

[श्रीमती सत्या बहिन]

करते थे तो हर एक का जवाब आता था और उसमें क्या कार्यवाही होती था इस पर जानकारी मिलती थी... (व्यवधान)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. CHANDRESH P. THAKUR): Madam, please sit down. Mr. Minister, if, perhaps, you did not hear the honourable Member saying that they are not getting response from the Government to their Special Mentions, kindly keep that in view and convey it to your colleagues.

SHRI ARIF MOHD. KHAN: Right, Sir. I will convey it to my colleagues.

श्री सत्य प्रकाश मालवीय (उत्तर प्रदेश) : महोदय, रोजगार के मामले में इलाहाबाद बहुत पिछड़ा हुआ है और जो मऊअग्रिमा की सरकारी समिति है यहां पर करीब करीब 14 सौ से 15 सौ मजदूर काम कर रहे हैं लेकिन आज प्रबंधकों और पुलिस को वहां सांठगांठ हो रही है और उनके अत्याचारों के कारण... (व्यवधान)

उपसभाध्यक्ष (प्रो० चन्द्रेश पी० ठाकुर) : इलाहाबाद का प्राइम मिनिस्टर है ।

श्री सत्य प्रकाश मालवीय : वह अलग सवाल है । वे फतेहपुर से हैं । मेरा निवेदन यह है कि यह बहुत ही गम्भीर समस्या है । 14 सौ से 15 सौ मजदूर और उनके परिवार वालों की रोजी रोटी की समस्या है और पुलिस तथा प्रबंधकों की सांठगांठ से यह कताई मिल बंद हो गयी है । इसलिए मैं मोहम्मद अमीन अंसारी साहब ने जो विशेष उल्लेख दिया है उससे अपने को सम्बद्ध करता हूं और सम्बद्ध करते हुए आपके जरिये, सदन के जरिये सरकार से मांग करता हूं कि सरकार को इसमें हस्तक्षेप करना चाहिए और कम से कम यह जो कताई मिल है इसको तुरंत खुलवाना चाहिए क्योंकि सरकार का संकल्प है कि हमारे जो प्रबंधक हैं उसमें मजदूरों की भागोदारी होगी ।... (व्यवधान)

उपसभाध्यक्ष (प्रो० चन्द्रेश पी० ठाकुर) :

सभी बंद मिलों की तरफ सरकार का ध्यान जाना चाहिए और उनकी क्वालिटी का रास्ता निकालना चाहिए ।

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. CHANDRESH P. THAKUR): Shri Jagmohan.

SHRI JAGDISH PRASAD MATHUR: This is his maiden speech.

Alleged International Disinformation on Kashmir situation

SHRI JAGMOHAN (Nominated): Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, thank you very much for giving me this opportunity. I hope I will be heard uninterrupted.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. CHANDRESH P. THAKUR): Why are you doubting that?

SHRI JAGMOHAN: Like a maiden, Sir!

Sir, I have to submit that a lot of disinformation is being intentionally spread about Kashmir. The statement which I just heard was an example of that. I hope this country is not going to be run by planted stories in the press and by disinformation techniques. If you want to know the truth about Kashmir, I would suggest that there should be a panel of Supreme Court Judges who should go into all aspects of the Kashmir situation—how this subversion, how this terrorism, how this emergency has been brought about in Kashmir, who are the personalities that are responsible for this and what are the underlying forces that are responsible for this... (Interruptions)...

SHRI R. K. DHAWAN (Andhra Pradesh): You were the Governor there... (Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. CHANDRESH P. THAKUR): Let him make his Special Mention.

SHRI JAGDISH PRASAD MATHUR (Uttar Pradesh): This is his maiden speech and they should at least have the courtesy not to interrupt him...*(Interruptions)*...

THE MINISTER OF ENERGY WITH ADDITIONAL CHARGE OF THE MINISTRY OF CIVIL AVIATION (SHRI ARIF MOHD. KHAN): Sir, Mr. Jagmohan is speaking for the first time, and at least they should have the courtesy to listen to him uninterrupted...*(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. CHANDRESH P. THAKUR): All of you, please sit down...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ARIF MOHD. KHAN : Let him make his point...*(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. CHANDRESH P. THAKUR): Nothing will go on record...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SUKOMAL SEN (West Bengal) : \*

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA (Bihar) : \*

SHRI ARIF MOHD. KHAN : Sir, let them differ later but let him have his say first.

SHRI R. K. DHAWAN : \*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. CHANDRESH P. THAKUR) : Mr. Dhawan, please sit down.

SHRI ARIF MOHD. KHAN : Let him have his say...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI VISHVJIT P. SINGH (Maharashtra) : \*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. CHANDRESH P. THAKUR): All of you please sit down. *(Interruptions)* It is my duty to see that Mr. Jagmohan has the right to speak. He must be heard. If anybody has anything to, we will see what can be done.

SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN (Maharashtra) : \*

SHRI R. K. DHAWAN : \*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. CHANDRESH P. THAKUR): Please sit down.

SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN : \*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. CHANDRESH P. THAKUR): Nobody should be subjected to any aspersion. Mr. Jagmohan is an hon. Member of this House. Let us have the pleasure of listening to him.

SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN : \*

SHRI VISHVJIT P. SINGH : \*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. CHANDRESH P. THAKUR): Nobody is a murderer here, please. Mr. Jagmohan does not need defenders. He can look after himself.

Mr. Jagmohan, please continue.

SHRI JAGMOHAN : Yes, yes. That is my contention.

SHRI JAGDISH PRASAD MATHUR : \*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. CHANDRESH P. THAKUR): You don't have the right to interrupt, Mr. Mathur. Nothing will go on record. Don't assert that you have the right to interrupt.

SHRI JAGDISH PRASAD MATHUR : \*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. CHANDRESH P. THAKUR): No point of order. It can be only after Mr. Jagmohan speak.

Mr. Jagmohan, please.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY (Pondicherry) : \*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. CHANDRESH P. THAKUR): I am ruling out all points of order. Let Mr. Jagmohan speak. This is his maiden speech.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY : \*

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA : \*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. CHANDRESH P. THAKUR) : Mr. Narayanasamy, you are a healthy person. Don't lose your temper, please.

SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN : \*

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY : \*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. CHANDRESH P. THAKUR) : I will give you chance.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY : \*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. CHANDRESH P. THAKUR) : Don't you disturb, please.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY : \*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. CHANDRESH P. THAKUR): I have already told Mr. Mathur.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY : \*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. CHANDRESH P. THAKUR): Yesterday is not today.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY : \*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. CHANDRESH P. THAKUR): Both of you will get chance. Let him

speak first. Please sit down. My request to all of you is : please sit down.

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA : \*

उपसभा-पक्ष (प्रो० चन्द्रेश पी० ठाकुर): कोई अन्यथा नहीं है । . . (व्यवधान)

Let Mr. Jagmohan speak.

SHRI JAGMOHAN : I was saying...

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY : \*

SHRI G. G. SWELL (Meghalaya) : \*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. CHANDRESH P. THAKUR): That is irrelevant. It will not go on record.

SHRI G. G. SWELL : \*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. CHANDRESH P. THAKUR): Precisely for that matter you should not interrupt. Don't take the rules in your hands. These things will not go on record. Mr. Jagmohan will speak first. You are wasting everybody's time. Mr. Swell. Don't keep reminding that you have been Deputy Speaker. The fact that you were Deputy Speaker should give you more moderation.

SHRI G. G. SWELL : \*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. CHANDRESH P. THAKUR): Please sit down. These things will not go on record. You are not presiding here. Please sit down. Mr. Jagmohan will continue.

SHRI JAGMOHAN : Please listen to me. I see your point. They are unnecessarily raising this issue.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY : \*

SHRI R. K. DHAWAN : \*

2 P.M.

**SHRI R. K. DHAWAN :** (*Interruptions*) You cannot say it unnecessary. It is for the Chair to decide whether it is necessary or not. (*Interruptions*).

**SHRI ARIF MOHD. KHAN :** The Chair has decided. (*Interruptions*).

**SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY :** Sir, if you say I cannot raise the point of order, I will get out. I will not open my mouth. (*Interruptions*) I am addressing the Chair. You are not giving me my right to raise a point of order. On that point I want to raise an important matter. I want your ruling on that. It is a very important matter. (*Interruptions*)

**SHRI R. K. DHAWAN :** Sir, he is under the Oath of Secrecy as a Governor. (*Interruptions*)

**SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY :** Till yesterday Mr. Jagmohan was Governor of Kashmir. He looked after the Office of the Governor. There was correspondence between the Government and Mr. Jagmohan as Governor of Jammu and Kashmir on the Kashmir issue. (*Interruptions*)

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. CHANDRESH P. THAKUR):** Just listen to me.

श्री बोरे ड्र वर्मा (उत्तर प्रदेश): आप  
वाइस चैयरमैन साहब को धमका रहे हैं।  
... (व्यवधान)

**SHRI R. K. DHAWAN :** Till yesterday, when he was a Governor, did he send a report to the Government that the Supreme Court Judges should look into it? That is the main point.

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. CHANDRESH P. THAKUR):** Mr. Narayanasamy, you are unnecessarily prematurely anticipating what Mr.

Jagmohan is going to say. I take it that Mr. Jagmohan knows his responsibility in the previous position and I am sure he will not violate that privilege. Let us not anticipate. Let us not say things which he has not said. If there is something else, we are listening to him here and then you will have your right to speak.

**SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY :** But what is the subject matter of the Special Mention? He used the word "The Hindustan Times dated 30-5-1990."

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. CHANDRESH P. THAKUR):** I cannot go into that issue. The Chairman has permitted Mr. Jagmohan to speak on a news item on Kashmir published in *Hindustan Times* dated 30-5-1990.

**SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY :** My point is, he is not speaking on that. I have the newspaper with me. The newspaper says "Jammu and Kashmir not for Big-2 powers meet". That is the only point. It says Gorbachev and Bush both do not want to interfere in Jammu and Kashmir affairs. They had a telephonic conversation with the Prime Minister. He should confine himself to that only. He cannot go beyond that. When Mr. Dhawan was speaking yesterday, it was said that in the name of special mentions he had diverted himself. He cannot go beyond the subject allotted by the Chairman. That is my point of order. I want a ruling on that.

एक माननीय सदस्य : काश्मीर को  
बर्बाद कर दिया और अब कह रहे हैं कि  
सुप्रीम कोर्ट ने यह फैसला दिया है ...  
(व्यवधान)

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. CHANDRESH P. THAKUR):** I think the hon. Minister wants to say something. Mr. Jagmohan, will you yield?

SHRI ARIF MOHD. KHAN :  
I said if they are ready to listen to Jagmohan I have nothing to add. But they are only... (Interruptions)

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY :  
Is Arif Mohd. Khan the Minister in charge of Kashmir Affairs today ? In which capacity he is now going to speak ?

SHRI ARIF MOHD. KHAN :  
You must know that I am a Minister of the Government of India and I speak on behalf of the Government of India.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY :  
Let the Prime Minister or the Home Minister come. You cannot speak on that. We will not hear you.

SHRI ARIF MOHD. KHAN :  
I say, it is not for you to decide. (Interruptions) Who are you to decide ? It is the Chair which has to decide who is to speak. Who are you ? (Interruptions) Who are you to decide ? The Chairman has allowed me.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. CHANDRESH P. THAKUR) : Please, all of you keep quiet.

SHRI ARIF MOHD. KHAN :  
As a Minister of the Government of India... (Interruptions)... and the Vice-Chairman has allowed me. Who are you ?

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY :  
Under what rule are you speaking ? (Interruptions)

SHRI ARIF MOHD. KHAN :  
It is for the Vice-Chairman to ask me. You are nobody to ask me.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY :  
Sir, we want your ruling.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. CHANDRESH P. THAKUR) : You listen to me. I am giving my ruling. (Interruptions) Please sit down.

