

do agree to nominate two members from Rajya Sabha to associate with the Committee on Public Undertakings of this House for the unexpired portion of the term of the Committee ending on 30 April, 1991 vice Shri Virendra Verma ceased to be a member of Rajya Sabha on his appointment as a Governor and Dr. G. Vijaya Mohan Reddy resigned from the Committee and do communicate to this House the names of the members so nominated by Rajya Sabha.'

I am to request that the concurrence of Rajya Sabha in the said motion, and also the names of the members of Rajya Sabha so nominated, may be communicated to this House."

SPECIAL MENTIONS

Incorrect Information given by a Member regarding Miss Mamta Banerjee

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Dipen Ghosh.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH (West Bengal): Madam Deputy Chairman,.....(Interruptions).....

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY (Andhra Pradesh): Madam, I would like to know about the health of Miss Mamta Banerjee.

... (Interruptions)...

डा. रत्नाकर पाण्डेय : (उत्तर प्रदेश): महोदया, मैंने शुक्रवार को... (व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have permitted Mr. Dipen Ghosh. All of you, please take your seats. I have permitted him to speak. I have allowed Mr. Dipen Ghosh to raise the matter about Miss Mamta Banerjee.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Madam Deputy Chairman...(Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The Chairman has permitted him and I am allowing him to speak. Mr. Dipen Ghosh has written letters to the Chairman and to me and I am allowing him to speak.

नहीं, आप बैठ जाइये। ऐसे खड़े होने की बात हाऊस में मत करिये। आप बैठ जाइये।

डा. रत्नाकर पाण्डेय : मैडम, ... (व्यवधान) ...

उपसभापति : नहीं, आप बैठ जाइये। मैंने आपको समझा दिया है। आप बैठ जाइये।

....(Interruptions)....

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Madam... (Interruptions)....

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : It is all right, but let him say what he wants to say..(Interruptions)... Let Mr. Dipen Ghosh say what he wants to say. I will permit you.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: On 17th August around 5.15 P.M. when the Minister of State for External Affairs, Mr. Hari Kishore Singh, was to make a statement on the condition of Indians in Kuwait, my learned colleague, Mr. Ratnakar Pandey, suddenly rose and said that Miss Mamta Banerjee, an ex-Member of Lok Sabha, succumbed to the injuries she had sustained on the previous day in Calcutta in a clash between pro and anti-banch elements. And he Condemned the Left-Front Government of West Bengal; he wanted an outright condemnation of the Government there from the House. He wanted the House to pass a condolence resolution and be adjourned. The Vice-Chairman...

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN (Tamil Nadu) : They tried to kill her.

डा. रत्नाकर पाण्डेय : यह बिल्कुल सत्य है... (व्यवधान)

उपसभापति : मैंने आप को बोलने की अनुमति... (व्यवधान)

... (Interruptions) ...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will permit you to speak. Please take your seat.

उपसभापति : जो तरीका आप कर रहे हैं, वह गलत है।... (व्यवधान)
यह तरीका आप मत करिये।

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Madam, I quote from the official proceedings of the Rajya Sabha what Dr. Ratnakar Pandey had himself stated...

(Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please take your seat. I will permit you. The Chairman has given permission to Mr. Dipen Ghosh and I have permitted to him to speak... (Interruptions)... No, it does not matter. That day also, the House was misled and then it was adjourned.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: I will quote from the official proceedings of the Rajya Sabha what Dr. Ratnakar Pandey had stated in Hindi:

"माननीय उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, बड़े दुःख के साथ मैं इस सदन को सूचना देना चाहता हूँ कि हमारे दूसरे सदन की साथी श्रीमती ममता बनर्जी का आज दिन में डेढ़ बजे कलकत्ता में निधन हो गया है।... कलकत्ता से मेरे पास सूचना आई; दिन में डेढ़ बजे श्रीमती ममता बनर्जी का निधन हो गया है इसके लिये हम लोग शोक प्रकट करते हैं। वैंस्ट बंगाल सी पी एम० की जो सरकार है उसने बुरी तरह से उनको मारा है। यह हमारे दल की एक मुखर साथी थीं और उच्च कोटि की वक्ता थी। उन पर इतना बुल एटैक किया

गया कि उनका निधन हो गया। इसके प्रति हम सदन में शोक प्रकट करना चाहते हैं।"

फिर श्रीमती, मैं पढ़ना नहीं चाहता हूँ।

Madam Deputy Chairman, the Vice-Chairman in the Chair at that time immediately advised the senior. Cabinet Minister, Mr. Murasoli, Maran, who was present in the House, to get the news confirmed and he asked the Minister of External Affairs to make his statement and the Members to seek their clarifications in the meantime. Mr. Pandey and some of his colleagues did not allow the Vice-Chairman to conduct the House accordingly. They were insisting on condemnation of the Left Front Government of West Bengal and on adjourning the House after passing a condolence resolution....

