

**REPORT OF THE COMMITTEE ON  
PUBLIC UNDERTAKINGS**

**SHRI DIPEN GHOSH (West Bengal):**  
Madam, I beg to lay on the Table a copy (in English and Hindi) of the Eighth Report of the Committee on Public Undertakings on action taken by Government on the recommendations contained in their Fifty-seventh Report (Eighth Lok Sabha) on Food Corporation of India—Despatches of substandard wheat

**MOTION FOR ELECTION TO THE  
CENTRAL ~~SILK~~ BOARD**

कस्तूर तथा खाद्य प्रसंस्करण उद्योग मंत्री (श्री हुक्मदेव नारायण यादव): मैं प्रस्ताव करता हूँ कि :

“केन्द्रीय रेशम बोर्ड अधिनियम 1948 (1948 का 61) की धारा 4 की उप-धारा (3) के खण्ड (ग) के अनुसरण में यह सभा उस रीति से, जैसा सभापति निर्देश दे, सभा के सदस्यों में से दो सदस्यों को केन्द्रीय रेशम बोर्ड का सदस्य होने के लिए निर्वाचित करने की कार्यवाही करें।”

*The question was put and the motion was adopted*

**MOTION FOR ELECTION TO THE  
COFFEE BOARD**

वाणिज्य मंत्रालय में उप मंत्री (श्री शान्तिलाल पुरुषोत्तमदास पटेल): मैं प्रस्ताव करता हूँ कि

“काफी नियम 1955 के नियम 4 के उपनियम (1) के साथ पठित काफी अधिनियम 1942 (1942 का 7) की धारा 4 की उपधारा (2) के खंड (ख) के अनुसरण में यह सभा उस रीति से, जैसा सभापति निर्देश दे, सभा के सदस्यों में से एक सदस्य को उक्त बोर्ड का सदस्य होने के लिए निर्वाचित करने की कार्यवाही करें।”

*The question was put and the motion was adopted.*

**REG. THE MEMORANDUM OF SHRI  
SIMRANJEET SINGH MANN**

**SHRI R K DHAWAN (Andhra Pradesh),** Madam Deputy Chairman .  
(Interruptions)

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर (उत्तर प्रदेश): महोदया, मुझे एक निवेदन करने की अनुमति दीजिए।

श्री सुरेन्द्रजीत सिंह अहलुवालिया (बिहार): एक्साइज स्केडल।

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर: महोदया, मैं आपके माध्यम से सरकार का ध्यान एक बड़े महत्वपूर्ण विषय की ओर आकर्षित करना चाहता हूँ। प्रधान मंत्री महोदय ने सिमरनजीत सिंह मान से बातचीत की है। अखबारों में उस बारे में छपा है। मेरे हाथ में मेमोरेण्डम भी है, जो मेमोरेण्डम मान साहब ने प्रधान मंत्री को दिया था। उनकी कुछ टिप्पणियाँ भी हैं। प्रधान मंत्री महोदय की, मेमोरेण्डम उन्होंने जो नेताओं के पास भेजा था। लेकिन अफसोस यह है कि इस सदन को प्रधान मंत्री और सरकार ने अब तक विश्वास में नहीं लिया है कि क्या हुआ है? उसमें बड़े महत्व की बातें हैं। सबसे ओपनिंग पैराग्राफ में ही मान साहब कहते हैं कि

“The Hindus, Muslims and the Sikhs were the signatories to the memorandum.”

उपसभापति: माथुर साहब, आप भाषण न करें। आपने अपनी बात कह दी। आपको पता है कि मेरे सामने लिस्टेड विजनेस है।

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर: एक मिनट लूंगा (व्यवधान)... विषय तो पूरा रखने दीजिए।

श्री सुरेन्द्रजीत सिंह अहलुवालिया: यह पता तो लगे कि यह मेमोरेण्डम सच्चा है या झूठा। अगर यह प्रधान मंत्री महोदय को दिया गया तो प्रधान मंत्री महोदय सदन के पटल पर रखे पढ़कर सुनाए... (व्यवधान)।

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर : वही कह रहा हूँ।

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH (West Bengal): Madam, Parliament is in session. (Interruptions)

श्री सुरेन्द्रजीत सिंह ग्रहलुवालिया : प्राइम मिनिस्टर साहब यह सदन पर रखे, उस पर विचार होगा। यह मेमोरेण्डम बी० जे० पी० के पास कहा से आया, इसका क्या जवाब है? यह सच्चा है, झूठा है, इसका क्या जवाब है?

... (Interruptions)

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर : प्रधान मंत्री ने सरक्यूलेट किया है।

श्री सुरेन्द्रजीत सिंह ग्रहलुवालिया : आपको दिया है?

