA (Bihar): Madam,.....

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes, I have your name, Mishraji. (Interruptions) I will call you also. (Interruptions)

SHRI P. UPENDRA: I will take only one minute.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: One minute, half a minute, a quarter minute.

SHRI P. UPENDRA: Madam we are setting a very bad precedent by pointing out about an officer performance because we are concerned with the Government as a whole. We have to pin down the Government for a proper enquiry. We are not concerned about which officer is investigating and all that. That is a very bad precedent.

Secondly, my friend, Mr. Jaipal Reddy, mentioned a portion of the report. He has not quoted the complete report also. Mr. Madhavan was asked about the reasons. He declined to give the reasons. At one place it has also been mentioned that I was denied promotion. It has been put in the paper. At another place they say that the Government is trying to persuade him. They have not accepted his resignation. There are different aspects of this whole story. Therefore, we should not rely on that.

The third point is that the CBI enquiry was ordered much earlier than the House decided on the JPC. We are not completely relying on the CBI enquiry. That is why we asked for the JPC, and the JPC is being constituted. If there is a deliberate attempt to pressurise the CBI to hush up the matter, the JPC can find it out at that stage.

उपसभापति : चतुरानन मिश्र जे आप एक जुमले में बोलिए जल्दी से...

श्री चतुरानन मिश्र : मैं एक ही जुमले में कहूंगा। हमारे पास एक सूचना आई है रिलायेबल सोर्स से। मैं कफ करना चाहता हूँ क्योंकि लीडर आफ हाउ बैठे हुए हैं, कि क्या यह सही है कि माधव साहब की रिपोर्ट में दो मंत्रियों का नाम आया था, उनका नाम फाइल पर बचावना चाहते थे, तो प्रधान मंत्री ने उनको रोक दिया। क्या यह सच है या नहीं यह बताएं।

श्री एस. बी. चव्हाण : यह असत्य है जे आप कह रहे हैं।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:
Mr. Baby, one sentence you speak.

1.00 P.M.

SHRI M. A. BABY: While associating myself with the points raised by the hon. Members of this side of the House, particularly with the point raised by Shri Yashwanth Sinha, first of all I would like to ask the hon. Leader of the House that when we have a very honest Government, why is it so that at least some of the honest senior-most officers like to take voluntary retirement? This is my first question.

In this particular case it is known that even when the Bofors case was investigated by a team under the leadership of Mr. Madhavan, he had to face very many difficulties the details of which I don't want to go into.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:
Your sentence is over.

SHRI M. A. BABY: This is my last sentence. There are many reports with colossal amount of proof, including the exposure which came out in *The Sunday Mail* regarding the Cabinet Minister in-charge of Petroleum and Natural Gas, wherein it was pointed out that there is a connection of his Ministry with the securities scam. Therefore, I allege that many Cabinet Ministers are behind...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:
No, please. I won't permit that. Mr. Baby, you know the Rules of Procedure. You are also a Member of the Panel of Vice-Chairmen. If you want to make an allegation, please don't make it only on the basis of newspaper reports. If you want to make an allegation, you have to first give me in writing in advance. If I give you permission, only then you can raise it. So, I can't allow you. (Interruptions) This is my ruling.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: But he can say they were allegedly involved.

SHRI S. K. T. RAMACHANDRAN: Madam, if they are not able to substantiate those allegations against the Minister, then I demand that that reference should be expunged from the record. (Interruptions).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:
That is over. Mr. Dipen Ghosh, please take your seat. शास्त्री जी आप भी एक ही वाक्य बोलिए।

श्री विष्णु कांत शास्त्री (उत्तर प्रदेश): माननीया उपसभापति जी, सबसे बड़ा आश्चर्य यह है कि एक ही कर्तव्यनिष्ठ अधिकारी के प्रति बार-बार ऐसी दुर्घटना होती है। बोफोर्स कांड में जिसको हट्टया गया उसको जांच से हटने के लिए विवश किया गया। क्या सिर्फ इसलिए कि कुल बड़े लोगों पर उसकी ऊंगली उठ गई थी? जंग में कत्ल सिपाही होंगे, सुखरु जिल्ले इलाही होंगे। जीतेंगे तो बड़े अफसर, जीतेंगे तो बड़े मंत्री और हट्टये जायेंगे क्लर्क। क्लर्कों को, छोटे अधिकारियों को जब तक शक की निगाह से देखा जाता है तब तक प्रक्रिया चलने दी जाती है और जब जांच की प्रक्रिया बड़े अफसरों को, मंत्रियों को अपनी गिरफ्त में लेती है तब उनको जांच से अलग कर दिया जाता है। यह बहुत बड़ी शंका और बड़े अफसोस की बात है। जब बड़े-बड़े अफसरों मंत्रियों को जांच प्रक्रिया अपने शिकंजे में कस रही हो तब जांच रिपोर्ट चलने दी जाए, ऐसी मेरी अभी है।

उपसभापति: मंत्री जी अभी आप बोलेंगे या मिसेज आल्वा बोलेंगे और या दोनों बोलेंगे? आई विल एलाउ बोथ आफ यू।
... (व्यवधान) ...

