

**Status of Implementation of Recommendations contained in the Sixty-third
report of Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Finance**

THE MINISTER OF CORPORATE AFFAIRS (SHRI PREM CHAND GUPTA): Sir, I make Statement regarding status of implementation of recommendations contained in the Sixty-third Report of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Finance. [Placed in Library. See No. L.T. 9544/09]

**Status of Implementation of Recommendations contained in the Ninth Report of the Department-
related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Water Resources**

जल संसाधन मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (श्री जय प्रकाश नारायण यादव): महोदय, मैं विभाग-संबंधित जल संसाधन संबंधी संसदीय स्थायी समिति के नौवें प्रतिवेदन में अंतर्विष्ट सिफारिशों के कार्यान्वयन की स्थिति के संबंध में एक वक्तव्य सभा पटल पर रखता हूँ। [Placed in Library. See No. 9648/08]

**Status of Implementation of recommendations contained in the Twentieth
Report of Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee
on Petroleum and Natural Gas**

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PETROLEUM AND NATURAL GAS (SHRI DINSHA J. PATEL): Sir, I make Statement regarding status of implementation of recommendations contained in the Twentieth Report of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Petroleum and Natural Gas. [Placed in Library. See No. L.T. 9516/08]

MATTERS RAISED WITH PERMISSION

Allotment of Spectrum

DR. V. MAITREYAN (Tamil Nadu): Sir, the spectrum scandal, the greatest ever scandal in the recent past, is in news. The Union Telecommunication Minister, Mr. A. Raja, has been charged with having allotted 2G spectrum for mobile services on a first-cum-first-served basis rather than going for a global auction. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI KANIMOZHI (Tamil Nadu): Sir, ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please don't disturb. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please don't disturb. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI VASANTHI STANLEY (Tamil Nadu): Sir, ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please don't disturb. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please don't disturb. ...*(Interruptions)*... This has been allowed. ...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. K. MALAISAMY (Tamil Nadu): Sir, this is an important matter. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please don't disturb. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*... Why are you coming here? ...*(Interruptions)*... You all please sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please sit down. He has been allowed by the Chairman. Please don't disturb. The Member has the right to raise any matter with the permission of Chair. The Chair has permitted him. When you are permitted, you can also raise it.

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Sir, please set the clock again.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have the clock here. Don't worry about that.

DR. V. MAITREYAN: The Union Telecommunication Minister, Mr. A. Raja, has been charged with having allotted 2G spectrum for mobile services on a first-cum-first-served basis rather than going for a global auction.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Don't repeat it.

DR. V. MAITREYAN: He is also charged with having allotted spectrum in excess of the stipulated 6.2 megahertz. The Central Vigilance Commission has questioned his ambiguous and political-patronage-driven move. The Delhi High Court has admitted a Public Interest Litigation against the spectrum allocation. According to the current estimates, the country has suffered a loss of nearly Rs. 1,00,000 crore. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You go ahead. ...*(Interruptions)*... You go ahead. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*... You go ahead. ...*(Interruptions)*... You go ahead. ...*(Interruptions)*... Allow the Member to speak.

DR. V. MAITREYAN: According to the current estimates, the country has suffered a loss of nearly Rs. 1,00,000 crore in this one deal. ...*(Interruptions)*... To put it in perspective, the six crore population of Tamil Nadu can be provided rice, now priced at one rupee a kg, free of cost, through ration shops for the next 140 years with this money. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You please sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*... Why are you coming here? ...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Mr. Raja claims that he had not deviated from the practice followed by his predecessor. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The Chairman has allowed it. ...*(Interruptions)*... You please go back. ...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. K. MALAISAMY: Sir, there is a Lok Sabha M.P. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Who is the Lok Sabha M.P.? ...*(Interruptions)*... How is the Lok Sabha M.P. here? ...*(Interruptions)*... A Minister can be there. ...*(Interruptions)*... What are you saying? ...*(Interruptions)*... Please. ...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Sir, he can reply to his Ministry. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Dr. Maitreyan, please. ...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Mr. Raja claims that he had not deviated from the practice followed by his predecessor. ...*(Interruptions)*... Kindly note that his predecessor was also a DMK nominee who functioned according to the dictates of his party supremo. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No.

DR. V. MAITREYAN: ...till he was sent out of the Ministry. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Thirty-six seconds. ...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: No, Sir. ...*(Interruptions)*... Nothing has happened. ...*(Interruptions)*... I will keep on saying. ...*(Interruptions)*... From the time the rate was fixed in 2001, till the allocation was made in 2008, spectrum appears to be the only item that has not registered an increase in price for seven full years.

Two companies, namely, Swan and Unitech have no experience whatsoever in telecommunication. ...*(Interruptions)*... A host of other companies are involved and interlinked with these two companies. They are: Swan, Tiger, Parrot and Zebra – all zoological specimens. Nobody knows who are the people behind these mysterious companies.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Your time is over. ...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Unitech is a real estate company, which got the bumper deal without investing anything in telecom infrastructure.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You please go. You are disturbing your own Member. ...*(Interruptions)*... Nothing goes on record.

