

(17) GSR No. 567(E), dated the 12th June, 1990, fully exempting from excise duty bicycle valves and its components.

(18) GSR No. 609(E), dated the 2nd July, 1990, amending Notification No. 73/90-CE dated the 20th March, 1990, granting excise duty concession to specified goods required for the establishment of rural telecommunications network by the Department of Telecommunications.

[Placed in Library See No. LT-1366/90 for (1) to (18)]

### LEAVE OF ABSENCE

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have to inform Members that the Chairman has received a letter from Shri R. K. Narayan stating that he has been advised by the doctors not to travel and is, therefore, unable to attend the current Session. He has requested for grant of leave of absence from the sittings of the House during the current Session. Is it the pleasure of the House that permission be granted to Shri R. K. Narayan for remaining absent from the sittings of the House during the current Session?

*(No hon. Member dissented)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Permission to remain absent is granted.

### MOTION FOR ELECTION TO THE RUBBER BOARD

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF COMMERCE (SHRI ARANGIL SHREEDHARAN): Madam Deputy Chairman, I beg to move,

"That in pursuance of clause (e) of sub-section (3) of Section 4 of the Rubber Act, 1947 (24 of 1947) read with sub-rule (1) of rule 4 of the Rubber Rules, 1955, this House do proceed to elect, in such manner as the Chairman may direct one member from among the members of the House to be a member of the Rubber Board."

The question was put and the motion was adopted.

### PERSONAL EXPLANATION BY SHRIMATI MANEKA GANDHI

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, Personal Explanation by Shrimati Maneka Gandhi...

SHRI P. K. KUNJACHEN (Kerala): Madam, on a point of order...

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA (Bihar): Madam, I am also on a point of order....

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let me hear one by one. Mr. Kunjachen.

SHRI P. K. KUNJACHEN: Madam, Rule 241, "Personal Explanation" says,

"A member may, with the permission of the Chairman, make a personal explanation although there is no question before the Council, but in this case no debatable matter may be brought forward, and no debate shall arise."

Madam, only a Member of this House, a Member belonging to this House, has the permission to make a personal explanation. She is a Minister and she is not a Member of this House. So she cannot be allowed to make a personal explanation in this House. If a Minister wants to say anything on behalf of the Government, the Government may come with a statement and the Members have a right to seek clarifications on that statement. So it is very clear...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let me give my ruling...

SHRI P. K. KUNJACHEN: I want your clear ruling.

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA (Rajasthan): Before you give a ruling... *(Interruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let us hear what he wants to say so that I

can give my ruling in peace and quiet.

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA: I also rose on a point of order, Madam.

SOME HON. MEMBERS: We also want to speak.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Not everybody. I will identify one or two Members. Now let me hear what Mr. Kamal Morarka has to say.

SHRI MAKHAN LAL FOTEDAR (Uttar Pradesh): After him, I also want to say something.

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: Madam, the rule quoted by the honourable Member, Mr. Kunjachen, is a very valid rule of this House. We should not set wrong precedents.

The job of the Opposition, the job of the Members, everyday is to point out the faults or slips of the Ministers and the Government is collectively responsible to the House, not individually the Ministers. It is not the job of this House to sit in arbitration in a dispute between the Minister and the Minister of State. It is entirely for the Prime Minister to sort it out. Now, this dispute has been brought into this House. I must say with anguish, Madam, that the matter was raised... (Interruptions)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Order, please. Let us hear him... (Interruptions)...

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: I must say with anguish, Madam, that a very valid point was made by the Members on the other side the other day that they had read in the newspapers that the Minister of State for Environment and Forests had said that she would not answer questions in Parliament and they said that this amounted to contempt of Parliament. A Member like me, who is always alert to the rights and duties of Parliamentarians and the House itself did not say anything further because the Minister was here and the Minister was answering questions.

Now, it is for the Minister and the Minister of State to decide who wants to answer in Parliament... (Interruptions)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please let him finish... (Interruptions)... Please let him finish... (Interruptions)... Order, please... (Interruptions)... Please let him finish... (Interruptions)...

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: Madam, this is my point. It is for the Government to decide who will answer questions on their behalf. But any dispute between a Minister and his or her Minister of State cannot be the subject matter of a discussion in this House. We cannot sit in arbitration. If they have a dispute let the Government and the concerned Minister sort it out; it is for them to sort it out. The point that Mrs. Jayanthi Natarajan raised the other day was relating to some alleged misuse of aircraft, etc., etc. Now, if the Government wants to explain the conduct of its Ministers, they must come forward with a statement and we will ask for clarifications... (Interruptions)... and if the Government does not want to explain, then there is no problem... (Interruptions)... But, safar as the

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN (Tamil Nadu): No; there is problem then... (Interruptions)...

