

# THE BUDGET (RAILWAYS) 1991-92.

डा० रत्नाकर पाण्डेय (उत्तर प्रदेश) : माननीय उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, एक आवश्यक तथ्य की ओर मैं सदन का ध्यान आकर्षित करना चाहता हूँ।

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी (मध्य प्रदेश) : उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHASKAR ANNAJI MASODKAR): Let us proceed with the business.

डा० रत्नाकर पाण्डेय : बहुत जरूरी है और कल से मैं इस पर कुछ कहना चाहता हूँ। मैं इसकी अनुमति...

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA (Andhra Pradesh): He is on a point of order.

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री भास्कर अन्नाजी मासोदकर) : एक मिनट जरा प्वायंट आफ़ आर्डर है।

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी : उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, मैंने आपको सूचित किया था कि सदन की बैठक हो रही है और काम सूची में पहला विषय...

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री भास्कर अन्नाजी मासोदकर) : रेलवे बजट।

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी : बजट नहीं है। हमारे यही तो आपत्ति है।... (व्यवधान)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHASKAR ANNAJI MASODKAR): It is listed as "THE BUDGET (RAILWAYS) 1991-92."

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी : एक वक्तव्य दिया जा रहा है जिसमें अनुमानित आय और व्यय के बारे में कुछ आंकड़े दिए गए हैं। यह पूरा बजट नहीं है। दूसरे सदन में इस बात को स्पष्ट कर दिया गया था कि यह इंटेरिम बजट है, लेकिन यहां इंटेरिम बजट को भी उड़ा दिया गया है।

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHASKAR ANNAJI MASODKAR): What is the point of order?

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी : उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, प्वायंट आफ़ आर्डर यह है कि यह अधिवेशन जैसे कि पहले दिन चर्चा हुई थी आप अगर संविधान की धारा 112 देखें, वे आपके द्वारा सदन का ध्यान अनुच्छेद 112 की ओर खींचना चाहता हूँ :

"The President shall in respect of every financial year cause to be laid both the Houses of Parliament a statement of the estimated receipts and expenditure of the Government of India for that year, in this Part referred to as the "annual financial statement". अब कहा जा रहा है कि वोट ऑन अकाउंट लिया जाएगा जनरल बजट के बारे में। रेलवे का बजट भी पूरा आता है। सचमुच मैं तो रेलवे पर भी जो ग्रामपनी और खर्चा होता है, वह जनरल बजट का एक हिस्सा होना चाहिए, लेकिन अंग्रेजी शासन में यह पद्धति थी कि रेलवे का बजट अलग पेश किया जाता था। इसलिए यह जो स्टेटमेंट आ रहा है, इसको बजट की संज्ञा नहीं दी जा सकती। वह बजट नहीं है। यह काम-चलाऊ सरकार का काम-चलाऊ प्रबंध है। इसलिए बजट के नाम से आप इसकी अनुमति दें, यह ठीक नहीं है।

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHASKAR ANNAJI MASODKAR): What is the point of order? I am not understanding the point of order.

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी : महोदय, हमें बजट पर विचार करने के लिए बुलाया गया है। अभी जो रखा जा रहा है, वह अक्षय्य है। यह फुल-फ्लैज्ड रेलवे बजट नहीं है जबकि सदन को सरकार से पूरा रेलवे बजट प्राप्त करने का और उसके बारे में अपनी राय कायम करने का अधिकार है।

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: I want to say something Mr.

Vice-Chairman, as Atalji has rightly said, the session has been convened for both the Budgets, The Railway Budget and the General Budget.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHASKAR ANNAJI MASODKAR): I think that this point was raised in the beginning itself.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: This is the relevant time to raise that. It has been raised in the papers and all that.

Mr. Vice-Chairman, subsequently, under the pressure of their masters, the Congress Party, they have decided to do away with the Budgets.

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA (Bihar): Why are you using that word? Who are you to say like this? (Interruptions).

