

REFERENCE TO SUICIDE BY TWO SUSPECTS IN RAJIV GANDHI ASSASSINATION CASE

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA (Bihar): Madam, I have a very important point to raise.

A couple of days ago in Coimbatore, there were two suspected LTTE militants who were in hiding there. The police went there and surrounded that place. The militants committed suicide. The details have appeared in today's papers. It appears that one of the persons who committed suicide was person called Dixon. He is described as a close aide of Sivarasan, who is the prime suspect in the Rajiv Gandhi murder case. Look at the way the whole thing is proceeding, especially after the suspicion which the hon. Home Minister was pleased to reflect in this House while replying to the clarifications on the escape of Shanmugam that he suspected the hand of a super-power. Though he did not name that super-power, everybody knows what he meant. In the light of such serious allegations which have been levelled by no less a person than the Home Minister of India, what is happening to this case? Why is it that people are being allowed to die one after the other? There are important witnesses and important accomplices in this murder case who are being allowed to just vanish from the face of this Earth. I want to know as to what is happening. Then the newspaper reports go on to say further that the investigation into the suicide or whatever it was will be conducted by the Tamil Nadu Police. The SIT was present there. They had gone there when they received information that these two persons suspected in the Rajiv Gandhi murder case were in hiding in Coimbatore in that particular building. Why were steps not taken to ensure that they were captured alive? I am sure our police is capable of much better performance than allowing the suspects to die. Now, I want to know what exactly is happening. Why are we on a two-track approach? The Tamil Nadu

Police is doing something and the SIT is doing something else. We do not know what is happening in this case. I regard this as a very serious lapse on the part of whoever is investigating this case. This must be clarified immediately. This House has expressed its concern at the way in which the investigations have been conducted in this very very important case. We are all interested that not only the culprits should be brought to book, but the larger conspiracy in this case should be unravelled and the country taken into confidence. I am raising this point because want the Government to react immediately and give a statement how exactly these two suspects in this case have been allowed to kill themselves.

SHRI MURLIDHAR CHANDRAKANT BHANDARE (Maharashtra): Madam, I associate myself with what the hon. Member has said.

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA (West Bengal): I fully associate. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM (Andhra Pradesh): The whole House is unanimous on this. I want the Leader of the House and Home Minister to come and make a statement in this House immediately.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY (Uttar Pradesh): He has made a statement on the other case, but why has he suppressed this information from the House?

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: I submit firmly that there is absolutely an air of suspicion .. (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The Minister of State for Home is here. I hope he has noted the concern of the Members of the entire House. I think he has taken note of it.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: That is not enough. The incident is three days old. It happened day before yesterday.

डा० रत्नाकर पाण्डेय (उत्तर प्रदेश) :
महोदया, राजीव गांधी की हत्या की जांच
में बहुत ढिलाई दी जा रही है। ...
(व्यवधान) रोज घटनाएं घट रही हैं,
ऐसी घटनाएं रोकी जाएं और गृह मंत्री
... (व्यवधान) एक और जांच समिति
... (व्यवधान)

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY (Pondichery):
The Tamil Nadu police is hostile towards this
case. They are totally hostile towards this
case, because most of them are involved in
that case. In the Thanjavur belt with the
connivance of the police. LTTE people are
operating in that area. Therefore, the Central
Government must exclusively depute officers
to investigate the case; otherwise the entire
evidence in the assassination of our leader
will be buried. I request the hon. Home
Minister to depute them immediately.

डा० रत्नाकर पाण्डेय : पुलिस खुद
जिंती हुई है। ... (व्यवधान)

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM: Mr.
Narayanamy is casting aspersion on the
AIADMK Government in Tamil
Nadu.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: What is
that he is telling? The police personnel who
are hostile towards this case were appointed
during Karuna-nidhi's regime. I am telling
you about it frankly.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr.
Narayanamy, allow the Home Minister to
react. He has taken note of it.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: The Home
Minister must react immediately because the
incident took place day before yesterday.
They must have all the facts. I would like the
Home Minister to react immediately.