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर : मैडम, मेरा यही एतराज है कि (व्यवधान)

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH Parliament is in session Parliament should be taken into confidence (Interruptions)

SHRI V NARAYANASAMY (Pondicherry) Was the Memorandum submitted to the BJP? (Interruptions)

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर : मैडम, मुझे इजाजत दी जाए। मेरी बात में क्यों दखल दिया जा रहा है?... (व्यवधान)

श्री सुरेन्द्रजीत सिंह ग्रहलुवालिया : महोदय, न तो सिमरजीत सिंह मान ने ... (व्यवधान) . . .

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH He is making statements outside the Parliament House in regard to (Interruptions)

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर : मुझे बोलने दीजिए, मुझे पहले पूरा बोलने दीजिए।

... (व्यवधान) . . .

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Parliament must be taken into confidence. Parliament is in session. . . (Interruptions)

SHRI VIREN J SHAH (Maharashtra) Mr Mathur is speaking You

allowed him to complete Let him complete

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA (West Bengal) The Prime Minister is behaving in a most improper way We would like to know what has happened between him and Mr Mann Let there be a discussion between Mr Mann and the Prime Minister I have no objection But we must be allowed to have a say. (Interruptions)

SHRI JAGDISH PRASAD MATHUR You allowed him?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN Mr Mathur, you know that he who has got a loud voice can be heard It so happens that he has been pleased with a loud voice Decide between yourselves who will raise it (Interruptions) You should ask not to disturb if others get up Please ask them not to disturb you

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर महोदय सबसे आश्चर्य की बात यह है कि (व्यवधान)

श्री सुरेन्द्रजीत सिंह ग्रहलुवालिया महोदय, इस मेमोरेण्डम को लेकर बड़ा कन्फ्यूजन है। रोज अखबारों में नई बात छपती है। (व्यवधान)

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर महोदय, मेरे से पूछा गया कि यह मेमोरेण्डम कहा से आया? प्रधान मंत्री के हस्ताक्षर से नेताओं को भेजा गया था, उसी की प्रति मेरे पास है। जो आडवाणी जी के पास गया, वह हम लोगों के पास भेजा गया। अफसोस यह है और जैसा मेरे साथियों ने कहा कि प्रधान मंत्री ने, क्या हुआ है, इस बारे में इस हाऊस को कान्फिडेंस में नहीं लिया और खास तौर से तब जब कि बात-चीत के बाद मान साहब ने खुल्लमखुल्ला यह वक्तव्य दिया है कि सेल्फ डिटरमिनेशन के अलावा किसी बात पर बात नहीं होगी। यह प्लेबिसाइट कहिए या ...

उपसभापति : माथुर साहब, आपने अपनी बात कह दी। सरकार के लोग यहाँ बैठे हैं, वह आपकी भावनाओं को जरूर पहुँचाएँ सरकार तक।

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर महोदय, यह बहुत महत्वपूर्ण बात है।

THE LEADER OF THE HOUSE (SHRI YASHWANT SINHA) About the remarks which have been made here I don't think the Prime Minister has done anything which is against the dignity of this House (Interruptions) The Prime Minister has not made any policy statement outside the two Houses of Parliament Let it be very clear I don't think it is the intention of the Prime Minister to keep back anything from Parliament and the people of this country The mere fact that he has shared it with the leaders of various political parties is a sure indication of his intent (Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN Now the matter is closed (Interruptions) We are not discussing this matter in the House

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA (West Bengal) Does he assure (Interruptions).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN I said the matter is not under discussion It is over

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA (Andhra Pradesh) It appeared in the Press. It is better that the Prime Minister makes a statement to clarify the position What is wrong in that? Very conflicting reports have come

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN Now, you have had your say The Minister reacted (Interruptions)

श्री शंकर दयाल सिंह (बिहार) : मैं बहुत दुखी हूँ क्योंकि मैं बहुत धीरे से बोल रहा हूँ, मेरी आवाज नहीं जा रही है जबकि जोर से बोलते हैं और लोग।

उपसभापति महोदय, जब से मान साहब का और प्रधान मंत्री की बातचीत का ब्यौरा अखबारों में आया है तब से पूरा देश चिंतित है खासकर के हम लोग विशेष रूप से चिंतित है देश की तरफ से। मेरी गुजारिश यह है कि इस सबध में प्रधान मंत्री जी को दोनों सदनों को विश्वास में लेना चाहिये। विश्वास में लेते हुये जो कुछ भी उनकी बात हुई है, जो उनकी मशा है, जो भी डिस्कशंस है उनको सदन के सामने रखना चाहिये और (व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN. That matter is over now

श्री शंकर दयाल सिंह : इस सबध में यहाँ चर्चा होनी चाहिये क्योंकि सदन की कार्यवाही चल रही है और इतनी महत्वपूर्ण बात सदन को गुमराह करके नहीं हो सकती है (व्यवधान)