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI (Maharashtra): On a point of order.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: I am on a point of order. How can you raise a point of order on that? Let us complete. (Interruptions)

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI: I am on a point of order.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: I am on a point of order. Let me finish. You cannot have a point of order on a point of order. I am not yielding. Let me complete.

SHRI SURESH KALMADI (Maharashtra): Their master is the BJP. (Interruptions)

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: One minute.

The Government has not come forward with any plausible explanation for postponing the Budget. It is only heard that because of the impact of the new imposts whether in the Railway Budget or in the General Budget on the impending Tamil Nadu elections the Budgets have been postponed. It is very serious thing. It is an affront to Parliament. We seriously object to that. The Government has to place full Budgets.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY (Karnataka): May I make a short submission, Sir? A vote-on-account is not a new thing in Parliament, I agree. A vote-on-account is taken when an election is imminent and there is no time to present the budget. That is one thing. In the First Parliament Sir, when elections were held rather late, this was resorted to; a vote-on-account was taken. The old Parliament was called. A vote-on-account was taken. There are instances where a vote-on-account is taken for a very short period.

SHRI JAGESH DESAI (Maharashtra): when did you present the budget? (Interruptions)

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: Please listen to me. It is taken for a very short period without forgoing or postponing the budget.

SHRI SURESH KAMADI: When did the Janata Dal bring the budget?

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY (Pondicherry): Not on February 28. You brought it on March 26.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: A vote on account is taken for a month or two to three months, Sir, not for the whole period.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Don't behave as saints. (Interruptions)

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: Sir, the Finance Minister is ready with his budget. He worked very hard. He is ready with the Budget.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHASKAR ANNAJI MASADKAR): He is here.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: He is here. That is what I am saying. But it was shelved. (Interruptions) My point is that the presentation of the Budget should not depend upon extraneous, partisan, and narrow political considerations. If the Budget is meant for the nation, it has got to be placed by the Government. It is

[Shri M. S. Gurupadaswamy]

meant for the nation. Today the situation is so grave and critical. There has got to be a Budget. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI JAGESH DESAI: You had said at that time that the coffers were empty and you postponed the Budget from 28th of February.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: We are committing a fraud, if not a crime, by postponing the Budget. I am told the Budget is ready, but he is not presenting the Budget.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHASKAR ANNAJI MASODKAR): How do you know that?

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: Let him contradict it. I have no objection, but we protest at this. It is highly objectionable that a Vote-on-Account is being placed, not the full Budget. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH (West Bengal): By a Presidential Order is was *inter alia* mentioned that the President was summoning the Budget Session. Even in the Rajya Sabha Bulletin, which was first issued, the dates were also fixed about the discussions to take place on the Railway Budget, General Budget etc. It was mentioned that the Railway Budget will be placed and a copy of it will be laid on the Table of the House. Even in today's Order Paper it is mentioned that at 2.30 p.m. the Budget (Railways) 1991-92 will be placed. In the text of the Order Paper it is said and I quote:

"Shri Bhakta Charan Das to lay on the Table a Statement (in English and Hindi) of the estimated receipts and expenditure of the Government of India for the year 1991-92..."

SHRI JAGESH DESAI: That is correct.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: My point of order is regarding the vote-on Ac-

count or Statement of Account or whatever it may be. Will the Minister kindly clarify if he is going to place the Statement for the year 1991-92.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHASKAR ANNAJI MASODKAR): I thought you are raising a point of order. There is no point of order. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: In that case let us try to understand that thing, because Parliament cannot be taken for a ride, that anything can be written and the Minister will do it in a different way under the dictates of certain other quarters. The question is that the Indian Railways are facing a crisis. (*Interruptions*). In recent years the Indian Railways have suffered a mounting and severe loss. So, we want to know the Government's policy towards replacement of equipment of the Indian Railways. But the statement of Accounts cannot be a substitute to that policy. So, I want to know from the Minister, through you, Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, whether he is going to lay on the Table a Statement for the entire year.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHASKAR ANNAJI MASODKAR): How ill explain that. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI: Sir, I have got a point of order. I am not concerned about what you are pleading. I am mostly concerned about the economy and naturally the Budget would have been expected. But for some reason, if it is a vote-on-Account...

