

meaning of article 110 of the Constitution of India."

Sir, I lay the Bill on the Table.

#### FAREWELL TO RETIRING MEMBERS

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members today I bid farewell, on behalf of the House and on my own behalf, to all those Members who will be retiring during this year after completion of their term. As Members are aware, this year some Members will be completing their term this month but a majority of them will complete their term in June or July. Some of you may feel, especially those retiring in June or July this year, that I am bidding you goodbye a bit too soon. But this is due to a convention and practice that has developed over the years to bid farewell to Members during this month. Not exactly this 1st April.

Parting is a moment of sadness and sometimes painful but it is very much a part of life. Some of you may be fortunate enough to be back here and I am happy that some of the retiring Members have already been re-elected but others who do not come back will surely be missed in this House where they were with us as colleagues for as long as six years or more in some cases.

Some of them who are not coming back this time, may come back later. The friendships that we have developed will, of course, continue in life, but the daily contact and company would be missing.

During this period, we have shared our personal joys and sorrows as well as of the nation. Though there may be

different political persuasions and different ideologies and opinions, yet all have had only one aim, that is, the service of this great country and the well-being of our people. In the course of discussions in the House, several times, we have had forceful debates and expression of diverse views but all this has been in the best parliamentary spirit with no residual rancour. I am sure retiring Members have a sense of fulfilment. I know that they have helped in taking our great nation forward. I would like to congratulate them on their contribution to the nation as Members, of the Rajya Sabha, and for their contribution to the Rajya Sabha as representatives of the people. I should like to place on record my personal appreciation and thanks for the valuable contribution made by all retiring members and the kind courtesy unfailingly shown by them to the Chair.

Hon'ble Members, Parliament is not the only forum through which you can serve the country. When you are free from the burden of parliamentary work, I am sure you will find several other avenues and opportunities to serve the weak and the underprivileged and do your best to ameliorate their condition and redress their grievances.

We, in this House, wish the retiring Members all health, happiness and peaceful time wherever they may be and I hope that they will continue to serve the country in whatever capacity they may choose to.

THE LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY):  
Mr. Chairman, Sir, I associate myself with all the fine and noble sentiments

you have just now expressed. I would like to believe that every retiring Member is returning, if not this time, next time, if not to this House, to the other House.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Lower House?

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: You are referring to it as a Lower House. I would call it a House of Olders. As we know, Sir, in politics, people hardly retire and as I said elsewhere, if God is supposed to have assumed ten incarnations, we in India could assume more incarnations and the Indian politicians like that famous Greek mythological bird Phoenix can rise from its own ashes. At any rate, we believe in rebirth and I am sure, all the retiring Members will be reborn as Members of Parliament. I, therefore, would not like to bid adieu to them. I would rather bid *au revoir*. In French, it means "good-bye until we meet you again." (*Interruptions*). Because of the cut and thrust of parliament debate, the public impression generated is that the area of disagreement amongst us is very large. It is not true. We tend to emphasise the area of disagreement with a view to preserving and promoting our respective entity. But we all know the area of consensus, the area of agreement amongst all of us, cutting across party lines and ideological lines, is much more than the area of disagreement.

Sir, when it comes to mentioning the names of retiring Members, I may start with my party. I may start with the seniormost member of my party, who may, perhaps, be the seniormost parliamentarian in this House, Mr. Gurupadaswamy. His look belies years. He is racing towards seventy and he

was a Member of the First Lok Sabha. He brought to bear dignity, maturity, urbanity and knowledgeability on the proceedings of this House. I must refer to Mr. Raja Ramanna, who is, of course, a legend in the world of science, who was behind the Pokharan explosion of which we are all proud. Then I come to Mr. Raj Mohan Gandhi, who never tried to draw upon the most revered lineage and legacy of which we are all legitimately proud. While always being precise and concise he commanded the attention and respect of all sides of the House through his measured and mellowed eloquence. Mr. Som Pal, like Mr. Raj Mohan Gandhi, has been here hardly for two years but whenever he spoke he made sense. Mr. Maheshwarappa never missed the cause of Karnataka. Mr. R.S. Naik never missed to speak in favour of the weaker sections and the tribals in particular. Mr. Chandra Mohan Sinha from Orissa in spite of his ill-health has always tried to participate in the proceedings of the House.

Now, I come to none other than the Deputy Chairperson and my benchmate. Whenever she occupies the Chair, the Chair not only becomes lovely but it becomes lively. She has always been the Zero Hour butter—the buffer between the Treasury Benches and the opposition. Of course, she has to suffer quite a few knocks administered from both sides. Then Mr. A.G. Kulkarni, an angry naughty old man. General Jagjit Singh Aurora—I don't find him here—

AN HON. MEMBER: He is here.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: —We will miss him very sadly because we

are all proud of him. We are all aware of the legendary contribution he made during Bangladesh war. Mr. Bekal Utsahi—without him the proceedings of the House will be even more prosaic. Dr. Nagen Saikia has given evidence of his sweet sobriety. Prof. Chandresh Thakur has combined in himself solid academic attainments with sound political instincts. Mr. Pramod Mahajan proved to be a blend of Youthful effervescence and mature eloquence. Mrs. Jayanthi Natarajan, a charming lady, combined in himself such contradictory attributes as tendency for belligerence and flair for eloquence. Then, of course, I cannot conceive of this House without that noisy pair, Dr. Rathnakar Pandey and Mr. Ahluwalia.

We will miss them very sadly. The House will be all the more dull without them. Shri Ram Awadhesh Singh, the champion of lost causes—I hope his cause this time will not be lost. Without Mr. T.R. Balu and Mr. M. Vincent the sound of waters of Cauvery will not be heard. We will also be missing such legendary names like Pt. Ravi Shankar, Shri M.F. Hussain, Shri R.K. Narayan and Shrimati Amrita Pritam. It has been our privilege to have been Members of this House during their term. Of course, Shrimati Renuka Chowdhury and Shrimati Margaret Alva are back here. They, of course, did not allow the glamour of the House, through their return, to be diminished. Mr. M.A. Baby has come back. He carries an old head on his young shoulders. Out of six Members retiring from Andhra Pradesh,

only one has come back. I would like to convey my good wishes to all of them. Dr. G. Vijaya Mohan Reddy, Shri Rao Gopala Rao and others. With these few words I take leave of the retiring Members. But we will soon join them in one House or the other. At any rate, we will continue to be members of that larger fraternity called political life of India which is the dynamo of Indian democracy.

SHRI SAMAR MUKHERJEE  
(West Bengal): Mr. Chairman, Sir, myself and my party fully associate with the sentiments expressed here. We express our good wishes to those colleagues who are now departing from us. If they continue their public life after retirement, there will be innumerable occasions when we will be meeting together for the cause for which we are fighting here and also outside. Now we are in the midst of an unprecedented crisis in our country. It is acknowledged and accepted by all the parties that we are in the midst of a deepening crisis. The crisis, according to us, is so all pervading that supreme effort of the entire country and the entire population is necessary to come out of the crisis. I think, on this point all will agree. But the policies now taken by the party in power to us, our aptitudes can not bring the country out of the crisis, are so different, so sharply opposite that at the present stage a battle of policies has become new feature not only inside the House but outside also. Our country is now not only threatened with disintegration

and disruption but also a serious economic crisis which is affecting the life of the masses, millions and millions of masses. The crisis is so deep that even individual security is in danger. Every day kidnapping reports are coming. Even highly technical and scientific people are also being killed. Innocent people are being killed daily. The question of secession, the question of disintegration has come before the entire country.

At this stage those who have been elected as representatives in the Lok Sabha or in the Rajya Sabha Should be committed to the objectives enshrined in our Constitution; the defence of sovereignty, defence of democracy, the defence of secularism and the objective of building socialism giving social justice to the masses. But the outside reality is just opposite. That is why we feel very much concerned and our concern may find expression inside the Parliament through debates, sometimes it may lead to bitter and heated debates, exchange of views, but friends who are here, we request them not to consider these as personal conflicts, personal bitterness, personal animosity. We are all fighting for a greater cause. Now the crisis is so deep that even our democracy is under severe strain. In this context I would like to refer to the speech made by our Rashtrapati on 25th January where he appealed for a moratorium on all agitations, all strikes, go-slow and other methods. Our immediate reaction to this was, we were reminded of the days during emergency where democracy had been completely subverted. Now we had seen a similar move on the part of

the Government; however, that has been stopped now. We prevented ESMA being reintroduced where the very basis of democracy would be threatened and challenged. All these things are related to the economic policies of the present Government. In the coming days also, inside the House, some turbulent debates from time to time may take place because the difference is so sharp. The defence of democracy, the defence of secularism for which our national movement has made a very big contribution and which has been reflected in the objective principles in the Constitution like right to work, living wages, removal of disparity, free education, self-reliance, all these are being negated and parliamentary democracy is being challenged. Unfortunately I am to mention here that major policy decisions are taking place outside the Parliament. That is Parliament has become only a forum for endorsement of these policies. So I request those friends who are now leaving us to maintain their public life and there again we will meet though not inside but outside and I share the hope of Shri Jaipal Reddy that many of them may again come inside and become our colleagues. We welcome those who have been re-elected and we will welcome those who may come in future because this is part of life. The old will go and new will come and this process is a normal process. But we are really grieved at the loss of their association because in the case of many of the colleagues who are retiring they have a very big background outside the Parliament.

We were fortunate enough to have them amidst us. And I request the Members who are leaving us, to contribute their services to the people, which is more important, though not inside but outside. The time has come when new alignment of forces is necessary to fight disruption, to prevent disintegration of the country, to defend democracy, to give social justice to the people and to defend the sovereignty of the country. The question of sovereignty, specially the question of economic sovereignty and the question of independent foreign policy are now publicly debated. In the present context of unipolar international situation, bigger and bigger pressures are working in our country and, therefore, we have to revive the feeling of patriotism again in the country. We want that people should not forget the role of imperialism. But in the debates nowadays, the word 'imperialism' is completely absent in our speeches. With very high respect for those friends who are leaving us, we convey our good wishes and we hope that we will gain their contribution, if not inside the House, at least outside and we will meet again in the field of action. With these few words, I conclude.

