

[श्री नितिश कुमार]

(ख) उपयुक्त प्रतिवेदन को स्वीकार करते हुए सरकार द्वारा विवरण।

[पुस्तकालय में रखी गई। (क) और

(ख) के लिये देखिये सं० एल० टी० 1361/90]

(iii) (क) 1984-85 के वर्ष के लिए राउस्थान राज्य डेरो विकास निगम लिमिटेड, जयपुर का वार्षिक प्रतिवेदन और लेखे, लेखाओं पर लेखा परीक्षकों के प्रतिवेदन और उस पर भारत के निषेधक महालेखापरीक्षक की टिप्पणियों सहित।

(ख) उपयुक्त प्रतिवेदन को स्वीकार करते हुए सरकार द्वारा विवरण।

(ग) ऊपर (3)(1) में उल्लिखित पत्रों के सभा पटल पर रखने में हुए विलम्ब के कारणों को दर्शाने वाला विवरण (अंग्रेजी तथा हिन्दी में) [पुस्तकालय में रखी गई (क) से (i) के लिये देखिये संख्या एल.टी. 1362/190]

**Calling attention to a matter of urgent Public Importance—Regarding Rampant Corruption, Mismanagement and Malpractices in the Nationalised Banks and the action taken by the Government in the matter—Contd.**

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Calling Attention to a matter....

SHRI SURESH KALMADI (Maharashtra): Madam, since the Minister is here, I would like to know when the Airbus is going to fly. We want a parliamentary probe into the Airbus affair. We spend 15 lakhs on advertisement. We would like to know when it will take off. Yes, Mr. Arif, you can say something on this. She has given you permission.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Neither have I given you permission nor have I given him permission. Even I have not allowed you to speak.

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: It is a matter of great importance. Now that he has come back, he should tell us. Every day we are losing one crore. We have already lost 200 crores. We would like to know when the Airbus is going to fly. Madam, he announced it. Why has it not taken off? Now he has come back. He should let us know. It is a matter of great importance.

THE MINISTER OF ENERGY WITH ADDITIONAL CHARGE OF THE MINISTRY OF CIVIL AVIATION (SHRI ARIF MOHD. KHAN): Madam, the last Session concluded with my reply on the discussion here initiated by the hon. Member on Civil Aviation. I must say that all the reasons that I had given for the decision to ground this fleet, had been appreciated by the hon. Member. I can only say that the moment we are satisfied...

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: But you announced that it will take off.

SHRI ARIF MOHD. KHAN: Let me complete my sentence.

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: Madam, he announced....

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That matter is over.

SHRI ARIF MOHD. KHAN: Let me complete, at least, I do not know a grammar where I can sum up in one sentence. And I do not know why he is shouting.

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: Because the public wants to know this.

SHRI ARIF MOHD. KHAN: Then let me, at least, complete.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Excuse me. Just a minute. He is not obliged to answer.... Just a minute. Please take your seat. He is answering, but you should not interrupt him.

(व्यवधान)

एक मेंबर ने पूछा है और मैंने जवाब दे दिया है। अगर सन्तुष्ट है तो बोलें।

SHRI ARIF MOHD. KHAN: Probably the other hon. Member does not want me to reply to Mr. Kalmadi. Anyway, this is between them. I can only say, because Mr. Kalmadi has been raising this question again and again, that the moment we are satisfied that we have taken all the steps to ensure safety of the passengers, because as far as we are concerned, it is not the commercial aspect, but it is the safety which comes first...

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: But you announced the flight. Why did you make that announcement? You announced resumption of the flights. How can he now say this?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now the matter is over. Let me make an announcement.

SHRI ARIF MOHD. KHAN: I can understand the concern of Shri Kalmadi for operating the Airbus. But our concern is for ensuring the safety of the passengers.

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: But did you announce or not that the Airbus will fly? You gave the schedule also...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That matter is over.

