

[The Deputy Chairman]

Mr. Jagesh Desai I request you, do not keep repeating. No senior Member of your stature should be repeating. I gave my ruling. I can't go beyond that. *(Interruptions)* You do not hear. You are fond of hearing your own voice. At least allow me to say something *(Interruptions)*

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE (Maharashtra): Madam, the issue involved reversing the entire conventions of the House. Whenever a debate is taking place on an important issue and it is inconclusive, it is taken on the next day in reference to the legislative business. It has happened all these years. I have seen; it has happened. About the Industrial Policy why are you going behind this precedent, this convention?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I said, Mr. Salve, I will find out. I cannot give you the answer immediately. On many occasions it has happened in the past that the business has been changed; precedents have been changed. But in this case the business which was left over should have been listed. And I assure you that in future it will not happen. Okay?

Now, can we go ahead? Prof. Chandresh P. Thakur. *(Interruptions)*

What is it? *(Interruptions)* I am happy that at least you are satisfied *(Interruptions)*

## RE. GOVERNMENT'S LANGUAGE POLICY

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN (Tamil Nadu): Madam, we wanted a statement from Government on the language policy. What has happened to ... *(Interruptions)*

SHRI PASUMPON THA. KIRUT-TINAN (Tamil Nadu): There will be no imposition of Hindi... *(Interruptions)* Hindi will not be imposed... *(Interruptions)*

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY (Pondicherry): Hindi is being imposed in other States. *(Interruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He wants to say something. Let him say something. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI PASUMPON THA. KIRUT-TINAN: What is the reason for their repeating 1965? *(Interruptions)* No, there should be no imposition of Hindi. You are all responsible. The Congress is responsible. *(Interruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: In this cross fire you cannot speak. Let this cross fire be over. *(Interruptions)* Order, please. The Minister wants to say something. Mr. Dipen Ghosh, please take your seat.

THE MINISTER OF SURFACE TRANSPORT (SHRI K. P. UNNIKRISHNAN): On behalf of this Government I wish to say that the language policy of the National Front is very clear and unambiguous.

SHRI M. M. JACOB (Kerala): Madam, I am on a point of order.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No point of order, Mr. Jacob. Please take your seat.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: The Member can raise his point of order and the Minister has to yield.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please don't make it an issue. Please sit down. I have not permitted him. Point of order does not mean this becomes his birth-right.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Yes, it is

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It is not.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Under the rules it is his right.

The DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: See the rules book first.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: He can raise it. You may rule it out.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Take your seat.

SHRI K. P. UNNIKRISHNAN: I will only quote from the National Front Manifesto, which is our policy. I quote:

"Use of regional languages in administration at State level and in education at all levels shall be promoted. Pandit Jawaharlal Nehru's assurance regarding the language policy will be implemented and all efforts would be made to promote the Indian languages. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please speak through the mike.

SHRI K. P. UNNIKRISHNAN: Gujral Committee's recommendation on Urdu will be implemented. The Schedule VIII will be extended to respond to the urges of other linguistic groups."

This is very clear and categorical and I wish to reiterate that this is the policy and we have no other policy.

SHRI M. M. JACOB: Madam, my point of order is this.

SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA (Karnataka): Madam, I have not heard the Minister.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Everybody was making noise. You want the Minister to repeat again?

SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA: Yes.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: O.K. The Minister may repeat.

SHRI M. M. JACOB: Madam, have you allowed me to raise the point of order?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The Member wants him to repeat. I will allow you. (*Interruptions*) Please, let the Minister be heard.

SEVERAL HON. MEMBERS: We have heard him.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, one Member has not heard him. Have you heard him? He has not heard him. Now please let him hear. I have to protect every Member. (*Interruptions*)

ग्राह्य जरा इनकी बात सुन लीजिए, एक मेबर साहब बोल रहे हैं शिवायत करेंगे।  
... (*अवधान*)

DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Have you heard it?

SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA: Yes.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, Mr. Jacob. You want to raise something.

SHRI M. M. JACOB: I appreciate my good friend, the hon. Minister. Shri Unnikrishnan, standing up and replying, but my point of order is this. Yesterday, in this House Mr. Upendra was categorically mentioning that he will censor anything in a Minister's speech which is other than his own Ministry. The Railway Minister's speech was censored by Mr. Upendra saying that that portion did not pertain to the Railway Ministry. So, my question is, has Mr. Unnikrishnan been authorised to say this by the Prime Minister? We want a categorical assurance in this House. In this context there is a lacuna. Mr. Upendra mentioned yesterday that a Minister cannot speak on anything other than his own Ministry. (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please let me deal with his point of order. Mr. Upendra is not in the Chair. In this House, what the Chair does counts, whoever is in the Chair. The Chair only can censor anything. It is not the Doordarshan or the 'Khula Manch.' This is Parliament of India where the Chair decides who will speak what.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Madam, I want to ask... (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: What is this? He wants to say something. Let her finish. Don't have atrocities on her. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI PASUMPON THA. KIRUTINAN:....Our hon. Minister has already replied on the language issue. This National Front's manifesto is clear. (*Interruptions*). There will be no imposition at all. We will straightway fight for ....(*Interruptions*). And we will fight against Hindi imperialism. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have heard you. Please.

SHRI PASUMPON THA. KIRUTINAN: They want to take political advantage of it. (*Interruptions*). I want to know whether Rajiv Gandhi is prepared on this language....(*Interruptions*). Let them say whether they are prepared for a Constitution amendment on this language issue. (*Interruptions*).

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Madam, they are speaking without your permission. It should not go on record.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Mr. Unnikrishnan said that the three-language formula...(*Interruptions*)....when the Chief Ministers of Janata Dal have decided....(*Interruptions*).

SHRI PASUMPON THA. KIRUTINAN:....Mr. Bakthavatsalam was responsible. Her grandfather was responsible....(*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please don't bring in people's grandfathers.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Madam, Mr. Unnikrishnan has responded. I appreciate what he said. I want to know this. If this is the stand of the Janata Dal, if this is the stand of the National Front manifesto,

what action are they taking against their own Chief Ministers who have come out publicly? Have they passed any resolution?...(*Interruptions*). Madam, it is very unfortunate that the DMK people are also supporting ....(*Interruptions*).

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY (Andhra Pradesh): Madam,...(*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: On the same issue? (*Interruptions*).

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Madam Deputy Chairman, for the sake of continuing in the Cabinet, the DMK is ....(*Interruptions*)....imposing Hindi on southern States. The point raised by us is whether they will take action against the Chief Ministers who passed resolutions.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Madam, it is very strange how DMK is supporting Hindi.

SEVERAL HON. MEMBERS: No, no. (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members, take your seats. We have had enough discussion on Hindi, English and any other language. Now please sit down.... Nothing should be spoken on this matter.... It is over. The matter is closed... No please, I have already identified Mr. Vishvjit Singh. बैठ जाइए No point. Nothing. Sit down... Stop, stop, stop... If you like I can speak in Hindi.

कृपया आप बैठ जाइये, अपना स्थान ग्रहण कीजिए। अपनी जगह पर बैठ जाइये।

No, no. Yes, Mr. Vishvjit Singh. Use your voice which you use every day... I said, no. It will not go on record. Any Member speaking without my permission will not go on record.... Sit down, sit down. It is not going on record. It will not be reported in the newspapers. Take your seats... You are the Whip of the party. At least you should understand that when the Chair tells you, "please sit down", you should sit down... Don't stretch it too much. Sit down. Sit down.

कृपया बैठ जाइए।

That rule applies to you also .... You may do anything. I have no objection. But don't speak. You don't speak but you can do what you like... You can protest the way you want to.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: As a protest, I walk out.

At this stage, the hon. Member left the Chamber)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You could have done that without making so much noise. Yes, Mr. Vishvjit Singh, you speak.

SHRI VISHVJIT P. SINGH (Maharashtra): Madam. .... (Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The Hindi-English controversy is over. I have identified someone else. That matter is now closed. It is over. Mr. Unnikrishnan spoke on behalf of Government. The matter is over. They complained and put their grievances in the House whichever way they could. It is all right. Now I have called him.

SHRI VISHVJIT P. SINGH: Madam, I am sure the entire House will agree with me that the office of the Prime Minister of India is sacrosanct and due respect must be shown to the office of the Prime Minister of this country. This is a great country with a long history. It has wonderful future.

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA (Rajasthan). Carry on without any preamble.

SHRI VISHVJIT P. SINGH: Do you wish to say something? I yield to you. I mean, this is the limit. This is a very serious matter on which I would like to....

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: But what is the matter?

SHRI VISHVJIT P. SINGH: I am just coming to it.

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: The suspense is killing. Tell us the matter.

SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA: Mr. Morarka, do you dispute the history of the country also?

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: He was talking about geography.

SHRI VISHVJIT P. SINGH: Let me handle it myself. I know how to handle it. Madam, certain allegations by imputation have been made by a very responsible newspaper published by one of the major political parties of this country. It has levelled certain very false—and I say this categorically because I know him—allegations. The allegations are: Recently a newspaper of Lahore has played up the new that\* (Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will not permit it.

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: Are you sure that that V. P. Singh is this V. P. Singh?... (Interruptions)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no. Mr. Vishvjit Singh, just a minute. I have permitted you, but I have said it before that making any wild allegations.... (Interruptions)... You have to substantiate. I won't permit you. By any newspaper or by anyone, while you read it out in the House, it is you who is reading it, and I won't permit it if it is a wild allegation, without substantiating it or without prior permission... (Interruptions)... No, no. It is out of question.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: It cannot go on record... (Interruptions).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It won't go on record... (Interruptions)...

SHRI VISHVJIT P. SINGH: \*

\*Not recorded.

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** I said, please, it will not go on record. Until and unless you substantiate any allegation, it will not go on record ... (Interruptions)... Prof. Thakur.

**SHRI SURESH KALMADI (Maharashtra):** Madam ... (Interruptions)...

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** You are not Prof. Chandresh P. Thakur. He is behind you... (Interruptions)... No, I have got Special Mentions and the Women's Bill listed. We have very heavy business ... (Interruption)... No.

**SHRI SANTOSH BAGRODIA (Rajasthan):** You have promised .....

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** No, I never promised anybody. I don't make promises, no... (Interruptions)

**SHRI SURESH KALMADI:** Madam, I generally don't insist. I am a good man.

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** I have listed business to go by. You have to give me the title of what you want to speak about.

**SHRI SURESH KALMADI:** It is the Government's bungling on the coverage of the Asian Games which are going to take place in Beijing. The Doordarshan has not been given the job at all. They have not paid the amount. ... (Interruptions)...

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** You write to the Minister. Please sit down.... (Interruptions)... Prof. Thakur.... (Interruptions)... Please sit down. I said, please take your seat. Please write to the Minister and get an answer or, you ask for a Special Mention and I will permit you. ... (Interruptions)... I will permit you a Special Mention. Please sit down now. Let me allow the ones who have taken the pains to give notice of Special Mentions. Otherwise, why do we have this rule? Please sit down.

(Interruptions)... I know what Prof. Thakur is going to say .... (Interruptions). No, no, Mr. Sarang. No; not even half a minute. It won't go on record. Please sit down, ..... (Interruptions).... Prof. Thakur.. (Interruptions)... Have a mercy on a nice Vice-Chairman! ... (Interruptions)....

मारंग साहब, आप बैठ जाइये...  
.... (व्यवधान).... बोलिये ठाकुर साहब.... (व्यवधान).... स्पेशल...  
स्पेशल मेंशन में आपका नाम है। इनके बाद आपको बुलाऊंगा।

**श्री सन्तोष बागड़ोदिया :** मैं इस पर बोलूंगा।

**उपसभापति :** आप यकी तो न बोलें। कंडीशन चैयर पर नहीं लगाई जाती है। कृपया आप बैठ जाइये।

When I want to be polite you don't want to listen. When I raise my voice, you only listen that. I will not allow you. ... (Interruptions)... I didn't allow other persons, I won't allow you. Please take your seat. Have some order in the House. Yes, Prof. Thakur.

## SPECIAL MENTIONS

### Recent Developments in Eastern Europe

**PROF. CHANDRESH P. THAKUR (Bihar):** Madam, Europe is undergoing unprecedented changes and particularly, in eastern Europe the rate of change has been very rapid. Until recently we were mentally prepared that the European Economic Community will get consolidated economically by 1992 and following that there will be political consolidation of western Europe. Much before the process of political unification of western Europe could gather momentum, events in eastern Europe have overtaken it.

I was recently on a European trip and I had an opportunity for the first time to make contact with people who are observing developments and are