डा० रत्नाकर पाण्डेय : गवर्नमेंट
सीरियस नहीं है, मैडम, अभी गृह मंत्री
जी के जवाब देने के बाद इस तरह
की घटनाएं हो रही हैं और हमारे नेता

के हत्यारे एक-एक करके भागते जा रहे
हैं। गृह मंत्री दूसरी जांच समिति नाने
की घोषणा सदन में करते हैं और अभी
तक वह जांच समिति नहीं बनी एस०
आई० टी० पर हमारा विश्वास उठ
चुका है और गृह मंत्रालय की इस जांच
का, काम करने का जो तरीका है, उसकी
हम निंदा करते हैं। रोज कोई न कोई
मुजरिम भागता रहा है। इससे बड़ा
अभाव पड़ता है। ... (व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let the
Home Minister react.

anr, w *rfotf \

SHRI TINDIVANAM G. VENKATA-
KAMAN (Tamil Nadu): Madam, I want a
clarification.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please sit
down. When he is speaking, I will not permit.

डा० रत्नाकर पाण्डेय : एस. आई.
टी. को एहने सस्पेंड करें। ... (व्यवधान)

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE
MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY
AFFAIRS AND MINISTER OF STATE IN
THE MINISTRY OF HOME AFFAIRS
(SHRI M. M. JACOB): Madam, the hon.
Member, Mr. Yashwant Sinha has raised a
very important point. The matter is really
noted by me because I am present here. The
Home Minister is replying to the clarifications
on the short duration discussion under rule
193 in the Lok Sabha on the subject of
Shanmugam murder case and allied things. As
regards the Coimbatore incident, I am also
aware of it that something had happened. We
are collecting the details from them as to what
exactly happened, the manner in which it had
happened and all that. I want to assure the
House that we do not want to hide any
information. At the same time, it is not fair on
our part to cast aspersion on any State police
in general. If ...

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM:
Your own Member has criticised them.

SHRI M. M. JACOB: I am only telling about that thing. If there is anybody who is found incompetent and is not doing his job well, we will have to certainly remove and replace them with trusted people who can carry out the job very well and that will be done by this Government.

डा० रत्नाकर पाण्डेय : आप इनको सस्पेंड करिए... (व्यवधान) और प्रधान मंत्री जी स्टेटमेंट दें इस पर और कांति-केयन को बर्खास्त करो। उसकी अध्यक्षता में ऐसा हो रहा है। उसको बर्खास्त करो और प्रधान मंत्री जी स्वयं इस इंपोर्टेंट इश्यू पर सदन में आकर स्टेटमेंट दें। गृह मंत्री जी के स्टेटमेंट देने के बाद यह घटना हुई है। इसलिए प्रधान मंत्री जी स्वयं सदन में आकर बतव्य दें। हम चाहते हैं कि इस बारे में प्रधान मंत्री जी का क्या कहना है। ... (व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Fernandes, what do you want to say? ... (Interruptions) ... I have identified Mr. Fernandes.

श्रीमती सस्था बहिन (उत्तर प्रदेश) : जब तक गोपालसामी व करुणानिधि से पृच्छा नहीं होगी तब तक मैडम, ... (व्यवधान) इस संबंध में कुछ भी आगे जांच नहीं हो सकती। ... (व्यवधान)

SHRI JOHN F. FERNANDES (Goa): There are reports in the press that in Tamil Nadu two LTTE hardcore terrorists attended the funeral of Mr. Shanmugam in spite of so many police personnel and SIT people present there. This is a total failure on the part of the investigating authority. There was also a report in the press that 12 SIT officials are understood to have been suspended. I want a statement from the hon. Home Minister about this matter.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: The evidence is being destroyed, it is not just a suicide. -By that suicide, they have lost evidence. And the

whole investigation is going in a zigzag way and in a most distorted fashion. Let the Home Minister come and make a statement on this.

डा० अबरार अहमद : (राजस्थान) उपसभापति महोदय, राजीव जी की मारने वाली महिला एक आत्मघाती दस्ते की सदस्या थी, यह बात गवर्नमेंट को अच्छी तरह पता है। तो जो भी व्यक्ति इस मामले में सम्मिलित है, उनमें भी कई लोग उस आत्मघाती दस्ते के सदस्य हो सकते हैं जोकि अपने आपको मारने में बिल्कुल नहीं हिचकिचाएंगे। यह जानकारी होने के बाद भी जब शनमुगम के बारे में मंत्री जी द्वारा दिए गए बतव्य पर स्पष्टीकरण मांगे जा रहे थे तो मैंने मंत्री महोदय से एक बात का आश्वासन मांगा था कि इस मामले के और कलिप्रदस नहीं मरेंगे और इस तरह की खबरें पढ़ने को नहीं मिलेंगी कि कोई दीवार से माथा फोड़कर मर गया या कोई बम लगाकर उड़ गया और किसी ने एक दूसरे का गला घोट दिया। इस के बावजूद भी कलिप्रदस एक-एक कर के मरते जा रहे हैं और हमारी सरकार और जो लोग वहां जांच कर रहे हैं, वह आखें मूंदे बैठे हैं। तो मैं सरकार से जानना चाहूंगा कि क्या सारे सबूत भिट जाने के बाद इस बारे में कार्यवाही होगी? क्या राजीव गांधी की हत्या के सारे सबूत समाप्त हो जाने के बाद सरकार को आखें खुलेंगी? (Interruption)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Just a minute, please. I will ask the Minister of State for Home Affairs to look into the matter and convey to the Government the sentiments of the Members, the entire House.

