

meetings of the House during the current Session?

(No Honourable Member dissented)

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Permission to remain absent is granted.

**SHRI A. G. KULKARNI** (Maharashtra): Madam.....

**SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY** (Uttar Pradesh): On a point of order...

**SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN** (Tamil Nadu): Madam, I want to raise an issue regarding a matter which I had raised earlier in this House...

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Mr. Kulkarni wanted to say something. I want you to listen to him.

#### DEMAND FOR STATEMENT BY PRIME MINISTER ON BOFORS

**SHRI A.G. KULKARNI** (Maharashtra): Madam, through you, I want to draw the attention of the Government to a problem which has been created in the last three or four days on account of the statement by the Government on the recent revelations in regard to Bofors. We raised this issue...

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** This matter was raised by Mr. Subramanian Swamy through a special mention.

**SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY** (Uttar Pradesh) The Prime Minister made the statement outside the House whereas he should have made it inside the House.

**SHRI A.G. KULKARNI:** The Prime Minister in his own way makes a statement on board an aircraft to the newspapers people on Bofors. The difficulty is confusion is created by such announcements. Now, a proxy war is being fought between various newspapers, one newspapers proposing one theory and another newspapers proposing contrary

theory. Various people are behind it. Perhaps, the Hinduja or the Wipro or the Chandha or the Bachchans might be there. Attempts are evident that these so called beneficiary want to scuttle the inquiry. Various types of interests wanted to create a confusion. I am seriously concerned about this situation and I also raised this issue two or three days back, when my colleague raised this issue, that a simple statement by the Prime Minister is very necessary in order to remove the confusion. Somebody here accuses somebody there and somebody there accuses somebody here and there is no solution and there is no court where one can go and get a clean certificate from. While this proxy war is going on, one paper says Arun Nehru has done nothing and there is no accusation against him, another paper says, even my barrister colleagues also says, that definitely there are some charges. We are bewildered; naturally the people in the country are bewildered, confused. Unnecessarily this issue is being raked up again and again and it is creating a bitter taste in the people's mind. I would request, through you, the Prime Minister should make a statement—outside he has made a statement—inside the House as to the present status of the Bofors issue.

**SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY:** Madam, the point is that this has been raised in the House already on two days running on Thursday and Friday last week. The Prime Minister could have made a statement here. But he did not. He made it aboard an aircraft 30,000 feet above the earth. Now, the person who has been accused, as Mr. Kulkarni said happens to be a Minister and can easily appear in this House.

**THE MINISTER OF ENERGY WITH ADDITIONAL CHARGE OF THE MINISTRY OF CIVIL AVIATION (SHRI ARIF MOHD KHAN):** He doesn't say..

**SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY:** You don't defend. You at

(Sh. Subramunium Swamy)

not being accused just yet. (*Interruptions*) What I am saying is on my behalf.

SHRI A.G. KULKARNI: I did not mention Arun or anybody.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: You said, the accused persons cannot reply.

SHRI A.G. KULKARNI: I said the accused persons cannot get a certificate. There is no court.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: No, the accused person..

SHRI ARIF MOHD. KHAN: He is ready to give his power of attorney to Mr. Subramanian Swamy.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: Who he is speaking of Have you got the power of attorney already from Mr. Arun Nehru that you get up all the time on this behalf? What is this? He can also defend himself.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, you don't get up on nobody's behalf every time.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: I am not getting up on nobody's behalf. I am getting up on behalf of the people of India who want to know the truth.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, please sitdown for the people of India.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: I would like to say here that the accused person happens to be a Minister. And he can easily defend himself in this House. The Prime Minister either should defend his Minister or the Minister should defend himself. And we would like a statement from the Government unless they have something to hide in this matter. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Just a minute.

