

line has been questioned by academics and other independent organizations. They say that a lot of window-dressing has been done, because according to the World Economic Survey, 40 per cent of the world's certified poor are living in India. Prof. Minhaus, a former Planning Commission Member, has made a survey and, according to his survey, about 45 per cent of the people are living below the poverty line. According to an independent organization, more than 50 per cent of the people are living below the poverty line. Therefore, I would like to know from the hon. Minister why is the discrepancy. Have you made any window-dressing in the accounts? Otherwise, how could that differ from organization to organization and from academician to academician?

SHRI SUKH RAM: Madam, we are not depending upon the reports of the world organization. We are depending upon our own organization, that is, the Indian Sample Survey Organization which conducts a survey and makes estimates once in an interval of five years. I have already conceded this point that there have been suggestions and a number of scholars and experts have suggested some different methodologies and, for that purpose, a committee of experts has already been constituted and that is looking into this entire problem. If the hon. Member wants to make any suggestion to that committee, we will welcome that also. Your suggestion will also be welcome. ... (Interruptions) ...

श्री मोहम्मद सलीम : मैडम, गरीबी की सीमा रेखा के नीचे रहने वाले लोगों के आंकड़ों को लेकर सरकार काफी खेलती रही है, प्लानिंग कमिशन या बजट में रुपये का आंकड़ा गरीबी की सीमा रेखा के नीचे रहने वाले लोगों के लिए बढ़ता गया और उनके नीचे संख्या भी बढ़ती गई है। मैं माननीय मंत्री जी से पूछना चाहता हूँ कि नई नीति के आधार पर पिछले एक साल में गरीबी की रेखा के नीचे रहने वाले लोगों की तादाद कितनी संख्या में बढ़ी है, क्या इस बारे में मंत्री महोदय बतायेंगे?

श्री मोहम्मद सलीम : मैडम, गरीबी की सीमा रेखा के नीचे रहने वाले लोगों के आंकड़ों को लेकर सरकार काफी खेलती रही है। प्लानिंग कमिशन या बजट में रुपये का आंकड़ा गरीबी की सीमा रेखा के नीचे रहने वाले लोगों के लिए बढ़ता गया और उनके नीचे संख्या भी बढ़ती गई है। मैं माननीय मंत्री जी से पूछना चाहता हूँ कि नई नीति के आधार पर पिछले एक साल में गरीबी की रेखा के नीचे रहने वाले लोगों की तादाद कितनी संख्या में बढ़ी है, क्या इस बारे में मंत्री महोदय बतायेंगे?

श्री सुखराम : मैडम, मेरे को शायद माननीय सदस्य ने ठीक ढंग से सुना नहीं था। समझने की कोशिश नहीं की है।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The Question Hour is over. Now Short Notice Question. Shri Inder Kumar Gujaral. ... (Interruptions)

This is in continuation of the Question Hour—the Short Notice Question. Shri Inder Kumar Gujaral.

SHORT NOTICE QUESTION NO. 1

Access to Eighth Plan Documents by World Bank

1. **SHRI INDER KUMAR GUJARAL:**†

SHRI SOMAPPA R. BOMMAT:
Will the Minister of **PLANNING AND PROGRAMME IMPLEMENTATION** be please to state:

(a) whether Government's attention has been drawn to a write-up appearing

† [] Transliteration in Arabic Script.

† The question was asked on the floor of the House by Shri Inder Kumar Gujaral.

in the *Indian Express* of the 16th July, 1992 that Eighth Plan documents were shown to and commented upon by the World Bank before the Parliament took cognizance of it; and

(b) if so, the reasons therefor?

THE MINISTER OF STATE OF THE MINISTRY OF PLANNING AND PROGRAMME IMPLEMENTATION AND MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF NON CONVENTIONAL ENERGY SOURCES (SHRI SUKH RAM): (a) and (b) Yes, Sir, The report is not correct. The 8th Plan document was approved by the National Development Council (NDC) in its 44th meeting held on May 22-23 of this year. Thereafter it was not a secret or confidential document. The Planning Commission has not given a copy of the document to the World Bank, nor has the Commission received comments from the Bank. The question of making amendments to the document after approval by the NDC does not arise. The document has already been circulated among the Members of Parliamentary Consultative Committee attached to the Ministry for its meeting held on July 6, 1992 and will be laid before the Parliament as in the past as soon as it is printed.