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: Madam, I want your protection.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have given you enough protection. Now I have to make an announcement. I say, please take your seat.

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: Madam, give me protection.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have given you enough protection. Now, please, I have to make an announcement. Sit down. (Interruptions) I have to make an announcement first. (Interruptions) Mr. Kalmadi, please take your seat. (Interruptions) I said, please sit down. I have to make an announcement. (Interruptions) Just a minute Mrs. Alva.

I have to inform the Members that the Prime Minister will make a statement at 1 p.m. today regarding measures for pro-

motion of employment for the youth in addition to the reservations for the socially and economically backward classes.

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA (Karnataka): I want to go on record about the brutalities committed by the police on the unarmed demonstration of university students. I am not going into the pros and cons of what their views are. I am not supporting the agitation or anything like that. The Government may have taken its own decision on the Mandal Commission, but what I want to say is that unarmed girls who were forming a human chain were attacked by the mounted police outside Parliament. (Interruptions) All that they were asking was that a delegation should be allowed to come in and meet the Prime Minister or the Minister in charge. Instead of responding to that, they had been brutally attacked. (Interruptions) I want to point out that the way of dealing with the students, right or wrong, is not with violence. They have a right to be heard. They have a right at least to place their grievances before a democratic Government. It was almost like a Tiananmen Square. We condemned what had happened there. Madam, there were innocent students. They committed no fault. They were not armed and they were peacefully demonstrating and asking that a group of them would like to come in and meet their representatives in the House. If the attitude of the Government is that the students should not speak or the students should not meet them, then I don't think any democratic process is possible. Madam, I condemn it. I have met the students who were injured. It is unfortunate. They do not belong to any political party or individual group. They were just representatives of those who were demonstrating. If this is allowed to be condoned there will be no end to the agitation and they may take to violence. I am, therefore, saying that this should be condemned and wherever the police officer in charge of this kind of brutality may be—you have seen the photographs in the papers... (Interruptions) Minister are now asking that others should take to the streets and give a reply to the students. Is that the answer? (Interruptions) Madam, I am warn-

ing that you will have a civil war in the country. They must stop speaking like that if they are a responsible Government.

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: Madam, we want a statement by the Minister on the brutal attack on the students. (Interruptions)

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA: The girls of the Delhi University have been attacked with rifle-bullets on their necks. I have seen it. Is this the way to attack young University girls unarmed and unprotected? All that they were doing was that they were falling in human chain which so many of us at various times have done in this country. Why was there an attack on the unarmed women, I ask this Government?

डा. अब्दुल अहमद खान (राजस्थान): आज इनकी सरकार के एक मंत्री शरद यादव का स्टेटमेंट आया है जिससे देश के प्रदर भविष्य का स्थिति पैदा हो गया है। उन्होंने इस तरह का व्यवहार किया है। कपड़ा मंत्री श्री शरद यादव ने पिछड़े वर्ग के लोगों से कहा कि अपने मान सम्मान के लिए वे तब तक सड़कों पर उतरें। इसके कारण देश में भविष्य का स्थिति पैदा हो रही है। वे लोगों का आवाहन कर रहे हैं कि आइये हम मर मिटें। जानवर की तरह हजारों साल असम्मान की जिंदगी जाने से बेहतर है मान सम्मान पाने के लिए मर मिट जाना.... (व्यवधान) आज जो लोग इस आक्षेप के समर्थन में हैं वे भी सड़कों में हैं और जो इसके विरोध में हैं वे भी सड़कों पर हैं। महोदया, जब भी कोई आक्षेप होता है तो शांतिप्रिय तरीके से प्रदर्शन होते हैं आंदोलन होते हैं... (व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You have expressed your grievance. Now, please take your seat. (Interruptions) I said please take your seat. That matter is now being raised in the House. Do you want to say something? (Interruptions) You want to say something?