श्रीमती सरला माहेश्वरी (पश्चिमी बंगाल) : माननीय उपसभापति महोदय, त्रिपुरा की महिला मंत्री श्रीमती विमुरानी देवी ने इस्तीफा दे दिया है और उन्होंने आरोप लगाया है कि उन्हीं के मंत्रिमंडल के एक मंत्री ने उनकी इज्जत और आबरू पर हमला किया है। उन्होंने खुद कहा है कि उनके मंत्रिमंडल के एक मंत्री श्री सुरजीत दत्त ने उनके साथ अपशब्दों का इस्तेमाल किया और जिस भाषा में उनके साथ बातचीत की उस भाषा का इस्तेमाल मैं सदन में नहीं कर सकती हूँ। लेकिन मैं बताना चाहती हूँ कि जिस सरकार के छाया तले महिला मंत्री की इज्जत-आबरू सुरक्षित नहीं है उस सरकार के छाया तले आप महिला की इज्जत-आबरू की क्या हालत होगी, यह पिछले ढाई वर्षों की त्रिपुरा की सरकार के आलम हो रहा है। हम लगातार इस बात को उठा रहे हैं कि ऐसी घटनाओं पूरे हिन्दुस्तान में नहीं घटी होंगी जैसी त्रिपुरा में ढाई सौ महिलाओं की इज्जत और आबरू के साथ खिलवाड़ किया गया है... (*व्यवधान*)

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY (Pondicherry): Have they forgotten what is happening in West Bengal, Goondaism has been unleashed in West Bengal. (*Interruptions*) Congressmen are beaten black and blue. She has forgotten what is happening West Bengal. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please...

SHRI M.A. BABY (Kerala) : This is an issue on which there should have been unanimity in the House. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I can only speak if you people keep quite. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH (West Bengal): Madam, both the Ministers belong to the Congress (I) Party. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I cannot understand anything, wha

is going on in the House. I cannot reply. *(Interruptions)* When everybody sits, down then only I can say. *(Interruptions)* I can give my ruling when everybody is quite. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Both the Ministers belong to the Congress (I) Party. One, a woman Minister and another a male Minister. The woman Minister has charged that her colleague in the Council of Ministers attempted to molest her. This is what she is raising. Whom are they supporting. The woman Minister or the male Minister? Both of them belong to the Congress (I) Party. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI M.A. BABY: It is very unbecoming of them. It is against the tradition of the House. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Madam, we have discussed many a time the issue relating to atrocities against women. They have also raised the issue. Here is a case of an atrocity against a woman Minister by a male Minister in the same Cabinet. *(Interruptions)*

DR. G. VIJAYA MOHAN REDDY (ANDHRA PRADESH): Let the Leader of the Opposition say something on this. *(Interruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Order please. All of you, take your seats. Mrs. Maheshwari, please sit down. *(Interruptions)* Nobody ever said that two wrongs will make one right. In regard to what happened in West Bengal, nobody supported it. This House condemned it. What happened in Tripura also, we condemn it. That is about it all. Now, Special Mentions please. *(Interruptions)*

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN (Tamil Nadu): Madam, I want to raise one issue. *(Interruptions)* A few days ago, in the House, I raised an issue, an important issue, regarding the misuse of official

machinery and misuse of a plane and *(Interruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Fotedar, I request you. So long as I am in the Chair, I have the right. If you cannot hear, that is your problem. You cannot take the right of the Chair yet. If I feel that I am not able to hear, her, I will ask her to come to the front.

SHRI MAKHAN LAL FOTEDAR (Uttar Pradesh): I cannot hear.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: If you cannot hear, you complain to the Secretariat that your earphone is not working. Now, Mrs. Natarajan please.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Madam, the other day I raised the issue, a serious issue, regarding the misuse of official machinery and the fact that a particular plane given by the U.N.D.P. for a specific purpose..

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Is it regarding the personal explanation of the Minister?

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: No.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Then, this is regarding what?

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: It has nothing to do with that matter. I had raised a serious issue in the House and the Minister's personal explanation did not answer it. Therefore, I am raising this issue before the House. It is not connected with the personal explanation because, according to me, it nowhere answers whatever charges that were raised in the House.

First of all, the plane is meant only for fire-fighting projects and it was given by the U.N.D.P. With great responsibility, I made a charge in the House. When the Minister wanted to use this plane, the offic

[Shrimati Jayanthi Natrajan]

wrote on the file that this plane cannot be used for any other purpose than firefighting projects. Then the PS or whatever he is—I do not know the correct designation of the officer—in the Minister of State's office wrote: "Show it as a demonstration flight". It means that we are violating the agreement with the UNDP because "Show it as a demonstration flight" means that it is not a demonstration flight, it is being shown as demonstration flight. And the Minister of State had signed it. Therefore, it is complete misuse of official machinery.