**श्री सिक्कन्दर बख्त (मध्य प्रदेश):** सद्गुरु साहिब मुल्क के मसाइल तो अनगिनत हैं, लेकिन आज तो मेरे दिल में सिर्फ बिछड़ने का गम छाया हुआ है। कुछ दिन पहले बहुत ही खूबसूरत, गुनगुनाता, जगमगाता एक फंक्शन पार्लियामेंट की एनेक्सी में हुआ, लेकिन आज जो कुछ मैं करूँगा वह उसकी सुंदरता के मुकबले में फेल कर जाएगी मेरी कही हुई बात। मैं एनेक्सी में दाखिल हुआ तो एक घबका लगा। संगमरमर पर फूल उग आए थे और तालाब के पानी में आग लग गयी थी। आसमानी के तारे उतरकर तालाब के पानी की सरह पर बिछा दिए गए थे। वहाँ जिस खूबसूरती के साथ

संचालन हुआ, हर बात ने सिर्फ एक ही रिश्ते को हमारे जेहनों में उभारा और वह रिश्ते हमनशीनी के रिश्ते हैं, साथ उठने-बैठने के रिश्ते हैं। अहले दिल के नजदीक ये हमनशीनी के रिश्तों की बहुत बड़ी कमील होती है। जब हमनशीनी के रिश्ते टूट जाते हैं तो अहले दिल के दिल टूट जाते हैं। हम यहाँ जाहिर है कि अलग-अलग संस्थाओं से तात्लुक रखते हैं। अलग-अलग नुक्ता-ए-खयाल हैं, इत्फाकत भी हैं, मुखालफत की बातें भी हैं, लेकिन एक घर में उठने-बैठने का जो खूबसूरत रिश्ता हम लोगों के दरमियान कायम हुआ है, उस रिश्ते की किसी एक शकल के टूट जाने का रज है। किसी एक शकल का मैंने इन मायनों में कहा कि कुछ हमारे साथी वापिस आधेंगे, कुछ साथी इस घर में वापिस नहीं आ सकेंगे... (छयलखान) ...यानी कुछ आ गए, कुछ नहीं आ सकेंगे। इस हावस में बड़ी-बड़ी दिलचस्प बातें हुई हैं। मैं हरेक का नाम लेकर तो क्या कहूँ, लेकिन जयपाल रेड्डी साहब ने कुछ खूबसूरत आवाजों का जिक्र किया। मैं ऐसा मानता हूँ कि अगर खुदा न करे, वह यहाँ दोबारा वापिस न आएँ तो आवाज कानों को चाहे कितनी भी भली लगी हो या बुरी लगी हो, लेकिन दिल उस आवाज को जुस्तजु करता ही रहेगा।

एक कहानी बहुत पुरानी है एक जईफा की। बच्चे उसे छेड़ा करते थे। अब वे जिन अल्फाज़ में छेड़ा करते थे, वह अल्फाज़ तो सिर्फ डा० नजमा ही दोहरा सकती हैं। मेरे बस की बात नहीं है। वे बच्चे बुरा-भला कहते थे। इत्फाक से एक दफ़ा सारे-के-सारे बच्चे किसी दिन गायब हो गए और इस जईफा को उन बच्चों को कोसने का मौका नहीं मिला। फिर उसने यह कहना शुरू किया कि कभबख्तो, कहाँ चले गए हो, आज मेरी ज़िंदगी बिल्कुल सुनी हो गयी है। तो खैर, ये मज़ाक की बात है, लेकिन मैं संजीदगी से अर्ज कर रहा हूँ कि आवाज किसी किस की भी गरं गुजरी हो कानों को, लेकिन वह आवाज भी उनकी थी जिनको हम अपना चुके थे, अपना कह चुके थे, जिनके अपने बन चुके थे और इसानी ज़िंदगी की यह फितरत है कि जिन आवाजों से जेहन जुड़ जाते हैं, दिल जुड़ जाते हैं, वह आवाजें सुनायी न दें तो तकलीफ होने लगती है और उन्हीं आवाजों की जुस्तजु में दिल भटकता है। एक शेर इस मौके के लिए है कि:

“चले दिल से उम्मीदों के मुसाफिर,  
ये नगरी आज खाली हो रही है।”

जो लोग लौटकर नहीं आएंगे, उनके न आने पर मैं यह प्रसन्नता हूँ कि सिर्फ दिल की नगरी नहीं बल्कि इस सदन की, इस घर की नगरी में भी कमी वाकै होगी। कुछ हजरात जो जज्बातियत और वाकईयत के फर्क को महसूस नहीं करते, जो जज्बातियत की कीमत नहीं जानते, वह वाकईयत की बात बताते हैं कि ज़िंदगी में आना-जाना तो लगा रहता है। वह हरेक जानता है कि आना-जाना लगा रहता है, लेकिन फिर भी दिल जाने से और बिछड़ने से डरता है और इसीलिए एक और बहुत खूबसूरत शेर अर्ज करता हूँ कि:

“सफर तो एक शर्तें जुस्तजू है,  
मगर है शर्तें को जो हमरही भी  
जो छोड़कर जा रहे हैं, उनसे कहना चाहता हूं—  
मगर है शर्तें हो हो हमरही भी  
मेरे बहकने में साथ देगा, ये कुछ तू हमनहीं से पहले।”  
“यहां से चले जाओगे, यहां से दूर होओगे,  
दूर हो नहीं सकोगे।”

लेकिन उसके बावजूद भी कहना चाहता हूँ कि ये हमनशी और हमरही की बात जो है, ये हमारे हमनशी अपने दिलों से भुला न दें।

सदर साहब, यह हमनशी का रिश्ता आशिक और माशुक का रिश्ता है और तुम्हें यह है कि वही आशिक है, वही माशुक भी है और यह बिछड़ना आशिक और माशुक की किस्म का होता है, फिराक का रंह अख्तियार कर लेता है। मैं यह कहना चाहता हूँ कि

“तुम चले भी जाओगे, लेकिन गर वक्त हमारे साथ रहोगे, तुम्हारे बाद मैं इस शहर में अकेला था, ये कौन है जो मेरे साथ-साथ रहता है।”

जाने वाले ये तुम हो जो हर वक्त हमारे साथ रहोगे।

सदर साहिब, मैं मुबारकवाद देता हूँ उन लोगों को जिन्होंने हम को बिछड़ने की सोझगी से बचा लिया, वापिस आ गए। मैं उम्मीद करता हूँ कि ये रिश्ते जो यहां बने हैं, ये हमेशा-हमेशा के लिए कायम रहेंगे। एक बात कहकर मैं अपनी बात खत्म करना चाहता हूँ कि एक घर में मिलकर बैठ जाने के रिश्ते बड़े खूबसूरत और बड़े नाजुक होते हैं। इस पर कड़वाहटों और तत्स्थियों के साथ नहीं पड़ने चाहिए। यही मुझे अर्थ करना था। धन्यवाद।

[illegible]

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA (Bihar): Mr. Chairman, I rise to associate myself with the sentiments which have been expressed in the House by you and by my colleagues so far. In a way these farewell speeches which we are having are reflective, I would say not by design but by pure accident, of the nature of this House. This House endures. It does not get dissolved. It never comes to an end. Similarly, this farewell function is being organised, as you said, for people who will be with us when we come back after this week—they will still be there and this is not the final parting, not the final farewell—and for others who are retiring tomorrow. Some of them have come back and others, as my friends have said, will come back, maybe, later, maybe, to the other House, but will be, I am sure, available in ample measure in the Central Hall to give us company. But I will say one thing, Sir, by way of personal experience I was not quite aware of this fact in life that it is possible to fight, to argue, to quarrel, vehemently within the four walls of this House and yet, the moment we are out of the threshold, all those differences melt away and leave us and we are friends again. This is something which I have not seen in other walks of life, this is something which I have seen only here in Parliament, that differences are entirely ideological, entirely political, and that they are never personal. And, Sir, I think here is a lesson for people who belong to the other walks of life that politics is capable of rising to great heights, even of spirituality, if one can put it that way, where it is possible to sink personal differences and rise above these when it comes to personal relationships.

The other thing, as you have mentioned, Sir, and as others have mentioned, is that we are all in public life, but Parliament is not the end-all or the *summum bonum* of our existence. There is a big world outside and I am sure there is a lot of work to be done in which those who will not be coming back to this

House will have to engage themselves and, therefore, it is to that world, that hinterland from where we all come, that we have to keep looking back at and it is that which we must serve because that is the real constituency, that is the real area, and that is the real field, from where all of us draw our sustenance. Therefore, even to those who are not coming back to this House and who cannot immediately come back to the other House, I would say that they would perhaps be busier than they have been here once they go out there in the wide world. Therefore, this parting which is taking place in a formal way today, will not be a real parting, as I said, and we will all be meeting, maybe from opposite directions, but meeting certainly will be there. Therefore, while, as I said, I wish them all the very best—I am not the one to say "Goodbye"—I want to use an expression, a German expression, as against the French expression used by Mr. Reddy, and, Sir, the German expression is "*Auf Wiedersehen*," which means, "Will see you again very soon." Thank you, Sir.

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM (Andhra Pradesh): Sir, I totally agree with and concur in the sentiments expressed by you as well as the Leader of the Opposition and other colleagues on this occasion.

We have reached another biennial election. The Rajya Sabha is a unique institution in our democratic polity. Every two years, some Members will retire and some Members will join. This is a continuous House and we cannot be free from it.

Sir, some Members who will retire may return, but some will not return, but will go to various fields and serve the country

through their chosen fields of activity. As Tennyson put it, "Men may come, men may go, but I go on for ever.", this is an eternal House and this is its uniqueness.

Sir, I am not a senior Member of this House. During my short tenure as a Member of this House, this is the second farewell. Farewell, Sir, is always an unhappy incident. Farewell to a friend, farewell to a colleague with whom we worked, we quarrelled, we argued, is all the more painful.

Sir, the pain of farewell is more acute in my own case. My party is losing five of its members. Thank God, one is coming back—Mrs. Renuka Chowdhury, who has enlivened the debates of this House with her scintillating performance? The net loss to my party is four Members, Sir. They are my senior colleagues, and I learnt a lot from them. I am particularly painful at the loss of my senior colleague, Dr. G. Vijaya Mohan Reddy, whose sincerity and dedication to parliamentary work is worthy of emulation by the new entrants into this august House. The other Members and their commitment to the cause of the poor and the down-trodden are exemplary. I am really unhappy that they will not be with us any more. I hope that they will eventually come back, if not now but in future—maybe in 1994 or in 1996. Sir, I will be failing in my duty if I do not wish them happiness and prosperity in their lives. Sir, we will not be seeing some faces who have been making tremendous contributions in this House. Many names are coming to my mind.

Dr. Nagen Saikia, who is an able parliamentarian in his own right, but the moment—he is a Vice-Chairman on the Panel—the moment he occupies the Chair he becomes a totally different man. He will conduct the proceedings of the House in the strictest manner. And really we are missing one of the ablest parliamentarians of the House.

SHRI SIKANDER BAKHT: I thought the same was true of Jayanthi! (*Interruptions*)

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM: Anyway, she is coming back.

Sir, as you said, some Members are retiring now, some Members are retiring in another two months' time. In another

more Members are retiring and we will be missing some, very smart, beautiful and also brainy lady Members. As my friend, Mr. Jaipal Reddy said, we are missing Mrs. Najma Heptullah, Deputy Chairman and also... (*Interruptions*) Another lady we will be missing, as it stands today, is Mrs. Jayanthi Natarajan. I hope the Prime Minister, who is also the President of Congress (I) Party—he is here—will emulate at least the tradition Telugu Desam adopted. We sent back our lady Member. So he will also... (*Interruptions*) I am pleading... (*Interruptions*)

Sir, as you said, this is a painful obligation, painful duty on our part, and I wish all the retiring Members all happiness, whether they are again coming back to this House, whether they are going into the world to prosecute their own destiny.

Thank you, Sir.

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN (Tamil Nadu): Mr. Chairman, Sir, it is always not pleasant to part company with some of our colleagues, with whom we have long interactions and interesting encounters. I am sure many of them will come back to this House as hon. Members.

First in the list of retiring Members is the name of our hon. Deputy Chairman. I am not saying goodbye to her, because she is going to come back. I do not know whether she is coming back to adorn the Chair as Deputy Chairman or to adorn the Treasury Bench, because there is a vacancy since yesterday ..... (*Interruptions*) I am saying this because anybody who controls the House admirably, well, can manage the task of any tough diplomacy. (*Interruptions*)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Portfolio also... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN: Even though we might have quarrelled with her, the ultimate victor is the Deputy Chairman! I should mention about the three great southerners who were elected from U.P., Mr. Curupadaswamy, Dr. Raja Ramanna and Mr. Raj Mohan Gandhi. I used to consider Mr. Raj Mohan Gandhi as the southerner though he belongs to whole of India. Mr. Gurupadaswamy as the Leader of the House during



the National Front Government regime and then as Leader of the Opposition and as a prominent Member of this House, has contributed much to the deliberations of the House. I would say he is undoubtedly one of the great parliamentarians of our days. His speeches are full of sobriety. Even his whispers are as forceful as his loud remark. In Dr. Raja Ramanna, we had an expert. In the World Cup cricket match we had Gavaskar to give expert comments. And on matters of science and technology, Dr. Raja Ramanna was our Gavaskar, and we will be missing him when the debate on nuclear non-proliferation treaty comes up. And if there is one person who can boast of direct heritage of Gandhiji and Rajaji, he is none other than Mr. Raj Mohan Gandhi. He has the moral authority even to make his adversaries listen to his well-considered and even-handed remarks. I think he will continue to make his contributions even though he ceases to be a Rajya Sabha Member.

