

SHRI VITHALRAO MADHAVRAO JADHAV (Maharashtra): It has been discussed. Five minutes have lapsed already.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHASKAR ANNAJI MASODKAR): Just listen. The time allotted for the Private Members' Business is over. Now the Minister was replying.

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA: He can speak next time.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHASKAR ANNAJI MASODKAR): Next time it lapses, as you are aware. So, let him complete the reply.

SHRI SHABBIR AHMAD SALARIA: That way I should also be allowed to say.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHASKAR ANNAJI MASODKAR): All right, I will give you one minute.

SHRI ANANTRAY DEVSHANKER DAVE: Two minutes, Sir. My name is also there. I want only one minute.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHASKAR ANNAJI MASODKAR): I think, I will have to close the Private Members' business. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI: Sir, we are breaking the conventions very liberally. There must be some convention in this House. Why are we all along breaking the conventions? So, you please stop it. Nothing of it should go on.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHASKAR ANNAJI MASODKAR): I agree with you.

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: Sir, the Private Members business was to start at 2. 30. It started at 2. 40 Therefore, I request the Minister should be allowed to reply.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHASKAR ANNAJI MASODKAR): Let us follow the convention. I am sorry. My view is that we must follow the convention. Since it is beyond 5 o'clock, its time is over.

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: The Minister would reply in a minute.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHASKAR ANNAJI MASODKAR): No. Then other Members will also have to be given time.

SHRI VITHALRAO MADHAVRAO JADHAV: Sir, convention should be honoured on both the sides. The discussion should have started at 2. 30 and then it should end at 5. I am supporting the convention.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHASKAR ANNAJI MASODKAR): Now, the Private Members' business is over. The speech given by the hon. Minister remains inconclusive. Now, we proceed to the next item.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Sir, we hope the Minister will send reply on the suggestions made by the Members.

#### PERSONAL EXPLANATION

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHASKAR ANNAJI MASODKAR): Mr. Jaipal Reddy; you have to make a personal explanation.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY (Andhra Pradesh): Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, I wanted to rise on a point of personal clarification in the morning, but the Chairman was pleased to state that I could do so after the Prime Minister gave the reply.

Yesterday, Mr. R. K. Dhawan made some remarks which I could not hear on account of the din. As I went through the records, I found Mr. R. K. Dhawan had said that I had gone to him and begged for a Rajya Sabha seat. I would like to set the record straight. That is the reason why I rose today on a point of clarification. I was thrown out of the Congress party way back in 1975 for my vehement opposition to emergency. I have since been uncompromisingly opposed to the Congress (I). When I came to the Rajya Sabha this time, I came from my State. We have surplus votes. I don't know how Mr. Dhawan made this preposterous and presumptuous claim. It is utterly untrue and unfounded. I may

[Shri S. Jaipal Reddy]

further state that I had never spoken to Mr. Dhawan in private for a single little moment.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY (Pondicherry): Sir, I am on a point of clarification.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHASKAR ANNAJI MASODKAR): Let him finish,

SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA (Karnataka): The point is that notice should have been given to Mr. Dhawan also so that he could have been present here. This point could have been raised in his presence... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: Yesterday. I could not hear what he said... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA: By giving personal explanation he cannot attack a Member who is not present here... *(Interruptions)*... We do not know what transpired between them. It would have been fair if Mr. Dhawan would have been present here... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI V., NARAYANASAMY: Mr. Reddy, you were fully aware of the fact when Mr. Dhawan was referring to you. Now, you are coming with an explanation. Is it an after-thought?

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY (Andhra Pradesh): I could not hear anything in the din.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHASKAR ANNAJI MASODKAR): Mr. Reddy, please don't argue with him.... *(Interruptions)*... Mr. Narayanasamy, please take your seat. Mr. Kapil Verma, please take your seat. Just see the position. The Chairman, has permitted him to make a statement and a personal explanation... *(Interruptions)*... Today, he has been given an opportunity and I cannot stop it.

SHRI HARVENDRA SINGH HANS-PAL: The point which Mr. Narayanasamy and other Members wanted to make was... *(Interruptions)*,

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: Mr. Reddy, you cannot go on like this.

SHRI HARVENDRA SINGH HANS-PAL (Punjab): Now Mr. Reddy is giving a personal explanation. Then, Mr. Dhawan would also like to make his personal explanation.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHASKAR ANNAJI MASODKAR): That does not matter. If the Chairman permits him, he is free to make.