DR. V. MAITREYAN: What is this, Sir? ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No. ...*(Interruptions)*...

It is Zero Hour. ...*(Interruptions)*... No. ...*(Interruptions)*... It is Zero Hour. ...*(Interruptions)*... Mr. Maitreyan. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please go. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please go.

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Sir, I want to know whether the mike is switched off or not.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You *See*, you have taken three minutes. ...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: No, I will not. ...*(Interruptions)*... What is this? ...*(Interruptions)*... They are disturbing me. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have allowed you. In another half a minute you complete it.

DR. V. MAITREYAN: One minute, Sir.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Okay. You complete it. Complete it. If you disturb it, I will not allow that. ...*(Interruptions)*... No. ...*(Interruptions)*... You cannot do that.

DR. V. MAITREYAN: It got licence to operate in 22 circles for Rs.1,651 crore within weeks, it sold 60 per cent shares for Rs.6,120 crore to the Norwegian company, Telenor, which is currently a major telecom player in Pakistan and Bangladesh. The Home Ministry has not cleared the Telenor's deal, as it is operating in Pakistan and Bangladesh.

The Swan Telecom bagged the licence for Rs. 1,537 crore for operating in 13 circles. Within weeks, it sold 45 per cent of its shares to Etisalat, the telecom giant in the UAE, for 900 million US dollar. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Your one minute is over. ...*(Interruptions)*... One minute is over. Shri Tapan Kumar Sen. ...*(Interruptions)*... Nothing else will go on record. It is over.

SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN (West Bengal): Sir, I stand here to..

DR. V. MAITREYAN: *

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That is not going on record. ...*(Interruptions)*... It is not going on record. ...*(Interruptions)*... It is not going on record. ...*(Interruptions)*... Nothing is going on record. ...*(Interruptions)*... Nothing is going on record. ...*(Interruptions)*... I have called Mr. Tapan Kumar Sen. ...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: *

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Sen, you carry on. ...*(Interruptions)*... Nothing is heard. ...*(Interruptions)*... That is over. ...*(Interruptions)*... Nothing is going on record. ...*(Interruptions)*... Nothing is going on record. ...*(Interruptions)*... Nothing is going on record. ...*(Interruptions)*... Mr. Tapan Kumar Sen, you go ahead. What Mr. Tapan Kumar Sen says will only be recorded. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN: Sir, I stand here today to draw the attention of the House to the serious scam on allocation of spectrum amounting to more than rupees one lakh crore which is unthinkable. The manner in which spectrum has been allotted on so called first-cum-first-served basis, and that too to some companies, which have no connection with the telecom industry whatsoever, even, some said, to a real estate operator having dubious credentials, is a **on the whole governance of these important economic and important infrastructural Ministries.

There are three components of the scam. The first is under-valuation of the licence for the new entrants. The second component is providing crossover licences to the CDMA operators for the GSM. These two add to Rs.80,000 crore, and this figure further increases if you take into account the related areas of expenditure and the prospective cost that may come to the exchequer. This is a big scam. Sir, it is a big scam in the country's infrastructural network. *(Interruptions)* Sir, I demand that the Government should appoint a Joint Parliamentary Committee to go into the matter. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: What has happened to you? ...*(Interruptions)*... You cannot interfere like this. ...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: The Chairman has allowed it. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN: It is a kind of allotment of freebies to the dubious operators and the money has been eaten away. ...*(Interruptions)*... We demand a probe by the JPC on the entire scandalous issue of allotment of spectrum. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री उपसभापति: श्री प्रकाश जावडेकर।

श्री प्रकाश जावडेकर (महाराष्ट्र): उपसभापति महोदय, यूपीए सरकार ने सारे रिकार्ड तोड़ दिए, इस scam ने तो सारे रिकार्ड ही तोड़ दिए। ...*(व्यवधान)*... एक मिनट ...*(व्यवधान)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You speak on the subject. Otherwise, your time will be over. ...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Interruptions should be stopped. ...*(Interruptions)*...

**Not recorded*

*** Expunged as ordered by the Chair.*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Your own Members disturb.

DR. V. MAITREYAN: That is to counter them. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री प्रकाश जावडेकर: सर, मैं यह बताना चाहता हूँ कि यह scam ऐसा है कि इस scam की कोई तुलना नहीं हो सकती। ...**(व्यवधान)**... इसमें मंत्री महोदय ने यहां तक कहा और पब्लिक में आया है कि प्राइम मिनिस्टर का जो लेटर है, मैं उसके मुताबिक कर रहा हूँ और ट्राई के गाइडलाइन के मुताबिक कर रहा हूँ। मैं आपके माध्यम से पूछना चाहता हूँ कि प्राइम मिनिस्टर का लेटर क्या है? मैं बताना चाहता हूँ कि ट्राई ने खुलासा किया है ...**(व्यवधान)**... ट्राई ने खुलासा किया है कि ट्राई की ऐसी कोई गाइडलाइन नहीं है, जिसके कारण इस तरह का allotment किया जा सकता है। लेकिन ट्राई का नाम उछालना, प्रधान मंत्री का नाम उछालना, जब वे प्रधान मंत्री का नाम उछाल रहे हैं और कह रहे हैं कि उनका लेटर है, तो हाउस को अधिकार है कि वह जाने कि प्रधान मंत्री का कौन सा ऐसा लेटर है, जिसके सहारे वे अपने scam को जायज ठहरा रहे हैं।