SHRI INDER KUMAR GUJRAL: Madam, the hon. Member's reply is bland and also equally depressing. The statement which he has acknowledged has been made by a very responsible journalist very categorically. It does not say "showed" it says "shared" with the World Bank. Then it proceeds to mention about the comments on it. May I ask him if he has checked up with the Secretary, Planning Commission, if the World Bank passed on their comments to him?

SHRI SUKH RAM: Madam, it is very unfortunate that the hon. Member with such a vast experience, is depending on the report of a reputed journalist, but he is not depending on the facts which I have stated in the House. If the hon. Member has gone into, or seen, the report, then, it says that before the Eighth Five-Year Plan document was shown to Indian Parliament, the World Bank had been

given access to it. This report starts from this sentence.

Now, I have made it clear that it is confidential only upto the time when the NDC puts its seal on this document. After the NDC has approved this document, it is not a secret document, it is not a confidential document.

I have already verified from all the agencies, from the Secretary, and it is only with reference to the Press report. The World Bank has also sent a communication that they never sent any comments to the Planning Commission. I ascertained from the Finance Ministry also. They have also apprised us, written to us that they never gave any document to the World Bank. I do not know the internal working of the World Bank. If something has been written about the Eighth Five-Year Plan in their internal working, I am not aware of it. But the question is whether any change — I am not aware of that — has been according to the World Bank's suggestion, whether we have made any change in our policy or in the Plan document according to their suggestion. Then only would it have been derogatory.

SHRI INDER KUMAR GUJRAL: The days of which the hon. Minister is talking are somewhat outdated. There were days when these documents were not shown to the World Bank. Those days are now gone. Now we are working under the conditionalities imposed by the World Bank. If we go to the details that were given comments on, those pertain to 'methodology of the Plan', they pertain to the 'old shibboleths', 'unrealistic' and 'over-ambitions'. I am quoting within quotes. It also talks of 'conditionalities'; it also talks of fiscal adjustments; it also talks of the rolling back of subsidies; it talks of the production in various sections in agriculture; it talks of industrial policy and it talks of the deficits. But the Minister would make us believe that all these are innocent documents of which he is not aware and that he has not taken note of. I am asking a simple question now. Has he read in the press the statement and comments with quotes and unquotes on

all these documents? If you want I will pass on a copy to him. Has the Planning Commission taken the trouble of making a detailed survey and also making a detailed statement to the public that these quotes and unquotes do not conform with the Government's present policy?

SHRI SUKH RAM: The main question which was agitated in both the Houses was that the Planning Commission made the Plan document available to the World Bank and that that was derogatory to our dignity and that the sovereignty of Parliament was damaged. These were the attacks. Now, the hon. Member says that the World Bank has made certain comments. My submission is that after this document had been approved by the NDC, it had become a public document. There was no secrecy about it. The Deputy Chairman of the Planning Commission had made available to the press a summary of the Eighth Five-Year Plan and there have been comments on the Eighth Five-Year Plan. *(Interruptions)* Anybody is at liberty to make any comment after it had been approved by the NDC.

SHRI INDER KUMAR GUJRAL: The World Bank cannot be 'anybody'.

SHRI SUKH RAM: I cannot say about it. You may be knowing better about the World Bank. What comments the World Bank has made that has appeared in the press. They may be at liberty to make any comment about our Plan document. I cannot make any comment about that. But as far as the secrecy of the document is concerned, this has not been breached. Now, whatever comments are coming, we are taking note of those. I may make it clear that we are not guided by the World Bank in preparing the Eighth Five-Year Plan or any other policy document.

SHRI SOMAPPA R. BOMMAI: The hon. Minister has said that the draft Plan proposal was not given by the Government to the World Bank. Our experience with this Government recently is that letters have been given without records, instructions are given or sought

without records and there is a growing public opinion in the country that the Plan documents and the Budgetary proposals are scrutinised by the World Bank and are ultimately tailored to suit the conditionalities of the World Bank. If this Government cannot keep the secrecy of the Government, may I know from the Minister why the Draft Plan can't be released to the public so that there is a national debate and we can give opinions, so that the Government can improve upon its Draft Plan? I would like to know if he would change his policy in regard to the Budgetary and Plan Documents. There is nothing harmful about it. Let the public know about it. Will the Government change its policy?