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: What is the reason?

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI: That we have to raise. But for some reason if there is a difficulty, the Government will itself explain. But, Sir, the Opposition should appreciate, the walking gazette of the Government of India i.e. Dr. Subramanian Swamy has stated in Madras that he is a freelance Cabinet Minister. He has explained to

the Congress party about the difficulties in presenting a regular budget. So it is no use blaming the Congress party. Don't blame the Congress party. It is his walking gazette which is responsible. The Prime Minister should take action against the free-lance Cabinet Minister, Dr. Subramanian Swamy. He is speaking something irrelevant. He is \* man and speaking irrelevant things. I object to that... (Interruptions)...

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHASKAR ANNAJI MASODKAR):** Mr. Maran, what is your point of order?

**SHRI MURASOLI MARAN (Tamil Nadu):** You please listen.

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHASKAR ANNAJI MASODKAR):** Are you on a point of order or something else it is?

**SHRI MURASOLI MARAN:** I am making a submission like others. Sir, we are passing through some unprecedented...

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHASKAR ANNAJI MASODKAR):** The point of order has been raised by Mr. Vajpayee. Do you want to support that?

**SHRI MURASOLI MARAN:** I want to support that with additional plea. We are passing through some unprecedented funny times. We have been summoned to attend the budget session. Here is a budget session without any budget. Here is a Government without any effective Government. Where are we leading to? In unprecedented times we can understand about the vote-on-account instead of a regular budget. But what is the reason they are saying? This vote-on-account can be taken if there is some compulsion. What is the compulsive reason? They are saying that the Tamil Nadu elections are going to take place so 30 to 40 MPs will be going there, so how how can

take up regular budget? Is it a proper reply? Then, who asked you to dismiss Karunanidhi's Government? So just to precipitate crisis... (Interruptions)... This is a valid point. They are searching for a lame excuse. Kulkarni has rightly pointed out about the \* \* He has not only said it in Madras but he said that he was the author of the idea of this... (Interruptions)...

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHASKAR ANNAJI MASODKAR):** Why do you want to follow Kulkarni?

**SHRI MURASOLI MARAN:** He is an elderly person. Whenever it is convenient for us we follow him. It depends upon our convenience.

**SHRI G. SWAMINATHAN (Tamil Nadu):** Sir, Mr. Subramanian Swamy is a Member of this House. Another Member cannot say that he is \* \* \* ... (Interruptions)... I strongly object to this... (Interruptions)... He is casting aspersions against a Member of this House... (Interruptions)...

**SHRI SURESH KALMADI:** \* \* \* should be taken off from the record. He is a Member of this House.

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHASKAR ANNAJI MASODKAR):** I will look into record.

**SHRI SURESH KALMADI:** The Member should either withdraw that word or it should be taken off from the record.

**SHRI MURASOLI MARAN:** Sir, I heard a voice that so and so is a very dynamic and active person. Sir, \* \* \* are always active. They cannot sleep. Coming to the point... (Interruptions)...

**SHRI SURESH KALMADI:** He is a Member of this House. \* \* should be expunged from the record. He cannot

[Shri Suresh Kalmadi]

not be termed as \* \* We want your ruling on this.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHASKAR ANNAJI MASODKAR): I will look into the record.

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: Can he use this word?... (Interruptions)...

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI: he statement for Dr. Subramanian Swamy in Madras is not only irrelevant but he is behaving as if he is out of joint with the Cabinet. When I used the word \* \* I never meant... (Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHASKAR ANNAJI MASODKAR): That should be enough... (Interruptions)...

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: Then, you withdraw that word.

SHRI JAGESH DESAI: You withdraw the words \* \*... (Interruptions)...

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: They are intimidating the Member. What is this? It is his honest opinion. They are trying to intimidate him and threaten him. He is a senior Member.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHASKAR ANNAJI MASODKAR): Have you finished, Mr. Maran- (Interruptions).

