

[Shri V. Gopalswami]

Acharya Narendra Dev.", etc. but they have no conscience at all. Madam, just ten days before the dismissal of the DMK Government in Tamil Nadu, a great personality of this country, who suffered eight years of detention under the British rule, came to Madras to participate in a function. He said, "A gentle breeze of peace is blowing throughout the State of Tamil Nadu. When the State of Tamil Nadu is compared with many other States in this country, it is absolutely peaceful." Who is that great personality? It is none other than the former President of this country, Mr. Neelam Sanjiva Reddy. Is he a DMK man? Just after four days, another great personality of this country, came to Coimbatore to participate in a function, a wedding ceremony, and he said, "By God's grace, by the grace of the Almighty, Tamil Nadu is ruled by Dr. Kalaignar." Who is that great personality? He is none other than the former President of this country, Gyani Zail Singh. But this Government of Mr. Chandra Shekhar, took the orders from its master—till yesterday they were his masters; but I do not know what is going to happen to him tomorrow—dismissed the DMK Government in Tamil Nadu using the same*. For what reason these people are often visiting the residence of Pamela Bordas of South India? To get some orders? Because the other day, that is, in the month of December when I was quoting Lady Macbeth, somebody asked who is Lady Macbeth of Indian politics? I told them I do not want to name anybody. But I did not elaborate on that day what happened subsequently to Lady Macbeth. The king was murdered at the behest of Lady Macbeth. But the final destruction came not only to Lady Macbeth but also to him who obeyed the orders of Lady Macbeth. After committing the crime, Lady Macbeth said... (*Interruptions*), A little water clears us of this deed—these are the words of Shakespeare. Then what happened? That lady started walking in sleep; somnambulism started. She became a mad woman. One day she

committed suicide. Final destruction came to all those who heeded her advice. Those who were thrown away from power came back to sit in the saddle. That is what is going to happen in Tamil Nadu. The DMK will come victorious with flying colours.

RE. STATEMENT TO BE MADE BY THE PRIME MINISTER

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Gopalsamy, at 5.30 we have a statement by the Prime Minister. It is 5.30 if you want, you can continue later. Let the statement be over, because the statement has to be finished.

THE PRIME MINISTER (SHRI CHANDRA SHEKHAR): Madam Deputy Chairman, at the invitation of the Prime Minister....

DR. NARREDDY THULASI REDDY (Andhra Pradesh): On a point of order. There is no quorum in the House.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let me count.

SHRI CHATURANAN MISHRA (Bihar): It is the convention of the Rajya Sabha. It never happened. You know it better. (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let me count first and then we will see what can be done. Meanwhile, let the Prime Minister continue to make his statement and then we will...

DR. NARREDDY THULASI REDDY: Let the quorum be there first.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let me count. Give me a chance to use my arithmetic and count the number.

कोरम का सवाल हमारे हाउस में नहीं उठाया जाता है, यह इस हाउस की प्रथा रही है।

सदन के नेता (श्री. यशवन्त सिंह) : आज तक नहीं उठा है।

*Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

उपसभापति : अभी आप स्टेटमेंट हो जाने दीजिये ।

Mr. Das Gupta, come in. Let the good traditions of the Rajya Sabha remain. Let us uphold the good ones.

DR. NARREDDY THULASI REDDY: At any point of time the quorum should be there.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Exactly. But many a time when you spoke there was no quorum.

DR. NARREDDY THULASI REDDY: Nobody mentioned about it.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I know that nobody mentioned it. So let us not mention it and let the Prime Minister speak. It is a statement of importance.

SHRI T. R. BALU (Tamil Nadu): There should be quorum, Madam.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I agree, but many times.... (Interruptions)

SHRI T. R. BALU: Already the Prime Minister has started....

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Balu, the thing is the we have eroded a lot of good conventions of Rajya Sabha, but at least we should preserve some whichever we can. Isn't it?

SHRI T. R. BALU: What is the ruling?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: This is no ruling.

SHRI T. R. BALU: As per the Rules of Procedure, Madam....

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Balu, may I say one thing? Please do not bring in the Rules.