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: If it is a Special Mention, then like all Special Mentions the Government can write to the Members concerned... (Interruptions)... But, as far as the rules go, there is absolutely no provision for this particular Minister to come and make a statement by way of personal explanation. There is no personal allegation and there is no personal explanation. Only a Member of this House can make a personal explanation.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Just a minute... (Interruptions)... Just wait. I will give my ruling... (Interruptions)... I had identified Mr. Ahluwalia and I have to call him now. Yes, Mr. Ahluwalia.

श्री सुरेन्द्रजीत सिंह अहलुवालिया :  
मैडम, हमारे संसद के प्रक्रिया विषयक  
नियम 241 के तहत कहा गया है कि—

“A Member may, with the permission of the Chairman, make a personal explanation although there is no question before the Council. But, in this case, no debatable matter may be brought forward and no debate shall arise.”

मैं इससे पूरी तरह सहमत हूँ।  
पहली बात तो यह कि श्रीमती मेनका  
गांधी जी इस सदन को सदस्या नहीं हैं।  
दूसरी बात, उन्होंने यहां पर्सनल एक्सप्लेनेशन  
देने के पहले दैनिक वांगमन में, हिंदुस्तान  
टाइम्स और इंडियन एक्सप्रेस में कहा है  
कि, “मनता खुलकर वैधान में उतरी।”  
उन्होंने यहां एक्सप्लेनेशन देने के पहले  
जब अवसरों को उसने कारेस्पॉन्डेंस  
रिलीज की है तो यह हमारा अपमान है  
ही, उसके साथ हमारी आज जो लड़ाई है  
वह सिर्फ मेनका गांधी और राजतराय के  
बीच में नहीं है। उन्होंने अपने विभाग  
के सेक्रेटरी और दूसरे अफसरों को भी  
खींचा है जो कि अपना पर्सनल एक्सप्लेनेशन  
देने के लिए यहां नहीं आ सकते।

मेरा सीधा-सा सवाल है कि यह  
पर्सनल एक्सप्लेनेशन श्रीमती मेनका गांधी  
से खत्म नहीं होता हमारा तो आरोप  
इस सरकार के खिलाफ है। इन दोनों  
मंत्रियों के बारे में, इस सेक्रेटरी के बारे  
में है और अगर कोई सही एक्सप्लेनेशन या  
सही जवाब कोई दे सकता है तो वह राजा  
विश्वनाथ प्रताप सिंह दे सकते हैं। राजा  
विश्वनाथ प्रताप सिंह आकर हमें स्पष्ट  
कर सकते हैं। अब हमारी डिमांड है कि  
राजा विश्वनाथ प्रताप सिंह आकर यह  
एक्सप्लेनेशन दें कि उनके विभागों में,  
उनके मंत्रालयों में और उनके मंत्रियों के  
बीच जा झगड़ा हो रहा है और उनके  
मंत्रियों और अफसरों के बीच झगड़ा हो  
रहा है, उसका जवाब दें। हमारी डिमांड  
राजा विश्वनाथ प्रताप सिंह से है, वह  
आकर जवाब दें।

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI (Maha-  
rashtra): Madam, I am on a point of  
order... (Interruptions)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: There  
is no point of order... (Interrup-  
tions)... Everybody is on a point of  
disorder... (Interruptions)... I have  
to call Mrs. Alva now... (Interrup-  
tions)... Yes, Mrs. Alva.

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA  
(Karnataka): Madam, I just want to  
say one thing... (Interruptions)... It  
was said here that a Minister who is  
not a Member of this House cannot  
give a personal explanation. I only  
want to point out that there is a pre-  
cedent in this House when, earlier,  
there was a dispute and when I had  
myself said something about some  
Minister and Mr. C. P. N. Singh...  
(Interruptions)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes,  
on the 17th November 1980... (Inter-  
rptions)...

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA: ...  
who was not a Member of this House,  
was allowed to come and make a  
statement explaining his position. So  
there is a precedent. A Minister has  
come and explained to the House.  
(Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Just a  
minute. Let me deal with this situa-  
tion because these people have raised  
similar points. Let me finish it. If  
you are raising something else... (In-  
terruptions) Listen. On this I will  
give my ruling. I have heard both  
the sides. (Interruptions)

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI: I am not  
quoting from the Rules. But I am  
quoting from the Constitution.  
Under article 88 a Minister can give  
personal explanation, and as my col-  
league has rightly said, when some  
allegations were made by my col-  
league Shri C. P. N. Singh came,  
though he was a Member of the Lok  
Sabha. So under article 88 Shrimati  
Maneka Gandhi was every right to

give a personal explanation (*Interruptions*)

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** I will just allow you for a minute. Please take your seat. Let me just deal with whatever has been stated. Otherwise I will forget what has been told. Let me deal with this.