SHRI VISHVJIT P. SINGH :  
Under what rule is he speaking, Sir ? (Interruptions)

उपसभाध्यक्ष (प्रो० चन्द्रेश पी० ठाकुर)  
आप बैठ जाइए। मेरे बातें तो सुनिए।  
(व्यवधान) ...  
... (Interruptions) ...

DR. RATNAKAR PANDEY  
(Uttar Pradesh) : \*

श्री कैलाश नारायण सारंग (मध्य प्रदेश) \*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. CHANDRESH P. THAKUR) :  
Members who have spoken without my permission will not go on record. ... (Interruptions) ... Let me clarify the position. ... (Interruptions) ... Yesterday the Deputy Chairman ruled... (Interruptions) ...  
मि० ग्रहलुक्कलिङ्ग, बैठ जाइए।

डा० जितेन्द्र कुमार जैन (मध्य प्रदेश)  
सुनो... सुनो... (व्यवधान) ...

उपसभाध्यक्ष (प्रो० चन्द्रेश पी० ठाकुर) :  
मेरे बातें सुनो।

श्री कैलाश नारायण सारंग : \*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. CHANDRESH P. THAKUR) : I request all Members to cooperate. We are all representatives of the public. We have certain responsibility. We have taken oath under the Constitution to maintain the dignity of the House and we should all cooperate. Shouting and counter-shouting is not going to help anybody nor it is going to help the purpose that you have in view. Now, listen to me carefully. Yesterday, the Deputy Chairman ruled when there was a controversy whether a particular Minister can make a point of order or not. Her ruling was very clear "If the Minister is a Member of this House, he has the right to raise a point of order."

\*Not recorded.

Why are you jumping again ? Today, Mr. Arif Mohd. Khan did not raise a point of order. . . (*Interruptions*). . . I listened to him. His request was to me. He wanted to make some point because there was a lot of controversy and I thought he is the only Minister here, it is in the fitness of things that he throws some light. So it was neither a point of order for him nor a question of dispute whether the admissibility of point of order is relevant here or not. So let me repeat the Deputy Chairman's ruling unless it is revised by her or the Chairman, that a Minister who is a Member of the Rajya Sabha has the right to raise a point of order. No Minister howsoever mighty a member of the Government of India he is, if he is not a Member of this House he does not have the right to raise a point of order but with the permission of the Presiding Officer he or she can make an intervention. . . (*Interruptions*). . .

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY :  
What happened to my point of order ?

SHRI VISHVJIT P. SINGH :  
Under what rules. . . (*Interruptions*)  
...

SHRI ARIF MOHD. KHAN :  
Sir, the hon. Member from the Opposition Benches... (*interruptions*)...

SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN :  
Under Rule 266, you have the power to allow him to make a submission. You have allowed it. . . (*Interruptions*). . . They are objecting to your ruling, Sir.

SHRI ARIF MOHD. KHAN :  
Sir, they seem to be developing more indignation than they can contain. (*Interruptions*).

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. CHANDRESH P. THAKUR) :  
There should be no controversy.

Mr. Vishvjit P. Singh, please take your seat. Don't be so much rule-minded. The rule is very simple that the Presiding Officer's words are final. Okay. That is the rule. If he wants to make a brief submission, what is so great about that ? Please listen to me. He is a pleasant person and I hope he is not going to add fuel to the fire. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI ARIF MOHD. KHAN :  
I am not yielding, Sir. I have been permitted by the Chair and I am not yielding to somebody who is so fond of making unnecessary interruptions. (*Interruptions*). I have been permitted by the Chair. (*Interruptions*).

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. CHANDRESH P. THAKUR) :  
It will not go on record.

SHRI ARIF MOHD. KHAN :  
I withdraw that, Sir.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY :  
Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, you have given no ruling on the point of order raised by me. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI VISHVJIT P. SINGH :  
Sir by virtue of his being a Minister of the Government of India, he is taking advantage of his position to come to this House and cast aspersions against Members of the House.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. CHANDRESH P. THAKUR) :  
That he has withdrawn.

SHRI ARIF MOHD. KHAN :  
Sir, I have been permitted by you and he is not allowing me to speak.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. CHANDRESH P. THAKUR) :  
He will allow you to speak.

SHRI ARIF MOHD. KHAN :  
You have allowed me. How can he stop me from speaking ?

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. CHANDRESH P. THAKUR) : Don't lose your temper, Mr. Minister. Speak, whatever you want to speak.

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA : Kindly give your ruling on the point of order raised by Mr. Narayanasamy. (*Interruptions*).

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. CHANDRESH P. THAKUR) : Mr. Narayanasamy, perhaps, you did not listen to what I said. I said that Mr. Jagmohan will take into consideration his responsibilities in his previous capacity. I have read out the exact topic for which the Chairman has given him permission. I have brought to his notice with reference to your point of order that he will keep that in view and he will confine his Special Mention to the subject for which he has been allowed. Then what is this noise about ?

SHRI ARIF MOHD. KHAN : Sir, today, Shri H. Hanumanthappa, was the first speaker to make a Special Mention and before he came to the subject which was allowed by the hon. Chairman, in fact, he made two Special Mentions. The point I am making is that Shri Jagmohan has not yet concluded. He has not yet made his Special Mention. He had just begun. I do not know what is that that is agitating the minds of the hon. Members sitting on the Opposition Benches because immediately Shri R. K. Dhawan mentioned that he is under the oath of secrecy. Sir, it is very peculiar. I would like to know whether Shri Dhawan or other hon. Members sitting on the other side are aware of something which Shri Jagmohan knows, which if divulged, will create problems for them. This is the only thing which I would like to know. (*Interruptions*). How he has come to know about it ? How he has anticipated what he is going to say ?

This is what I would like to know from him. (*Interruptions*). How do you know that ? Why did you mention the oath of secrecy ? (*Interruptions*).

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. CHANDRESH P. THAKUR) : Nobody should anticipate what Mr. Jagmohan is going to say. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI VISHVJIT P. SINGH : I move a motion that the intervention by the hon. Minister may be expunged from the record. Once again, I say, the hon. Minister, who is a stranger to this House... (*Interruptions*).

SHRI ARIF MOHD. KHAN : You should know that a Minister is never a stranger to any House.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. CHANDRESH P. THAKUR) : The Minister is not a stranger. He is a welcome Member of the House in his capacity as a Minister.

