

[श्री सत्य प्रकाश मालवीय]

साल्वे जी की बात सुनने को तैयार हैं लेकिन कम से कम लोकतंत्र में जब इधर से कोई बोले तो उनको भी सुनना चाहिए।  
(व्यवधान)

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: Madam, I want to assure the hon. Member that we are equally worried about a healthy parliamentary democracy. (Interruptions) Madam, if I am not allowed to speak, they will be responsible. Madam, I want to assist you. (Interruption)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I allowed Mr. Shiv Shanker yesterday... (Interruptions) But, unfortunately, none of the Members listened to the request from the Chair the whole day. And I am telling you this is not the way to abide by the rules of the House. Yesterday I permitted Mr. Shiv Shanker to speak in rapt silence. The whole day the matter was discussed. I thought... (Interruptions) Just a minute. Don't interrupt me... (Interruptions) Just a minute, please. If you are not satisfied... (Interruptions) By shouting in the House you cannot... (Interruptions). If you are not satisfied, one person can get up and say: we are not satisfied. But to raise slogans in the House is against the Rules. I shall not permit this. Mr. Salve... (Interruptions) Please sit down. (Interruptions). Mr. Salve, you tell me, is this the way to behave when I am speaking? Is this the way to behave? (Interruptions). Please do not interrupt me. Mr. Salve... (Interruptions) Sit down. (Interruptions) Mr. Salve, if you are not sitting there, if you are sitting in the Chair, what would you do?

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: I respectfully bow to what you say. (Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Okay. I allow you to speak. But you must promise as the Deputy Leader of your party that your Members will allow me to do the business which is listed. You decide amongst yourself. Mr.

Salve, I need your help and cooperation—of a major political party in this House—to restore peace and order and let us run some business. (Interruptions) I allow him to speak but I want only one promise that then there will be quiet and peace in the House, otherwise I will not allow. (Interruptions). I allow him or him or anybody you identify. You make your Members keep quiet. (Interruptions). I will allow one person. (Interruptions.) Please take your seats. (Interruptions).

श्री सत्य प्रकाश मालवीय : जब तक यह हमारे लीडर्स को नहीं सुनेंगे हम भी इनकी बात नहीं सुनेंगे (व्यवधान) हम ऐसा नहीं होने देंगे.. (व्यवधान)

श्री सोमपाल (उत्तर प्रदेश) : जब तक हमारे नेता को नहीं बोलने देंगे हम भी नहीं सुनेंगे। (व्यवधान) हमारे सदस्य पहले बोल रहे थे और वह हल्का मर्चा रहे थे। (व्यवधान) हम नहीं बोलने देंगे। (व्यवधान)

#### ALLEGED INTERFERENCE WITH THE JUDICIAL PROCESS IN THE SYED MODI MURDER CASE

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Salve, you identify one person. It is not my choice. I leave it to you as the Deputy Leader of the party. I will allow one person to speak for two minutes and then I will continue with the List of Business. If you agree, it is fine. Otherwise, I am going ahead with the business. (Interruptions). O.K. Don't allow. It is up to you (Interruptions) I am giving you the best of offer. If you are not prepared to accept it, it is entirely up to you. If you don't allow the business, it is up to you.

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE (Maharashtra): Kindly gave me a minute to express our viewpoint in the matter. Yesterday, the agreement that we had arrived at...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I know. That is for you to see. It is for you to see whether it was a bazar or it was the Parliament of India. You should know. *(Interruptions)*.

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: Madam, the spirit of yesterday's agreement has been hopelessly violated. We want redressal. A certain gentlemen's agreement was arrived at yesterday. The spirit of that agreement was that if specific allegations were made, a reply would be given. No denial has come. Mr. Dhawan has made very serious charges against the Prime Minister.

THE LEADER OF THE HOUSE (SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY): He is repeating what was said yesterday. It was closed yesterday. There was a reply from my colleague.

*(Interruptions)*

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: If the Government is to be guilty of violation in accordance with the spirit of the agreement yesterday, then please don't blame us. Madam, I urge upon you that the sanctity of the agreement and the spirit of the agreement has to be maintained. Very serious allegations.....