As Mrs. Margaret Alva has said, on the 17th November 1980 Shri C. P. N. Singh, who was not a Member of this House, came for a personal explanation on some allegation which Mrs. Margaret Alva had made in this House. So there has been a precedent.

Secondly, if Mrs. Maneka Gandhi was only a Member of that House then the Chair would not have allowed any allegation on her. It was allowed because she comes to this House and as a Minister she is answerable to the questions of the Members in both the Houses. And if it was not so I would not have permitted you to say anything about any Member belonging to the other House. So the matter is closed as far as this is concerned.

Secondly, the Chairman in his right has permitted Mrs. Maneka Gandhi to make a personal explanation. That is why she is here (*Interruptions*).

**SHRI VISHVJIT P. SINGH (Maharashtra):** I would request you to kindly allow me. (*Interruptions*)

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** I will hear you provided he will allow me to hear you.

**SHRI VISHVJIT P. SINGH:** I mention two things. I have got two apprehensions. One, the Rule clearly states that no debatable matter shall be revised by way of personal explanation. (*Interruptions*)

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Now you are mistaken.

**SHRI VISHVJIT P. SINGH:** We are going to call for a debate. We are

going to seek a debate on the misuse of the aircraft. That is a debatable matter. We do not want that to be raised as a personal explanation. Two, we do not want that explanation by a Minister to be used as a vehicle to make charges against certain officials. (*Interruptions*)

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Please let me deal with this. Just a minute. I hear you. Please take your seat.

**SHRI VISHVJIT P. SINGH:** I seek your protection.

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** I will give my protection. (*Interruptions*)

**SHRI VISHVJIT P. SINGH:** Clear these two points.

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Okay. (*Interruptions*) Just a minute. About what you referred to, Mr. Vishvjit, would you refer to 'Kaul and Shakh-dher', which explains that when a personal explanation is made, no question, no explanation or no debate will take place? (*Interruptions*) Just a minute. After a personal explanation is made. Secondly, if you have some other matter, you can raise some other point. I do not know what Mrs. Maneka Gandhi has to say. I cannot know what is in her mind. So I will permit her to make a personal explanation. (*Interruptions*)

**AN HON. MEMBER:** You may be knowing it.

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** I do not know. ....(*Interruptions*).... That matter is closed. (*Interruptions*) I have called the Minister. (*Interruptions*) That matter is totally closed. I have called her to make personal explanation, and she is in her right to speak for herself. I am on my right. I have called her, and she is on her right. Chairman has permitted her, and I cannot object to her making a personal explanation. (*Interruptions*) According to the Constitution, article 28, it is her right to make a personal explanation. (*Interruptions*)

[The Deputy Chairman]

Allow her to make her explanation. Please take your seat.

श्री सुरेन्द्र सिंह : (इंटर्रप्शन्) : मैडम, मैं एक बात कहना चाहता हूँ।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No debate or any personal explanation either before or after. I will not allow any debate.

श्री सुरेन्द्र सिंह : : मैडम, मैं एक बात कहना चाहता हूँ। मेरा एक सुझाव है। मेनका जी वही बात कहेंगी जो आ. की प्रैस में है। ... (व्यवधान) ...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please take your seat. He is asking me and not you. When he asks you you are most welcome to answer.

श्री सुरेन्द्र सिंह : : मैडम, मेरा एक सुझाव है। वेह... यह होता कि अगर श्री नीलमणि राउतराय भी यहां पर मौजूद होते। यह जो बात कहेंगी कल को उनकी परसनेल एक्सप्लेनेशन देना होगा और उसके बाद प्रैसला क्या होगा ? ... (व्यवधान) ... क्योंकि उनकी बात में कोई गलत बात नजर नहीं आती। ... व्यवधान) ...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr Chaudhary, when we reach the bridge, we will know how to cross it. So let us, first reach the river.

SHRI JAGESH DESAI (Maharashtra): Madam, I want to draw your attention to Rule 241.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have already called her. Now there is no question of Rule 241.

SHRI JAGESH DESAI: It is very clear. It says :

"A member may, with the permission of the Chairman, make a personal explanation although there is no question..."

