

**[श्री राम पूजन पटेल]**

(2) ऊपर I (i) में उल्लिखित पत्रों को सभापटल पर रखने में हुए विलम्ब के कारणों को दर्शाने वाला विवरण (अंग्रेजी तथा हिन्दी में)।

[Placed in Library. See No. LT-999/90]

**II. निम्नलिखित पत्रों की एक-एक प्रति (अंग्रेजी तथा हिन्दी में) :--**

(i) 1 जुलाई, 1987 से 31 मार्च, 1989 तक की अवधि के लिए सुपर बाजार, दि कोमपरेटिव स्टोर लिमिटेड का तेईसवां वार्षिक प्रशासनिक प्रतिवेदन और लेखे लेखाओं पर चेयरपर्सन के प्रतिवेदन सहित।

(ii) कोमपरेटिव स्टोर के कार्यकरण की सरकार द्वारा समीक्षा।

(iii) ऊपर (i) में उल्लिखित पत्रों की सभा टल पर रखने में हुए विलम्ब के कारणों को दर्शाने वाला विवरण।

[Placed in Library. See No. LT-1000/90]

**Report of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India for the year ended 31-3-1989 (No. 4 of 1990)—Municipal Corporation of Delhi).**

THE DEPUTY MINISTER IN THE MINISTRY OF FINANCE (SHRI ANIL SHASTRI) : Madam, I lay on the Table, under clause (1) of article 151 of the Constitution, a copy (in English and Hindi) of the Report of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India for the year ended March 31, 1989 (No. 4 of 1990)—Municipal Corporation of Delhi).

[Placed in Library. See No. LT-1020/90]

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : There is a reply by Shri I. K. Gujral to clarifications. (Interruption).

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY (Uttar Pradesh) : I am on a point of order. (Interruption).

श्री राम अवधेश सिंह (बिहार) : महोदय! मंडल कमीशन की रिकोमेंडेशन पर बहस कराने के लिए कहा था और आपने मंजूर भी कर लिया था कि इस पर बहस कराई जाएगी, लेकिन जो बिजनेस एडवाइजरी कमेटी की बैठक हुई, उसमें कल इस पर बात नहीं हुई और न ही मंजूरी हुई।

**उपसभापति : क्या ?**

श्री राम अवधेश सिंह : मंडल कमीशन की रिकोमेंडेशन पर बहस कराने के लिए आप राजी हुई थीं, आपने कहा था कि सब प्रोत्स हो गया है और इस पर बहस होगी। तो मैं कहना चाहता हूँ, महोदय, कि

**(व्यवधान)**

उपसभापति : मैं एक-एक का जवाब दे दूँ। पहले तो मैं राम अवधेश सिंह जी का जवाब दे दूँ। आपने जिस बारे में चेयरमैन साहब को कहा था, मैं आपसे यह गुजरिश करूँगी कि आप चेयरमैन साहब से मिल कर भी बात कर लें ताकि किस तरीके से इस छोटे समय में भी आपकी बात के बारे में भी विचार-विमर्श हो जाए... (व्यवधान) अब आपको बात खत्म हो गई।

श्री राम अवधेश सिंह : मैंने बातचीत की है... (व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I have asked Mr. Subramanian Swamy, please sit down.

श्री राम अवधेश सिंह : मि० सुब्रह्मण्यम स्वामी आप बैठिये !... (व्यवधान)

उपसभापति : राम अवधेश सिंह जी आप अपनी जगह पर बैठिये। अभी आप वहाँ से सुब्रह्मण्यम जी को बैठने के लिए न कहें। जब आप वाइस-चेयरमैन बनेंगे, तो आप उस समय स्वामी जी को बैठने के लिए कहिए।

Let me deal with Mr. Subramanian Swamy.

**श्री राम अवधेश सिंह :** उन्होंने मुझे कहा कि सरकार को राजी करो ! हम रात को छठ-नौ बजे तक बैठने के लिए तैयार हैं । आप इस पर बहस कराने के लिए पूरा करें ।

**उपसभापति :** इसमें मुझे कोई एतराज नहीं है, लेकिन आप चेयरमैन साहब से समय ले लीजिए ।

**श्री राम अवधेश सिंह :** यह आपके ऊपर और सरकार के ऊपर है ।

**उपसभापति :** अब आप बैठ जाइये ।

**श्री राम नरेश यादव (उत्तर प्रदेश) :** महोदय ! कल... (व्यवधान)

**उपसभापति :** उनको चेयरमैन साहब ने परमिशन दी है, इसलिए मैं उनको कह रहे हूँ । अपना आप शांति से बैठिये । शांति, शांति ।

**श्री राम अवधेश सिंह :** मैं इतने दिनों से शांत रहा हूँ । मंडल कमिशन पर बहस हो जाए ।... (व्यवधान)

**SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY :** Madam, I want to raise two issues. One is that a very serious allegation has been made against the Prime Minister's office for having suppressed the murder that has taken place in Allahabad where the nephew of the Prime Minister was involved and if this is not a true story, it should be denied or if it is true, then it is a very very serious matter and this House has to take notice if the Prime Minister's office pet" rlveld to protect the nephew of the Prime Minister. And the

second thing is, I think it is entirely objectionable that Members of the Planning Commission should intervene in the internal party affairs and submit their resignations. *(Interruption)*. Mr. L.C. Jain should be removed from the Planning Commission.

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :** Mr. Subramanian Swamy, I am not aware of the two matters which you are referring to. If you have written to the Chairman, it is entirely the prerogative of the Chairman to allow you to raise it in the House in whichever form he wants you to raise it and I will not allow any party matters to be discussed in the House *(Interruptions)*.

**SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY :** The Planning Commission is a govenmental body. The Members have no right to indulge in politics. *(Interruption)*. They should be dismissed.