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: Do you want the agreement at your convenience? You know what was done yesterday. Don't talk about the agreement. You have no respect for any agreement. *(Interruptions)* I say that you have no respect for any agreement. *(Interruptions)*.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please have order in the House. I allowed Mr. Salve to place his viewpoint. Now will you restore order in the House?

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE Madam, my respectful submission has been that in accordance with the spirit of the agreement we expected a reply. Certain very serious allegations of a very personal nature on the integrity of

the Prime Minister have been made. *(Interruptions)*. They are only allegations. They are only allegations impinging on the question of... *(Interruptions)*. Now that the Prime Minister is here, the matter can be resolved. Kindly allow those allegations to be repeated here.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No repetition. I am not permitting any repetition.

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: That is the spirit of the agreement.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: What has been said is in the records.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: The agreement has been repudiated yesterday.

*(Interruptions)*

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE. There has been no repudiation.

THE LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (SHRI P. SHIV SHANKAR): Madam, the reply that was given by the hon. Home Minister was most unsatisfactory. The hon. Prime Minister is here. We will request him to please say something so that we may be satisfied.

The DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now the Prime Minister has come. Please let him finish and after that the matter will be closed. *(Interruptions)*. No repetition of yesterday's debate. No, it is never done in the history of Parliament. I will not try new traditions. It has never been done in the history of Parliament that whatever is spoken yesterday is repeated.

THE PRIME MINISTER (SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH): Madam, I do not want to take cover under any technicalities. If the hon. Members have any allegation, they are free to put it against me. I am before the House, and I submit myself to the House. In public life, I have never done it. And they should be bold to make .... *(Interruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please do not interrupt.

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: Madam, he has fairly made an offer. He has made a fair offer.

(Interruptions)

श्री शंकर दयाल सिंह (बिहार) : याद रखिये (व्यवधान) अगर आप प्रधान मंत्री जी को नहीं बोलने देंगे (व्यवधान)

उपसभापति : प्रधान मंत्री जी खुद सुनना चाहते हैं ! आप बैठ जाइये (व्यवधान)

Please take your seats. The Prime Minister himself has allowed. It is okay. (Interruptions) Mr. Reddy, please take your seats. (Interruptions)

SHRI R. K. DHAWAN (Andhra Pradesh): Well, your Prime Minister himself invites me to speak, and you are interfering. What is all this, I do not know. You have no respect even for your Prime Minister?

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: He has made a fair offer.

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: He has no respect for your Leader? You have no respect for your Prime Minister even.

(Interruptions)

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: He wants to honour the agreement that is arrived at.

(Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes, Mr. Dhawan.

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी (मध्य प्रदेश) : महोदय, अभी धवन साहब ने कहा है कि युवर प्राइम मिनिस्टर वह हमारे प्राइम मिनिस्टर नहीं है, इज दि प्राइम मिनिस्टर आफ दि कंट्री ।  
... (व्यवधान) ...

SHRI R. K. DHAWAN: No, he is not our Prime Minister. He is the country's Prime Minister. (Interruptions)

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: He is the Prime Minister of all of us. He is the Prime Minister of the nation. (Interruptions)

SHRI R. K. DHAWAN: He is the Prime Minister of India; you Prime Minister, not our Prime Minister. हमारे प्राइम मिनिस्टर नहीं है, ये आपके प्राइम मिनिस्टर हैं। आप इनका समर्थन करते हैं वाजपेयी जी, ये आपके प्राइम मिनिस्टर हैं, हमारे नहीं हैं ।  
... (व्यवधान) ...

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Madam, there is a limit to this. (Interruptions). He does not know the Parliamentary niceties. It cannot be allowed.... (Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please sit down. I will look into the record. If there is anything which is wrong, I will remove it.

(Interruptions)

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA (West Bengal). Mr. Dhawan cannot be allowed to hold this Parliament into ransom...

(Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please sit down.

SARDAR JAGJIT SINGH AUROLA (Punjab): It is only appropriate that the Leader of the Opposition... (Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please sit down.

SHRI SANGH PRIYA GAUTAM (Uttar Pradesh): On a point of order.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am not allowing you any point of order. I have identified Mr. Dhawan and he will speak. Please sit down.