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA:
Madam, we have the CBI Minister here. (Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:
Both will speak. He is the Leader of the House and the Home Minister. Both can speak. He promised that he will speak. If she does not speak, your allegation will be that she did not speak.

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PERSONNEL PUBLIC GRIEVANCES AND PENSION (SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA): I am just giving a clarification about the facts from the records concerning the resignation of Mr. Madhavan. The points will be answered by the hon. Home Minister, the Leader of the House.

SHRI P. UPENDRA: Not on voluntary retirement.

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA: Yes, I will say on voluntary retirement.

Shri Madhavan had made a representation for change in the recruitment rules for the post of Additional Director, CBI on 27-3-1992. The Representation has been sent to the Ministry of Home Affairs with the comments of the CBI Head Office. Since all the Central....

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: I am on a point of order.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:
No. on everything you cannot make a point of order. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY:
Madam, it has nothing to do with the resignation. (*Interruptions*) The hon. Minister is deliberately trying to mislead the House. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:
No. I am not permitting you. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: Madam, it is very unfair. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:
Just a minute, Mr. Bommai.

SHRI SOMAPPA R. BOMMAI (Orissa): Madam, I am on a point of order.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:
I am allowing you now. I will allow you later on. Please take your seat. Just a minute. There was a demand in this House from your side also that the Minister should come and speak. The Minister is yet to speak. I will permit her and give her all the protection to speak.

SHRI SOMAPPA R. BOMMAI:
Madam, I am on a point of order.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:
Let her finish, then, I will allow you.

SHRI SOMAPPA R. BOMMAI:
No. I am on a point of order.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:
I have given my ruling.

SHRI SOMAPPA R. BOMMAI:
On a point of order, Madam.

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA: What is your point of order?

SHRI SOMAPPA R. BOMMAI:
On a point of order, Madam.... (*Interruptions*).....

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:
Mr. Ahluwalia, let me hear his point or order. I think I can handle it.

SHRI SOMAPPA R. BOMMAI:
Madam, when Mr. Jaipal Reddy was speaking, you said that Mr. Madhavan is not a Member of this House and no allegation should be made against him.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:
But you named someone, not Mr. Madhavan.

SHRI SOMAPPA R. BOMMAI :
Please let me put the record straight.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :
You should hear me....(*Interruptions*).....Okay, after you speak, I will give my ruling. I will be thankful if Members do not interrupt me. Please let me handle the House; otherwise I am leaving and anybody can come and sit in the Chair. If you are not allowing my voice to be heard, it is not for me to hear anybody's voice....(*Interruptions*).....Please keep quiet for one minute.

SHRI SOMAPPA R. BOMMAI :
Madam, I am on a point of order.

Now the officer's background and his other applications cannot be raised here....(*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :
Let me hear what he is saying. I have a right to hear what he is objecting to.

SHRI SOMAPPA R. BOMMAI :
You can give your ruling. He has applied for early retirement. We do not know the reasons. What he did in the ten years of his services, why he has applied for change of rules—are these relevant here? Those things cannot be said here.... (*Interruptions*)....

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :
I will give my ruling on this. You see there are two points which you have mentioned in your point of order. One point was with regard to my observation that those people who were not here, I did not permit their names to be referred to. That was in relation to Mr. Dutta. If it was in relation to Mr. Madhavan, I would not have permitted anything to be discussed here but you people insisted that you wanted to

discuss about it, so, I allowed it. The Minister concerned has to reply about Mr. Madhvan. There are two different issues here, one is Mr. Madhvan and the other is Mr. Dutta. My application objection was in relation to Mr. Dutta and not in relation to Mr. Madhavan. So the Minister has a right to reply.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : Madam, I am on a point of order.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :
I will not allow any point of order till the Minister finishes her speech.

I won't allow you. This is the way that you do not want the Minister to be heard. I have to adjourn the House.
.....(*Interruptions*).... I am not allowing you.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : I am on a point of order.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :
No Point of order.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : I have a right to rise on a point of order.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Mr. Dipen Ghosh, please do not let it go on record as if you are not allowing the Minister to reply. It will be very bad for you not for me. Let her speak.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : I am on a point of order.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :
What is your point of order?

