

are held out to them and allurements are also being offered to them. The freedom of the Indian Press is sought to be silenced by those who are waging the war against Iraq. This is a war against the sovereignty of a nation. This is a war against the freedom of the Indian Press. We cannot tolerate this. I wish the Prime Minister speaks on this subject.

THE PRIME MINISTER (SHRI CHANDRA SHEKHAR): Madam, I have patiently heard Mr. Gupta. He quoted from a letter which has been written by some diplomat. I do not know whether he is a diplomat or some official.

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: He is a diplomat. I mentioned. He is a Minister and Deputy High Commissioner of the British Embassy.

SHRI CHANDRA SHEKHAR: There is nothing threatening in it. But the letter is not in good taste. I cannot pass any judgement until and unless I know what article the journalist wrote. In a free country, people are free to express their opinion. If the article is in the same way, the reply may be totally justified. This is not a matter on which a diplomat can be sent back.

The other remark which has been made, is unfortunate; our journalists being allured by any foreign mission. I have not that poor opinion about our journalists. If some people are making this attempt, it should be spurned. I have very high opinion about our journalists and I am quite sure, they will withstand any pressure; they will not be pressurised.

If there is anything which is out of the way, surely, the Government will take action, but not because certain people use certain types of language. Words do not catch anybody's tongue. I do not know what has been written in the article and what is the reply. Until and unless I see it, I cannot pass any remark. I am sure that our journalists will not be influenced. Threatening is a different thing. But in regard to influence, it is part of diplomatic work. They try to influence. It is for that purpose they are here. They must be try to influence them, but threatening is not allowed. If any threatening is there, we shall not allow.

SHRI KAPIL VERMA (Uttar Pradesh): I must say that our Indian journalist will not be influenced by anybody. They are strong enough. They have taken part in the freedom struggle. No outsider, no diplomatic staff can influence or succeed in bullying us or put us on the wrong path. There is no question like this. (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now that letter is over. The Prime Minister has replied. I think it is closed now.

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: The Prime Minister should have been more categorical. It is not a question of language, it is a question of audacity.

CBI REPORT ON BUGGING OF TELEPHONES

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY (Uttar Pradesh): Madam Deputy Chairman, I want to draw the attention of the Prime Minister and the House to a very important and serious matter. The CBI has submitted a report to the Government in respect of telephone tapping sometime past. All the leaders of the Opposition have sent a letter to the Chairman in this regard only two days back and we requested him that we want to raise this issue on the floor of the House.

AN HON. MEMBER: Let the CBI report be laid on the Table of the House.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: This is a serious, blatant breach and violation of the privileges and rights of M.Ps, leaders, M.L.As, Ministers political party headquarters, ex-M.Ps, cutting across all political parties and a part of it has been published... (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The Chairman has permitted him. I will permit you also. If your special mention is there, I will permit you also.

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI (Maharashtra): When?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: After he finishes, not together.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: Part of this report has appeared in 'India Today' and this has been going on for a number of years. Only sometime back when my friend, Shri Chandra Shekhar,

raised this issue of phone tapping, he said that his house had been bugged and his phone was tapped. This was raised by him and the Lok Sabha took notice of his complaint. (*Interruptions*). He repeatedly asserted that his phone was being bugged.

THE MINISTER OF COMMERCE WITH ADDITIONAL CHARGE OF THE MINISTRY OF LAW AND JUSTICE (SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY): All the three phones.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: Here the CBI has given this report. Many important names are there—names belonging to the Congress party, names belonging to our party, Communist party and various important citizens of India.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA (Andhra Pradesh): Including the name of Mr. Jayalalitha.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: I consider it is a very serious matter. It is a gross breach of all the laws of the land, propriety. It is an infringement. This has caused grave infringement on the rights and liberty of the citizens of India. This is a grave violation of all the rules. This does not concern my party alone, this concerns all of us. Therefore, I am not making any partisan attack at all.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Shri K. C. Pant's telephone was tapped.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: Phones of Shri K. C. Pant, Ms Jayalalitha Shri Bangarappa, have been tapped. All these names, Kumaramangalam, Antulay—various names—have been given. I want the Government to place this report on the Table of the House. And this has got to be debated and Parliament should suggest action against those people who are responsible for violation and infringement of the law, whoever it is. On this issue the Prime Minister was very vocal when he was an ordinary Member of the Lok Sabha. Now he is the Prime Minister of India and there is a report. Those who are responsible for this breach of law and propriety and grave infringement of the rights of the citizens of India should be identified, responsibility should be fixed and they should be punished. I demand that the report should be placed on the

Table of the House, there should be a full-dress debate, action has got to be suggested by Parliament and Government should not shirk its responsibility in placing this report on the Table of the House.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH (West Bengal): Madam ... (*Interruptions*) ...