SHRI SUKH RAM: Madam, what is the experience of the hon. Member, well, I cannot challenge it. In a way it is a personal matter. My only submission, which I have been trying to explain, is that I am saying something here with full responsibility. After ascertaining all the facts, I am placing them before this honourable House. These are the facts. If you have got some documents or some information in your to session... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: Madam, he goes on commenting on the seniority of Mr. Gujral, on the seniority of Mr. Bommai. Are we going to listen to homilies from the Minister? We do not want that commentary from him. He can answer the facts and* of his place... *(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Don't use such words. I won't allow it.

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: He should not use such words... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: Have you heard him making derogatory comments on Mr. Gujral, derogatory comments on Mr. Bommai? Who is he? He is not in his chamber. He is in Parliament. He must know how to submit before Parliament. We are not going to tolerate his**

*Not recorded

**Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

We are not going to tolerate it. The Minister must know how to behave himself. We are not going to tolerate it... (Interruptions)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Morarka, please don't use such expression... (Interruptions)... Order please.

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: Madam, these words "*" should be expunged from the record. We have never heard these words "*" should be expunged... (Interruptions)...

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: All right, I said it. What is unparliamentary about "*" ? What is wrong with it? Madam, please go into the record. I stand by every word of what I have said... (Interruptions)... After the Question Hour, we also * and he can also get out.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Just a minute.

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: We have never heard such words before in the House.

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: Don't teach me parliamentary etiquettes.

SHRI S.K.T. RAMACHANDRAN: He has no business to ask the Minister to... (Interruptions)...

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: I have no objection if the Minister does not want to *, he can sleep here. But he has no business to comment on Mr. Gujral and on Mr. Bommai. I take serious exception to it.

SHRI R. K. DHAWAN: Why are you bothered?

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: Even if he comments on Mr. Dhawan, I have to bother. That is the point... (Interruptions)...

It is everybody's concern.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Leave it to me. I can handle it... (Interruptions)

Mr. Dhawan, will you please take your seat? Please leave it to me... (Interruptions)...

SHRI R. K. DHAWAN: He is totally wrong... (Interruptions)...

*Not recorded.

श्री शंकर दयाल सिंह : मैडम, उनको बिठाइए नहीं तो हम लोगों को उठना पड़ेगा... (व्यवधान)... हम को भी उठना पड़ेगा। यह कोई तरीका नहीं है। इस बहस की शुरुआत मंत्री जी और माननीय सदस्य कमल मोरारका में हो रही है... (व्यवधान)... यह खड़े हो गए... (व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I said, I will look into the record.

SHRI VITHALRAO MADHAVRAO JADHAV: Madam, he has no business to use such words against the Minister. ... (Interruptions)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Krishna Kumar, will you please sit down? ... (Interruptions)...

SHRI SHANKAR DAYAL SINGH: Madam, this is not the way. You should control them.

उपसभापति : अच्छा अब आप लोग बैठ जाइए। आप मेरी बात सुनिए, बैठिए।

I know that you are agitated... (Interruptions) Please sit down... (Interruptions)... When I tell you to listen to me, you don't listen. Then, how is he going to listen to me?... (Interruptions)... Don't get agitated. Please sit down.

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: It is very unfortunate that Mr. Kamal Morarka has used such an expression.

श्री शंकर दयाल सिंह : मैडम; यह कोई तरीका नहीं है... (व्यवधान) अगर मंत्री महोदय से गलती हुई है तो उन्हें माफी मांगनी चाहिए।

उपसभापति : आप बैठिए।

श्री शंकर दयाल सिंह : महोदय, अगर मंत्री महोदय समझते हैं कि... (व्यवधान) तो उनको माफी मांगनी चाहिए इसके लिए।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Don't use the words * ' We have never used them.

इसमें माफी और उसका सवाल नहीं है,
एक मिनट,

I am not permitting. One minute, Mr. Gujral.

SHRI INDER KUMAR GUJRAL: It is very strange. Madam, whatever the Minister may or may not have said, I don't think it is serious.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now let us go ahead on a good note. Say that you don't mean it. you were agitated. That is all. Okay. That is all.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: He has disowned the advocate.

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: Madam, he must take back his words. It is very unfortunate that Mr. Kamal Morarka:.. (Interruptions).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It is over. That matter is over now. (Interruptions). I am capable of handling it. Will you please sit down?

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PETROLEUM AND NATURAL GAS WITH ADDITIONAL CHARGE OF MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF DEFENCE (SHRI S. KRISHNA KUMAR): Is it going on record?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will look into the record. I have said that I am the custodian of the record. (Interruptions).