Then we have great Dr. Ratnakar Pandey, the roaring lion of rajya Sabha. Without him, this House will be a silent second chamber. I am told great singers like Michael Jackson used to insure the throat because it has a delicate voice. I think if Panditji, Dr. Ratnakar Pandey comes back, he should insure his throat because I have seen him often in the dispensary swallowing a lot of mixture for his sore throat immediately after the zero hour. And then we have the redoubtable Mr. Ahluwalia.

Mr. Ahluwalia in fact when he was in the opposition, taught the opposition Members the strategies and tactics to stall the proceedings of the House. So he is the guru of opposition, and I think he will come back.

We will be missing Mr. Ram Awadhesh Singh. Not only this House but the Central Hall where the President used to give his address, will be missing him a lot. He is an ardent champion and a full-throated advocate on Mandal. I appreciate his sincerity of purpose and I assure Mr. Ram Awadhesh Singh that we will take up his cause, not in his way, but in our own way.

We will be missing many of the Members of Telugu Desam Party. I should

mention about Dr. Vijay Mohan Reddy whose radical thoughts and concern for the poor we used to share. From DMK we will miss T. R. Balu, a firebrand. From Tamil Nadu, one of the notable Members who is going to retire and I think would come back is Shrimati Jayanthi Natarajan. She has a dual personality. While she is not in the Chair, she is an ardent advocate for her party joining in the shouting match. But while in the Chair, she is like a judge who used to hold the scales even. We have seen her like a butterfly flying here and there, performing her duty as the whip, but the pity is, as she is sandwiched between Shri Ahluwalia and Panditji, we could not hear her sweet voice.

Thiru Palaniyandi, the grand old man of Tamil Nadu Congress, used to appreciate any good point even though it is directed against his party, provided the point has any justice and meaning.

Mr. Swaminathan from AD MK; I hope he will come back, he is a great advocate for the cause of the ruling party because even the ruling party members could not defend their party like him. He is a seasoned politician.

In Mr. Salaria we used to hear the voice of reason and secularism from Kashmir.

Mr. Masodkar, who was a Judge of the High Court, with whom everybody wants to be sincere, is such a charming presiding officer. Dr. Nagen Saikia; he is a friend that sticketh closer than a brother. He conducted the House admirably well and with his smile he used to disarm everyone. Also, I should mention about General Aurora. He used the words with military precision and has never missed his target. Also I should mention about Mr. Baby. By appearance he looks like a rugged, dry Marxist, but later I found that he is a connoisseur of fine arts. I am very happy he has come back and his contribution to this House and in the field of fine arts will continue.

A very special mention must be made about the nominated Members, Mr. Husain, Pt. Ravi Shankar, Mr. R. K. Narayan and Shrimati Amrita Pritam, because it is our privilege to be with them and especially when Mr. R. K. Narayan makes a special mention, it is a jewel of

English prose, effectively putting forward the problems of the day.

As the Leader of the Opposition has stated, we the politicians in India, not elsewhere, especially India, belong to a class of citizens who never retire. So, in our lexicon there is no word as 'retirement' because like advocates we belong to a noble profession and public service has no retirement. So, we do hope many of them will come back.

Hon. Leader of the Opposition used the French words *au revoir*. In English we say, "Good-bye", which is a contraction of 'God be with you'. Hon. Sinha referred to a German phrase which I cannot pronounce. Anyhow, we are opening up. The entire economy is opening up and our greeting form should also borrow from French and German. I combine both and I say, *au revoir*, that means till we meet again and his German phrase which means, see you again very soon.

Thank you.

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA (West Bengal): Sir, parting is very painful undoubtedly, but it is also memorable. Memory is memorable because what we did in the House, whether we quarrelled or shouted or interrupted or cajoled, we all believed in our respective cause. This is the faith in the cause that gave us the strength of conviction. Since we had the strength of conviction, we were friends and we would like to be friends. Wherever we are, whether in this House today or tomorrow outside, we must keep this strength of conviction flying. Let us remember, the world that we are living in, is a world of fast changes. We are living in a situation of erosion of values, we are living in a condition of affliction, down-troddenness and distress. Therefore, let this conviction of faith for the right cause unite us in giving shape to a new and better India. Even when we part, let us remain friends and comrades in the quest for a better life, in fighting for a new future for us and for our children. Therefore, Sir, even after we part we remain associated. We remain associated with a cause, with a greater cause. Therefore, let me tell you, Sir, we don't part but we remain united and associated for building

a new India for the cause that we all belong to and believe in.

Thank you, sir.

SHRI G. SWAMINATHAN (Tamil Nadu): Sir, as the leader of the AI-ADMK Party, I have the opportunity to express my good wishes to the retiring Members. But I am not aware whether I have to express my good wishes to the retiring Members because I am also one of the Members who are retiring and I do not know whether I have to receive the good wishes of the other Members and respond.

Sir, I was having the same thought when you also mentioned that some of the Members are retiring in April, some after three months, and some more after four months. So I did not know because still there is another session for us. We will be coming here by the end of April and we will be here, I think, till 15th of May or so, because the Rajya Sabha never concludes at the time when it decides and, sometimes, it also never meets on the date it decides. Therefore, we have still got some more time to leave the House. The same thing was expressed by Mr. Ahluwalia when he came here. He was talking to some of my friends here and he said, "Why are you bidding me good bye so soon? I have got three more months and you could have another farewell party after two, three months!"

Sir, in your speech you said that even though you would like to give another farewell party after two or three months, the convention is that all the Members are supposed to retire at one particular point of time, that is, April and one-third of the House has to retire. Sir, yesterday I saw in the newspaper—I think it was either the *Indian Express* or *The Hindu*—that somebody has gone to the U.P. High Court with a writ petition that retirement of Rajya Sabha Members cannot take place all through the year and, according to the convention and the Constitution, one-third of the members have to retire every two years and it should be a continuous body. According to the writ petition, he also wants the Members to retire by 2nd April. I hope the writ petition may not be taken up for another two, three months—till we retire. Other-

wise, Sir, we will be having two problems. One of the problems is, we will be missing another two, three months. Another serious problem which we will face is, as the hon. Railway Minister has said in his speech while presenting the Railway Budget, the retiring Members will get their passes only if they complete their term. So I was worried, Sir, if the hon. Court decides that the Members who may have to go by 29th June will have to go by 2nd April, then I may not have the opportunity of having a railway pass which I very much value. But I do not know how they are going to conclude.

Sir, the main point is, after having come here to the Rajya Sabha about 5<sup>1/2</sup> years ago—I am a Member for the first time here—I had the good fortune to be nominated as a Vice-Chairman by the previous Chairman who is the present Rashtrapati. For two terms I was a Vice-Chairman of the House. After I became my party leader, I have always been associated with the parties given by the Chairman of the House whenever he called us for the Business Advisory Committee. And more so I value the dinners he gave when I had the opportunity to meet party leaders as a party leader and also as a Vice-Chairman I had the opportunity to meet them. Every session the party used to be held and the Prime Minister, whatever may be the constraint of time—he may have the time or may not have the time—used to be there and we always valued this party because this party is supposed to be held for discussing important business matters. I use to feel that matters except business matters used to be discussed in that party. But then the most important thing is that we used to value those parties because we used to have a personal interaction not only with the Chairman of the House but also with the Prime Minister, with the Leader of the House and the Leader of the Opposition, and then we had a report because of those parties.

12.00 NOON

Also the Business Advisory Committee meetings have given me a lot of inkling of how the proceedings of the House have been conducted and all the difficulties that have come in this.

But, more, so, Sir, as a Member of the House I also value the breakfasts the honourable Chairman has given me several times. It has become a convention for the honourable Chairman to call the Members of the Rajya Sabha. I think many other Members have also enjoyed them because by turn he calls them either for breakfast or for tea. Once in a session he calls us for breakfast or tea. His tea and breakfast used to be so sumptuous that I always feel that his catering department is confused between a breakfast and a dinner or a lunch. After the breakfast I could not even take lunch. That kind of sumptuous breakfast he used to give. More important Sir, is the discussion we used to have in your house before the breakfast and during the breakfast, and a lot of things used to be discussed.

Sir, in your parties we had opportunity to meet many people, many important people in the House. As it has been mentioned, I respect the Members who have been nominated like Mr. R.K. Narayan, Mr. Husain, Pt. Ravi Shankar, Smt. Amrita Pritam. The last three of them used to be invited along with me.

Whenever I was invited, Mr. Husain used to come, Pt. Ravi Shankar used to come and Mrs. Amrita Pritam, the poet, used to come. We always value their nomination to the House. We are very happy that we have been Members of this House when they were also here.

One point I would like to mention about nominations by the President to the Upper House, Rajya Sabha, or nominations by the Governor to the Legislative Council. Nomination is for the people who do not want to contest, the people who have been celebrities in their own way in different fields of life. These forums should have an opportunity to have them and to hear them. That is the principle on which these nominations have to be done. I had been a Member of the Legislative Council of Tamil Nadu for a period of nearly four terms. I do not want to complain against the Governor's nomination. It has come into vogue in the States. Wherever there are Legislative councils, the nominations have not been done the way they should be done. The nominations had been done in those States only of people who were eminent in other fields of life, who could contri-

bute to the discussions in those Houses. But, later on, what has happened, Sir, is that the party in power had always recommended their senior party members. I do not know. For various reasons they cannot come to the House either by direct election or they want them not to contest election because they want to get some thier people by doing election work for them. Later on, we found that this nomination had gone almost on party lines to the Upper Houses of the States.

I do not want to complain about Rajya Sabha. But here also, sir, there have been certain occasions, rare occasions, when members of the parties have also been given nominations by the President. I do not want to complain.

Yet, because" the hon. Prime Minister is here, I want to say that my personal feeling is that the nomination should always be given to eminent persons and not to party people because party people have got other opportunities to come to this august House.

Sir, regarding the farewell party which has been mentioned by the hon. Member, the hon. leader, we all really enjoyed the farewell party which was given in the Annexe about a few days ago, and we really had an opportunity. We not only enjoyed the farewell party and the speeches made by the hon. Deputy Chairman, but we could see that she has a brilliant talent. Most probably she has more brilliant talent in other fields than even being the Deputy chairman. I was really suprised by the way she could do mimickry as it is called about people getting party tickets. But then the mimicry not only conveyed her talent but also conveyed how popular the congress Party was and how many people are coming to get tickets from various States. I hope she will come back. We always valued her as a Member of this House and also as the Deputy Chairman.

Sir, I don't want to add more except saying that from AIADMK Party three of us are retiring. The hon. leader of the Telegu Desam Party has said that his party would be suffering a loss in its membership. Its five leading Members are retiring, and only one Member, Mrs. Renuka Chowdhury has come back. But, in our Party, because our Party has got a

government in Tamil Nadu—three of us may be retiring—most probably four persons at least will be coming back.

