

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :  
Mr. Pandey, please take it away. ...  
(Interruptions)... Mr. Pandey, take  
it away. You cannot bring it ; take  
it away... (Interruptions)... I say,  
take it away...(Interruptions)... I  
adjourn the House of 10 minutes.

The House then adjourned at forty-five minutes past twelve of the clock.

The House reassembled at one of the clock. The Deputy Chairman in the Chair.

### **Alleged Censoring of Doordarshan's "Khula Manch" Programme**

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :  
I hope now the re will be peace.  
So, I can call Shri Suresh Pachouri.  
He is not here. Yes, Mr. Salve.

SHRI N. K; P. SALVE (Maharashtra) : Madam, I crave your indulgence to refer to a matter in which this Government has indulged in a most shameless operation of sialism in censoring a very important item on the Doordarshan's "Khula Manch". "Khula Manch" in English means 'open platform'. Amongst others, *Indian Express* has this to say. I will just read two lines and I am done.

"The Minister was critical of both the Pepsi deal and the Maruti-Suzuki collaboration and not particularly supportive of the industrial policy, recently announced by the Government."

Questions were allowed to the participants to be put to the Railway Minister. The Railway Minister answered those questions. Thereafter those questions which were inconvenient to this Government were censored. This Government which swears day in and day out, in season and out of season, by its avowed commitment of running an open Government censors this kind

of a thing. I don't think much of the "Khula Manch" business. As it is a very shameful performance, but at least there must be a modicum of honesty. A Minister whom you are putting there to eulogise the Government performance if he chooses to criticise, let it come openly. It is no longer a secret that their's is not a cohesive Cabinet at all. 'Each one unto himself they work'. But what is worse is that they are resorting to censoring of a programme which is called as "Khula Manch". It is now absolutely clear that this Government is not only not worth its salt, is not only going back on the promises it has given, but is also indulging in a very heinous act. It is indulging in an act of virtual treachery to the nation. That is what I charge. (Interruptions) Yes, treachery in the sense that they are not being true to what they have promised. Therefore, I would like to know from the Minister of Information and Broadcasting as to who ordered the censoring. I would also like to know whether or not they are going to show that part which has been censored. If they don't do so, the credibility of this Government which is already at a very low ebb, will completely evaporate.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY (Andhra Pradesh) : Madam, let Mr. Salve not bother about the credibility of the Government (Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :  
He has asked for it.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY (Uttar Pradesh) : Madam, he is not a Minister.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :  
He is a Member. He is answering for himself.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN (Tamil Nadu) : What Mr. Fernandes has said is that he will not allow the Industrial policy to be passed.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY:  
Let Mr. Salve not bother about the credibility of the Government. Let him bother about the credibility of his party which is getting more and more eroded.

Now, coming to his question, we all know that "Khula Manch" is a forum where the Ministers answer questions in regard to their Ministry.

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE: Madam, where does he get authority from? Then why were questions allowed?

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: Then why did the Minister answer those questions? He should have kept quiet.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:  
Mr. Salve, let him have his say. There is no harm. If you have made your point, let him make his point. *(Interruptions)* It is his observation, his knowledge, his perception. Whatever you may call it, but let him speak.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY:  
I am rather surprised that a senior Member as Mr. Salve does not have the patience to hear another Member.

I saw the "Khula Manch" when Prof. Dandavate answered questions in regard to the Finance Ministry. All the questions related to the Finance Ministry. Therefore, assuming that the "Khula Manch" is meant for questions to be put in regard to the concerned ministry..

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: He was in charge of the Jammu and Kashmir Affairs.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: Than don't keep it as "Khula Manch.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY :  
What is this? You should no interrupt me. .

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:  
Please let him have his say.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: Mr. Fernandes was Minister of Jammu and Kashmir Affairs some time back, not on the day when he appeared on the "Khula Manch."

SHRI M.M. JACOB (Kerala):  
So, is he not permitted to speak now?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:  
Mr. Jacob, please don't interrupt. Otherwise I will close this discussion. I would not permit anybody to interrupt. This is not the way. *(Interruptions)* There is not going to be a debate on "Khula Manch" here. Please take your seat.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: If an individual Member has a right to say something, I too have a right to speak something. He is speaking on behalf of the Government.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:  
It does not matter.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: But we want to know what is the official stand.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:  
Please take your seat. It is entirely up to the Chair to identify or not to identify.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: I am assisting the Chair in this matter.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:  
Please don't assist. Thank you very much.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: I don't even know if the facts referred to by Mr. Salve are correct.