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : The point of order is even if you accept the issue relating to his resignation, alleged resignation or seeking premature retirement, from what I have heard.... (*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I did not hear what Mrs. Alva has said.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : She has said that he had sought modification of a rule and that was sent to the Home Ministry. It is not directly related to this issue.

... (Interruptions) ...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Mr. Abrar Ahmed, please sit down.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : She should not be allowed to bring in extraneous matters. That is my point of order.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : At the moment, she is the concerned Minister and she will answer it. It is within her competence and within her right to say whatever she wants to say before the House. When you are a Minister, I am sure you will do the same thing. So, let her speak, (Interruptions).

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : She is bringing in extraneous matter.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : It will be a disaster if a Communist is a Minister in this country. (Interruptions)

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : No Minister can be allowed to bring in extraneous matters.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Now, I have to adjourn the House. (Interruptions). There are no extraneous matters. You also brought many matters. There was the matter of the Foreign Minister who was not here. There was no question about it. Yes, Mrs. Alva.

SHRIMATI MARGAL

ALVA : Since all the Central organisations are affected by change in rules, it was referred to the Home Ministry and it will take some time to decide the main issue. Shri K. Madhavan has served notice addressed to the Secretariat, Department of Personnel and Training, Government of India, intimating that he would like to go into voluntary retirement from service with effect from 31st October with retirement benefits as are permissible under the rules. This was received by the Director, CBI, on the morning of 20th July 1992.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : To what date is it 31st July 1992.

SHRIMATI MARGAL

ALVA : On 20th July, Shri Madhavan met the Director when Shri Sethi, Additional Director, was present. He explained that he had taken a very conscious decision so that he could join the IAS profession. He, however, assisted the Director, CBI, and the AD, CBI, that he will continue to superintend effectively the seven bank scam cases which are in his charge. Presently, -- I mean, at that time he was in Bombay for supervision of the seven bank scam cases. In these seven cases, he is assisted by three DIGs exclusively along with a number of SSPs and IOs. Shri Madhavan was asked to specify the circumstances referred to in his notice for voluntary retirement. In his reply, he has stated that whenever any officer seeks voluntary retirement, there are always circumstances therefor. He said that for seeking voluntary retirement, the circumstances need to be mentioned in the notice. Therefore, he does not wish to put out the circumstances due to which he proposes to retire voluntarily. Subsequently, he told the Director, CBI, on phone, on the 24th morning that it was entirely for personal reasons.

reasons that he was seeking voluntary retirement. Shri Maudavan has been handling the bank scam case from the beginning. This is his area of work. He has been given full freedom to act and there has been no interference with his work. The Government has scanted all the additional strength for investigation of the cases as is required.

Thank you, Madam.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY :
Madam, I am on a point of order.

SHRI S.B. CHAVAN : Madam, *(In;erruptions)*.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :
The Leader of the House wants to say something. Let him say that.

उसके बाद वाइंट ऑफ ऑर्डर कर लीजिएगा

Although we have gone beyond the time allowed, I am not objecting to your making it. but let the Leader of the House say what he wants to. After all, you also wanted him to react.

SHRI S.B. CHAVAN : Madam. Deputy Chairperson, my colleague, Shri Alva... *(Interruptions)*.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :
She functions very efficiently. So, you you forget 'Shrimati'.

SHRI S.B. CHAVAN : Shrimati Alva gave the factual position as it stands. I must say, in fairness to all the hon. Members, that there is a limit up to which politics can be played in certain matters. There is a limit. In everything, if you feel that there is a political angle which you should try to take advantage of... *(Interruptions)*. Please sit down. I have heard everything of what you were saying. I know what the reasons are which, in fact, are impelling you to say certain things which some of the hon. Members are ware they need not pursue. But Mr. Jaipal Reddy was bold enough

to say that he is prepared to take full responsibility of the statement that he is making here. I am really surprised that, without knowing the facts, on the basis of newspaper reports, Mr. Jaipal Reddy, who is a very seasoned and very mature parliamentarian, should go to the extent of accepting full responsibility. It is something, which, in fact, I cannot possibly reconcile myself with. But, I would like to assure all the hon. Members that in accordance with every word of what the hon. Prime Minister has said on the floor of the this House, we are interested in seeing that we would do the maximum that is possible in order to ensure that corruption at different levels is eliminated. And you should try to help us out instead of trying to impute motives in almost everything that you find. It is very unfair. It is a small thing wherein papers were being put in by a certain officer and the matter is very clear. He said, "for personal reasons, he is resigning. He is voluntary resigning." *(Interruptions)*.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY :
Mr. Minister, what are those circumstances? *(Interruptions)*

SHRI S.B. CHAVAN : I have heard you without Interruptions. *(Interruptions.)*

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : Is it a small thing ? He is seeking voluntary retirement. Is it a small matter ? *(Interruptions)*.