उपसभापति : कृपया स्थान ग्रहण करें।

श्री शंकर दयाल सिंह : इसलिये महोदय आप माध्यम से मैं (व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please take your seat

श्री शंकर दयाल सिंह : सदन के नेता श्री यशवन्त सिन्हा वे कृपया हमारी भावनाओं को प्रधान मंत्री तक पहुँचाये और इस सबध में एक वक्तव्य देने को कहें और वह (व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN Mr Gurudas Das Gupta, please take your seat

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Madam, let me say this thing We do not feel concerned because a discussion has taken place between the Prime Minister and Mr. Mann We are not concerned We feel that whatever might have been the discussion, that should be told to the press and to the Parliament.

[Shri Gurudas Das Gupta]

And we believe that through discussion something tangible should emerge to restore peace in Punjab

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN Please sit down Now that matter is closed

SHRI R K DHAWAN Madam, I want to raise the issue of excise scandal.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN Yesterday somebody raised it

SHRI R K DHAWAN I will explain I am fully conscious of the fact that the issue was raised yesterday and that the issues should not be raised again and again That position has changed today in view of Mr Madhu Dandavate's statement And a pertinent point has arisen out of that statement Madam, as you and this august House know, this issue of excise scandal involving crores of rupees has been engaging, rather agitating the minds of all of us The then Finance Minister, Mr Madhu Dandavate was pleased to make a statement on the floor of the House I sought certain clarifications to which he never gave a specific reply Of course, rather to cover up the truth, he went on saying and trying to confuse the issue (Interruptions)

SHRI S JAIPAL REDDY (Andhra Pradesh) Madam (Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let him finish I will allow you I will permit you (Interruptions) I will permit you Let him finish

SHRI R K DHAWAN And he tried to confuse the issue Well, it was not surprising that whenever one tries to hide the truth, one finds himself in such a mess in which he found himself here He also backed out from his promise on the floor of this august House that he was prepared to lay all the papers on the Table of the House which he did not do But now the situation has changed further The position has become worse Mr Madhu Dandavate has issued a statement saying

that the file was lying at his house This was in reply to the Finance Minister's question that the file was received by him on the 5th of December, and the allegation by the Deputy Finance Minister Mr Digvijay Singh that the particular opinion of the Attorney-General was missing from the file As the hon. Members might have observed from the statement of Mr Madhu Dandavate, he says that the relevant file (Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Reddy, I will allow you. (Interruptions)

SHRI R K DHAWAN I am making a very relevant point to which the hon. Member can reply (Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please sit down Don't interrupt

SHRI R K DHAWAN: I am making a very relevant point If I am wrong, the hon Member can correct me Mr. Madhu Dandavate says that the opinion of the Attorney-General and the minutes of the then Law Minister were found in his house Well, it is a different matter if he wants to take shelter under 30 days or one month After all, he ceased to be a Minister on the 7th of November upto 5th December, the file was lying at his house He can justify it under the garb of 30 days But the point is, as the hon Members are aware, whenever an opinion of the Attorney-General is sought, the whole file is sent to him He cannot give his opinion, not based on papers So, when all the papers, when the whole file was sent to him, the Attorney-General must have given his opinion That file must have gone to the Finance Minister It is very likely that the file was kept back through an oversight at his house But the pertinent point is how is it that this opinion of the Attorney-General and the comments of the Law Minister thereon got separated from the file? In other words, it proves the allegation of the Deputy Finance Minister that the opinion of the Attorney-General was missing from the file Mr Madhu Dandavate further goes on to say that a copy of this was available with the Revenue Secretary.

If the opinion was sent to him in a separate cover, without the relevant file, how a copy of it was retained. So, either what Mr. Madhu Dandavate is saying is not true or what the Revenue Secretary is saying is not true. All these facts cannot be brought to light; they will never see the light of day until and unless JPC is appointed to examine the whole issue. My point is, that Mr. Madhu Dandavate's statement has come. He did not reply to the clarifications I sought; he has not given his reply to the specific charges. Now another revealing thing has come to light, and therefore, only the JPC can sort out the problem. Therefore, I demand, the Congress Party demands appointment of the JPC to go into the whole matter.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: Madam Deputy Chairperson, when Mr. R. K. Dhawan who is a votary for morality and purity in Indian politics has spoken... (Interruptions).

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA: What is he talking about? (Interruptions)

SHRI SURESH KALMADI (Maharashtra): It is a reflection on the hon. Member of the House.. (Interruptions).

SHRI R. K. DHAWAN: He is talking about morality! (Interruptions). May I remind him that he came to me for the Rajya Sabha seat.. (Interruptions). From Andhra Pradesh he came.. (Interruptions) Mr. Reddy, you came to me.. (Interruptions)... Mr. Reddy, you back of me. And today you are talking of my morality! You begged of me. What morality you have got, I know. This is your morality. (Interruptions).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I would request.. (Interruptions). Please listen. Just a minute...(Interruptions).

