

देखिये, आप सीनियर मेंबर हैं। वह वहाँ के प्रासीजर की बात कर रहे हैं वहाँ के ट्रदर्शन के प्रासीजर की बात कर रहे हैं (व्यवधान)

I am talking of the procedure in the House. You have made your point. There is no procedure that the Minister is bound to answer immediately. I don't have that thing in my hand. Just a minute (*Interruptions*). This is the procedure. I am saying, my hands are tied with the rule book. There is no procedure or there is no rule under which I can make the Minister answer immediately. You made your point. He says, he will answer and he will answer. He made an assurance in the House that he will answer. I can protect that. But I cannot make him answer immediately. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: I seek your protection on a different point. Having made a statement, now he says, "I will go and check up whether my statement is right or wrong". *Prima facie*, is the House not entitled to an apology of the Minister in this matter?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That matter is over now. Yes, Mr. Kulkarni, what do you want to say? (*Interruptions*). You don't look at them.

REFERENCE To FIRING ON INDO-PAKISTAN BORDER

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI (Maharashtra) : Madam, I am bringing through you, to the notice of the Government a serious matter which I raised during the Question Hour also. I wanted really the Prime Minister to reply and assure not only this House but through this House, the nation about the grave condition which was telecast yesterday in the news and today in the newspapers that in the Kupwara sector in Jammu and Kashmir, an explosive and incendiary ammunition was used against Indian troops. Madam, in this connection, everybody in this country is feeling whether the war has come near between India and Pakistan. Already we have got problems

of law and order and price rise and... i (*Interruption*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I believe the Government is going to make a statement. (*Interruptions*). I have to find out and inform the House in due course.

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI: Madam, let me complete. I want to say this shows the lack of intelligence in the Government machinery which is stationed on the Indo-Pakistan border. Here the statement of the Government says, there are usual skirmishes but this was on a large scale where ammunition which was not up to now used is being used. Naturally, I think, the Government will appreciate this thing. We, the common people, are very much worried of this condition and I would have been really happy but I do not want to mention it again and again, it is only the Prime Minister who can satisfy us. (*Interruption*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let him finish. I will allow you to intervene.

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI: What I wanted to know, Madam, is that some casualties took place... (*Interruptions*).

SARDAR JAGJIT SINGH AURORA (Punjab): There is nothing to tell. There is nothing to worry. (*Interruption*). There is nothing to panic. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI: You are a General. I am an ordinary citizen. You fought in Bangladesh. (*Interruption*). I am an ordinary person. I want to know more facts because it seems that the Government intelligence machinery on the border does not seem to be up to the mark wherein they could anticipate... (*Interruptions*). Madam, I have drawn through you, the attention of the Government and I demand a full-fledged statement and if Mr. Upendra is going to reply just now, I will just find out.

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF DEFENCE (DR. RAJA RAMANNA): Can I make a statement? I think, the Prime Minister will speak at 5 o'clock. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The Prime Minister will make a statement at 5 o'clock.

DR. RAJA RAMANNA: I am stating that the Prime Minister will make a statement at 5 o'clock on this particular issue because the subject is of some importance. *(Interruptions)*.

SHRI SURESH KALMADI (Maharashtra): Not of some importance.

DR. RAJA RAMANNA: Not of some importance but of great importance. *(Interruptions)*.

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: This is the importance they attach... *(Interruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: If you are going to stop him on every word, then how will he reply? It is his way of saying. It is okay. *(Interruption)*, If you see grave importance all right. *(Interruption)*. We are not sitting here to improve his language. I am concerned about the concern of the Minister. *(Interruptions)*

DR. RAJA RAMANNA: I would like to clarify why I used the word 'some importance' It is because I wanted to point out that at the Consultative Committee of Parliament, recently, some Members walked out without realising how important these things are. *(Interruptions)*.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now that matter is over. Now I call Mr. A. K. Antony. *(Interruption)*. I am sorry. Just a minute. Mr. Antony has asked for a Special Mention. There is a very serious matter which Mr. Antony wants to raise. It is about Kuwait. I am permitting him. *(Interruptions)*. If all of you sit down, then I will give my ruling. No, I am not permitting you.

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: He has made allegations against the Members of the Defence Consultative Committee. *(Interruptions)*. He highlighted the importance of the meeting. *(Interruptions)*. The Prime Minister was absent in the meeting and that is why, we walked out. *(Interruptions)*.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You made your point clear. Now that matter is closed. *(Interruptions)*.

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: He must apologise. He cannot make allegations on the Members of the House. *(Interruptions)*. How can he cast aspersions on the Members of the House? *(Interruptions)*. The matter regarding the Defence Consultative Committee cannot be raised in the House. *(Interruptions)*.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: If you allow me to speak, then I will speak. *(Interruptions)*.