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :** I am not allowing it. Mr. N. K. P. Salve. *(Interruptions)*. The Chairman has given him permission. I will allow him first.

**SHRIN.K.P. SALVE (Maharashtra) :** Madam, I am grateful to you. . . . *(Interruptions)*.

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :** Mr. Salaria, don't behave like this. Please sit down. I said, please take your seat. I request you to please take your seat. *(Interruptions)*.

बैठिए, बैठ जाइये । ...  
(व्यवधान) अब मैं आपको बुलाऊंगी तो जहर बोलींगा । मैं आपको मना नहीं करूंगी । लेकिन अभी मैंने आपको बुलाया नहीं है ।

### SPECIAL MENTOINS

#### Remarks of J & K Governor in an Interview to a Weekly

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE (Maharashtra) : Madam, I am grateful to you for giving me this opportunity to raise a matter of very grave public importance. I raise it in this House with great distress, agony and pain. Destruction of Kashmir appears to be on the cards. What is worse, destruction of one of the most cardinal and fundamental . . . (Interruption).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes. It is a special mention.

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE : . . . foundation of our noble Constitutional law appears to be on the cards. Today, in the press, alarming reports have appeared about the terror and leonine violence which have been unleashed by the Governor against the *innocent* people in the Valley of Kashmir. Madam, it has to be made absolutely clear that we do not, and no one should try to take political advantage of the difficult situation which is entirely the creation of this Government. (Interruptions). Madam, let us take it seriously. What I have to say is it is not purely politicking, it is not purely political advantage that we want to gain out of it. But let us speak frankly, honestly and candidly.

SHRI SHABBIR AHMAD SALARIA (Jammu and Kashmir) : Madam, this is not the time to say whose creation it is. We want a solution. We do not want to know whose creation it is.

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE : I shall be referring to what has appeared in the Press by way of an interview of the Governor a little later. But I want to submit that I consider it most unfortunate that the Govern-

ment of India and the Prime Minister are dangerously sanguine about the events in the Valley by their unwillingness to order an immediate halt to the wanton killings of innocent lives. Madam, Kashmir is weeping. It is a well-known idiom and proverb that Nero was fiddling when Rome was burning. Someone said the other day : "V.P. is reciting poetry while Kashmir is weeping." Let it not be true. We must understand the hard realities which exist today. We want to make it clear that we do not—repeat 'not'—want any compromise with the militants ; nor do we want any compromise with the terrorists ; nor do we want any compromise With the saboteurs. The unity and integrity and sovereignty of our country is just not negotiable to us as it would be not negotiable to anyone who is patriotic. The situation, however, has to be very firmly handled. It is one thing to be rough and uncompromising so far as anti-national elements are concerned, not only in Kashmir but anywhere. We have to deal firmly with those anti-national, anti-social elements, Who are out to take advantage of the situation and to loot, to murder, to kidnap and to indiscriminately kill the innocents. What is extremely Unfortunate, what is extremely dis-surbing, what is extremely disconcerting is this kind of tough and firm handling should not be on the basis of communalism. Please do not communalise the situation in Kashmir. Don't brand one community as anti-national, as militants, as terrorists, only with a view to persecute them, to harass them and to kill them. This is a matter which is very serious because so far as subversive activities are concerned, we would really want them to be handled, as I said, very firmly. But let it not be done in a manner as though it is a manifestation of nothing but sheer communal bias and religious bigotry. That is what seems to be happening today, It is very unfortunate. I very vehemently protest against this attitude and

approach with which you are handling the situation. That is threatening the integrity of the nation. Let it be handled in a manner which is worthy of the Indian ethos and Indian tradition and the mandate enshrined in the Constitution. Let secular values be not thrown overboard. Let not one particular community on the basis of religion be made to feel that they are the ones who are discriminated against.

... they are the ones against whom we are doing witch-hunting. It will be the single greatest disgrace to this country of Gandhi and Buddha, if we were not to ensure that this country is a habitat to live with dignity, peace and honour for everyone who is born out of the womb of this motherland and mother India and that there will be no witch-hunting on the basis of religion, sex, creed, caste etc. Madam, with great anguish I want to submit that presently Kashmir is under the Governor's rule and it must be accepted that the deeds and misdeeds of the Governor are those of the Central Government and the V. P. Singh Government. Madam, conspiracy to disintegrate Kashmir, it appears, is slowly but systematically and certainly being worked about because so far as Mr. Jagmohan's misdeeds were concerned, we had been hearing them from the Members of the National Conference and it was they who were complaining that he was not acting like a just and fair administrator, tackling a very grave and difficult political situation in which the entire nation was concerned. The complaint was about the attitude of the Governor, Mr. Jagmohan there. There was a patent and palpable attitude of a very disconcerting communal bias and, therefore, he was happy under the garb of eliminating the terrorists, the saboteurs and the culprits, eliminating the whole community as it were. Now the Governor has himself, Madam, given profuse and unabashed vent to his malicious malignity, hate and extreme dislike, branding every member of a

particular community as a militant . . .  
(Interruptions) . . .

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE : Not at all.

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA  
(Rajasthan): Is he trying to instigate a communal upsurge in the House?

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA:  
What is his attempt?

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE: For from it. ...  
(Interruptions)....

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA:  
This will inflame communal passions in the House, Madam. ..(Interruptions) .... Pleass restrain him -----  
(Interruptions) Please restrain him ... (Interruptions) -----

श्री सुरेशजीत सिंह अहलुवालिया :  
(बिहार) : मोरारका जी, वह तो अपने प्रधान मंत्री के पूछो... (व्यवधान)...  
क्या प्रचार कर रहे हैं।... (व्यवधान)  
... प्रयोगंडा, गवर्नर हाउस में किया जा रहा है।

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: I am on a py'mt of order Madam.(Interruptions I am on a point of order. (Interruptions)....

SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN  
(Maharashtra): You see the condition of Hindus there. (Interruptions) — You see the condition of Hindus and even of pro-India-Muslims. Even Mr. Jagmohan has supported the pro-India-Muslims in the same interview (Interruptions) He is the only man who is saving Hindus there and you are not worried about the Hindus in Kashmir. ... (Interruptions) You are not at all worried about the Hindus in Kashmir. (Interruptions) You are not worried about Hindus there (Interruptions) —

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE: Let him listen to what I have to say... *(Interruptions)*... You understand the basis on which I make this allegation. ... *(Interruptions)* Madam, the people including Mr. Morarka will know the basis .... *(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:  
Please, hon. Members, the Chairman has permitted ... *(Interruptions)* .. Just a second please. The Chairman has permitted Mr. Salve a Special Mention and I will allow him to say what he likes..... *(Interruptions)* ... There is no discussion before the House and it is a Special Mention and I will permit him.

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE: Let him understand properly the basis on which I make this allegation..... *(Interruptions)*... He has done it. I would have nothing to say. I would have no grievance..... *(Interruptions)*...

AN HON. MEMBER: He is talking about communalism of the Governor? ... *(Interruptions)* ....

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE: Of all the people, Mr. Morarka knows my values and my commitment to the values of secularism.

More than anything else. Mr. Jagmohan has been my personal friend. Times out of number I have defended him when the entire BJP was at his throat. But he has said something and please listen to what he has said and then say whether or not what I am saying is correct. *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: Within two minutes. ... *(Interruptions)* .. I'

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE: Why don't you listen to me? ... *(Interruptions)* ... Madam, I maintain that he has

himself come out. *(Interruptions)* ...

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: If Mr. Salve is not yielding, then I will reply in the same tone in which he is replying... *(Interruptions)*... On this issue, on this matter, Mr. Salve knows and Mr. Shiv Shanker knows that there is hardly any difference in perception between their views and ours ..... *(Interruptions)* ... I wish to caution... *(Interruptions)* .... Madam, sometimes .. *(Interruptions)*...

AN HON. MEMBER: Is it going on record?

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: Madam, just a minute. ... *(Interruptions)* ...

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY (Uttar Pradesh): Madam, Mr. Morarka has said that there is no difference in the perceptions of both. I have always said that and I have always said that the Janta Dal is a duplicate of the Congress (I)! There is no difference in perception .... *(Interruptions)* ..

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA : Madam, my point of order is very simple. *(Interruptions)* ... I will leave it to Mr. Salve. ... *(Interruptions)* ... I will leave it entirely to him ... *(Interruptions)*. .. Madam, in national affairs ... *(Interruptions)* ....

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE: Madam, I will never be unfair to Mr- Morarka and I have always yielded. But, at this juncture, Madam, my thought link would be disturbed. .... *(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:  
You see, his thought link would be disturbed and so, let him speak. I can assure the honourable Members that I am not allowing a debate on this .... *(Interruptions)*....

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE: Madam, the things that have been said are so atrocious ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA:  
Don't repeat those atrocious things here. Please don't do that .... *(Interruptions)*  
Because you say they are so atrocious why do you want to repeat those atrocious things here ? \_\_\_\_\_ *(Interruptions)* -----  
Why do you want to repeat those atrocious things ? \_\_\_\_\_ *(Interruptions)* \_\_\_\_\_

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE: Madam, what is the basis of my anguish ?....  
*(Interruptions)* \_\_\_\_\_

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I would like to make a request to the honourable Members: Don't curtail the right of a member whom the Chair has permitted. Please let him have his say. Mr. Salve's name is there before me and I will allow him to speak.

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE: Madam, what is the basis of my anguish? And what is the basis of the charge that I am levelling against this Government?... *(Interruptions)* \_\_\_\_\_  
It is not as a result of anything else, but it is as a result of what I have read in the papers about something which has been stated by the Governor himself .... *(Interruptions)* .... who speak, Madam, only what the Government wants him to speak; nothing more, nothing less. And, I quote with a great anguish— this is in quotes— something which has appeared in the "Current", issue dated May 26-June 1— :

"Every Muslim in Kashmir is a militant today."

*(Interruptions)*

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER  
(Gujarat): This is what the Governor is saying .... *(Interruptions)* \_\_\_\_\_

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE: Again he says:

"All of them are for secession from India."

*(Interruptions)*

"Bullet is the only solution for Kashmir."

*(Interruptions)*

"Unless the militants are fully wiped out, normalcy cannot return to the Valley."

Madam, he proceeds further, and I am reading out only selected paras. It is an interview, it is verbatim quoting: what I have said is in quotes and this is not the reporting of one who interviewed him ....  
*(Interruptions)*....

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: By whom?

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE: Interview of Mr. Jagmohan by one Sumitra Bose, reported in the "Current", and these words which I am reading out are in quotes and these are not the words or description or the evaluation by the interviewer of Mr. Jagmohan's views. It is entirely in quotes. Madam, he further says:

"Muslims have adopted the approach of killing every Hindu in the Valley. I will eliminate them first."  
*(Interruptions)*

"If they adopt the approach of killing the Hindus, I will eliminate them first."

*(Interruptions)*

Madam, this is being vindictive..  
..*(Interruptions)*....

AN HON. MEMBER: He has also said that he will see that no Indian Muslims are killed. That is also written \_\_\_\_\_ *(Interruptions)*

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: We cannot tolerate this even for a day  
-----*(Interruptions)* \_\_\_\_\_

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE: Madam, these are the words, these are the utterances of a Governor of this country. These make me ashamed

of my country (Interruptions)

.... I am ashamed of myself, I am ashamed of being an Indian when there is a Governor who can talk all this kind of things with venom .... (Interruptions).... How to tolerate this kind of a thing? Now, what does he say further?