SHRI ARIF MOHD. KHAN : Please update his Parliamentary knowledge at least. (*Interruptions*). If you do not know, please see the rule-book.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. CHANDRESH P. THAKUR) : Just as I have requested people on this side not to anticipate what Mr. Jagmohan is going to say, similarly, I would have thought that the Minister will also not anticipate what they are going to object to. So please let Mr. Jagmohan speak now. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA (Karnataka) : My name has been taken by the Minister. (*Interruptions*).

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. CHANDRESH P. THAKUR) : I said that he should not have anticipated.... (*Interruptions*).

Please sit down. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI R. K. DHAWAN : Sir, . . . (*Interruptions*).

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. CHANDRESH P. THAKUR) : I am not able to hear what you are saying. There are so many people speaking at the same time. (*Interruptions*). I again repeat that Mr. Jagmohan knows his responsibility. (*Interruptions*). Listen to him. If there is anything which transgresses that, you can react to that. You will have the right to react to it. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA : Mr. Vice-Chairman. . . (*Interruption*) . . .

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. CHANDRESH P. THAKUR) : He has already withdrawn. Please sit down. (*Interruptions*). Mr. Arif Mohd. Khan, by the remarks you made earlier, somebody was disturbed. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI ARIF MOHD. KHAN : No. Earlier, it is O.K. Not this. I have only said this is a special mention. What is it that is agitating Mr. Dhawan's mind? Why is he mentioning oath of secrecy? Does he know something which is divulged by Mr. Jagmohan? (*Interruptions*).

SHRI VISHVJIT P. SINGH : Sir, I beg of you to go through the record. You will find very serious. . . (*Interruptions*).

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. CHANDRESH P. THAKUR) : We will look into the record. If there is anything which is insinuating in character, it will be expunged. I have said that. We will look into the record. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA : Why should you allow it to go on record? My name has been taken.

(*Interruptions*). I want to set it right.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. CHANDRESH P. THAKUR) : There is nothing to set right. Will you please sit down ? I have said that we will see the record and if there is anything by implication insinuating, we will expunge it. The matter is over. (*Interruptions*). There is nothing. Mr. Jagmohan.

SHRI JAGMOHAN : I was saying, Sir, that a panel of the Supreme Court Judges which I am suggesting . . . (*Interruptions*).

SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA : Sir, you know, he is a Minister. I am a silent Member. He has taken my name. I want to clarify.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. CHANDRESH P. THAKUR) : You must sit down. Please cooperate. Hanumanthappaji, you had been in the panel of Vice-Chairmen. Please sit down.

SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA : If he has not taken my name, I would have been simply sitting quietly. When he has taken my name . . . (*Interruptions*).

SHRI ARIF MOHD. KHAN : I will withdraw his name.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN : (PROF. CHANDRESH P. THAKUR) : Now the matter is over.

SHRI M. M. JACOB (Kerala) : Sir, his name had been taken. Mr. Hanumanthappa has a right to clarify.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. CHANDRESH P. THAKUR) : Mr. Hanumanthappa, your name has been withdrawn.

SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA : Sir, it is something wrong. Certain thing has gone on record about me. You don't allow me to set it right.



THE VICE - CHAIRMAN (PROF. CHANDRESH P. THAKUR) : Your name has been withdrawn.

SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN : Sir, he may withdraw. But we will object to his withdrawing. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA : You are not allowing me when there is something wrong going on record . . . (*Interruptions*).

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. CHANDRESH P. THAKUR) : You are refusing to listen. I have said more than once that I will look into the record and if there is anything by implication insinuating, it will be expunged on top of it. Please. (*Interruption*). Nothing will go on record. If you continue to shout, it is not making any sense. When I am saying repeatedly that we will go into the record and if there is anything by implication insinuating, it will be expunged. are you so agitated over it? Why are you so agitated about it? What is so grave about it? . . . (*Interruptions*) . . . I am not able to hear what you are saying. There are so many people speaking. . . . (*Interruptions*) . . . What are you saying? Let Mr. Jagmohan speak. If there is something that agitates you, you can react to that . . . (*Interruptions*) . . .

SHRI M. M. JACOB : Sir, I want to seek a clarification. When a Member makes an allegation . . . (*Interruptions*) . . .

THE VICE - CHAIRMAN (PROF. CHANDRESH P. THAKUR) : It is my responsibility to protect the privilege of the Members. It is for this reason I am saying that the records will be looked into and if there is anything insinuating, even by implication, it will be expunged. What further protection are you suggesting? I am as much a Member as any body else even when I am sitting here and I am entitled

to, and to look after, the same kind of protection and I am sure . . . (*Interruptions*) . . .

THE LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER) : Since the Minister himself has withdrawn, the original reference may be expunged, the original reference to Mr. Hanumanthappa may be expunged.

SHRI ARIF MOHD. KHAN : It was not an allegation but I had merely mentioned. I have said if there is any objection to it, I will withdraw that.

THE VICE - CHAIRMAN (PROF. CHANDRESH P. THAKUR) : O.K. The matter is over now.

SHRI JAGMOHAN : I am saying Sir, I can assure everybody the hon. Chairman, and the hon. Members that I am not going to say anything which will even remotely impinge on the Oath of Secrecy which I have taken in office, but as an individual and as a Member of this House, I have a right to make a submission, I have a right to make a suggestion and the suggestion is in the interest of truth in the interest of letting the nation know what has actually happened in Kashmir because a lot of disinformation is being intentionally spread which is not in the national interest, which is not in the interest of truth. Therefore, I am suggesting that there should be a panel of Supreme Court Judges. We should look into all the circumstances, the underlying forces who have brought about the current militancy, terrorism and subversion in Kashmir. So far as I am concerned, I myself would submit to that panel as to when I went to Kashmir as Governor on 19th January, 1990, what the conditions were and I only want the Judges to know how I have brought Kashmir

back from Pakistan and how this disinformation technique has brought me back from Kashmir to Delhi. This is what I want the panel of Judges to know. There is no question of any official secrecy in it... *(Interruptions)*...