I assume them to be correct because I don't think he would be held responsible as other Members belonging to the "Khula Manch" will be held. Assuming all these facts to be correct, let me state last night Mr. George Fernandes, Minister for Railways, faced very hostile questions. And it is a tribute to the openness of the Government that the Minister was asked inconvenient questions in regard to the Railway Ministry.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: This is a 'bogus' Manch.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: I must say in relation to the "Khula Manch" that the Minister for Railways was more effectively grilled than they could do so here in this House.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, Shri Suresh Pachouri.

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE: Half a second, Madam.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No further questions, Mr. Salve, please. I have got 15 Special Mentions. (*Interruptions*) I will say this to the Members that whatever Special Mentions can be finished by 1.30 p.m., I will finish them and then the rest will be taken up after the Legislative business at 5.30 p.m.

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE: Five seconds, Madam.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Madam, I may also be allowed.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Not all of them. We cannot take the time of the House for zero hour and Special Mentions and not do any business. It is not possible.

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE: If what the hon. Member has said has any merit in it, he should have realised that Mr. George Fernandes himself

should have declined to answer questions which he was not supposed to answer. (*Interruptions*) Do I take it as a joint responsibility or not? Their Cabinet functions under the principle of joint responsibility. Do we know that in their Government Ministers are prohibited from publicly answering questions which do not relate to their Ministry? This is how they are going to work.

श्री ईश दत्त यादव (उत्तर प्रदेश): आपने मुझे एक मिनट का समय देने के लिए कहा था ।

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: You may know the rules, Mr. Salve\*

डा० अबरार अहमद खान (राजस्थान):\*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It is not being recorded. I say, have some order in the house. It is not going to be recorded.

डा० अबरार अहमद खान :\*

उपसभापति : रिकार्ड पर नहीं जा रहा है । . . . (व्यवधान) जब समय आयेगा तब बोलिये ।

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Madam, allow me on "Khula Manch".

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: "Khula Manch" is closed now. I have permitted him. (*Interruptions*) Mr. Abrar Ahmed, you are speaking without my permission. Please don't disturb the House and take your seat. (*Interruptions*) Don't argue with the chair. You should know about your right. Sit down, don't get excited for the things which are not there.

डा० अबरार अहमद खान :\*

उपसभापति : रिकार्ड पर नहीं जा रहा है, बेकार तकलीफ उठा रहे हैं । अगर उचित

\*Not recorded.

[उपसभापति]

समय पर महत्वपूर्ण बात उठायेगे तो यकीनन रिकार्ड पर जायेगा। आप क्या समझते हैं कि दूसरे लोग महत्वपूर्ण बात नहीं उठाते, आप ही उठाने लायक हैं। . . . (व्यवधान) . . . रिकार्ड पर नहीं जा रहा है, आप बैठ जाइये।

श्री ईश दत्त यादव : मैं निवेदन कर रहा था कि दो वर्ष से कुछ अधिक समय हो गया . . . (व्यवधान) . . .

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:  
When the Minister was going to answer the House was adjourned. That is the problem.

श्री ईश दत्त यादव : लगभग दो वर्ष से अधिक समय हो गया है (व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:  
You people did not want to discuss it. . . {Interruptions}.. You never wanted to discuss it. Sit down.

डा० अब्रार अहमद खान :\*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:  
Mr. Abrar Ahmed, your Member wanted the House to be adjourned and did not hear about Kuwait. Sit down. Nothing should go on record.. {Interruptions}.. Now you come and say that you want to discuss it. You should have discussed it on Friday.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH (West Bengal): He himself wanted the House to be adjourned. Now he is raising that matter. He did not want to hear the Minister.

उपसभापति : अगर देश को खतरा है तो आपको यह फ्राइडे को भी सोचना चाहिये था। आपने फ्राइडे को क्यों नहीं सोचा कि देश को खतरा है फ्राइडे को खतरा नहीं था क्या? फ्राइडे को लोगों की जानों को खतरा नहीं था? तब आप क्यों नहीं बोले, क्यों हाऊस को एडजोर्न होने दिया?

\*Not recorded.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: I am on a point of order.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:  
Mr. Ish Dutt Yadav is already on his legs. . . {Interruptions}.. Unfortunately your people did not want to discuss it. It is all right. We will discuss it when it comes.

श्री ईश दत्त यादव :माननीय उपसभापति महोदया, (व्यवधान)

SHRI S. B. CHAVAN (Maharashtra): The kind of statement which the hon. Deputy Chairman has made is not correct. You said we never wanted to discuss it. Probably under different circumstances the House was adjourned. So to say that we were not interested in discussing it is not correct.. . {Interruptions}..