SHRI HARVENDRA SINGH HANS-PAL: Will it go on like this?

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHASKAR ANNAJI MASODKAR): But we cannot send for the Member to come here. You see, the Member is expected to be present here for the whole day.

SHRI HARVENDRA SINGH HANS-PAL: But nobody knew.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHASKAR ANNAJI MASODKAR): But we cannot Stop the business of the House just because a particular Member is absent. You know the position.

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE (Maharashtra): Sir, you are absolutely right... *(Interruptions)*... All that I want to submit is that if it is on a point of allegation, point of explanation... *(Interruptions)*... How long have you been in Parliament?... *(Interruptions)*... Is it all that you have learnt?

DR. G. VIJAYA MOHAN REDDY (Andhra Pradesh): You are taking up a question without understanding the matter.

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: A Member is entitled... *(Interruptions)*... Why are you disturbing me? You listen to what I am saying... *(Interruptions)*...

DR. G. VIJAYA MOHAN REDDY: Except to become. *(Interruptions)*.. for Mr. Dhawan, you have not learnt anything. He is not making any charge against Mr. Dhawan. He is trying to state that he has met Mr. Dhawan. Is there anything wrong?... *(interruptions)*

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: Dr. Reddy, you need some treatment. Have I said

anything against him?.. (*Interruptions*).. I am afraid, you' need some treatment... (*Interruptions*).. Have I uttered a single word against him ? I am. on a question of procedure.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHASKAR ANNAJI MASODKAR): Mr. Salve, you please address the Chair,

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: Sir, I am on a question of procedure. Sir, it cannot go on *ad infinitum, ad nauseam*. A Member is entitled to give a personal explanation with the permission of the Chair which I believe has been given to him. He is entitled to do so. But in the process of explanation if there is ■ going to be a statement or allegation that a Member of this House what he has Stated in the House is untrue—he has stated so—that it is ill-founded, then, in such a case the only procedure is to bring a privilege motion; so that he has a fair opportunity to deal with it. And therefore, my respectful submission is, if anything has to be said in the course of explanation by any Member which involves any other Member of the House who is not here at the moment, it will have to be confined to something which does not even remotely cast aspersions on any of the Members.

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI: May I make one suggestion? There is no point of order with me. In fairness to both Mr. Dhawan and Mr. Reddy, I would like to make this suggestion. Mr. Vice-Chairman, you are entitled to allow him to make a statement as per the Chairman^ directive.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHASKAR ANNAJI MASODKAR): I cannot stop him.

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI: That is right. If the explanation is made when Mr. Dhawan is not here, there may be again conflicts. So. if you can, in your own right, postpone... (*Interruptions*), —

SHRI KAPIL VERMA: To Monday.

SHRI A. -G. KULKARNI:... When Mr. Dhawan is here, thai will be good. If Mr. Reddy agrees... (*Interruptions*).

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: The point I have raised is that if the allegation or the explanation is based on an allegation of an untrue statement or ill-founded statement by a Member of the House, it is clear breach of privilege, if he has really said something which is untrue or unfounded. Therefore, the right thing would be a privilege.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHASKAR ANNAJI MASODKAR): He has heard you. It is for him. Mr. Reddy, while making your statement... (*Interruption*)

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: I did not say anything. What is the point?

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHASKAR ANNAJI MASODKAR): You should not raise any controversial issue. You know that a personal explanation is limited to making the position clear. The whole point of giving a personal explanation is, you make your position clear. That is all. If you introduce any controversial subject, then again, the difficulty will start.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: I request the Chair and hon. Members not to presume that I am importing any controversy. (*Interruptions*). I, do not think I have said anything controversial so far. I was only trying to say that I have never met -Mr. Dhawan in private anywhere,, even for a fleeting pioment. I have never been in more than greeting terms with him as Members of this House. Therefore, this statement is unfounded. This allegation is stupid ' and silly.  
\* •..

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHASKAR ANNAJI MASODKAR): How can you say that?

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA: He should withdraw that word.

SHRI VITHALRAO MADHAVRAO JADHAV: It is unparliamentary.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHASKAR ANNAJI MASODKAR): I do not know whether he is saying that with regard to the allegation or otherwise

[Shri S. Jaipal Reddy] said the allegation is stupid. (Interruptions). You reserve the ruling.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHASKAR ANNAJI MASODKAR): I will see the record. (Interruptions).