SHRI JAGESH DESAI (Maharashtra): should be allowed to speak. I am a Member of that Committee.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will not allow you to speak about what happened in the meeting. I will not allow anything which transpired in the meeting. I will not permit it in the House. *(Interruptions)*.

SHRI SATYA PRAKASH MALAVI-YA (Uttar Pradesh): Mr. Desai, did you walk out or not? *(Interruptions)*.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Take your seat. Let me deal with it. *(Interruption)*. Mr. Vishvjit P. Singh, are you also a Member of the Consultative Committee?

SHRI VISHVJIT P. SINGH (Maharashtra): I am a Member of the House. I am raising a point of order.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am allowing Mr. Vishvjit Singh to raise a point of order. *(Interruptions)*.

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA (Karnataka): I stood up first on a point of order. *(Interruptions)*. It is not fair.

SHRI VISHVJIT P. SINGH: Madam, this is a serious matter. *(Interruptions)*.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: All right. Let me hear him also sometime.

SHRI VISHVJIT P. SINGH: It is a settled convention of this House that

matters pertaining to the Consultative Committee or the proceedings of the Consultative Committee are not mentioned on the floor of this House and that convention has been broken. *(Interruptions)*.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please let him make his say. You don't allow the Members to heard. Don't give a running commentary. Let him say.

SHRI VISHVJIT P. SINGH: That Convention has been broken by the hon. Minister himself. That convention has been broken by the hon. Minister himself. When you, Madam, _____ *(Interruptions)*. When you, Madam Deputy Chairman, are restraining hon. Member Shri Jagesh Desai from raising this matter, . . . *(Interruptions)*.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am not restraining. I am allowing you. I cannot allow ten people at the same time. I am allowing you. So you raise it. *(Interruptions)*. Just a minute. Just imagine. Mr. Kalmadi is a Member. He had raised the issue. *(Interruptions)*.

SHRI VISHVJIT P. SINGH: Madam, when you allowed the hon. Minister to raise this issue, is it... *(Interruptions)*.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I did not allow. I want to make it clear. *(Interruptions)*. Just sit down. Let me deal with it. Sit down. Don't keep on getting up like this.

SHRI VISHVJIT P. SINGH: Madam, ... *(Interruptions)*.. . one for the Minister and one for us.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Sit down. I will deal with it. *(Interruption)*. Just listen to me. First you sit down and let me handle. I did not allow the Minister to mention anything about what happened in the Consultative Committee. The Minister reacted when the matter was raised by an hon. Member in this House regarding what happened on the India-Pakistan border and he wanted to say something regarding the statement which was demanded in the House and he mentioned. I did not allow. I allowed Mr. Suresh Kalmadi who is also an hon. Member of that Committee to say his point of view why

he walked out. And the Minister, if he ever open's anything about what happened in the Committee, I will not permit. And what he said was nothing so happened in the Committee at all. Now take your seat. The matter is over. *(Interruptions)*. That is my ruling. *(Interruptions)*. Don't challenge my ruling. If you want to challenge my ruling, it is all right. *(Interruptions)*. It is overruled. *(Interruptions)*.

SHRI SURESH KALMADI; ... That will give the full picture. He gave half the picture.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN; All right. Why you walked out, you gave the full picture. Now Mr. Antony *(Interruptions)* ,

SHRI VISHVJIT P. SINGH:. . . I am requesting you. I am once again requesting you to protect the Chair, to protect the House and ask the Minister to apologise. *(Interruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I gave my ruling. You said your point. *(Interruptions)*. That is all right. *(Interruptions)*, Don't behave like this. Yes, Mr. Shiv Shanker.

THE LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER); Madam Deputy Chairman, ... *(Interruptions)*.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please. *(Interruptions)*. How do you insult your leader? You just look around yourself. I have permitted him to speak and you don't allow him to speak. If you don't allow the Chair, it is O.K.

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: Madam Deputy Chairman, when the hon. Minister was pleased to refer the matter as of "some importance", Mr. Kalmadi said it is not a matter of some importance, but it is a matter of great importance. Now Just to react to that, if he says, " I am saying 'of some importance' because some of the Members have walked out of the Consultative Committee", I do not find any relevance whatsoever. Apart from the fact that it is in a bad taste, there is no

[Shri P. Shiv Shanker]

relevance for the hon. Minister to react in this fashion. And it is lasting aspersion on the proceeding's ... *(Interruptions)*,

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let Mr. Shiv Shanker say what he has to.

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: ... of the Consultative Committee. It is an established practice it is a convention which is now accepted by both the Houses, this House, this House particularly, that whatever happens in a Consultative Committee is never referred to here at all. Therefore, since there is a breach on the part of the honourable Minister, it will only be fair and it would add to his dignity if he stands up and apologises.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN (Tamil Nadu): But he is laughing.