दूसरी एक बात, जो यहां हमारे एक साथी चन्दन मित्र जी के पेपर में आई है कि किस तरह से *quid pro quo* arrangement हुआ है, कैसे benefit किसको दी गई है। इसलिए यह जांच जेपीसी के माध्यम से होनी चाहिए। सीबीआई की जांच की मांग हमने पहले से की है। ...**(व्यवधान)**... हवा में इतना पैसा खा रहे हैं, हवा बेच कर पैसा खा रहे हैं। यह पाप कहाँ जाएगा! जो हवा बेच कर पैसा खाते हैं, उनको कुछ नसीब नहीं होगा। सवाल यह है कि जब प्रधान मंत्री तक का नाम आया है ...**(व्यवधान)**... प्रधान मंत्री का लेटर क्या है, यह सभा गृह के सामने आना चाहिए। यही मेरी मांग है। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Sir, we want a JPC on this matter.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You should not talk like this. Dr. K. Malaisamy. ...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Sir, we want a JPC on this matter. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: This is not the demand. Dr. Maitreyan, you please sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Sir, we want a JPC. We want the Minister to be dismissed. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: All of us have agreed for a Zero Hour and this House is following certain norms. Now, in Zero Hour, you know that the Minister cannot reply. You insist that the Zero Hour should be taken up and when we take up the Zero Hour, you demand this and that. You have a right to say this but how can the Government respond? You have to use the other forum which is available to you under the rules. If you do not make use of the other forum and you say that Zero Hour is used for all purposes, I think, this is not correct. In all party meeting, we have taken a decision. Let us respect that decision. Let us follow that. Dr. K. Malaisamy. ...*(Interruptions)*... Sharad Yadavji, please.

श्री शरद यादव (बिहार): सर, मुझे एक मिनट दीजिए। यह सवाल, जो लोगों ने उठाया है, बहुत गम्भीर है और इस सवाल पर जब allow किया गया, तब उन्होंने कहा, लेकिन इतना गम्भीर सवाल है, तो इस पर पूरी तरह से डिबेट होनी चाहिए।

श्री उपसभापति: आपको किसने मना किया है! आपने डिबेट के तरीके छोड़ दिए हैं। आपको इसे ज़ीरो ऑवर में नहीं लेना चाहिए था। डिबेट के तरीके हैं, तो उनमें लीजिए न! आपको कौन मना कर रहा है!

श्री शरद यादव: ठीक है, सर।

श्री उपसभापति: डा. मलयसामी।

Situation arising out of power cut in Tamil Nadu

DR. K. MALAYASMY (Tamil Nadu): Sir, I am on a different issue.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I know that.

DR. K. MALAISAMY: Sir, the others can relax.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Okay.

DR. K. MALAISAMY: Thank you, Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, for having given me permission to raise an important issue which is, again, relating to Tamil Nadu. This is with reference to the unprecedented power cut imposed by the Government of Tamil Nadu. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI VASANTHI STANLEY (Tamil Nadu): Sir, this is a State matter. ...*(Interruptions)*... This is a State subject. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It is difficult to understand when Members of two Parties speak together! ...*(Interruptions)*... You go on telling that. I will not be able to hear if you go on speaking together like this. ...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. K. MALAISAMY: Sir, whatever be the time taken by them. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA (Jharkhand): If your Party Members speak, the AIADMK Members get up and interrupt and if. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It looks like that. ...*(Interruptions)*... Their disturbance I cannot stop. ...*(Interruptions)*... You disturb and they disturb. Please go on. ...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. K. MALAISAMY: Sir, I would like to get a clarification from the Chair. I am entitled to have three minutes. Whatever be the time taken by them. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You are entitled, but will not be responsible for your own party Members getting up and speaking together, and all that.

DR. K. MALAISAMY: No, no; I *Seek* a clarification. ...*(Interruptions)*... I am *Seeking* a clarification, Sir.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Malaisamy, whatever you say will go on record. You go ahead. ...*(Interruptions)*... You don't take cognisance of whatever disturbance they are doing.

DR. K. MALAISAMY: Unless I am permitted the due time, I cannot afford to speak.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The Chair is permitting you. And, then, as I said, you go ahead; that will be recorded. What they say will not be recorded.

DR. K. MALAISAMY: Sir, kindly *See* that those Members do not interrupt me again.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You please, go ahead.

DR. K. MALAISAMY: Sir, I am coming to the problem. Sir, the unprecedented power-cut – I used the word "unprecedented power-cut" consciously. ...*(Interruptions)*...