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY (Andhra Pradesh): Yes, Madam. But after the interruptions are over.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Even in the interruptions, I am sure you can... (Interruptions)... I heard you. Please take your seat... (Interruptions)... It is a very serious matter and that is why I allowed her. I also want her to make her point... (Interruptions)...

श्री सुरेन्द्रजीत सिंह अहलवालिया :  
(बिहार) : महोदया, यह शर्म की बात है.... (व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Just a minute, other Members also have a right to raise something even on this issue.

श्री सुरेन्द्रजीत सिंह अहलवालिया :  
महोदया, यह.... (व्यवधान)

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY: Madam, I could understand their sentiments and I echo them. If we have not learnt anything in the Government, we should have learnt a lesson from history. I do recollect when we came from Andhra, when Legislators, elected representatives came to Delhi to give a representation to Mr. Rajiv Gandhi, the then Prime Minister, women were teargassed, their sarees were burnt and they had to go running semi-nude... (Interruptions)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Ahluwalia, let her make her point. She has the right to say what she likes. Let her complete. Let her finish first.

श्री सुरेन्द्रजीत सिंह अहलवालिया :  
महोदया, यह बहुत ही शर्म की....  
(व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I cannot give you any protection... (Interruptions). Please take your seats. Order, order.

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA: She has no sympathy. She is playing a political game. That is why she is not interested in anything. She wants to justify everything.

SHRIMATI RANUKA CHOWDHURY:

I was the person who told her about these things... (Interruptions)... That is not the attitude. They have no business to say like this. They should have learnt a lesson from the history... (Interruptions)... What is that? (Interruptions)... There is nothing to protect myself... (Interruptions)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I heard everybody. Now take your seats. I have a listed business. Let me go ahead with the business. Please take your seats. You have made your say.

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY: You have set the precedent. You were the first one who has done it. I can challenge it on the floor of the House. Let me tell you that... (Interruptions)...

श्री सुरेन्द्रजीत सिंह अहलवालिया :  
पुलिस की लाठियों से.... (व्यवधान)  
सरकार को शर्न अर्नो चाहिए।

श्रीमती रेणुका चौधरी : शर्न करो,  
शर्न करो। बैठ जाइये, सरदार जी।

श्री सुरेन्द्रजीत सिंह अहलवालिया :  
छातों पर लाठियां चलाई गई हैं।...  
(व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please don't keep on repeating. I said, please take your seats. I am not permitting anybody. There are other issues. Now the matter is over... (Interruptions)... What do you want to say? (Interruptions)... I have some other matter also. I have allowed somebody else. अगर उनकी बात होने देंगे। अगर बैठ जाइये। हाँ, आप उनको बोलने दें जिए। Mr. Ahluwalia, there are other Members also who want to say something... (Interruptions)... Please take your seats.

श्री सुरेन्द्रजीत सिंह अहलवालिया :  
पुलिस ने बेरहमी के साथ छातों पर  
लाठियां चलाई। कई छात अस्पताल में  
हैं।.... (व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Ahluwalia, please take your seat. (Interruptions).

SHRI GOPALSINH G. SOLANKI (Gujarat): Mr. Ahluwalia, I have intervened... (Interruptions). For God's sake, keep mum. I don't defy your right. (Interruptions).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: There is something very serious.

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY: Madam, I wanted to conclude but you have not allowed me to conclude. (Interruptions). Madam, let me tell you. (Interruptions). I am on record... (Interruptions)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please sit down. Take your seat. (Interruptions).

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY: What have you done for them? (Interruption).

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA: Are you justifying? (Interruptions).