SOME HON. MEMBERS : No, no.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : I can quote. But I do not want to take the time of the House. I have got a copy of the official proceedings and it does not speak well for you. It is on record. I am not quoting.

Madam, the Vice-Chairman in the Chair at that time had no alternative but to announce adjournment of the House after advising the Minister to collect the information. Immediately thereafter we got information that the Minister of Parliamentary Affairs, Mr. P. Upendra, had contacted the Chief Minister of West Bengal and got information that Miss Banerjee was hale and hearty...

SHRI SURESH KALMADI (Maharashtra) : Not hale and hearty. She had 13 stitches in the head. And you call it 'hale and hearty'!

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Whatever the Minister said, he is repeating it. Those are not his words.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : I am only repeating what he said. I

personally contacted my Calcutta office and they also informed me the same news. Madam Deputy Chairman, having heard this information from the House, you yourself had contacted Calcutta and you got the information that Miss Mamta Banerjee was very much alive and kicking....*(Interruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : No, no, Mr. Dipen Ghosh. You restrict yourself. I did not come to the House....

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : I have only used the English phrase....

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : No. I did not come to the House and announce it. I got the information; I was told that the House was concerned. When I was told that such a news had come to the House, I telephoned and found out and informed Mr. Ratnakar Pandey that she was alive and that the news was wrong.

THE LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER) : Madam, the word he used is not in good taste.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I did not use any word like that. *(Interruptions)* I do not know what he is saying. Please sit down. I did not tell him....

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER : We are only bringing to your notice that the word 'kicking' is not in good taste.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I will look into the record.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : I am sorry, this is an English phrase, "alive and kicking". It does not mean that she is kicking. Madam, you know better than anybody else the meaning of that word in English...

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA (Bihar) : He should withdraw that word.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : No, no; no withdrawal. I will look into the record. If there is anything unparliamentary. I will remove that.

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA : He should withdraw that word.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN : Madam, that word should not be used....*(Interruptions)*....

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA : He should withdraw that word....*(Interruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : All of you, take your seats. I will take my own decision....*(Interruptions)*....

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA : Madam, he should withdraw that word or you should expunge it from the records....*(Interruptions)*

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN : It should not be allowed to go on record....*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA : It should not be allowed....*(Interruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I will look into the records and see what is right and what is wrong. I will judge it....*(Interruptions)*.... You please sit down....*(Interruptions)*.... I have said that I would look into the records. So, you please sit down....*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA : Madam, he has used that word and that should not go on record....*(Interruptions)*....

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : All of you, please sit down....*(Interruptions)*.... Let Mr. Dipen

[The Deputy Chairman]

Ghosh speak....(Interruptions)

Please sit down....(Interruptions)

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : Ma-
dam, you will kindly appreciate...
(Interruptions)...

डा० रत्नाकर पाण्डेय : मैडम, कम्प्यु-
निस्ट कामरेडों ने... (व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :
I have said that nothing will go on
record....(Interruptions)....Nothing
of what Mr. Ahluwalia says or what
anybody else says without my per-
mission will go on record....
(Interruptions)....There should be
some order in the House....
(Interruptions)....I have said that I
would go into the records....
(Interruptions)....I am giving my
ruling now. I will go into the re-
cords. This is my ruling....
(Interruptions)....Let Mr. Dipen
Ghosh speak.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : Ma-
dam, I do not support those who
engineered an attack on Mrs Mamata
Banerjee. I condemn the attack,
the physical attack, on Miss Mamata
Banerjee....(Interruptions)

Madam, you will kindly appre-
ciate that this attempt on the part of
an honourable Member of Parliam-
ent to mislead the House by con-
veying an unfounded news is repre-
hensible....(Interruptions)....It is
reprehensible....(Interruptions)....
Madam, I consider it to be a serious
misdemeanour on the part of a Mem-
ber of Parliament....(Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :
Please allow him to speak....
(Interruptions)

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : to use
the floor of Parliament to trade an
unfounded charge against the duly
elected Government of a State....
(Interruptions)....Madam, Parliam-
ent is an august body and it has
its own honour and if a Member
tries to take advantage of his im-
munity in speaking on the floor of

Parliament and if he tries to utilise
the floor of Parliament to trade
charges against a State Government
which cannot be defended by that
Government here in Parliament..