"On being reminded that a minuscule percentage of Kashmiri pandits has exploited the majority Muslim population for decades, Mr. Jagmohan remarked, 'It is a matter of facility. Can one help if the Hindus are more intelligent and capable than the Muslims? That does not mean that the Hindus can be killed.' "

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: What a perception! .... (Interruptions) ....

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE: What a perception, what intelligence and what brilliance! Is there no such thing as Indian ethos? \_\_\_\_\_ (Interruptions) .... Is there no such thing which is the heart of the Constitution of this country? What are we doing to our secular values? We are throwing them overboard in such a manner and with this type of things which are only helping the people shedding crocodile tears in Pakistan and elsewhere? This is not what India is going to tolerate. This is not what our brethren of Kashmir Muslims are willing to tolerate. We will stand by them. As long as we cherish the values of Gandhi and Buddha, as long as those values are so well-enshrined in the Constitution, till the last man, we will fight out people like those who are so communally biassed and go by this bigotry. Madam, my worst grievance is, what has happened to the conscience of this Government? Conscience is very well-bred' Madam. You snub it once to silence and it never troubles you

again. (Interruptions). For this interview, Mr. Jagmohan is certainly guilty. But much more guilty is the V.P. Government and V.P. Singh himself. Madam, it appears that their mind is blurred, their ears plugged and their conscience drugged.

Madam, in the end, I only want to submit that he should not be allowed to be there even for a second more in Kashmir as the Governor. He should be dismissed outright, called back here and tried for high treason and for violation of the cardinal norms of the Constitution. Thank you.

श्री राम अवधेश सिंह (बिहार) :  
मैजम, मैं इनके समर्थन में एक वाक्य  
कहना चाहता हूँ ।... (व्यवधान)...

I am not allowing any other person to speak. I am not allowing any discussion. Mr. Shiv Shanker.

श्री राम अवधेश सिंह : स्पेशल मेंशन  
पर कई बार... (व्यवधान)...

उपसभापति : आप बैठ जाइए ।...  
(व्यवधान)... शिव शंकर जी, आप का  
नाम लिखा है, आप बोलेंगे ?....  
(व्यवधान)...

I have been permitted by the Chairman Just a minute. I have been permitted by the Chairman to allow the special mention. I have allowed enough time from 12-05 to 12.22 p-m. to Mr. Salve. (Interruptions).

I am not allowing. We have only one hour today. (Interruptions)

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त (मध्य प्रदेश) :  
शिव शंकर साहब, आप मुझे बोलने का  
सौका देंगे ।... (व्यवधान)...

श्री श्री शिव शंकर : आप पृष्ठ लीजिएगा उनमें । . . . (व्यवधान) . . .

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Just a minute. Take your seats. Don't make such things- Mr. Shiv Shanker is speaking. (Interruptions).

राम अश्वेस जी, आप बैठिए । . . . (व्यवधान) . . . अगर चेयरमैन साहब कश्मीर पर डिस्कशन प्रलाऊ करेंगे तो . . . (व्यवधान) . . .

I will not allow you. He allowed only special mention. I am sticking to the rule. (Interruptions). I allowed Mr. Salve.

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE: Madam, [ beg of you. I crave your indulgence, Madam. (Interruptions).

श्री राम अश्वेस सिंह: जगमोहन \* है । . . . (व्यवधान) . . .

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद सायूर (उत्तर प्रदेश) : एक तरफ बात सही हो सकती । . . . (व्यवधान) . . .

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please don't teach me rules. (Interruptions). I have been told by Mr. Shiv Shanker in the Chamber of the Chairman that he has been allowed. I am allowing. I am not stopping the right of Members. But there are certain rules of procedure which I want to remind Members of. I am sticking to rules. (Interruptions). If the Chairman permits a full-fledged discussion, I would be too happy to discuss Kashmir. I am as anguished as Members are- (Interruptions).

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE: Madam, .... (Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: If you ask, I will allow Mr. Salaria.

SHRI N-K-P. SALVE: Madam, half a minute. Only 30 seconds. All I want to submit on such a delicate, sensitive and important matter is .... (Interruptions).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:

It is not necessary for individual Members to associate. The whole House associates with the atrocities going on there. (Interruptions) I do not want individual associations.... (Interruptions) Mr. Salaria. (Interruptions) I allowed Mr- Salve under the permission of the Chairman. (Interruptions) You ask for special permission ... (Interruptions) I have no permission.... (Interruptions) Mr. Mathur, do not argue.

देखिए, मेरे हाथ नियमों में बंधे हुए हैं । चेयरमैन साहब से आप इजाजत ले लीजिए, मुझे क्या तकलीफ हो सकती है ?

Mr. Salaria comes from there. (Interruptions) If that is the attitude. I am not allowing anybody. You requested that somebody who comes from that State should be allowed. Only Mr. Salaria comes from Kashmir. Therefore, I allow him. (Interruptions).

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE: But on much less important issues, Madam, on Special Mentions, you have allowed the Members to associate themselves, giving them two minutes each. (Interruptions).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I

have been reminded of the rule manytimes in the House .... (Interruptions) Don't argue with the Chair. I will not allow. I have been told to stick to the rule. I have been put in the Chair by you people .... (Interruptions)

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE: It is a discretionary power. You have allowed, on much less important issues, the people to be associated,

\*Expunged as ordered by the Chair.



[Shri N. K. P. Salve] ving them two minutes. Why don't you allow now, Madam? (Inter interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I said, everyone is concerned about Kashmir—the whole House. And you are a representative of this House— If the Chairman permits any other discussion, any other voice, to be raised in the House, I would be so happy to allow. So, please don't let me not abide by Rules. You, as a law-abiding person, do not let me divert from the Rules, please.