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY: I am not justifying. (Interruption). No, this is not the way. (Interruptions). You set the precedent in this country. (Interruptions).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Jagesh Desai, I will allow you. I will allow you when the Government come with the statement. (Interruptions). Please sit down. Shrimati Renuka Chowdhury you complete your statement. (Interruptions). Somebody is on her legs. Let her finish her statement. Then I will permit you. (Interruptions). Please have some consideration for other views also. Please take your seat. Let her complete her statement. Let her say what she wanted to say. Let me finish with her statement. I can give you no assurances. I will allow her to finish. (Interruptions). She is not speaking for you. She is speaking for the House and she is an elected Member of this House and she has a right to speak. You cannot stop her. (Interruptions).

**SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY:** What I am saying is that by no means we can justify or condone this action because the students have hereditary right over this nation and if they want, they can express. Freedom of speech is their fundamental right and they should have been allowed too. Why the Government has done it, the Government is going to come out with a statement if they want or whatever their problems are. But I am trying to call for a collective sense of responsibility of this House. We are not divided across the floor on the sentimental values on this issue. All of us belong to this nation. I have repeatedly said on the floor of this House that we stand under one flag. (*Interruptions*).

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Let her conclude. Let her say what she wants to say. (*Interruptions*).

**SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY:** It is people like you who are responsible for this. (*Interruptions*). Let me finish I am trying to tell you....

**उपसभापति :** बैठ जाइए आपकी बात हो गयी। आपकी बात सुनायी दे गयी। I said, 'Take your seat.' I said, 'Sit down.' (*Interruptions*).

**डा. अबरार अहमद खान :** सिविल वार करने की बात है.... (*व्यवधान*) सरकार का मंत्री इस प्रकार का वक्तव्य दे.... (*व्यवधान*).... देश के अंदर सिविल वार की स्थिति पैदा हो गयी है। लोग डंडे लेकर सड़कों पर आ रहे हैं। यह इस तरह का गैर जिम्मेदाराना वक्तव्य दे रहे हैं.... (*व्यवधान*).... उस सरकार के मंत्री.... (*व्यवधान*).... जिसने वक्तव्य दिया है.... (*व्यवधान*)....

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** I have been calling-attention before me. Please take your seat. I said, 'Take your seat.' I have heard you. You don't have to repeat it again and again. Please take your seat. (*Interruptions*) You don't understand! I said: आप स्थान ग्रहण किए। इंगलिश हिंदी में जो आती है, मैं दोनों में बोल रही हूँ कि

अपना स्थान ग्रहण किए। आप बैठ जाइए अपनी जगह पर। अपनी सीट पर बैठिए। Please take your (*Interruptions*). There are other issues. (*Interruption*). Mr. Ahluwalia, I said 'no'. I will get everything removed from the record if you do not abide by me.

**SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA:** You can do anything. (*Interruptions*).

**SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY:** You can't hijack the proceedings. (*Interruptions*).

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Mr. Ahluwalia, don't go beyond a certain point. Please take your seat. Now that matter is closed. I am not allowing anybody on it. (*Interruption*). I am not allowing it. I will not allow. There is some other matter. I will permit him.

**श्री चतुरानन मिश्र (बिहार):** हम भी बोलेंगे.... (*व्यवधान*).... हल्ला करने वालों को आप टाइम दें.... (*व्यवधान*)....

**उपसभापति :** आप कर नहीं सकते हैं, करिए। आप इतने सोबर मेंबर हैं कि आप हल्ला कर ही नहीं सकते

.... (*व्यवधान*)....

**श्री चतुरानन मिश्र :** महोदया, अभी जो प्रश्न उठाया गया माननीय विरोधी दल के माननीय सदस्यों द्वारा, यह सचमुच अत्यंत ही बिना का विषय है।.... (*व्यवधान*).... इसका यह इम्पेसन हुआ है। मैं भी इसकी निंदा करता हूँ। मैं सरकार से अनुरोध करूँगा कि इस तरह का पुलिस एक्शन न हो। महोदया, प्रश्न यह नहीं है कि यहीं पर न हो पालिसी-मेंट में, बाहर भी नहीं होना चाहिए। एक तो पहली बात मैं यही रखना चाहता हूँ। मंत्रीजी सुन रहे हैं, जल्दी कार्यवाही कराएँगे। दूसरी एक बात मैं यह कहना चाहता हूँ कि सरकार ने यह स्पष्ट कर दिया है और मैं समझता हूँ कि सदन इसके साथ है कि जहाँ तक बड़े बड़े कम्युनिस्टों