SHRI R. K. DHAWAN: Your morality. Mr. Reddy, is known to me. You need not force me to expose you further... (Interruptions).

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: Let him withdraw his words.

629 RS-9

SHRI R. K. DHAWAN: You are talking of morality. You may teach others; you don't talk of morality to me, Mr. Reddy, (Interruptions). You would know what you told me in Hyderabad. (Interruptions). And today you are talking of my morality! Can you stand on your feet (Interruptions).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I would request hon. Members to please keep quiet. I would suggest, when we are discussing something which is a very serious matter, and all the Members have been raising this issue from the previous session also, you please confine yourself to the subject matter. Please don't pass any comments. Please don't do that. I would not allow anybody to pass comments, either good or bad.

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA: Don't is quoting Bible.

SHRI R. K. DHAWAN: What is the morality of the then Finance Minister? (Interruptions).

SHRI M. A. BABY (Kerala): I am on a point of order.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Baby, please sit down. I request you.

SHRI M. A. BABY: I shall sit down. But I would like to raise a very important point.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: How can you sit down and at the same time raise a point? Please sit down.

SHRI M. A. BABY: This is very important.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: May be. But I am not allowing you. No.

SHRI M. A. BABY: I have the right. This is a point of order.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will permit you later on, but not now.

SHRI M. A. BABY: This is regarding..

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, I am not allowing you. I will not permit. Please sit down. No point of order. (Interruptions) I am not allowing any point

[The Deputy Chairman]

of order. I am not allowing anybody I said 'No'. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY (Tamil Nadu): Madam, if you allow Mr. Suresh Kalmadi, you should allow him also.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am not allowing anybody. I only said that when we are discussing such serious matters. We should not pass any comments, good or bad, against anybody (*Interruptions*).

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: He should withdraw what he said. He called an hon. Member "immoral". He should withdraw it. It cannot go on record. (*Interruptions*) He is casting aspersion on an hon. Member. He has used a highly objectionable word.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Reddy, please don't say that. (*Interruptions*) If he does not withdraw, it will be expunged.

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: What is wrong in it?

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: It is not unparliamentary. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY (Uttar Pradesh): What is objectionable in that? (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Dhawan, please take your seat. (*Interruptions*) I request you to take your seat. (*Interruptions*) Mr. Reddy, please take your seat. (*Interruptions*) I can handle the situation. I can control everybody. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: Madam, what is objectionable in that? Please let me know. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please sit down (*Interruptions*) Mr. Ahluwalia, please sit down. Don't you know the meaning of the words 'sit down'? (*Interruptions*) Mr. Jaipal Reddy, please take your seat. (*Interruptions*) I requested from the

Chair that you should confine yourself to the matter which is being discussed. Don't pass any comments, good or bad, against any Member.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: I did not.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Don't do it. It does not concern the matter. Therefore, either you withdraw it. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: What is objectionable, Madam? (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He does not want to withdraw it. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI MOTURU HANUMANTHA RAO (Andhra Pradesh): Madam, Mr. Dhawan passed many remarks against Mr. Dandavate. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Madam, I want to learn from you. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let him get educated. He wants to talk to me.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: I want to learn from you. I have heard what Mr. Dhawan has said. I have heard what Mr. Reddy has said. (*Interruptions*) I have gone through the book which contains the words which cannot be used in Parliament which are called unparliamentary.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That is not the question

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: I want to learn from you. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Abrar Ahmed, let me handle the situation. Otherwise, I will leave it to you. If you are capable, do it. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: I want to know which word, which he has used, either by meaning or by implication, is unparliamentary?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please take your seat. We are not going to . . .

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: I want to learn from you whether on the floor of Parliament while speaking on an issue one can use humour or banter. *(Interruptions)*.

SHRI M. A. BABY: I have my point of order

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let me answer him first. *(Interruptions)* Please take your seat

SHRI M. A. BABY: I am not a very loud Member of the House.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I know. That is why I am unhappy that if you are discussing a matter, you should confine yourself. *(Interruptions)*. Please sit down. What is wrong with you today?

SHRI M. A. BABY: Madam, I have raised my point of order first.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Then I will allow everybody to raise his point of order. I allowed him first because he had been raising his hand for quite some time. *(Interruptions)*. Shri Reddy was asked as he created the uproar over the point of order.