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: The Prime Minister is present. Let him please listen to us also. He can wait for some time.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Prime Minister, Mr. Kulkarni has also given a Special Mention.

THE PRIME MINISTER (SHRI CHANDRA SHEKHAR): About this only?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes, the same thing. So I will allow him also to speak.... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Before the Prime Minister reacts, we have certain points to make....(*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let Mr. Kulkarni speak first. Then I will decide what to do—not now. (*Interruptions*)... We can't have a full-fledged discussion on it ...(*Interruptions*)... Just a minute; please sit down. ... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN (Maharashtra): I had given notice of this Special Mention. If somebody hijacks my Special Mention, goes to the Chairman and gets permission, this is not the system.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I don't know that. You inquire from the Chairman and the Secretariat. That is not my job.

SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN: This was given only three days back. I had given it five days back and you don't allow me.

...(*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Don't get agitated. I will inquire why your Special Mention was hijacked. ...(*Interruptions*)... I will find out.

SHRI JAGDISH PRASAD MAIHUR (Uttar Pradesh): Why should it be hijacked by somebody else? ...(*Interruptions*)...

उपसभापति : माधुर साहब, आप उनको बोलने दीजिये। वे आपसे ज्यादा जोर से बोलते हैं।

श्री प्रमोद महाजन : जोर से बोलने की बात नहीं है।

उपसभापति : मुझे मालूम नहीं है।

श्री प्रमोद महाजन : इसमें मेरा दोष नहीं है।

उपसभापति : मैंने आपसे कहा कि मुझे मालूम नहीं है। मैं पता लगाऊंगी और बतलाऊंगी। स्पेशल मेंशन चेयरमैन साहब देखते हैं। उनसे मुझे पूछना पड़ेगा।

I will ask the Chairman's office and the Secretariat.

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी (मध्य प्रदेश) : आप उनको भी एलाऊ कर दीजिये और मामला खत्म कीजिये।

उपसभापति : वह मैं एलाऊ कर दूंगी। लेकिन चेयरमैन साहब के अख्तियार में अपने हाथ में नहीं ले सकती हूँ। जो मेरे हाथ में है वह मैं एलाऊ कर दूंगी।

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Give us one minute each.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No. When Chairman allowed Mr. Gurupadaswamy, it was in consideration that he would be speaking for all of you.

SOME HONOURABLE MEMBERS: No. ... (Interruptions)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: But you cannot have a full-fledged discussion on it.

SHRI V. NARAYANSAMY (Pondicherry): Madam, kindly allow us also... (Interruptions)...

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: To save postage we don't put all letters in one cover and post it. We have to spend one rupee for each letter.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: Madam, I request you to hear other leaders also. ... (Interruptions)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Balu, please sit down. At least, let the

Member speak. He is already on his feet. You can't hijack him now. Please sit down take your seat. ... (Interruptions)... I heard you. I can see and hear both of you. Sit down.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN (Tamil Nadu): Please allow us also. ... (Interruptions)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: On phone tapping? ... (Interruptions)... That is some other matter. After the telecommunication matter is over, we will take it up.

SHRI M. M. JACOB (Kerala): Madam, if you allow many people to participate, then. ... (Interruptions)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let Mr. Kulkarni speak. He has a Special Mention. I am allowing him. ... (Interruptions)... Please take your seats. I have allowed only Mr. Kulkarni, nobody else ... (Interruptions)...

Now order in the House. Yes, Mr. Kulkarni.

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI: Madam Deputy Chairman, I am thankful to you. I have also the same complaint. My special mention was hijacked. The Chairman has allowed Mr. Gurupadaswamy. I have no objection. Anyway, I want to make

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am happy that only the special mentions have been hijacked, not Members of Parliament.

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI: I do not know what they will do.

I am drawing the attention of the Prime Minister to the news item about what he mentioned. I have also read it. Everybody has read it. The whole point is not whether my friend, Mr. Chandrá Shekhar, has mentioned it in the last Lok Sabha, whatever it is. I used to go to Mr. Chandrá Shekhar's residence many times. I also found that there was something going on. So, we used to call him out and say, "we shall sit in the garden. You speak with us in the garden." That is a fact.

SHRI JAGDISH PRASAD MATHUR: What were you conspiring?

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI: I will tell you everything. Mathur Saheb. Just take it slowly.

So, Madam, what this report of the CBI, the special investigation bureau, has stated. I do not know. But it will be in the interest of the Government to lay it on the Table of the House, as a friend I advise.

Madam Deputy Chairman, there is another friend of mine, Dr. Subramanian Swamy.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: I don't want you to say "friend." You say "honourable friend."