[THE VICE-CHAIRMAN SHRI M.A. BABY), in the chair]

SHRI R. K. DHAWAN: This is not personal explanation... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Sir, I raised the issue... *(Interruptions)*... This is not a personal explanation... *(Interruptions)*... I raised the issue... *(Interruptions)*... There is an issue. I raised the point of order. The Vice-Chairman ruled... *(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI M.A. BABY): Nothing will go on record. You are not allowed to speak. Only Mr. Jagmohan will speak... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Sir, when I raised a point of order, the Vice-Chairman ruled... *(Interruptions)*... Sir, Mr. Jagmohan will be allowed to speak only on the subject that is permitted by the Chair... *(Interruptions)*... Sir, he is going beyond the limits permitted by the Chairman. My point is that he is going beyond the permission that has been given by the Chairman on the subject... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN: Sir, it is the duty of the Chair to see, not for every Member to see, what Special Mention he is making... *(Interruptions)*... Every Member cannot see... *(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE - CHAIRMAN (SHRI M. A. BABY): Please sit down. Please take your seats... *(Interruptions)*... Please sit down... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Sir, you should see whether he is going beyond the limits or not... *(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE - CHAIRMAN (SHRI M.A. BABY): No, you are not allowed to speak. What you said will not go on record. Yes, Mr. Jagmohan, please carry on.

SHRI M. M. JACOB: Sir, just one moment. Yesterday, when one of our Members was speaking, the Deputy Chairman ruled that in a Special Mention, one cannot deviate from the subject and go to make other suggestions and to other areas.

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: Yes.

SHRI M. M. JACOB: Today, Sir, I find Mr. Jagmohan going out of the subject, which is reported in the newspapers, and he is going to other suggestions and other areas and it is beyond the scope of the Special Mention... *(Interruptions)*... if the interpretation given by the Deputy Chairman is taken as correct. Therefore, I request you to ask him to confine himself to the Special Mention for which permission has been given.

SHRI SHANKAR DAYAL SINGH (Bihar): Sir, I am on a point of order... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI JAGMOHAN: Sir, I was on the point... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SHANKAR DAYAL SINGH: Sir, I am on a point of order... *(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE - CHAIRMAN (SHRI M. A. BABY): Don't complicate the matters further. Please sit down... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SHANKAR DAYAL SINGH: Sir, I am on my legs... *(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE - CHAIRMAN (SHRI M. A. BABY): You can be on your legs only when I permit you. You have not been permitted...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री शंकर दयाल सिंह : माननीय सदस्य जगमोहन जी का यह पहला वक्तव्य हो रहा है और इसी वजह से हंगामा होना शुरू हुआ। मैं जानना चाहता हूँ कि क्या रोज जगमोहन जी को ही केन्द्र में रखकर यह हल्ला होता रहेगा और रोज ऐसा ही मूड बना रहेगा क्या मदन में कुछ काम होगा ? इसलिए मैं चाहता हूँ कि...*(व्यवधान)*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI M. A. BABY): Please sit down...*(Interruptions)*...Nothing will go on record...*(Interruptions)*...I am not allowing anybody...*(Interruptions)*...whatever you people are saying is not going on record...*(Interruptions)*...Please sit down...*(Interruptions)*...For raising any issue, you have to take the permission of the Chair...*(Interruptions)*... You do not have the permission. So, please sit down...*(Interruptions)*... All of you, please sit down...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, what is most objectionable is that the honourable Member says that he has retrieved it after the took over. That he has retrieved Kashmir from Pakistan. That is objectionable.

SHRI JAGMOHAN: Let me complete. I was saying that the forces which were creating anti-national feelings, those forces had been curbed by me...

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: Mr. Jagmohan, if it were to be what you said, we appreciate it. But you went further to say that you had retrieved it from Pakistan. Had Kashmir become a part of Pakistan? That is very unfortunate. This kind of a statement is very unreasonable. You must

withdraw that statement. You must first withdraw that statement. It is unfair. This is not the way. A very responsible person who has enjoyed such a status should not speak in this manner. This is very unfair.

SHRI JAGMOHAN: Let me explain...

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH (West Bengal): I do not know on which subject Mr. Jagmohan has been allowed to make a special mention. Earlier also we had raised this point. The rule is very specific. Not only a notice for making a special mention, but a clarificatory note also has to be submitted while seeking permission of the Chair. That is the normal procedure for making special mentions. Therefore, according to the procedure the Members are not allowed to stretch outside of the notice which they have given while seeking permission of the Chairman. Now what I heard from the statement made by Mr. Jagmohan is that when he was sent as Governor of Jammu and Kashmir, he retrieved Kashmir from Pakistan. This is too much because retrieving Kashmir from Pakistan cannot be done by a single individual. Kashmir has been kept with India by the people of India and by the Government of India and the people of Kashmir, fighting against the fissiparous and separatist tendencies. Therefore, naturally it is too much to boast of this kind of things. So I think Mr. Jagmohan will see to it that that word does not go into the record that it is Mr. Jagmohan who has retrieved Kashmir from Pakistan. I hope he will amend it by saying that it was the people of Kashmir and the people of India who had retrieved Kashmir from Pakistan.

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: Mr. Vice-Chairman, it will enhance the dignity of Mr. Jagmohan if he withdraws what he has said.

THE VICE - CHAIRMAN (SHRI M. A. BABY): The Leader of the Opposition as well as some honourable Members from other parties have spoken about some of the expressions made by the honourable Shri Jagmohan...

SHRI JAGMOHAN: May I clarify?

THE VICE - CHAIRMAN (SHRI M. A. BABY): You will be allowed to speak. I am not saying you have concluded or you are not going to be allowed to speak again. But when any Member of the House speaks on such a sensitive subject—the sensitivity of the subject is understood by every Member of this House—we have to use utmost restraint in making our observations. Of course, I would not have to advise any Member in this House as to how they should react. But still I request the honourable Member who is speaking on this news item on Kashmir published in the *Hindustan Times*—this has been permitted by the Chairman and the Chairman must have permitted this with the full confidence that the parameters would be maintained by the honourable Member. Therefore, when you make your submissions, kindly keep this in mind. And I request all honourable Members, let us listen to the submissions of the honourable Member with utmost silence. (Interruptions) Please sit down. I am on my legs.