SHRI SURESH KALMADI :
You are here to defend.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : On
an unfounded news, it is a mis-
demeanour on the part of a Member
of Parliament. And, Madam, this
is not the first time. You may
kindly recollect that some days ago,
when there was a complaint from the
other side It was I who, after you
allowed me to speak said that there
was a limit to the cock-and-bull
stories being related on the floor of
the Rajya Sabha and, Madam, on
the 17th August, they crossed that
limit also. He said something
based on an unfounded information
about the death of a member, of a
leader, of their own party ; Madam,
I belong to a party and other leaders
also belong to their respective par-
ties. I appeal to Mr. Shiv Shanker,
the Leader of the Opposition. Did
this speak well of his party ? ..
(Interruptions)....Did this speak
well of his party ?....(Interruptions)
....Did it not bring shame on his
party ?....(Interruptions)....Did
it not cause damage to the credi-
bility of his party?....(Interrup-
tions)....

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER :
Madam It is not his business to
talk about Congrss (I) Party....
(Interruptions)....If somebldy says
something, how can be condemn the
whole party ?....(Interruptions)..
You cannot apply it to the whole
party....(Interruptions)

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : Just
wait for a minute....(Interruptions)

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER :
Madam, how can talk about the
whole party....(Interruptions)....
We were not a party to that....
(Interruptions)....

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Mr. Ghosh, you do not talk about everyoffe, but you tak about the concerned person only....(Interruptions), but you talk about the concerned person only....(Interruptions)....

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : O. K. (Interruptions)....

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : He should not talk about the party. (Interruptions)....

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : I am glad that the Congress (I) Party delinks itself from the reprehensibles act committed by Dr. Ratnakar Pandey on 17th Mugust. I would request you to seek sn apology from Dr. Ratnakar Pandey for misleading the House. It is a question of privilege of the House. He has deliberately misled th House. Let him apologise on the floor of the House. Thank you.

(Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : He is doing it. Dr. Ratnakar Pandey, do you want to say something ?

डा० रत्नाकर पाण्डेय : माननीय उप-सभापति जी, जब माननीय दीपेन घोष जी बोल रहे थे तो आपके आदेश से मैंने न तो कोई इंटरप्शन किया और न कोई रिएक्शन दिया। अब मुझे... (व्यवधान)...

Don't teach me. The Deputy Chair- man is here. I do not want you teaching.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I feel it was not only Dr. Ratnakar Pandey. There ware six other Mem- bers who also spoke. While that lady was alive, all these Members spoke on the basis of wrong informa- tion. We wish her long life. It was a mistake. Dr. Ratnakar Pandey, whatever you want to say, you can say. (Interruptions) Please have

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी (मध्य प्रदेश) : महोदया, क्या आज भी मेंबरों को बोलने का मौका मिलेगा ?

उपसभापति : हां, मैं आपको बोलने दूंगी। क्योंकि उनसे माफी मंगवा रही हूं, इसलिये मैंने उनको कहा, उनका मेटर था। मैं आपको एलाउ करूंगी।

डा. रत्नाकर पाण्डेय : महोदया, दीपेन घोष जी ने जो कुछ कहा है, उसमें पूरा नहीं पढ़ा है। इसी सदन में मैंने कहा था कि सरकार बताये कि यह खबर सही है या गलत है ? मेरे पास... (व्यवधान)

Please don't interrupt me, Mr. Dipen Ghosh.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : Ma- dam. he is telling untruth. Shall I quote the proceedings ?

(Interruptions)

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY (Po. dicherry) : Why is he not allow ing him to speak ?

डा० रत्नाकर पाण्डेय : माननीय उप-सभापति जी, मैंने सद. में यह सूचना, जो कुछ पढ़ा, जो मुझे टेलीफोन से मिली, वह मैंने सदन को दी और उसके बाद हमने और हमारे दल के माननीय सदस्यों ने सरकार से पूछा सभापति के माध्यम से, कि भगवान करे यह खबर झूठी हो, सदन को सूचित करो कि सच क्या है और बीस मिनट तक यह *सरकार (व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Don't use these words. I won't permit it. You give your apology and sit down. No debate on it. I am not allowing any d bate on it. I warn you. You just apologise if you want to apologise. Otherwise I willl ask someone else. Don't throw more fire into an already anarchic situation. I am not permitting it.

[The Deputy Chairman]

आप मांफी मांग रहे हैं या नहीं मांग रहे ?

डा. रत्नाकर पाण्डेय : मैडम, मेरे ऊपर आरोप लगाया गया है ...