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: It is an insult.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: When the Leader of the Opposition has said something, there is no point in adding to it because he has said whatever he wanted to say in very clear terms, in a language, which is understood by everybody, including me and the Minister. If the Minister wants to react, let him react.

DR. RAJA RAMANNA: I do not want to continue this controversy. If people feel very strongly about my reference to what happened in the Consultative Committee, I apologise but I will, however, say that when defence was being discussed, whatever the circumstances, the greatest importance that should have been shown was not shown at that meeting. So I made a reference ...

(Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: There are many matters listed before me and We cannot go on like this.

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: By expressing this sort of regret he is compounding what he had already said.

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE: If this is how he puts it, then what does he apologise about?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now I am calling Mr. Antony on Special Mentions. Mr. Antony, do you want to speak on your special mention?

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: If this is the attitude of the Minister towards the Members of the Committee, we are walking out in protest. *(Interruption)*. We are walking out and we will not attend the Defence Committee's meetings till he apologises.

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA (West Bengal): I must confess that the apology offered by the Minister is too salty. If he had a different understanding, he should not have stood up and said 'I apologise'. After the apology he should not have referred to the behaviour of some Members at the meeting again. This does not speak of normal parliamentary wisdom nor of the behaviour that a Minister should do in a House like this. I strongly object to the way the Minister is behaving.

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: The conduct of the Minister, to say the least, is insult to use. What he has said has aggravated what he has said earlier. While condemning what he has said, as a protest we are walking out.

(At this stage some hon. Members left the chamber.)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have called Mr. Antony. Mr. Antony, what about you? Are you also walking out? *(Interruptions)*

SHRI A. K. ANTONY (Kerala): Madam, I am coming back ...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You walked out and now you are walking in.

SHRI A. K. ANTONY: Yes, I have walked in now.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You walked out and walked in. It is an exercise. Now you may speak on your special men-

tion. If you like, you can come to the front. But you can be heard from anywhere. In any case, it is very quiet now.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I hope, now we will work in peace.

SHRI A.K. ANTONY: I walked out and then walked in.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Agreed. You can start. *(Interruptions)* No more disturbance please. *{Interruptions}* Dr. Abrar Ahmed Khan, I have identified Mr. Antony. Please take your seat. No *vyavastha*. Mr. Antony please.

SPECIAL MENTIONS

Evacuation of Indians stranded in Kuwait

SHRI A. K. ANTHONY (Kerala): Madam Deputy Chairman it has been officially announced yesterday that 15,000 Indians are allowed to return from Kuwait. It has also been stated that they are on their way to Amman. Earlier, the Government was saying that all the Indians in Kuwait were safe and that there was no need to get panicky. But now, the Government itself admits that 15,000 Indians have already expressed their willingness to leave Kuwait and that the Iraqi Government has agreed to evacuate them.

My request is that we should send a Parliamentary delegation to Amman to study the situation there and oversee the arrangements for their evacuation. The Government of India must establish a refugee camp at Amman and, if it is possible, the Parliamentary delegation should visit the other Gulf countries also.

The second thing is, the Government of India should request the Iraqi Government to allow the Indians to send letters through the Indian Embassy, because their relations, their family members, are spending sleepless nights and they are anxious to know the latest condition there. Therefore, the Iraqi Go-

vernment should be approached to permit our people to send letters through the Indian Embassy. This is my another demand.

Thirdly, the Government should also issue daily statements about the latest situation there to allay the anxiety of their family members and other relations.

As I said, it is now admitted that thousands of people are returning from Kuwait. Already, 15,000 Indians are on their way. When these people are returning, it is going to be a problem in the respective States. As far as Kerala is concerned—the majority of the expatriates is from Kerala—nearly 1,70,000 Keralites are there—it will have an impact on our economy. They are mainly depending on Gulf money. Therefore, it is high time that the Government of India prepares a rehabilitation scheme for these Gulf returnees. The Government of India should act quickly and it should clear all the pending proposals of the Kerala Government in regard to rehabilitation projects.

In the end, I would once again request the Government of India to immediately send a Parliamentary delegation to Amman first and then to the other Gulf countries to study the latest situation there, to allay the anxiety of their relations and friends here. Thank you.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Dr. Abrar Ahmed Khan, you were very much agitated yesterday over this issue. I will allow you now. This is the right forum and I will allow you. You can say whatever you want to.

डा० अबरार अहमद खां (राजस्थान) :
यैक यू मैडम। इस संबंध में मैं यह कहना चाहता था कि जिस प्रकार से कुवैत और इराक की घटना घटी उससे भारत बहुत ज्यादा प्रभावित हुआ है। आज उस घटना से हमारे देश की सुरक्षा को खतरा हो गया है। जिस प्रकार से इस घटना के कारण अमरीका की फीजें भारत के दरवाजे के बाहर तक आकर खड़ी हो गई हैं उनके ढाई लाख सैनिक, पचास जंगी-जहाज और