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: In the year 1990 you looked to this side and now you are under the pressure of that side.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No pressure I do not yield even to your pressure. I do not even yield to blood pressure. Do not worry

SHRI MURLIDHAR CHANDRAKANT BHANDARE (Maharashtra): Let me make my point of order clear. The question of unjust enrichment is a serious issue which many Members, including me, have raised *(Interruptions)*.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN. I am allowing you Mr. Baby *(Interruptions)* Please sit down He raised his hand first You are not to tell me who should be allowed when It is for me to keep the time, not you

SHRI MURLIDHAR CHANDRAKANT BHANDARE: Madam, we are all called honourable Members because we are all men of honour I am really pained that

in a debate on a public issue a Member should choose to cast personal aspersions. *(Interruptions)*. Of course, you cannot talk of morality of other members I have never done it. *(Interruptions)*. I am not yielding Let me tell these Members that they are neither adding to the dignity of the House nor to the dignity of the Members by lowering the standard of the debate in a cheap and personal way. There is a bounded duty cast on us to show minimum of respect, minimum of regard towards each other *(Interruptions)*. You please sit down. Please ask him to sit down. I am not yielding. *(Interruptions)*. May I end up by saying that there is no greater honour for a Member than to withdraw any remark which has offended another Member? Luckily that stage has never come for me but had there been an occasion, I would not have hesitated to withdraw any remark which has offended another Member.

SHRI M. A. BABY: Thank you very much for having permitted me to raise this issue Just now my hon friend and colleague has made an observation that a Member should not cast aspersion on another Member. To that extent I totally agree with Bhandareji. What Shri Jaipal Reddy has done is that he paid compliments to Shri Dhawan. *(Interruptions)*. One minute. If Mr. Dhawan, Jagesh Desaiji and others. *(Interruptions)*... Please listen. *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY We don't want your compliments... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. A. BABY: Madam, if they don't take that as a compliment, I do not have any objection. *(Interruptions)*.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have allowed him to speak Please let him finish.

F

SHRI M. A. BABY: Madam, it was proved *(Interruptions)*.. On the other hand, when Mr. Dhawan spoke later on *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MADAN BHATIA (Nominated): Madam, he is casting a reflection on the intelligence of the House *(Interruptions)*... How can be speak? *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. A. BABY: Madam, my point of order is *(Interruptions)*.

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA: He is giving a speech, Madam

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr Baby, I think the best thing would be *(Interruptions)* Sit down, Mr. Baby

SHRI M. A. BABY: My point of order is *(Interruptions)*.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That matter is closed. It will not go on record. Sit down If he doesn't withdraw it, it won't go on record—any remark

SHRI M. A. BABY: Madam, my point of order is, when Mr. Dhawan spoke later on, if I have heard him correctly, Mr Dhawan said, "Mr. Jaipal Reddy does not have the morality to stand on his own feet." If it is there, it is highly improper. That should be removed. This is my point of order... *(Interruptions)*... One minute Madam, everybody knows that there is some physical disability with Mr Jaipal Reddy, but Mr. Dhawan *(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let him speak Don't disturb him, *(Interruptions)*.

SHRI M. A. BABY: Madam, what Mr. Dhawan said is highly uncivilized. *(Interruptions)*... It was a most uncivilized remark against Mr Jaipal Reddy. Therefore, that particular reference should be removed *(Interruptions)* I want a ruling on this. *(Interruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN I will check up the record and see Now please sit down Mr. Jaipal Reddy, please What you wanted to say, please say. *(Interruptions)* I will look at the record

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: That remark against Mr Jaipal Reddy is an uncivilized remark and it should be removed

SHRI M. A. BABY, I request Shiv Shankerji to please *(Interruptions)*.

SHRI R. K. DHAWAN: Madam, let him consult the dictionary about the phrase

SHRI M. A. BABY: I repeat my offer to Shiv Shankerji and I expect Shri Shiv Shankerji

SHRI R. K. DHAWAN: I repeat what I said Please look at the dictionary to see what the meaning of it is.

SHRI M. A. BABY: Madam, the physical disability of a Member should not be made fun of

SHRI R. K. DHAWAN: What it is in the English language, he should understand. He should understand the phrase *(Interruptions)*

SHRI M. A. BABY: It is highly improper.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Baby, please sit down. When I gave an assurance that I will go through the record, please sit down. The matter is over. I will go through the record and see. Please sit down.

SHRI R. K. DHAWAN: Madam, you can send him the dictionary *(Interruptions)*.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now the matter is closed. Yes, Mr. Jaipal Reddy *(Interruptions)* I think everybody should say sorry to everybody else and let him speak

Mrs. Jayanthi Natarajan, I will not permit anybody. Please sit down Nobody is permitted We have a listed business I am not allowing you, please. *(Interruptions)* Please sit down.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: What does he think of himself? What do you think of yourself?