SHRI S.B. CHAVAN : I think the body of the letter is very clear. He states : "Due to certain circumstances, I hereby give notice that I propose to voluntarily retire from service with effect from..." *(Interruptions)*.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY :
We would like to know what are those circumstances. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI S.B. CHAVAN : Let me have my say. Are you merely interested in seeing that whatever you have said should go to the people and not the Government-side ? Is it really the intention? It seems to be very obvious. You must have Patience to listen to the other side of the Picture also. I would like to inform the House that the Government has not interfered, the Government will not interfere and the Government is not at all interested in protecting any person, howsoever high he may be. For God's sake, have this in mind, try to believe what we say and don't try to impute motives unnecessarily. The Prime Minister has gone on record to say that howsoever high or powerful a person might be, if he is involved, he will never interfere in the matter and he will go to the extent of taking a stern action against him. In spite of that, if you are still questioning him that he has been trying to shield certain persons; that is why Mr. Madhavan has not been allowed to continue and the investigation is being proposed to be scuttled, I think this is not true. I should not use the word false but it is untrue. I cannot say false. I have to say that this is not true and if for personal reasons, he is retiring voluntarily, I cannot possibly say anything. This is also going to be effective from 31st October, 31st of October is the date when it is going to be effective (Interruptions). In the meanwhile, he is going to assist us. (Interruptions).

श्री सिकंदर बख्त : सदर साहेब, मैं चव्हाण साहब से एक गुजारिश करना चाहता हूँ। मेरी गुजारिश यह है कि इतने करप्शन के केसेज आज हिन्दुस्तान के सामने हैं, कितने करप्शन के केसेज में अब तक तहकीकात पूरी हुई है, उस बेकग्राउंड में, उस पसमंजर में, उस पृष्ठ भूमि में माधवन साहब का मौजूदा बयान जो हिन्दुस्तान के तमाम अखबारात में आया है

How do you propose to read that?

†[श्री सिकंदर बख्त : صدر صاحبہ - میں چران صاحب سے ایک گزارش کرنا چاہتا ہوں۔ میری گزارش یہ ہے کہ اتنے کرپشن کے کیسز آج ہلدر۔ تان کے سامنے ہیں کتنے کرپشن کے کیسز میں اب تک تحقیقات پوری ہوئی ہے۔ اس بیک گراؤنڈ میں۔ اس پسر منظر میں اس پرشتہ یہودی میں مادھو صاحب کا موجودہ بیان چر ہلدوستان کے تمام اخبارات میں آیا ہے۔]

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : That matter is over.

श्री एस. बी. चव्हाण : आपने जिस ढंग से उसको रीड करने का फैसला किया है उससे मैं आपको दूर जाने के लिए नहीं कह सकता हूँ। आपको इतना ही कहूँगा कि मेहरबानीकर के जरा इसकी (व्यवधान)

श्री सिकंदर बख्त : एक करप्शन का मामला अब तक साफ नहीं हो सका है और रमज एक नया करप्शन का मामला हमारे इस मुल्क के सामने आ रहा है। हम सिफ दावेदारियां करते हैं कि हम किसी करप्शन के मामले में एकावट नहीं डालेंगे। यह बहुत नामुराद सी बात है (व्यवधान)

†[श्री सिकंदर बख्त : ایک۔]

करप्शन का معاملہ اب تک صاف نہیں ہو سکا ہے اور روز ایک نیا کرپشن کا معاملہ ہمارے اس ملک میں سامنے آ رہا ہے۔ ہم صرف دعویٰ دریاں کرتے ہیں۔ کہ ہم کسی کرپشن کے معاملے میں رکوٹ نہیں ڈالیں گے۔ یہ بہت نامورک سی بات ہے (مداخلت)।

मोलाना अब्दुल्ला खान आजमी (उत्तर प्रदेश) मैडम :... (व्यवधान)...

†[मोलانا عبید اللہ خان اعظمی :

میدم (مداخلت) ...]

£[J Transliteration in Arabic Scrip t

उपसभापति : आप बैठिये ।
I have got the name of Shukla Ji.
He has to lay the papers.