SHRI S. KRISHNA KUMAR: Then we are at liberty to ask anybody to...*

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: Madam, I used an English phrase which has been misunderstood. I did not tell the Minister to...*. Only you can do that. I cannot do that.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I won't do that. And those words of Mr. Morarka will not go on record.

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: I am only saying that he can answer the question and...*. I amend it to 'go out'. He

can answer the question and go out. This cannot be objectionable. (Interruptions).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: When I am standing, all of you, please sit down; not only sit down, but please keep quiet. Mr. Morarka, I do not know why you suddenly got agitated. The Minister is answering the question at great length.

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM: He has not answered it.

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY: That is the point. He has not answered it. (Interruptions).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: May I ask what behaviour is this? There are other phrases also in the English language. Reasonably, you could say, 'The Minister can leave', if you want him to leave. But that is my job, not yours. When you are elected to this place, you may do that. But, just now, please.... (Interruptions). I have got supplementaries. Mr. Subramanian Swamy.

SHRI SUKH RAM: Madam, I still fail to understand what infuriated Mr. Morarka. (Interruptions).

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: Madam, again.... (Interruptions). Please tell him to mind his own business. (Interruptions). He fails to understand the main question. How can he understand me? He does not understand the question at all. How will he understand me?

SHRI ASHIS SEN: Madam, in spite of your saying that the matter is over, again the Minister is provoking Mr. Morarka.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Morarka's question is coming much later. Before that, there are many people.

भाप बोम्मई साहब का जवाब दें ।

SHRI SUKH RAM: I was replying to the question raised by Mr. Bommai. (Interruptions). And, he made certain allegations against the Government. He has said that we are being guided by the World Bank and this has been the experience there. I simply said, "It may be your experience." But, as far

*Not recorded.

[Shri Sukh Ram]

as I know, I am simply stating in this House what are the facts. If this is also not to be tolerated by hon. Member, what can I do? I have not uttered a single word which has injured the feeling of Mr. Morarka or Mr. Bommai.

SHRI R. K. DHAWAN: Ever since he lost the Ministry, his feeling has been injured.

उपसभापति : अभी वह सवाल का जवाब पूरा हो जाए, उसके पश्चात् ।

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: Madam, he is giving a personal explanation.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Even personal explanations cannot be given without my permission. That is the rule.

मंत्री जी, आप अपना जवाब मेरी तरफ देखकर बोलिए तो झगड़ा नहीं होगा आप इधर-उधर देखते हैं ।

SHRI SUKH RAM: I have categorically denied. Neither the Planning Commission has been guided by the World Bank, nor any confidential document was made available to the World Bank. After the NDC approval, when this Eighth Five-Year Plan document became a public document, there was no secrecy about it. Therefore, anybody, within the country or outside the country, any organisation, may comment anything on that. But Parliament is supreme and we are placing this document, this Eight Five-Year Plan document, before both the Houses of Parliament. (Interruptions).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: This is not the way. You read the answer, please. Then you would know what is given in the written answer.

SHRI SUKH RAM: At that time, Members will have an opportunity to comment upon our document. I have already made my position clear. If still any doubt persists, what can I do?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Subramanian Swamyji, does a doubt still persist? (Interruptions). Mr. Bommai, he has answered whatever he can.

SHRI SOMAPPA R. BOMMAI: Madam, let me put my second supplementary.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You don't have a second supplementary. You have only one.

SHRI SOMAPPA R. BOMMAI: He has not answered my question.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Bommai, you had only one supplementary. (Interruptions). Don't interrupt. Don't make this a habit. That is why running of this House has become difficult because I am not heard.

SHRI SOMAPPA R. BOMMAI: Madam, is the Government prepared to change the policy so that all the plan documents, including the budgetary documents, are made public so that there will be a national debate? (Interruptions)... That is the question I asked. Is the Government thinking of changing its policy?

SHRI SUKH RAM: Madam, there cannot be any change after the Plan document has been approved by the NDC. It is only when we place the documents before both Houses of Parliament... (Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no. I am not permitting.