So, we have more opportunity. A leader of a party or a group which has got only four Members is not officially recognised in this House, sometimes it becomes very difficult because we are always called last. Even a party which has got only four Members sometimes is not allowed even to ask clarifications from the hon. Minister on his statements. But, Sir, I had to fight a long way to say that even if we have four Members, we should be allowed to ask clarifications. After the elections are over, we hope that we will be atleast a five Member party, enjoying the status of a group in this House. If that takes place I will be very happy.

From Tamil Nadu, another Member who is retiring is my very valued friend, Mr. Palaniyandi. We all respect him because he is one of the leading Members and is a labour leader from Tamil Nadu.

My colleague from Tamil Nadu, Mr. Vincent, will also be retiring. It has been said by the Leader of the Opposition, Mr. Jaipal Reddy, regarding Mr. Vincent and Mr. T.R. Balu—another Member has also mentioned about it—that whenever Mr. Vincent and T.R. Balu are there, they are negative and positive poles and whenever any subject on Tamil Nadu came up, there was a fight. Sometimes I used to feel that the Tamil Nadu Assembly itself has come here, because sometimes they talked in Tamil. Many of the Members did not understand that. Tamil speeches used to be made, Tamil debates used to be raised and Tamil arguments used to be levelled. We really enjoyed it. I do not know whether Members from other State enjoyed it or not.

AN HON. MEMBER: What about Mr. Narayanasamy?

SHRI G. SWAMINATHAN: Mr. Narayanasamy is already there from Pondicherry. He is not actually from Tamil Nadu. He will be here because he has come in recently.

Shrimati Jayanthi Natarajan will also be retiring. As has been said here, she has been accommodating herself very well as a Member here and also as a Vice-Chairman of the House. I am sure she will get elected and come back. She

is one of the very good Members that we have from Tamil Nadu.

I have moved with many other Members. If I am going to talk about them, maybe I will have to take a long time of the House, because a number of such Members are retiring. But talking about a Member from Telugu Desam, I have moved with Dr. G. Vijaya Mohan Reddy and with him I have a close association. I value him because of his very sober ideas and thoughts. I hope he will be able to contribute in his own way. Somebody said after two years many more Members from Telugu Desam will be coming here and we will have many more members from various other parties. I do not want to mention their names, except to wish them well. I feel, whether they come back or do not come back, they will always contribute to the best of their ability in their own way in the political life of the country. Thank you.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY (Uttar Pradesh): Sir, this occasion is more like Diwali or Holi where we get an opportunity to make a speech to remove whatever little rancour that may be left. I hope by the time the Members return and our turn comes to retire, they will say nicely about us, because from all that we have seen from the past, Members who retire do come back. None of them are of retiring nature. So, the question of their going away for good does not arise any more. But I was a little intrigued by the Leader of the Opposition wishing some of them return to the Lok Sabha. In the last four years I have already seen two Lok Sabha elections and it looks as if in the remaining two years I will have to see another Lok Sabha election. So, no other friend will wish any friend to go to the Lok Sabha. Rajya Sabha obviously is the best place to come. Also knowing the level of violence that is taking place, I think the best thing anybody can wish any politician today is that he should come to the Rajya Sabha so that he can have six years of uninterrupted presence here.

Sir, some of us are banded together in the United Parliamentary Group. Mr. Salaria will be retiring in October. I hope perhaps by then the Jammu and Kashmir Assembly elections would take place and

that he will come back. But we will certainly miss him because he was one of the most regular Members, who sat throughout and had his opinion on a variety of subjects by way of incisive comments.

Sardar Jagjit Singh Aurora is another retiring Member, not to talk about the retiring nominated Members like Mr. M.F. Husain and Pt. Ravi Shankar who have also agreed to be the Members of this Group.

In fact, M.P. is not a permanent title but ex-M.P. is a permanent title and that is one title nobody can take away. Now that the Railway passes have been made available, if you are not in Rajya Sabha or Lok Sabha, at least to the 'Praja Sabha', to the Central Hall, all of them will regularly come. With these words, I wish them all well and hope to see them soon again.

PROF. SAURIN BHATTACHARYA (West Bengal): Mr. Chairman, Sir, I think during the last 15 years, this Parliament, particularly Rajya Sabha saw that there is no vested interest either in the Treasury Benches or in the Opposition. There have been constant flux. But as it happened we of the Left, at the Centre had always been either to the left of the Chair or in the middle but have been in the Treasury Benches in our State, West Bengal. But we have never been thoroughbred Treasury Benches. But with the Congress here, in spite of their occasional loss of power they always had a mind of the ruling party whether in power or out of power. But this lesson in the intervening years has been very important.

One point which you raised. Sir, while participating in the discussion with force it should be within Parliamentary practice. That only showed—I do not know whether you realised it subsequently—that Parliamentary practice is a very elastic thing. We have come to learn these things being in the Rajya Sabha for such a long time, the safe haven of the Rajya Sabha.

Another point is that you wished peaceful life to the retiring Members. The men of politics perhaps, cherish least of all peaceful life because politics is something about turmoil that exists in the

country as a whole. So Mr. Chairman Sir, I would otherwise fully associate with the sentiments expressed on all our behalf by yourself and by other leaders who spoke before me.

Sir, my only misfortune is two of my neighbours, that is, Gen. Jagjit Singh Aurora and Mr. Vincent are retiring. When I was speaking about it to Gen. Aurora, I told him "Perhaps, Mr. Vincent may come back but I do not know about you". He said: "I spend my time usefully." That is perhaps the most important thing, how we spend our time. I think the retiring Members will all spend their time usefully. But Gen. Aurora said that they are not retiring from life. That is the mission of their life which is not confined just to this House or that House of Parliament. I wish them all success in their mission of life. Thank you Mr. Chairman.

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE (Maharashtra): Mr. Chairman, Sir, it is my privilege to associate myself with the very noble sentiments which have been expressed by you and by various leaders of the Opposition on this very auspicious day. In fact, the noble sentiments manifest a sense of camaraderie and bondage between the Members which is the true relationship between them. One has to be just outside this Chamber and then realise the amount of cordiality and fellowship which exists between the Members of this august House. Sometimes, people sitting in press gallery try to portray a picture which is wholly fallacious. What we speak in Parliament about what we think of a person may be contrary to what our relations may be. Sir, once it was very amusing. One day, Mr. Jethmalani came up to this place when the House had adjourned and said something to me. As is my habit—sometimes, I pull up my sleeves—I pulled up my sleeves. And the next day, it was in the House that I was going to be at the throat of Mr. Ram Jethmalani. Not very fair. Sir. Even Mr. Ratanakar Pandey, in one of his memorable speeches, shed tears for the Plight of Mr. Ram Jethmalani when he visited the House of Mr. Chandra Shekhar. His shirt, Mr. Ram Jethmalani's shirt, was torn, his underwears were torn, his undergarments were torn. And one

person who was extremely anguished was Mr. Ratnakar Pandey and he expressed his anguish on the floor of the House.

Sir, we are all legal tenders in politics, who are Members of this House. Some of us go out and some of us remain in circulation. In economics, there is the law of Gresham. Gresham was a great authority on monetary matters. He laid down a law that if sub-standard coins and standard coins are put in circulation, only the sub-standard coins remain in circulation. The bad money drives away the good money. Twice I have come back.

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN: What does it mean?

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE: Well, what it means is obvious. Therefore, for those who will not remain in circulation, I want to assure them that they are the real legal tenders and there is ample scope for them to be doing things in the remainder of their public life outside Parliament. And one never knows how long they are likely to remain out. I am not in agreement with Mr. Jaipal Reddy when he says that they will go to Lok Sabha. Having remained in this House which is so durable, do you want to get into there? This is a beautiful House. I had been there. I have been here. And, certainly, I think this House is beautiful.

I will be very sorry if Mr. Gurupadaswamy does not come back to the House. Sir, as the leader of the Opposition, he scaled dizzy heights of restraint, of responsibility and great parliamentary skill. His performance as the Leader of the Opposition almost matched the performance of the Leader of the Congress Party when we were in the Opposition. It was as good. Then, he became the Leader of the House. As the Leader of the House, he was speaking one day. I had to remind him, "For God's sake, you are not sitting on this side. You are sitting on the other side". He was certainly aware. He has been a very noble Member of this House like many others who are retiring.

Sir, I listened to the senior leader Mr. Samar Mukherjee and I appreciate his regrets that the word "imperialism" is not to be heard. Sir, a great shock will await us when, after some time, nobody will

utter the word 'communism' also. I hope both 'imperialism' and 'communism' are something which will remain things of historical importance to all of us.

Mrs. Renuka Chowdhury and Mrs. Jayanthi Natarajan have quite some common attributes. They made debates very lively, continuously lively. So far as the Members of the Anna DMK or the DMK are concerned, I have only one request to make. I hope all of them do come back. But if they do not come back, they do send Members who will keep alive the liveliness in the House between the two of them. Cordial relationship between the ADMK and the DMK is a matter of great importance to us. Otherwise, many of us would be asleep in the House.

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN: It is very important for the Congress.

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE: Yes, it is very important for the Congress.

So far as Ravi Shankarji, Mr. Narayan, Mr. M.F. Husain and Shrimati Amrita Pritam are concerned, they are legendary figures in their own right. We have been greatly honoured, this House has been greatly honoured by their presence and we will miss them. We wish them all well and we wish all others well who are likely to go out and will be away from us. But I have a very very strong sentiment on this issue and it is, wherever we are, once we have been comrades here, wherever we are, we will always be the same whether we are Members or not Members.

“हमारे नगर से चले जाइयेगा, दिल से तो न आखिर निकल जाइयेगा।

हम रोकर करेंगे दुआ यह खुदा से, उम्र में शिदर से समा जाइयेगा।।”

DR. (SHRIMATI) NAJMA HEPTULLA (Maharashtra): Thank you, Mr. Chairman, Sir. Perhaps, this is the third time that I am making my speech from here. (*Interruptions*). No, not the farewell because I made my farewell from there, in 1986 and came back. I spoke from here when I was elected in 1985, then when I was elected in 1988 and today, I am speaking from here. Sir, when I look at you at the strike of the mid-day hour, I only have to look that I have to occupy that Chair which is being graced by the eminent people like you and your predecessors before and we know what hap-

pens at that time. Our Members very nicely had converted 'one' into 'zero'. I do not know whatever the eminent scientists will have to say about that and it was mentioned by my benchmate and the Leader of the Opposition, Shri S. Jaipal Reddy.

Sir, I was not planning to speak really but I think, this is a rare occasion for me to speak. Generally, Sir, I make others not to speak and today is one of those fortunate days when all the bells are quiet and however long anybody speaks, you will never ring the bell and I am not there to hit the gavel on the table which I think, might be having top many dents on it. It has been a rare pleasure to be a Member of this House for two terms and to be a colleague of all those Members here; some of them have been here before, they left us for some time and came back again and it has really been a great opportunity and I mean it, including the Zero Hour. It was a pleasure to be on this Chair and sometimes when the House was quiet, which was a very rare occasion, I almost fell asleep. I used to pinch myself to keep my eyes open because I think, I am quite used to some kind of less silence in the House. I won't use the word 'noise' because I think, it will be unparliamentary. It was very kind of some of our hon. Members to have said nice things about me. I wish they will continue it when you leave this Chair after we bid farewell to each other and I occupy again the Chair.