SHRI R.K. DHAWAN: Madam, as you and this august House know, the issue of removal of the public prosecutors in the so-called Modi murder case was raised in the House yesterday. Various speakers mentioned various things. I had raised certain specific points.

Now, I am not concerned with the merits or the demerits of the case. It is none of my business. Nor is it my concern as to what considerations weighed with the Government; whether it was the economy consideration or it was some political consideration or, for that matter, any other consideration which weighed most with the Prime Minister or, for that matter, with the Government. Of course, the whole country knows—although the Prime Minister would not tell us—what was the consideration which weighed with him.

Madam, I had raised certain specific points to which I expected a reply from the Home Minister. The points were these. When was the issue raised, that such and such public prosecutors should be removed from this case? In other words, when was this initiative taken? What was the need? Was it only on account of economy, as mentioned by the Home Minister, or, was it before the 6th—as he has said—that the issue was taken up that such and such persons should be removed from this case? Is there any officer by the name of Mr. Sharma, a senior police officer—Mr. Chintamani Sharma—he is also on record—who initiated such a note? Did this note go to somebody? At what level was it seen and who approved this note? What was the note? When was this order issued and was it brought to the notice of the Prime Minister at that time? (Interruptions) I say this because the CBI, the investigating agency, is directly under the control of the Prime Minister. Does anybody believe, does anybody from the other side believe—as Mr. Som Pal was saying—that the CBI would take any action without the knowledge

and approval of the Prime Minister? I have had to face the CBI between 1977 and 1980 and I know what the CBI does, what they do. Does anybody from the other side want me to believe that...(Interruptions):

श्री राम अवधेश सिंह (बिहार) :  
मिस्टर धवन के ऊपर श्रीमती इन्दिरा  
गांधी की हत्या का चार्ज था (व्यवधान)  
यह क्या कह रहे हैं (व्यवधान) चार साल  
बनवास रहे हत्या के चार्ज में (व्यवधान)

SHRI R.K. DHAWAN: Does the hon. Prime Minister want me to believe that very senior police officers...(Interruptions)

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE: Madam, what are these interruptions? You reprimanded us...(Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I never reprimanded anybody. I only want that there should be some sense. What happened yesterday, you know very well. (Interruptions)

SHRI R.K. DHAWAN: Does the hon. Prime Minister want us to believe that the CBI takes action without his knowledge, or, is it that the senior police officers...(Interruptions)

SARDAR JAGJIT SINGH AURO-  
RA: He should only ask questions.

SHRI R. K. DHAWAN: I am only asking questions. Some senior police officers, who are facing trial, against whom cases are pending in the Supreme Court, and who are on bail, have been appointed to some sensitive posts in the Government and they are directing the policies of the Government. I charge the Prime Minister that a very senior officer, against whom a criminal case is pending in the Supreme Court, and who is on bail, has been appointed to a sensitive post in the Government. (Interruptions) Why are you bothered? It is a question regarding the CBI and police officers. (Interruptions)

AN HON. MEMBER: What is the name? (*Interruptions*)

SHRI R. K. DHAWAN: Let the hon. Prime Minister find out and let me know. (*Interruptions*) If the Prime Minister does not have the information, let me know. (*Interruptions*)

DR. G. VIJAYA MOHAN REDDY (Andhra Pradesh): You cannot mislead the House. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI R.K. DHAWAN: Were the instructions that the public prosecutors should be removed verbal or written? By whom were they given? And when, ultimately, this matter came to the notice of the Prime Minister, what action did he take? Of course, the Home Minister has said about that. But what was the recording on the file? So, I pleaded before the Home Minister again and again yesterday that he should let me know, but there was no reply to the points I made and that is why the reply of the Home Minister was not at all convincing. (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am not permitting you. Please do not keep raising your hands. There is an order in the House. The Prime Minister is here. Shri Salve said that Mr. Dhawan wanted to speak. The Prime Minister agreed and so I allowed him. Now the Prime Minister will answer.

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: Madam, yesterday for quite some time hon. Members were agitated and also the proceedings of the House could not go ahead. Now I have come to know the formulation of it as Mr. Dhawan has said. One fact is, while these lawyers, about whom reference is being made, were arguing the case in Lucknow on behalf of the Government, it was being argued in the House that they were not there. This is fact number one.