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA: What is the response of the Government on this issue? (Interruptions).

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI M. A. BABY): Let us close the issue here. I hope the Member will appreciate the spirit of the House (Interruptions).

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY (Tamil Nadu): Kindly permit me... (Interruptions)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI M. A. BABY): We cannot convert it into another discussion. Many Members have already spoken.

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY: It is an extraordinary... (Interruptions) In the name of submission, something he said. So it is the right of the Member to raise the issue. It is a sensitive... (Interruptions)

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA: What is the reaction of the Government on this issue? (Interruptions)

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, the hon. Member has held very high positions. Recently he has been the Governor of that State. It does not behave well of him to speak in the manner in which he has spoken. It brings all of us into indignity—all of us into indignity, the nation itself. (Interruptions) Therefore, I again appeal to him—it is my earnest appeal—to withdraw what he has said. (Interruptions)

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: 'Retrieve' does not apply in this case. (Interruptions).

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI M. A. BABY): Now, please... (Interruptions) Now, let us listen whether Shri Jagmohan is reacting to your sentiments. Let us listen. Please sit down. (Interruptions) Please sit down.

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER: He must be allowed to speak.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Give him a chance to withdraw. We are here. (Interruptions)

SHRI JAGMOHAN: I would most humbly submit that the interpretation that is being sought to be drawn upon my expression is not correct. (Interruptions)

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA: He is not withdrawing.

**SHRI MADAN BHATIA** (Nominated) : I give him a chance to withdraw and retrieve the honour of the nation. His words have constituted an outrageous insult to the entire nation. Let him have a chance to withdraw. He should withdraw and retrieve for the nation its honour. If he does not withdraw, then we have a right to say what we want to say. He must retrieve the honour of the nation by withdrawing his words. (*Interruptions*)

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI M. A. BABY)** : Let him complete the sentence. Please permit him to complete. If any Member goes beyond a certain understanding and consensus that we are having here. (*Interruptions*). Nobody will tolerate that. Let the Member complete his sentence. (*Interruptions*). It is the sentiment of the House. (*Interruptions*) It is not good. I am on my legs. Mr. Dhawan, please sit down. I am on my legs. Please sit down. You are not allowing him even to complete a sentence. Please have some patience. If the hon. Member speaks something without taking into consideration the sentiments of the House, we will decide what should be done about those sentences and whether those sentences should go on record or not. The House is supreme. (*Interruptions*) It is not good. Please sit down. You cannot stand up and speak like that without the permission of the Chair. Please sit down. I request the hon. Members to please sit down. I request the hon. Member not to take the round-about route. Please come to the point and understand the spirit of of the House.

**SHRI JAGMOHAN** : I understand, Sir. My point is that if I am allowed to complete, then probably their point will be met. They are not allowing me to complete. This is the whole tragedy of it. If that interpretation is being drawn on my words, I would like to make

it absolutely clear that what I meant was that the pro-Pakistani forces were dominating the scene. It did not mean... (*Interruptions*). Please listen to me. (*Interruptions*).

**SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY** : He is going in a round about way....

**SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA** : He should take his words back. (*Interruptions*).

**SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER** : Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir....

डा० श्री ए. अहमद खान (राजस्थान) :  
मने जो प्वाइंट आफ़ ऑर्डर उठया था  
(व्यवधान) वह सदन को सुमराह कर रहे  
हैं (व्यवधान)

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI M. A. BABY)** : Will you please give the hon. Member a chance to withdraw what you object to ? (*Interruptions*) Please give him an opportunity to withdraw the objectionable point which he has said.

**SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER** : That is what we wanted....

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI M. A. BABY)** : The hon. Member himself is withdrawing the objectionable point.

**SHRI JAGMOHAN** : All right, I withdraw. I withdraw.... (*Interruptions*)

**SHRI VISHVJIT P. SINGH** : He has made an allegation against a duly elected Chief Minister. This is an allegation which is reprehensible, unprecedented and should be withdrawn. (*Interruptions*)

**SHRI JAGMOHAN** : Sir, what I was submitting is that in view of the disinformation that has been going around about Kashmir, a panel of Supreme Court Judges should be appointed to look into all aspects, the background, the circumstances and the facts, and even

after I have taken over, whatever thing has gone right or wrong, should also be subjected to that enquiry by that Commission. Nothing could be more fair than this. The Maulvi's murder or the subsequent events or incidents or the incidents prior to that, all should be looked into by that Commission so that the truth may come out. The only question... *(Interruptions)* Please listen. All that I am submitting to say is why truth should not be brought before the nation. That is the point that I am submitting. *(Interruptions)*

**SHRI SIKANDER BAKHT** (Madhya Pradesh) : You might repeat you are withdrawing those words.

**SHRI JAGMOHAN** : All right, those words I withdraw. I withdraw those words because that was not central to my theme at all. If it has been understood like that, I withdraw. There is no question of that. I withdraw that. But the issue is... *(Interruptions)* You never allowed me to speak *(Interruptions)*

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI M. A. BABY)** : This is not fair. *(Interruptions)* please carry on.

**SHRI JAGMOHAN** : So, what my submission is that the various components of power structure in Kashmir were operating in a particular environment, and when I said myself, I did not see myself, I mean that... *(Interruptions)*

**SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY** : Sir, he cannot go beyond the scope of the Special Mention.

**SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA** : Sir, you go through the papers... *(Interruptions)*

**SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY** : That personal explanation was not allowed.

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI M. A. BABY)** : The Chair has permitted.

**SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY** : The Chair permitted about the news item appeared in the 'Hindustan Times' dated 30-5-1990 *(Interruptions)*

**SHRI N. K. P. SALVE** (Maharashtra) : Sir, I am on a point of order. *(Interruptions)*

**SHRI JAGMOHAN** : I strongly protest and I sit down. I am not going to speak *(Interruptions)* You do not want any Member to speak. I withdraw *(Interruptions)*

**SHRI N. K. P. SALVE** : Sir, I am on a point of order. I want your ruling. *(Interruptions)*

**SHRI JAGMOHAN** : I strongly protest. They are not hearing me. Therefore, I sit down. *(Interruptions)*

**SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY** : He has said so many things outside the scope of the Special Mention. You gave your ruling. He has gone beyond it. *(Interruptions)*

**SHRI N. K. P. SALVE** : What I want to submit is, it is essential that....

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI M. A. BABY)** : Are you making a submission, or, are you on a point of order.

**SHRI N. K. P. SALVE** : On a point of order. I want that the record of the proceedings of the House should be set right. The hon. Member who spoke just now has held extremely responsible positions and held them with distinction. He is new to the House. It is most unfortunate that on his maiden speech, a section of the House should have felt compelled to heckle him. But the crucial issue is this. It is a well-known convention of the House that a Special Mention

[Shri N. K. P. Salve]

is with reference to a specific subject. The list of Special Mentions given to the Leader of the Opposition—I think, it is authentic—has this item : 'No. 16—Shri Jagmohan—News-item on Kashmir published in the 'Hindustan Times' of 30-5-90'.

I was trying to listen to him with great patience and very carefully. Unfortunately, most of the things he said had no nexus, had no relation, whatsoever, to the news-item which has been published. Therefore, Sir, I want a clear ruling, a categorical ruling, from the Chair. Things have been said from there. Things have been said from here. I also said a few things. He also had been gracious enough to withdraw something. But Sir, the question is, on an item of this nature, which is every sensitive, is it permissible for a Member to go outside the subject and make submissions and, if he has made such submissions, would it be in order? Would it be still part of the record? I would want you to give your ruling on this.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI M. A. BABY) : Now, .... (*Interruptions*) Mr. Viren Shah, please sit down. Let me dispose of Mr. Salve's point of order.

Mr. Salve, the Chairman, in his wisdom, permitted this Special Mention.

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE : No dispute.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI M. A. BABY) : Unfortunately, I have not gone through this news-item in the 'Hindustan Times'. Therefore, I am not in a position to give my ruling whether what the hon. Member has said is relevant to the news-item published in the 'Hindustan Times'. I leave it to the

Chairman to decide whether what Mr. Jagmohan has said is relevant or not. But we know that in this universe, everything is related. With some stretch of imagination, you can bring any subject and connect it to any other subject. Of course, in the House, we do not behave like that. (*Interruptions*). If it is something innocuous, we do not object to it. But if there is anything objectionable in what Mr. Jagmohan has said,....

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE : Sir, half-a-second.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI M. A. BABY) : If something is there which is very much objectionable and which is outside the scope of the Special Mention permitted by the Chairman, that will be removed from the record. Is that all right?

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE : Sir, if it is innocuous, I have nothing to say. Even if it is indirectly or remotely connected, I have nothing to say. But Sir, the hon. Member demanded an enquiry by a panel of Supreme Court judges into the systematic disinformation. This is also a damnation of the Government in a very bad way.

AN HON. MEMBER : It is not.

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE : It is for them to decide. 'Jammu and Kashmir is not too big for me'. This is the subject. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI VISHVJIT P. SINGH : His special mention relates to the Summit meet between the U.S. and the U.S.S.R. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE : So, something which is irrelevant will not form part of the record.

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER : Mr. Vice-Chairman, I stand to

defend the right of speech of the hon. Member. The hon. Member has come just now. He has tried to make a mention on a very sensitive issue, but I find that he is not being allowed to speak and he sat down in dismay. That is unfortunate. We may not agree with him, with whatever he says. Every point we may disagree to, but his right to speak we respect.

AN HON. MEMBER : You tell them. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER : Just listen to me. What is paining me is that in dismay he sat down; that he not being allowed to speak. An impression should not go that his right to speak in any form has been curtailed. I stand to defend his right of speech. I may disagree with him, with whatever he has said. I disagree with many a thing which he has said, but his right to speak is absolute. He is entitled to speak. Please do not get dismayed. You are a new Member. Please do not get dismayed that you have not been allowed to speak. This is what I want to submit.

THE LEADER OF THE HOUSE (SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY) : With great respect I listened to all the speeches and comments made by hon. Members, Sir. It pains all of us, pains me, pains others when the proceedings of the House are disturbed and it pains more when an hon. Member is prevented or obstructed from making his speech. I reciprocate the sentiments expressed by my friend Shiv Shankerji. I have been trying my best for the last few days that we should maintain discipline in the House and should speak within certain parameters, we should observe norms and standards. I feel many Members have failed in this. Even now I appeal to all the hon. Members that we should observe. . . . (*Interruptions*). I am making an

appeal. Should I not make an appeal? Have I done anything wrong to you ?

SHRI R. K. DHAWAN : Why did you not think of this yesterday ? Why didn't you do it yesterday ?

SHRI S. K. T. RAMACHANDRAN (Tamil Nadu) : Why did you not advise your partymen last year ? What happened last year ? Why did he not preach the sermon last year ? (*Interruptions*).

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER : The objection was only to certain expressions, nothing else. He has the right to speak. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI S. VIDUTHALAI VIRUMBI (Tamil Nadu) : You have not allowed him to speak. It was his maiden speech. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY : Even an appeal is disturbing you. (*Interruptions*). What is the matter with you ? I am just making an appeal to all of us, including me. I said, you can include me. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI S. K. T. RAMACHANDRAN : Then say it boldly that it includes yourself also. Say it boldly. You can appeal to those who are forgetting themselves.

SHRI S. VIDUTHALAI VIRUMBI : Including yourself also. (*Interruptions*).

3 P.M.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY : Sir, I did not mean any offence or insult to anybody. I was only making an appeal to the entire House and I was saying that we should maintain peace and goodwill in the House, we should not disturb each other and, even if we disagree let us disagree, but later on there is an opportunity for everybody to reply. That is all I say. We have



[Shri M.S. Gurupadaswamy]

discussed this matter not once but quite a few times. May I again use this opportunity and appeal to all Members—after all, this is a very august body, we are Elders and we have got a lot of experienced people here—that in future at least let us observe norms and set up good standards and good precedents in the House and let us not disturb each other? Even if a Member makes an offensive remark, let us have the tolerance to bear with it. After all, there will be opportunity, there will be occasion for every one to reply that. After all, nobody is here to shut the other from speaking. Everybody has got a right—it is a basic right. I agree with my honourable friends here that even if we disagree with anybody, he has got a right to make his speech. We may disagree with him, but this norm should be observed by all of us. May I again say, Sir in future at least let us observe certain parameters? .. (Interruptions)..