At least Mr. Ahluwalia, Dr. Ratnakar Pandey, Shrimati Jayanthi Natarajan and some others, who are supposedly retiring in June. We are going to come back for the next part of this Budget Session. After the recess when we meet again, I hope, you will remember that you have today paid great tributes to all of us and we will keep it up in our next part of the Session. It has been a great experience to be on this Chair and to listen to the viewpoints of various Members. It is very true that though we belong to different political ideologies, different political parties, represent different interests in our lives, when we are outside this House, we all are one. We think for the country and we think for the welfare of the people. Specially in this House, as a woman Member of Parliament, I would say that

there have been many occasions where there have been issues raised about the plight of women cutting across party lines. I must say—the leaders of various political parties are there and the Prime Minister is there—that the House would not be the same because many women Members are retiring this time—I think, the maximum number of women are retiring. Some names have not been mentioned, I would say Mrs. Bijoya Chakravarty; Kumari Sayeeda Khatun, Kumari Alia, Kumari Sushila Tiria, Mrs. Jayanthi Natarajan and myself. We are happy that Mrs. Margaret Alva has come back and we hope that there will be women replacing those women who are retiring or they will come back. If they do not, for any reason, there would be other women coming from various political parties. I hope other Members don't mind my saying so because they have been very conscious, they have always been very conscious participants. Mrs. Bijoya Chakravarty used to be very active. Sometimes she is the lone Member who could overpower everybody. As for as some Members are concerned, sometimes their looks are very deceiving. I never knew that behind Mr. Murasoli Maran's sober face there is a hidden treasure of a sense of humour because most of the times he is very serious. As far as DMK, Anna DMK, Congress and Mr. Narayanasamy are concerned, I think, that is why the Secretariat has spread them in the House. Whenever there is a mention of States beyond Andhra Pradesh—I don't know from where, from different channels—there is one voice from here, another from there and a third from there and they all become one. I remember only one occasion when all the voices were one in favour unanimously. Otherwise, sometimes I really don't know who is speaking and what. There was one occasion when somebody was angered and they converted their speech into Tamil. I am trying to learn Tamil language so that if I have to come back again and I have to listen to them I would be able to understand it. There was a complaint by a Member that some unparliamentary word was used. I said, "if it is translated then I can remove it from the record".

Sir, these are the lighter points. But I say it has been a pleasure to be a Member of this House and whether we come back or we don't come back we would all be working for better causes in

life and for the country. I wish all my colleagues who will remain here the best and all my colleagues who are going to retire the very best. The only difference would be, Sir, that it would be only up to the inner lobby that they can come. It is only a matter of a few yards. They can always look through the doors and see what is happening; it is not a very big deal.

I thank you very much. Sir, for giving me, specially in the Chair, all your co-operation and help, and the Secretariat and everybody else and specially all the Members. I really enjoyed the so-called Zero Hour, but please let us dispense with it today. Thank you.

SHRI SHABBIR AHMAD SALARIA (Jammu and Kashmir): Mr. Chairman. Sir, I must thank you for having afforded me this opportunity to express my sentiments at this time. I have been in this House not for the full term but I happen to be a Member who came in-between. I belong to Jammu and Kashmir, a State regarding which Gandhiji said, "holds the *roshni ki kiran*" during the great turmoil that followed the division of our country in 1947. The State held and holds the banner of secularism for which my party in particular has been a target for some years now. We withstood it and Allah willing truth will prevail. As a Member of this House I have learnt a lot from the hon. Members and all of them have been and are men of parts and vision.

I look forward to benefit from their teachings and from what I learnt from them. Their voice of reason, their debates and their knowledge which they brought to this House had added to my knowledge which will be a great source of help for me, wherever I may be. The melodious nightingale of this House, Shrimati Najma Heptulla, of whom I had

["तुम मेरे पास होते हो गोया, जब कोई दूसरा नहीं होता।"]†

تم میرے پاس ہوتے ہو گویا۔ جب کوئی دوسرا نہیں ہوتا۔

heard but never known, I had occasions to see and to appear before her but not to come too near her during the time I had been here. In any case I will sing with the Urdu poet who says

†[ ] Transliteration in Arabic script.



As regard the state of our country, I would say:

† تاريخ کے دوروں نے یہ سب دکھایا ہے  
 مسوں نے خطائیں تھیں صدیوں نے سزا پائی -  
 تاریخ کے دوروں نے یہ سب دکھایا ہے।  
 مسوں نے خطائیں تھیں صدیوں نے سزا پائی ॥

A large section of our people, those who fought for a united and prosperous India, those who sacrificed for it, those who worked for it, have got disillusioned. It is lamentable that they have to feel otherwise. They have been disillusioned. There are mistakes, colossal mistakes, which have been committed and which have led to this state of affairs that today this great country, this great civilization is faced with. There are insurmountable problems and problems of separatism. It is now our task to win those sections of the society who have got disillusioned. They may have their reasons. But it is our duty, it is the duty of this House, it is the duty of everybody to see that reason prevails and they are reassured that the values of democracy, the principles of secularism, the principles of socialism will be followed in India not only in words but also in deeds. In 1965 people came to Jammu and Kashmir with arms. Volunteers came from across the line. They were not welcomed. Only 27 years have passed. Now the people from the State of Jammu and Kashmir have started getting arms and fighting. We must have introspection. We must see, what happened during this interregnum, so that those who in 1947 said, "nothing doing", to the partition of the country on religious basis, those who in 1965 scorned all offers, have, after 27 years been driven to such an amount of disillusionment that we are faced with the present situation. Therefore, I would like to submit that it is not only the time for parting but the time when we must have introspection. In India secularism is the corner-stone of our politics. If secularism is weakened, India is weakened. Therefore, I would request that no political party should do anything which may harm secularism in India and that all sections of the society, minorities, lower castes and poorer sections of the society must be reassured that India is their home as much as it is

†Transliteration in Arabic script.

of any other section of our society or as much as it is that of the rich. We need to improve the lot of the poorer sections of our society. We need to reassure our minorities in India that in India they have a secure future and prosperity awaits them. I would say that relationship between the various communities—the major communities in India are the Hindus and the Muslims—should be.

"कहता हूँ मैं हिन्दु-मुस्लिमों से यही,  
 अपनी-अपनी रबिश पर तुम नेक रहो।  
 लाती है हवाएं दहर, पानी बन जाओ,  
 मौजों की तरह लड़ो मगर एक रहो।  
 मैंता हूँ मैं मुस्लिमों से यही,  
 अपनी-अपनी रबिश पर तुम नेक रहो।  
 लाती है हवाएं दहर, पानी बन जाओ,  
 मौजों की तरह लड़ो मगर एक रहो।"

As regards socialism, our socialism has to assure the deprived people of India a secure future. Unemployment should be banished and we should see an India in which as Gandhiji said, "Every tear is wiped from every eye." Last but not the least, I would submit that this is a parting and partings are painful. Though I am going from this House in October, though there are dim chances of my returning in the present turmoil, nevertheless I would say, to meet, to know, to love and then to part is the sad tale of many a human heart.

श्री जी० स्वामी नाथक (आन्ध्र प्रदेश): सभापति जी, मैं आपका बड़ा ही आभारी हूँ कि मुझे इस दुख भरे विदाई समारोह में बोलने का अवसर दिया। सबके पहले मैं तो हमारी मरहूम लीडर श्रीमती इंदिरा गांधी जी को नमन करूंगा कि उन्होंने सन् 1980 में मुझे यहाँ इस ऑगस्ट हाऊस में आने का अवसर दिया।

सभापति जी, मैं ऐसी कम्युनिटी को रिप्रजेंट करता हूँ कि भारत में करीब दो करोड़ की आबादी है—बंगाल कम्युनिटी। यहाँ लोक सभा और राज्य सभा में इस कम्युनिटी का कोई नुमाइंदा नहीं था, उस वक्त इंदिरा जी ने मुझे यहाँ 12 साल पहले आने का अवसर प्रदान किया। मैं एक बार फिर उनके कदम में अपना नमन करता हूँ। उसके बाद सन् 1986 में जब मेरा पहला टर्म खत्म हुआ, आज हमारे लीडर राजीव गांधी जी हमारे बीच में नहीं हैं, जिनकी हत्या गुजिस्ता 21 मई को श्रीपेरम्बूर में हुई और मैं भी उस सभा में उनके साथ था। आज दुख होता है कि हमारे लीडर हमारे बीच में नहीं हैं। उन्होंने 1986 में फिर दोबारा मुझे मेरी कम्युनिटी को रिप्रजेंट करने का मौका दिया था। हम जब इलेक्ट होते हैं तो शायद 6 साल या 12 साल के बाद रिटायर होना स्वाभाविक है। उसी

†Transliteration in Arabic script.

तरह से कई साधियों ने अपने विचार हमारे विषय में रखे। मैं उन सबका शुक्रगुजार हूँ।

इस सदन में और सदन के बाहर हमारे नेताओं से हमेशा मेरी एक ही गुजारिश होती थी कि मेरी बदकिस्मत कम्युनिटी जो बंजारा कम्युनिटी है, वह देश के भिन्न-भिन्न प्रांतों में भिन्न नामों से जानी जाती है। कहीं तो यह शैड्यूल का स्ट की सूची में है, कहीं यह अनुसूचित जन जाति की सूची में है, कहीं यह विमुक्त जाति की सूची में है, कहीं यह पिछड़ी जाति की सूची में है। अध्यक्ष जी, इस विषय में प्रधान मंत्री जी को हमने कई बार ज्ञापन दिये।

लेकिन इस देश की ब्यूरोक्रेसी ऐसी चीजों को होने नहीं देती है। कुछ न कुछ बहाना बनाकर पिनिसटर के सामने वह जवाब भेज देती है और एक ही जवाब होता है कि आर्टिकल 341 और 342 में कंस्टीट्यूशन अमेंडमेंट की जरूरत है।

मैं यह पूछना चाहूंगा, क्योंकि अध्यक्ष जी, मुझे फिर मौका नहीं मिलेगा मेरी कम्युनिटी के बारे में यहां से कहने का, लेकिन जो मेरा सपना अधूरा रह गया है, जो मेरी खाहिश अधूरी रह गई है, मैं देखना चाहता था कि मेरी कम्युनिटी सारे देश में एक समान एक ही सूची में हो। यह ख़ुशी की बात है कि आज मेरे गुरु श्री पी०वी० नरसिंह राव जी, जो देश के प्रधानमंत्री हैं, वे यहां मौजूद हैं। मैं यह याद दिलाना चाहूंगा कि आदरणीय नरसिंह राव जी के जरिए ही 1976 में जब इंदिरा जी प्रधानमंत्री थीं और ब्रह्मानंद रेड्डी गृह मंत्री थे तो देश के कुछ भागों में हमारी जाति एक प्रांत में तो अनुसूचित जाति थी, यहां तक कि एक ही प्रांत के कुछ भाग में अनुसूचित जाति थी और कुछ भाग में पिछड़ी जाति थी। तो इस एरिया रिस्ट्रिक्शन को निकालने के लिए उस वक़्त बिल नरसिंह राव जी के द्वारा ही लाया गया था। इनके कारण ही हमें यह अवसर मिला और उस वक़्त से मैं शैड्यूल ट्राइब की सूची में आंध्र प्रदेश में आया। मुझे इस बात की ख़ुशी है कि आज ये हमारे देश के प्रधानमंत्री हैं।

मैं इसे अपनी बदकिस्मती समझता हूँ कि इस मसले को लेकर कल मैं प्रधानमंत्री जी की कोठी पर गया था लेकिन वे बहुत व्यस्त थे इसलिए इस विषय में कुछ बात नहीं हो सकी और मैं अपना मैमोरेडम नरसिंह राव जी को देकर चला आया और उनसे कुछ बात नहीं कर सका। आज मैं इसे सुअवसर समझता हूँ कि प्रधानमंत्री जी यहां मौजूद हैं और मुझे यकीन है कि प्रधानमंत्री जी इस बात को मंज़ूरी-मांति समझते हैं और वह खुद इस विषय में अपना आदेश देंगे और देश में बंजारा जैसी और जो जातियाँ हैं किसी प्रांत में एक सूची में और किसी प्रांत में दूसरी सूची में, इस विषय में दिलचस्पी लेकर वे उन भिन्नताओं को दूर करेंगे, ऐसा मुझे विश्वास है।