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE: We never said that.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let him answer. (*Interruptions*). Please Mr. Salve. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE: Mr. Prime Minister must know that he said in turn that they had been reinstated.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: If Shri Shiv Shanker did not say, perhaps somebody else said that. (*Interruptions*). I did not allow anybody to interrupt Mr. Dhawan and I would not allow anybody to interrupt the Prime Minister. I am sore about it.

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: This fact goes unchallenged by the representatives of the opposition. (*Interruptions*). Is it accepted or not that when those lawyers were arguing the case on behalf of the Government, at the very same time it was being argued that they were not there and that they had been removed?

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE: Nobody has argued like that, Madam. You have a look at the record. (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am not allowing anybody. Yes, Mr. Shiv Shanker.

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: Madam Deputy Chairman, it is useful to recall, yesterday I had myself said that the Prime Minister was pleased to reinstate them. That has come in the papers. I have said it myself. Yesterday when I started I made the position clear that they are working because of your orders. I have already said that.

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: Thank you for the second fact. I do not have to say it. The Leader of the Opposition, Shri Shiv Shankerji, is a fair person. He has confirmed that I had passed the orders to reinstate the lawyers in the Modi case and also in the case where charges were there against people for attacking the ex-Prime Minister,

Shri Rajiv Gandhi. And one thing more. In the whole of the country while all the lawyers have been removed, only these two lawyers have been reinstated. It is a total reply to all the suspicions that you want to raise. It is a complete and total reply to your suspicions.

SHRI R. K. DHAWAN: Is this the reply? Hon. Prime Minister, you know the functioning of the Government. Is this the reply? (Interruptions).

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY (Pondicherry): Why don't you reply in what way he is related to you? (Interruptions).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I would not like Members to bring in the relations in this House. Members are Members, they are nobody's relations here. So, please do not mention it again and do not force me to remove it from the record. You should be decent yourself to remove it. I would not allow any relations to be mentioned here.

1.00 P.M.

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: Madam, I do not have a daughter. Where is the question of a son-in-law?

डा० रत्नाकर पाण्डेय (उत्तर प्रदेश):  
आपने कन्यादान दिया था।

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: I have only two sons. If somebody wants to...

SHRI R.K. DHAWAN: You recognise your own daughter only in your relations?

डा० रत्नाकर पाण्डेय: आपने कन्यादान दिया था या नहीं, प्रधान मंत्री जी?

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: Take it in good humour.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: We are not discussing all that. Don't talk irrelevant.

डा० रत्नाकर पाण्डेय: प्रधान मंत्री जी बताना चाहते हैं, संजय सिंह जी की जब शादी हुई थी तो आपने कन्यादान दिया था कि नहीं। (व्यवधान)

श्री विश्वनाथ प्रताप सिंह: कन्यादान नहीं, कन्यादान होने की बात है ... (व्यवधान)

श्री विश्वजित पृथ्वीजित सिंह (महाराष्ट्र): प्रधान मंत्री जी का कोई रिश्ता नहीं है संजय सिंह जी के साथ, सारी दुनिया जानती है।

उपसभापति: बैठ जाइये।

एक माननीय सदस्य: मैं अभी भी कहता हूँ दामाद नहीं है। ... (व्यवधान)

श्री विश्वनाथ प्रताप सिंह: यह बहस का बात नहीं है। कोई आफिस में रहता है तो आफिस की इयूजी को डिसचार्ज करना होता है। (व्यवधान) उस समय संबंधों की बात है और हम से ज्यादा आप क्यों परेशान हैं?

डा० रत्नाकर पाण्डेय: ... (व्यवधान)  
आपके पिता की संतान है कि नहीं?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please sit down. We are not discussing that. I am going to adjourn the House for lunch. Let the Prime Minister finish his speech and I am going to adjourn the House.