SHRI SOMAPPA R. BOMMAI: He has not answered my question. (Interruptions).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am not permitting anything except Mr. Subramanian Swamy. (Interruption). Mr. Bommai, you are a very senior Member. I don't take it as a derogatory remark. I am saying that there is a procedure in this House. (Interruptions) Mr. Jadhav, you are also a Member of this House and the rule applies to you also. I said, the rule applies to you also. Take your seat. Don't interrupt the House. It is a very bad habit and I am very sorry about it. The thing is that the question was in the name of Mr. Gujral. I allowed him two supplementaries. I also permitted you to give an

explanation which you thought you didn't give. Now, I have other Members also. At the same time, we have other business also.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: Madam Deputy Chairman, in view of the fact that the press report seems to be based on a document circulated by the World Bank at the Paris meet of the Consortium—that is the country report on India which is supposed to be confidential—I would like to know whether the Minister has seen this document himself and whether he is prepared to place that document, from which these quotations are made, on the Table of the House.

SHRI SUKH RAM: I have already submitted that neither we made any document available to the World Bank. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: Have you seen the World Bank document circulated in the Paris meet of the Consortium and are you willing to place it on the Table of the House so that we can... *(Interruptions)*

SHRI SUKH RAM: Neither I have seen it nor I am in a position to get hold of the document from the World Bank. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: No, no. Our Finance Secretary, Mr. Ahluwalia, was present there in that meeting and the copy was given to the Indian Government. I would like to know whether you will place that report on the Table of the House. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI SUKH RAM: As far as the Planning Commission is concerned... *(Interruptions)*

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: Madam, I need your protection now. You have been protecting everybody. There is a document of the World Bank from which the *Indian Express* has made quotations. That has been made available to the Government of India in the Paris meet of the Consortium when the Consortium meeting took place in May 1992, that is, this year. The Expenditure Secretary, Mr. Ahluwalia, was sent there.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Not our Ahluwalia.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: Mr. Montek Singh Ahluwalia went there on behalf of the Minister of Finance and the report as given there and circulated there. I would like to know whether the Minister has seen that document and whether he will place that report on the Table of the House so that we can satisfy ourselves that the *Indian Express* quotation are wrong.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The Minister said that he has not seen that document.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: Then he has come unprepared to the House.

SHRI SUKH RAM: I have not seen that document.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Neither he has seen that report nor he was there.

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: The whole question is based on that.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He was not there in Paris. How could he see that?

SHRI SUKH RAM: Madam, I am not aware about what circulated by the World Bank at the Paris meet of the Consortium. But for argument's sake, even if it was circulated, I don't concede this point. The only relevant point is, at what point of time it was done, whether it was done before the NDC's approval or it was done after the NDC's approval. The N.D.C. approval was given... *(interruptions)*...

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: Madam, please direct him to place it on the Table... *(interruptions)*...

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: When I said, "I am angry", he is surprised why I am angry.

SHRI SUKH RAM: Mr. Morarka, I am not new to this House, that you understand.

SHRI JAGESH DESAI: If any suggestion or advice comes from any quarter, whether it is from the World Bank or any other organisation, and if it is in the interest of the country, there is nothing wrong in accepting it. I would

like to know from you, Mr. Minister, since the comments have appeared in the press, at what point of time these comments had been made by the World Bank, whether it was before you put the report in the Consultative Committee or afterwards, and if it was earlier, then whether the Government will make an inquiry and find out from what source they got this kind of document and on which date they had made the comments. I would like to know whether the Government will make an inquiry about it.

SHRI SUKH RAM: I have already made an inquiry about it before coming to this House, from the Finance Ministry, from my own Planning Ministry, that this document was not made available to the World Bank before the approval by the NDC and for the NDC we cyclostyled about 600 copies and made available these copies to all the Chief Ministers, to all the Secretaries of the Government of India and to all the Ministers and we had requested all of them that this document was only for the official use. So I satisfied myself that it was not...*(interruptions)*...

SHRI JAGESH DESAI: Madam, that was not my question. What I wanted to know was if the comments were received earlier than you gave to the Chief Ministers or the Consultative Committee, whether you enquired as to how they got the report. That is all I wanted to know.