हम रिटायर होने वाले मेंबरों के विषय में जो हर पार्टी के लोगों ने अच्छे अलाफ़ाज़ दिए, किसी ने शायरी में कहा, मैं उन तमाम लोगों का शुक्रगुजार हूँ और खासकर चेयरमैन साहब का, जो हर सेशन में हमको एक बड़िया किस्म का नाश्ता चेयरमैन साहब के पास मिलता था, मैं उस नाश्ते को कभी भी नहीं भूलूंगा और उनसे बराबर मिलता रहूंगा।

इतना कहते हुए मैं एक बार फिर हमारे लीडर गुरु नरसिंह राव जी का बहुत-बहुत धन्यवाद करता हूँ और विश्वास दिलाता हूँ कि जो आदेश आप देंगे उसको पार्टी का डिस्प्लिन

समझकर पूरा करूंगा। मैं सेक्रेटेरियेट क्ल और वाच एंड वार्ड का भी शुक्रगुजार हूँ। धन्यवाद।

SHRI RAJ MOHAN GANDHI (Uttar Pradesh): Mr. Chairman, my hon. colleague, Shri Subramanian Swamy, referred to the opportunity that the Ex-Members of Parliament may have of travelling without tickets on the trains. The other day, when I was, as a sitting Member of Parliament, travelling by train, a man who discovered that I was a Member of Parliament, asked me this...

क्या मैं आपसे एक सवाल पूछ सकता हूँ?

पूछिए, मैंने कहा।

आप यह बताइए कि एम०पी० लोग दिन भर करते क्या हैं?

I say this, Mr. Chairman, because I feel that we in this House need to understand what the people of our country are thinking about the politicians of our country. My leader, Shri Jaipal Reddy, referred to the political segment of India as the dynamo of Indian democracy. Mr. Chairman, this is a very good time for us to see that this dynamo is a disappointing dynamo, a disillusioning dynamo and a dynamo in disrepair. And since this is a moment when we are in a receptive frame of mind, I would like to submit for the consideration of the House and of the Chairman two or three very humble suggestions. Firstly, can we agree, all of us together, that during the Question Hour we will restrict ourselves only to a question or a supplementary of thirty seconds and not have any preface? Secondly, can we all agree that our questions for clarification will not exceed two minutes? And thirdly, — and this perhaps is the most important of all — can we all agree that even when someone is saying something which is totally opposed to our viewpoint, we will patiently listen to that honourable colleague? (*Interruptions*) Mr. Chairman, recently at a symposium in Japan a Japanese gentleman said to me: "I have been attending seminars all the world over, international seminars. The chairman at an international seminar has two difficult tasks: one is to persuade the shy Japanese delegate to speak, and the second is to persuade the Indian delegate to conclude his speech." This may be an amusing story. Mr. Chairman, I would submit that what the people of India see is not the harmony of the farewell hour

or the camaraderie of the Central Hall. What the people of India see are the proceedings of this Chamber. And I beg of my colleagues who have shown me and all those retiring Members of Parliament such great warmth and friendship in the Lobby, in the Central Hall, I beg of my honourable colleagues, that our dynamo is under critical scrutiny and if we do not now sit back and repair the dynamo, we will be known as the discarded dynamo. And finally, let me express my most serious concern — Can we with our hands on our hearts say, whether it is Kashmir or Punjab or Assam or the economy or Jharkhand or Andhra Pradesh, that we are able to discuss these tremendous questions soberly and maturely as a committee, as a small group? We take our positions, we have our immediate reactions, we have our party lines, but do we have a considered view after a free and frank exchange? I thank you, Mr. Chairman, for being in the Chair and listening for the 'first time to what I have had to say in this Chamber. I thank everyone for his kind words to all of us retiring Members of Parliament. I express my gratitude and, of course, I also express my regrets if in any manner I have hurt feelings at any stage.

SHRI KHYOMO LOTH A (Nagaland): Mr. Chairman, I am extremely grateful to you for giving me this opportunity to have my last say. Sir, when I came to the Rajya Sabha in the year 1974, I was perhaps one of the youngest Members at that time to enter the House of Elders and when I was growing to be an Elder, I retired at the age of 40! I never expected to come back. But, God willing, and with the blessings of my beloved leader, the late Rajivji, I was able to come back after a gap of 9 years in 1989. I was preceded by two former Chief Ministers, Mr. Hokushe Sema and Mr. S.C. Jamir and I am being replaced by another Chief Minister, Mr. Vizol.

Sir, I am happy that I have been here for the second time and, as you know, I have spoken less and I tried to be brief all the time because I learnt more by listening to the eloquent speeches, learned speeches, of my senior colleagues here. I have not learnt from trying to speak, but I have learnt much more by listening to the various speakers on vari-

ous subjects. I also tried to be attentive because I know that I will not be here for ever, but will have to go back to my State one day or the other and, so, I must acquire knowledge and experience so that I am able to become a useful citizen and a social worker as I used to be in my State and amongst my people. One thing I must say here, Sir. According to the tribal traditions, when we quarrel, when we engage ourselves in verbal quarrels, and start heated argument with each other, we challenge the other saying, "You come out and fight". But here when we are angry, we quarrel, but when we go out into the Lobby, we calm down and are friendly. We quarrel here, the Opposition and the Treasury Benches, as if we are about to fight with each other. But when we go to the Lobby, we hug each other, we shake hands with each other and we smile at each other. This tradition must be shown to the terrorists who are fighting in the North-East, in Punjab and in the Kashmir Valley, and it must be shown to them that India is really having a secular approach and in spite of the turbulence through which we have passed during the 'seventies—during 1974-84', I have seen and we all have experienced it—and even after the assassination of Rajiv Gandhiji, in spite of all the differences, in spite of the party differences, and in spite of the differences of caste and religion, we all, all the people, were able to stand together and prove to the world that India is a great country.

Sir, I thank you especially for the fellowship I had with you and for your fatherly treatment. I thank all the other leaders also because I have gained much from their speeches. I am thankful for the guidance from our Prime Minister and even the Finance Minister who have always been leading us, not only with their learned speeches, but also in a very humorous and very gracious way. So, I thank all my colleagues here, especially the Chair and the Deputy Chairman also. In spite of her strict control, she had been kind to us. But, as a person coming from the North-East and representing a small State, as a minority, I want to plead for one thing. We have only one Member in the Rajya Sabha or in the Lok Sabha, and so also the other few

States. So, sometimes we get lost in this mainstream. So, I feel that now that I am going, I must plead for my other friends. Otherwise, I would be considered to be selfish if I speak here only for myself. My plea is with regard to the house allotment. We have got many guests to visit us from distant places, from far off places. And we do not get a proper house for our members here. In other matters also I feel—the Leader of the House is here—they should take care of members, whichever party they may be representing. These steps must be taken.

Thank you. Sir.

SHRIMATI BIJOYA CHAKRAVARTY

TY (Assam): Sir, it is a glorious privilege to be a Member of this House and to have such great politicians and scholars as colleagues. Sir, I do not want to be a retired person because I want to participate in the process of nation-building.

Sir, the word parting' is very painful, which we do not want to hear, Sir, during my tenure of six years, the moment I sat in the House I enjoyed every moment the great, warm friendship and sense of cooperation from all the colleagues whether they belong to Congress Party or any other. But it is a fact that I got great love and affection from each and every Member. And when the Hon. Chairman graces the Chair, I feel it is really heavenly. Sometimes I feel that an indulgent father is sitting there. I always deem it a great regard to get an invitation from the hon. Chairman and the few moments I spent there and I waited for him I enjoyed a lot. And when Najmaji was in the Chair and when in the Zero Houli we did some mischief, it reminds me of an ex Vice-Chairman of Benaras Hindu University—I was a student there—when he was cautiously looking at the students with a rod in his hand but a glow of smile glittering across his face. And I feel the same when Najmaji was in the Chair. She is a spring of laughter, spring of music and it is difficult to resist

Sir, I must say one word regarding Desaiji. When we visited Port Blair, I felt his brotherly affection when he cautiously told me not to do this, not to do that, I was very much careful because I always wanted to do some mischief.

Lastly, Sir, I want to say that I cannot collect much from the House. I could simply collect some pebbles on the shore; I cannot dive deep into the 'sea' to collect pearls. But whatever I collected will be glittering in my life and will be sufficient to get me going in my life.

श्री राम अब्दुल्लाह सिंह (बिहार): सभापति महोदय, विदाई के धार्मिक क्षणों में आम तौर से ईसान दिमाग के बदले दिल से ज्यादा बोलता है। दिल इस समय ज्यादा बोलता है, दिमाग कम बोलता है। और क्षणों में हम दिमाग से कई करते हैं, एक दूसरे को काटने की कोशिश करते हैं। लेकिन ऐसे क्षणों में हम दिल से बोलते हैं।

मैं सबसे पहले आपसे माफी मांगना चाहता हूँ क्योंकि ऐसे कई क्षण आये हैं जब मैं आपसे काफी उत्पन्न हूँ और उपसभापति महोदय से भी उत्पन्न हूँ। अल्पसे ध्यान दिया होगा, जब कभी मैं उत्पन्न हूँ निजी सवाल के लिए नहीं उत्पन्न हूँ। जब भी उत्पन्न हूँ तो कोई सार्वजनिक और राष्ट्रीय सवाल के लिए उत्पन्न हूँ जिस पर मैं बहुत चाहता था और चाहता था कि सदन में उस पर बहस हो। तीन बातें हमारे दिमाग में हमेशा रहती थीं, झां स्त्रोहिया की तीन बातें हमारे दिमाग में गुंजती रहती थीं। भूख, युद्ध और गुलामी से मानवता को मुक्ति दिलाने के लिए जो कटव संघर्ष हो उस कटव को जल संभव हो, सदन में हो, सड़क पर हो, बाजार में हो, खेल में हो, छलियान में हो, उन सबालों को उठाओ। जब कभी भी मुझे मौका मिला, मानवता को भूख, युद्ध और गुलामी से मुक्ति दिलाने के लिये ऐसे हर सबाल को मैंने उठाने की कोशिश की। उसमें हो सकता है कि आपका दिल दुखा हो। इसीलिये मैंने शुरू में कहा कि आप मुझे माफ करेंगे। मैं सदन में और सड़कों पर साथ-साथ दो-तीन सबालों को उठाता रहा हूँ। इसमें एक सबाल था सामाजिक न्याय का। जब मैं लोकसभा में था, 77-78 वाले टर्म् में, उस समय मैंने इस सबाल को सदन में और सड़क पर ज्यादा जोर से उठाया और उसके परिणामस्वरूप मंडल कमीशन की स्थापना हुई। उसके बाद 13 सालों तक सड़कों पर लड़ता रहा और फिर दूसरी बार यहाँ आया तो मैंने सोचा कि सदन का इस्तेमाल इस देश के 52 फीसदी पिछड़े लोगों के लिये, उनकी मुक्त बाली के लिये, उनको राजनैतिक सत्ता में हिस्सेदारी दिलाने के लिये करना और लड़ना हमारा कर्तव्य है और मैंने उस लड़ाई को बाकायदा लड़ा। मैंने कोई परबाह नहीं की, कोई शर्म नहीं की और कितनी ही बार इस सभाल को उठाया।