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI: Dr. Subramanian Swamy, an honourable Member of this House, whether he is a friend or a foe, is there. He must be annoyed. But Madam Deputy Chairman, it was Dr. Swamy who raised this issue of tapping of telephones a year back against Mr. Hegde. Dr. Swamy raised this issue. The House itself suggested that the draconian law passed in the eighteenth century needs a replacement and that it must follow the present political set-up. Madam, though at that time the V.P. Singh Government promised that it would bring in the necessary legislation ... (Interruptions)

SHRI JAGESH DESAI (Maharashtra): They made so many promises.

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI: It made the promise in the discussion in the Lok Sabha. But it is still not coming to the extent it is necessary.

I do not know why Mr. Hegde has taken so much trouble about the value-based politics etc. and resigned. Now there is no necessity of resigning at all. One must stick to the chair whatever may happen because this is the present value-based politics. The definition of "value-based politics" is the chair, and the chair is more important than anything else. So, Madam Deputy Chairman, I request through you....

SHRI G. SWAMINATHAN (Tamil Nadu): Madam, he is casting aspersions on you.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: My Chair is important. Don't worry.

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI: You get that Chair. I don't mind. Madam Deputy Chairman, lastly I want to say that we have got examples right from Watergate. So, it is high time that the Prime Minister applies his mind. First he should place the report on the Table of the House on behalf of the Government. Otherwise, I have seen that that report is being distributed to the Members of the House. Anybody can come and place it. But the basic point, Madam, is that the dreaded intelligence agencies like the I.B., then the Police Commissioner, it has been mentioned....

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: The RAW.

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI: Intelligence agencies means everything. Even if Mr. Upendra has got one, it is an intelligence agency. It has been mentioned that the Intelligence Bureau and even the Police Officers order tapping without the requisite permission and authority as provided in the law. So, I hope that the Prime Minister will see that a law is immediately enacted as early as possible to stop all this. I think the Government which Mr. Chandra Shekhar is heading, will last till that law is enacted.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Pramod Mahajan, (Interruptions) No. At least let me allow those who have said their Special Mention has been hijacked. Let me bring them back to the House, please.

श्री प्रमोद महाजन : उपसभापति महोदया, मेरी सब से पहली प्रार्थना तो यह होगी कि शून्य काल में किसी विशेष विषय को उठाने की अनुमति देने के पहले राज्य सभा सचिवालय इसकी भी जांच करे कि क्या इसी विषय पर किसी सदस्य ने अगर कोई विशेष बात मांगी हो और उसकी विशेष उल्लेख की सूचना राज्य सभा सचिवालय के पास चार-पांच दिन से पड़ी हो तो उसकी जानकारी वह राज्य सभा अध्यक्ष को

दें। मुझे राज्य सभा अध्यक्ष के निर्णय लेने में कोई आपत्ति नहीं है लेकिन इससे निर्णय लेने में उनकी मदद हो सकती है कि पहले इसी विषय पर किसी सदस्य ने अनुमति मांगी थी या नहीं मांगी थी।

उपसभापति : यह चूंकि सेक्रेटेरियट की बात है, जितने भी नोटिसेज स्पेशल मेशन के लिये आते हैं किसी विषय के लिये मैम्बर्स की तरफ से तो सेक्रेटेरियट ईमानदारी के साथ डेट और टाइम लगा कर चेयरमैन साहब के पास भेज देते हैं। यह चेयरमैन साहब का डिस्क्रिशन होता है वह जिसको चाहें दें। यह उनकी डिस्क्रिशन है। मैं समझती हूँ कि यह सही है और रहनी चाहिये। अब अगर आपको इस विषय में चेयरमैन साहब से पूछना है तो मैं उसमें आपकी मदद कर दूंगी।

श्री नरेश सी० पुगलिया (महाराष्ट्र) : उपसभापति महोदया, मैंने भी एक महत्वपूर्ण विषय जीरो आवर में . . . (व्यवधान)

उपसभापति : जीरो आवर खत्म हो गया।

श्री नरेश सी० पुगलिया : आपने अलाउ किया था प्रधान मंत्री जी के सामने महाराष्ट्र के महत्वपूर्ण विषय को उठाने के लिये (व्यवधान)

उपसभापति : आपको अलाउ नहीं किया है बीच में बोलने के लिये . . . (व्यवधान)

श्री नरेश सी० पुगलिया : उपसभापति महोदया, मुझे महाराष्ट्र के कुछ महत्वपूर्ण मुद्दे उठाने हैं, मैं आधा मिनट का समय लूंगा। महाराष्ट्र के महत्वपूर्ण विषय को और मैं आपका ध्यान आकर्षित करना चाहूंगा। (व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will not allow like that. That is not proper. Please sit down.