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Sir, you protect the Member. Mr. Ahluwalia is threatening him, intimidating him. (Interruptions).

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHASKAR ANNAJI MASODKAR): Please take your seats. Mr. Maran, take your seat.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: You must protect Mr. Kulkarni.

See; how he is threatening him. (Interruptions).

SHRI G. SWAMINATHAN: Tomorrow another Member will say Mr. Kulkarni is... (Interruptions). This is not the way to address another Member. Apart from being a Minister, he is a Member of this House. (Interruptions). Please expunge those words.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHASKAR ANNAJI MASODKAR): Please take your seats.

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN: Sir, let me complete.

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI: Sir, when I said... (Interruption).

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHASKAR ANNAJI MASODKAR): Are you withdrawing or are you not withdrawing?

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI: Let me express... (Interruptions).

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: This is unfair. (Interruptions). They are intimidating him. There is nothing unparliamentary. Why should he withdraw that? (Interruptions).

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Is that unparliamentary? (Interruptions).

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHASKAR ANNAJI MASODKAR): They do not look well.

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN: Please listen to me before you deliver your judgment. (Interruptions).

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHASKAR ANNAJI MASODKAR): They will stand expunged.

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN: Sir, I plead with you. Neither you nor I nor Kulkarniji nor anybody here can certify whether one is... \*

\*Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHASKAR ANNAJI MASODKAR): This will not go on record.

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN: Why? (Interruptions). He has uttered that words.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHASKAR ANNAJI MASODKAR): Please listen. These words, derogatory remarks, will not go on record. (Interruptions).

THE MINISTER OF FINANCE (SHRI YASHWANT SINHA): Sir, just a moment. (Interruption).

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN: Let me finish.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: I have something to say on this. You can speak after that, Mr. Maran. I have something to say on what has happened. (Interruptions).

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI: ...my intention was, this is a mad... (Interruptions).

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHASKAR ANNAJI MASODKAR): Please take your seats.

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: What is your ruling in the matter?

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHASKAR ANNAJI MASODKAR): All of you, please take your seats. Any derogatory remark against Members will not go on record. And I do feel... (Interruptions).

SHRI M. VINCENT (Tamil Nadu): How can he say that? He is not a doctor. (Interruptions).

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHASKAR ANNAJI MASODKAR): Those words will be expunged.

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN: \*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHASKAR ANNAJI MASODKAR): That will not go on record. (Interruptions). Nothing will go on record.

Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

(Interruptions). Please sit down, all of you. Please sit down. (Interruptions). Let us hear Mr. Murasoli Maran. Would you please restrict your speech? (Interruptions). Now please restrict your point or order. (Interruptions).

डा० रत्नकर पाण्डेय : तमिलनाडु में राष्ट्रपति शासन लागू कर दिया गया है इसलिए पार्टी लाइंस के आधार पर... (व्यवधान) डी०एम०के० के सदस्य इस सदन का समय खराब कर रहे हैं। किसी सदस्य को मेंटल सिक कहने का अधिकार किसी को नहीं है। अगर किसी ने कहा है तो उसको आपस लिया जाए। तब सदन की कार्यवाही आगे चलने दी जाएगी।

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHASKAR ANNAJI MASODKAR): That has already been done.

SHRI JAGDISH PRASAD MATUR (Uttar Pradesh): That means Mr. Subramanian Swamy is\* \* \*

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN: Sir, when Mr. Subramanian Swamy went to Madras, he has stated without paying heed to the... (Interruptions).

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHASKAR ANNAJI MASODKAR): Restrict yourself to the point of order.

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN: He has convinced Mr. Rajiv Gandhi about the necessity of the Vote-on-Account. (Interruptions). We know fully well that the Finance Minister was ready with the full-fledged Budget. (Interruptions).