I have also said that the Minister had made personal trips to Bareilly and to reach Pilibhit which is in her constituency on 24th of June and 23rd of March.

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :** Now you are speaking in which connection ? I will not permit you ....Just a second....I will not permit you to speak because whatever personal explanation was made, there should never be any comment or discussion on that.

**SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN :** It is not a comment on that. I am not dealing with that. (*Interruptions*).

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :** Please, let her say. She is the one who raised it. She had said in the House that she received a letter..

**SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN :** That I am dealing with separately. My stand on the personal explanation is that even according to the precedent that the Chair quoted on that day about Mr. CPN Singh that Mrs. Alva was allowed to reply to him and therefore, I should reply, that is a separate issue. I have written a letter. I am not dealing with that now. I am saying....

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :** Because those two examples are not the same.

**SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN :** That is totally separate. I am on something totally different. I had made four charges. I had said that it was written on the file "Show it as a demonstration flight" which is a clear misuse of official position because it was not a demonstration flight. It was in order for the Minister to attend the World Environment Day.

Secondly, I had also said that she made various charges against the Cabinet Minister, Mr. Routray, and against the officer concerned, both in the press and the in letter—not a private letter, but a demi-official letter—written to me in reply to the charges I had raised. Over there, she says that the Minister is actually misusing the plane and the Environment Secretary is also misusing the plane. If this is true, then this is a very serious charge. We are not concerned with the personal squabbles between the Minister of State and the Minister because we know the whole Government is squabbling. It is a matter which is happening every day and that is certainly not a matter to be raised in Parliament. Let them sort out their squabbles. What I am more interested in is, if the Minister of State and the Minister are going to trade charges against each other like this and go to the press, then we are cutting a very sorryfigure.

I also raised the matter in the House saying whether the Minister of State had said....

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :** That also is not your bother. It is for the Government to consider.

**SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN :** I am sorry, I am a Member of this House, I am a responsible Member of this House..

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :** What do you want to say ?

**SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN :** I want a discussion in the House .

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :**  
Please don't disturb her. Let her finish.

**SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NAT-ARAJAN :** I want three things. I want the person responsible, whoever it is, whether it is Mrs. Maneka Gandhi or the Minister, should resign owning responsibility.

Secondly, in order that correct facts may come before the House and the people of this country, Government should come forward with a statement, or we should discuss this motion about misuse of official machinery and truth should be placed before the House.

Thirdly, there should be a parliamentary probe into the matter.

These are the three demands. I feel it is very important in public interest that it should be raised before this House.

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :**  
Thank you. Special Mentions. Dr. Ratnakar Pandey.

**SHRI VISHVJIT P. SINGH (Maharashtra) :** What is the reply of the Government ?

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :**  
Now take your seat. When the Government replies, I will permit them to make a reply. . . . When the Government replies, if the Government replies, I will permit it. Let us go ahead with the Special Mentions.

**SHRI AJIT P.K. JOGI (Madhya Pradesh) :** Let the Leader of the House react to it. It is a very important issue.

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :**  
It is for the Government to see. Please now no more discussion on this.

**SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA (Bihar) :** We want a reaction from the Government.

484 R.S.—11

**SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NAT-ARAJAN :** The silence is deafening.

**उपसभापति :** आप भी बैठ जाइये । आपका व्यवस्था का प्रश्न बंद में आयेगा । रत्नाकर जी को बोलने दीजिए ।

**श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज (हरियाणा) :**  
मैं व्यवस्था का प्रश्न रूल कोट क के कर रही हूँ । रूल 238(ए) के तहत मेरा व्यवस्था का प्रश्न है । आप किताब निकालिए और देखिए ।

**SHRI VISHVJIT P. SINGH :**  
Madam, what she does not realise is that if personal explanation is used. . . .

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :**  
Let her have her say. She may be saying something else. How do you know what she is going to say ? Did she tell you ?

**श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज :** मैडम, रूल नं० 238(ए) देखिए इसके तहत मेरा व्यवस्था का प्रश्न यह है कि यह रूल, यह नियम बहुत स्पष्ट तौर पर एक बात कहता है कि यदि—

“No allegation of a defamatory or incriminatory nature shall be made by a Member against any other member or a member of the House unless the member making the allegation has given previous intimation to the Chairman and also to the Minister concerned so that the Minister may be able to make an investigation into the matter for the purpose of a reply.”