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI M.A. BABY) : Please, just a minute. The honourable Leader of the Opposition, Shri Shiv Shanker, with his rich parliamentary experience and experience in public life, has mentioned something every relevant. Similarly, the Leader of the House, who is also having the same amount of experience of parliamentary as well as public life, responded to the sentiments. And all of us remember what the response of the Chair was towards certain incidents in this august House. Therefore, let us unanimously resolve that we will restrain ourselves and, as the honourable Chairman has once remarked, we will not convert our House into a laughing stock. There are no two opinions on this point. Sometimes, on certain issues, we understand how tempers run high and how bitterness would be there, but let us also resolve unanimously that we will maintain the dignity and decorum of this House. With these

observations, please permit me to call Mr. G. Y. Krishnan to make his Special Mention.

DR. G. VIJAYA MOHAN REDDY (Andhra Pradesh) : Sir, Mr. Jagmohan has not completed his speech.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI M.A. BABY) : Mr. Jagmohan has completed his observations. Mr. Krishnan.

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA : What about lunch, Sir?

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI M. A. BABY) Please have your lunch.

SHRI G. Y. KRISHNAN (Karnataka) : Honourable Vice-Chairman, Sir, before I start, can I have one clarification about the issue which we have gone through just now? The honourable Vice-Chairman gave a ruling that the House should normally function well. Now, what has happened is, the honourable Leader of the Opposition as well as the honourable Leader of the House have mentioned that decorum has to be maintained.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI M. A. BABY) : You are speaking on a different thing now.

SHRI G. Y. KRISHNAN : Before starting this, I sought your permission for a clarification on a point with regard to the previous issue.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI M.A. BABY) : No, please make your Special Mention.

SHRI G. Y. KRISHNAN : Everybody talks of decorum and everything, but what has happened to that word which is most dangerous to our country? ..(Interruptions)...

**AN HON. MEMBER :** It was withdrawn.

**SHRI G. Y. KRISHNAN :**  
Withdrawn ? Okay .

### **Need to Reinstate Retrenched Employees of Coffee Board**

**SHRI G. Y. KRISHNAN (Karnataka) :** Sir, now I rise to speak about the need to reinstate all the 120 retrenched daily-wagers and the Group D employees of the Coffee Board thrown out of their jobs indiscriminately and mercilessly.

Sir, in all public undertakings and Government where utility service is there, workers are taken on daily wages or appointed casually to meet the exigencies of work. The executive is at liberty to take such persons, local persons, to see that the work does not suffer and it continues. In the Coffee Board there are different wings like the Propaganda Wing, the Marketing Wing and several other wings which take care of the business of the Coffee Board. To meet the exigencies the executive will take local persons. The executive had taken local persons and appointed about 500 to 600 persons, and they have been continuing for a sufficient period. After considering their service, their sincerity and honesty, their services were regularised by the executive. In spite of that regularisation order issued by the executive, now the present Government has sent out nearly 120 persons out from the Coffee Board. Thereby, the families of those retrenched employees are on streets, and they are almost on fast every day.

The employees who have been thrown out like that approached the court, the High Court. But the hon. High Court also was not kind enough to hear them. The hon. High Court ordered them to go and approach the Labour Court. Sir, the hon. House knows what the plight of such employees will be. If they go to the

Labour Court, it takes its own time, even years together, for settlement. That is why we have to see that those employees and their families are safeguarded. Let the Government, the hon. Minister for Commerce as well as the hon. Minister in charge of plantations, take a lenient view and see that those casual workers who have been thrown out from the Board are taken back and that their families are relieved of their difficulties.

Thank you very much.

### **Need to encourage Bidri Handicraft**

**श्री मोहम्मद खलीलुर रहमान (आंध्र प्रदेश) :** जनाब वाइस चेरमन साहब, मैं इस स्पेशल मेंशन के जरिए हुकूमते हिंद की तबज्जह एक इतिहाई अहम इश्यू की तरफ ले जाना चाहता हूँ। जैसाकि आप जानते हैं कि बिदर की जो सनत है वह न सिर्फ साउथ इंडिया में बल्कि पूरे हिंदुस्तान में एक खास मुकाम रखती है। यह कोई तीन-चार सौ साल पुरानी सनत है और आगर्टा इवहेदराबाद का जो बिदर जिला था, वहाँ की यह स्टेट थी। स्टेट रि-आर्गेनायजेशन के बाद यह जिला बिदर कर्नाटक में चला गया। अब हुकूमते कर्नाटक की यह जिम्मेदारी है कि इस सनत को एनकरेज करे, इसकी हिम्मत अफजाई करे और इस की पेटीनाइज करे। मगर पिछले चंद सालों से हम यह देख रहे हैं कि इस सनत को बुरी तरह से नजरंदाज किया गया है, निलेक्ट किया गया है। जिसकी वजह से इस बात का पूरा-पूरा खदशा है इस बात का डर है कि यह सनत जो है अनकरेजिब मुस्तबिल में खतम हो जाएगी। यह इतिहाई जो मशहूर सनत है और यह जो बिदरी हैडीक्राफ्ट है, इसकी मांग न सिर्फ हिंदुस्तान में बल्कि दुनिया के गोसे-गोसे में है। इसका जो माल बनता है, निहायत ही नफीस और इतिहाई खूब-सूरतीन बनता है और इसकी खपत न सिर्फ हिंदुस्तान में बल्कि पूरी दुनिया में है। लिहाजा जरूरत इस बात की है कि हुकूमते-कर्नाटक की जानिब से और फिर हुकूमते-हिंद की जानिब से इसकी सरपरस्ती की जाए और इसको एनकरेज किया जाए।