उपसभापति : नहीं, नहीं, आप भाषण न करें।

डा० रत्नाकर पाण्डेय : मैडम, मेरे ऊपर आरोप लगाया गया है। दुर्भाग्य से, सौभाग्य से आप उस समय चेयर पर नहीं थीं, इसलिये उस बारे में जान लें, ते-तीन सेंटेस में कहूंगा।

उपसभापति : आपको गलत इत्तला मिली थी। आप कह दीजिये—गलती हो गई।

डा. रत्नाकर पाण्डेय : मैडम, मेरे पास टेलीफोन आया था। यह भी सत्य है कि पूरे कलकत्ता में शेयर बाजार से लेकर चारों तरफ पांच बजे तक यह शोर था कि ममता बनर्जी मर गई है और इस पर यह खबर आई, लेकिन यह सरकार...

श्री दीपेन घोष : शेयर-बाजार बन्द हो गया था। ... (व्यवधान) ...

डा० रत्नाकर पाण्डेय : मैडम, मिस्टर प्रशांतक सुद, जो इनके मंत्री हैं, उन्होंने खुद स्वीकार किया है कि ममता बनर्जी नहीं रही। और उस आधार पर मैंने सदन में सूचना दी और सरकार से पूछा कि अगर यह सत्य है, भगवान करे कि यह सत्य न हो, तो इसकी पुष्टि दीजिये और यह सरकार कोई पुष्टि नहीं दे पाई। ऐसी स्थिति में, ममता बनर्जी की आरती आपकी सरकार ने नहीं उतारी है... (व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Not beyond that....(Interruptions)

अटल जी, आप बोल रहे थे कुछ। (व्यवधान)

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : Will he be allowed to say all that ? Then I will have the right to reply.

डा० रत्नाकर पाण्डेय : उपसभापति महोदय, (व्यवधान)...

उपसभापति : बस, आपने कह दिया, बात खत्म हो गई। ... (व्यवधान)...

श्री पी. शिव शंकर : इसको बढ़ाना उचित नहीं है। ... (व्यवधान)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : He said it was a mistake. I do not know....

श्री पी. शिव शंकर : इसको बढ़ाना उचित तो नहीं है। अब आप बोलेंगे, फिर दूसरे लोग बोलेंगे। (व्यवधान)...

डा० रत्नाकर पाण्डेय : और वेस्ट बंगाल गवर्नमेंट जिस तरह से (व्यवधान) ... प्रहार कर रही है उन पर ... (व्यवधान)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Six people spoke on it. It was only Mr. Ratnakar Pandey who informed the House. There were six others who spoke on it. I got it from the record. So, I will allow Atalji to will allow Atafji to speak. (Interruptions) Mr. Jagesh Desai, will you please take your seat ?

डा० रत्नाकर पाण्डेय : उसकी हम निन्दा करते हैं और जो सही सूचना मैंने सदन को नहीं दी, उसके लिये हम सदन के समक्ष सादर खेद प्रकट करते हैं। ... (व्यवधान) ...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I am not permitting you, Mr. Narayanasamy. You please take your seat. (Interruptions)

श्री पी. शिव शंकर : बाजपेयी जी, ... (व्यवधान) ...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Mr. Narayanasamy, please take your seat. (Interruptions)

श्री पी० शिव शं : आप याद कीजिए, मोरारजी भाई भी जय प्रकाश जी के ताल्लुक से उस हाऊस में बोले थे। इसको बढ़ाना कोई उचित नहीं है। अब वह खेद प्रकट कर रहे हैं, इस मामले को खत्म कीजिए। (व्यवधान)

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : You cannot draw the corollary.

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA : If you are allowing him, you allow a debate on this issue? (Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I am not permitting you, Mr. Narayanasamy. Take your seat. Nothing will go on record.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY : **

Dr. ABRAR AHMED KHAN (Rajasthan) : **

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : It is not going on record. Please sit down. (Interruptions) Mr. Abrar Ahmed, please take your seat. (Interruptions) This is the way you people behave in the Houses and do not allow any body to speak.

आप बोलिए, अटल जी।

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी : महोदय (व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : There was a Member in this House. The matter arose about one lady who was sarrested and could not be found. I myseff went to her house. So, until and unless we ascertain that somebody is dead or alive, we should not pass such comments. This is not fair. I do not agree with it. (Interhptions) अटल जी, आप बोलिए।

I am permitting Atalji to speak. (Interruptions) If he has misled the House, I will see the record. But let Atalji speak.

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी : महोदय ... (व्यवधान) ...

**Not recorded.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I have only permitted Atal Bihari Vajpayee. No other person will go on record.

(Interruptions)

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE (Maharashtra) : Madam, I very respectfully urge upon you..

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : No, Mr. Salve. I request you. I have permirted Mr. total Bihari Vajpayee. He is a Member of this House.

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE : Kindly close this matter. It is very unfortunate..

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Many matters arose in this House and never closed in one sentence. If he wants to say something, I have to permit him. I do not know what he wants to say,

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE : After he expressed regrets..

