

RAJYA SABHA

Friday, the 28th December, 1990/7
Pause, 1912 (Saka)

The House met at eleven of the clock, Mr. Chairman in the Chair.

INTRODUCTION OF MINISTERS

प्रधान मंत्री (श्री चन्द्रशेखर) :
सभापति जी, मैं आपकी अनुमति से मन्त्रि-
परिषद् के सदस्यों का परिचय करता हूँ :

(1) श्री विद्या चरण शुक्ल-- विदेश मंत्री

(2) श्री र व वीरेन्द्र सिंह--
खाद्य और नागरिक मूर्ति मंत्री

(3) श्री दीलत राम सारण--
शहरी विकास मंत्री

(4) श्री मनुभाई कोट डिया--
जल संसाधन मंत्री

(5) श्री राजमंगल वाशेय--
मानव संसाधन विकास मंत्री

(6) श्री कल्याण सिंह कालवी--
ऊर्जा मंत्री

(व्यवधान)

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Mr. Kalvi is supporter of Sati. He cannot be allowed. According to the Sati Prevention Act anyone supporting Sati cannot be a Member of Parliament.

श्री संघद सिकते रजी : मैं भी अपने को इसके साथ जोड़ता हूँ । (व्यवधान)

MR. CHAIRMAN: I request all of you to go back to your seats. Your protest has been registered. Please go back to your seats.

(Interruptions)

Your protest has been noted. The Prime Minister has noted your protest.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Sati samarthak cannot be allowed.

(Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please move back to your seats. Your protest has been noted. Now when you have protested, let us hear the views of the Prime Minister also.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Sati samarthak cannot be allowed. He must resign.

(Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: The Prime Minister wants to say something. Let us hear him. He is going to reply.

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: The Prime Minister should tell us whether this gentleman supported Sati or not. He is a *to you. You are shielding the * committed by him. It is a shame for the country.

SHRI CHANDRA SHEKHAR: All right, let me have my say...

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: It is a shame for the country.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: According to the Sati Prevention Act passed by this Parliament no person supporting Sati can be a Member of this House, what to speak of a Minister. And he has gone on record supporting Sati. We have got a tape-recorded version of what he said. Therefore, we cannot tolerate it.

श्री सभापति : प्रधान मंत्री जी बोल रहे हैं। लवी जी बोल रहे हैं। आप उनकी बात तो सुन लीजिये ... (व्यवधान)

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: We have his statement made in the Rajasthan Legislative Assembly..

(Interruptions)

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: It is not a question of logic. It is a question of morality. He must be expelled.

*Expunged as ordered by the Chair

MR. CHAIRMAN: Let us hear what the Prime Minister has to say.

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: It is a shame for anyone to rise in support of a person who supported Sati... (Interruptions)

MR CHAIRMAN: You don't have any business to speak like that. You didn't hear what Jayanthi said. You are just blaming her. Kindly take your words back.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATA-RAJAN: Sir, I want him to be dismissed. (Interruptions) People like him are a * on any civilized society and he happens to be a Minister, a Cabinet Minister, not just a Member. (Interruptions)... Sir, he is the Minister of Energy and I do not know whether he wants the women of India to be burnt as an alternative source of energy! (Interruptions). It is totally unconstitutional to retain him as a Cabinet Minister. He has sworn to uphold the Constitution of India after having supported Sati. He should be prosecuted and he should not even be a Member, let alone a Minister. (Interruptions)... Sir, it is not enough. (Interruptions)... If he now says that he never said anything like that. (Interruptions)... Let the Government conduct an inquiry and let the prosecution continue and if, afterwards, he is absolved, then he can become. (Interruptions). Right now he cannot make that statement and he cannot retract his earlier statement. (Interruptions). I have a copy of the statement he made. (Interruptions)... He has said that there is no Sati at all in Rajasthan. (Interruptions)...

MR CHAIRMAN: Let him say, let the Prime Minister explain. (Interruptions)...

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATA-RAJAN: Sir, let me read out what he has said. He has said:

"जैसे मैंने पहले ही स्पष्ट कहा था, जहाँ तक राजस्थान का सबल है, हमारे

प्रदेश के अंदर न तो सती प्रथा नाम की चीज कभी थी ...

Which world is he living in now?... (Interruptions)... Which world is he living in now?... (Interruptions) ..

MR CHAIRMAN: Let him speak now... (Interruptions)...

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: Sir, what happened in Rajasthan was not Sati. (Interruptions)

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATA-RAJAN: What happened in Rajasthan? (Interruptions)...

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: What had happened last year in Rajasthan was not Sati. (Interruptions)... What are you talking?... (Interruptions) What happened there was not Sati. What are you talking?... (Interruptions). What are you talking?... (Interruptions) ..

MR CHAIRMAN: Let us hear his versions also. (Interruptions) ..

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: They are rewriting history. (Interruptions)

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATA-RAJAN: If they do not want to hear my explanation, what can be done? (Interruptions) ..

श्रीमती सरला महेस्वरी : सभापति महोदय, आपको मालूम होना चाहिये कि ... (व्यवधान) .

श्री दयानन्द सहाय : काल्वी जी को सी.पी.एम. के लोगो ने सपोर्ट किया था और आज इसीलिये वे मंत्री बने है ... (व्यवधान)

श्रीमती सत्या बहिन : जिन्होंने काल्वी जी को मंत्री बनाया है वे सभी गुनहगार है । ... (व्यवधान)

डा० रत्नाकर पाण्डेय : सभापति जी, काल्वी जी ने सती प्रथा का समर्थन किया या नहीं, बताया जाय । (व्यवधान)

*Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

MR CHAIRMAN Now, let the Prime Minister speak. (*Interruptions*) The Prime Minister will give his explanation. (*Interruptions*) ..

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Sir, I demand that the Prime Minister should drop this man from his Cabinet. (*Interruptions*)... Let the Prime Minister drop him from his Cabinet. (*Interruptions*) ..

MR CHAIRMAN: Please hear him. (*Interruptions*) Please hear the Prime Minister. (*Interruptions*) ..

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Sir, he is a * (*Interruptions*)...

THE PRIME MINISTER (SHRI CHANDRA SHEKHAR): Mr Chairman, Sir, this should be expunged... (*Interruptions*)... Sir, this should be expunged. (*Interruptions*) ..

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Sir, he is a * (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI CHANDRA SHEKHAR: Sir, it is permissible for any honourable Member to say that he is a * ?.. (*Interruptions*) ..

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: I repeat that he is a* . (*Interruptions*) .. I repeat he is a* .. (*Interruptions*) This man is a* ... (*Interruptions*) .. He is a* (*Interruptions*) ..

SHRI CHANDRA SHEKHAR: Mr Chairman, Sir, .. (*Interruptions*) ..

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: He is a* (*Interruptions*) ..

SHRI CHANDRA SHEKHAR: Sir, this should be expunged. (*Interruptions*) ..

MR. CHAIRMAN: I want to make one thing very clear. (*Interruptions*) I want to make it very clear that it is not proper for any Member to call another Member like that and I am expunging these words. No Member should call another Member like that. We are all Members of

Parliament and all Members of Parliament are gentlemen. (*Interruptions*) It is your prestige, it is my prestige and it is everybody's prestige. (*Interruptions*) .. So, no Member can call another like that. (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Sir, according to the law, supporting Sati is a crime. (*Interruptions*)...

MR CHAIRMAN: Under the law, nobody is a criminal till it is proved in a court of law. And we have no business to call a person—and especially a Member of the House, this House or that House, whoever is there. (*Interruptions*) Let us not use such words. It does not fit in the propriety of this House. Let us not use those words. You can put your point of view without using strong words. (*Interruptions*)

THE MINISTER OF FOOD AND CIVIL SUPPLIES (SHRI RAO BIRENDRA SINGH): Should be expunged. He cannot be charged as being a supporter of 'Sati' unless he has been prosecuted and convicted. How can somebody say that he was a supporter of.. (*Interruptions*)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Under the law, every person is supposed to be innocent till it is proved beyond any shadow of doubt—beyond a shadow of doubt—that he has committed a crime. It is a fundamental principle of law. (*Interruptions*) Even if there is a shadow of doubt, the court will not convict.

THE LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (SHRI P SHIV SHANKER): Mr. Chairman, Sir, we may not like the appointment of a particular person as a Cabinet Minister, but to use the word* or * is unbecoming of any Member. You should direct that he should withdraw those words.

MR CHAIRMAN: That is what I have requested. (*Interruptions*) I will expunge it. (*Interruptions*) I

*Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

[Shri P Shiv Shanker]

will expunge it. (Interruptions)
Take it back

मौलना अब्दुल्ला खां ब्राजमी : अगर वह सती की हिमायत करेंगे तो क्या सत्ता को भी बहिमायत करेंगे ? मर्द के मरने के बाद औरत जलाई जा सकल तो क्या औरत के मरने के बाद उसके पति को सत्ता दिया जाएगा ? अगर मर्द के मरने के बाद औरत सती की जाती है तो क्या औरत के मरने के बाद मर्द को भी सत्ता दिया जाएगा (व्यवधान) मर्द को भी सत्ता होना चाहिये । अगर सती है तो सत्ता भी होना चाहिये, अगर सती नहीं है तो सत्ता भी नहीं होना चाहिये (व्यवधान)

श्रीमती सरला महेश्वरी : यह औरतों का अपमान है (व्यवधान)

श्री मोहम्मद अफजल उर्फ भीम अफजल : यह तो सत्ता के साथ रहना चाहते हैं (व्यवधान)

श्रीमती सरला महेश्वरी : इस सदन का अपमान है, इस सदन की गरिमा का अपमान है । इसलिए सभापति महोदय, मैं मे आपसे अपील करना चाहूंगा (व्यवधान)

श्री चन्द्रशेखर : सभापति महोदय, मुझे दुख है और मैं भावनाओं को समझ सकता हूँ । कोई भी व्यक्ति सती प्रथा का समर्थन करे, इससे बड़ी दुर्भाग्य की कोई बात नहीं हो सकती है । सती प्रथा कलक है । लेकिन जो बातें हमारे यहां लोग कह रहे हैं शायद इतिहास की जानकारी कम है । राजस्थान में (व्यवधान) हा, हिन्दुस्तान की औरतों को हिन्दुस्तान के इतिहास के बारे में मालूम नहीं होगा तो हमको बताना पड़ेगा (व्यवधान)

श्री दीपेन घोष : इतिहास मत सिखाइये हम लोग को (व्यवधान)

श्री चन्द्र शेखर सभापति महोदय, मैं सिखाऊँ तो भी नहीं सीख सकते हैं क्योंकि तुलसीदास ने कहा है

मूढ हृदय नहीं चेत, जो गुरु मिले विरचि सम ।

मे किसी को कुछ सिखाने की चेष्टा नहीं करता, जो लोग सीखने को तैयार नहीं हैं उनको सिखाने की कोशिश करना सबसे बड़ी गलती होती है ।

श्री मोहम्मद अफजल उर्फ भीम अफजल : हम नहीं सीखना चाहते हैं । (व्यवधान)

श्री चन्द्रशेखर : लेकिन मैं यह कह रहा था कि जो राजस्थान में था वह जौहर था और जौहर जो औरतें किया करती थी वह पति के मरने के पहले करती थी (व्यवधान) आप देखिये पति के मरने के पहले जो औरतें मरती थी वह राजस्थान में जौहर था, वह सती प्रथा नहीं थी । सती प्रथा बंगाल में थी । राजस्थान में सती प्रथा नहीं थी । एक औरत कोई जली वह गलत है, दुर्भाग्यपूर्ण है उसकी निन्दा होनी चाहिए ।

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: What is he saying? At that time, he was a Member of Rajasthan Assembly. Then the entire Parliament condemned it. (Interruptions)

श्री चन्द्रशेखर : सभापति महोदय, मैं उनकी बात तो सुनता रहता हूँ । अ.ज. मे सदन में फिर । (व्यवधान)

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Sir, I am sorry to say that the Prime Minister of this country does not know the social practice of Sati. (Interruptions)

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: When the Parliament enacted Sati Prevention Act, at that time, the Roop Kanwar

issue was considered by Parliament of India as Sati and it was not Jauhar Pratha. (Interruptions)

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: There is a Sati temple in Rajasthan. (Interruptions) The Prime Minister cannot presume to teach history to us

SHRI CHANDRA SHEKHAR: I cannot teach you anything. I have not been able to teach anything so far. How can I teach you any more? So, Sir.. (Interruptions)

श्रीमती सरला महेश्वरी. हमारे पास रिकार्ड है।

SHRI CHANDRA SHEKHAR: I am not interested in all this history. I want to make only one thing clear that even at that time, Mr. Kalvi was a member of the Janata Party and (Interruptions) Mr. Kalvi made his position quite clear in the Vidhan Sabha of Rajasthan and also by a press statement that at no stage he has supported Sati. (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: You listen to him.

SHRI CHANDRA SHEKHAR: Mr. Chairman, Sir (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: You hear him. Let us hear him.

श्री सुरेन्द्रजीत सिंह अहलुवालिया :
राजा रमोहल राय को अच्छी तरह से पढ़ो। बंगाल से शुरू हुआ था।

SHRI CHANDRA SHEKHAR: Again I cannot teach the rules of this House. If a Member says something here in this House, it is more credible than any report any Member might have been having from anywhere. (Interruptions) So, Mr. Chairman, Sir, I categorically say that Mr. Kalvi never supported Sati. He does not support Sati, and... (Interruptions)

AN HON. MEMBER: Let Mr. Kalvi say.

SHRI CHANDRA SHEKHAR: If this is the behaviour, how can Mr. Kalvi say anything? But I shall ask Mr. Kalvi to make his position clear as he made it in the House of Rajasthan. And I assure you, Mr. Chairman, Sir, that all of us think that any attempt for Sati should be condemned by all civilized people, and there is no question of supporting Sati

ऊर्जामंत्री (श्री कल्याण सिंह कालवी)
माननीय सभापति जी, आप आज्ञा दें तो मैं व्यक्तिगत स्पष्टीकरण दे दूँ। मैं आज कुछ भी बात कहूँगा तो आप कहेंगे आप्टर थाट है, मैनीयुलेटेड है या अपनी कुर्सी बचाने के लिए कह रहे हैं। इसलिए मैं वह बात पढ़कर आपको सुन रहा हूँ जो राजस्थान विधान सभा के अंदर मैंने कही थी। जो मैंने भाषण दिया था उसके कन्टेन्ट्स आपको पढ़कर सुन देता हूँ। इससे सारी बातें अपने आप स्पष्ट हो जाएगी। मैं सारा बता देता हूँ.. (व्यवधान)
2 नवम्बर, 1987 को राजस्थान विधान सभा में मैंने अपना भाषण दिया था.. (व्यवधान)

मौलाना अबेदुल्ला खां आजमी : हम यह जानना चाहेंगे कि रूप कवग जो सती हुई थी, क्या आपके बयान के बाद हुई या आपके बयान के पहले हुई थी.. (व्यवधान)

श्री कल्याण सिंह कालवी : राजस्थान विधान सभा में मैंने 2 नवम्बर, 1987 को भाषण दिया था और जो शब्द कहे थे वे अपने आप में स्पष्टीकरण देते हैं।

जैसा मैंने पहले ही स्पष्ट कहा था जहाँ तक राजस्थान का सवाल है हमारे प्रदेश के अंदर न तो कोई सती प्रथा नाम की चीज कभी थी न आज है और जब तक राजस्थान के अंदर समझदार व्यक्ति रहेंगे तब तक इस प्रथा का पुनर्जीवित होना या इस तरह की कोई शका करना यहाँ पर बिल्कुल निर्मूल बात है और न इस तरह की बात को हम कभी होने देंगे। यह सारा अपने में स्पष्ट है।

प्रधान मंत्री (चन्द्रशेखर) : आपति जी, मैं आपकी अनुमति से मंत्री परिषद् के अन्य सदस्यों का परिचय कराता हूँ।

1. श्री शकीलुर रहमान, स्वास्थ्य और परिवार कल्याण मंत्री।

2. डा० संजय सिंह, संचार मंत्रालय में (स्वतंत्र प्रभार) राज्य मंत्री। (व्यवधान)

श्री सुरेन्द्रजीत सिंह ग्रहलवालिया : सभापति जी, यह सी.बी.आई. की रिपोर्ट है। ... (व्यवधान)

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: Mr. Chairman, Sir, I would like to make a point on the appointment... (Interruptions).

श्री चन्द्रशेखर : : अन्य मंत्री हैं :—

3. श्री भागेय गोवर्धन, मानव संसाधन विकास मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री।

4. श्रीमती उषा सिंह, पर्यटन मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री।

5. श्री सरवर हुसैन, खाद्य और नागरिक पूर्ति मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री।

6. श्री रामजी लाल सुमन, श्रम मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री और कल्याण मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री।

7. श्री जयन्तीलाल वीरचन्दभाई शाह, कृषि मंत्रालय में कृषि और सहकारिता विभाग में राज्य मंत्री।

8. श्री बाबनराव थाकने, ऊर्जा मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री।

9. श्री ललित विजय सिंह, रक्षा मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री।

10. श्री राम बहादुर सिंह, कृषि मंत्रालय में ग्रामीण विकास विभाग में राज्य मंत्री।

11. श्री जय प्रकाश, पेट्रोलियम और रसायन मंत्रालय में उप-मंत्री और संचार मंत्रालय में उप-मंत्री।

श्री सुरेन्द्रजीत सिंह ग्रहलवालिया : यह सी.बी.आई. की रिपोर्ट साफ लिखती है... (व्यवधान)

डा० रत्नाकर पाण्डेय : यह बी.पी. सिंह के... (व्यवधान)

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: Sir, I would make one submission with your kind permission. We would like to submit that we strongly resent and protest on the appointment of Dr Sanjay Singh as the Minister. (Interruptions).

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA. We all support... (Interruptions).

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER It is no doubt. (Interruptions).

SHR DIPEN GHOSH. Is he a criminal? Do you call Dr. Sanjay Singh a criminal or not? (Interruptions).

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: Sir, while it is the sole prerogative and the privilege of the hon. Prime Minister to select his team for the Cabinet, there are certain democratic norms, certain conventions and certain laws that we have to follow. In this case, at the time when the hon. Member was sworn in as a Member, we had protested. We had made the position clear that Janata Dal at that time had selected a person who was involved in a murder case and he should not have been brought to this House. Equally, Sir, this gentleman should not have been appointed as a Minister. I can understand that the Prime Minister was pleased to appoint him at a time when the Criminal Revision Petition was not filed and the case in the district court was held in his favour. But after that, this Government had decided to file Criminal Revision Petition . . .

AN HON. MEMBER: It has already filed.

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER. That means, there is a *prima-facie* case against him and the Government headed by the hon. Prime Minister was satisfied that there is a *prima facie* case against him. In such circumstances, his continuance is resentful and we protest against his appointment and continuance and we leave it to Dr Sanjay Singh to decide. In the best interest of the democratic traditions, he should not continue as a Minister and we would like to lodge our protest accordingly.

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA. No walk-out? Are you compromising (Interruptions).

MR CHAIRMAN: Question No. 21 (Interruptions)

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: Sir, may I make a submission?

MR CHAIRMAN I have called Question No 21. The Question Hour has started.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY. Please hear me.

MR. CHAIRMAN No. You can make your submissions after the Question Hour.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY. Sir, please hear me

MR CHAIRMAN No. Question No 21 (Interruptions) I have to maintain some standard. I believe in one standard (Interruptions) I permitted you yesterday. He had a Motion that the Question Hour should be suspended. I cannot have it repeated.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY. Unless you decide we cannot co-operate. (Interruptions)

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA. How long will you take? (Interruptions)

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY. We protest against this.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA. He is sitting along with the Min-

isters again. It has become a *tamasha*.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: It is a mockery. Please decide the issue (Interruptions) I would request you to settle the issue. (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN. I have made the position clear yesterday. Now, Question No. 21 please. (Interruptions)

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY. Unless you decide the issue, it is very difficult to function in the House.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA. We do not accept the position that the Attorney-General will decide about our status in the House.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: We do not want the Attorney-General to decide. (Interruptions)

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA. It is a political question. It is not a legal matter. Yesterday we made our submissions. We had also written a letter to you.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY. Sir, it is a very anomalous situation in the House. Unless it is set right, it is very difficult for us to function.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Let them have the guts to say that they are opposing the Government. They are not saying that (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN. Mr Upendra Mr Gurupadaswamy, you are aware what I did when you were sitting on this side. What I followed at that time I cannot change today. When once the Question Hour has started... (Interruptions)

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Let them say that they are opposing the Government. When they have given in writing that they are supporting the Government, how can they sit in the Opposition?

MR. CHAIRMAN. You know that I did not permit the Congress Party at that time. (Interruptions) What

[Mr. Chairman] was good at that time is right today also (*Interruptions*) The whole House knows what I did earlier. Once the Question Hour started, I did not permit all the noise and other things that was coming from this side. I continued the Question Hour. I did not yield. Yesterday, I gave you a chance. Today, the Question Hour has started (*Interruptions*)

SHRI PRAVATHANENI UPEND-RA. The matter has not been finalised. You have to finalise the matter. With whose support are they existing here? With whose support is the Government surviving?

MR. CHAIRMAN. I have asked for the best legal opinion.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: It is not a legal question. The Attorney-General cannot decide as to who should sit in the Opposition. It is a political issue.

MR. CHAIRMAN. I have sent their representation and your proposition on that to the Attorney-General.

SHRI PRAVATHANENI UPEND-RA. It is a political matter. It is not a legal matter.

MR. CHAIRMAN. It is a legal question.

SHRI PRAVATHANENI UPEND-RA. It is not a legal question. The Congress Party has to make it clear whether they are supporting the Government or opposing the Government. They cannot do both. Let them say that they are opposing the Government. How is the Government surviving?

MR. CHAIRMAN. I am committed to the judicial process. I have to decide things judicially, not politically.

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN. Let them withdraw their support to the Government then.

MR. CHAIRMAN. So long as I am sitting here, I decide things judicially, judiciously and not politically. I

am not going to decide anything politically. I only decide judiciously.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY. The Congress Party is playing a dubious role.

MR. CHAIRMAN. I have made my position clear. According to me, this is a matter justiceable in a court of law.

SHRI PRAVATHANENI UPEND-RA. Let them make it clear whether they are supporting or opposing the Government.

MR. CHAIRMAN. They have given in writing.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: It is a political issue.

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY. There is a moral and ethical ground involved in this.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: It is a political issue. A party supporting the Government cannot sit in the opposition. It is a political issue. It is not a question of sophistry. They are playing a double standard. If you allow the Congress party to sit in the opposition.

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI. On a point of order.

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY. The Congress party has no policy. Mr. Shiv Shanker, have you any policy at all? (*Interruptions*)

MR. CHAIRMAN. There is no point of order. All that they are saying outside, nothing will go on record. Nothing will go on record which is not permitted by me because during Question Hour nothing else has come. I have done it when you were here. I am doing it when you are there. (*Interruptions*) Please be fair, be kind to me. I have done it when you were there and I cannot change now. After the Question Hour you can raise the matter. Mr. Gurupadaswamy, you can get up after the Ques-

tion Hour. You know the rule, you know everything. The whole world know...

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA. *

MR. CHAIRMAN The whole world knows that I decide matters according to correct things. The whole world knows that I did not permit this side to raise things Mr. Gurupadaswamy, you were there And I cannot change it overnight because the things have changed, you have decided to change things, I cannot I have done it I have permitted you one day. I permitted you fully. Now it is not correct You look to your own conscience I am not stopping you from raising it but after the Question Hour. (Interruptions) I cannot be called guilty of double standards.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: *

MR. CHAIRMAN. That is none of my business. You know that I do not belong to the Congress Party. The matter ends.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH *

MR. CHAIRMAN: This is the question Hour. Till the last day of the last session of this House you have seen my views. Mr Jaipal Reddy, in the last session of this House you were sitting here You saw my view last time Now I can't change it You may change your sides or do whatever you like, but so far as I am concerned, I will stick to what I followed then. I am not stopping you .. (Interruptions) After Question Hour, please. (Interruptions) .. After Question Hour, after Question Hour. .. (Interruptions) ... I will not permit. The matter is clear, and if you are not satisfied—I want to make it very clear—you can remove me. I don't care. But, so long as I am alive, I will stick to one standard. I can't change what I said in the last session. (Interruptions)

SOME HONOURABLE MEMBERS: We walk out ... (Interruptions)

[At this stage, some honourable Members left the Chamber]

ORAL ANSWERS TO QUESTIONS

Damage to Railway Properties during the Anti-Reservation Stir

*21. CHOWDHRY HARI SINGH†
DR RATNAKAR PANDEY:

Will the Minister of RAILWAYS be pleased to state.

(a) what was the estimated loss suffered by the Railways during the recent months due to the anti-reservation stir by the students throughout the country, so far

(b) whether there are any proposals under Government's consideration to raise the railway fares in order to offset that huge loss; and

(c) if so, what are the details thereof?

THE MINISTER OF RAILWAYS (SHRI JANESHWAR MISHRA): (a) While the loss suffered cannot be quantified precisely, it is approximately in the range of Rs. 100 crores.

(b) and (c) No concrete proposal has yet been formalised.

चौधरी हरि सिंह : माननीय सभापति जी, मंत्री जी ने अपने उत्तर में कह है कि लगभग एक सौ करोड़ रुपए की रेलवे प्रॉपर्टीज का नुकसान एजिटेशन के दौरान हुआ है। मैं माननीय मंत्री जी से जानना चाहता हूं कि यह रेलवे की किस तरह की प्रॉपर्टी का नुकसान हुआ है और किस रेलवे यानी नार्दन, ईस्टर्न या सदर्न, किस रेलवे में अधिक प्रॉपर्टी का नुकसान हुआ है और किस स्टेट में कितना हुआ है। इसका ब्यौरा क्या आपके पास है? अगर है तो उसको बताने की कृपा करें। नंबर दो, यदि इस वक्त आपके पास न हो तो उसे बाद में सदन के पटल पर रख दे क्योंकि मेरी जानकारी यह है कि सौ करोड़ से ज्यादा का नुकसान हुआ

*Not recorded

†The question was actually asked on the floor of the House by Chowdhry Hari Singh