मायबवर, दूसरा सबाल मैंने उठाया आर्थिक आजादी का और क्षेत्रीय विषमता का। पिछली बार मैंने इसे लोकसभा में उठाया था। मैंने सामाजिक अन्याय और क्षेत्रीय विषमता के सबाल को यहाँ बार-बार उठाया। आप जानते हैं कि इस सदन का सदस्य रहते हुए भी मैं दो बार जेल में गया और इस साल भी डेढ़ महीने जेल में रहा। इसी तरह से एफनामिक, आर्थिक आजादी का छोटे लोगों के लिये सबाल है। मैंने यहाँ चौकीदारों का सभाल उठाया। 15 हजार गांवों में चौकीदारों को 15 रुपये मिलते थे। थाने वाले एक रांस में जिनकी गाली दे

सकते हैं, मां और बहिन की लगातार, उतनी गालियां खाकर वह उन्हें सताम करता था। मैंने इस चुनौती को स्वीकार किया और उनकी लड़ाई लड़ी और उनको चतुर्थ वर्ग के कर्मचारियों की श्रेणी में लाया, जिनकी संख्या 45 हजार है। अब उत्तर प्रदेश में उनको मुक्त कराने के लिये लड़ाई लड़ रहा हूँ। वहां भी गिरफ्तार हुआ हूँ और इन सारे सवालों पर लड़ रहा हूँ शुरू से अब तक।

मान्यवर, मैं आपके प्रति आभारी हूँ। जब भी मैं आपके चेंबर में गया तो आप अकेले ऐसे आदमी थे जो हर राष्ट्रीय सवाल पर कहते थे कि इसको उठाने का मौका दिया जाना चाहिये, इस पर इसको बोलने देना चाहिये। मैं अपनी पार्टी में अकेला था और हमें बिजनेस एडवाइजरी कमेटी में कोई मदद नहीं करता था। हमारे आप ही मददगार थे। आप कहते थे कि इसका सवाल सही है, इस पर भी विचार करिये। आपसे मुझे प्रोवोकेशन मिलता था।

मैं एक और बात कहना चाहता हूँ। अभी श्री समर मुखर्जी ने कहा कि इम्पीरियलिज्म शब्द रह जायेगा और सत्त्वे साहब ने कहा कि कम्युनिज्म शब्द नहीं रहेगा। ये दोनों रहे या न रहे, हमको इससे कोई लेनादेना नहीं है। लेकिन मैं चाहता हूँ कि जो भारत के संविधान के प्रियबल में लिखा गया शब्द समाजवाद और सेकुलरिज्म है, इसको यह सरकार न मिटाये। कम से कम यह इसका आदर करें ताकि आने वाली पीढ़ियां और आने वाली सरकारें भी कम से कम समाजवाद और सेकुलरिज्म शब्द को न मिटा पायें। अगर ऐसा नहीं होगा तो हम अधूरे रहेंगे। मान्यवर, जीवन की स्वाभाविक धारा अनन्त है और राज्य सभा भी अनन्त प्रवाह वाली है। क्योंकि इसका अंत नहीं होता है इसलिये यह अनन्त धारा प्रवाह वाली है। हम लोगों का जीवन भी अनन्त धारा प्रवाह वाला है। आते हैं, जाते हैं, इसमें कोई फर्क नहीं है उन लोगों के लिए जो सड़क और संसद को बराबर महत्व देते हैं। मेरे जैसे लोग संसद से भी ज्यादा सड़क को महत्व देते रहे हैं और आगे भी देते रहेंगे। मैं नहीं जानता राजनीति की नज़ाकत क्या होती है। अभी तीन महीने हम को जून तक आपके साथ यहां रहना है। कितनी परिस्थितियां बदल सकती हैं। उसके बारे में मुझे चिन्ता नहीं है, बदल जाएंगी तो मैं आ जाऊंगा, नहीं भी आ सकता हूँ और आ भी सकता हूँ। राजनीति की नज़ाकत का कोई ठिकाना नहीं है। माननीय प्रधानमंत्री जी यहां बैठे हैं, यह खुशी की बात है। हमारी जो चिन्ता है, मैं बिलकुल निर्भीक बोलता हूँ। आपको बुरा भी लग सकता है। मैं यह कहना चाहता हूँ कि छोटी मशीनों की सभ्यता ही इस मानव और मानवता को भूख, युद्ध और गुलामी से बचा सकती है। यह बहस आइसटीन और डा० लोहिया के बीच में हुई थी और अंत में वे इस निष्कर्ष पर पहुंचे थे कि छोटी मशीनों की सभ्यता ही बचा सकती है, बड़ी मशीनों की सभ्यता मानवता को भूख, युद्ध और गुलामी से नहीं बचा सकती है। यह हमारा अपना सोचा, समझा है और हमारा यकीन है। संसद का सदस्य रहते हुए मैंने यह तीनों सवाल उठाए और तीनों ही राष्ट्रव्यापी हो गये। एक सवाल मैं नहीं उठा सका, उसका मुझे अफसोस है, वह है विश्व संसद और विश्व सरकार की जो डा० लोहिया की कल्पना थी। इसके लिए मैं सड़क पर या

संसद में जद्दोजहद नहीं कर सका। अगर मैं फिर लौट कर जून में आ गया तो इस सवाल को सड़क और संसद में एक साथ उठाऊंगा।

सभापति महोदय, जिन दोस्तों को मुझ से तकलीफ हुई हो मेरी बात से या मेरे व्यवहार से जाने अनजाने में, मैं सब से क्षमा चाहता हूँ और कहना चाहता हूँ कि हम लोग फिर मिलेंगे। हम तो सड़क वाले आदमी हैं। सड़क वालों से सड़क पर मिल लेंगे और सेंदल हाल वाले लोगों से सेंदल हाल में मिल लेंगे। कोई परेशानी नहीं है। लेकिन विदाई का क्षण थोड़ा मार्मिक होता है, भावुक होता है। इस क्षण में मैं आपसे विदा लेता हूँ और आशा करता हूँ कि जो हम से कुछ गलतियां हुई हों, मुझे माफ करेंगे।

THE PRIME MINISTER (SHRI P.V. NARASIMHA RAO) : Mr. Chairman, Sir, I rise to associate myself with the noble sentiments, friendly sentiments expressed by all my colleagues on this rather sad occasion when we are bidding farewell to the retiring Members. Personally also I would like to bid farewell to those who are retiring except those who have already disqualified themselves from a farewell by coming back to the House. We want them to come back, as many as can come back. In fact, Sir, the subtlety and wisdom of our civilization which reflects in our languages, clearly testifies to the fact that we do not accept that any one goes, there is no going. In many of the Indian languages, when a person is taking leave, he does not say, I am going. In Telugu they say *vasta*, means I am coming. Actually he is going, but he says, he is coming. The same in Marathi. In some languages it is "I go and come—poyosta." This really shows that in our way of thinking there is nothing like going. This is a wheel. Time is a wheel, life is a wheel. The same point goes up, the same point comes down only to go up again. So I am sure that those who are leaving this House for the time being will not be retiring for good. There is no question of any one of us retiring because in this country politics is not a profession. It is an act of faith, it is an act of service. That is what Mahatma Gandhi taught us and that is what we have not altogether forgotten, not completely in any case and, probably, one more generation will still be left with the remnants of that memory.

None of us, I am sure, has planned a political career—not me, at all. None of

us, I could say, has planned a political career. We came here, we were thrown up at a time when it was a privilege to get into the freedom struggle, not for any office that we had anticipated at that time or could have anticipated at that time but because we just could not keep out. Many of us were brilliant students. If we had continued in the colleges, if we had continued to study and served under those undemocratic Governments, there was nothing which was out of our reach. We left all that because the cause was greater than the benefit which was beckoning to us right then. So there is some element of indelible patriotism in the politics of India. That is how we come to these Houses. We go back, but after going back there is no question of our resiling from our duty—and we come here as a part of that duty. This is not a destination for us. This is only a padao, a temporary camp, where we come for five years, six years, and go back. In that eternal journey, eternal so far as human life can make it, the journey is of service to the people.

I have worked with many Members here, many Members in the State Legislature, many, many Members in the Lok Sabha. I have seen this that every one, after all the acrimonious debates, tends to think of the people, tends to think of the country, and that is the bottomline here. That continues to be the bottomline in Indian politics. I am proud of it. We are not afraid of facing anyone because he has money power, muscle power. We are not brought up in that tradition. We may accuse each other, that is a different matter; that is only a part of the debate. But no one believes that any Indian would not stand for India when the time comes. So this is the greatness of democracy in India, not because it is only as old as Indian independence but because it is thousands of years old. It has been ingrained in the lives of the people, in the thinking of the people, in the philosophy of the people. Therefore, I think that we have to work together, we will continue to work together.

Those who come back are welcome, will be welcome. Of course, Members like Najmaji will have to choose whether they want a nice, good, emotional, tearful farewell or a disqualification from

farewell which she has had already, twice or thrice. Sir, I am happy in a way that this House does not end. There is no termination of" this House. Every two years life renews. The House gets replenished, and this is something which again conforms to Indian philosophy, that there is no such thing as end because it is only the beginning of another cycle. And this House has something very profound in this. Of course, I regret still that I could never be a Member of this House, and I envy so much those who could be my sons and are still Members of this House. I envy Mr. Jaipal Reddy very much.

I am grateful to the Members who have shown me so much affection, so much affection in spite of everything. The parliamentary life has been very very kind to me, unusually kind to me in my life. Members are very much opposed to policies, may be the actions taken by me from time to time because 30 years wielding power is a long enough time. If I have not committed as many mistakes as I otherwise could have, it is because of their co-operation. Those Members came to me and told me that this was likely to be a mistake. I gratefully accepted their advice. Wherever I accepted such an advice, I could avoid those mistakes. This has to be the interaction between the Government and the friends of the Government.

There are no foes of any government. There are no enemies in a democracy. They are opponents. They are opponents because they are just wanting to change places. They are rivals. They are asking for the same things. एक इच्छापिलाही है। Yes, to that extent opposition is allowed. So from that point of view, I have not found any difference between Members belonging to any one party and any other party. We have all worked together, we will work together and we will continue. So, help us, God.

I wish all the best to those who are retiring. Those who will come back, will be welcome.

पुनरागमन आश्चः।

Thank you, Sir.

DR. RAJA RAMANNA (Uttar Pradesh): Mr. Chairman, Sir, perhaps, I am at a disadvantage in saying farewell to

everybody especially after the Prime Minister's speech.

It has been my experience here that people are classified into two sections—the senior ones and the junior ones, but I have never found out where I actually come because I became a politician or became a Member of Parliament only a few days ago, but, at the same time, they permitted me, because I have grey hair, to be somewhere in between. However, Sir, I would try to speak like a senior politician only because I have an experience which many people do not have, and that is that I have sat practically in every sector of Parliament though being in the same party. I was right in front as a Member of the Government, and we shifted further. Now we have come here, and in a few months I still have, we will be shifting again. So, I have a lot of experience of seeing Parliament from all sides.

The Deputy Chairman who graciously used to look after us, referred to scientists.

I would like to refer to a little advice given by our great Scientist, Prof. C.V. Raman, about speaking on such matters. He said: Don't use the microphone; speak as loudly as you can. That advice has been very good to me as a Member of Parliament, because even with the microphone it sometimes was not loud enough. It was a good education and good experience.