SHRI M. M. JACOB: Yes, Madam. I will look into the matter.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: We want him to make a statement. Let him make a statement.

SHRI MENT AY PADMANABHAM: We demand a statement. Cutting

across party lines, the entire House demands a statement.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I said 'the entire House'. (*Interruptions*). Unfortunately, you are fond of listening to other things. Please sit down just a minute. I said 'the sentiments of the entire House, including the Chair

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: We want a statement today. We want an assurance from the Minister. (*Interruptions*).

डा. रत्नाकर पाण्डेय : उपसभापति महोदया, गृह मंत्रीजी ने जो वक्तव्य दिया था, उसके विपरित चीजें हो रही हैं इसलिए मैं मांग करता हूँ कि प्रधान मंत्रीजी हाउस में आएँ और आश्वासन दें और उसके विपरित कोई काम न होने पाए। महोदया, मैं मांग करता हूँ कि प्रधान मंत्रीजी हाउस में आएँ और स्टेटमेंट दें और कॉन्फ़िडेंस को आज ही सस्पेंड किया जाए।

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY (Uttar Pradesh): Madam, may I say this?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The Minister has already committed himself that he will come back before the House. He cannot commit more than what he knows. Until and unless he collects the information, he cannot come before the House. He cannot come back without proper information. Give him some time. He will come back.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: How much time will they take to collect the information?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Narayanasamy, you have made your point. Let others also speak. There are other people also in this House who want to say something on this issue. Let them speak. Now let Mr. Subramanian Swamy speak.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: Madam, in addition to your articulating the opinion of the House, I am bringing to the notice of the Minister the point that Dixon was no ordinary person. He was a key person, not so much in the assassination itself, but right through. If you see the records of the IB, Dixon figures as a very very key person in the whole LTTE episode in Tamil Nadu. Therefore, the Government must make a statement today. They may make one tomorrow also. But today, definitely before the house rises, he should make a statement so that we may know exactly what happened. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: The Minister should react to this. Is he making a statement today or not?

SHRI M. M. JACOB: I shall try my best to come back to the House with a statement. I want to get the information. It depends on the collection of full information. If I am successful in collecting the information. I can come back to the House.

THE LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY): Will he come back today evening or tomorrow morning? Will he make a statement?

SHRI M. M. JACOB: I cannot promise a statement now because I have to get the information.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Do you want the Minister to come back with full facts or do you want him to come and make any statement? You want him to collect the facts. And I think he could not say better than what he has said that he will try his level best to get all the information today. If he cannot, would you like him to come and make just a statement which has no meaning? Let him give the time. If he can do it today, it is fine. He is going to collect the information and come before the House. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: Madam, the hon. Minister has not made a specific commitment in regard to a statement. It he cannot make a statement today, will he make a statement tomorrow? That is

[Shri S. Jaipal Reddy]

a categorical assurance we all are seeking. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI N. E. BALARAM (Kerala): Madam, you are saying one thing and the Minister is saying a different thing. (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The Minister is not saying anything different. The fact is, you want to discuss this matter on the floor of the House. Right. So whichever way he brings the information before the House, that is more important (*Interruptions*).

SHRI MENT AY PADMANABHAM: Madam, the point is whether the Government is prepared to give a statement in this House either today or tomorrow. That is what we want. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI M. M. JACOB: Madam, if every Member keeps on talking like this.. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Madam, he is trying to get out of that situation. We want a definite assurance from him. (*Interruptions*). This incident took place day before yesterday. The Government should have known about it. The Government should have had all the facts. Wore it. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Madam, the Minister is deliberately not making any commitment.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I can assure you that the Minister is as much concerned about finding out the culprit who murdered Rajiv Gandhi as all of us are. So he will come back. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Madam, your statement can be contested. The way the investigations are being done does not prove your statement. Your statement that the Government is as much interested is not proved. I am not prepared to accept that statement that the Government is prepared. Otherwise, the Government would have been more forthright, the Government would have been more alert. (*Interruptions*). They are not, (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now let us have discussion on the Budget.