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Doesn't matter. You listen to him, and then you might pass comments.

श्री एन०के०पी० साल्वे : बोलने से क्या फायदा होने वाला है, माफी मांग ली है। ... (व्यवधान) ...

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी : माफी नहीं मांगी है। ... (व्यवधान) ...

श्री दीपेन घोष : माफी नहीं मांगी है, माफी मांगने दो। ... (व्यवधान) ...

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी : माफी नहीं मांगी है। ... (व्यवधान) ...

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : He has not apologised. (Interruptions)

उपसभापति : बोलिए।

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी : महोदय, मैं उस दिन सदन में मौजूद था ... (व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :

Mr. Narayanasamy, please take your seat. I have allowed Mr. Vajpayee. (*Interruptions*) I am not allowing you. No. (*Interruptions*) I said 'No to you.

(*Interruptions*)

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी : महोदया मैं मामले को बढ़ाना नहीं चाहता । लेकिन मैं उस दिन सदन में मौजूद था । जो कुछ हुआ सचमुच में उसकी निंदा करने के लिये शब्द नहीं हैं । मैं उम्मीद करता था कि पाण्डेय जी से एक गलती हो गयी, बड़ी भारी गलती हो गयी... (*व्यवधान*)

श्री सुरेन्द्रजीत सिंह अहलुवालिया : और ममता बनर्जी के बारे में जो कुछ हुआ उसके बारे में... (*व्यवधान*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : No justification. (*Interruptions*) Nobody justifies any atrocities on women. (*Interruptions*)

अटल जी बोलिये, मैंने इन्हें परमिट नहीं किया है । (*Interruptions*)

There is no point in interrupting. It is not going on record. (*Interruptions*)

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी : पूरी पार्टी उस कांड पर पर्दा डालने की कोशिश कर रही है । (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Nobody justifies atrocities on any woman, Mamta Banerjee or anybody. Nobody will support. But it does not give a right to a Member to kill her when she is alive.

(*Interruptions*)

I have allowed Mr. Vajpayee. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY : Democracy is being murdered in West Bengal. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Nobody is supporting atrocities on women. Nobody in this House has ever supported atrocities on women. We are discussing it day in and day out. (*Interruptions*) Do not argue with me when I am speaking. Take your seat. (*Interruptions*) What is this ? Is it an atrocity on the House or what ? This is not the way. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : Madam you can well appreciate. If the Members of Parliament behave like this, you can imagine how their colleagues will behave in the streets of Calcutta. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER : This is very unfortunate. Mr. Dipen Ghosh, the way you speak. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : You cannot control your men here. (*Interruptions*)

How can your men in West Bengal be controlled ? (*Interruptions*)

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER : This is an irresponsible way of speaking.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : They are indulging in anti-social activities. They are burning trams and buses. (*Interruptions*)

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी : महोदया, माफी नहीं क्यों माँग सकते, माफी मांगने के लिये भी बड़प्पन चाहिये । और मैं आशा करता था कि विरोधी दल के नेता इस बारे में कुछ कहेंगे । भविष्य में ऐसा मामला दोहराया न जाये । इसके बारे में सभी दलों के सदस्यों... (*व्यवधान*)

श्री पी० शिव शंकर : मैंने स्पष्ट रूप से कहा कि वह खड़े रहे हैं क्षमा मांगने के लिये... (व्यवधान)... उनको क्षमा मांगने के लिए हमने... (व्यवधान)...

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी : अपनी पार्टी के नेता के नाते आपको कुछ कहना नहीं है क्या... (व्यवधान) और भी मेंबर्स थे। मामले का राजनीतिक लाभ उठाना चाहते हैं।

श्री पी० शिव शंकर : मैंने खेद भी प्रगट किया और... (व्यवधान) दोनों बातें मैंने कही है... (व्यवधान)

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी : पार्टी के सारे मामले को अपने से अलग करना चाहते हैं। क्यों क्या यह पार्टी का मामला नहीं है।

श्री पी० शिव शंकर : आप राजनीतिक रूप देना चापते हैं।

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी : नहीं देना चाहते हैं।

श्री पी० शिव शंकर : आप राजनीतिक रूप देना चाहते हैं और तो कोई है नहीं।

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी : राजनीतिक रूप तो उस दिन आप लोगों ने दिया... (व्यवधान)

श्री पी० शिव शंकर : हम खुद इसका खंडन करते हैं... (व्यवधान)

श्री हंस राज भारद्वाज (मध्य प्रदेश) : क्यों मारा, किसलिए मारा... (व्यवधान) एक महिला को इस तरह से मारने का क्या हक है... (व्यवधान)

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER : We condemn it outright. That was a very wrong statement. (Interruptions)

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE : This is very unfortunate. This should not

have happened. We should not have lowered the dignity of the House.