श्री नरेश सी० पुगलिया : प्रधान मंत्री जी हाऊस में मौजूद हैं।

उपसभापति : प्रधान मंत्री जी मौजूद हैं और मौजूद रहेंगे। (व्यवधान)

I will not allow like this. He is not yielding. He is already on his feet. He has to finish what he is saying.

SHRI NARESH C. PUGLIA: Then you allow me, Madam.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: When we have a subject before the House, we cannot hijack like that. I know every Member has very important things to say, but we have to go in a proper order. So, help me in running the House in proper order. I will allow you, but not just now.

श्री प्रमोद जहाङ्गन : उपसभापति महोदया, टेलीफोन टेपिंग पर केन्द्रीय गुप्तचर जांच ब्यूरो की जो रिपोर्ट है उसके कुछ अंश "इण्डिया टुडे" में छपे हैं। इसलिए मैं उन अंशों को यहां उद्धृत करना आवश्यक नहीं समझता हूँ। सब ने पढ़ा होगा। सरकार ने भी देखा होगा लेकिन वह रिपोर्ट पढ़ने के बाद एक साधारण नागरिक के रूप से भी व्यक्ति चिंतित होता है। इसमें विभिन्न राजनैतिक दलों के नेता हैं, संसद सदस्य हैं, अनेक पार्टियों के कार्यालय हैं। जैसे भारतीय जनता पार्टी का केन्द्रीय कार्यालय है उस का नाम इस टेलीफोन टेपिंग में है। आज सत्ता में जो लोग हैं उनके भी नाम हैं। जो विपक्ष में लोग हैं उनके भी नाम हैं। जो पहले सत्ता में थे और तब विपक्ष वालों का होता था। सत्ता पक्ष वालों का भी होता था। उनके अपने ही दल के कुछ लोगों के नाम हैं। इसलिए मैं यह जानना चाहता हूँ जैसे मेरे पूर्व-वक्ताओं ने कहा कि इसे सदन के पटल पर जरूर रखा जाए क्योंकि यह टेलीफोन टेपिंग का निर्णय जैसे कुछ जगह उस में लिखा गया है आर्थिक कारणों से कुछ संसद सदस्यों के टेलीफोन टेप किये जाते हैं।

एक इकनामिक आफेंडर। मुझे लगता है यह वाक्य बड़ा ही आपत्तिजनक है। अगर संसद सदस्यों में कुछ ऐसे हों जिनका नाम "इकनामिक आफेंडर" के नाते वहां आता हो तो यह काफी आपत्तिजनक है। इसलिए बार-बार अलग-अलग सरकारें आईं लेकिन सभी सरकारों ने एक ही बात कही कि टेलीफोन टैपिंग अधिकांश आर्थिक गुनाहगारों के लिए करते हैं जिनसे राष्ट्र को नुकसान पहुंचता है और किसी भी प्रकार से राजनैतिक नेताओं के टेलीफोन की टैपिंग नहीं होती है। लेकिन जितनी सूचियां पढ़ी जायें उनमें अधिकांशतः विभिन्न दलों के राजनीतिक नेता होते हैं। इसको देखते हुए, स्वाभाविक रूप से देश यह जानना चाहता है कि इस टेलीफोन टैपिंग का निर्णय क्या राजनीतिक निर्णय था? था, तो किस समय, किस सरकार ने किसके बारे में किया? क्या यह आर्थिक निर्णय था तो ऐसा आर्थिक निर्णय इन सदस्यों के बारे में किसने किया? या जैसे यह कहा जाता है कि न राजनेताओं को पता है, न सरकार को पता है, प्रशासन अपने लेवल पर इसका निर्णय लेता है। तो क्या इतने महत्वपूर्ण व्यक्तियों जैसे किसी मंत्री या पूर्व मंत्री अथवा किसी राजनीतिक दल के केन्द्रीय कार्यालय की टेलीफोन टैपिंग का निर्णय प्रशासन की लेवल पर होता है? इसलिए मैं चाहता हूं कि यह सदन के पटल पर रखा जाए। इसमें जो भी गुनाहगार हों, चाहे राजनैतिक व्यक्ति हों, मंत्री हों या सरकार हो उसके प्रशासनिक अधिकारी हों अगर उनको सख्त से सख्त सजा दें तो स्वाभाविक है कि इससे छुटकारा मिलेगा।

अंत में, एक बात यह भी कहना चाहता हूं कि माननीय चन्द्रशेखर जी जब संसद सदस्य थे, आज भी हैं, तब उन्होंने इसके बारे में शिकायत की थी। अब गत कुछ महीनों से वे प्रधान मंत्री हैं तो स्वाभाविक रूप से औरों की शिकायत जानने में देर लगे लेकिन उनके प्रधान मंत्री बनने के बाद उनका टेलीफोन किस प्रकार टेप होता था इसकी जानकारी उन्हें स्वाभाविक रूप से मिली होगी। तो वे सदन को इस जानकारी से भी अवगत

करायें कि उनकी टेलीफोन टैपिंग किस प्रकार और क्यों होती थी। इतनी जानकारी वे जल्दी दे सकते हैं, बाकी रिपोर्ट भी अगर सदन के सामने रखेंगे तो उचित होगा।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please sit down. The matter is not over. Let me finish this. The Prime Minister is going to react. ... (Interruptions)...

SHRI T. R. BALU (Tamil Nadu): Madam, he is the affected person. So you should allow him.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Balu, it is not necessary for your leader to be protected so much. I think, he can defend himself very well. He has the protection of the Chair like any other Member. I am just saying that the matter has been referred to by three Members—Mr. Gurupadaswamy, Mr. Kulkarni and ... (Interruptions) ... This is the way you people behave.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: Please allow the leaders of various groups also to speak.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It is all right. Unfortunately Members do not have the patience.

SHRI S. K. T. RAMACHANDRAN (Tamil Nadu): If you allow a Member from each party to speak, you should allow us also to speak.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: There is no discussion before the House on this subject. It was a matter of special mention. Now, it is not a party affair. It is an issue which was raised by three Members and they have already spoken on it. You can say that you associate with it because I cannot allow the time of the House to go on like this on issues which have not been listed officially. It is not proper also.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: We have also signed the letter which was sent to the Chairman. You must allow us also.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I cannot go beyond the purview of the Chairman.

THE LEADER OF THE HOUSE (SHRI YASHWANT SINHA): Madam Deputy Chairman, the Chairman had permitted Mr. Gurupadaswamy to raise a matter on behalf of many colleagues. (Interruptions)...

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: All the leaders have signed the letter. ... (Interruptions)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Gurupadaswamy, I do not agree with it.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: I am quoting Mr. Gurupadaswamy only. He said that many leaders of political groups have got together and decided to raise this issue. He raised it in this House and two other people have also raised this issue. The Prime Minister is fortunately here in this House and he is prepared to respond to it.

SHRI CHANDRA SHEKHAR: If you want to hear; otherwise...

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Now, if you want to hear the Prime Minister, give him a chance. Are we entering into a debate? ... (Interruptions) ... Madam Deputy Chairman, my point is, are we entering into a debate on this issue? Are we going to debate every issue which is raised? (Interruptions).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Just a minute. (Interruptions). Mr. Upendra, you were also a Minister. You understand. Just sit down. Please take your seat. (Interruption). Don't use that kind of an expression or language. There is no need to be agitated. (Interruption). I am not rigid at all. (Interruption). I have to be because ... (Interruptions) ... I have the listed business. (Interruption). Don't try to argue. I have allowed everybody listed here. Your name is not there. Where is your name? Is your name there? (Interruption)

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: You should get up and address the Chair. You should not sit down and address the Chair like this. (Interruptions).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It does not matter. He has a right to speak.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: He cannot sit down and address you. He must stand up and address you. (Interruptions).

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: We know why you are angry. (Interruptions).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please take your seats.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Madam Deputy Chairman, I want to make one sentence. In this House ... (Interruptions).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Control your own friends first before I can hear you.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: In this House, the complaint of telephone-tapping ... (Interruptions) ... of certain M.Ps. including Mr. Chandra Shekhar, was raised by Mr. Subramanian Swamy. (Interruptions). He raised this complaint. I would only remind you that at that time, when Mr. Subramanian Swamy raised the issue of the complaint of Mr. Chandra Shekhar's telephone being tapped, it was discussed here. (Interruptions).

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER (Gujarat): Madam, are you allowing a discussion on this? The Prime Minister wants to speak. If he is prepared to hear, let him hear.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am not allowing any discussion. (Interruptions). I am not permitting any discussion because the Chairman did not permit anybody else. I have to run this House on a proper order. (Interruptions). Please take your seats. When the letter was sent to the Chairman, the Chairman, in his wisdom,

allowed Mr. Gurupadaswamy to speak. (*Interruptions*). Just a minute. Please have patience to hear somebody else also. Then, Mr. Kulkarni and Mr. Mahajan said that they had also submitted a special mention. As a special consideration of the special mention, I allowed them both. (*Interruption*). All right. He was also permitted. (*Interruption*). He was overlooked by the Chairman. (*Interruption*). Keep quiet. I think one should learn certain decorum in the House. How can I allow a discussion on it when the Chairman did not permit it?

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: I am not asking for a discussion.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Then what are you asking for?

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Let the Prime Minister assure us that the report will be laid on the Table. (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You are not allowing him to speak. He stood up twice to speak. (*Interruption*). My phone is not being tapped. Don't worry.

SHRI CHANDRA SHEKHAR: I can well understand the concern of Members about the report that they have received from some quarters. My friend Mr. A. G. Kulkarni has got that report. It is true that there is a report. But I am sorry to say that I cannot share the report with the House. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Why?

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Why? (*Interruptions*). You made a false charge against the Government. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI RAJ MOHAN GANDHI (Uttar Pradesh): This is the report, I lay it on the Table. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: That is the report.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Mr. Subramanian Swamy wanted the CBI to inquire. The CBI has investigated. Why should not that report be tabled here? (*Interruptions*). It is an affront to Parliament. (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It is very unfortunate that a Member like Mr. Gandhi should do this. Does not he know the rules of the House that without my permission it cannot be laid on the Table of the House? He should not have done that. (*Interruption*) I am very sorry that though Mr. Raj Mohan Gandhi knows the rules of the House, he cannot lay anything on the Table of the House. He should not do it. It is not proper. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Anybody can do it. (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let the Prime Minister speak. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: When the Prime Minister says that he cannot share ... (*Interruptions*) ... It is an affront to Parliament. (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You allow him to speak. First you should allow him to speak. You cannot cut him short like this. He is the Prime Minister of the country. Let him speak. (*Interruption*). Mr. Gopalsamy take your seat. (*Interruptions*). Don't be so agitated. I say take your seat. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: What is the reason for withholding the report?

SHRI CHATURANAN MISHRA (Bihar): Madam, I am on a point of order.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: What is your point of order?

श्री चतुरानन मिश्र : मेरा पॉइंट आफ़ ऑर्डर यह है कि जो चीज़ एक गैर मेंबर को बाज़ार में मिल सकती है उससे मेंबरों को मेहरूम किया जा सकता है ?

उपसभापति : जवाब तो दे रहे हैं न। मैं पॉइंट आफ़ ऑर्डर का क्या जवाब दूँ ?

He is answering. Please keep quiet. (Interruption).

SHRI CHATURANAN MISHRA : You must give your ruling.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I will not give my ruling until and unless the Prime Minister finishes his speech. (Interruptions).

SHRI CHATURANAN MISHRA : You now any citizen can get this information. Then why the Members are deprived of it? (Interruptions).

SHRI DINESH GOSWAMI (Assam) : Madam, I am on a point of order.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : What is your point of order?

SHRI DINESH GOSWAMI : My point of order is that the CBI went into the enquiry because of the demand of Parliament and therefore has the Prime Minister the right to deny the availability of the report to Parliament when Parliament itself initiated the course of action for the report?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I cannot react to it and I say, until and unless I hear the Prime Minister fully, I will not give my opinion. Let me hear what he has to say. How can I give my opinion without hearing him? (Interruptions).

SHRI CHANDRA SHEKHAR : Madam Deputy Chairman, the CBI report is not the Commission of Enquiry report. Investigating agencies reports are not laid on the Table of the House. There has been an occasion when private Members have

laid some purportedly report of the CBI or other agencies but never in the history of this Parliament, the Government has ever laid on the Table of the House the report of the investigating agency because it will not be possible then for the investigating agency to function properly. Otherwise, I have no other thing to conceal or keep away the report from this House. In order to see that the investigating agency functioning effectively, I am constrained to say (Interruptions)... What do you mean by no, no? (Interruptions).

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY (Andhra Pradesh) : You are giving no reason. (Interruptions).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Let him finish. Take your seat. (Interruption).

SHRI CHANDRA SHEKHAR : I will not share... (Interruptions). I am guided by the rules, by laws and by conventions. I am guided by the rules, by the laws, by the conventions ...

(Interruptions)

I shall also answer that point.

(Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Sit down. Take your seats. Just because you have a loud voice, you can't interrupt the House.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA : When no such report can be placed, why did you demand an inquiry at that time?

(Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : It is very unfortunate that when the Prime Minister is reacting on your request, you are not listening to him. (Interruptions) That is not the proper way. Let him finish his speech and then I will allow you.

(Interruptions)

No, I am not allowing you to speak. I am not allowing you to interrupt the proceedings of the House like this...

(Interruptions)

SHRI CHANDRA SHEKHAR: Madam Deputy Chairman, I want to correct one thing. I never asked for a CBI inquiry. ((Interruptions) Hear me first.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: *

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: *

SHRI CHANDRA SHEKHAR: Certain Members raised that question in the House. ...