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE : I seek indulgence of your discretionary powers. You have allowed earlier, Madam, on Special Mentions, far less important ....(Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I have allowed many disorders in this House— Let me run it with order, please....(Interruptions) Mr-Salaria-

श्री अश्विनी कुमार (बिहार) : माननीय उपसभापति महोदया, मैं इतना ही निवेदन करना चाहता हूँ कि सलारिया साहब ने जो स्टेटमेंट पढ़ा है उसके अंदर कुछ और अंश है जो मैं आपके सामने रखना चाहता हूँ... (व्यवधान)

उपसभापति : आप क्या बोल रहे हैं? अगर आप इस बारे में बोलना चाहते हैं तो आपसे गुजारिश करती हूँ कि इस हाउस के कुछ नियम हैं। स्पेशल मेशन चेयरमैन साहब परमिट करते हैं। उन्होंने परमिट किए हैं। हमारे पास केवल आधा घंटा है... (व्यवधान) अगर आपको इस पर बोलना है तो आप चेयरमैन साहब से परमिशन ले लीजिए, मुझे कोई एतराज नहीं है मगर यहाँ पर कोई डॉयलाग नहीं हो रहा है।

No dialogue. You understand there is no dialogue in this House. It is only a mention.

मेरे पास और भी चिट्ठियाँ आई थीं। अगर मैं इनको एलाऊ करती हूँ...

I am sticking to the Rules (Interruptions)

उपसभापति : एक मिनट, सलारिया साहब उस स्टेट से आते हैं उनको बोलने तो दीजिये।

एक सम्मानित सदस्य : यह स्टेट का क्या सवाल है... (व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : All right, I am not allowing Mr. Salaria. I won't allow anybody. I will now call Mr. Shiv Shanker on a different issue.

श्री श्री शिव शंकर : मैडम, ... (व्यवधान)

उपसभापति : यह मैटर खत्म हो गया, आप कल बोलियेगा। प्लीज मेरी बात सुनिये, प्लीज एक मिनट, सलारिया साहब आप भी तशरूफ़ रखिये। बात सुनिये, देखिये, चेयरमैन साहब बहुत से इश्यूज पर स्पेशल मेशन देते हैं। चेयरमैन साहब जो स्पेशल मेशन देते हैं, जो मेंबर यहाँ उठाते हैं उनका एक अलग ही तरीका होता है। उस स्पेशल मेशन पर कोई डॉयलाग नहीं होता, उसके ऊपर कोई रिप्लाय नहीं होती। जो गवर्नमेंट को लिखना होता है वह लिखते हैं। यह स्पेशल मेशन के तहत उठाया। अगर हाऊस के सामने कोई इस तरह का विषय हो कि इस पर डिस्कशन हो रहा हो तो मैं दिल से आपको इजाजत दूंगी, दिल और दिमाग दोनों से। मगर इसमें कोई आपको क्लेरिफिकेशन देने का यहाँ पर कोई तरीका नहीं है कि आप क्लेरिफिकेशन करें। दिन में रोज़ ही एक दूसरे पर एलिगेंस लगते हैं।

I cannot allow you to give a clarification on it. It is not your job. If you want a Special Mention, then ask the Chairman and I will permit you. I will be the first person to do it.

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त : मैं यह पूछता हूँ कि क्या सलारिया साहब उसी पर हैं जिस पर सलार साहब थे।

**उपसभापति :** सलारिया साहब को मैं ने मना कर दिया है ।

I have asked him not to speak. Now he is not speaking (*Interruptions*) I was not in the Chair. Mr-Salaria is also not speaking on that. I am not permitting him, Mr. Salaria, please take your seat-

**श्री प्रमोद महाजन :** कल स्पेशल मेंशन पर 10 लोग बोले ।

**उपसभापति :** गलत किया ।

**श्री अश्विनी कुमार :** हमारे स्पेशल मेंशन को छोड़िये आप... (*व्यवधान*)...

**उपसभापति :** नहीं, सलारिया साहब नही बोल रहे हैं ।

I request the hon- Members to please take their seats. Nothing which is said without my permission will go on record

**श्री अश्विनी कुमार :** उपसभापति महोदया, मैं केवल इतना कहना चाहता हूँ... (*व्यवधान*)

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :**  
Please take your seats If the Members are not going to listen. I will adjourn the House. I warn you, I will adjourn the House if you do not restore order in the House Please sit down. (*Interruptions*).

**SHRI N. K. P. SALVE :** Let there be a debate. We do not mind. (*Interruptions*)

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :**  
I request the Members to please sit down. If the Members are so agitated on the Kashmir issue, I will request the Chairman to allow a full-fledged discussion on the subject. And whatever the hon. Member has brought to me and if he feels that Mr Salve... (*Interruptions*) Just a minute. Do not disturb the House If some

hon Members feel that what Mr Salve has read is not the full account, I will give you full permission on Monday if the Chairman permits you to speak on it.