The second one has let me down a bit. He used to say: If you cannot pass on your information in five minutes, even if I give you two hours you will not be able to do it. Here I have learnt that on this I was at disadvantage, because people like to say for a long time what they can say in two minutes and it has an effect in the end because some people can rest a bit. However, these are what the great man said and so, when we, who are at scientific platform come and see the camaraderie that takes place after a very severe debate and noisy debate, where people are about to call each other worse than unparliamentary names, but they restrain themselves. Among the scientists it is different. If there is a difference of opinion in the ninth decimal place of measurement, they will stop speaking to

each other. Not only that, one of them will go away to America even saying "I do not want to stay with this man." This is, of course, not the case with Prof. Menon, who is next to me. That is because we have slightly different fields of activity though, of course, we have overlapped in the same kinds of experiments. But it still shows you the great difference that exists between a scientific approach and the political approach. The scientific approach says if something is not true, it must be false, whereas in the political approach, it may be false, it may be true and you have a very large grey area which can be either true or false. In that process the friendship and camaraderie grows and in a very big way.

Sir, I have no intention of criticising all the things that have been happening in the House. It has been my privilege to be associated with how this great country is governed. Mr. Raj Mohan Gandhi made some remarks, but then, he has the authority of both Mr. Gandhi and Mr. Rajagopalachari. I have none. But I will merely say, what the Prime Minister just mentioned, that beyond all of us there is an India. I have seen some very difficult situations in the House and in the country. Having merely the same span of years is not quite so much as the Prime Minister himself said. He mentioned in my farewell speech, when I was Secretary to the Government of India many things that we have gone through in the last 40 years. You can say farewell to everybody in the same House, where people like Pandit Ji and Sardar Patel spoke. I had seen them speaking from the Gallery when I was a young man. I shall always remember them speaking in the House.

I would also like to express my gratitude to you, Sir, as Chairman of this House. I have known you for a long time as a highly cultured and deeply learned man. I would like to express my gratitude for the kindness and courtesy you expressed at all stages.

I cannot but make an apology to the Deputy Chairman, our gracious lady, because she sometimes has the way of saying: sit down' and then say 'please' much later afterwards. That is why probably you have not noticed that when we had to shout in Parliament, because we

get excited, I always sat and shouted, so that she never has to say sit down'. I once again express to her my respects. She has made the Rajya Sabha into a lively one. We are supposed to be elderly people, very calm and quiet, but we are certainly a vigorous people. I think that is a very good sign for the country.

Sir, I know the lateness of the hour. So, I thank you very much for giving me the opportunity to speak and I express my gratitude to all my colleagues who have been such good friends of mine.

**कुमारी सईदा खातून (मध्य प्रदेश):** सर, इस विदा की बेला में, हालांकि मुझे मालूम है कि विदा होने वाला बोलता नहीं है, मगर मैं बोल रही हूँ क्योंकि यह हमारी राजनीतिक विदाई है और मुझे उम्मीद है कि हमारे तमाम साथी लोग अपने दिल से विदा नहीं करेंगे, अपनी यादों में संजोए रखेंगे।

सर, परम् आदरणीय राजीव जी ने मुझे इस हाउस में लाया और मैं हाउस उनकी एहसानमंद और शुक्रगुजार रहूँगी जिन्होंने मुझे इस हाउस में लाकर कुछ सीखने का मौका दिया।  
....(व्यवधान)....सर, मैं आपकी तबज्जो चाहूँगी।

**श्री सभापति:** इशार्द, इशार्द।

**कुमारी सईदा खातून:** सर, मैं उस वर्ग से आती हूँ जोकि समाज में तो अल्पसंख्यक नहीं कहलाता महिला वर्ग से मैं आती हूँ जोकि राजनीति में जरूर अल्पसंख्यक वर्ग है और खास तौर से इस पार्लियामेंट में तो हम महिलाएं अल्पसंख्यक वर्ग में ही कहलाती हैं। सर, यहां हम महिलाएं बहुत कम हो गयी हैं। इस पर मैं आपको एक शेर सुनाना चाहती हूँ....(व्यवधान)....सर, मैं आपकी तबज्जो चाहूँगी।

“कि हमने डूब की मानिद, दब-दब के उभरना सीखा,

**श्री सभापति:** जरा शेर चुप होकर सुन लीजिए, शांति के साथ।

**कुमारी सईदा खातून:**

“ कि हमने डूब की मानिद, दब-दब के उभरना सीखा,  
ता सहर शमा की मानिद, पिघलना सीखा।”

सर, मैं अपने सभी साथियों की, आप लोगों की और खास तौर से पार्लियामेंट स्टाफ और प्रेस गैलरी की और तमाम लोगों की बहुत शुक्रगुजार हूँ जिन्होंने कि मुझे वक्त-बेवक्त सहयोग प्रदान किया। धन्यवाद।

**DR. G. VIJAYA MOHAN REDDY** (Andhra Pradesh): Mr. Chairman, Sir, I am thankful for all the good words which have been expressed by our hon. colleagues. We the retiring Members hold these expressions very near to our heart and keep the memories of our life in Parliament as a unique chapter in our experience.

I have to state certain things here even though it is the last day. "Imperialism"

has been there for generations and our freedom fighters fought against it. That is why it is in our blood. We shall have to fight against it continuously. It has done damage not only to this country but to many of the countries in the world.

I also want to state the biggest and the best friend of our country was the erstwhile Soviet Union. There are no two opinions about it. When no other country came to our help, it was the Soviet Union which stood by us in our efforts for industrialisation, for our progress and for our Defence purpose. Let us not forget these things.

I also want to state that imperialism cannot be equated with communism. Communism is the idea of resurgence of man. It may have temporary difficulty but it is a great experiment that has been conducted in the 20th century. It has got a great future in the coming years.

These are the things which I wanted to express. Without these ideas we could not have existed. It is those ideas which have united us. It is that philosophy that has given us life to stay and fight back.

I thank all the colleagues for their kind words expressed here. With some of the colleagues I have been at loggerheads but they were our biggest partners. Every day I used to fight with Mr. Ahluwalia. But whenever there was an opportunity, I used to drop at his house. Over a cup of tea, we used to have very hearty discussions. So also with all our friends, absolutely. There may be some differences. But differences do come when we are in the quest of great things. That is why, Sir, I want to say, on behalf of all the retiring Members, that we will be with you in your endeavours to make India big; we will be with you in all your efforts to achieve great things. And we will also meet you often. Just like other friends, I would also use the Russian term because even now, I hold the friendship with the Soviet Union as a very great happening in our country's history. Even when we were fighting for freedom, when the Russian Revolution succeeded, the Indian freedom fighters welcomed the victory of the Soviet Revolution. So, to say we will meet again, I use the Russian term "Dasvidania".



MR. CHAIRMAN: Now, the House is adjourned to meet again at 2.30 P.M.

The House then adjourned for lunch at thirty-one minutes past one of the clock.

The House reassembled after lunch at thirty-three minutes past two of the clock, The Vice-Chairman (Shri Shankar Dayal Singh) in the Chair.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SHANKAR DAYAL SINGH): Special Mentions.

#### RE: RESIGNATION OF EXTERNAL AFFAIRS MINISTER

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर (उत्तर प्रदेश): श्रीमान्, मेरा एक निवेदन सुनलें। डिप्टी चैयरमैन ने मुझे इजाजत दी थी कि मैं यह प्रश्न पूछू कि बोकर्स से सम्बन्धित मामले में हमारे विदेश मंत्री ने त्याग पत्र दिया है, ऐसा समाचार पत्रों में छपा है। लेकिन इस सदन में विधिवत् कोई घोषणा नहीं की गयी है और जब तक सदन में विधिवत् घोषणा न हो, हमको सच्चाई मालूम नहीं हो सकती। तो आपके माध्यम से मेरा विनम्र निवेदन है कि प्रधान मंत्री अथवा कम से कम कैबिनेट का कोई व्यक्ति आकर के विधिवत् बताये कि त्याग पत्र हुआ है, नहीं हुआ है, क्यों हुआ है? इसके साथ मैं यह भी निवेदन करूंगा कि सारी स्थिति का वह स्पष्टीकरण भी करें। सोलंकी जी इस सदन के सदस्य हैं, वह स्वयं भी आकर के सारी स्थिति को बता सकते हैं। तो मैं प्रधान मंत्री जी से निवेदन करूंगा कि वह उनको प्रोत्साहित करें कि स्थिति पर बयान दें और सदन के सभी सदस्य सहमत होंगे और जानना चाहेंगे कि स्थिति क्या है।....(व्यवधान) अन्य कोई कार्यवाई होने से पहले प्रधान मंत्री का काम था कि वह यहाँ आते। सुबह हमारे रिटायरिंग मेम्बर्स का विदाई समारोह था। तब भी उन्होंने कुछ नहीं कहा। उसी के बाद उनके सारी स्थिति बतानी चाहिये थी। यह इस प्रकार से सदन की अवहेलना है, अवमानना है, जो कि हमारे प्रधान मंत्री जी से ऐसा अपेक्षित नहीं है।....(व्यवधान)

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री शंकर दयाल सिंह): एक मिनट, सुकोमल सेन जी। आप जरा सा बैठिए माथुर साहब, आपने जो परमिशन मांगी थी और आपका रिटर्न लेटर यहाँ पर आया था, उस पर आपको परमिशन मिली और आपने अपनी बात कह दी। मैं सम्मति हूँ कि दूसरे भी माननीय सदस्य यह बात कहना चाहते होंगे लेकिन आपने जो बात कही....(व्यवधान)

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर : यहाँ तीन-तीन मंत्री बैठे हैं....(व्यवधान) कब बयान होगा?

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA (West Bengal): Let me supplement it.

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री शंकर दयाल सिंह): तीन-तीन मंत्री बैठे हुए हैं। आपकी यह भावना जो है....(व्यवधान)

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर : भावना का प्रश्न नहीं है।

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री शंकर दयाल सिंह): आपकी भावना ये उन तक पहुँचा देंगे, ऐसा मेरा उनसे अनुरोध है।

श्री यशवन्त सिन्हा (बिहार): उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, कल भी भावना व्यक्त की गई थी और कल यहाँ पर गृह मंत्री ने कहा कि उन्होंने भावना पहुँचा दी है प्रधानमंत्री को। कल से भावना पहुँची हुई है प्रधानमंत्री को।....(व्यवधान)

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री शंकर दयाल सिंह): अच्छा हो आप एक-एक करके बोलें तो सबकी बात सुनी जाएगी।

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN (Tamil Nadu): Sir, we cannot have everything like this. What is this? (Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SHANKAR DAYAL SINGH): I am not going to allow a debate on it. (Interruptions)...

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Sir, how can you allow this? (Interruptions)....! am on a point of order. (Interruptions)....! am on a point of order. (Interruptions)...

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री शंकर दयाल सिंह): क्या है आपका प्वाइंट ऑफ आर्डर?

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: This is a matter which has been raised day before yesterday. We have already spent a great deal of time on this matter yesterday and day before yesterday." "Whatever the hon. Members had to say on the matter has been said and the Home Minister has said whatever he had to say. I want to know under what provision you are allowing this. (Interruptions)....Let me raise my point of order. (Interruptions)...

SHRI JAGDISH PRASAD MATHUR: There is no point of order.

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री शंकर दयाल सिंह): माथुर साहब, आपकी बात सुनी, अब इनकी बात सुनने दीजिए।

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Sir, we have to take up the Special Mentions. I want to know under what rule you are going to allow this. If the Members start a new debate there should be no end to this. (Interruptions).... I want to know under what rule you are going to allow this? Is it a debate? Is it a Calling Attention? (Interruptions)...

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY (Tamil Nadu): This is a very serious matter. (Interruptions)...

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: I want to know under what rule you, are allowing this. (Interruptions)....Then you allow all the