**श्री सुरेन्द्रजीत सिंह अहलूवालिया :** ब्रह्म-  
वरों में अपना नाम छपाने के लिए बोल रहे  
हैं.... (व्यवधान)

SHRI & JAIPAL REDDY: I have been longer in public life than you or your leader.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHASKAR ANNAJI MASODKAR): Now let us proceed with the business. Clarifications. Dr. Abrar Ahmed.

#### CLARIFICATIONS ON STATEMENT OF MINISTER OF FINANCE RE- GARDING CURRENT FISCAL SIT- UATION

**डॉ० अब्रार अहमद (राजस्थान) :**  
उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, मैं 27 दिसम्बर,  
1990 को वित्त मंत्री जी ने जो वक्तव्य  
सदन में दिया है और जिस प्रकार से नए  
कर लगाए हैं; उनके संबंध में माननीय  
मंत्री जी से स्पष्टीकरण चाहता हूँ।

मैं पहला सवाल यह पूछना चाहता हूँ कि इन करों से चाहे प्रत्यक्ष या अप्रत्यक्ष रूप से जो साधारण लोगों पर लगाए गए हैं, उन पर जो प्रभाव पड़ता है उसको किस प्रकार इसके प्रभाव से बचाएंगे? दूसरे अभी पूर्व की सरकार ने आई.एम.एफ. से लोन न लेने का निर्णय किया था जहाँ तक मेरी जानकारी है। अभी कुछ समय पूर्व आई.एम.एफ. की एक टीम आयी थी और उसने पाँच बिलियन डालर ऋण लेने की सरकार ने रिक्वेस्ट की थी। आई.एम.एफ. ने उस संबंध में कुछ शर्तें रखी हैं। तो क्या उसमें एक शर्त यह भी है जो आई.एम.एफ. ने रखी है कि भारतीय रुपये की कीमत घटाई जाए? अगर यह शर्त है तो सरकार इस दिशा में क्या काम कर रही है? दूसरा स्पष्टीकरण यह भी है कि

आई.एम.एफ. का रेट आफ इटरस्ट काफी अधिक है और इस स्थिति में कुछ देश बड़े वर्ल्ड कंटरीज से लोन लेने की बात करते हैं या लोन लेना पसन्द करते हैं तो इस दिशा में क्या भारत भी ऐसा सोचता है और ऐसे देशों से लोन लेने के बारे में कोई योजना है?

मैं अगला स्पष्टीकरण यह लेना चाहता हूँ कि जो ऋण भारत ने विदेशों से लिया हुआ है उसकी री-पेमेंट के लिए और उस पर इंटरेस्ट की री-पेमेंट के लिए क्या हमारे पास कोई फंड है? यदि वह फंड नहीं है तो क्या रिजर्व फारेन एक्सचेंज जो है उसमें से यह रिपेमेंट कर रहे हैं? यदि कर रहे हैं तो प्रतिवर्ष, प्रतिमाह कितना भार उस रिजर्व फारेन एक्सचेंज पर पड़ रहा है? अभी 11 महीने जो सरकार रही है उसकी गलत नीतियों के कारण फारेन एक्सचेंज का अर्थ होना काफी कम हो गया है तो मैं माननीय वित्त मंत्री जी से पूछना चाहता हूँ कि 11 महीने में कितनी विदेशी मुद्रा में, निर्यात के घटने की वजह से या किसी और कारण से कमी आई है?

मैं यह स्पष्टीकरण भी चाहूंगा कि क्या प्रवासी भारतीयों को देश में इन्वेस्ट-मेंट करने के लिए, उनको प्रेरित करने के लिए कोई टीम बाहर भेजी गई है? यदि भेजी गई है तो उसने इन प्रवासी भारतीयों को इसके लिए क्या इन्सटिव देने की बात कही है? इसके साथ-साथ सोफ्ट क्रेडिट लोन देने के लिए क्या कोई वर्ल्ड बैंक से या आई.एम.एफ. से बातचीत की है? यदि बातचीत की गई है तो उसका ख़ौरा क्या है?

जब संसद में बजट पेश किया गया था तो उस समय बजट को बिना बजट बताया गया था। लेकिन इस वक्तव्य में बिना से संबंधित कोई बात नहीं है। मैं माननीय वित्त मंत्री जी से जानना चाहता हूँ कि क्योंकि इस पर काफी खर्च होता है इसलिए आप इस बारे में क्या सोच रहे हैं? दूसरे यह कि जो पिछली सरकार थी, विश्वनाथ प्रताप सिंह की सरकार थी