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM. Madam, we all suspect that the Government is not at all serious in finding out the truth. (*Interruptions*).

श्री मोहम्मद अफजल उर्फ मीम अफजल
(उत्तर प्रदेश): मैं हम कम से कम मंत्री सह दय
इतना बयान तो दे दें कि जब तक इनका बयान
आएगा तब तक कोई दूसरा नहीं मरेगा।

SHRI M. M. IACOB: Madam, there are two issues raised in the House today One is about the Coimbatore incident about which some of my friends have just suggested. (*Interruptions*) Another one is about international ramifications..., (*Interruptions*). On the Coimbatore incident, I will immediately collect as much information as possible and if I am successful to get it completely, I will come back today itself. Otherwise, may be tomorrow because today we are discussing the Budget. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Rajiv Gandhi's murder case is more important and you must come out with the facts.

मौलाना अबुल्ला खान आजमी
(उत्तर प्रदेश): सरकार को यह मालूम है कि
कोन महाशयिया इस कत्ल मे हैं तो उन
महाशयियों का नाम उसे सभा में पढ़ा कर
रखना चाहिए।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: We have not started the Budget. I will call your name. Mr. Vishvjit Singh, please take your seat.

DR. RATNAKAR PANDEY: The Home Minister has already made a state ment but that is not effective. So the Prime Minister must come with a statement That may be today or tomorrow.

SHRI SURENDRA SINGH THAKUR (Madhya Pradesh); No, no. It should be today only and that too by the Prime Minister and not by the Home Minister (*Interruptions*).

DR. RATNAKAR PANDEY: We want a statement from the Prime Minister himself. (*Interruptions*). Let the Prime Minister come and make a statement. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI YASHAWNT SINHA: Some private negotiations are going in the Treasury Benches. (*Interruptions*).

श्री मोहम्मद अफजल उर्फ सीम अफजल :
महोदया, आप तस्वीर का बयान दे सकते हैं
इन्होंने होम मिनिस्टर क खिलाफ इस बात का
इजहार कर दिया है। (व्यवधान)

डा. रत्नाकर पाण्डेय : गृह मंत्री जी
जो कुछ कहा उसका असर जांच कमेटी
पर नहीं पड़ा। इसलिए गृह मंत्री जी
ने सदन को जो आश्वासन दिया था,
उसके आगे बंधकर के, उपसभापति जी,
फिर दुर्घटनाएं हो रही हैं उस जांच में।
ऐसी स्थिति में प्रधान मंत्री जी आए और
सदन को विश्वास में लेकर के स्टेटमेंट
ईशू करें। यह साधारण घटना नहीं है।
यह जैसा कि गृह मंत्री जी ने कहा कि
... (व्यवधान) ... सुपर पावर्स ने
दुनिया के सबसे बड़े नेता को, जो गरीबों
का नेता था, उसको मरवाया है, सुपर
पावर्स ने मरवाया है। प्रधान मंत्री जी
आएं और स्टेटमेंट दें। ... (व्यवधान)

श्री मोहम्मद अफजल उर्फ सीम अफजल:
प्राइम मिनिस्टर जबाब दें। खुद उनकी पार्टी
क लोग चाह रहे हैं।

† [شری محمد افضل عرف م -
افضل : پروا ئم منسٹر جواب دیں -
خود انکی پارٹی کے لوگ چاہ رہے
ہیں -]

श्री सुरेन्द्र सिंह ठाकुर: वे हमको इस प्रकार
का आश्वासन दें कि आज यहाँ पर प्रधान
मंत्री जी स्टेटमेंट लेकर आएंगे। ऐसा हमको
आश्वासन दें। (व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He will
convey the sentiments of the entire House,
every Member and the Chair also, to the
Prime Minister, to the Home Minister, to
the entire Government, and as soon as
he collects the facts, he will come back
to the House and I think beyond that the
Minister cannot say anything. So, that is
over... (Interruptions)... That is over.
He cannot say anything... (Interruptions)
... He cannot say anything more than
that ... (Interruptions)... He cannot
say anything beyond that... (Interrup-
tions) ...

मीलाना अबुल्ला खान आजमी: जब
सरकार को मालूम है कि महशकियाँ इस
मर्डर में हैं तो उन महशकियों का नाम
जाहिर होना चाहिये। ... (व्यवधान) ...

† [مولانا عبيد اللہ خان اعظمی :
جب سرگرم کو معلوم ہے کہ مہاشکیاں اس
مردر میں ہیں تو ان مہاشکیوں کا نام ظاہر ہونا چاہیے۔
... (مداخلت) ...]

श्री सत्य प्रकाश मालवीय : होम मिनिस्टर
एशोरस दे सकते हैं? (व्यवधान)

उपसभापति : कोई भी एशोरस दे सरकार
की तरफ से देगा इसलिए आप बैठिए।

श्री मोहम्मद अफजल उर्फ सीम अफजल:
जो हलिंग पार्टी है उसी के लोग इस बात
की डिमांड कर रहे हैं कि होम मिनिस्टर
जबाब न दें बल्कि वजीरे अंजम एबाब दें
तो इसका मतलब यह है कि खुद उनकी पार्टी
के लोगो का एजेंडा होम मिनिस्टर में खत्म
हो गया है यह बहुत खतरनाक बात है होम
मिनिस्टर को इस बात पर रिजाइन कर
देना चाहिए

† [شری محمد افضل عرف م -
افضل : جو رولنگ پارٹی ہے اسی
کے لوگ اس بات کی قیادت کر رہے
ہیں کہ ہوم منسٹر جواب نہ دیں
بلکہ وزیر اعظم جواب دیں تو اسکا
مطلب یہ ہے کہ خود انکی پارٹی
کے لوگوں کو اعتماد ہوم منسٹر میں
ختم ہو گیا - یہ بہت خطرناک
بات ہے - ہوم منسٹر کو اس بات
پر رزائن کر دینا چاہئے -]

†Transliteration in Arabic Script.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN
(Tamil Nadu): Madam...

श्री श्रीमद अकजल उर्फ श्री अकजलः
आप अपने मैम्बर से पछिए,
(इश्वरान) ...

[شری محمد افضل عرف م -
افضل : آپ اپنے ممبرس سے پوچھئے
.. (مدخلت)]

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now we will discuss the Budget (General), 1991-92... (Interruptions)... That matter is over... (Interruptions)... What do you want to say, Mr. Jacob?... (Interruptions)... Order, please.

SHRI M. M. JACOB: Madam, regarding the Budget one request have to make. Yesterday, we had consultations with the Party leaders who were present in the Chamber and this morning I have also met some leaders in this connection. The Vote on Account was passed in the Lok Sabha without debate and afterwards they continued with the consideration of the Budget. So I suggest, if most of the Members agree to, to have the voting first and then the debate.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Agreed?

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI (Maharashtra): Madam, let them discuss the Vote on Account first and then we will discuss the Budget.

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM: Madam, we agree to it if they are serious into the investigation of Rajiv Gandhi's assassination.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Whether you pass the Vote on Account or you don't pass the Vote on Account, everybody is serious about Rajiv Gandhi. Before I call the names of Members to speak... (Interruptions)... Now will take up the Appropriation (Vote on Account) No. 2 Bill, 1991. Dr. Manmohan Singh...

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: Madam, I would like to make one submission.

fTransliteration in Arabic Script.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You gave your commitment and now you want to make your submission. How is it possible? It is not a conditional commitment...

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: No, no, no. We are only keen to have a commitment from the Government that this will not be treated as a precedent.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I can assure you that is not going to be made a precedent. I assure you from the Chair... (Interruptions)... I can assure you from the Chair... (Interruptions)... I know what he says. I can ready your mind also...

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: Madam Deputy Chairperson, you must permit us to make our submissions. We want an assurance from the Government that this will never be treated as a precedent.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: O.K. Given. The Minister can also give that.

THE APPROPRIATION (VOTE ON ACCOUNT NO. 2 BILL, 1991

THE MINISTER OF FINANCE (SHRI MANMOHAN SINGH): Madam, I beg to move:

"That the Bill to provide for the withdrawal of certain sums from and out of the Consolidated Fund of India for the services of a part of the financial year 1991-92, as passed by the Lok Sabha, be taken into consideration".

The question was put and the motion was adopted.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: We shall now take up clause-by-clause consideration of the Bill.

Clause 2 to 4 and the Schedule were added to the Bill, Clause 1, the Enactment Formula and the Title were added to the Bill.

SHRI MANMOHAN SINGH: Madam, I beg to move:

"That the Bill be returned".