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have already given my ruling. I have said

that she has taken permission from the Chairman and the Chairman, in his right, has given her permission. I will not entertain any more explanations. (Interruptions) Please take your seat I have given my ruling and if you want to challenge it, you can't. She is in her right. Mr. Jagesh Desai, may I remind you one thing? Any allegation made against anybody should have come in writing. Mr. Jayanthi Nataraj gave it in writing to the Chairman and took his permission. So, you cannot have two rules in this House. (Interruptions) Then she was also wrong in raising it. I am allowing her to speak. (Interruptions) I am happy that you remember your duty. Thank you very much. I am very happy that you took the permission.

SHRI R. K. DHAWAN (Andhra Pradesh): She did not take any permission from the Chairman. It was a Special Mention.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It was not a Special Mention. I remember every word spoken in the House. (Interruptions) I am not allowing anybody.

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA: It is a debatable issue.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It is not a debatable issue. Sit down.

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA: It is a hundred per cent debatable issue.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I think you are unnecessarily trying to obstruct her personal explanation.

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA: Are you calling Mr. Routray tomorrow? (Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You are obstructing the permission of the Chairman. I say with all the responsibility at my command that you are obstructing the permission given by the Chairman. You have no right. Mr. Chairman has given her permission. I will allow her.

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA: Madam, are you calling the Departmental Secretary tomorrow to give his personal explanation?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You raise it with the Chairman. Please speak, Manekaji.

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA: Are you calling the Departmental Secretary?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am not allowing you. Whatever the Members speak will not go on record while she is speaking.

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA: Your ruling is very unfortunate, Madam.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I ruled it and you cannot challenge my ruling. I have given my ruling and you cannot challenge it.

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA: Madam, I am not challenging your ruling. I am saying this is unfortunate that if she makes some charges against the Environment Secretary, are you going to call the Secretary to give his personal explanation?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please take your seat. (Interruptions) I said, when we reach the bridge we will know how to cross it. We have not even reached the river.

मैंने कहा जो बोला

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF ENVIRONMENT AND FORESTS (SHRIMATI MANEKA GANDHI): Madam Deputy Chairman, I am grateful to the Chairman for having granted permission to make a personal explanation.

(Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please do not interrupt her. I do not want you to interrupt her.

SHRIMATI MANEKA GANDHI: Allegations have been made in this House that as a Minister in the discharge of my responsibilities. I had been less than punctilious about relations with Nepal. Since this matter

was raised in the House when I was not present I would like to establish the correct facts of the matter. I am surprised to note that these allegations are based on an allegedly secret letter supposedly written by the Foreign Secretary to the Secretary of Environment and Forests. I must state that I was not even aware of such a letter until I saw it for the first time in press reports. I am astonished that a secret letter could find its way into the press and is so casually referred to.

(Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No comment on her explanation, please.

SHRIMATI MANEKA GANDHI: I had proposed a visit to the Dudhwa National Park officially. The Park falls within the area of the Modern Forest Fire Control Project run by my Ministry. I was to review this project and also look into complaints that we have received about the Park. Accordingly, my office had asked Secretary, Environment and Forests, on 25-5-1990 to obtain the necessary clearances for the project aircraft to land on the Nepal side of the border which is a few KMs away from the Park. A request to the Ministry of External Affairs had also been sent from the Joint Secretary in my Ministry to make necessary arrangements.

Due to circumstances beyond my control, I had on 29-5-1990 cancelled my visit i.e. three days before the Scheduled departure. The Secretary, E&F, was informed about this the same day. On 30-5-1990, the Joint Secretary concerned had recorded, "I was told by the Secretary, EF, that MOS (E&F) had cancelled her proposed visit to Dudhwa National Park." My APS further reminded the Ministry in writing on the 31st. Thus, the officials concerned had sufficient time to inform the Ministry of External Affairs and/or the Indian Embassy in Nepal of the cancellation of my programme. Apparently this was not done.

[Shrimati Maneka Gandhi]

Further, if due to the oversight of the officials concerned, some embarrassment had been caused, this should have been brought to my notice immediately so that I could have expressed proper regret to the Royal Nepal Government for any inconvenience caused due to circumstances beyond my control. However, this was not brought to my notice and I first learnt about it from the press reports a few days ago and then from allegations made in this House.

There has also been an allegation that the Government of Nepal was requested to lay a runway and trees were cut to facilitate it. This is not based on facts. The Dhangarhi airfield in Nepal is a controlled airfield with an existing pucca runway which is regularly used by twin otter aircraft.

Secondly, some totally incorrect accusations relating to the use of aircraft have also been made. It has been alleged that out of a total of 294 hours that the aircraft has flown, I have used it for 290 hours. I would like to clarify that it has been used for 71 hours flying time logged by the Project aircraft since I became Minister. I have used it for 8 hours. Of these 8 hours, 6 hours were logged in visiting the Project area for work relating to the Project. 2 hours were outside the Project area to Jaipur on World Environment Day, i.e. 5th June, 1990. It is pertinent to note here that as far as demonstration flight is concerned, 10 States; of which Rajasthan is one, have asked for the demonstration of the plane. Previously this plane had gone for demonstration to Arunachal Pradesh Nagaland and Manipur for over 20 hours. As I had to attend official functions in Rajasthan, Haryana and Delhi within the space of a few hours, these six official function all of which had to do with major policy announcements were to be fulfilled on World Environment Day between the period of 7 AM to 5 PM. Only because of this exceptionally heavy schedule was the aircraft of the Ministry employed. It has also

been stated that the Minister of State for Environment and Forests was spending extra money on petrol when the whole country was trying to conserve petrol. Even though the eight-hour-use of a plane out of 71 hours is a minor thing, I would still like to clarify this point. It may be pointed out that 120 litres are consumed by the highly fuel-efficient Piper Seneca plane for a flight to Bareilly and back. Two Ambassador cars, one for the Minister and one for the security, would consume more petrol. Added to this is the saving in travelling time from 12 hours to 1 and half hours.

Finally, about my passionate concern with issues that far transcend narrow and transitory concern of the moment, issues that involve the well-being of entire living systems, concern of global importance, I need not have to be apologetic nor explain anything. That is why this example of a selective leak of documents is not much more than an attempt at maligning me. I reject it. My concerns remain. My endeavours shall continue.

I would like to thank the Chairman again, for giving me the opportunity to clarify the truth, and the hon. Members, for patiently listening to it.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No point of order on this. This matter is closed. (*Interruptions*) I am not permitting any point of order. Nothing will go on record regarding this matter. (*Interruptions*) I would request hon. Members. Let us maintain the dignity of the House. (*Interruptions*) The Minister has given her personal explanation and the matter is closed.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Madam, I want to say something... (*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Look at Kaul and Shakhder and then

come back. (*Interruptions*) If you have anything, please come and tell me in the Chamber. This matter before the House is closed.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Let me say something.

SHRI A.G. KULKARNI: Madam, I would like to make a submission. (*Interruptions*)

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: I want to say something else. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Kulkarni wants to say something. I will allow you later on.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Madam, I am not going to say anything about the personal explanation given by the hon. Minister which arose out of the allegations I had made. I accept your ruling totally. I am not going to say anything about it. Nor did I interrupt her. I only want to point out that the hon. Minister has replied to me. She sent a personal letter to me after I raised certain allegations against her in the House. She has only referred to one part of it which I am not touching. I am not touching on it because I know the rule.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mrs. Natarajan, I am not going to allow any discussion on this matter. This matter regarding the personal explanation is closed.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Not that matter at all. I am saying something else.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Not connected with that matter? Not connected with her?

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Not connected with her personal explanation.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Not connected with that matter?

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Not that matter. My point is different. The point is, there have been Press reports today that the hon. Minister of State has made certain allegations against the Cabinet Minister.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That again arises out of it. (*Interruptions*) Please, I would request you... (*Interruptions*) Now, I will tell you how you can raise it if you want to raise it in the House. Please write a letter to the Chairman and if the Chairman permits you, I will allow you. I cannot allow you to raise any other matter. (*Interruptions*) I am not going to permit. I am not going to allow new precedents in the House.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: No new precedents, Madam.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please help me in keeping the dignity of the House.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: I am not going into the scandals.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am telling you. Please help me.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Madam, we are only concerned that there should not be any misuse of official position by anybody.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That matter is closed. You can write to the Chairman and I promise, if he permits you, I will allow you.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: I am appealing to you.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You can appeal to me.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Please listen to me.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: A personal letter cannot be read in the House.



SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: I am not reading it.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You cannot even mention it. It is a private correspondence. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI R. K. DHAWAN: What about the allegation in the press today?

(*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You write a letter to the Chairman. If he permits you, I will permit you, I am not objecting. (*Interruptions*). Abide by the rules. Write a letter to the Chairman. I am not allowing you on this matter any more. You write to the Chairman and get the permission. (*Interruptions*). Let me allow somebody else. Yes, Appasaheb. (*Interruptions*). He was getting up otherwise also.

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI: I want to draw the attention of the House and the Government to a serious confusion that is throughout prevailing in this country. This Government, the Prime Minister made some announcement on the Mandal Commission report. As far as I am concerned, I had personally supported the Mandal Commission, that is in the Business Advisory Committee, though, but the way in which this Government is behaving, the way in which various Ministers are behaving and making announcements, is making a mockery of the high traditions of the Government administration.

Madam, yesterday when I was looking at the T.V., I found my friend, Mr. Chimanbhai Mehta, making an announcement that the reservations were not meant for admission to the schools and colleges, there the merit will stand. I do not know how Mr. Chimanbhai Mehta, the Minister of State for Education...

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA: He is a marticulate

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No such allegation. You have to substantiate that you were with him in the college. Have some dignity.

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY: (Andhra Pradesh): There are no educational qualifications prescribed for Ministers. They are not required to submit their bio-data. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI: Now the point is, Shri Chimanbhai Mehta's announcement yesterday gave a different twist to the announcement made by the Prime Minister about the Mandal Commission report. Again, Shri Biju Patnaik has made an announcement from Orissa that he is not going to accept the Mandal Commission report. Therefore, I want to know whether this National Front Government or the Janata Dal Government has any constitution in the party. Everybody is pulling the legs of the Prime Minister and making different announcements. My colleague Mr. Yashwant Sinha has made another statement.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will not like anybody's legs to be pulled in this House.

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI: What is this Government for? Is it a party of... (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Kulkarni, please take your seat. I have to call other people. (*Interruptions*). The matter is over. (*Interruptions*). That is all right, Mr. Yashwant Sinha. (*Interruptions*). Just a minute please... I heard you.

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI: So, Madam, I request the Prime Minister to make a clear statement about what the Government's view is on Mandal Commission so that all confusion is removed.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Okay, just a minute... I have permitted him. He has something to say about the Order Paper. Let me find out what is not in order.

श्री रजनी रंजन साहू (बिहार) :  
पहले आपने मुझे कहा था बोलने के लिए।

उप-सभापति : मैं कितना से नहीं कहती हूँ। मैं प्रायः लोगों से यह कहती हूँ, और यह कहा भी था कि आप बैठ जाइये।

श्री रजनी रंजन साहू : आपने कहा था इतना देना।

उप-सभापति : मैंने आपसे यह कहा था कि आप बैठ जाइये। इसलिए आप बैठ जाइये।

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: (Bihar): I want to raise a matter relating to the Order Paper. It says that there will be further discussion on the new industrial Policy which was raised by Shri Ram Jethmalani on the 20th August—i.e. ten days from now. Madam, we have noticed on many days that this subject has appeared in the Order Paper but has never come up.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: And has disappeared.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Yes, it has disappeared. There are many of us who feel that the Industrial Policy should be discussed in this House. We had hoped that when this matter came up, we would get an opportunity to say what we wanted to say on this. I feel, we are being denied the right as Members of this House to discuss this Industrial Policy.

Madam, I am quite sure, the way in which the Order Paper is made today, this will not come up because for the other discussion which started yesterday—Short Duration Discussion on Sri Lanka—a specific time is mentioned—5.30 p.m. We had agreed yesterday that we would take it up at 5.30. Now there is no time mentioned for the Industrial Policy discussion. I am only appealing to you, Madam Deputy Chairman, and through you the Members

of this House and especially the Members of the Business Advisory Committee, let us take the matter of Industrial Policy seriously. Let us fix a specific time when we must take it up on any other day because it is not likely to come up even today.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Just a minute. Let this one matter be settled, otherwise इस मामले को वहीं हल होना जो इंडस्ट्रियल पॉलिसी का हो रहा है।

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH (West Bengal): One thing more. I want to draw your kind attention to another Supplementary List of Business circulated today in the morning about clarifications on the statement of the Minister of Finance, laid on the Table the other day, about the budgetary deficit.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That will be after this.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: It has been mentioned: "To be taken up immediately after the conclusion of the 'further discussion on the new Industrial Policy' entered in the main agenda for the day". I do not know how the day is construed, how many hours the day consists of!

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: To me a day is of 24 hours, or maybe 26 hours.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: I am only raising this point to emphasise that we should be a little more serious while circulating any supplementary item for discussion, because already as Mr. Yashwant Sinha, has said, the Industrial Policy is not likely to come up...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Dipen Ghosh, just one second. Please take your seat. I will explain this. About this matter of industrial Policy discussion which is not even disposed of yet, there were Members like Mr. Jagesh Desai and some others who raised the objection— I

think you were also one of them—that the Industrial Policy discussion had disappeared from the Order Paper. So we saw to it that whatever was leftover business should come on the Order Paper and accordingly we go about it. Now we cannot—neither you, nor I—in the present circumstances guarantee at what time any discussion will start and stop. So keeping that point in view, it was suggested—and I said from the floor, perhaps, on your recommendation—that we should continue and finish whatever was the left-over business. Fortunately we had some more business yesterday which unfortunately could not be finished because Members refused to sit beyond 6 o'clock. I implored upon the Members, please, if we are serious about issues, let us.... Mr. Jages Desai, it is impossible. You are a member of the Business Advisory Committee it is impossible to allocate four hours for a discussion on one subject and three hours on another and another two hours on something else—which can be extended by Members not abiding by their limited time, to finish it before six o'clock. Count from 12 o'clock, minus one hour for lunch, till six o'clock and please tell me how many hours are there. ... (Interruptions) ...

SHRI JAGESH DESAI: If we are sitting till six o'clock. ...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: All right, tell me. I have put a question to you... (Interruptions)... Please sit down. I request you to count how many hours we have. With 14 Special Mentions which we haven't yet started, you tell me how to expand the time. That is why we have not specified any time on the order paper. As soon and as early as we finish the left over business, we will go ahead, one by one, with all the important issues. Now let me go ahead with my business. ... (Interruptions). ... All this business is unlisted. ... (Interruptions)... One minute, please.

श्री रजनी रंजन साहू : सारे स्कूल बंद कर दिये गये हैं, उनके मां-बाप परेशान हैं... (व्यवधान) । इस पर कृपया हमारी बात ली सुनिये ।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Just a minute. ... (Interruptions)... Please take your seat. I am only trying to say this. We have had a long discussion. Unfortunately, when a matter comes up, everybody agrees. Now I have a listed business. These things which you are raising now are out of context from the business which is listed before me. Now, who is going to account for this time?

श्री रजनी रंजन साहू : महोदया, जरा कृपया हमारी बात ली सुनिये । दिल्ली में सारे स्कूल बंद कर दिये गये हैं... (व्यवधान) ।

SHRI SYED SIBTEY RAZI (Uttar Pradesh): Madam, the Delhi Administration has announced that all the Delhi schools—whether they are Government schools or aided schools, recognized institutions or public schools, all — will be closed from today... (Interruptions)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You can speak to the Parliamentary Affairs Minister... (Interruptions)...

SHRI SYED SIBTEY RAZI: Madam, it is a very important matter. The future of lakhs and lakhs of students is jeopardized, and Vice-Chancellors of all the Universities are resenting these instructions of the Government. The Home Minister called them and pressurized them to close down the Delhi University, Jamia Millia and the Jawaharlal Nehru University. All the Vice-Chancellors, Professors and Lecturers say that this way the situation will become more provocative. In U.P., three Universities have already been closed down. Now the Government is intervening in the working of the academic institutions and the Vice-Chancellors are being pressurized.

the Government has failed to maintain law and order in Delhi. Now, I demand the resignation of the Home Minister because he has been an utter failure and this Government is intervening in the working of the academic bodies... (Interruptions).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have heard you. Now you have asked for his resignation. Please take your seat... (Interruptions)... you do not have to be so long in making your point.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY (Uttar Pradesh): Madam, I have a point of order.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Madam, I pointed out about the imposition of Hindi, yesterday... (Interruptions)...

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: Madam, the Chairman has very kindly given me permission to make a Special Mention on the Bofors issue. I would like to know whether the Minister for Commerce, Mr. Arun Nehru, can also be present while I make this Special Mention.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: What is it about?

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: The Chairman has given me permission.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let me look at the list... (Interruptions)... Please I will look at the list. Just a minute.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: It is a Special Mention on Bofors.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let me go through the list. Just let me see... (Interruptions)... Just a second. It is No. 13 I will allow you when No. 13 comes.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: But can you ask the Commerce Minister, Mr. Arun Nehru, to be present so that he can reply?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I cannot ask anybody to be present. That is beyond my jurisdiction... (Interruptions)...

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Madam, as I have said, the three Chief Ministers who met at Indore have passed a resolution that all Government business should be conducted only in Hindi, and I raised apprehensions that people from the South would not be able to... (Interruptions)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have got your paper. I will allow you in a proper manner.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Madam, what has happened is, later, the Minister, Mr. Unnikrishnan...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please take your seat. Now, these matters are not listed. Mrs. Natarajan, you cannot take the House for granted. I have got listed business. I am not allowing you.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: I am asking your permission, Madam.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No. Please don't ask for permission. Now it is too late.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: I have a problem. I asked it in the beginning.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You should have taken my permission in advance. Please, no.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Madam, the problem is...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have to run this House.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Yes, Madam. Only one more sentence. I will sit down.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Allow me to run the House.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Only one more sentence. I will sit down. Mr. Unnikrishnan has said ....

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please take your seat.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: One more sentence only, Madam.

SHRI SANGH PRIYA GAUTAM: (Uttar Pradesh): Madam,...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, please. Don't learn such habits. You are a new Member. Start a new tradition, good tradition. (Interruptions) Please take your seat.

Mrs. Jayanthi Natarajan, please take your seat. I am not permitting you.

श्री संघ प्रिय गौतम : मुझे बहुत अफसोस है कि जो वइस-चेयरमैन के पैल पर हैं, वे जो चेयर का प्रदर नहीं करते तो हम लोगों का क्या होगा मुझे अफसोस के साथ कहना पड़ रहा है कि जो वइस चेयरमैन के पैल पर हैं वे चेयर का प्रदर नहीं करते, उनके कहने को नहीं मानें तो हम कैसे लोगों का क्या होगा ! बड़ी गर्व की बात है :

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Madam....

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please take your seat I said, "Please take your seat."

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Madam, he said something about me.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: If he has said something about you, you can write to him. You can write to me. You can take my permission to make a special mention. I will permit you, but not like this.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: It has gone on record, Madam. (Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Which record?,

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: On the official record. Whatever he has said, has gone on record.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will look into the record. Let me see the record.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: You heard it, what he said, Madam.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Who?

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: What this gentlemen spoke about me.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He said, "You are a Vice-Chairman."

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: He said that I did not respect the Chair. (Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He said, "You are a Vice-Chairman. You should respect the ruling of the Chair."

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: He said that I did not respect the ruling of the Chair.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Then, I will request you to respect the ruling of the Chair.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Are you not giving me the right to reply?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am not giving you permission. Please take your seat. Don't argue.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Not that permission, what you said.

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** You are not listening to me. (*Interruptions*) Please take your seat. Let me finish with the business in my hand. Don't argue.

**SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN:** I have closed this matter. But you are going to allow that to stay on record.

श्री संघ फि गीतम : जो सही है वह क्यों नहीं लिखा गया ?

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Please, let us not have a dispute on such matters. Please take your seat.

**SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN:** Madam, I have a right to reply.

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** You have the right, but not immediately.

**SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN:** When will you give me, Madam?

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Tomorrow. You have the right. I will give you permission. You come. Just a minute. When any Member comes in proper order according to the rules. I will never object to anybody. (*Interruptions*)

**SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN:** It is very unfortunate, Madam. (*Interruptions*) I have never challenged your ruling.

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** All right. Now I am going to special mentions. Shri Ram Awadhesh Singh. Not here. Shri Rajni Ranjan Sahu.

श्री रजनी रंजन साहू : प्रोपन मैशन के पहले मैं यह कहना चाहता हूँ कि जो...

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Speak on your special mention.

**SHRI DIPEN GHOSH:** Let Mrs. Jayanthi Natarajan be in the Chair. (*Interruptions*)

**SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN:** You are not allowing me. (*Interruptions*)

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** I will allow you. Let me have proper order. Mrs. Natarajan, the written business I must conduct. Do you not agree that the Chair should go ahead with the written business? Everybody is raising the issue that we are not going through the business of the House.

If he has said anything I am going to see the record, and I will remove what is derogatory. I will never allow anything against any Member, whether Vice-Chairman or anybody else, to go on record, which is derogatory. But let us see the record. In this noise I cannot hear what is happening.

**SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY:** I agree:

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Would you also be attentive?

**SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY:** I am attentive, Madam.

**SHRI RAJNI RANJAN SAHU:** Madam, I would like to draw the attention of this House, through you first of all to the fact that about 1 to 20 boys of ten years of age have been locked up.

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Is it your special mention?

**SHRI RAJNI RANJAN SAHU:** I am coming to that.

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** The special mention is about alleged misuse of junk export. Are you coming to junk export through boys?

**SHRI RAJNI RANJAN SAHU:** First of all, the Government should take care of those boys.

Now I am coming to my special mention.

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Okay. Your first concern has been recorded. Now go to the special mention.