SHRI R. K. DHAWAN He does not know English He does not understand English *(Interruptions)* He should understand the meaning of the phrase. *(Interruptions)*



SHRI DIPEN GHOSH:\*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Nothing will go on record now.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH.\*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Nothing is going on record. I said, "Nothing is going on record from now on." I will look into the record, what is bad and good. Please sit down. Enough. Sit down

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI (Maharashtra):\*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You also sit down, please.

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA.\*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Sit down. I say, please take your seat. If you want to speak about the matter.

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA \*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Just a minute. It has not gone on record. There is no question of withdrawal. It has not gone on record. Sit down.

SHRI M.A. BABY \*

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH:\*

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA:\*

SHRI MADAN BHATIA:\*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please sit down. Please take your seat. Please sit down. I am sorry, I am very sorry. Please sit down. Everybody should sit down. This is a serious house, the House of Elders.

Nobody should speak. I requested everybody, every Member to confine himself. (Interruptions)

Please, Mr. Jaipal Reddy, have some patience with at least with the Chair. I said, "Have some patience with the Chair." I said, "Please sit down." (Interruptions)

SHRI JAGESH DESAI (Maharashtra) \*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please sit down. I request you to sit down. Do you want the matter to be finished or to be continued? I will adjourn the House if you people behave like this.

We have a very serious business. We have the discussion on the communal riots. (Interruptions)

Please sit down. I think there is something wrong with you today. I request. (Interruptions) When the chair is on the legs, please sit down. And keep quiet for one minute, as long as I speak. At least have this much patience with the Chair.

When serious matters are discussed, why should one make good or bad comments? Don't talk about anybody's morality or immorality.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: Prof. Dandavate is not a Member of the House.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He was a Minister, and in that context he is being referred to Okay. You reply, speak what you want to speak, but don't make any comments neither on the right or the left or the from. Now finish it. That matter is closed. Nobody else should speak on this. (Interruptions) Please sit down.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: Madam Deputy Chairman, at the outset I must make it clear that I have not cast any personal aspersion on Mr. Dhawan. I was only calling him a votary of morality and purity in public life. (Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please don't start it again, Mr. Jagesh Desai. He is withdrawing it, perhaps. Mr. Jaipal Reddy, don't talk of what happened; you please talk from where you should talk.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: Madam, I am talking...

\*Not recorded.

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: He has got nothing to say about Mr. Dandavate.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: The hon. Member, Mr R. K. ...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, you don't talk about Mr. Dhawan, please.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: I am not going to say a word against him.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Jaipal Reddy (Interruptions) Please sit down. Don't interrupt. I have not permitted you. You please take your seat. Mr Jaipal Reddy, you refer only to Mr Dandavate, if you want to defend him and then finish it off.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: A demand in the House was made for an inquiry as to what is called the excise scandal. I have no objection to such a demand being made, to such a demand being conceded by the Government. What I am objecting to is the remark made by the hon. Member on Mr Dandavate. He charged him with having sought to cover up. (Interruptions) Let me finish. (Interruptions) Please hear me. Prof. Dandavate yesterday offered an explanation in the other House as a Member of the other House, not as a Finance Minister. Therefore, any reference to a person, who is not a Member of this House, is not correct. (Interruptions)

SHRI R. K. DHAWAN: Does Mr. Jaipal Reddy mean to say that if Mr. Dandavate was involved in the kickbacks, he should be forgotten and it should not be discussed in the House because he is not a Member of the House. Thank you very much for your morality.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It is with reference to a matter to which Mr. Dandavate gave an assurance in the House as Finance Minister, not as an individual now. As I said before, the matter is being raised many times in the House and it is continuing to be raised.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: Madam, may I draw your attention?

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA: Is he challenging the demand of JPC on the refund scandal?

SHRI R. K. DHAWAN: He is not aware of the facts even.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: I am not being allowed to speak at all. Is this the manner of goings-on in the House, Madam?

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: I am just saying that my friend, the Finance Minister, has already laid on the Table of the House some of the papers.

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN (Tamil Nadu): All the papers

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: These relate to the same case.

SHRI R. K. DHAWAN: No, they were not laid on the Table.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: Coming to the question of refund, a charge was made in 1990, when the previous Government was in power.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The papers have been laid on the Table.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: Madam, kindly hear me. (Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, I won't allow. Let him finish. (Interruptions)

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: If they want a JPC, they should bring in a motion. Papers have already been laid under item No. 2 of the Revised List of Business.

SHRI R. K. DHAWAN: We don't want papers, we want all the files.

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA: We don't want papers, we want JPC on this.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Then you bring in a motion on this.

SHRI R. K. DHAWAN: He does not know anything... (Interruptions)...

SHRI S JAIPAL REDDY, Madam Deputy Chairperson, you are not listening to me.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN. I am listening to you. I am finding out the legality of the motion on JPC.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Papers have already been laid on the Table.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Does not matter. The Government has to bring a motion but not the Members.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: If the Member wants a JPC... (Interruptions)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He made a demand already.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: All right. (Interruptions)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let him finish.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: The present Prime Minister has made an allegation that Rs. 10000 crores were paid by way of refund. (Interruptions)...