**श्रीमती जयती नटरांन ने कहा** बाकायदा यह शब्द कहाँ हैं कि मैं चार्जज लगा रही हूँ । उन्होंने चार्ज चार्जज लगाये हैं उन्होंने आफिशल मशीनरी के मिसयुज का चार्ज लगाया है ।

मैं आपसे यह जानना चाहती हूँ कि यह चार्जज लगाने के पहले क्या इस रूल का अमल करते हुए इसे नियम के

[श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज]

तहत उन्होंने मिनिस्टर कनसर्ड को नोटिस दिया था? ... (व्यवधान)

श्री विश्वजित पृथ्वीजित सिंह :  
हां दिया।... (व्यवधान)

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज : आपको कैसे मालूम ? (समय की घंटी) मुझे पूरा बताने दीजिए।... (व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :  
Mr. Vishvjit Singh, I think that lady has got a nice voice to answer.

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज : मुझे समझ नहीं आती कि मैं उपसभापति जी से पूछ रही हूँ कि यह नियम इस बात का प्रि-रिक्युजिट करता है कि इस सदन में सदन के किसी सदस्य के या मंत्री के विशुद्ध चार्जज लगाने से पहले चेयरमैन को नोटिस दिया जाएगा। विश्वजीत सिंह पृथ्वीजित सिंह जो उसका जवाब देने के लिए सही व्यक्ति नहीं है।

आप मुझे बताइये कि क्या सभापति को श्रीमती जयन्ती नटराजन ने ईस रूल के तहत नोटिस दिया कि आज इस सदन में मंत्री के खिलाफ चार्जज लगाने वाले हूँ और क्या उन्होंने संबंधित मंत्री को यह नोटिस दिया, ताकि वह अपने जवाब देने के लिए अपनी व्यवस्था और तैयारी कर लें। उसके बाद उनको बोलने की इजाजत मिलनी चाहिए थी, वरना ... (व्यवधान)

उपसभापति : आप बैठिये, मैं बताती हूँ।

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN : The charges were not against the Minister. I said, here is misuse of official machinery and I want to know who is responsible. Therefore, the honourable Member is misdirected in her submission.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :  
I will give my ruling. Mrs. Maneka Gandhi is a Minister, and about whatever was charged against her a few days ago, she gave her personal explanation. I would never permit anybody—even that day, Members wanted—to raise issues on her personal explanation. . . (Interruptions)

उपसभापति : आप बैठिये। शांति से सुनिये तो मैं बताऊंगी। शांति से सुनिये, यह मसले ऐसे नहीं हैं कि इसमें इमोशंस आये। मैंने उस दिन भी एलाय्री नहीं किया था।

आज इन्होंने श्रीमती मेनका गांधी के पर्सनल एक्सप्लेनेशन पर नहीं बोला है। इन्होंने सरकार पर चार्जज लगाये थे कि गवर्नमेंट की मशीनरी का मिसयुज हुआ है। किसने किया है उसके बारे में इन्होंने सरकार से जानकारी मांगी है और रोज ही हाउस के अंदर इस तरह की बातें उठाई जाती हैं कोई न कोई सरकार के ऊपर यह आक्षेप लगाता है कि सरकारी मशीनरी का सही उपयोग नहीं हुआ है। तो यह जो भी है यह मैटर खत्म हो गया।

अब रत्नाकर पाण्डेय जी बोलेंगे।... (व्यवधान) अब आप बैठ जाइये। यह मामला बस खत्म हो गया।... (व्यवधान) That is my ruling. ... (Interruptions)... You cannot challenge the ruling.

श्री मोहम्मद सलीम : माननीय उपसभापति जी आपने सही कहा लेकिन विश्वजीत सिंह पृथ्वीजित सिंह ने हाउस को गुमराह किया कि पहले नोटिस दिया गया था। यह प्रश्न पूछे जाने पर कि पहले नोटिस दिया गया था कि नहीं दिया गया था उन्होंने\* कहा।

श्री अजीत जोगी : पार्लियामेंट्री नहीं है।

\*Expunged as Ordered by the Chair.