डा० रत्नकर पाण्डेय : प्रधानमंत्री ने राष्ट्रपति से आदेश ले करके लेखा अनुदान दोनों सदन के सामने रखने का फैसला किया है, यह सबको मालूम है। उसके बाद भी इस तरह सदन का समय खराब करने की डी०एम०के० के लोगों की साजिश है। सबेरे से वे लोग सदन

Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

डा. रत्नाकर पाण्डेय :

का समय खराब कर रहे हैं। ये राष्ट्र को क्या संदेश देना चाहते हैं....  
(अवधान) ये सदन का समय खराब कर रहे हैं, इनको रोका जा।

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHASKAR ANNAJI MASODKAR): I have followed the point of order.

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN: The media-reports have said that the Railway Minister and the Finance Minister, they were ready... (Interruptions).

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Sir, I must protest against this. I have been listening patiently all this while. Now, there is no point of order in it. What is the point of order? The Railway Minister has not even presented the Budget. Let us listen to him. He will offer all the explanations that you want. (Interruptions).

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Sir, you have to give the ruling and not the Finance Minister. How can he give the ruling? (Interruption).

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Sir, how can the Leader of the House say whether it is a point of order or not?

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHASKAR ANNAJI MASODKAR): I agree that whatever feelings... (Interruptions).

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN: Sir, I have not completed. I am in the mid-way. Let me complete. I won't take a lot of time.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHASKAR ANNAJI MASODKAR): When are you likely to complete?

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN: Within one minute, Sir. Sir, we know from the media reports that the Railway Minister and the Finance Minister were ready with the full-fledged Budgets.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHASKAR ANNAJI MASODKAR): This is not a point of order.

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN: What is the compelling reason to postpone it? That means you are postponing the taxes, new taxes, heavy imports, freights and fares and other things to cheat the people. You say Tamil Nadu election is the reason. Delhi did not have election for so many years. There is no election in Assam. Why are you showing the lame excuse? Another thing is, the Budget secret is sacred in a democratic system. We have read as students of Public Finance about Dalton and others and because of leakage of secrecy, they had resigned. Now, Sir, on behalf of the Congress party, Mr. Pranab Mukherjee—he is a genius—he goes and holds discussions, answers all the points. How is it possible? (Interruptions).

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: It is not true. (Interruptions).

SHRI MAKHAN LAL FOTEDAR (Uttar Pradesh): Let the Budget be first presented and then Mr. Finance Minister, you speak.  
3.00 P.M.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHASKAR ANNAJI MASODKAR): I would request all of you to take your seats. Mr. Leader of the House, do you want to respond to this? If you respond, this will again go on.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: If you are an honest man, you promise... (Interruptions)

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: I want to bring this debate to an end. I think it is entirely irrelevant at this time to raise issues which are not connected with the presentation of the Railway Budget which my colleague, Mr. Bhakta Charan Das, is presenting and because I am not presenting the General Budget... (Interruptions)

AN HON. MEMBER: This not your Budget... (Interruptions)

**SHRI YASHWANT SINHA:** When I come before this House, I shall tell you all the reasons why I am not presenting the budget. This is no time to discuss it. Let me make it quite clear. I am not running away from any responsibility... (Interruptions)... I am not running away from any responsibility. But this is no time to discuss it. When I come with my speech, I will tell you why I am not presenting the budget. This is not the time, Sir... (Interruptions)... If they are interested in wasting the time of the House, let them go ahead. They have done it and they might go ahead. But I think we should bring to an end this absolutely irrelevant discussion. Please permit the Railway Minister to present the Vote-on-Account. (Interruptions)

**DR. G. VIJAYA MOHAN REDDY** (Andhra Pradesh): How can he say it is irrelevant? (Interruptions)

**SOME HON. MEMBERS:** We want to know the reasons for postponing the budget. (Interruptions)

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN** (SHRI BHASKAR ANNAJI MASODKAR): I am on my legs. Please sit down. All of you, please take your seats. (interruptions) Please take your seats. I have heard the hon. Members...

**SHRI DIPEN GHOSH:** Sir, because the Leader of the House who happens to be the Finance Minister, has stated that the presentation of Railway Budget has no connection with the presentation of the General Budget, this fact has to be clarified.

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN** (SHRI BHASKAR ANNAJI MASODKAR): He has already responded to it. Nothing else.