का ..... (व्यवधान) .... जिसको कहते मंडल कमिशन के मुताबिक, 27 परसेंट आरक्षण के बारे में किसी को मतभेद नहीं है। अगर मतभेद है तो बोलिए। लेकिन मैं समझता हूँ कि इस पर किसी को मतभेद नहीं है..... (व्यवधान)..... है

मैडम, मैं जो बात बोल रहा हूँ... (व्यवधान).... अभी सरकार ने आज यह अखबार में निकाला है कि जो अपर कास्ट के लोग हैं, उनमें जो बीकसे क्लस हैं, उनके लिए भी आरक्षण की बात.... (व्यवधान)....

उपसभापति : वह बयान आ रहा है, एक बजे। प्रधान मंत्री जी का बयान आ रहा है।

श्री चतुरानन मिश्र : अगर ऐसी बात हो रही है तो क्या यह सदन तमाम छात्रों से नहीं कह सकता कि जब सरकार बात सुनने के लिए तैयार है तो टेबिल पर बैठकर बातचीत कीजिए। .... (व्यवधान).....

श्री जगेश देसाई (महाराष्ट्र) : यह होता तो यह हल्ला नहीं होता। .... (व्यवधान).....

श्री संघ प्रिय गौतम (उत्तर प्रदेश) : उस दिन तो यह प्रॉटेक्शन मांग रहे थे और आज यह कह रहे हैं... (व्यवधान)...

श्री चतुरानन मिश्र : मैं कह रहा था कि पूरे सदन का साथ देना चाहिए, आपोजीशन को भी रिस्पोंड करना चाहिए और हम सबको मिलकर एक रास्ता निकालना है। .... (व्यवधान).... सुनिए, यह एक राष्ट्रीय समस्या है। जगेश जी, आपको भी यह किसकी हवा लग जाती है। .... (व्यवधान).... सुनिए, इसीलिए मैं यह अनुरोध करूंगा कि इसका निदान हो रहा है। इस पर सभी मिलकर एक रास्ता निकालें और इस समस्या का निदान निकालें।

... (Interruptions)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Kulkarni Sahib wants to say something. Just a minute. There is no question of representation of parties. It is for everybody.... (Interruptions)... Let me finish. I have allowed Mr. Kulkarni... (Interruptions)... We are not having any discussion just now.

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI (Maharashtra): I want to make my point.... (Interruptions)... I appreciate the great patience that you exhibit, in spite of all these interruptions, and you also laugh.

SHRI BHUVNESH CHATURVEDI (Rajasthan): Smiles.

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI: That is very kind of you, Madam,....

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now he is saying something nice to me. Please allow him to say what he wants. Every day I get abuses, at least let him say some compliment to me today.

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI: Madam, what I want to say is this. It is becoming very difficult to make our points audible because from all sides we make various points. Particularly on this point, I am one with everybody that the Government should have been more responsible in dealing with these types of agitations. But today I see that the Prime Minister is making a statement; that is one of the ways of defusing the situation, but I do not appreciate the statement made by a Minister of the Government because in my whole life here no Minister has gone out when he is a Minister of the Government—to provoke any type of conflicts between different castes. I appreciate their intense feeling in accepting the Mandal Commission Report and in its implementation. I am one with them, but a Minister is a Minister, he is a responsible person and he should behave with responsibility.

.. (Interruptions)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That matter is closed now. Please take your seats. I have got some other matter. All of you please sit down. I am not going to allow anything. There is some important matter which Mr. Solanki wants to raise. Have some patience to listen to other Members also.