**SOME HON. MEMBERS :** Today itself.

**THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :** Just a minute- Please sit down.

माथुर साहब आप समझदार हैं, आप बैठिए एक सेक्शन के लिए Please do not pass any comments on any Members. माथुर साहब साल्व साहब ने किसी सिक्रेट फाइल में से तो पढ़ा नहीं, कोई पेपर के कमेंट दिये हैं । आप भी उसी पेपर से पढ़ना चाहते हैं । वह अखबार जरूर कहीं न कहीं बिक रहा होगा । (*व्यवधान*)

**श्री प्रमोद महाजन :** वह क्यों बोलेंगे । (*व्यवधान*)

**SHRI N. K. P. SALVE :** Madam, I must clarify Madam, I was on a Special Mention. Therefore, I have to be very selective in what I quoted. If they want a debate, we are ready for it here and now... (*Interruptions*) You are supporting a Government ... (*Interruptions*) Otherwise, this Governor should not have remained there even for a second more. It is the fault of the Government (*Interruptions*) Here and now let us debate (*Interruptions*) Madam, I referred only to remain in my limits. What are they saying ? Am I misquoting or what ? (*Interruptions*)

**श्री अश्विनी कुमार :** वहां मुसलमान जो मर रहे हैं, जो भारत माता की जय बोलते हैं मुसलमान लोग वे भी मारे जा रहे हैं । उसे साल्वे साहब ने नहीं पढ़ा है जो उसमें लिखा हुआ है । (*व्यवधान*)

**उपसभापति :** यह स्वाभाविक बात है कि जो भी इस हाऊस में बोलता है पोलिटिक्स पर बोलता है (व्यवधान) माधुर साहब आप बैठ जाइये, शांति रखिये । (व्यवधान)

SHRI KAILASH NARAIN SA-RANG (Madhya Pradesh) : This is one-sided, Madam (Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I would request all the Members. Please take your seats. (Interruptions)

SHRI JAGESH DESAI (Maharashtra) : Madam, you stick to your decision. Let this be debated on Monday (Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Let me be heard (Interruptions) There is nothing one-sided about it. Nothing one-sided. The Chairman had permitted him to make his Special Mention. You go and ask the Chairman. You ask for your right to reply to it. There is nothing one-sided about it. It was his right I allowed him (Interruptions)

SHRI VIREN J. SHAH (Maharashtra) : Madam, what Mr Salve read was one-sided (Interruptions)

SHRI VITHALRAO MADHAV-RAO JADHAV (Maharashtra) : The Chair has already given the decision (Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Mr- Salve made his Special Mention. If you feel hurt, you please ask the Chairman. If he gives permission, I will preside over the house, the whole day, the whole night, any time you want (Interruptions) Nothing one-sided about it, I did not permit Mr Salve also (Interruptions) I had withdrawn permission (Interruptions) I will give you the reason (Interruptions)

SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN : If you had given permission, you

had given permission How can you withdraw it? (Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : On your objection, I withdrew it. (Interruptions)

SHRI VIREN J- SHAH : Mr Salve read only part of it. He concealed the other part (Interruptions)

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE : I cannot quote the whole interview (Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Mr Viren Shah, you are a political person. You know what Mr Salve will read and what he will not read. You read day-after-tomorrow, Monday, what you want to read.

SHRI VIREN J SHAH : Permit me to read now (Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I will allow I have not denied permission to any Member. There is nothing one-sided about it at all (Interruptions)

मैंने इसलिए पहले ही कहा कि साहब साहब ने कोई सीक्रेट डॉक्यूमेंट नहीं पढ़ा है साहब साहब ने खुले अखबार में अखबार में से कुछ पढ़ा है... (व्यवधान) । आप लोग थोड़ा चुप रहेंगे तो आपकी मेहरबानी होगी । My voice has gone hoarse I cannot speak louder than this. वह अखबार आपने भी पढ़ा है और वह अखबार हिन्दुस्तान की सब जगहों पर मिल रहा होगा । आपको लगता है कि उन्होंने पुरा नहीं पढ़ा है तो आप चेयरमैन साहब से परमिशन ले लीजिये और पुरा पढ़ लीजिये... (व्यवधान) । यह तो अखबार की बात है, पेपर की बात है । मैं आनरेबल मेंबर्स से बहुत ही नम्रतापूर्वक हजाजत चाहूंगी कि मुझे नियमों से चलने दें । नहीं तो मेरे ऊपर बहुत इल्जाम लगते हैं कि मैं नियमों से बाहर जाती हूँ । मैं नियमों से बाहर कुछ काम नहीं करना चाहती ।... (व्यवधान)...

श्री अन्तर्राष्ट्रिय शोधक केंद्र (गुजरात) :  
... (व्यवधान) ... तीन दिन से ड्रामा  
आप कर रहे हैं, हम लोग क्या ड्रामा  
करेंगे। ... (व्यवधान) ...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : It is a  
different special mention on Bofors. He is  
speaking on Bofors, not on Kashmir  
(Interruptions). He is speaking on Bofors.  
Please sit down

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर : पहले  
इसका फैसला होगा, बोफोर्स नहीं होगा।  
... (व्यवधान) ...

SHRI P SHIV SHANKER I have taken  
permission from the Chairman. May I  
proceed ? (Interruptions).

श्री ज. शोश प्रसाद माथुर : मैं इस नो,  
हमको इसका जवाब देना पड़ेगा ...  
(व्यवधान)

श्री प्रमोद महाजन : आपको केवल  
एक जाति की चिंता नहीं होनी चाहिये  
संनद में ... (व्यवधान) ...

उपसभापति : मैंने जो कुछ चेयर से  
सुना वह यह है कि कश्मीर में जो भी  
इन्फोर्सेट लोग मारे जा रहे हैं उसकी हमें  
चिंता है। एक जाति, दो जाति, तीन  
जाति की बात नहीं है। जो इन्फोर्सेट  
लोग वहाँ मारे जा रहे हैं उनकी चिंता  
है। ... (व्यवधान) ...