**SHRI DIPEN GHOSH:** But that is not correct, Sir. This is neither pro-

entire budgetary process. ... (Interruption)... What is the use of presenting a Vote-on-Account?

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN** (SHRI BHASKAR ANNAJI MASODKAR): Let me finish this point of order. ... (Interruption)... I have heard the hon. Members including the mover of the point of order and I don't think there is any point of order in my view...

**डा. रत्नाकर पाध्ये :** इद लोगों ने राष्ट्रपति के अभिषाषण का बायकाट किया है और सदन की कार्यवाही नहीं चला रहे हैं (Interruptions)

**SHRI MURASOLI MARAN:** He should tell us why it was postponed.

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN** (SHRI BHASKAR ANNAJI MASODKAR): He will explain it later on.

**SHRI MURASOLI MARAN:** Let him tell what the reason is.

**SHRI YASHWANT SINHA:** I will tell you the reasons when I come with my statement. When I come with the General Budget, I will tell you the reason.

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN** (SHRI BHASKAR ANNAJI MASODKAR): Do you want to respond, Mr. Sinha? ... (Interruption)... If you respond that will again go on. (Interruptions)

I request all of you to take your seats. Let us finish the point of order. Let us finish it. (Interruptions) I don't think there is any point of order and the Government is entitled to bring a Vote-on-Account to this House...

**SOME HON. MEMBERS:** It is not a Vote-on-Account (Interruptions)

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN** (SHRI



Just listen to me. ... (Interruptions) ...  
Would you listen to me or not?

**SHRI DIPEN GHOSH:** I am on a point of order, Sir. I want to know whether there is a Vote-on-Account for the entire year because it has been mentioned that it is for the whole year. (Interruptions) Similarly, in my view...

**SHRI JAGDISH PRASAD MAHUR:** Sir,...

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHASKAR ANNAJI MASODKAR):** I have not permitted you, Mr. Mathur. I have not permitted you. Nothing will go on record.

**SHRI JAGDISH PRASAD MATHUR:**

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHASKAR ANNAJI MASODKAR):** I am in the midst of my statement. Please sit down, Mr. Mathur. Please sit down. Would you please sit down? Mr. Mathur, a senior Member like you, when I am in the midst of giving a ruling, should not interrupt. I was just trying to dispose of the point of order. I said that the Government is entitled to lay before this House the Vote on Account and there is no impropriety in it. Article 112 which has been relied upon does not prohibit the Government from this procedure. In fact, Article 116 of the Constitution is enabling. So, there is no point of order. Now, the Railway Minister... (Interruptions)...

**SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA:** In protest we walk out.

[At this stage hon. Members left the Chamber]

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHASKAR ANNAJI MASODKAR):** Mr. Bhakta Charan Das, please lay the Bill on the Table.

Sir, I beg to lay on the Table a statement (in English and Hindi) of the estimated receipts and expenditure of the Government of India for the year 1991-92, in respect of Railways.

#### DISCUSSION ON GULF WAR— Contd.

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHASKAR ANNAJI MASODKAR):** Now, the question is whether the House should take the Special Mention or the Gulf situation. Let us finish the Gulf situation because it is half-way.

**SHRI A. G. KULKARNI (Maharashtra):** When is the Prime Minister going to reply to the Gulf situation?

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHASKAR ANNAJI MASODKAR):** Therefore, I ask what is the view of the House.

**SHRI M. M. JACOB (Kerala):** Gulf.

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHASKAR ANNAJI MASODKAR):** Mr. Jacob, let us begin with you.

**SHRI A. G. KULKARNI:** Yes. But at what time the Prime Minister is going to reply?

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHASKAR ANNAJI MASODKAR):** Mr. M. M. Jacob. (Interruptions)

**SHRI A. G. KULKARNI:** Mr. Vice-Chairman, when is the Prime Minister going to reply?

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHASKAR ANNAJI MASODKAR):** At the end of the discussion.

**SHRI A. G. KULKARNI:** At what time, Sir? How much time it will take?