SHRI SUKH RAM: We have not given it earlier. There is no question of it and I have made inquiries and I have satisfied myself.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: Madam, how can he say categorically when he doesn't know that the document exists? The May-document which was circulated to the Consortium countries in which the Indian Secretary was present has not been given to the planning Minister. He doesn't know what is available with the Government of India. So how can he be so categorical? Ask him to make...*(interruption)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I don't think he was Planning Minister then.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: No, it does not matter. Government is continuing. It is not that...*(Interruption)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, he took the oath very recently. He is sure...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: Madam, it is not that. Let him say that he will make inquiries whether such a document exists and that he will place it on the Table. Let him make that much commitment that he is being kept in the dark and that he will find out whether such a document exists...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SUKH RAM: There is no question of making an inquiry. That NDC approval was...*(Interruptions)*... Let the hon. Member...*(Interruptions)*... Let the hon. Member tell me on which date that meeting took place and when it was circulated.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: Your Finance Minister is sitting there. He knows about it. This Consortium meeting in Paris took place in May this year...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SUKH RAM: And it was approved by the NDC in the third week of May.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: It was before that. This meeting of Consortium in Paris took place before the NDC meeting.

SHRI SUKH RAM: Well, as far as the Planning Commission is concerned, I made my position clear that it was not made available to anybody before the NDC meeting.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Salve...*(Interruptions)*... No, I think we have had enough discussion.

AN HON. MEMBER: No, Madam.

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: Madam, I want to seek a very small supplementary.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have your name. Mr. Salve.

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: Madam, may be, technically what the Minister says must be correct factually, in point of time it may not have been given. Why are you shy of admitting, you and the Finance...

Ministry, that the entire economic policies are being formulated in consultation with the World Bank and the IMF. ... (Interruptions) ... They are your creditors and you are consulting them and they are telling you what ought to be the limits of deficit financing or they tell you what should be the growth of borrowed money.

SHRI JAGESH DESAI: Madam, I strongly object to this. Credit cannot decide our economic policies. I take strong objection to Mr. Salve's remark. It is an insult to the country...

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: Madam, I am saying... (Interruption)... Jageshji did not hear me... (Interruptions)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Desai, you did not hear him properly.

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: Madam, I said, "You are determining your economic policy in consultation with the World Bank and the I.M.F." (Interruptions)

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: No, no. The Prime Minister made it very clear on that day... (Interruptions)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Okay. Now you put your question.

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE: Madam, I cannot be cowed down because I am talking on a subject I know about. (Interruptions)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Put your question, please. (Interruptions)...

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: Madam, I am talking on a subject I know about. Have they not determined what ought to be the fiscal deficit? May I ask any one of them: What are the ingredients of a fiscal deficit? If they are going to determine what loan we will take, if they are going to determine what is going to be our budgetary deficit...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Will you please put your supplementary?

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE: ... are we not discussing this matter with them? All that I want to submit is...

श्री शान्ति त्वाणी : कर्जा लिया है, सोवरेनिटी नहीं बेची हमने ।

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE: Tyagiji, you are a respected Member. I am as much worried about the party as you are worried. Therefore, I am asking a question. The nation is above the party sometimes. Therefore, I am asking a question whether or not, Mr. Minister, what was contained in the document was discussed with the IMF or the World Bank by you or the Finance Minister. If you have not discussed, you may say so. If you don't know whether the Finance Minister had discussed or not, you may say so.

SHRI SUKH RAM: Madam, as far as the Plan document is concerned, while preparing this document and formulating the policies contained in it we neither have consulted the World Bank authorities nor have we been guided by the World Bank authorities. I can only say about this Plan document. I cannot say about the other matters you have raised such as financial matters and others. I am not concerned about them. You may put those questions to the right quarters. As far as the Plan document is concerned, I again emphatically state here that we have not been guided by the World Bank policy. This is our own Plan and this Government has framed this Plan.

SHRI SUKOMAL SEN: Madam, the Minister's position is pathetic. He is in a quandary.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, you ask your question. No comments, please. I have already got a lot of problem.

SHRI SUKOMAL SEN: Madam, I fully support what Mr. Salve has said. The Minister is repeatedly saying about the seal being put by the NDC and there is no secret about it. I would like to know from the hon. Minister specifically whether before the NDC meeting or after the NDC meeting, at any stage—even at the preparatory stage of the Eighth Plan, approach paper—there was any consultation by the Government—either by the Finance Ministry or the Planning Ministry

[Shri Sukomal Sen]

—with the World Bank and whether any document by the World Bank exists on our Plan. A specific reply to that should come from the hon. Minister, Madam.