उपसभापति : अगर रत्नाकर जी खेद के बजाय यह कहते कि मुझ से गलती हुई... (व्यवधान) खेद तो माफी नहीं। अगर वह यह कहते कि मैं अपोलोजाइज करता हूँ तो कुछ नुकसान नहीं था।

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE : Madam, we apologise for what has happened. He has expressed regret. Kindly put an end to this matter, for God's sake.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I wish everybody supported me to end the matter. (Interruptions).

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE : How can there be a debate on this ? can there be a debate on this ? (Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I cannot hear you because three people are speaking at a time. When I say something nobody wants to hear and you say that I should restore order in the House. I said that the other day not only Mr. Ratnakar Pandey but on the false information which he gave 6 other people spoke. If Mr. Atal Bihari Vajpayee says a word... (Interruptions). I have gone through the record. You please go through the record and see. If other people also said that this was wrong and it should not have happened, let Mr. Atal Bihari Vajpayee also say a word. Heavens will not fall if he says something. (Interruptions). What is the harm ? He is a Member of this House. He has a right to say something. He was present in the House. (Interruptions). This is the way they argue with the Chair and I am trying to restore order. (Interruptions). Mr. Salve, I will permit you. Let him speak. I give my word, I will permit you. Let Mr. Atal

[The Deputy Chairman]

Bihari Vajpayee complete his sentence, I will permit you. I have always stood by my commitment. Let him say something. (*Interruptions*). How can you stop the Member from speaking? Every day we discuss atrocities on women. Let him also say something. Why do you object?

श्री हंसराज भारद्वाज : अटल का महिलाओं के प्रति... (व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Please do not say that. Don't say about anybody.

SHRI HANSRAJ BHARDWAJ : What are you saying? You seem to be very much concerned about.... (*Interruptions*).

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA (Bihar) : You are casting aspersions on the Chair. Mr. Bhardwaj, you have to maintain decorum in this House. You cannot charge the Chair, you are casting aspersions.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : The House is being taken to ransom. I want everything said against the Chair to go on record. Let everybody know, let it be on record. Whatever anybody says against the Chair, let it go on record. Let the people know.

SHRI HANSRAJ BHARDWAJ : She does not need your protection.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA : But you need my advice. I have to discipline you.

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी : महोदया, मुझे अपने बारे में चिंता हो रही और मैं आपसे आश्वासन चाहता हूँ। मैं इस सदन का वर्तमान सदस्य हूँ। कुमारी ममता बनर्जी इस समय किसी सदन की सदस्य नहीं हैं। वह भूतपूर्व संसद सदस्य हैं। वह जीवित हैं, किंतु उन्हें मार दिया गया। फिर भी अगर

किसी के मरने की सूचना दी जाए तो जो व्यक्ति जीवित है उसके प्रति क्या हमारी जिम्मेदारी नहीं है... (व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Please take your seat.

कुमारी सईदा खातून (मध्य प्रदेश) : जय प्रकाश नारायण जी के मामले में... (व्यवधान)

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी : यह जो कुछ हुआ, उसको ठीक ठहरा रहे हैं। इनको इसका खेद नहीं। मुझे इसी बात की चिंता है।

श्री एन० के० पी० साल्वे : आप हमारी नीयत में खोट मत देखिए। गलती हुई है, यह हम मानते हैं। जैसी आपकी गलती हुई थी वैसी इन की गलती हुई है।

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी : महोदया, मुझे डर है कि कल कहीं मेरे बारे में गलती न हो जाए... (व्यवधान)... कहीं ऐसा न हो कि मैं जीवित रहूँ और सदन में कह दिया जाए कि मैं मर गया हूँ और मेरे मरण पर शोक प्रस्ताव पेश करने की तैयारी हो जाए...

श्री एन० के० पी० साल्वे : अटल जी, यह गलत बात है... (व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Order, order. I have not allowed you. I have not permitted.... I have allowed him. Let him finish. (*Interruptions*).