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:  
Please sit down. There was no *namaz* in the evening. When the Minister laid the statement on the Table of the House, the Members should have waited to seek clarifications. If they are so concerned about our Indians in Kuwait or Iraq or anywhere in the world, I am also equally concerned about them. But this is the way they behave. You are a senior Member. You just look at it. I leave it for the House to see. Every Member should see what is happening in the House.

श्री एस बी० चव्हाण : उस स्टेटमेंट के बारे में यह कहना कि हम इंटरस्टेड नहीं थे, यह ठीक नहीं है।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :  
Mr. Chavan, it is very easy to pass comments on me. You don't understand how every Member speaks here. If you pass comments even on one day on the behaviour of the Members also, I will be very thankful, I will be very, very happy. You tell them at least on one day not to behave like this and argue

with the Chair. I am not agitated or worried because I am here to do my job to the best of my ability. If members function well, it is fine and if they don't function well, it is okay.

**श्री ईश दत्त यादव :** मैं यह निवेदन कर रहा था कि मुझे लगभग दो वर्षों से इस माननीय सदन का सदस्य होने का सौभाग्य प्राप्त है और उस समय नेता-विपक्ष, माननीय पी० शिवशंकर जी जब इधर बैठते थे और अब जब उधर बैठ रहे हैं (व्यवधान)

**डा० अब्दुल अहमद खान :** यह सब बातें तो रिकार्ड में आ रही हैं (व्यवधान)

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** It is for me to decide. I have permitted him.

रिकार्ड में आ रही हैं।

**श्री ईश दत्त यादव :** मैं श्री पी० शिवशंकर जी के गुणों और व्यवहार से बड़ा प्रभावित रहा और बहुत कुछ मैंने सीखा भी। (व्यवधान)

**उपसभापति :** यह बात आनी चाहिए रिकार्ड पर। शिवशंकर जी की तारीफ कर रहे हैं। आने दीजिये आप अपनी बात संक्षेप में बोलिये।

**श्री ईश दत्त यादव :** मैं एक मिनट लूंगा। मैं कभी कभी सहस्रस करता हूँ कि ऐसे विद्वान और भले आदमी को इधर रहना चाहिये जहाँ भले लोगों की जमात है (व्यवधान) मैं परसों वाराणसी में था और मैंने समाचार-पत्र में पढ़ा कि श्री० पी० शिवशंकर जी ने अपने ही माननीय सदस्यों के आचरण और दुर्व्यवहार से दुःखित होकर त्याग-पत्र दे दिया है। यह समाचार पढ़ कर के मैं यह आपसे जानना चाहता हूँ कि इस में असलियत क्या है।

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** That is not my concern. It is the concern of his party.

**SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY:** Madam I am on a point of order... (Interruptions)...

**श्री ईश दत्त यादव :** विपक्ष के नेता हैं या नहीं, यह मैं जानना चाहता हूँ। मुझे बड़े ही खेद के साथ कहना पड़ता है कि यह कांग्रेस पार्टी के लोग रोज गलत व्यवहार करते हैं (व्यवधान) रोज माफी मांगते हैं और देश के अन्दर तथा विदेश के अन्दर इस संसद की गरिमा पर बड़ी आंच आ रही है। अभी पाण्डेय जी ने माफी मांगी और पांच मिनट के अन्दर संसद के अन्दर (व्यवधान) प्रदर्शन कर रहे हैं इसलिए श्री पी० शिवशंकर जी विपक्ष के नेता हैं या नहीं हैं, मैं यह जानकारी चाहता हूँ?

**उपसभापति :** वे यहाँ बैठे हैं, मेरे लिए तो हैं।

(Interruptions) That matter is over now. (Interruption).

**SHRI M. A. BABY (Kerala):** Madam, we are very happy that you see to it that Shiv Shanker Ji is the Leader of the Opposition. (Interruptions)

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** I have the information, he is the Leader of the Opposition (Interruption)

**THE LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER):** I am sitting here. That by itself is enough. (Interruption)

**SHRI M. A. BABY:** Madam, you also protect his authority as the Leader of the Opposition.

**डा० अब्दुल अहमद खान :** मुझे एलाउ नहीं किया गया। मेरे रिकार्ड में नहीं जाने दिया, इसलिए मैं सदन का बहिष्कार करता हूँ।

**उपसभापति :** बोलने दीजिए। आप लोग मेम्बर्स को बोलने क्यों नहीं देते हैं।

**SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY:** Madam, I am very happy that

[Sh. Subrajanian Swamy]

the Leader of the House is here. There has been an increasing tendency of the ruling party Members to denigrate Judges. Kuldeep Singh is a classic case. I would think that the Leader of the House should see. (Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:

That cannot be a point of order because we are not discussing that matter. (Interruption). It is not. When it comes, you can discuss it. (Interruptions).