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: If the hon. Member is discussing the merits of the case, then, we must have an opportunity to discuss the merits of the case... (Interruptions)... He has not gone into the merits. I have been keeping quiet all the while. I am the Leader of the House and I am also the Finance Minister and Mr. Jaipal Reddy, I think, should refrain from going into the merits of the case. He should respond to the point which Mr. Dhawan has made. But if he goes into the merits of the case, then, it will be entirely a different matter.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: Okay, we are ready for a debate. We are ready for an enquiry. (Interruptions)... You make false allegations.

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER (Gujarat): Madam, may I just make one submission? This issue had been agitating the minds of

all the Members here for quite a long time.. (Interruptions)... It is becoming murkier and murkier day by day. Therefore, why not the Government come out with a statement? Either the Finance Minister can make a statement first so that we can have a debate or let us go in for a JPC. The Government must react to this. I request the hon. Finance Minister to react to it. (Interruptions)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The Finance Minister is reacting, please.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Let the Government order an enquiry... (Interruptions)...

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: He made a false allegation.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Let them order an enquiry.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Madam, the problem is that as the Finance Minister I have the responsibility flowing out of knowledge. Mr. Jaipal Reddy has the advantage of ignorance. I am saying with all sense of responsibility that the statements that we have made, we stand by those statements. I stand by every statement that I have made as a Member of Parliament and as the Finance Minister. Let me make that very clear... (Interruptions)...

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: I am referring to your statement as a Member of Parliament.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Let him order an enquiry... (Interruptions)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You must know the convention of this House. When the Leader of the House is on his legs, nobody should interrupt him. I will not permit anybody to interrupt him while he is speaking, whoever he might be... (Interruptions)... Please sit down... (Interruptions)... Let him speak; he is the Leader of the House. I want to uphold this rule and we will do it. Let him speak.

**SHRI YASHWANT SINHA:** Madam Deputy Chairperson, it was not my wish to react in a huff. It is not my style either. But when I heard my colleague, Mr. Jaipal Reddy saying that as a Member of Parliament, the present Finance Minister and I made false allegations, then, it became imperative for me to react in the manner in which I have... (Interruptions)

**SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY:** You made allegations.

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Don't interrupt. He is the Leader of the House. He has a right to speak. This is the convention of this House... (Interruptions) .. Did you hear me what I said? ... (Interruptions)... Sit down. When the Leader of the House is on his legs, the convention of the House is that nobody will interrupt him and I am going to uphold that convention of this House. Everybody, please listen.

**SHRI YASHWANT SINHA:** Madam Deputy Chairperson, I was merely saying in response to that. As a Finance Minister I stand by all that I have said as a Member of Parliament let there be no doubt about it. But in order to clarify the position, this House had received a statement from the then Finance Minister. I am quite willing and ready to come with another statement before this House which will give an opportunity to the Members of this House to discuss the matter and come to their own judgement as to who is right and who is wrong.

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Now the matter is over. The matter is closed. Mr Jaipal Reddy, the matter is closed. I am not permitting anyone. Please take your seat. I allowed you. Just a minute. (Interruptions). No, Mr. Jaipal Reddy, nothing. It does not matter. The Leader of the House has committed as the Finance Minister that he is coming with a statement. We do not have time to waste any more on this. I am sorry. (Interruptions). It is not in order.

**SHRI JAGESH DESAI:** It should be made in this Session itself.

**SHRI SURESH KALMADI:** It should be in this Session.

**SHRI P SHIV SHANKER:** We would only like to know as to when the Finance Minister would be pleased to make that statement.

**SHRI YASHWANT SINHA:** When I say here and now I am ready to make a statement, it obviously means that I am willing to make the statement during this Session of Parliament. It is entirely up to the Business Advisory Committee to fix the time for it.

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Now that matter is closed. (Interruptions). Mr. Salve that matter is closed.

**SHRI N. K. P SALVE (Maharashtra):** Not on that matter. This is another matter of very grievous diplomatic impropriety which seems to have been committed by us. I have been given to understand by a very reliable source that when the Iraqi Foreign Minister landed at Palam Airport at 5.10 p.m., there was no one from the Ministry of External Affairs to receive him. I only hope I am wrong. Such an impropriety, such a blatant outrage, would not be committed by the External Affairs Ministry. If you know personally, Madam, you can tell us that my information is wrong.

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** I, as the Deputy Chairman, do not tell things to the House. I have my own personal information. Let the Ministry of External Affairs come forward to say something.