SHRI INDER KUMAR GUJRAL (Bihar) : Madam, give me a minute.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Shukla Ji, he wants one minute. Don't take more than one minute. In fact, we were to adjourn at 1:00 p.m.

SHRI INDER KUMAR GUJRAL : Let me start, Madam. I will take a minute but after I start. Madam, I fully sympathise with the predicament of the Government. I do understand....(Interruptions).

SHRI MADAN BHATIA : What is the predicament ? (Interruptions).

SHRI S.K.T. RAMACHANDRAN : We are on the right track. (Interruptions).

SHRI INDER KUMAR GUJRAL : I don't question the bonafides of the statement made by the Minister here and I accept those bonafides. I accept that the Prime Minister is very keen to go to the root of the problem. I accept that. Now, an account has been given—in some papers, I think, in all of them, details have been given as to what the cases were. Does the hon. Home Minister feel or does not feel that it is in Government's own interest to keep up that promise that they have made to this House and the other House that the scam enquiry does not stop halfway ? And if some officer....(Interruptions) Just a minute. If some officer.. (Interruptions)...

If some officer..(Interruptions)... I am not naming any officer. If some officer..(Interruptions)...

श्री राम नरेश यादव (उत्तर प्रदेश) : उपसभापति महोदया, जे.पी.सी. तो जांच करेगी सारे मामले की इसलिए इस बात को उठाने का कोई औचित्य नहीं है (व्यवधान)

उपसभापति : मुझे लगता है कि चव्हाण साहब ने जो कहा है वह बात सुनाई नहीं दी है । उन्होंने यही बात कही है ... (व्यवधान)

Now we will have....(Interruptions)

Now we have to...(Interruptions)...

SHRI INDER KUMAR GUJRAL : Madam let me finish. Madam please let me finish my point. If some officer... (Interruptions)... Let me finish. If some officer or a machinery or a system has been put into motion to make enquiries some steps have been taken some arrests have been made. it is not in the Government's interest to derail that process not by itself but even by the circumstances which is not in the Government's interest. I would urge the Government... (Interruptions)... I am not naming anybody... (Interruptions)... I am not naming anybody. (Interruptions)

SHRI R.K. DHAWAN : If Madhavan falls ill They will say "Don't fall sick." (Interruptions)

SHRI INDER KUMAR GUJRAL : No. I am not naming anybody. I am only asking this, "Is it or it is not in the Government's interest to see that the process that has been put into motion and the action that has taken, do not get derailed and the whole scam is unravelled ?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Yes, Mr. Shukla. (Interruptions)

SHRI S. B. CHAVAN : We are not interested in derailing the matters, but I can't force anybody against his will not to go on voluntary retirement. There have been thousands of cases where the voluntary retirement has been accepted.

(Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Now that matter is closed. Shri V. C. Shuklaji.

SHRI MADAN BHATIA : Under the rules the Government cannot compel any Member of the ... (Interruptions) ...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : He is saying it. Baba, he is saying it. Shuklaji.

THE MINISTER OF WATER RESOURCES (SHRI V. C. SHUKLA) : Madam, I am sorry I was not present when you called me for laying the Papers.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : He is apologising.

PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE— Contd.

I. Report and Accounts (1990-91) of the National Water Development Agency New Delhi and related papers

II. Notification of the Ministry of Water Resources

THE MINISTER OF WATER RESOURCES (SHRI V. C. SHUKLA) : Madam, with your permission I am laying on the Table :—

I. A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers :—

(i) Annual Report and Accounts of the National

water Development Agency New Delhi, for the year 1990-91, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.

(ii) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (i) above. (Placed in Library. See No. LT 2304/92)

(ii) A copy (in English and Hindi) of the Ministry of Water Resources Notification G.S.R. No. 143 dated the 21st March, 1992 Publishing the Brahmaputra Board (Amendment) Rules 1992, under section 30 of the Brahmaputra Board Act, 1980. (Placed in Library. See No. LT-12360/92).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : The House is adjourned for lunch till 2.30 P.M.

The House then adjourned for lunch at twenty-three minutes past one of the clock.

The House reassembled after lunch thirty minutes past two of the clock.

The Vice Chairman (Shri Jagesh Desai) in the Chair.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI) : Motion for election to the Central Advisory Board of Archaeology.

श्री सुन्दर सिंह भंडारी (राजस्थान) :
यह तो ढाई बजे के बाद .. (व्यवधान) ..

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI) : Don't worry about that. I will extend the time to that extent. I have got three motions. I will extend the time to that extent which is taken for the purpose of motions.