SHRI SUBRAMANTAN SWAMY: No, that is what I am saying It should be on the agenda.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:

When it is not on the agenda, that matter cannot be taken up in the House. (Interruptions). Are you running the House or am I running the House? Why can't you just keep quiet? (Interruptions). You know that you can only raise a point of order in the matter before the House. There is no matter before the House. Please take your seat. You discuss it at the correct forum Okay. This is not the forum.

Alleged Atrocities on Members of Minority Communities

श्री सुरेश पचौरी (मध्य प्रदेश) : महोदया, विशेष उल्लेख के माध्यम से भारत में अल्पसंख्यक वर्ग पर जो अत्याचार, अनाचार हो रहे हैं उनकी ओर मैं आपके माध्यम से सरकार का ध्यान आकर्षित करना चाहता हूँ। जिस ढंग से दिल्ली की सरकार राज कर रही है, उससे अल्पसंख्यकों में भय व आतंक का वातावरण निर्मित हो गया है और अल्पसंख्यक अपने आपको असुरक्षित महसूस कर रहे हैं। ऐसी स्थिति उन राज्यों में ज्यादा हो रही है जो कि भा०ज०पा० के द्वारा शासित राज्य हैं। यह अल्पसंख्यकों पर जुल्म सितम ढाये जा रहे (ध्वजध्वनि)

उपसभापति : बोलने दीजिए।

श्री सुरेश पचौरी : उस पर दिल्ली की सरकार इसलिए अंकुश नहीं लगा रही है क्योंकि वह इन्हीं भाजपाइयों की वैसाखियों पर खड़ी हुई सरकार है। महोदया, उत्तर प्रदेश में गजरोला में नन्स के साथ जो दुर्भाग्यजनक घटना हुई है उसकी स्याही अभी सूख भी नहीं पायी थी कि मध्य प्रदेश में भिण्ड जिले में मौ कस्बे में एक अत्यंत दुर्भाग्यजनक घटना घटित हो गयी जो मानवता के नाम पर कलंक है। मौ कस्बे में जो मध्य प्रदेश में है साम्प्रदायिक दंगे में एक ही सम्प्रदाय के एक ही मुस्लिम जाति के, बेकसूर निर्दोष लोगों के मकान, दुकान लूट गये। उनकी रोजी रोटी के साधन उजाड़ दिये गये। महोदया, प्रदेश के विभिन्न भागों में ऐसी स्थिति निर्मित हो रही है। साथ ही देश में भी कुछ ऐसी स्थिति होती जा रही है। जयपुर में साम्प्रदायिक दंगे हुए। मस्जिद की मीनारें तोड़ी गये, भड़काले नारे लगाये गये। जम्मू, कश्मीर में पुलिस और कर्फ्यू राज चल रहा है। विश्व हिंदू परिषद को जिस आग्रह और अधिकारी ने नोटिस दिया उसको तुरंत हटा दिया गया। उपेन्द्र जी यहां मौजूद हैं। विश्व हिंदू परिषद के पदाधिकारी अशोक सिंघल के भाई श्री वी.पी. सिंघल को फिल्म सेंसर बोर्ड में नामजद कर दिया गया। सदस्य के नाते किसी के भाई को नामजद करने पर मुझे कोई ऐतराज या आपत्ति नहीं है लेकिन प्रश्न इस बात का है कि वह विश्व हिंदू परिषद जो कि इस देश में साम्प्रदायिकता का वातावरण निर्मित कर रही है उससे संबंधित और उनके परिवार के लोगों को इस ढंग से लाभित किया जा रहा है जिससे कि हमारे देश में जो अमन और चैन का वातावरण है वह बिगड़ता जा रहा है। महोदया, सिख समुदाय के साथ भी यही स्थिति हो रही।

26 मई, 1990 को केरल, कालीकट में प्रधान मंत्री को जाना था। 25 मई को वहां जितने भी सिख होटल में पाये गये, जितने भी सिख रोड पर गुजरते हुए देखे गये, उन सब को बंद कर दिया गया। लेकिन जब मौसम की खराबी से प्रधान मंत्री जी का प्लेन नहीं उतरा, तो उन सिखों को छोड़ दिया गया।

वही स्थिति लुधियाना में हुई। जिस आन, बान और शान के साथ प्रधान मंत्री जी वहां गये और सिमरन जीत सिंह मान का