**SHRI N. K. P SALVE:** Let the Leader of the House or the External Affairs Minister react. I am not making an allegation unnecessarily. I will be very happy if I am told that my information is wrong.

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** You check up your information. It could be wrong.

SHRI SHABBIR AHMAD SALARIA  
(Jammu and Kashmir): I have an important point

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No more important things. Now we shall discuss the communal situation, I think that is more important. Shri Mohammed Afzal,

CALLING ATTENTION TO A MATTER OF URGENT PUBLIC IMPORTANCE—COMMUNAL SITUATION IN THE COUNTRY—Contd.

श्री मोहम्मद अफजल उर्फ मीम अफजल (उत्तर प्रदेश) : मैडम, मैं आपकी त्वज्जह इस तरफ दिलाना चाहूंगा कि कल यहाँ इस बात की यकीनदहानी कराई गई थी कि इस ग्रहम-इन्तहाई मसले पर जब बहस होगी तो वजीरेअजम साहब खुद यहाँ मौजूद रहेंगे। वजीरेअजम आए भी और आकर थोड़ी देर के बाद उठकर चले भी गये।

ऐसा लगता है कि जैसे उन्हें इस ग्रहमतीरन मसले में कोई दिलचस्पी नहीं है और वह खास तौर से मोअजिज मेम्बरान के ख्यालात सुनना नहीं चाहते।

कल सरोज खापड़ जी ने एक मुबारक-बाद उन्हें पेश की थी कि नया साल है, उसकी मुबारकबाद दी है। चूँकि वजीरे-अजम साहब यहाँ मौजूद नहीं हैं और उनकी जो ग्रहमे-दिलचस्पी है, उसको देख कर मैं कह सकता हूँ और अपने मोअजिज लीडर अफजल जी हाऊस के जरिए उनकी एक शेर नजर करना चाहता हूँ।

“अभी जनवरी है, नया साल है, दिसम्बर में पूछेंगे, क्या हाल है।”

उपसभापति : दिसम्बर, 1991।

श्री मोहम्मद अफजल उर्फ मीम अफजल : जी।

एक माननीय सदस्य : तब तक वह रहेगे भी ?

श्री मोहम्मद अफजल उर्फ मीम अफजल : जो भी होगा, पूछ लेंगे उनका हाल। कल जब हाऊस में इस मसले पर बहस हो रही थी और हमारे एक मोअजिज मेम्बर बी० जे पी के, प्रमोद महाजन साहब बोल रहे थे तो उन्होंने एक बात कही थी कि इस हाऊस में बड़े होकर आप कुछ भी कह दीजिए लेकिन जब आप अजम में जायेंगे तो वहाँ आपको कुछ और ही देखने को मिलेगा और वहाँ लोगों के जज्बात की आपको कद्र करनी पड़ेगी। लेकिन इस हाऊस में उनकी तकरीर पर जो रिएक्शन था और मैं समझता हूँ कि यह हाऊस सिर्फ इस हाऊस को रिप्रेजेंट नहीं करता यह इस पूरे देश की जनता को रिप्रेजेंट करता है। उनकी तकरीर पर तमाम पार्टियों की तरफ से जो रिएक्शन आया उससे हमें यह अंदाजा हो गया है कि इस देश में भारतीय जनता पार्टी के मोकफ पर और कम्युनल सिचुएशन पर, उसकी सोच पर पूरे देश का क्या रिएक्शन हो सकता है, वह रिएक्शन देखकर मुझे जैसे आदमी को जो एक माइनारिटी कम्युनिटी से आया है एक यकीन सैकुलरिज्म के अन्दर और ज्यादा मजबूत हुआ है और ज्यादा बड़ा है। मैं समझता हूँ कि जब तक यह सोच रहेगी कुछ ज्यादा मायूस होने की जरूरत नहीं है। मैडम, हमारे दोस्त जो इस हाऊस के मेंबर हैं और एक सियासी जमाअत से जिनका तात्लुक है, एक बार मेरी उनसे गुफ्तगू हुई। उस गुफ्तगू में उन्होंने फर्माया कि मुझे यह बात कहने में कोई शर्म नहीं कि मैं आर० एस एस का बच्चा हूँ। उन्होंने फर्माया है कि आर एस एस का बच्चा हूँ। मैं इस हाऊस में उनके जजबे की कद्र तो कर सकता हूँ लेकिन अजम मुझे ख्याल आया कि कल वह बहुत रिप्ट कर रहे थे तो मैंने कहा कि मैं भी अपना कुछ हस्तोन्सब उनको बता दूँ। मैं इस हाऊस में एलान करना चाहता हूँ कि मैं न मुस्लिम लीग का बच्चा हूँ, न मैं जमाअत-ए-इस्लामी का बच्चा हूँ, न मैं जिन्हा का बच्चा हूँ, न मैं किसी