(Interruptions)

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: *

SHRI SUKOMAL SEN: *

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: *

*

SHRI CHATURANAN MISHRA: *

SHRI CHANDRA SHEKHAR: The matter was raised by some other Members. For two days I did not make a statement. Then there were some challenge words from my own party or the party to which I belong. I am not taking the responsibility ... (Interruptions) ... The Prime Minister in his wisdom ordered the inquiry of the CBI ... (Interruptions) ... Hear me. I am on record in that House: "CBI is not a toy in the hands of a child to be used anytime or everytime." I have said this at that time. And this is not going to solve the problem.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: *

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Dipen, this is not the way. I will not permit this kind of behaviour when the Prime Minister is on his legs. I will not allow anybody, I will not permit anybody. (Interruptions) I will just close down this discussion. Whatever he is saying, you will have to listen. Please sit down. I don't want Members should get up like this and

start interrupting him ... (Interruptions) Any body speaking without my permission is not going on record. Now they should realise that they can't just hijack the House like this. (Interruptions) of course, you are doing this.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: *

SHRI SUKOMAL SEN (West Bengal): *

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: *

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please sit down. As long as I am in the Chair, the House will run in order. Please sit down. (Interruptions) Take your seats, Please take your seats. (Interruptions)

SHRI CHANDRA SHEKHAR: The CBI report is for information on the basis of which the Government takes action. That is what the CBI report is meant for. On the basis of the CBI report ...

SHRI P. UPENDRA: *

(Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Sit down. Please take your seats. It is not going on record. There is no point in interrupting like this. If you take my permission, I will allow you. (Interruptions) It is not going on record. Whatever you say, he is not answerable to you

(Interruptions)

SHRI CHANDRA SHEKHAR: He might have done, I might have done, but it does not make the legal situation any different. (Interruptions) Now you do it. I am not going to accept it. That is where ..

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: *

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: *

SHRI CHANDRA SHEKHAR: You come to any conclusion, I have no opinion on that. I am giving the Government's opinion. I can only say

[Shri Chandra Shekhar]

that the hon. Members should rouse that I have not ordered any telephone tapping during the last three months (Interruptions). It is because I don't want that we should go into the past and that we should not try to expose each other. That is what I say.

(Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am not permitting anybody to interrupt the Prime Minister. Please take your seats.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA:*

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: *

SHRI CHANDRA SHEKHAR: I tell the House firmly, categorically and definitely, that the Government is not going to lay the report on the Table of the House ... (Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, I have not permitted anybody. And nothing will be placed on the Table without my permission. (Interruptions) Please sit down, Mr. Balu. Coming into the well is a different thing and laying anything on the Table without Chair's permission is a different thing.

SHRI DINESH GOSWAMI: Madam, ...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Dinesh Goswami, please sit down. I will permit you. Let him finish first. I promise you.

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी: महोदया, अगर आप अनुमति दें तो मैं प्रधान मंत्री जी के विचार के लिए एक सुझाव रखना चाहूंगा।

उपसभापति: मिस्टर बालु, आप जरा बैठिए।

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी: प्रधान मंत्री जी ने कहा है कि वह सभा-पटल

पर रिपोर्ट नहीं रखेंगे। मेरा सुझाव यह है कि वह चेयरमैन के कमरे में विरोधी दलों के नेताओं को रिपोर्ट दिखा दें इसमें कोई आपत्ति नहीं होनी चाहिए।

श्री चन्द्रशेखर: उपसभापति जी, मैंने दूसरे सदन में कहा है कि उस रिपोर्ट के बारे में श्री टेलीफोन टेपिंग के सवाल पर हम पूरी जानकारी हासिल कर रहे हैं। कल मैंने उस सदन में कहा कि टेलीफोन टेपिंग का दुरुपयोग न हो, उसके लिए क्या कदम उठाए जायें। उन रिपोर्टों को ... (व्यवधान) ...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let the Prime Minister complete his answer.

SHRI T. R. BALU: *

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN: *

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA:

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will not permit. Let him finish first.

(Interruptions)

श्री चन्द्रशेखर: जरा मुझे पूरा कर लेने दीजिए। सदन की विशेषाधिकार समिति के सामने उस रिपोर्ट की बातें कह दी गई हैं, बता दी गई हैं, उसी सी०बी०आई० की रिपोर्ट के बारे में ... (व्यवधान) ...

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी: किसको?

श्री चन्द्रशेखर: विशेषाधिकार समिति को और अगर माननीय अटल जी चाहेंगे और जब कोई कानून, जैसा आप कहते थे बनाने की जरूरत है, वह कानून बनेगा तो आपके सामने सारे तथ्य रखने में मुझे कोई एतराज नहीं है। लेकिन ... (व्यवधान) ...

If an agency or an officer is authorised by a political authority, then it is not unauthorised tapping. It may be improper, it may be irregular, but it is not unauthorised.

(Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes, Mr. Dinesh Goswami.