श्री एन० के० पी० साल्वे : यह गलत बात है, ऐसा नहीं है... (व्यवधान)

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी : महोदया अगर पाण्डेय जी को कोई सूचना मिली थी तो वे सचिवालय को कह सकते थे, पूछ सकते थे, मगर एक महिला की मौत को मुद्दा बनाया जाए, यह उचित नहीं है... (व्यवधान)

महोदया, उनके ऊपर जो लाठी प्रहार हुआ है, उसकी अलग से चर्चा हो सकती

है। आप उसकी निन्दा करना चाहते हैं, करिए, हम भी उस में साथ दे सकते हैं, लेकिन यह मरने की बात कैसे आई ? ... (व्यवधान)

माफ करिए, आप ने जो कुछ कहा था, वह बहुत गंभीर था। महोदया, यह एक मैबर का मामला नहीं है। इसलिए मुझे अफसोस है। मैं उम्मीद करता था कि लीडर आफ अपोजिशन खेद व्यक्त करेंगे, लेकिन इन्होंने एक वाक्य भी नहीं कहा... (व्यवधान) ...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Have some respect.

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE : Madam, give me half a minute. I will take half a minute. What had happened was on account of sheer inadvertance and was bona fide.... Bonafide inadvertance should not be sought to be politicised.... What has happened is most unfortunate....

उन्होंने माफी मांग ली है, खेद व्यक्त किया है... (व्यवधान) ...

He said, "I express my regret".

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Did he apologise ? Where did he apologise ?

कहां माफी मांगी है ? कहिए कि माफी मांगना है... (व्यवधान)

डा० रत्नाकर पाण्डेय : मैंने सूचना जो दी थी उसमें जो त्रुटि हुई है, उसके लिए मैं पूरी तरह से खेद प्रकट करता हूँ... (व्यवधान)

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE : What he has said is enough. That is an apology. "I express regret" is an apology. Madam, I submit that it must be clearly understood. Mr. Vajpayee is a very hon'ble Member of this House and he must know that you do not impute motives to Dr. Ratnakar Pandey. I want to ask a simple question : Do we,

Madam, want our esteemed and beloved leader, a colleague in Calcutta, to be subjected to this kind of rumour ? Not at all. We would never want to do that....

THE MINISTER OF FINANCE (PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE) : Madam, he has gracefully expressed his regrets. Please end the matter.

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE : That is the end of the matter, I agree. He has expressed regret. That is the end of the matter. Thank you, Madhu.

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE : He has gracefully expressed regret. End the matter and let us go over to the next item.

डा० रत्नाकर पाण्डेय : महोदया, ... *

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : That will not go on record.

पांडे जी, अगर जिन्दगी में कोई गलती होती है तो उस पर टिप्पणी मत कीजिए, इसको रद्द किए मत।

Otherwise I will ask Mr. Baby..

प्रो० मधु दण्डवते : उन्होंने रिप्रेट एक्सप्रेस किया है, अब उसको खत्म कीजिए... (व्यवधान)

SHRI M. A. BABY (Kerala) : Regarding bonafide. Mr. Salve has mentioned and I do not want to question his bona fides, but I would like to know from hon. Pandeyji, after having made the statement here and after having the House adjourned—I will take his word as correct. I want to know whether he has tried to know from some journalists whether the fact is correct or not. If he has made such inquiries with the press, then, without cross-checking that he has raised the issue in the House. Then one has to

[Shri M. A. Baby]

suspect his *bona fides*. This I would like to get clarified by Pandeyji. ... (Interruptions)...

उपसभापति : पाण्डेय जी क्या जनें लिस्ट से पूछा था ? ... (व्यवधान)
पांडे जी आप कुछ कहना चाहते हैं... (व्यवधान) Mr. Pandey, wants to say something.

श्री ईश दत्त यादव (उत्तर प्रदेश) : मेरा दूसरा प्वाइंट है... (व्यवधान)

उपसभापति : यह दूसरे पांडे जी हैं कुछ कहना चाहते हैं । ... (व्यवधान)

श्री विशम्भर नाथ पाण्डे (नाम निर्देशित) : मैडम, मैं इस सदन को आपके माध्यम से याद दिलाना चाहता हूं कि सन् 1978 या उसके आसपास जब मैं इस सदन का सदस्य था तो यह सदन एडजार्न हुआ था एक बड़ी सूचना के आधार पर । प्रधान मंत्री जी ने... (व्यवधान)

उपसभापति : अगर गुस्ताखी न हो तो मैं आपको रिमाइन्ड करूं कि लोक सभा डजार्न हुई थी, राज्य सभा एडजार्न नहीं की थी । इस सिलसिले में ममता बनर्जी इस सदन की सदस्य कभी रही हैं । एक बात मैं रूल की बता रही हूं । ... (व्यवधान)

श्री विशम्भर नाथ पांडे : मेरी बात सुन लीजिए... (व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Just a minute. Not Jayaprakash Narayan. That is not the matter. That is closed. Don't talk wrong facts. गलत बातें रिकार्ड में मत लाइये । लोक सभा एडजार्न हुई थी उनको याद नहीं होगा । (व्यवधान)