**उपसभापति :** इस तरह की बात विश्व-जित पृथ्वीजित सिंह जी ने अगर कुछ कही है, तो वह बता सकते हैं कि उन्होंने सच कहा है कि सच नहीं कहा। वह हाउस को बता देंगे।

अब रत्नाकर पाण्डेय जी बोलेंगे।

**श्री विश्वजित पृथ्वीजित सिंह :** अगर आप मुझे इजाजत दें, तो.... (व्यवधान)

**उपसभापति :** मैं इजाजत नहीं दूंगी।... (व्यवधान)

**SHRI VISHVJIT P. SINGH:** You have asked me; I am permitted.

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** First of all, you are not a concerned party.

**THE LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER):** Does he mean to take the ladies for about or what?... (Interruptions) ...

**SHRI VISHVJIT P. SINGH:** I am not going to talk about the misuse of the aircraft by Mrs. Maneka Gandhi. I am neither going to mention her tour programmes.

**SHRI VIREN J. SHAH (Maharashtra):** Madam, he says he will not mention but keeps mentioning. I think this needs to be taken care of. If he mentions it, it gets recorded. ..(Interruptions). - .

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :** Mr. Vishvjit Singh, I am not permitting you. Please don't misuse this House for making any more allegations. Please take your seat. Let me allow Dr. Ratnakar Pandey. That matter is closed. Yes, Dr. Ratnakar Pandey... (Interruptions)... That is over now. That matter is closed. ... (Interruptions)... About the Tripura Minister also, that matter is closed. ... (Interruptions)... Don't interrupt him.

## SPECIAL MENTIONS

### Alleged fraud in the Ministry of Steel and Mines.

**डा० रत्नाकर पाण्डेय (उत्तर प्रदेश) :** जाननीया उपसभापति जी, आपने व्यवधानों के बीच में मुझे बोलने का मौका दिया है, मैं आपका कृतज्ञ हूँ।

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Do not interrupt.

**डा० रत्नाकर पाण्डेय :** मैं आज एक विशेष उल्लेख के माध्यम से एक्साइज के 12 हजार करोड़ रुपये के इस सरकार के घोटाले के संबंध में आपका ध्यान और इस सदन के माननीय सदस्यों का ध्यान आकर्षित करना चाहता हूँ। नागपुर से प्रकाशित "लोकमत" समाचार के 25 अगस्त समाचार में छपा है कि 12 हजार करोड़ रुपये के घपले में भारत के प्रधान मंत्री वी० पी० सिंह फंसेंगे। उत्पाद कर लगाने के खिलाफ एक अदालती प्रौसले के बाद देश की इस्पात मिलों तथा अन्य इकाइयों को आबकारी कर की रकम लौटाने का मामला राष्ट्रीय मोर्चा सरकार का एक बड़ा घोटाला बनता जा रहा है। पूरा न पढ़ करके तथ्यों की ओर मैं इस सदन का ध्यान आपके माध्यम से आकर्षित करना चाहूंगा। 24 अगस्त, 1990 को जनता संसदीय दल की बैठक में हमारे सदन के माननीय सदस्य और वरिष्ठ जनता दल के नेता श्री यशवन्त सिन्हा ने इस्पात मिलों और अन्य इकाइयों द्वारा आबकारी कर के रूप में प्राप्त लगभग 12 हजार करोड़ रुपये पुनः उद्योगपतियों को इस सरकार द्वारा वापस किए जाने का मामला उठाया था। इस बैठक में प्रधानमंत्री श्री विश्वनाथ प्रताप सिंह भी उपस्थित थे। कुछ दिन पूर्व ही जनता दल के एक वरिष्ठ नेता श्री चन्द्रशेखर जी ने इस बात को प्रधान मंत्री और वित्त मंत्री मधु दण्डवते के समक्ष उठाया था। बम्बई उच्च न्यायालय ने उक्त आबकारी कर को उपभोक्ता कर जैसी कोई संस्था बना कर उसका उपयोग उपभोक्ताओं के हित में ही करने का सुझाव दिया था, परन्तु इस सरकार ने 24 अगस्त को एक परिपत्र जारी कर उक्त धनराशि को पुनः उद्योगपतियों को लौटाने की घोषणा कर दी। पिछले तीन