1.00 P.M.

Order, Please ...*(Interruptions)*... If anybody speaks without my permission, that will not go on record ... *(Interruptions)* ... Anybody speaking without my permission will not go on record ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: *

SHRI CHANDRA SHEKHAR: I am not answerable to you, Mr. Ghosh... *(Interruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Ghosh, you just don't get up and put a question. It has to come through me ...*(Interruptions)*... Otherwise, I will not permit ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI CHANDRA SHEKHAR: Madam Deputy Chairman, ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will not allow anybody now ... *(Interruptions)*... Let the Prime Minister speak ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI CHANDRA SHEKHAR: What I say is that the issue is whether the report can be laid on the Table of the House ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY (Tamil Nadu): *

SHRI CHANDRA SHEKHAR: No. It is not the Goebbelsian tactics adopted by this Government ...*(Interruptions)*... It is the technique which has been adopted in this House for four decades and I think that this cannot be disclosed in the House ...*(Interruptions)*...

SOME HON. MEMBERS: Why? ... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI CHANDRA SHEKHAR: It is not possible for the Government to say ... *(Interruptions)*...

DR. G. VIJAYA MOHAN REDDY (Andhra Pradesh): *

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN (Tamil Nadu): *

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Order, please ...*(Interruptions)*... I will not permit anybody who is speaking without my permission ...*(Interruptions)* ... It will not go on record ...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. G. VIJAYA MOHAN REDDY:*

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: *

SHRI CHANDRA SHEKHAR: I shall like to say ...*(Interruptions)*... I shall like to say only one word because otherwise it will create confusion. Some honourable Member mentioned about the RAW. RAW is not engaged in this type of activities ...

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN: *

SHRI CHANDRA SHEKHAR: I am saying this ... *(Interruptions)* ...

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN: *

SHRI CHANDRA SHEKHAR: What I say is that the RAW is responsible only to get information if certain people commit themselves with the outside world and if certain people feel sorry about it, ...*(Interruptions)* ... I have nothing to say about it ...*(Interruptions)* ... But, in the electronic field, the Government of India cannot afford to say that it will not get all the information which is against the interests of the nation. So, the RAW is engaged only where certain people try to establish contracts with foreign forces and this will continue in all circumstances ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have allowed Mr. Dinesh Goswami only ... *(Interruptions)*... All of you, please sit down ...*(Interruptions)*... I have identified him only ...*(Interruptions)*... Yes, Mr. Dinesh Goswami ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN: *

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have allowed Mr. Dinesh Goswami only, only him ... (Interruptions)... I am not allowing anybody else ... (Interruptions) ... Yes, Mr. Goswami.

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN: *

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: *

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: *

SHRI S. K. T. RAMACHANDRAN: *

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am allowing only Mr. Dinesh Goswami ... (Interruptions)... Yes, Mr. Goswami.

SHRI DINESH GOSWAMI: I would like the Prime Minister to respond to one of my questions.

I would like to know from the Prime Minister that if the report exposes that the privileges of the Members have been violated, imputing that certain Members have been considered to be economic offenders, what is the law and wherefrom he derives Parliamentary conventions which give them the authority to deny this report to the House? (Interruptions)

SHRI CHANDRA SHEKHAR: Let me answer.

Madam Deputy Chairman, my friend knows the law better than myself. But the only thing is that not for any other reason but in order to have smooth functioning of this investigating agency certain tradition has been established in this House, and because of that tradition and because of the free functioning of the investigating agency the Government will not lay the report on the Table of the House. (Interruptions)

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN: No tradition. Lay the report on the Table of the House. (Interruptions)

Madam, you said that you would give your ruling after the Prime Minister's ... (Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I said that the matter is over now. (Interruptions).

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN: You said that you would give your ruling. (Interruptions).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Do what you like. I cannot allow the House to go into discussion. I am not allowing. (Interruptions).

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: I want to know from the Prime Minister ... (Interruptions).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: If you want to walk out, why are you disturbing the House?

AN HON. MEMBER: Everything is exposed, (Interruptions).

(At this stage some hon. Members left the Chamber)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: We are now going to take up the Statutory Resolution. Mr. Yashwant Sinha.

श्री नरेश सी० पुगलिया : माननीय उपसभापति महोदया, मैं प्रधान मंत्री जी के ध्यान में यह बात लाना चाहता हूँ ... (व्यवधान)

उपसभापति : आप प्रधान मंत्री जी से बाद में बोल दीजिएगा ... (व्यवधान)

श्री नरेश सी० पुगलिया : महोदया, प्रधान मंत्री जी बहुत कम इस सदन में आते हैं और हमारा इशू बहुत इपोटेंट है । मुझे एक मिनट का समय दे दीजिए ।

उपसभापति : प्रधानमंत्री यहाँ बैठे रहेंगे । वे सुन लेंगे आपकी बात ... (व्यवधान) कश्मीर हो जाय फिर आप बोल दीजिएगा । यह टेक्निकलिटी है; इसको आज ही पास होना है ।