SHRI VISHVJIT P SINGH : There are  
only 15 minutes left for the House to  
adjourn for lunch. They want to stall the  
proceedings of the House

SHRI P SHIV SHANKER : Madam, the  
matter of Bofors has been hanging fire for  
quite sometime. For more than three years  
the matter has been going on...,  
(Interruptions)

उपसभापति : देखिये इस सवाल पर  
कोई नहीं बोल रहा है। ... (व्यवधान)

जो सलारिया साहब ... (व्यवधान) ...  
देखिये माथुर साहब, प्लीज एक मिनट।  
मेरी बात एक क्षण दुबारा सुन लीजिये।  
मेरी बात सुन लीजिये। मैं आपको सूनिगी,  
आई प्रामिस। बात यह है कि मुझ पर  
यहाँ इल्जाम लगा कि मैं नियमों पर नहीं  
चलती हूँ। जब मैंने यहाँ हंगामे में बिल  
पास किया तो मुझे यह कहा गया कि  
मैंने नियम तोड़े हैं। आप क्यों मेरे ऊपर  
यह इल्जाम लगवाना चाहते हैं कि मैंने  
नियम तोड़े हैं ? ... (व्यवधान) ...

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर : आप  
हमको क्यों अनुमति नहीं दे रही हैं ...  
(व्यवधान) ...

उपसभापति : आप चुप रहिये, यह  
आपका सवाल नहीं है।

श्री प्रमोद महाजन : दूसरे लोगों ने  
अगर बड़े आरोप लगाये हैं तो उसकी  
चिंता मैं हमारी अनुमति क्यों रोक रही  
है ?

उपसभापति : दूध का जला छाँछ भी  
फ्रूक फ्रूक कर पीता है।

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर : इस हाउस  
में एक स्पेशल मेसन पर दस-दस लोग  
बोले हैं। इसलिये इस पर ... (व्यवधान)

SHRI ASHWANI KUMAR :  
We are all walking out today on this  
issue.

[At this stage some hon. Members left the  
Chamber]

SHRI JAGDISH PRASAD MATHUR :  
They are the murderers of Kashmiris, they  
are the murderers of Hindus, they are the  
murderers of democracy.

[At this stage the hon. Member left the  
Chamber]

[श्री प्रमोद महाजन]

तरह से कश्मीर के हिन्दू वहां से जा रहे हैं और यहां हिन्दू विरोधी उसका समर्थन कर रहे हैं। इसके खिलाफ हम रुदन का वाकाउट करते हैं।

[At this stage the hon Member left the Chamber]-

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER : This should not go on record. It is without your permission.

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE : Madam this has been said on the floor of the House. I beg of you \_\_\_\_\_ (Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I will look into the records

श्री कृष्ण लाल शर्मा (हिमाचल प्रदेश) : आप अगर एक कौम की बात करेंगे तो कश्मीर की बरबाद करेंगे (व्यवधान)

श्री कैलाश नारायण सारंग : हम कश्मीर की बरबाद नहीं होने देंगे (व्यवधान)

श्री शम्भू शर्मा सारंग : कोई हिन्दू नहीं भग्न रहा है (व्यवधान) कौन जिम्मेदार है (व्यवधान)

SHRI P- SHIV SHANKER : Madam, may I proceed ? \_\_\_\_\_ (Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I again request the hon Members, please don't have a divide on this issue. Please sit down..... I have called him His name is listed I cannot call you. Your name is not listed here. Anybody whose name is listed, I am calling. I am not calling anybody out of the list..... Please don't let me be doing things -----

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : On a point of order. Has the BJP walked out or not walked out, or is it a partial walk-out ?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : There is no point of order.

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER : What is this walk-out ? It is not a ywalk-out at a'l. It is an insult on vwalk-out.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I have already called Mr. Shiv Shanker to speak on Bofors. If you want to speak on Bofors, you are most welcome to speak later—  
jiot now ----- (Interruptions) Not until (Chairman gives you permission. Then j will allow you. I am not doing anything at my own behest. I am doing everything according to my duty. If the Chairman, ijamuts. aay discussion on anything under the gun, I will permit

DR JINENDRA KUMAR JAIN (Madhya Pradesh) : Madam, am also duty-bound \_\_\_\_\_

श्री पी० शिव शंकर : आप लोगों के अनुशासन को क्या हो गया (व्यवधान) आप तो दाक आऊट की भी इनसल्ट कर रहे हैं।  
Madam, may I proceed ? I was submitting....'

डा० जिनेंद्र कुमार जैन : महोदया, (व्यवधान)

उपसभापति : आप नये मन्बर हैं, आपको शायद नियम मालूम नहीं होंगे (व्यवधान)

डा० जिनेंद्र कुमार जैन : मालूम हैं।

उपसभापति : अगर मालूम होते तो आप कभी ऐसा नहीं करते (व्यवधान) मेहरबानी करके आप चुप नहीं रह सकते, नहीं रह सकते हैं तो मुझे कोई शिकायत नहीं है।

Now I have identified Mr. Shiv Shanker. He is on his legs. That

matter—that first Special Mention on Kashmir—is closed \_\_\_\_ Just a minute...I did not permit anyone to speak on it from any side, except Mr. Salve. If you have any grievance, you are most welcome. It is open to you. You come and talk about it. You can take the *permission* of the Chairman and speak for the whole day. I do not mind it. But the problem is that my hands are bound. I cannot open the Pandora's box and ask everybody to speak... Please take your seat.

DR- JINENDRA KUMAR JAIN : Madam, I was also on my legs during the whole discussion. (*Interruptions*)

[At this stage, the hon. Member left the Chamber].

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Now the Secretary-General has come to me and told me that the Chairman has given permission to Mr. Sikander Bakht. The Chairman has informed the Secretary-General who has informed me that the hon. Chairman has permitted Mr. Sikander Bakht to speak.

श्री चतुरानन मिश्र (बिहार) :  
उपसभापति महोदया, एक मिनट ।

उपसभापति: उनको बोलने की इजाजत चेयरमैन ने दी है। मैं चेयरमैन के आर्डर्स का उल्लंघन नहीं कर सकती हूँ। आप लोग चुप हो जाएं... (ब्यवधान) मलारिया साहब, इसके आगे कोई बात नहीं। आप बैठ जाइये। मैंने नहीं दी है परमिशन। बैठ जाइये। चेयरमैन साहब ने परमिशन दी है..