SHRI SUKH RAM: Madam, I have stated it a number of times and I still state that the letter which I have received from the Finance Ministry stated that the document was not made available to the World Bank either before the NDC approval or after the NDC approval. It is there. The World Bank, with reference to the press report, has sent up a communication stating that they have not sent any comment to the Planning Commission. So, these are the facts available with me. I can speak only on the basis of these facts. But if the hon. Members have something else, how can I help them?

SHRI SUKOMAL SEN: I would like to know whether such a document exists or not.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, I think, he has made his position very clear. Whatever facts he has put it before the House. Now, Mr. Morarka. You have asked so many questions in between, unofficially.

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: I was only defending the hon. Members.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You are creating heat in the House.

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: Madam, my supplementary is very small. I don't want to enlarge the scope of this question to economic sovereignty and other things. The specific question was in relation to an Indian Express report whether the World Bank was taken into confidence about the Eighth Plan before the Parliament was taken into confidence. The reply says "No". But further in the answer he says that the Plan document is yet to be placed in the Parliament. Even today it is not placed in the Parliament. He says on 6th July it was circulated to the Members of the Consultative Committee. Suppose we accept it for the sake of this argument. Then he says of another

date. On 22nd and 23rd May the NDC approved it after which it is a public document. Madam, even conceding that—NDC is not Parliament; they are two distinct entities—the Paris meeting was held on 19th of May. Before the NDC put its approval on the Eighth Plan the World Bank has circulated its comments to the Indian Government in Paris on 19th May. It is three days before the NDC gave its approval. It is three days before it became a public document. Then the question should have been answered by the Finance Minister. He is present here. I would like him to enlighten us how on earth the World Bank has commented on the Eighth Plan which was yet to be approved by the NDC. How does the Government of India accept such a position? That is my clear and precise point.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: This question is in the name of the Planning Ministry. The Planning Minister was not a Minister at that time... *(Interruptions)* You cannot ask the Finance Minister... *(Interruptions)*.

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: How can it be?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You have not heard me.

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: Mr. Bhardwaj was also here just now.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You have not heard me. I cannot allow the Finance Minister to interfere with the question which is being tabled to the Planning Ministry. Otherwise there will be no limit to the question.

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS AND MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI M. M. JACOB): Madam, Rule 58 is very clear. A question must be put to the Minister concerned. You cannot go against Rule 58. *(Interruptions)*.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The Planning Minister has answered it but you are not satisfied. *(Interruptions)*. He had the inclination; I gave the time. What else do you want?

SHRI SUKH RAM: Mr. Morarka has put a question and he has given the reply

to that question himself. According to him the meeting of the World Bank was held on 19th May. I am not aware of that.

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: If he is not aware, the whole question collapses because the whole news item is based on that. If he is not aware of it, how can he answer?

SHRI SUKH RAM: Will you please listen to me?

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: No, I don't want to listen to you. You cannot force me to listen to you.

SHRI SUKH RAM: Or have you monopolized speaking in Parliament?

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: If you don't want to listen to him then why are you putting questions?

उपसभापति : मंत्री जी आप मुझ से कह दीजिए, मैं बता दूंगी। ... (व्यवधान)

SHRI SUKH RAM: I take full responsibility for the past events also. I am not shrinking. I am not saying that I was not a Minister at that time. What I say is, on the basis of records I say that the Finance Minister also has very categorically stated in the letter which I have received that they did not receive any comment of the World Bank before the NDC approval or after the NDC approval.

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: How can he say before or after? If it is before the approval then it is a serious matter.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He says that he did not receive that before or after. The matter is closed now.

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: He is not aware of it. Let him find out the facts and come back to the House.

SHRI SUKH RAM: Will the hon. Member be satisfied if I say whatever he wants me to say?

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: Please find out the facts and come back to the House; then I will be satisfied. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI SUKH RAM: I have stated a number of times that we also in the Planning Commission have not received any comment of the World Bank.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That closes the matter. The matter is closed now. Now Papers to be laid on the Table.

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर : बरुड बैंक के कमेंट्स आप से मेल खाते हैं ... (व्यवधान)

उपसभापति : मंत्री जी को बोलने दीजिए ... (व्यवधान) । इनका जवाब देने की कोई आवश्यकता नहीं है । कुछ रहा ही नहीं है तो क्या जवाब देंगे? ... (व्यवधान)

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर : मैं अपनी पार्टी की ओर से ... (व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: This is not a matter of any party. We are not having any discussion. Mr. Mathur, this was a question. There is no question of any party. Please don't bring parties into it. It was an extension of the Question Hour.