श्री विश्वनाथ प्रताप सिंह: श्री आर० के० धवन जी ने सी०बी०आई० की बात कहा है कि बिना प्राइम मिनिस्टर के हुकम के कैसे सी०बी०आई० चलती है और उसी पर आप फार्सी के फंदे पर लटकने वाले थे, बताइये... (व्यवधान)

श्री आर०के० धवन: उसी गवर्नमेंट में आप शामिल थे। आप ही ने शायद यह सब कुछ चलाया होगा। ... (व्यवधान)

श्री विश्वनाथ प्रताप सिंह : आप भी उस गवर्नमेंट से निकल और हम भी निकले । . . . (व्यवधान)

उपसभापति : रत्नाकर पांडेय जी, पीज आप बैठ जाइये। आप घड़ी-घड़ी क्यों खड़े हो जाते हैं। बैठिये, यह कोई तरीका नहीं है इस तरह के हाउस में बहस करने का। . . . (व्यवधान)

श्री आर० के० धवन : आप उस गवर्नमेंट में शामिल थे।

श्री विश्वनाथ प्रताप सिंह : आप वहां पहुंच गये और हम यहीं पहुंच गये। . . . (व्यवधान)

उपसभापति : यह कोई तरीका नहीं बैठ जाइये। बोलिये नहीं। . . . (व्यवधान),

श्री विश्वनाथ प्रताप सिंह : मैं आपको आश्वासन दिलाना चाहता हूँ कि जिस तरह का सी० बी० आई० का चित्र श्री धवन जो के मन में होगा उस तरह सी० बी० आई० नहीं चल रही है, उसने स्वतंत्र इन्वेस्टीगेशन किया है और कोई भी फेवर का बात नहीं है। (व्यवधान) जो हां, बतलाओ।

श्री आर० के० धवन : आपके प्रधान मंत्री बनने पर सी० बी० आई० का चित्र भां बदल गया। (व्यवधान)

श्री विश्वनाथ प्रताप सिंह : हां, बदला है।

श्री आर० के० धवन : कि वह नोट पुट-अप कर और आप दस्तखत करें, आप बताय नहीं और आप रिटायर आदमियों को जिन पर क्रिमिनल केस चल रहे हैं उनको आप नौकरियां दे दें। जिस पर सुप्रीम कोर्ट में केस चल रहा है, वह आफिसर बेल पर है और जिस को आपने जज की पोस्ट पर लगाया है। . . . (व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Just a minute, Mr. Dhawan, please, I per-

mitted you. I do not like these interruptions. I am warning the Members that I will adjourn the House. Please don't interrupt like this. It is not proper...No, doesn't matter. I am not allowing you. If you feel that it is a serious discussion for which you asked the Prime Minister to come, please let him reply. We have had one full day...No, I will not permit you.

SHRI R.K. DHAWAN: Madam, he referred to Mrs. Gandhi's assassination case.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I say, please take your seat. Many things have been said.

SHRI R. K. DHAWAN: He was a party to that decision.

श्री अब्दुल अहमद खान (राजस्थान) : मैडम, अब एक बात बनी है।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please sit down, Mr. Abrar Ahmed. I am not permitting you. Don't make a mockery of this House. Yesterday we discussed this matter for the whole day. I am warning the Member that if they do not want to listen to the Prime Minister, I will adjourn the House and the matter will be closed.

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: Now the issue has been raised as to how they were removed and how they were reinstated. That is the next issue. Two you have agreed with me totally. One, you have agreed that while they were arguing the case there, here it was being argued that they were not there...(Interruptions)...

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: You seem to have been wrongly informed. Nobody said that...(Interruptions)

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: I will modify it. All right, nobody said like that. Very happy!

I think the impression is removed. Nobody said like that. All right, this much fact you agree, that those lawyers were arguing the case in Lucknow yesterday. There is no disagreement on that.

SHRI VISHVJIT P. SINGH: Yes...  
(Interruptions)...

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: Yes, No. 1. No. 2, it is agreed by you that I reinstated those lawyers.

SHRI VISHVJIT P. SINGH: Yes...  
(Interruptions)...

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: Thank you. No. 3: You agree, that while in the whole of the country all the lawyers are removed, only these two are reinstated.

SHRI VISHVJIT P. SINGH: We don't agree...(Interruptions)...

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: Madam, I am saying it on the floor of the House: While in the whole of the country all the lawyers are removed, only the Modi case lawyers and the Rajiv Gandhi case lawyers are reinstated.

SHRI VISHVJIT P. SINGH: May I say something...(Interruptions)... I would like to say just one thing...  
(Interruptions)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The Law Minister is on his legs. Please sit down. Yes, Mr. Dinesh Goswami...  
(Interruptions)...