SHRI T. R. BALU: As per the Rules of Procedure, Madam, do we need a quorum or not?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Listen to me. One minute. I will give my ruling. But then you will have to listen to my ruling for every misconduct in this House. Then there will be so much difficulty in the future. Not for me. Things would be very good for me if everybody follows the Rules in the House. But there would be difficulties for all of you. So, please listen to the Chair and sit down.

SHRI T. R. BALU: Are we going to abide by the Rules of Procedure or not?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: We do. But do you abide by the Rules of Procedure? Standing in the well of the House is a part of the procedure? Now, sit down.

SHRI T. R. BALU: It never happened before.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: We have never raised this matter of quorum. Please sit down. Take your seat.

SHRI T. R. BALU: Madam, I need your categorical reply according to the Rules of Procedure.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will give my categorical reply to your categorical question definitely. But then you will have to abide by the rules. Are you prepared? (Interruptions) Let us not make an issue of the things.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Madam Deputy Chairman, the House runs by the Rule Book as well as by the conventions. We Chairman, the House runs by the Rule Book as well as by the conventions. We all know it. And it is the established convention of this House that at no point of time is the matter of quorum raised. It has not been raised in this House as such. We are all aware of it. We have been sitting in this House without anybody raising the question of quorum. Now, in this case, the Prime Minister has come to this House to make a statement. Copies of the statement have already been distributed. They are in the hands of the Members. Now, if anybody raised the question of quorum, then, I think, it is the most inappropriate stage at which this question should be raised. I would request you and through you, Madam, the House that we should go ahead with the statement.

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: (Tamil Nadu). Madam, I am on a point of order. Just now the Leader of the house gave an explanation that the copies of the statement to be made by our hon. Prime Minister have been distributed to the Members. But that does not justify that even without quorum the Prime Minister is entitled to make a speech. My point is...

SHRI CHANDRA SHEKHAR: I am not interested in making a speech.

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: Now you have become a philosopher. You have lost interest. Madam, he said about the conventions. But...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You know the conventions as much as I do.

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: According to the Rule Book....

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Don't bring in the Rule Book, Mr. Gopalsamy. You will be in difficulty in future. Let us keep the Rule Book out of it just now. Let us talk about the conventions.

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: Madam, there is no quorum at present.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am saying the same thing that there are certain conventions of this House. There are certain good conventions of this House. Now, there are conventions of this House that when a Minister makes a statement, the Members ask questions. Is it not the convention? Are you going to abide by that convention or do you want me to overrule that also because it is not in the Rule Book?

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: I will abide by the Rules of Procedure.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I would be very happy.

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: I am not the one who will follow the person who said in this country, "I will break thousand conventions." One political personality has stated, "I will break thousand conventions." I am not the man to follow that.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, let me read the Rule. "Statement by Minister: Statement may be made by a Minister on a matter of public importance with the consent of the Chairman, but no question shall be asked at the time the statement is made." So, you can ask the question later.

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: That is different, Madam. (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Gopalsamy, why did I read the Rule?

SHRI MOTURU HANUMANATHA RAO (Andhra Pradesh): The atmosphere is not congenial in order to....

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Just a minute. Why did I tell you before that there is the convention?

SHRI MOTURU HANUMANATHA RAO: ...make a statement and ask for clarifications. Whatever may be the convention....

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Is it the convention to interrupt the Chair also?

SHRI MOTURU HANUMANATHA RAO: The atmosphere is not congenial in the House.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: But the convention is that when the Minister makes a statement, the Members can ask questions. Right? Is there any Rule protecting that? But we do it by convention.

SHRI CHANDRA SHEKHAR: Madam Deputy Chairman, ring the bell. If the quorum is there, all right. Otherwise adjourn the House. I am not so interested. But all the time, people should go by the Rules. It will not be only today. All the conventions in the future will not be your way.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: We will ring the bell. Ring the bell. (*Interruptions*) We are ringing the bell. I think, we can recognise between our Members and the Members of the other House. At least, I know who is our Member, including you.

I will be very happy personally if the House runs on the rules from tomorrow. I will be very happy. I am happy that the Members for once remember that there is a rule book. Because I have to run it. All the Vice-Chairman are going to be happy.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Mr. Bhatnagar has raised a very important point. That point is that a Member cannot be allowed to come inside the House, question the quorum and go out and come again and raise the question of quorum and go out again. Is this a decorum? Is this in accordance with the decorum of the House? *(Interruptions)*.

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: This Government should not speak... *(Interruptions)*

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: The Governments will come and go but this House will remain. Let us not play with the norms of this House, with the convention of this House. Don't play with the norms and conventions of this House... *(Interruptions)*. You don't take to us about the quorum. I know what quorum you have maintained.

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: The point did not arise... *(Interruptions)*.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: We have listened to enough that has been said in this House. We have not retaliated, not because we are not capable of retaliating but because out of sheer concern for the norms and decorum of this House we have not retaliated. And we are more wedded to democratic norms than anything else.

SHRI SUKOMAL SEN (West Bengal): Let the Prime Minister make a statement. But you have quoted a rule which is wrong.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You did not understand. That rule was only an example that there is no rule for you to ask questions on a statement. There is no rule. I am quoting that. I am only saying that it is due to a convention that I allow

you to ask questions on a statement. You have sent me the names, it is only out of convention not according to the rules. So, if you quote a rule then I will quote that rule also that you cannot ask any question. You understand now Do you understand the problem?

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: I want to know whether there is a rule that when the question of quorum is raised it will be over ruled.

THE MINISTER OF COMMERCE WITH ADDITIONAL CHARGE OF THE MINISTRY OF LAW AND JUSTICE (SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY): Is this the way? The persons who have raised the question of quorum are watching from the window. Is this the way the Parliament is run? They are paid to attend the Parliament and they are wasting public money. They are paid for attending Parliament.

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: What is wrong in it? We are watching the fall and demise of this Government.

(Interruptions)

He wants to pick up a quarrel again. I am not prepared for it.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: If there is going to be a quarrel... *(Interruptions)*.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: You are a first-class*

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: You are a* Because he has... *(Interruptions)*.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That is not going on record: Because in the morning also I said if you both want to fight please go out of this House and not fight here.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: What is the meaning of Members watching from there? They are paid to attend the House.

*Not recorded.

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA (West Bengal): This is an example of sheer bad taste on the part of a Member of the Government just to stand up at any moment of time and hurl abuses the way he likes. It is not proper. I wish we all live in harmony in this House whether or not there is a quorum.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I had requested in the morning also, let us work in peace.

SHRI CHATURANAN MISHRA: In the beginning itself, I had said it has not been the convention of the House to raise the question of quorum. Of course there are rules that have been raised by the Members and particularly the whole Congress party who have the largest number, is absent. It was a very important visit that our Prime Minister had undertaken to a friendly country, Nepal; certain important things have taken place. I, therefore, suggest that we don't discuss it now in this atmosphere and discuss it only when all the Members are present in the House. This is a situation today which we cannot help.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Gopalsamy, do you want to be counted in the quorum or you are out of it?

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: As long as I am in the House, I would like to be counted in the quorum.

SHRI CHATURANAN MISHRA: It is better that we do not discuss such an important matter now in this way.

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: I entirely agree with him.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Mr. Chaturanan Mishra is raising an entirely different point. We understand that point and we sympathise with it.

SHRI CHATURANAN MISHRA: I have already explained my position about quorum. We have not done that. Similarly, Deputy Chairman has quoted rules about not asking questions. But we would not like to forgo that right of asking questions.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: But he might forgo, because he is quoting the rule, and therefore, I will also quote the rule.

SHRI CHATURANAN MISHRA: I would prefer that we discuss it when other Members are also present. It is an important job done by the Government. We have friendly relations with Nepal. Therefore, an impression should not go or a signal should not go outside that this situation arose and such questions were raised on Indo-Nepalese friendship. I would not like this signal to go outside and I would request that we discuss it in a proper atmosphere without going into the matter of quorum.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: In that case we will postpone it and I adjourn the House for the day till 11 o'clock tomorrow.

The House then adjourned at forty-seven minutes past five of the clock till eleven of the clock on Wednesday, the 6th March 1991.