श्री विशम्भर नाथ पांडे : मैं इस सदन का मैम्बर था । (व्यवधान) जय-प्रकाश नारायण जी बहुत बीमार थे और

श्री मोरारजी देसाई जो उस समय प्रधान मंत्री थे उनकी सूचना के आधार पर इस सदन ने प्रस्ताव पास किया था उनकी मृत्यु के बारे में । ऐसी गलती हो सकती है । अगर पाण्डेय जी को गलत सूचना मिली तो उनको स्वीकार कर लेना चाहिए (व्यवधान) उनको मान लेना चाहिए कि उनकी सूचना गलत थी । ईश्वर करे ज्यादा उम्र हो ममता बनर्जी की । यह गलतियां हो सकती हैं इसलिए ऐसी गलतियां अगर साबित हो जाएं ... (व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Now Mr. Suresh Pachouri. (Interruptions).... I have called Mr. Suresh Pachouri.

डा. अबरार अहमद खान : मैडम... (व्यवधान)

श्री ईश दत्त यादव : मेरा दूसरा विषय है... (व्यवधान)

डा० रत्नाकर पाण्डेय : हमारे सदन के एक माननीय सदस्य श्री बलराम सिंह यादव... (व्यवधान)... को उत्तर प्रदेश की सरकार ने जिस तरह से... (व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : No, no, I am not allowing you. I am allowing Mr. Suresh Pachouri. Special Mentions. ... (Interruptions)...

डा० रत्नाकर पाण्डेय : बुरी तरह से पीटा गया ... (व्यवधान) यह देखिये ... (व्यवधान)

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : This is the stand of the honourable Member... (Interruptions)... It cannot be brought here.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : No, it is not permitted in the House.

हाउस मैं नहीं दिखायेंगे... (व्यवधान)

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : Point of order. He should be named. ... (Interruptions)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :
Mr. Pandey, please take it away.
...(Interruptions)... Mr. Pandey,
take it away. You cannot bring it ;
take it away...(Interruptions)...
I say, take it away...(Interrup-
tions)... I adjourn the House of
10 minutes.

The House then adjourned at
forty-five minutes past twelve
of the clock.

—
The House reassembled at one
of the clock, The Deputy Chairman
in the Chair.

Alleged Censoring of Doordarshan's "Khula Manch" Programme

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :
I hope now there will be peace.
So, I can call Shri Suresh Pachouri.
He is not here. Yes, Mr. Salve.

**SHRI N. K. P. SALVE (Maha-
rashtra) :** Madam, I crave your in-
dulgence to refer to a matter in which
this Government has indulged in a
most shameless operation of stalism
in censoring a very important item
on the Doordarshan's "Khula
Manch". "Khula Manch" in Eng-
lish means 'open platform'. Among-
st others, *Indian Express* has this to
say. I will just read two lines and I
am done.

"The Minister was critical of both
the Pepsi deal and the Maruti-
Suzuki collaboration and not parti-
cularly supportive of the industrial
policy, recently announced by the
Government."

Questions were allowed to the
participants to be put to the Railway
Minister. The Railway Minister
answered those questions. There-
after those questions which were
inconvenient to this Government
were censored. This Government
which swears day in and day out, in
season and out of season, by its
avowed commitment of running an
open Government censors this kind

of a thing. I don't think much of
the "Khula Manch" business. As it is
a very shameful performance, but
at least there must be a modicum of
honesty. A Minister whom you
are putting there to eulogise the Go-
vernment performance if he chooses
to criticise, let it come openly. It
is no longer a secret that their's is
not a cohesive Cabinet at all. 'Each
one unto himself they work'. But what
is worse is that they are resorting to
censoring of a programme
which is called as "Khula Manch".
It is now absolutely clear that this
Government is not only not worth
its salt, is not only going back on the
promises it has given, but is also
indulging in a very heinous act. It
is indulging in an act of virtual trea-
chery to the nation. That is what I
charge. (Interruptions) Yes, trea-
chery in the sense that they are not
being true to what they have promis-
ed. Therefore, I would like to know
from the Minister of Information and
Broadcasting as to who ordered the
censoring. I would also like to
know whether or not they are going
to show that part which has been
censored. If they don't do so, the
credibility of this Government
which is already at a very low ebb,
will completefy evaporate.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY
(Andhra Pradesh) : Madam, let Mr.
Salve not bother about the credibi-
lity of the Government (Interrup-
tions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :
He has asked for it.

**SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWA-
MY (Uttar Pradesh) :** Madam, he is
not a Minister.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :
He is a Member. He is answering
for himself.

**SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NAT-
ARAJAN (Tamil Nadu) :** What
Mr. Fernandes has said is that he
will not allow the Industrial policy
to be passed.