SHRI R. K. DHAWAN: Will the Prime Minister be pleased to state the total number of lawyers removed throughout the country...(Interruptions)... What is the total number of lawyers removed?

SHRI VISHVJIT P. SINGH: I charged that only... (Interruptions)...

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: There has been no reinstatement of any other lawyers.

SHRI R. K. DHAWAN: How many have been removed?...  
(Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: This is not the Question Hour—I must remind the Members. Mr. Dhawan, please, this is not the Question Hour. You raised certain issues today. Let him answer...  
(Interruptions)...

SHRI R. K. DHAWAN: He said "throughout the country." Does he know the number of people who have been removed?...  
(Interruptions)...

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: Will, Madam, the fact is...

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: I would request the honourable Prime Minister to straightway speak out and settle the matter instead of complicating it...  
(Interruptions)... I fear you are complicating it more...  
(Interruptions)...

SHRI MOTURU HANUMANTHA RAO (Andhra Pradesh): Why don't you allow him? You wanted him here. Please hear him...  
(Interruptions)...

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: What the Minister of State for Home said yesterday was that there was a general order. As soon as it came to my notice that under this general order the lawyer related to the case of attempt on the life of the ex-Prime Minister and also the Modi murder case lawyer have been removed, I immediately passed orders that they should be reinstated, and they were reinstated. That is the simple fact.

SHRI MADAN BHATIA (Nominated). I want to know...  
(Interruptions)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Bhatia, don't you understand when I say that this is not the Question Hour? Mr. Dhawan has raised some issues. Let the Prime Minister answer.



[The Deputy Chairman]

You can't get up like this. You are a lawyer, you should know what are the rules and regulations. Can you do it in the court like this? Please sit down. You are a lawyer, you are an educated person, you know the Rule Book. I can't allow it like this ... (Interruptions)...

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: Have you finished, Mr. Prime Minister?

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: Yes.

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: We are sorry. We have not been satisfied with the various questions that have been raised. I think the only way out for us is that as a protest we walk out. [At this stage some hon. Members left the Chamber.]

THE MINISTER OF STEEL AND MINES WITH ADDITIONAL CHARGE OF MINISTRY OF LAW AND JUSTICE (SHRI DINESH GOSWAMI): Madam, I have to state...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have to adjourn the House for lunch. Just a minute. It is late today. I have to adjourn the House. Mr. Law Minister, what do you want to say?

SHRI DINESH GOSWAMI: I will take one minute.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes.

SHRI DINESH GOSWAMI: Madam, I made a statement yesterday. It is related to this. I made a statement yesterday that in the past Judges had been appointed without the recommendation of the Chief Justice. I have records of more than three cases to show that the Judges have been appointed without the recommendation of the Chief Justice. (Interruptions) I also assured that I would place the records on the Table of the House.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE: No, Madam, not on the Table.

SHRI DINESH GOSWAMI: The records should be shown to you. But I feel that it will be improper on my part, subject to the permission of the House, to lay it on the Table of the House because in that case I will drag the names of the Judges who are discharging their duties. I had a talk with the Leader of the Opposition. I told him that I would show the file to him. If he is satisfied, then I feel that I am vindicated. The matter can rest there, if the House so approves.

2.00 P.M.

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी : अगर फाइल दिखाना भी है लीडर ऑफ दी ऑपोजिशन की, चैयरमैन साहब की उपस्थिति में दिखाना चाहिये, अलग से नहीं।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I request the Law Minister that if the Leader of the Opposition and the Leader of the House so agree, then, this file can be shown in the presence of the Chairman, and the matter....

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त (मध्य प्रदेश) : उसके बाद क्या होगा?

उपसभापति : उसके बाद हाउस में रिपोर्टिंग होगी। ... (व्यवधान) ... उसके बाद लॉ मिनिस्टर और लीडर ऑफ दी ऑपोजिशन रिपोर्ट करेंगे— That is my ruling

—...

#### THE COMMISSIONS OF INQUIRY (AMENDMENT) BILL, 1990—Contd.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: We have a small Bill. If the Members would agree, we will finish it. You have moved it. I am just putting it to vote for passing it.

The question is: