

Committee, copies of which are available in the Parliament Library. Major recommendations have been accepted and implemented by the Government.

#### Use of BVO in soft drinks

1349. SHRI GHUFRAN AZAM; Will the Minister of HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE be pleased to state;

(a) whether Government are aware that the Parle Exports have declared that BVO is not used in manufacture of Gold Spot, Limca, etc.

(b) if so, to what extent the declaration of Parle Exports is correct; and

(c) what further steps are contemplated by Government to check the use of BVO by soft drink manufacturer throughout the country?

THE MINISTER OF STATE OF THE MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE (SHRI RASHEED MASOOD): (a) to (c) M/s. Parle Pro-ducts|Parle Beverages have informed the Ministry of Food Processing Industries that BVO is not used in manufacture of Gold Spot and Limca.

The Ministry of Food Processing Industries has issued instructions to their regional offices to inspect the stocks in the factory and in the market and to draw samples for the purpose of ensuring that these are free from BVO.

The Ministry of Health and Family Welfare has also issued instructions to the States/JU.Ts. to ensure that soft drinks marketed after 15-4-90 are free from BVO;

A's per information made available by Delhi Administration, 2 samples of Gold Spot and one sample of Limca manufactured by two bottling companies in Delhi have been found to contain BVO.

#### SITUATION ARISING OUT OF MURDER OF AN INDEPENDENT CANDIDATE IN MEHAM

THE LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER); Mr. Chairman, Sir, what has happened in Meham and what has come to be learnt thereafter, is a total disgrace to democracy in this country. From the way things are going on, it is a case of chaos, double-standards, leading to in a situation where democracy cannot work in Haryana, in any form. Even the Central Government, whose constituent is ruling Haryana, is helplessly watching the situation and indirectly abetting what has been happening Haryana. Sir, to go into the facts a little, which have come out on the basis of our party members having gone there to Meham and finding out the facts,.... (*Interruptions*).

SHRI JAGDISH PRASAD MATHUR (Uttar Pradesh): Sir, I am on a point of order. Is he moving any resolution or is he just making a submission? (*Interruptions*).

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER; I have already moved the resolution. (*Interruptions*). I am not moving any formal resolution. I am going to say what I have to say. (*Interruptions*).

**श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर : आपने पहले कहा था कि वहां की गवर्नमेंट डिसमिस की जाए, इसको मूव करना चाहते हैं . . (अवधान)**

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER; I am explaining the purpose for which I sought suspension of the Question Hour. And I am doing so under the permission of the Chairman. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI CHATURANAN MISHRA (Bihar); I want to know whether there is any motion which you are moving again because this motion has already been carried and the Question Hour stands suspended. What next are we taking up? The Chair should tell us what next we are taking up. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: Sir, have you permitted him to...*(Interruptions)*.

SHRI CHAUTRANAN MISHRA: After having suspended the Question Hour, what business do we have next?

SHRI T. R. BALU (Tamil Nadu): The Chair should inform us.

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: In support of.....*(Interruptions)*.

THE MINISTER OF ENERGY WITH ADDITIONAL CHARGE OF THE MINISTRY OF CIVIL AVIATION (SHRI ARIF MOHD. KHAN): Sir, it na? to be either a motion or a resolution. There has to be something before the House. Now that the Question Hour has been suspended, we should know what we are going to discuss. And it should be in the form of...*(Interruptions)*'.

MR. CHAIRMAN: The Question Hour has been suspended for discussing the fall-out of the killing of an independent candidate in Meham...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI JAGDISH PRASAD MATHUR  
In what form. are we discussing?...  
*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: Mathurji, I will make the position clear...*(Interruptions)*... Mr. Chairman, Sir, if you kindly recall. I sought the suspension of the Question Hour to discuss the motion which I moved...*(Interruptions)*...

SOME HON. MEMBERS: Which one?  
...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: Will you allow me or not?...*(Interruptions)*... You don't allow me...*(Interruptions)*...

THE LEADER OF THE HOUSE (SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY): There is no motion...*(Interruptions)*... The motion was to suspend the Question Hour...*(Interruption)*... There was no motion...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: It was specifically said...*(Interruptions)*... When I moved the motion, I specifically said that the Ministry in Haryana should be dismissed and the President's rule should be imposed there...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY:  
This is out of order...*(Interruptions)*... Mr. Chairman, Sir, we cannot discuss this motion for the dismissal of a State Government here. We can't do that...*(Interruptions)*... No, we can't do fiat...*(Interruptions)*... No, no, we can't do that...*(Interruptions)*... Simply we can't do that...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: For the present, only the Question Hour is suspended. If you people want that there should be a motion, he is putting a motion...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: No, Sir. They are discussing the Meham incident. You said that they have moved the motion...*(Interruptions)*... It is out of order, Sir...*(Interruptions)*... They are discussing the Meham incident...*(Interruptions)* They are discussing the Meham incident...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: That would be the conclusion of my motion...*(Interruptions)*... That would be my conclusion...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY:  
I would like that the Chair should give a ruling on this. This House is not competent to discuss the motion...*(Interruptions)*... asking for the dismissal of a State Government...*(Interruptions)*... No, no, Sir...*(Interruptions)*... No, this can't be discussed...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: As a result of which I am demanding...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY:  
We cannot dismiss a legally-constituted government in a State...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. YELAMAMCHILI SIVAJI (Andhra Pradesh): Sir, we move a motion for imposing President's rule in Andhra Pradesh.. . . (Interruptions). . . We move a motion to suspend the Government of Andhra Pradesh. . . . (Interruptions). . . We move a motion to dismiss the Andhra Pradesh Government... (Interruptions)

THE MINISTER OF INFORMATION AND BROADCASTING AND PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRI P. UPENDRA); Sir, if at all there is a case for the dismissal of a State Government then the Andhra Pradesh Government should be dismissed first... (Interruptions) . . .

MR. CHAIRMAN: The motion which has been carried is that Rule 38 be suspended and the situation arising out of the Meham incident. . . (Interruptions) . . .

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI SUBODH KANT SAHAY); Sir, they are not interested.. (Interruptions) . . .

MR. CHAIRMAN: ... be discussed and the discussion is going on. That is all... (Interruptions) . . .

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA (West Bengal); Sir, on a point of order... (Interruptions) . . . Sir, I am on a point of order. . . (Interruptions) . . . Sir, my point of order is that under the rules, notice of a motion shall be given in writing addressed to the Secretary-General.. (Interruptions) . . . Sir, Rule 168 says that notice of a motion shall be given in writing.. (Interruptions) ... addressed to the Secretary-General . . . (Interruptions)... I would like to know whether such a notice has been given to the Secretary-General. . . (Interruptions) ...

MR. CHAIRMAN: The motion which has been carried is that the House discuss this particular situation arising out of the Meham incident. . . (Interruptions) ...

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Under what rule? • (Interruptions) • Under what rule, Sir?.. (Interruptions) ...

MR. CHAIRMAN: My ruling is there. (Interruptions)...

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA; What is the ruling?.. (Interruptions) . . .

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER; You don't have respect for the ruling of the Chair even?.. (Interruptions) . . . You do not have any respect for the ruling of the Chair.. (Interruptions).. You do not have respect for the ruling of the Chair? . . . (Interruptions) . . . You don't respect the Chairman's ruling?... (Interruptions)... It is surprising. . . (Interruptions) . . . Sir, see these people. . . (Interruptions) See the Treasury Benches misbehaving.. (Interruptions).. The Treasury Benches are misbehaving... (Interruptions).. They are not yielding to the Chair's ruling.. (Interruptions).. This is surprising... (Interruptions)... Sir, this is their democracy.....(Interruptions),,, Sir, this is democracy... (Interruptions) . . .

THE LEADER OF THE HOUSE (SHRI M.S. GURUPADASWAMY) : If they want to discuss Meham, it has already been discussed. . . (Interruptions)

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER; Sir, I am not allowed to speak. . . (Interruptions). . . This is their respect for democracy?... (Interruptions) . . .

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY; Sir, there cannot be a second discussion on Meham. . . (Interruptions) . . . There cannot be a discussion again on Meham in this House.. (Interruptions)... It has already been discussed in the House.. (Interruptions) . . .

MR. CHAIRMAN: Will you all keep quiet?.. (Interruptions).. Will you all keep quiet? This . . . disorderly conduct . . . (Interruptions).. . . does not help anybody. Now, I have said something earlier and I will have to repeat the same thing . . . (Interruptions) . . .

SHRI SUKBOHDH KANT SAHAY: They are not interested. . . (Interruptions). . . It has already been discussed, ... (Interruptions) . . .

MR. CHAIRMAN: You are all bound by the decision.. (Interruptions).. . . We are all bound by the decision of the House... (Interruptions).. . . The discussion has been permitted by the House. The Rule has been suspended by the House. Now, Mr. Shiv Shanker.. (Interruptions) . . .

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: Sir, the ruling has already been given. . . (Inter, ruptious). . . This is the democracy of the Treasury Benches. . . (Interruptions) ... They do not even allow me to speak. . . (Interruptions). . . The Chair has given the ruling.. (Interruptions)..:

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY; Meham cannot be discussed again. Meham has been discussed already. You cannot have a second discussion -on Meham again. (Interruptions)

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: Why not after new facts have come to our notice (Interruptions), Sir, am I permitted to speak? May I proceed with my speech? (Interruptions). They are worried of the facts that I would reveal and that is why they are not allowing the House to function. (Interruptions)'. Sir, I stood up to Speak. They ; v not permitting me to speak even, I am speakng under your permission. They do not have respect for the Chair. This is what.. . (Interruptions). If the Ministers themselves want to murder democracy . . (Interruptions).

SHRI P. UPENDRA: What is that (In. terruptions),

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: You people do not allow me to speak. The Question Hour has been suspended and I have been pirmitted to speak. You do not want to allow me to speak. Even Ministers are , joining the chorus and they would not like me to speak. If this is the approach of the treasury benches, what else is Shere In this country except murder of democracy? (Interruptions). What more proof people require that democracy is murdered in this country? (Interruptions).

[THE BBPOTY CHAIRMAN (in the Chair)]

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN; Please Sit down.

SHRII P. SHIV SHANKER: K you don't allow me to speak, that is the murder of democracy. You are responsible for that.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The Question Hour' has been Suspended by

the Chairman. If everybody feels that democracy is being Curtailed. . .

SHRI MAKHAN LAL FOTEDAR (Utt-r Pradesh): Democracy is in peril. (Interruptions)

डा. अमरेश कुमार खान (राजस्थान) : हरियाणा में इन्होंने जनतंत्र की हत्या कर दी, निर्दोष लोगों को मारा है, 17 वर्ष की लड़की को मारा है, कई निर्दोष लोगों को मारा है . . . (व्यवधान) . . .

SHRI M. M. JACOB (Kerala): Nothing short of Presidents rule in Haryana is going to satisfy iis

SHRI P.. SHIV SHANKER:I was called upon to speak. You don't allow me to speak. This is the democracy you want. (Interruptions) Chairman his ruled. I started my speech. You are not allowing me to speak. You are the murderers of democracy.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN; I request thi' hon. Members to go back to their seats. If you don't go back, I will adjourn the House. The House is adjourned for one hour.

The House then adjourned at forty-six minutes past eleven of the clock,

Th; House re-a5sembled at forty-five minutes past twelve of the clock,

The Deputy Chairman in the Chair.

#### SITUATION ARISING OUT OF MURDER OF AN INDEPENDENT CANDIDATE IN MEHAM—Contd.

श्री सुदेशजीत सिंह अहलुवालिया (बिहार) महोदया, मेहम घटनाओं में यह देखें जो निहत्थों पर गोली बरसायी गयी है और जिसमें 2-3 महिलायें तो मर गयीं स्पष्ट पर एक महिला जिंदगी और मौत की लड़ाई रोहतास मेडिकल कालेज में लड़ रही है और ऐसे . . . (व्यवधान)

उपस्थिति : अहलुवालिया जी, यह हाइको की गरिमा के खिलाफ है। कभी पहले भी अगर किसी ने इस तरह के हार बगैरा पहने हैं तो उसको एकाउ नहीं किया है। मेरी आपसे रिक्-

[उप सभापति]

बेस्ट है कि ... (व्यवधान) मेरी खाली आपसे रिक्वेस्ट है और उससे ज्यादा मैं कुछ कह नहीं सकती कि यह हाऊस की गरिमा के खिलाफ है।

श्री सुरेन्द्रजीत सिंह ग्रहलुवालिया : वे जनतंत्र की रक्षा करें।

उपसभापति : ठीक है मगर,

I only request you. If you agree, it is fine. If you do not agree, it is up to you.

(Interruptions)

श्री सुरेन्द्रजीत सिंह ग्रहलुवालिया : और यहां पर जो देश में जनतंत्र है, हत्याएं हो रही हैं उसकी रक्षा करने में असफल हो रहा है यह हाऊस और यहां पर... (व्यवधान)

डा. रत्नाकर पांडेय : जनतंत्र की हत्या हो रही है और वी०पी० सिंह के इशारे पर यह सब हो रहा है। या तो राष्ट्रपति शासन वहां लागू कराईये या इस्तीफा दें।

उपसभापति : जस्ट ए मिनिट। चेयरमैन साहब ने परमिशन दी है, आप चाह रहे हैं शिव शंकर जी बोले या नहीं चाह रहे हैं।

You want Shiv Shankerji to speak or not? You do not want him to speak? All right.

(Interruptions)

श्री शान्ति त्यागी : मंडम, चौटाल को गिरफ्तार करके मंगवाईये आप हाऊस में।

उपसभापति : शिव शंकर जी को चेयरमैन साहब ने इजाजत दी है मेहम पर बोलने की। आप उनको बोलने देंगे या नहीं। मेहम में जो यह वाक्या हुआ उस पर चेयरमैन साहब ने क्वेश्चन आवर सस्पेंड करके इजाजत दी है। मैं समझती हूं कि आप उनको बोलने दीजिये। लीडर आफ अपोजिशन को सुनने की इजाजत दीजिये, तशरीफ रखिये।

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: Madam... (Interruptions)

डा. रत्नाकर पांडेय : मेडम, राष्ट्रपति शासन वहां लागू कराईये।

उपसभापति : आप भाषण में यह सब जरूर बोलिये, मुझे कोई ऐतराज नहीं है। मेम्बर्स को हक है कि भाषण में कुछ भी बोल सकता है। पर बोलने तो दीजिये आपके लीडर को। उसके बाद जो कुछ होगा... (व्यवधान)

श्री सुरेन्द्र सिंह (हरियाणा) : मेडम, प्राइम मिनिस्टर हो या होम मिनिस्टर, कोई तो सदन में हों।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Shiv Shanker, may I request you? There are some Papers to be laid on the Table

SOME HON. MEMBERS: No, no.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am asking. That is the regular business of the House. We suspended the Question Hour. (Interruptions)

SHRI HANSRAJ BHARDWAJ (Madhya Pradesh): I don't think any other business is more important than protecting democracy. (Interruptions)

श्री सुरेन्द्र सिंह : इतना सीरियस इश्यु है एक प्रांत की जम्हूरियत के बारे में। फरवरी में चुनाव हुआ, मर्डर पर मर्डर। अब यह दुबारा काउंटरपेड यह चुनाव हुआ, कंडीडेट को मार दिया गया और इस सदन में पिछले सीटिंग से यह बहस चल रही है और न तो होम मिनिस्टर हैं और न प्राइम मिनिस्टर इस सदन में हैं और इस बात को यह सरकार सीरियस तौर से नहीं ले रही है। मेरी आपसे प्रार्थना यह है कि यह बहुत सीरियस ला एण्ड आर्डर का, डेमोक्रेसी का, सर्वाइवल का, सवाल है और प्राइम मिनिस्टर, होम मिनिस्टर सदन में कोई न हो।

श्री सुरेन्द्रजीत सिंह ग्रहलुवालिया : पहले उन्हें बुलाया जाये।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You want me to give my ruling? *(Interruptions)* If you want to continue, you can continue. But if you want me to comment on something, let me comment. *(Interruptions)* Please take your seats. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY (Pondicherry): Neither the Prime Minister nor the Home Minister comes to the House. *(Interruptions)*

श्री शंकर दयाल सिंह (बिहार) : सदन  
रूल के अनुसार चलता है। सभापति जी  
यहाँ बैठे हुए थे उस वक्त लीडर आफ  
द ओपोजिशन ने मूव किया कि प्रश्न-  
काल स्थगित किया जाए . . . . .  
(व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It will not go on record. Anybody's observations, "who Speaks without my permission, will not go on record,

SHRI SHANKAR DAYAL SINGH;\* *(Interruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please sit down. I have asked Mr. Shiv Shanker to speak. *(Interruptions)* We suspended the Question Hour for this purpose. *(Interruptions)* If you do not want Mr. Shiv Shanker to Speak, I have no objection. *(Interruptions)* The Leader of the Opposition requested the Chair that the Question Hour should be suspended and the Question Hour was suspended to discuss the situation in Meham. Now, I have asked Mr. Shiv Shanker to speak. *(Interruptions)*

श्री सुरेन्द्र सिंह : मेरा प्वाइंट आफ  
आर्डर है . . . .

श्री राम नरेश यादव (उत्तर प्रदेश) :  
मेरा व्यवस्था के प्रश्न का क्या हुआ ?  
(व्यवधान)

उपसभापति : : कोई प्वाइंट आफ  
आर्डर नहीं होता। (व्यवधान)

SHRI P. UPENDRA: Madam, is there a Motion? *(Interruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: There was a Motion that the situation in Meham arising out of the murder of an independent candidate Should be discussed. The Chairman had permitted it. Therefore, I have permitted him. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM (Andhra Pradesh); Madam, we have given notice of a Motion to discuss the situation in Andhra Pradesh Are you going to allow it or not?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: When the Chairman permits a discussion on Andhra Pradesh, we can take it up. Now, Mr. Shiv Shanker please. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: I have been making consistent efforts from the morning when the Chairman permitted me to speak to make our point of view very clear. But unfortunately, friends on the other side— it is regrettable—have not allowed me to speak and I make position absolutely clear . . *(Interruptions)*.

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS AND THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF TOURISM (SHRI SATYA PAL MALIK): We are not prepared for any debate with this nonsense. They should learn to behave, otherwise there will be no debate. Either Mr. Shiv Shankar says that he can discipline them, otherwise we will not allow him to speak. .

SHRI P. UPENDRA: Let him control his own men. . . *(Interruptions)*

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: They are only expressing their anguish and anxiety . . . *(Interruptions)* I would like to give you an assurance that if my friends on this side are vociferous, that is only to express the anxiety and anguish that they have. . . *(Interruptions)*

SHRI SATYA PAL MALIK: The House cannot be run like this There will be no debate... *(Interruptions)*

---

\*Not recorded

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN Excuse me . . . Just a minute. . . The Question Hour was suspended for the Leader of the Opposition to speak. If Members do not want this it is okay.. . (Interruptions) Let him speak Action is there on the part of the Chairman. I have an action which is that I can allow the Leader of the Opposition to speak. That is the only thing within my rights. I cannot arrest anybody; I cannot bring anybody into this House. I have limited powers and I am allowing him. Let him speak. (Interruptions)

1 P.M.

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: Sit down. You are provoking them. (Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please sit down" (Interruptions) If I allow the Leader of the Opposition to speak, I will allow the Leader of the Hotfse also to speak. Please take your seats. Everybody has the right to speak in the House. (Interruptions), It is not going on record. (Interruptions) \_

Just a second, please. If you don't want to listen I am going to adjourn the House. (Interruptions) The House is adiourned till 2-30 p.M, for lunch.

The House then adjourned for lunch at two minutes past one of the clock.

The House reassembled after lunch at thirty minutes past two of the clock, The Deputy Chairman in the Chair.

#### **SITUATION ARISING OUT OF MURDER OF AN INDEPENDENT CANDIDATE IN MEHAM—Contd.**

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Shiv Shanker Ji, would you like to speak?

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY (Uttar Pradesh): Some pressmen have told me that Maulvi Farooq of Kashmir has been shot dead. I would like the Home Minister to made a statement, be cause he is a respected leader of Kashmir.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I don't have information. I will find out. If

there is any information, we will let you know.

**श्री सत्यपाल मलिक :** महोदया, मेरा व्यवस्था का प्रश्न है। माननीय सदस्य अपने गले में कोई चीज पहने हुए हैं। इस सदन में पहले भी ऐसी घटनाएं हुई हैं जिनमें चेयर की रूलिंग हुई है और उस रूलिंग को अबाइड किया गया है। मैम्बर ने वह चीज उतारी है तब वह सदन में आए हैं। उपसभापति महोदया, यह सदन का अपमान है। मैं इस पर आपकी रूलिंग चाहता हूं और यह चाहता हूं कि माननीय सदस्य उस रूलिंग को अबाइड करें और उसके लीडर भी अबाइड करें। इस सदन में यह हुआ है (व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I 'had requested the hon. Member to abide by the conventions of the House. He should take that garland out of his neck. I can only request him.

**श्री सत्यपाल मलिक :** यह इस हाऊस का कन्वेंशन है (व्यवधान)

**श्री सुरेन्द्रजीत सिंह अहलुवालिया :** यह उसका प्रमाण है (व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please sit down. I request you to follow the convention of the House. If you don't want to follow the convention of the House, it is up to you. If the Members do not want to abide by the convention, it is all right. (Interruptions)

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Madam, so many lives have been lost and this Government is totally unable to control the situation., (Interruptions) I want the National Front Government to resign.

#### **STATEMENT BY MINISTER**

**Correcting the reply given to the Rajya Sabha on 24th July 1989 to Unstarred Question No. 677 regarding complaints against gas agencies.**