(*Interruptions*)... I have not given you permission. Chairman has all authority. If he gives permission, I will allow you.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : I am on a point of order. Mr. Salaria should also be... (*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I say, please don't argue about everything.

SHRI SURESH KALMADI (Maharashtra) : Point of order.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No point of order. I will not permit. ... (*Interruptions*)... Don't argue.

SHRI SURESH KALMADI : I am not arguing. I want to know how, at one time, there can be two Presiding Officers. You have said that you will not give him permission to speak. The other one goes to the Chairman and takes permission. How can the House be presided over by two Presiding Officers at one time ?

SHRI MAKHAN LAL FOTE-DAR (Uttar Pradesh) : That is the point.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I will not allow. Please sit down. Chairman is my senior. I will allow him.

SHRI SURESH KALMADI : This is unprecedented.

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE : There can be only one rule. ... (*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please sit down—I won't permit you. Please take your seat.

SHRI SURESH KALMADI : No. ... (*Interruption*)...

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE : You have to allow if Chairman allows anyone...

... (*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please sit down. The Secretary-General informed me, and I will act according to the Chairman.

• SHRI N. K. P. SALVE : Madam, can there be two standards ? ..  
..(Interruptions)...

SHRI SURESH KALMADI:  
Now you ask Shiv Shankerji to speak.

...{Interruptions}...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please sit down, Mr. Ghulam Nabi Azad. You are a new Member to this House. Many a time the Chairman had sent me a chit saying that he had permitted so and so to speak. Please sit down. It happened many times- You don't run the House. I run the House, not you.

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER : Madam, we don't dispute it ... {Interruptions}..

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : If you don't want to permit him to speak, I will still allow him to speak-

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER :  
We will obey you, but kindly listen to me for a minute. We will obey you, but I have one submission to make. ... (Interruptions)..

SHRI SURESH KALMADI: You are in the Chair. How can you allow ? Only one person is in the Chair at one time ..  
..(Interruptions)..

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE : There has to be a uniform standard, Madam. There is^a procedure- ... (Interruptions)...

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: Madam, ...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN :  
You want me to answer you, yet you keep on shouting. Mr. Shiv Shanker, you know it and I know. I know, many times a list is there ancj Members go and take permission

of the Chairman and I allow them. You know it and everybody knows

SHRI SURESH KALMADI :  
No-....

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:  
Sit down- This is not the first time. I run the House, I know it many times I have permitted. I did not permit anybody except Mr Salve whose name was there ... (Inter  
ruptions) ... Sit down. Please take your seat When my Chairman informs me that he has permitted Mr. Sikander Bakht, I wilt permit him.

J  
SHRI  
VITHALRAO MADHAV-RAO  
JADHAV : Madam, what happens to Mr. Shiv Shanker ? ... (Interruptions)...

SHRI M. M. JACOB (Kerala): Under rule 9 of the Rules of Procedure of Rajya Sebha—Powers of Deputy Chairman, etc.,—while presiding, you are..  
..(Interruptions)...

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA :  
Mr. Shiv Shanker is on his legs and his own people are not permitting him to speak.

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER : Madam, we obey your ruling and Mr. Sikander Bakht can... (Interruptions)..

SHRI CHATURANAN MISHRA : I am on a point of order.  
... (Interruptions)...

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER : Madam, while Mr Sikander Bakht may be allowed to speak under your order, I take very great exception to some of the Members of the Government, who are being supported by the BJP, going to the Chamber and telephoning to the Chairman and getting orders. This is reprehensible. We condemn this

attitude by some of the Government Members. This is very unfortunate. This should never be done. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE : On your back they got permission from the Chairman. (*Interruptions*)

**श्री रफीक अलम (बिहार) :** आज फाइने है। नमाज का वक्त हो गया है।  
... (व्यवधान)

**हमें नमाज को जाना है।**

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA (Bihar) : They are only interested in clocking the proceedings of the House. That is what they want. (*Interruptions*) They don't want to listen, I tell you. This is what it is It was a conspiracy. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : The House is adjourned for lunch till 2-30 P.M.

The House then adjourned for lunch at one minute past one of the clock.

The House re-assembled after lunch at thirty-two minutes past two of the clock, The Vice-Chairman (Shri M. A. Baby) in the Chair.

#### **ALLOCATION OF TIME FOR DISPOSAL OF GOVERNMENT AND OTHER BUSINESS**

THE DEPUTY MINISTER IN THE  
MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY  
AFFAIRS (SHRI JA-

GDEEP DHANKHAR) : With your permission, Sir, I rise to announce that Government Business in this House during the week commencing Monday, the 28th May, 1990, will consist of :—

1- Consideration and return/passing of the following Bills as passed by Lok Sabha:

- (a) The Union Duties of Excise (Distribution) Amendment Bill, 1990.
- (b) The Additional Duties of Excise (Goods of Special Importance) Amendment Bill, 1990
- (c) The Gold (Control) Repeal Bill, 1990.

2 Further discussion on the working of the Ministry of Civil Aviation.

3 Further discussion on rise in prices.

4- Consideration and passing of the following Bills as passed by Lok Sabha:

- (a) The Constitution (Sixty-Sixth Amendment) Bill, 1990.
- (b) The Constitution (Sixty-Eighth Amendment) Bill, 1990.
- (c) Bill regarding Statehood of Delhi.
- (d) The National Commission for Women Bill, 1990.
- (e) The Prasar Bharati (Broadcasting Corporation of India) Bill, 1989.
- (f) The Lokoal Bill. 1989.